Riviera Beach Community Redevelopment Agency Budget Workshop

City of Riviera Beach Council Chambers

2nd Floor, Municipal Complex

600 West Blue Heron Boulevard

Riviera Beach, Florida

Wednesday, July 27, 2016

5:35 p.m. to 8:45 p.m.

APPEARANCES:

Chair Terence Davis

Vice-Chair KaShamba Miller-Anderson

Commissioner Tonya Davis Johnson

Commissioner Lynne Hubbard

Commissioner Dawn Pardo

Attorney Michael Haygood

CRA Executive Director Tony Brown

Operations Manager & Public Information Officer Darlene Hatcher

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

CHAIR DAVIS: At this time we're going to call this regular -- no, this is the budget workshop for the CRA.

Madam Clerk, roll call, please.

(Upon roll call by Operations Manager & Public Information Officer Darlene Hatcher, the following were present: Chair Terence Davis, Vice-Chair KaShamba Miller-Anderson, Commissioner Lynne Hubbard, Commissioner Dawn Pardo. Also present: Attorney Michael Haygood and CRA Executive Director Tony Brown.)

CHAIR DAVIS: Let's stand for a moment of silence; and the Pledge will be led by our attorney, Mr. Haygood.

(Moment of silence, followed by the Pledge of Allegiance.)

CHAIR DAVIS: So there will be no adoption of the agenda because right now we're going to the budget workshop.

Presentation will be conducted by the Executive Director, Mr. Tony Brown.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Mr. Chair, members of the board, I'm going to present -- for really direction -- highlights of our 2016 budget; some principles in general, given the things you discussed with myself and the city manager during the course of our various retreat workshops.

So I would hope that at the end of this meeting that we have good guidance for presenting a first draft of our operating budget.

I'm going to sum up where we are with our unfunded capital plan, with the whole purpose of hopefully at the end of this

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

meeting is to get good direction from you as to where you want us to go with our 2017 plan.

As I typically like to do, I like to start out with just a general overview of the state of the CRA. And as you've heard me say before, that we are proud of the fact that we have been presenting to you over the past several years what we consider to be innovative programs and award winning performance.

The other thing I'm pleased to report, that we continue to see an increase in our tax increment revenues; and that basically means that individuals are investing in our city, businesses are expanding; and you'll see that when I give you a highlight of our tax increment revenues.

A couple years ago you assigned to this agency the responsibility to operate the marina upland properties. And we will report to you and show you that we are showing significant losses in our responsibility for the Marina Village; and we project those losses through 2019 as a result of largely the fact that there is no private investment on city-owned land.

CHAIR DAVIS: Excuse me, Mr. Brown.

Let the record reflect that Commissioner Davis Johnson is on the dais.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: And as you aptly did during our various sessions during our retreat, we talked about our cash flows between the City and the CRA, and you directed us to look for innovative creative ways -- and you asked very hard

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

questions, appropriately so, about our expenses and ways in which both the City and the CRA could cover these costs, and so I plan to highlight that.

So in general this past year we've completed the largest capital improvement project ever at the Marina Village. We brought that project in within budget. We're pleased of having met that performance. As I said, we've assumed responsibility of the marina enterprise. It has officially opened for us in March of this year.

We're proud of the work that our neighborhood based community leaders are doing with our Community Development Corporation. We formed that entity several years ago and are proud to report that they have five homes under construction in such a short period of time.

If there is any message I'm looking to convey tonight, and that is recognizing the importance of the marina, its drain on our resources, the intended catalytic investment we wanted it to make, that our focus and our recommendation to this board is to align our resources in such a way that it develops the marina to attract private development.

I want to talk about our award winning performance. I've done this in the past. One of the things that we set as a goal, my team and I, is that we wanted to be recognized by our peers as having programs that would be considered to be among the best of the best. And as a goal we set each year to be recognized by

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

the Florida Redevelopment Association for awards in their Best Book. This year we submitted the largest number of submissions we've ever done in my short tenure here at the CRA. We have three projects that we're hoping to make you very proud this fall in terms of what we submitted for the Marina Village, the linear park, and the partnerships we've created in order to fulfill our responsibilities to your community.

Last year we were recognized for our annual report and the way in which we communicate to our stakeholders. Even more than just that, we thank the board for the resources provided for us to hire a public relations firm; and that has allowed us not only with our annual report but to tell our story and to highlight our programs in a way that casts a positive light over our city. And for that we certainly thank the O'Donnell Agency for their direction and services to our organization, where we were recognized as having the best annual report and showcased as a best practice for communicating to stakeholders.

We were recognized in 2014 by the Florida American Planners Association for our Ambassador Program as a best practice initiative. Before them we were recognized internationally in the LivCom competition for the community garden and the ways in which we were trying to develop our neighborhoods and address the issue of a neighborhood impacted by predatory lending, high foreclosure rates, and showing innovative ways to do in-fill development. And our community garden won the coveted LivCom

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

award in 2012.

And then in 2011 for the best outstanding rehab, Ocean Mall won that. So we've had a great track record in being recognized as having programs as being one of the best among the best and so we hope again this fall to make you proud. And we've given each of you the dates for the Florida Redevelopment Association meeting, and we hope that you can attend.

The best report card for a redevelopment agency is its trend in tax increment revenues. And I think our report card is outstanding.

As I like to do, primarily for our general public, is to explain what I mean by tax increment financing revenues, TIF revenues. The CRA does not cover the entire city. The red line shows our boundaries. It captures and uses increased local property tax revenues largely from new development in a defined geographical area for a defined period of time.

We were created in 1984 with a 60-year life, and we have about 27 years remaining to that life.

And the whole purpose of a CRA is to spur private development to eliminate blighted conditions and to expand the tax base.

Ms. Hubbard has been very directive in saying a very important aspect of what we do is the creation of jobs. And even though it is not a documented requirement under the statutory term of a finding of necessity, it has always been one

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

of those community impact measures that we find important and that we know you consider to be very important that we do measure in our major initiatives.

So what is TIF? The CRAs, we do not control the millage rate. As you know, when you sit as members of city council you control whether or not the rate goes up or down. However that rate flows, it does affect our revenue. If the millage rate goes up, our revenues go up.

As we set our budget last year when the City lowered its millage rate, it did have an impact on our revenue. And although we saw an increase, it wasn't as steep because at that time the City reduced its millage rate. So for 2017, unless you know otherwise, we're budgeting with the City's millage rate at $8.45 per $1,000 of value. And right now as far as we know the County's millage rate is $4.78 per $1,000 of value.

As I said, we have seen tremendous growth year after year in our redevelopment agency; 8% over the prior year. I think this is the same rate of growth in the City overall. And since 2013 we've had a 41% increase in our TIF revenues.

I always like to address the issue of in creating a CRA means that we're taking money away from the City, that we take revenue away from the County. For the County, yes. In terms of the City, there is an impact to the City, but we work for the benefit of the City. So in the CRA there is a little under 10 million dollars of tax revenue generated. We receive about 78%

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

of that value, the City 14%, and the County 8. So theoretically we're utilizing the County's money for the benefit of improving our redevelopment area.

So if you look at it differently, with our 7.6, 7.7 million dollars in TIF money projected for 2017, 4.9 million is based on the millage rate that the City charge; and that 2.7, that 2.8 million that the County has forgone as a result of having a redevelopment area in the City of Riviera Beach.

To look at it differently -- and we've had members of the public talk about, well, perhaps we should end the CRA. And I think that if you decide -- and I'll share with you, if you think that our work is done, that we've achieved our goal, I think that is an appropriate consideration. But if the CRA was to end today, at a 4% growth rate you would be returning 131 million dollars to the county. If we continue to grow at an 8% clip, then over that remaining life of the CRA you would be returning 243 million.

As Ms. Davis Johnson may know, the county's position with any CRA that looks to expand is that the county administration usually take a negative approach because of the impact it has on their revenues.

So when we produce our annual report -- last year I got a phone call from now County Administrator Verdenia Baker who told me she read it from cover to cover to indicate and to know that we're doing good things with their money. And so I share that

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

with you to tell you that the County is looking to ensure that we're doing the right things and that the things we do is having a positive impact.

A question that we typically get is which properties generate the most CRA revenues. So I thought this would be an interesting slide. We usually get a request from our lenders about the top ten properties generated in the CRA and so if I were to share what the top five are, even though the bulk of the FP&L value went to the City because CRAs do not get tax revenue on equipment, but the value of the real estate is the largest tax assessed value in the CRA at about 10 million dollars. The second highest assessed property is Lockheed Martin at 8.9 million. Followed by one of the penthouse condos at 27 North Ocean.

CHAIR DAVIS: Excuse me. Is that the Ritz Carlton?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Yes.

CHAIR DAVIS: The Ritz Carlton.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: And if you collectively took all those condos, the Ritz Carlton probably would be number one if we aggregated the values of the condos. And the Marina Grande, if you aggregated those condominiums, would likely be number two. But as individual property you can see that the Ritz Carlton, one single unit, ranks number three. Followed by Publix at Blue Heron. And then Newport Cove, the marina at 22nd Court. So I think it's an interesting look. And one of the

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

good things about this is you can see the fact that there is not one single property, even though the Ritz Carlton and Marina Grande represent a number of condos, that there isn't one single property that reflects sizable value in the CRA, so we have a diversity of properties that is probably also contributing to the fact that our revenue trend has remained steady, and remained steady even in the worst of times.

So that is sort of my primer on TIF. I'll keep going and then what I might do in each section, I may just stop in case you want to probe or ask me questions.

Oh, I guess I do have another slide. And so when we think about our future and are we done, is there an opportunity, have we matured, and I will say to you that we have not. In the next 10 years, if we just grew at a 4% rate, I'm projecting that our tax revenue would grow from about 7.6 million to 11 million. We have opportunities still at the marina and around the marina. We have opportunities at and around the Ocean Mall. And the Broadway corridor is a significant opportunity.

I'm not going to go much into the opportunities in the marina because I'm going to talk about that when we talk about Marina Village. But again the message, and you'll hear me say this several times, is that we must put private development on city-owned land. And whether it's the CRA's pocketbook or the City's pocketbook, that we are subsidizing these values until we get private development that can allow an additional return to

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

our city so that we can reinvest it in other areas. And that waterfront is important in showing that the Ocean Mall is catalytic to what is appearing to be a blighted influence even from Ocean Drive to Blue Heron immediately east of the bridge. And then the Blue Heron corridor is an opportunity.

And we've studied this and we know that between Broadway and the Port, just on Broadway and Avenue E, that there are significant clusters of ownership where we've identified five model blocks and have examples as to what we can do under current zoning codes.

And the blue represents the marina development and the catalytic impact we want it to have along the Broadway corridor.

So if I may spend a few minutes on Marina Village, because for us, if I looked at this, and wearing my former corporate hat, and to talk about where -- what are the drain on our earnings, it is the Marina Village and the operational expense that's created, and the amount of time we are projecting it's going to take us to put private businesses on city-owned land.

When we look at the marina uplands enterprise, we're telling you that we're going to lose about 1.6 million dollars this year. And that loss is largely attributed to, as I said, no private development on city-owned land. Everything that has been built, everything that is standing in our new marina are all public facilities.

We are paying the City -- now this loss is perhaps, well, I

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

would say it's somewhat misleading in terms of the loss, but the expenses are real. The loss is somewhat misleading because of this 1.6 million dollars that the CRA is losing, we are paying the City 1.2 million for the ground lease. So instead of a dollar a year, we're paying the City 1.2 million. So if you looked at that and you said, well, we're paying ourselves, if you deducted that, then the impact to the CRA is about 400,000. And I'm going to come back to that because this was the item you focused on during the retreat, as to why should the City provide grants for programs. And when we were -- when we looked at the impact of how we structured this deal, making assumptions as to who would receive the FP&L money, we did this because we thought at the time the CRA would be better poised to absorb the losses. But now the City has used this funding to borrow, and so to reverse it would be problematic. So theoretically even though we're paying the City 1.2 million, it goes from one pot to the other and so the real impact to us is about 400,000.

And that 400,000 can also be attributed to the fact that we're projected to pay next year Viking a little under $400,000 to lease land for parking; and that's predicated on whether or not you approve the abandonment of old 13th Street, which then gives us site control of their parcels at 13th and Broadway for at least a five-year period of time for temporary parking.

CHAIR DAVIS: Excuse me, Mr. Brown.

That slide, we're talking about the CRA paying 1.2 million

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

to the City for ground lease. If the City's property values increase, would that number change? The appraised value?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Yes. Well, when we negotiated this, one of the things that the City, we negotiated that after a year, that they could reappraise and whatever the new appraisal was, that would set the new rate.

CHAIR DAVIS: And that begins next year?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: It does. And the City has shared the appraisal. And I've yet to pay to have it critiqued. But based on the City's updated appraisal, they would have the legal right to tell us that our new rate goes from 1.2 million to 2.4. And if they did that, I would come to you and say there is no way that the CRA can carry this property and therefore we should return it to the City. I just would need to be real frank about it.

CHAIR DAVIS: Okay. And what impact would it have on the bottom number?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Well, again, the bottom number -- if we said the City is unrelated --

CHAIR DAVIS: Okay. I see what you're saying.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: If we said the City is unrelated, then really the bottom number is 400,000, because we're paying ourselves.

I've used the word CAM. Just for our viewing audience, CAM is the net charges billed to a tenant in a commercial lease;

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

that when you have commercial property, you're allowed to have those tenants pay for what they call the pass-throughs; so the cost of utilities, the cost to cut the grass, and the water, and the electricity, are all expenses that you can pass on to your commercial tenant based on a percentage of the space that they occupy. So I'll use that word CAM a lot, and I just wanted to define it.

CHAIR DAVIS: Let me ask you a question. When it comes to those leases, the restaurants that are projected to be coming to the City, so they're required to participate in the CAM. Do CBRE participate in the CAM?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: No, CBRE is not a tenant. They're our commercial broker. What CBRE does for us is to illustrate to them, you know, what is the cost to lease the ground plus the CAM.

And if you were a fly on the wall you will find that with these restaurants the amount of CAM and what they're going to pay for CAM, the common area maintenance, is more significant to them than what they're going to pay in the base rent.

So if you looked at the Ocean Mall for instance, that the base rent and CAM means that they're paying about $32 a square foot. And so how we charge, and making sure that our common area maintenance budget is as low as it could be, we're finding that to be a significant condition in our negotiations to attract tenants.

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

So let me break down the expenses. So this is a real expense, whether it's the City or the CRA, even if you said we -- well, when you include the lease. So we're talking about 2.5 million dollars of expenses. The upland, the cost of maintaining the upland expenses, is about 51% of that number. The Event Center is about 37%. And then we also have responsibilities to maintain Bicentennial Park. So when you break down that 1.5 million in upland and Bicentennial Park expense, as I mentioned it includes the $388,000 that we're paying to Viking in the form of a land lease for parking, it includes the 1.2 million in the ground lease that we're paying to the City. The offset to that is that the City is paying the common area maintenance expenses up to the time and through the time that we attract private development. So as we attract private development that begins to pay CAM, the City's subsidy, the amount that it pays for CAM, is reduced. And so even from the City's perspective, the pace to which we can get private development at the marina is beneficial to both of us. Because for us it produces or it provides an offset to our costs for the ground lease, and then for the City it offsets a cost to their subsidy of the CAM expenses.

So the strategies that we employ in looking at the crystal ball is that with the city manager we felt that it was, it would be impractical to recommend to you to reverse the lease terms; and as we discussed, primarily because the City has used that

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

revenue to borrow against it, and it would then probably mean that they would be non-complaint in some of their loan covenants; and so they've identified other buckets of money that they could offset our costs, and one of those are the program expenses. And I have a couple of slides to make some recommendations to you regarding that.

The other decision to be made by this body is how prudent is it for us to be leasing land long-term for parking, knowing that it's the parking factor that is the impediment to private development; and to what extent should we start focusing on acquiring property or building a parking garage and doing all those other things more mid to long-term so that we control the destiny and the pace to which we attract private development.

So to break down the Event Center expenses for you: $946,000 is paid for the Event Center expense. It includes the CRA paying $298,000 to the Event Center, LLC, the entity that was created to borrow money to build this facility. The money that we pay to the Event Center, LLC, they use that money to service debt.

CHAIR DAVIS: Excuse me. Who is "they"?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: The Event Center, LLC.

CHAIR DAVIS: Who are the members?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: It is a single owned LLC by the Riviera Beach CDE. The members of that board include myself, Scott Evans; from the city, Natalie Moore; John Howard -- so

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

three city employees: Myself, Scott Evans, Natalie Moore representing the City; John Howard, president of the Black Business Investment Corporation; and Zar Yassine, who has a local business on Broadway.

CHAIR DAVIS: So Scott Evans, yourself, Ms. Moore, John Howard?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: And Zar Yassine.

CHAIR DAVIS: I know Zar. Okay.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: And the structure is such that when you form a community development entity -- as you know, we have applied several years, we have an application outstanding now where we're seeking over 30 million dollars in New Markets Tax Credits to put towards the parking garage and the public market; and that the structure of the board meets the community accountability test set by the U.S. Department of Treasury, and it allows us to say that you, this body, control the Riviera Beach CDE by its staff; and the bylaws indicate that the only investments it makes are the ones in which you've approved.

MR. HAYGOOD: In the plan.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: You want to -- please.

MR. HAYGOOD: The tie in to make sure that there was a nexus between the CRA and this board, they can only undertake projects within your CRA plan.

CHAIR DAVIS: Does it have to come back before the board?

MR. HAYGOOD: I don't know that they do but -- I don't

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

think so. Only because it depends on the plan. But it has to be something that you have in your plan. In other words, they couldn't go out and just do their own project. So that was the nexus.

There was a -- if I recall correctly, there was a line that we could go up to. In other words, you couldn't have direct control, it couldn't be a governmental controlled body. So we thought to ensure we were putting in the safeguards, that it had to be a CRA project that was undertaken; and to control the membership, the majority of the board would be members of either City staff or the CRA staff.

CHAIR DAVIS: How often do they meet?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Quarterly.

CHAIR DAVIS: Quarterly.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: And in fact when you're certified by the Department of Treasury to be a community development you have to designate your business area. And the business area that we designated is the City of Riviera Beach. You can do the city, the county, the state, nationally, or regionally. So we've been certified to be a community development in a -- whose business strategy is only to focus in the City of Riviera Beach. And in fact this CDE could make investments and could do projects throughout the city. The only area that does not qualify for New Markets Tax Credits are the two census tracts on Singer Island. So pretty much every other

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

census tract in our city, with the exception of the two tracts in Singer Island, are eligible for New Markets Tax Credits type of investments.

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: How were these employees selected?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: I created the CDE, so my expertise was important in order to win it. Scott, being our director of development and planning, his expertise was important to denote. Initially we had Mary McKinney as the director of community development. We got a legal opinion, they sort of felt that maybe that was a conflict. And so we wanted to look for a city employee whose job responsibility would still meet the government test for community accountability; and so it was recommended that Natalie Moore serve.

CHAIR DAVIS: By who?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: I think by Ms. Jones.

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: She recommended that based on the parameters that were set by who?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Based on the fact that we wanted to ensure that the board met the community accountability test to be certified as a community development entity.

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: And that requirement comes from where?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Comes from -- it's a federal regulation, the Department of Treasury.

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: What happens if any of these employees are no longer employees, do they automatically come off? Or what happens?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: I think our bylaws designate that it's the CRA executive director; so if I'm no longer your executive director, whoever you replace --

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: No, I mean everybody, all three: Scott, Tony, Natalie, what happens --

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Michael, do you recall the bylaws?

MR. HAYGOOD: I don't offhand. But certainly if they weren't employees -- the bylaws require them to be city employees or CRA employees. So if they're no longer CRA or --

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: So what I'm saying is, someone would need to go and change that and make sure that it's removed?

MR. HAYGOOD: We would have to change the person. In other words, they would no longer be eligible if they no longer work for the City or the CRA.

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: Okay. And we have a mechanism in place to make sure that --

MR. HAYGOOD: In the by -- yes, ma'am.

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: I'm not saying anybody is going anywhere. But I do know that there have been times when people have left the City, they still have property, they still

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

have numerous things. So I just want to make sure that if that occurs, you know, they're not still on that -- listed as a member.

MR. HAYGOOD: No, they would not be qualified for the board under those parameters in the bylaws.

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: And who makes sure that they come off? I mean who checks to make sure they're no longer working and then they're coming off --

MR. HAYGOOD: Well, let's put it this way: If in fact we attempted to do another deal, I would have to issue a legal opinion that the board was validly constituted, and I wouldn't be able to do that.

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: And how often to you have to do that?

MR. HAYGOOD: Whenever you do a deal. If I do an opinion --

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: So if we never did one, no one would --

MR. HAYGOOD: Well, I wouldn't say no one but it wouldn't necessarily be where I would have to actually sign. But it's in the bylaws so the board wouldn't be properly constituted.

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: Well, we have a lot of things in writing and we don't always follow them. So I'm just trying to find out is a person who no longer works for the City still allowed to be on this LLC?

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

MR. HAYGOOD: No.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Ms. Hatcher has a response too.

THE CLERK: I type the minutes for the Event Center, LLC, and the CDE. So upon roll call -- and I also maintain the files, the records. So upon roll call, or upon notification, I will in return inform the executive director and Michael if one of the employees is no longer employed with the CRA or the City.

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: So you would be the person, the checks and balances.

THE CLERK: Yes, ma'am.

COMMISSIONER HUBBARD: Mr. Chair.

CHAIR DAVIS: Commissioner Hubbard.

COMMISSIONER HUBBARD: Okay. This is almost like the CDC that's created. It uses the name the Riviera Beach CDC --

MR. HAYGOOD: CDE.

COMMISSIONER HUBBARD: Okay. I said this is almost like the CDC, in relation to the CDE.

So let me say this: For employees to create an entity that has a separate set of bylaws, that all -- that does not have any authority or attachment to the City itself, if I'm hearing you guys correctly, the only thing that is put in -- that was put into place is this, is merely that the -- you have stated inside your bylaws that the service area is going to be the City of Riviera Beach. This entity consists of employees of the city and a, and a business person from the city. If, you know,

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

this -- there -- this just seems a little convoluted to me; as does the CDC and its relationship to the CRA and to the City of Riviera Beach. I don't -- you know, it's something to be said for an entity that can go out and borrow money on behalf -- or let me say this: That can go out and do projects on behalf of the City of Riviera Beach and we don't really have any kind of authority over it if -- you know, when the rubber meets the road we don't have any authority over this entity at all. It's set up autonomously. But it does consist of Riviera Beach employees. And I find that a little odd.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Ms. Hubbard, I think there's an opportunity -- the previous board all had a chance to attend a New Markets Tax Credits conference and it would be my recommendation with your travel budget that we recommend that you do the same.

The Riviera Beach CDE was created for one purpose, and that was to raise private capital to help us fulfill our mission. And the significance of that is, is that in its short history it has raised, subject to receiving tax credits, it has raised 100 million dollars. One hundred million dollars. Fifth Third Bank, BB&T Bank, have pledged significant amounts of money. And in fact even Palm Beach County has pledged like 4 million dollars to help with the financing of the marina.

I did this in my prior life, I raised a hundred million dollar fund when I was at Cincinnati; and I supervised the

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

regulations for the program; so I'm considered nationally to be an expert in the program. It hasn't won us tax credits but it has gotten us significant financial pledges.

We cannot do -- I cannot achieve your goal without private capital. And it is by some -- and it has been touted even by Harvard as one of the best federal government programs to spark private capital into low income communities. It was created during the Clinton administration. The rules and regulations were drafted during the Bush administration, that I supervised. And in Mrs. Clinton's platform she's calling for the permanent placement of New Markets Tax Credits to the tune of 7 billion dollars annually. So it for us could be a very viable tool to further our mission.

COMMISSIONER HUBBARD: Mr. Brown, somehow I think you misunderstood me. It wasn't because I'm not familiar with New Markets Tax Credits, which I am; and that I am saying the New Markets Tax Credits tool is not a viable tool to spark or to raise funds for our projects. What I hope you were hearing me to say is the makeup of the LLC and its relationship to the City and the CRA was my concern. Not that the entity or the CDE itself is not a viable tool for us to use to go after New Markets Tax Credits. I'm sorry you heard me to say that, because that's not what I said.

I said the makeup of the entity is what caused me pause, as opposed to it being -- our relationship to it, the CRA's

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

relationship to it, that's what's a little convoluted.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Okay. I will move on to the next slide. And then I'm moving into now is the direction we're going to need related to the operating capital; as I highlight this section, being new initiatives hampered by cash flow constraints. And so I thought I'd sort of sum it up the way I sort of look at our cash flow, that when you consider the tax increment revenues of 7.6 million, the infrastructure refund that we're getting from the City, we have about 8.2 million dollars of revenues coming into the City for next year.

The first order of business is to pay our debt. That's about 3.7 million. And then the Marina Village, as I said, we're losing about 1.5, leaves 3 million dollars after debt service and our obligations to manage the Marina Village that then go towards the cost of operations.

So when we break it down, this is just a summary of our debt service, so you know that the most significant debt payment is to BB&T Bank. They have a first lien on TIF revenues. One of the unique things that we did when we borrowed this money, it did not obligate the City to not one dime. They do have the first pledge of revenues, meaning that if you decided tomorrow to close down the CRA you still are obligated to pay off its debt. And so the first order of business would be to pay BB&T. And then BB&T looks at us and say that we're pretty strong and solvent. They look at our TIF revenues and they realize that

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

our revenues is more than two and a half times greater than the annual amount of debt service. So from BB&T's standpoint they consider us to be quite healthy as a redevelopment agency, realizing that you have no obligation as a member of city council to cover our debt.

The Ocean Mall was restructured so that once the Wachovia debt is repaid in 2022 we will start paying the Ocean Mall funds that was a loan made to -- a grant given to Catalfumo for the beach park and the infrastructure. That money came from an insurance fund. And the CRA is repaying that obligation out of TIF.

So the real story here is that 3 million dollars is available. And when you look at 2016 expenses, we are looking at about 4 1/2 million in operating and programmatic expenses. So this 3 million does not include what we would propose to have and what the City presently have in its budget for 1.3 million to cover program initiatives. And I'm going to talk about each of these: Personnel, operating, marketing, real estate development, and programs.

So the questions -- and these were the questions you raised during the retreat: What programs or initiatives should the City sponsor, if any. And so you were clear in letting me know that the list of things that you would sponsor was still open for this board to discuss; or if not, then what programs do we cut in order to balance the budget.

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

So personnel expenses. This is our current organizational chart.

CHAIR DAVIS: Excuse me. Can you blow that up a little bit?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: I could. But I guess I have to take it out. I think you have a copy.

CHAIR DAVIS: Can't read it.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: You can't read it?

CHAIR DAVIS: No, it's even smaller.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Okay. Let's do this.

CHAIR DAVIS: I guess we have to go through each one so everybody can know what it is.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: That's all right.

COMMISSIONER PARDO: I can read it.

CHAIR DAVIS: I don't have a magnifying glass, Mr. Brown.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Okay. How's this, Mr. Davis?

CHAIR DAVIS: Much better. I appreciate it.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: So just to let you see the flow chart. As you know, Mr. Haygood reports to the board; he doesn't report to me. So the two entities that report to the board are myself and Mr. Haygood.

The administrative assistant you all know is Tamara. She primarily supports me and in general the entire office.

My direct reports have included Scott Evans and Darlene Hatcher. Scott being our director of planning and development;

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

and Darlene our operations manager and public information officer.

Under Mr. Evans we've had Ms. Jenkins as our Neighborhood Services manager, with her team. And this is the org chart back in March. I made some changes for reporting purposes. But also under her, our manager of Neighborhood Services, is Ms. James, Latoya James is our community projects coordinator.

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: Mr. Brown. The one that you gave me on Monday is the current one? Or that's the current one?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: That's the current. I may have made some changes --

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: Up there? That one?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: This one, yes.

And I think the one I gave you, it was probably more current. I did this one back -- this was a PowerPoint I put in as of March. I think you have the one dated June. The only thing that's different there is that Ms. Jenkins is reporting to me.

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: So that was the old one? That's old? The PowerPoint.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Yes. But the bodies are the same.

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: Right, right.

CHAIR DAVIS: Mr. Brown, as you go through each one of

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

those, and as you are describing what their responsibilities and duties are, could you please explain what each position is the salary?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: I'd have to do that from memory. Or I think we may have perhaps given you a copy. Do you --

COMMISSIONER HUBBARD: Where would it be located?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: When we gave each of you briefings we provided individual copies. So you should have that.

CHAIR DAVIS: I don't have that. No, I don't have that. I don't have that.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: I don't know if we brought copies, because we gave them to --

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: She's going to go make copies.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: And actually it may be the other -- this slide. I'll give you the summary, and then I'd like to share the recommendation of what we're proposing here. Because what we're proposing is that Neighborhood Services go back to the City, including the program support that we've provided. We got into the Neighborhood Services business when the City got out during the great recession. They indicated they had a department that for budget reasons they eliminated the department and the individuals in that department. And so we created the Neighborhood Services function and we formed the Community Development Corporation because I understood and

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

understand that the true resources of being able to do neighborhood development will not come from the CRA, will not come from the City, but will largely come to us through the County, with funds provided by HUD to community based organizations like the CDC that we formed.

And so the ambassador program, the public safety, and marine facilities manager is currently reporting to Mr. Evans.

And then under Rod McLeod is our ambassador operations manager, Mr. Spence; and then the equivalent of 9 FTEs or ambassadors.

CHAIR DAVIS: So let me ask you a question. Public safety, Mr. McLeod, what does -- what is his responsibility?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: His responsibility is to run the entire ambassador program, to supervise staff, to make sure that the budget is in place, to -- he has the financial responsibility of paying the bills, meaning utilizing the procurement card to purchase gas; and to make sure that the information from the public is analyzed and that program initiatives are implemented between he and Mr. Spence.

I think I had asked Ms. Hatcher to be prepared. Did we do a summary of each employee's position?

THE CLERK: We did.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Do we have copies?

THE CLERK: No, I didn't make copies.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: All right. So we have --

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

CHAIR DAVIS: Do you want this copy so you can explain to everybody?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Well, Ms. Hatcher, she's our personnel manager; that's one of her responsibilities. Do you want to -- it will give me a chance to drink some water. So why don't I take a break and you take over this part.

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: No, he's going to want it for each one of them so --

CHAIR DAVIS: For each one of them.

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: Make a copy of them, yeah.

CHAIR DAVIS: Well, let's --

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: He can keep going to something.

CHAIR DAVIS: So the ambassadors operations, so what does he do differently from the public safety gentleman?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: One is -- Mr. Spence is in the field and he's working very closely with the team of ambassadors.

In fact, let's see, why don't I just have --

CHAIR DAVIS: Yeah, that's cool.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Where's Rod? Oh, I'm sorry. Rod.

CHAIR DAVIS: Both of them.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Both of them.

MR. McLEOD: Yes, Mr. Spence is responsible for managing

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

the daily activity of the ambassadors. He's also involved in implementing and managing the Neighborhood Watch programs; and also in overseeing the Business Watch programs. He spends a large part of his time dealing with the community, especially Riviera Beach Heights, Park Manor South, in helping those neighborhoods in building this Neighborhood Watch program.

One of his initiatives that we did was implement SmartWater in Riviera Beach Heights, which had a direct impact on the decrease in crime in Riviera Beach Heights.

And then again, as I say, he supervises the day-to-day ambassadors, the clean team ambassadors, the public service ambassadors.

CHAIR DAVIS: Can I hear from him, please?

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: Well, you told us --

CHAIR DAVIS: Yeah, I want to hear what you -- I was trying to find out what you did. And then he can explain to us.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: He's the supervisor but, sure, go ahead.

CHAIR DAVIS: Let him -- Mr. McLeod, what do you do? What's your responsibility? I apologize.

MR. McLEOD: I manage the whole organization. I developed and implemented the Business Watch program, the Neighborhood Watch. I developed all the --

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: What is Business -- I'm sorry. What takes place with the Business Watch? I know the

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

Neighborhood Watch, but what are --

MR. McLEOD: We meet with the businesses in the Riviera Beach CRA, and we discuss issues that we have; we become the advocate for them if they have city issues.

CHAIR DAVIS: So they have a scheduled meeting each month or so?

MR. McLEOD: Yes.

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: When is that?

MR. McLEOD: We have monthly meetings, except for the summer. And typically it's the third Tuesday of every month. They'll start up again in September.

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: What time?

MR. McLEOD: It starts at six p.m.

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: Okay. All right. Thank you.

CHAIR DAVIS: You can finish the list of things that you do.

MR. McLEOD: And I analyze and procure equipment that we use. I analyze what we can do to make our ambassadors more effective. I determine what exactly we need going forward for future work. For example, we've determined and I determined all of the equipment we needed at the Marina Village in order for us to maintain that equipment and maintain that facility in a condition that we all want it to be maintained at. I do the budget, monitor the budget. We're under budget. I work on the personnel, as far as doing reviews of them. And just about

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

everything else that's not covered by Neimah.

CHAIR DAVIS: Thank you.

Mr. Spence, please come and kind of talk about your responsibilities.

MR. SPENCE: Well, one of the things that I do, I created a training program for the ambassadors, where we're a customer service base. And I trained them on not only customer service, conflict resolution, also first aid, CPR.

One of the things that I did create with the Neighborhood Watch program is to get in with the key stakeholders; and also work closely with Riviera Beach Police Department so if there are any crime trends that are occurring we'll be able to create crime prevention strategies that will help eliminate or reduce crime in the community.

One thing that I did with the ambassadors program is we ensured that we go inside of the community, Riviera Beach Heights, so we'll be able to talk with a lot of the residents to see if they was having any issues, and we'll come together and help out with different strategies.

We do a lot of picking up the trash in the vacant lots. In the Riviera Beach Heights community we picked up over 19 bags of trash last month.

Also I created a monthly operations manager report to let everyone know exactly what our ambassadors are doing, along with the different things that I'm doing also.

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

CHAIR DAVIS: And who receives that once that report is completed?

MR. SPENCE: It goes to the executive director, Rod McLeod, and Scott Evans.

CHAIR DAVIS: Okay. Anything else -- as far as the business model that was stated, what do you all do on your level with the businesses?

MR. SPENCE: I meet with the businesses to see if there are any issues that they may be having. And I will create a training program for -- for instance, if we look at our crime stats and we see a high level of credit card fraud, then during the Business Watch I will create a training curriculum to address different issues.

What I also do with the Neighborhood Watch, not only Riviera Beach Heights but we're also in Park Manor South community, we're gathering a lot of interest in other communities who want to establish a Neighborhood Watch program.

MR. McLEOD: One of the other things that we implemented was our --

CHAIR DAVIS: Excuse me. Excuse me.

Before we move any further, did anyone have any other questions for Mr. Spence?

Okay, sir, go ahead.

MR. McLEOD: One of the other things we implemented is what we call our eponics system. And we track all of the matrix of

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

what our ambassadors do day in and day out. So we can tell basically how many interactions they had with visitors, how many interactions they had with homeless, how many interactions they had with businesses where they needed support from either the police or from us to deal with the situation. So we're tracking all the details of what the ambassadors do.

CHAIR DAVIS: How do you track that? How is that tracked?

MR. McLEOD: Beg your pardon?

CHAIR DAVIS: How is that process conducted?

MR. McLEOD: It's done under handheld iPhones; and it's an application that they use and they actually put in the data, what occurs.

CHAIR DAVIS: Okay. I've seen that.

They took a picture of, I think, a sidewalk; and then they put some comments and they send it in; is that what they do?

MR. McLEOD: Yes, that's another.

And we in the past presented eponic reports for you so you can see what exactly our ambassadors are doing.

Also we started, based on an analysis, we determined that we can pick up some of the grass cutting services that the CRA is paying landscaping to do; we can do it internally a lot cheaper; and we've been slowly picking up those properties from our landscape contracts.

CHAIR DAVIS: Any other questions from any members of the board?

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

Mr. Brown.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: We usually have our Neighborhood Services team and our Safe and Clean team give a report at least twice a year. And our goal is to try to do it quarterly. So we'll make that a regular part of our updates to this board.

CHAIR DAVIS: Do you have this with you now?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: I didn't get a copy. But, Ms. Hatcher, she can address whatever questions you have.

THE CLERK: This is the salary. Not the job descriptions.

COMMISSIONER HUBBARD: Question.

CHAIR DAVIS: Ms. Hubbard. Commissioner Hubbard. I apologize.

COMMISSIONER HUBBARD: If the Neighborhood Services moved back over to the City, on the City side, if we chose to keep that arm, the CDC being the separate formed non-profit entity, what function do you -- will it have in connection -- that would be connected with the CRA as well as the City?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: The way we've structured this, the Neighborhood Services team, Ms. Jenkins, Ms. James, they are employees of the CRA. And we have a management contract with the CDC in order to more or less manage its books, records; and we conduct its meetings. So their strength has largely been a paper tiger. The funding that they get from us has been for board training and to leverage. So the question would be, in turning this responsibility back to the City, would be whether

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

or not the City -- and I hope either they could do one of two things, they could take the staff and continue the same model; or they could provide the funding directly to us and we would maintain the model that's been created; or they can provide the grant directly to the CDC and they could hire their own staff.

And I've got the next slide to kind of talk about what those savings would be. And maybe that might be a good way to just segue into what my recommendation is. So the recommendation -- and I'll come out of presentation mode because you can't see the draft. So between the program support that we provide the CDC for board training, we probably would still maintain giving them a grant to manage the community garden. But the total impact of putting this responsibility back to the City would shift about $502,000 of expense back to the City, including CDC program support. And so the City could fund the cost with the grant from the City and we could still maintain the responsibility and focus delivery through the CDC.

So I didn't have any detailed discussion with Ms. Jones, but just recognizing that one of the things that we all had always been challenged with is to make sure that the projects that we were doing were largely in the CRA; that we do see opportunities outside of the CRA, which now makes it even problematic for me to allow the staff, including myself. Because there's one big project requiring a great deal of my time, and it's outside the CRA. And so for the record I do that

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

on my own time -- you like that, Mr. Haygood?

MR. HAYGOOD: Yes.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: -- to not have a conflict.

So making it a responsibility of the City, the CDC could do projects in the CRA or outside and it would probably be a more better model to do it.

CHAIR DAVIS: So --

COMMISSIONER HUBBARD: One of the things --

CHAIR DAVIS: Really quick. No, you go ahead. I'll wait.

COMMISSIONER HUBBARD: When I started my question, one of the things that I was looking at was the -- again I say the, the way the CDC, as with the CDE, the CDC is set up with its own board; and with that autonomy it uses -- it was using CRA employees to staff the CDC. Now the CDC in turn, or the CRA, the CDC pays the CRA for management services? Is that the structure?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: It does not.

COMMISSIONER HUBBARD: So how --

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: But there's a management contract and a grant agreement that specifies our authority. But there is no -- the CDC does not pay the CRA.

COMMISSIONER HUBBARD: Okay. You were saying that -- now how does the management -- what were you saying about the management services? What did I miss?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: When I created the CDC there was

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

two things I wanted to do: I wanted to have a close affiliation with the CRA and so in its bylaws it names me president, as the operating officer. In addition to that we wanted it to be certified under HUD guidelines for a community housing development organization. And it has strict guidelines that it cannot be controlled by government. But yet still we wanted it to have an affinity to this board, and so each of you get an appointment to the CDC board. And then the other members -- so the law specifies really two things: That one third of the members cannot be more, cannot exceed the threshold to be considered government accountability; and at least a third of the board members have to represent the low income community with which the CDC is doing business. So with that requirement, two-thirds of the board members are sort of elected at large by the board; myself and each of you get an appointment. So out of -- there are six members out of a total of how many board members?

MS. JENKINS: 19.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Out of 19 board members you each get one, plus me; so there's six out of 19; and the other 13 members, we try to make sure that at least half of that 13 represent the low income community under the guidelines established by HUD.

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: How are they selected, those people?

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Usually the board, we -- the members of the board make recommendations as to when we have a vacancy who will serve. So the board itself goes through a process of filling it.

And, Ms. Jenkins, is there anything you would like to add?

MS. JENKINS: No, you're doing well.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: I want the whole team to participate.

So -- and the, the real benefit of what this organization has done, largely to the credibility of our Director of Neighborhood Services, Ms. Jenkins, and myself, it gave us immediate credibility with the County. Our City -- and I'm saying this respectfully -- our City, with the staff of Economic Sustainability, has a horrible reputation of executing on grants. And one of the things that they have impressed upon us and in the grant agreements is the expectation of performance. Because if you follow what's happened at the county level, the County's had to give money back to HUD because of performance issues. And so it's been very important to them that we perform. And so the five houses that the CDC is building is largely as a result of the confidence or the new confidence that County staff has in the organization's ability to execute.

CHAIR DAVIS: Do you have any questions?

Let's go back to -- you made your comments about the community garden. How many more years are left on that lease?

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

MS. JENKINS: We have -- I'm Annetta Jenkins, Neighborhood Services. There is approximately three and a half years left, with an option to renew for another five years.

CHAIR DAVIS: So what is the plan right now? What's the current status of the community garden?

MS. JENKINS: It is operational.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: We also have a first right of -- if they were to sell, we also have a first right of --

MS. JENKINS: First right to purchase.

CHAIR DAVIS: Is the operation -- the plants, what are we growing? Who's working? What are the programs? What's going on over there with that?

MS. JENKINS: As you know, Chair Davis, there is a professional gardener who has the management of the garden. The garden has been on a hiatus for the last month because of the summer season for the most part. There are several volunteers who are maintaining the plants there. We have recruited a number of organizations who have pledged volunteer hours to work in the garden. And our garden committee has, they have created several programs that will introduce and make the garden available for residents. For instance, there is an Adopt-a-Plot program that we intend to implement, where residents can adopt a plot and they can come into the garden and grow what they would like. There are a number of organizations who have pledged dollars and time or in kind support where the food that's raised

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

there will be given to food banks. And we've already done that for the last six or nine months, where the harvest has been divided among several elder programs and food banks and the residents in that immediate community.

CHAIR DAVIS: So what have you harvested over the last year?

MS. JENKINS: There have been a number of types of foods, a number of herbs, there have been carrots, collard greens, kale, about four or five types of lettuce, tomatoes, including heirloom tomatoes, about five or six types of tomatoes. They've had radishes, two or three types of onion, turnips, et cetera.

CHAIR DAVIS: How are you all charting how much is being harvested and how much is being given away? How much?

MS. JENKINS: It's being weighed.

CHAIR DAVIS: How many pounds?

MS. JENKINS: Depending upon the type of foods, it's weighed or it's measured by the basket, or half bushel, et cetera.

CHAIR DAVIS: So what type of report do we have in place to kind of show, to demonstrate what's being harvested over the last year?

MS. JENKINS: I didn't bring it with me tonight. I don't have the numbers. I think Ms. James is in the audience and she probably could remember a little better than I can.

But the professional gardener provides a monthly report,

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

which we'd be happy to share with you, where we have a goal for the year and it's tracked on a monthly basis. Volunteers are tracked. The harvest is tracked. The people or organizations that food is given to is tracked.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: And when we get back into -- we're getting back into the flow of the regular meetings since the elections; we will have each of the functions at least give a quarterly update; and usually when Neighborhood Services give their update, they talk about the community garden.

CHAIR DAVIS: Here's my concern. When this item came before us quite some time ago -- and I was totally objected to it for two reasons, three reasons: One, we didn't own the land; two, we didn't have a program in place that would show that it would be sustainable. And based on what I'm hearing today, we still don't have that. Considering that we spent over half a million dollars for the garden. So at what point are we going to make this a priority?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: I think we have a program in place. I feel the program can be improved. And one of the issues is I don't know if our professional gardener should be part-time. And so one of the things we're looking at is whether or not the gardener should be full-time. That's one.

We recently put signage so that the community knows when it's open.

But I won't sit here and say that we can't improve on the

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

efficacy of the program, its interaction with the schools, getting folks to the garden to get community service hours.

I intervened several months ago, established a performance plan for the community gardener; clarified what the roles and responsibilities are between the organization and us, its funder; so that brought a significant amount of clarity to the program, and I think you're going to begin to see a change.

CHAIR DAVIS: How much are we funding this garden now?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: I think 25,000.

CHAIR DAVIS: A month?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: No, a year.

MS. JENKINS: No, about 25,000 a year.

CHAIR DAVIS: So we spent over a half million dollars to build it but $25,000 a year to fund it? There's no way it can sustain itself.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: It has attracted a great deal of other money, grant money. When you look at other models for the community garden it really isn't that cost -- you don't have to put that much money into it. It gets a lot of things donated from Lowes and Home Depot.

CHAIR DAVIS: So why are we spending so much money on it?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Well, I think we need to do better. But what the CDC should do better is the whole community engagement part. And it cannot do that and it has not done that effectively, one, with a part-time gardener; two, with

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

a CRA staff that has other responsibilities. So it would be my strongest recommendation that if you were inclined to turn this over to the City that it gets funded directly to the CDC so it puts in place the appropriate staff to be engaged. Because I think that with the responsibilities of my team doing CRA stuff, and the general expectation, that we have not done well on the engagement part.

CHAIR DAVIS: So what happened differently from when you came before this board and recommended this for approval versus to what's happening now? What changed?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Nothing.

CHAIR DAVIS: Well, you felt comfortable that it was going to be sustainable. So what happened to make it not sustainable?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Is there anything I said that made this program unsustainable? I said it needs to be improved --

CHAIR DAVIS: Well, I know what --

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: -- the engagement part.

CHAIR DAVIS: Okay. With all due respect, I know what you've stated. All I'm asking you, you have yet to provide any documentation showing on how this program is effective. You have no tracking on what's being harvested, how much is being harvested. And I shared these concerns and questions at the very beginning. This is nothing new to me.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Ms. Jenkins indicated --

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

CHAIR DAVIS: What is -- let me ask you a question then, with all due respect. The part-time gardener, how many hours is she required to be there? What time does she get there? What days of the week? What time does she leave? How are we tracking that?

MS. JENKINS: She works 20 hours a week. And I'm doing this from memory, I don't have the schedule in front of me. But it's Wednesday, Thursday, and Friday, 9:00 to 1:00. There's some alternate Fridays when there are evening hours, there's several evening hours; and there are alternate Saturdays and Sundays when the garden is open in the morning. Additionally there are several volunteers that are out there other than those stated hours.

When we have organizations that have committed time, and we have approximately 15 or 20 non-profit organizations and companies that have pledged service hours through the end of the year, they are out there based on a defined schedule when they are able to get the volunteers out.

CHAIR DAVIS: Do anyone else have any questions?

COMMISSIONER DAVIS JOHNSON: I --

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: I have a question.

I'm sorry. Go ahead.

CHAIR DAVIS: Commissioner Johnson. It's her district.

COMMISSIONER DAVIS JOHNSON: So I agree that there is an issue with engagement, and I do believe that we need to do a

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

better job.

For the most part the residents that are directly affected by the garden, we primarily work; and so when you have hours of 9:00 to 1:00 you are excluding a group of individuals that could actually come out and spend some time in the garden. So we need to look at the, we need to look at the overall dynamics of the community to see who is available to come and to volunteer their time.

But then there needs to be a greater job and a more improved job of talking about the garden, the benefits of the garden. Because I remember as a citizen there was some talk about citizens being able to purchase individual boxes, and I don't know that that's available, or it hasn't been expressed to me. Now that may be happening, but that's not something that I'm aware of.

But what I would request, number one, as the district commissioner, to receive those reports, as well as the entire commission. But I think that it's important if you are seeking my support of this, and my continued assistance with the citizens, and just the general oversight and view of the garden, we need to do a better job of communicating what's actually going on within the garden, with the volunteers, within the staff. It is not my intention to micromanage you but it is my intention to understand what is actually going on. And I think that that's the simple idea here that's going on, that we want

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

to be able to know and to be able to see milestones and measurements.

You know, if this family decides they no longer want us to be on this property, you know, we have improved this property to a great degree. So, you know, it certainly behoves us to continue to have that relationship so that we can continue to -- continue the relationship and to continue the lease. And that is at a dollar, am I --

MS. JENKINS: Yes, a dollar a year.

COMMISSIONER DAVIS JOHNSON: A dollar a year.

CHAIR DAVIS: Vice-Chair Miller-Anderson.

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: I just want us to keep in mind, I know you said that we could probably take this over and put it over to the City, but I would like to see different options on how we could possibly combine some of the job responsibilities and split them out amongst those we already have in positions. I, I know everyone has a defined job description but we really need to keep in mind as we move forward how we can combine some of these responsibilities and not have as many spread out all over the place. So just keep that in mind as we move forward.

COMMISSIONER DAVIS JOHNSON: Mr. Chair.

CHAIR DAVIS: Commissioner Johnson.

COMMISSIONER DAVIS JOHNSON: What grant opportunities are out there that are available to help us sustain the gardener or

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

just other issues? I know that we have support from Lowes or from the Home Depot or from the various companies that are here in town, but have we identified any other sources of funding that can support what we need moving forward for the garden?

MS. JENKINS: Yes, we have. Part of what I do is work with our grants consultant, and on my own, and with our garden committee, looking for grant opportunities for this program and others. And there are a number of small grant opportunities typically for community gardens if it is not a cooperative type of garden; which we have not gotten to a model like that yet, where we're charging for the produce, then the grants tend to be small. So we have been mildly successful in getting some corporate and individual support in the last quarter for our Adopt-a-Plot program, and we are going to continue that. I think there's a great opportunity. There are other national organizations and corporations that give grants to garden programs. So, yes, there is a plan to aggressively continue that and to step it up.

CHAIR DAVIS: Any other questions?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: If I --

CHAIR DAVIS: Mr. Brown.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: If I could answer Ms. Miller-Anderson's questions. I didn't go into -- if we moved the Neighborhood Services group as direct staff to the CDC and it was funded by the City, it allows me to flatten my

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

organization.

Mr. Evans' strength is in planning and development. We have several projects still that need to be focused, and so I would have him focus on that. I would take on the direct supervision --

CHAIR DAVIS: Excuse me. You're saying Mr. Evans go over to the City?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: No, I'm saying as my director of planning and development his focus would be on projects, singularly on projects.

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: And what are those projects?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: I'll come to them when we talk about the capital projects. But as you know, we've got the utility burial. We still have construction issues related to the marina. I can address it more fully when I share with you the capital plan.

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: That's fine.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: The parking enterprise --

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: Okay.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: -- those things.

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: What about when Neighborhood Services --

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: So what this chart says is that the City is providing a grant to the extent that the CDC hires its own staff; and that with this funding agreement, we can set

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

the expectation better for performance.

So your influence, your control, is the expectation you set as a grantor to an organization that you expect to do great things in our neighborhood. And what happens, I feel, is the confusion between CDC, CRA, who is actually their staff. And I've had to tell the CDC board that they have no staff other than the part-time community gardeners. So we perhaps have even been at fault for giving the impression that the CRA is the CDC staff.

I obviously am accountable to you. And so I think the clarity of creating a grass roots community based organization would be to work with the board, for them to hire the staff that's needed, and based on a grant agreement that we would present to this body or the City would present to city council -- we haven't gone into the details of it -- that then the performance standards would be established in that regard.

So what this does for me is it gets me back to basics. And whether I'm here or not, my primary recommendation to this body is to focus on getting the marina enterprise to break even to profitability. So the single most priority for me and my staff in the coming year -- and you're going to see this as I get toward the end of this presentation -- is to focus on getting private development at the marina.

So in the chart Mr. Blomeke and Mr. McLeod would report to me. As co-managers there is some synergy between what we want

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

the ambassadors to do at the marina in terms of picking up trash, providing transportation, making sure that those costs are appropriately balanced.

And then the operations manager. I didn't talk about my two accounting specialists. But maintaining -- Mr. Koller maintains the books and records of what we call our affiliate and enterprise operations; and Ms. Bell is our bookkeeper for the CRA books.

And so that flattens our organization and puts the priority where I feel it needs to be for the CRA, assuming you still want us to manage the upland properties. And if not, then we can just focus on new projects and work with developers.

So I just wanted to share that slide. Ms. Miller-Anderson, because you are right, there are opportunities to combine job responsibilities.

But I think for me it was by default that we got into Neighborhood Services. I've said to you individually, this community needs to have the best neighborhood development program. I'm not washing my hands of it. But I think it is a needed service for the improvements of our neighborhoods. Neither the City or the CRA will ever have enough money to do what we need to do to stabilize our neighborhoods and to make sure that Riviera Beach is a community of choice. And I say having a certified CHDO, community housing development organization, that is seen by the County as productive, is the

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

delivery mechanism.

CHAIR DAVIS: So what is your recommendation to the board?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: My recommendation -- and you'll see when I summarize it -- my recommendation is to fund Neighborhood Services through an allocation of the grant funds from the City.

CHAIR DAVIS: So you want the City to pay for it?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Yes, sir.

CHAIR DAVIS: So you want us to give you how much money?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Well, you can -- I can eliminate the cost and expense and you can be direct to the City. But if it flowed through us it would be $502,000.

COMMISSIONER HUBBARD: Question.

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: Out of the one point --

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Out of the 1.3 million budget.

CHAIR DAVIS: Commissioner Hubbard.

COMMISSIONER HUBBARD: So you're saying the City should pay that to the CDC, and the CDC would run the housing service and program coordination initiative?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Yes.

COMMISSIONER HUBBARD: Now -- okay. I don't think that we should put the Neighborhood Services program as it is on the City side. I do think that -- okay, if you have a full-fledged operating CDC and a CHDO certified CDC, what is it that is keeping that entity from getting housing grants, CDBG funds,

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

going after whatever is out there for a real live CDC CHDO to be engaged in?

Because, again, as I stated earlier, my concern is the fact that the structure of the CDC that we have here now, there is -- we have no authority or no jurisdiction with over how it operates or what it does at all. So for us to I guess fund the CDC, if you will, or pay the CDC, that I have a direct concern with. And surely this coming over to the City's side, we would definitely have to have a long talk with Ms. Jones and Mr. Sherman about how it affects us on the City's side.

So moving the -- having Neighborhood Services, surely we need to do that. But how we do that I think is going to be another discussion. We may have to and should maybe move that off the ledger of the CRA, so that's something that you all don't have to worry about funding as well.

And while you have your -- while we're talking about Neighborhood Services and the flow chart is still there, some of the things that I saw, and I mentioned some of them yesterday, was the public safety position and the ambassador operations, I think that's kind of -- for a minute I thought it was a duplication of services. But, still, if you have an administrative assistant and -- that's handling the -- you have someone handling the supervisor staff, that's your ambassador of operations I see here. You have two financial persons that definitely are paying the bills and helping to develop the

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

budgets. So I think that the -- some of the positions are duplicating themselves and need to -- should be eliminated.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Ms. Hubbard, before you -- you made two points. You had two questions. And I didn't want that to go by without answering, because I thought those were two great questions. As it related to the CDC -- before you transitioned into the Event Center and Safe and Clean. As it relates to the CDC, you basically asked the question -- and it's a very good one -- and that is what keeps the CDC from getting money. The bottom line, staff. What has been the advantage of the Riviera Beach CDC is staff. And the day it was formed, I remember Ed Lowery saying that you, we, expect Riviera Beach to be one of the County's high performing CHDOs because we brought to it staff; and most of these organizations are without staff and they work out of largely with the exception of --

MS. JENKINS: Neighborhood Renaissance.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Neighborhood Renaissance -- or I was thinking of the ones that always build houses for volunteers. Habitat, with the exception of Habitat, the County has said that they expect Riviera Beach and Habitat to be its two highest performing organizations.

The other question you raised dealt with your authority with the CDC. It is my great desire and hope that each of you have a huge affinity towards the Community Development Corporation. Your authority, your influence, is the checkbook;

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

it's the grant agreement. If it does not meet your expectation, you don't fund it, period. And that's what any well-founded foundation, corporate sponsor, you're putting your money where the priorities are with the organizations whose performance you expect. And if that performance is not there, you don't fund it.

The other point you raised about the Event Center, and the reason why I'm looking at the restructuring, is Mr. Blomeke has been tremendously overwhelmed with the demand and the interest of the Event Center. And we want to try to leave some time, because we were going to talk about the policies. The amount of inquiries we get, the interest in it, it is almost -- particularly on weekends, it's a 20-hour operation from Friday through Sunday. And let alone at least a 12-hour operation during the weekday. And so we need to give it a tremendous amount of attention with the resources we have, because it is a great asset and we want it to be catalytic for future development. We cannot stumble.

And I'm looking at these positions particularly. Mr. Blomeke has been a one-man operation. We moved the administrative assistant from the Neighborhood Services group to what I'll just call the enterprise operations, so that they have the appropriate staff to take reservations, to answer inquiries, to do all the things --

CHAIR DAVIS: Excuse me. I don't mean to cut you off. But

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

is this the same chart that we approved last year?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: No, sir.

CHAIR DAVIS: So where is that chart? So people can see the difference --

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: It's the one that I showed earlier.

CHAIR DAVIS: That one?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Yes.

CHAIR DAVIS: So now you recommend we go from this chart to the one that's the function expenses for 2016? Is that what you --

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: That's correct.

CHAIR DAVIS: Could you explain the -- so now you're explaining those changes now?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Yes.

CHAIR DAVIS: Okay.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: And so in essence what this chart basically says is that the Neighborhood Services function is not a direct responsibility of the CRA. Whether we have the fiduciary responsibility for the City's funding, or whether or not the City's funding go directly to the CDC or City staff itself, what I'm saying to the board for 2017 is that with your direction and the resources you allocate our focus is getting the marina property developed and to make sure that the responsibilities that we have today, that we're managing those

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

responsibilities well.

CHAIR DAVIS: So what about Neighborhood Housing?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Neighborhood Housing, if you provide a half million dollar grant, either through us, we'll manage the CDC as we've done, or if the city manager would prefer to do it directly, then my only recommendation to her is that it should empower the Community Development Corporation, the CHDO, otherwise we won't receive federal money.

CHAIR DAVIS: So the marina is more important than the neighborhood, is that what you're suggesting?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: No, sir. I'm saying that the City -- we only got into Neighborhood Services because the City got out, sir.

CHAIR DAVIS: Okay.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: And our resources are strained. And you've questioned whether or not the City should provide a grant for the services. So it's an appropriate question. I as a community development professional would say that Riviera Beach should have the best neighborhood development program, but it should not come under a government entity like the CRA or the City.

CHAIR DAVIS: So please explain what each position is entitled to financially, to the public.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: I'm not sure if I understand the question.

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

CHAIR DAVIS: The cost of the restructuring. I asked you a question prior to that, how much each position was getting paid; and that question has yet to be answered. So I can understand where we're going to this position.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Well, I did answer the question of how much each position is paid. We made a copy of the report. You have that.

CHAIR DAVIS: But the public don't have that report. At home, they don't have that. So they need to hear this information. Because whatever decision we make, they need to understand why we're making that decision.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Okay. In essence what I'm reporting to you is that we -- by shifting Neighborhood Services back to the City we're reducing our payroll costs by $222,000, and then the programmatic support by nearly 300,000. And so that responsibility for funding would go to the City. And the resources that we have, we're looking at, overall it will probably end up being about a 6% reduction in payroll costs over the prior year, with this restructuring.

This chart does show adding two more part-time -- actually I need to update this number. I think this asks three and a half part-time ambassadors, for about twelve and a half FTEs that are being assigned to the marina to deal with upland and weekend Event Center responsibilities.

CHAIR DAVIS: So this is the second slide, correct?

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Yes, sir.

CHAIR DAVIS: Okay. So go back to the first slide. Because we're going to go through these one by one, if the board don't mind.

Okay. Director of Planning and Development, Mr. Evans, what does he make? For the public to know.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Have you got the report?

CHAIR DAVIS: Well, she gave you the report.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Ms. Hatcher, would you mind answering --

CHAIR DAVIS: Hold on. You're the executive director.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: But I'm directing the staff --

CHAIR DAVIS: Well, I'm asking you.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: And she has the report, sir.

CHAIR DAVIS: Do you have a copy? You're the executive director, and you don't know this information?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: I do.

CHAIR DAVIS: So would you please answer the question?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: So your question is?

CHAIR DAVIS: How much the director of Planning and Development, Mr. Scott Evans, makes.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: His salary in 2016 is $104,000.

CHAIR DAVIS: So last year, the question I have with that position, last year was that position ever reclassified? Within the last three years.

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: I think it was, because he was given development responsibilities.

Is that correct, Ms. Hatcher?

Ms. Hatcher is our employment -- is our employee officer; so she has the expertise and the history, so that I can answer your question accurately.

CHAIR DAVIS: Okay.

THE CLERK: Yes, the City looked at the job description.

CHAIR DAVIS: So before he was just a regular planning?

THE CLERK: It was planning and -- right, the director of planning. And then it went from --

CHAIR DAVIS: Then it added in addition, development?

THE CLERK: Yes.

CHAIR DAVIS: So what was he making before we reclassified him?

THE CLERK: It wasn't reclassified. They just -- the pay grade remained the same. They just added development on there.

CHAIR DAVIS: So his pay grade remained the same?

THE CLERK: Yes.

CHAIR DAVIS: So they just added --

THE CLERK: Right, the word development.

CHAIR DAVIS: Was he already doing that work before?

THE CLERK: Yes.

CHAIR DAVIS: Okay. So nothing really changed in his status?

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

THE CLERK: Huh-uh.

CHAIR DAVIS: Okay. So let's go over to your position, what was your position before? Operations manager and public information. What was that position before?

THE CLERK: Administrative director.

CHAIR DAVIS: Administrative director.

THE CLERK: Mmhmm.

CHAIR DAVIS: What was that salary before, Mr. Brown?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: I don't have the 2015 number but her present salary now is 68,370.

CHAIR DAVIS: So did her responsibilities change?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Significantly so.

CHAIR DAVIS: Okay. How significant?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: We had the job re-class -- all of our positions are graded --

CHAIR DAVIS: The only reason I'm asking these questions is we have new board members that need to know what happened with these reclassifications.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: And with that, respectfully, I don't want the new board members to think that I arbitrarily gave a salary. So all these positions are rated and graded and assigned a job class by the City.

So once we shared Ms. Hatcher's responsibilities as being the personnel officer, public information officer, managing the internal operations of staff, they reclassified it and gave it a

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

ranking. And she was previously below that job grade. So in 2016 her salary increased to reflect the minimum of the new classification.

CHAIR DAVIS: And what was it before that?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Ms. Hatcher, do you recall?

THE CLERK: 59.

CHAIR DAVIS: So about 10%?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: $9,000.

CHAIR DAVIS: $9,000. Okay. All right. Cool.

How about administrative assistant, that vacancy there, what is that administrative assistant vacancy, what is that entitled to? How much? That one is vacant?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: It's vacant, it has nothing. But I think we have it as a budget item at around 30,000.

CHAIR DAVIS: 30,000. Okay.

So account specialist, and affiliate enterprises. Is that a new position within the last year?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: These are the new positions you approved last year. And both are account payable technicians. One is paid forty-one six. The other one is 52,000.

CHAIR DAVIS: Okay. So there's one that supervises the other? Is that the difference --

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: No.

CHAIR DAVIS: So why the one is making more?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: It's the one that came in. And

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

then one is still on probation; and once they get past the probation period it will be closer to parity.

CHAIR DAVIS: So it goes from 41 to 52 after probation?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: One of them will go from forty-one six to -- and I'm showing for 2016, closer to 50,000.

CHAIR DAVIS: 50,000. Okay.

What's the next position?

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: Does one have more responsibility --

CHAIR DAVIS: That's the question I had. So one does have more responsibility than the other?

Okay. Neighborhood Services. Which is you're requesting this board to send back to the City, correct? Yes or no?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Funding for staff support, correct.

CHAIR DAVIS: So you want the City to fund this position now?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: That is if -- depending on how the City funds it. If the City was to fund the grant to the CDC, I think that's the CDC decision.

CHAIR DAVIS: To refund the grant. So it still come out of our -- from us, correct? To the CDC?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Yes, sir, that's the recommendation.

CHAIR DAVIS: As a grant?

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: That's the recommendation.

CHAIR DAVIS: Okay. So public safety, that position, that's a new position, right? That's the first time?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: No.

CHAIR DAVIS: Last year was the first time Mr. McLeod came on?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: I think he came in 2014.

CHAIR DAVIS: Was it '14?

MR. McLEOD: In February of 2014.

CHAIR DAVIS: '14. Okay. All right.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Sixty-three six.

CHAIR DAVIS: And Mark, the next one.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Since you're going through each position, let me speed this up.

The operations manager for Clean and Safe is 55,167.

The community services coordinator in the Neighborhood Services group, that salary is $72,000.

CHAIR DAVIS: So what is their responsibility?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: They work in partnership with Neighborhood Services. They do the home buyer counseling program. They supervise the community garden.

Ms. Jenkins, is there anything else you would like to add on that position?

MS. JENKINS: Ms. James does the Property of Distinction program, the Houses of Distinction program.

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: So the housing grants that are provided.

MS. JENKINS: Yes.

CHAIR DAVIS: Okay. Was this position reclassified?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: No, sir.

CHAIR DAVIS: This has always been the same?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: The position was graded by the City and not reclassified.

CHAIR DAVIS: Not reclassified.

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: I have a question.

CHAIR DAVIS: One last question and I'll let you have this.

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: It was about what she just said.

CHAIR DAVIS: Okay. Go ahead.

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: For Ms. Jenkins -- not Jenkins. Latoya, Ms. Latoya. You said the Houses of Distinction program?

MS. JENKINS: Yes.

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: Is that a continuous all year program or is that a one time event that occurs?

MS. JENKINS: It's an adoptive program. The board adopted the program a little bit more than a year ago. And it's dependent upon funding. It is currently open. And there are houses that are being assisted currently.

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: How many have we done in the

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

past year?

MS. JENKINS: May I ask Ms. James to come up? She'd have more direct information.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: There have been seven houses that we've provided grants to. This program is funded through the allocation of the BB&T loan proceeds in Riviera Beach Heights. So it's about $150,000 that we've provided on a competitive process. I shouldn't say competitive. We put out a request to a targeted group of home owners. As they respond, they go through a very extensive home inspection process. They choose and select a list of qualified contractors. And so today in the pipeline there are seven homes that are in various stages of completion. We chose the homes around the linear park, and the homes around where we were putting in new sidewalks, in an effort to have what we call a cluster impact, so it just didn't just spread around and you wouldn't see it.

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: From beginning to end, how long does it take for one home to be completed?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: What I've seen, the tracking, the pipeline, it has -- from start to finish it's been taking about eight months.

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: And that's an 8-hour job, every day, five days a week?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: I think it -- it's what I call the ebbs and flow. In the process of making folks known about

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

the opportunity, it's full-time for an extensive period of time. In selecting and reviewing and working with the inspector, it probably is -- it takes a great deal of time. Ms. James can speak to it. But it depends on what stage we're in.

And so the -- and I've said this to my staff in terms of what I would like to see in the way of having a highly productive housing development arm is that between our housing grant program and the seminars that we have to qualify people for homes, I find that process to be very labor intensive in terms of getting the dates, promoting the workshops, the houses. So when you add a cluster of projects, it makes it a full-time job.

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: Right, I understand if it's seven. I mean, but is it always seven at one time? I mean, is there a time when there may only be one and, if so, are the hours, are they less? I mean, does it -- out of a whole year, is she working or has enough work for 40 hours a week?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Yes. I think, if I may infer on your question, if we run out of funding and we can't fund that program, and her time has not been allocated to some other resource, then you can question whether or not that position should and ought to be full-time.

But now, in between the variety of programs that we're doing and the opportunities that we have as a start-up -- it is still a start-up operation if you consider our entry into

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

Neighborhood Services, that there is plenty of opportunities between writing for grants, doing feasibility studies, putting on seminars, managing the grant program, that it is and can be a full-time responsibility, especially if those programs are funded.

CHAIR DAVIS: Commissioner Hubbard, do you have anything?

COMMISSIONER HUBBARD: Well, the only thing that I would say about the Neighborhood Services is that, one, if we, the City would -- the City needs to provide Neighborhood Services program. I'm not sure if, again, if we need to provide it through the CRA slash CDC.

I think that we need to find -- we need to -- we need to in this organizational chart deal with how much that we can cut when we get to the City's side; then we'll look at where we can put Neighborhood Services type programs if we can't, if we can't fund them on the CRA side.

The other thing that I wanted, that I wanted to say is that a -- someone from the administrative assistant could really do the list of things that was listed that the public safety director is going to have to do.

I wanted to ask you, why, why was there a need for two account, accounting specialists?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: In this past year your organization flowed through 40 million dollars worth of check activity; the bulk of which was all the DPOs, direct purchase

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

orders, the draw requests, the process of following the bank's requirement, so with 40 million dollars plus worth of activity and cash, where this organization did not have a financial infrastructure, meant I had to give it a great deal of attention quickly. And so the two specialists, we had one who had done an outstanding job, found that the growth and the complexity of the agency was perhaps too much for one person, and so the two resources allowed us to sort of separate responsibilities. And in addition to that it provided more accountability because now one can do the billings and the accounts payable and have a separate resource to write checks, and even better manage any potential fraud.

COMMISSIONER HUBBARD: With the City's finance department and one other person, those responsibilities, are those something that the City can do?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: They can. I wouldn't recommend it, given what I've seen happen to CRAs and cities in other parts of the state where the monies have been commingled and issues have arose. So I would not recommend it.

COMMISSIONER HUBBARD: Well, I wouldn't recommend that they commingle the funds. I would definitely make sure that the person that's responsible for handling the CRA finances be in charge of just that, handling the CRA finances; so therefore when you come to the check cutting, or whatever, you have somebody that's just responsible for the CRA services or

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

services that the CRA needs.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: But what I've talked to Mr. Sherman about more than just the bookkeeping responsibilities, is more of a more senior accountant that understands GASB and all this other stuff.

You know, I know the City is looking at changing its accounting system. We need to change ours. Quick Books is inadequate. So I don't necessarily know that it would be the same amount of activity -- and listening to Mr. Sherman, it seems like he is challenged on keeping up with his own pace. But clearly the expertise of knowing where the debits and credits should be, considering that at the end all of our financial records are consolidated.

We're going through this frustration now with the auditors in terms of how we report two separate books, to let you know that your money is being well kept and that we're following the right process. And then the frustration of being able to identify the elimination so that we report a consolidated financial statement.

We are not required to do a separate audit. And in fact the City's audit includes our financial information. I've taken the extra step of, one, maybe call it an overabundance of caution, but given the magnitude of our investments, and even the complexity of the organization structures I've created, I felt it would be very prudent for me to report to you a very

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

independent assessment of our financial performance.

CHAIR DAVIS: And who is going to conduct that?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: We use the same auditor as the City, HCT.

CHAIR DAVIS: And when are you going to do that?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: As soon as they complete it.

That would be another 15-minute discussion, in terms of the frustration that I think both the City and the CRA is experiencing.

Just as a checkpoint, I think that there are some other hot button issues that I have in this presentation, that I can move as fast, Mr. Chairman, as you would like me to, or as slow and we can just -- when we run out of time we can continue.

CHAIR DAVIS: There's almost roughly 15 minutes. So I'll ask the board to try to hold the questions so that you can get through it. And then what we'll do is ask some of those questions at the end of the regular CRA meeting. Because this one start, we advertised, at 7:45.

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: It didn't say immediately after?

CHAIR DAVIS: No, it said 7:45.

Can we do it immediately after?

THE CLERK: Right. It was properly noticed in the Palm Beach Post as immediately following the budget workshop.

CHAIR DAVIS: Okay. So we can keep going.

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

Go ahead, Mr. Brown.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: So just moving to the operating expenses, in 2016 we had a little over a million dollars in operating expenses. When you break it down between rents and office expense, it accounts for 34% of that.

We broke up professional services into three categories: One for admin, operating, and real estate.

Travel represents 9% percent.

And, Ms. Hubbard, to the question you raised, we do buy services from the City, and so that number represents 9%.

Our recommendation -- and I'm going to go through the professional services because I know that's another one of your hot button topics. But in looking at the board travel, it's our recommendation, we find that some of you travel, some don't, that we would recommend that we re-set board travel to be the greater of either your rollover balance or 10,000. So that those of you that did not travel may have over 10,000 in your budget, and those that you did, in most cases no one has less than 7,000, we would propose to reset it to 10. And so you can each give me your feedback or you can talk about it.

We're looking to cut staff travel by about $10,000 and a big part of that affects the budget travel for your executive director.

CHAIR DAVIS: How much did you spend in travel the last year?

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Total -- there's a budget of 90,000; 50,000 is board travel and 40,000 is staff and executive director.

CHAIR DAVIS: That's the entire staff?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Yes, and with the bulk of that being me. So 50/40, board/staff.

CHAIR DAVIS: So how much did you spend on travel this year?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: I think the budget for me is 25.

CHAIR DAVIS: At this point, this year?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: I spent less than 25.

CHAIR DAVIS: Okay. Anybody have any questions for Mr. Brown?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Professional services, admin. It's really two areas, two categories. It's our legal expense which accounts for 78% of the number. And we're at about that pace, at about 235,000. And 10% -- I'm sorry. 22% is our lobbying expense, and we work -- we have a separate contract with the City's lobbyist, Sean Pittman.

We think that we can cut our legal expense by about 10%. Our legal expense is a function of activity, volume, you know, between --

CHAIR DAVIS: How are you going to do that?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: I think it's just in conversation with Mr. Haygood, you know, we've had outside

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

counsel for construction litigation, we've had to review contracts, so the legal expense really is a function of activity; and I just think that we'll have less other volume beyond general administration.

Lobbying is the same in that we're going to have Mr. Pittman focus with the agricultural department and the public market, and so have more of an intensive strategy. But 235,000 is what's in the budget for professional services and will likely be what we would propose for next year.

In the budget for professional services operations, it's our finance and auditor and our grant writer. When you look at this number as a percentage of professional services operations, City services then account for 28% of this category. Our technology consultant is 14%, and all other is 5. Largely because of the grant writer we're going to look to double the finance and audit number; it will go from about 30,000 to -- actually it goes from 60,000 to a little over $100,000. No change in City services. And the technology number is going to increase but we'll have a way to allocate some of that to the Event Center; and that number is likely to go up twofold.

CHAIR DAVIS: Mr. Brown, right now I know the City is currently restructuring, revamping its whole IT department. Is that something that you all can piggyback off of and have some cost savings in the future?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: In fact, the City used to

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

provide IT services for us and they gave it back, because of our demand, they just couldn't handle it.

THE CLERK: Mr. Brown is correct. They couldn't handle our demand. And then not only that, at the time our infrastructure was greater than the City's, it was more advanced than the City's at the time, our servers. So it was like a learning curve, the City's IT department, you know, they were spending a lot of time trying to learn our system, and it was causing too much time.

CHAIR DAVIS: Well, my concern is probably to reach back out to the City and have a conversation considering, you know, they're getting back in front of that, to see if there is a cost savings; because we're getting ready to allocate a lot of funding on the City side for that master plan, to address that, so there can be some cost savings. Now is the time to have that discussion.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Absolutely.

This other number, when we do the budget you're going to see it in a different category, because one of the things we're trying to clean up is the profit and loss statement, so it provides a good, better analytical picture. But right now in 2016 for professional services we had real estate in the budget for about 120,000. It has spent less than that. We think we can reduce it, plus move the line item to a category we have under our real estate department called development allowances;

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

and that's going to be a better way to track what we're spending when we're doing due diligence for real estate or we're doing due diligence in analyzing a potential lease that might come to the Event Center. So it pretty much is just going to be a correction in how we reclassify our income statement.

Marketing and events. We're proposing that we increase this number by 125,000; in a partnership with the City, the CRA budget would account for 125,000. And that's largely the services of our public relations firm that account for 52% of this number. Special events -- and actually I think I probably need to update that slide because the percentages doesn't seem right.

When we break down the number of what's in the budget for 2016, it's our public relations firm, special events, printing and design.

And then the other category of about 10%.

Sponsorships is we buy ads, if you will, or tickets for non-profit functions, and that falls in that category, and that's about been about 6% of the expense.

The recommendation for the --

CHAIR DAVIS: How much have we spent in sponsorship this year?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Excuse me?

CHAIR DAVIS: How much have we spent in sponsorship this year?

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: 25,000.

And so I think the Najee event this past weekend is an example of where either for a non-profit organization or for an event that we put on for ourselves is having a fund that with -- and we're going to talk about this a little bit if we still have time, on getting direction from you for the Event Center policy. But having a resource to continue to bring foot traffic to discover our marina, we're finding it to be beneficial for both meeting space as well as getting inquiries for folks who want to do restaurants along the waterfront.

Real estate development. In this line item the budget is about 625,000. When you look at the 2016 breakdown, half of that is for real estate that we own that we provide property maintenance. We expect that number to go up a little bit because of the linear park. At MLK and Australian we're going to create another pocket park, and those things will create carrying cost expense.

Transportation and parking is a new line item that we're going to propose to have increased funding, given our desire to charge for parking at the marina and increase our parking capacity.

Development allowances is sort of a catch-all for the variety of consultants we use to do appraisals, to do property inspections. We've had a real estate advisor as we've negotiated with Viking, that comes out of that number.

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

Acquisitions and development. This number has been low in the past couple years. In prior years it's been as much as a million dollars plus when we were acquiring property. This past year we had $171,000 in the budget for acquisitions and we spent nothing. So that number will be low, because as I'll share with you, we wanted to put the focus in increasing our parking capacity so that we can attract private development at the marina.

So this begins to sum up what we talked about. If you were inclined to provide funding for the variety of programs that we have, it's about 2.8 million dollars, 2.9.

Neighborhood Services. I'm showing that -- and the numbers are a little different because the CRA probably would still provide some funding for the community garden but we would recommend that the City cover Neighborhood Services, the CDC function, to the tune of $500,000.

We're looking at getting land available where there's just the temporary parking at Spanish Courts. Or whether or not the deal we're looking at with Viking, we're looking at about $900,000 to do temporary parking at the marina; and so we're requesting about 550,000 of that would come out of the City's program sponsorship funding, and 350 would come from the CRA.

Special events, as I indicated, 375; 250 from the City, 125 from the CRA. With this reallocation we think we can absorb the Ambassador program, especially if we have cost savings by

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

putting some of the staff as a common area maintenance expense; which is already being picked up separately by the City so we're not double dipping.

The Capital Access Program would be funded by the CRA at this next year's installment of about 250,000, which would be matched by our community lending partner.

And then the Community Boating Program is the last year for the Community Boating Program.

So between the TIF revenues and what we projected in our working capital reserves, which we estimate we would probably need to use about 600,000, maybe as much as 700,000 of our reserves, which at year end we estimate will likely be about 2.7 million.

And I think that's sort of summarizing in a sense what we would do for the programs and initiatives.

Looking at the capital projects, the question Ms. Miller-Anderson raised is the capital projects and what for. The money that we've had to do capital projects has largely dwindled, because we've completed our responsibilities at the marina. You still have a significant amount of money for the utility burial at Broadway. And we still have about a couple hundred thousand dollars left for the allocation made for Riviera Beach Heights. And we suspect that by the time we get to the September 30th, that the only funding for projects that we'll have will be in 2013 about two million dollars set aside

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

to bury the utility lines from the Port to Blue Heron. And if you didn't think that that was still your priority, that money could be redirected.

COMMISSIONER PARDO: Mr. Chair.

CHAIR DAVIS: Yes, ma'am.

COMMISSIONER PARDO: Okay. So, Mr. Brown, how come you haven't moved forward with burying the lines?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: The biggest issue has been getting utility easements; and the most of those were associated with Viking, and then the BB&T property at Broadway and Blue Heron; and so FP&L was not going to move forward until we could provide them all the utility easements. And so we had a few holdouts, and the remainder is tied in this escrow agreement with Viking.

Mr. Haygood, is there anything else you know about that and want to add?

MR. HAYGOOD: No. What I don't know offhand -- Scott is not here -- whether the easements were conditioned upon the abandonment. I'm not sure.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: I'm not sure either.

COMMISSIONER PARDO: So can you, you know, by the next meeting, can you have that answer for us, please?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Yes.

COMMISSIONER PARDO: Because this money has been sitting there for quite a while; and I would really like to know if

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

Viking is holding us hostage on that.

COMMISSIONER HUBBARD: Question.

CHAIR DAVIS: Yes, Commissioner.

COMMISSIONER HUBBARD: Why -- how long has they been waiting for us to bury, to bury the utility lines?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: It was part of the original allocation we made when we first borrowed the money in 2011. What we find, that it's a very extensive process with working with the utilities, not only FP&L, but you've got the telephone company, the cable company. If I'm not mistaken, I think the lines have been buried for the cable and the telephone company. FP&L is the big gorilla in the room; they dictate the engineering, they dictate who to hire, and they dictate when to start. So we've --

MR. HAYGOOD: I'm not sure they --

COMMISSIONER HUBBARD: I'm sorry. What I find I guess funny is that we don't know about Viking's intent. Have we approached them? Have we talked to them? And I'm assuming that we have. What did they say about us coming, encroaching upon their easement and that we need to get this done? Because this would benefit them as well as us.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: And --

MR. HAYGOOD: They've agreed to it. I mean they've agreed to it now. But it was a very -- and Scott was more intimately involved with it than I. But it was a very involved process.

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

As Tony has said, not only are we talking about FP&L but every utility that had a line on the pole had to be accommodated.

COMMISSIONER HUBBARD: Sure. But, okay, if they're waiting for us, we don't want them to not go forward with being willing to do their part, because we haven't gotten the ease -- we haven't gotten them the easement signs or provided them with what they need. And I still find it strange that we don't know if -- okay, if Viking is saying they'll go along with it, we should have it. And you're saying now you don't know whether that's contingent upon the closing of the road. That's something that we need to know. We need to know all those things. If that's the case then, you know, that puts us in a whole different mindset as well as position.

MR. HAYGOOD: Yeah. I just can't tell you offhand.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: I don't think it is. But we should --

MR. HAYGOOD: It's in the agreement. I know that it's addressed in the exchange agreement.

COMMISSIONER HUBBARD: For what?

MR. HAYGOOD: For the easements. In other words, the exchange agreement that's already been signed, not the other part, that's already been signed, was a comprehensive agreement; so it didn't just cover the exchange of those properties but it also covered the easements, it also covered --

COMMISSIONER HUBBARD: Why did you group them all together?

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

We should have left them apples and apples and deal with one thing at a time so that we don't get it all convoluted. Because if that's not the deal -- we don't -- you know, we don't want to tie up everything, we don't want to -- we want to leave ourselves some, you know, form of leverage to deal with. And that's my concern, I guess, with our, our, our, the way we negotiate.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Well, Ms. Hubbard --

MR. HAYGOOD: We didn't -- they put it in the deal.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: I mean we were going to -- they had agreed and we went to closing on just the land swap for the public market. They withheld those documents for an entire year; even to the extent that we sought legal counsel and felt that we had a claim to litigate. And so they did not want to piecemeal. So in these negotiations -- and I've reported to the board lengthy -- and I would love to give you one-on-one update so I don't take up more time, to show you the history of the negotiations. What was supposed to have been a 90-day process took 20 months.

COMMISSIONER HUBBARD: This is my final question on this topic. The easement, they knew that the ease -- that FP&L was waiting to get this easement document, or signed off on, and that whatever FP&L does it's going to benefit the whole redevelopment area and not just us. And so would you say that they've been waiting, FP&L has been waiting at least 20 months

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

for us to get this done?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: At least it was all predicated on having all the easements so that they could get started all at one time and not have to start and stop.

The original plan was to do all -- my words. Not what the engineers would say -- when they were redoing Broadway, the plan was to put the tunnel or whatever you would need to do for the lines simultaneously; and then that created a problem where their contractor basically kicked us off the job because it was delaying them and it was complicating the process. So that was, so that was the first hurdle we ran into in terms of trying to do things simultaneously when Broadway was being redone.

MR. HAYGOOD: And these easements, they aren't like right-of-way easements; they're easements actually on the property. So most of the actual, I don't know what you call them, boxes or something, for the power, the boxes had to go on their land, so that was really the easements that we were looking at. So if I was to show you a map, each piece of property -- not each piece. But on several pieces of property that Viking owned we would take an easement of say 20 by 20 for those boxes. So there were numerous. So it wasn't just --

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: And I want to add, Michael, so it doesn't just sound like I'm bashing Viking publically. But they had to do their due diligence given the amount of property, that where were the easements going to be placed, how might it

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

affect their future development. So it wasn't a simple process given the magnitude of the property, the number of properties that they own, and the number of easements that would fall on their property. They had to do their own due diligence. And once they did that, they became very cooperative. It took a while; but after they did it, they became cooperative.

COMMISSIONER HUBBARD: Thank you.

CHAIR DAVIS: Any other questions?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: So the unfunded capital projects -- and I believe this is -- actually I've got two more slides and I'll be done.

So when you look at the unfunded capital projects -- you saw this slide during the retreat -- is that $15,000,000 for roads and infrastructure, Avenue E and 15th Street, I understand from talking to Ms. Jones that the responsibility, that Avenue E is now the responsibility that the City has put on the list of things that would be funded with your concurrence if the surtax pass. I've asked her to consider 15th Street. We've been successful each year in getting funding recommended to connect 15th Street from Broadway to Bicentennial Park, only to have it vetoed by the governor. And so I've asked the City if they would include the match funds contingent upon whether we're successful this year and hopefully survive the governor's veto.

Ms. Pardo, you look like you're ready to jump in.

COMMISSIONER PARDO: I am. I am. You know, before we ask

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

anyone for money and start allocating taxpayer dollars toward 15th Street, I think we need to know what Viking is intending to do with 15th Street.

COMMISSIONER HUBBARD: Is it theirs?

COMMISSIONER PARDO: Yes.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Well, 15th Street is not --

COMMISSIONER PARDO: Yes, part of 15th Street on Broadway, right, 15th Street on Broadway belongs to Viking.

MR. HAYGOOD: On the corner.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: On both sides?

COMMISSIONER PARDO: And there's been, you know, I've been hearing stuff at the chamber about Viking getting ready to do something over there. So, you know, before we start using money I think we need to find out from Viking what they're intending to do over there.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: I will add that they -- and Mr. Healey personally contacted the governor in order to salvage and to get him to reverse his veto. So I take that to assume that they didn't have any intentions on seeing 15th Street closed, if they own both sides. But I don't think they own both sides of 15th Street, so the ability to --

COMMISSIONER PARDO: I'm not saying closing. I'm not saying closing. I didn't hear anything about closing.

I want to know what they intend to do on the street, because they're going to benefit from it, you know. So tell us

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

what they're -- or find out what they're going to do with the street.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: So noted.

COMMISSIONER PARDO: You know, there are other streets in the city where, you know, we own the property on both sides; maybe we can do something with the money if we're looking to allocate money towards streets.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Okay. I'd like to thank the board as you sat as members of city council for approving the Desman parking plan and the City's vision to create a parking enterprise fund. We think that that would be the vehicle and the revenue stream needed to finance about 40 million dollars in parking structures at the marina and Singer Island. And putting together a parking enterprise fund with all the policies is the first step.

And then the 15 to 20 million dollars needed for the public market continues to be a CRA responsibility. And we have a -- will get a big shot in the arm for funding if we're successful this year in our application for tax credits.

To close, with what I opened with, was the single most, the highest priority for this agency is to secure private development not just on city-owned land but for the investments at the marina to do what we all intend for it to do, to be a catalyst to spark private development at the Broadway -- along the Broadway corridor.

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

I share with you that the proposal we got from CBRE to move forward, they wanted a success fee so I think we need to go through the process of my asking you to help me find another resource that we can put an RFP out on the streets. Depending on the direction for the procurement process, I'm thinking that we could come to you between August and November of this year with the development of an RFP and let you look at the selection guidelines. If those guidelines are satisfactory to you, we could then bring back to you the proposed scope and evaluation criteria in December. We think then that putting the RFP out for 60 to 120 days, depending on whether or not we want anything from qualifications to a bid, if we want a bid, then I think it's more a 120-day window. If we expect a developer or development partners to come with a financing plan they will likely need the additional time to evaluate what that criteria would be. Then we project that it would be 60 to 90 days to evaluate and qualify all proposals. And between August and October of 2017 we will present for your consideration the developer selection, or selections, for the board's consideration.

I get that given the magnitude of this I would envision that we would probably bring to you, depending on how the scores ranked, at least two, if not more than two, of the most qualified developers, for them to make presentations for your selection. And then again depending on the depth and the scope

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

of the development agreement we think it will take about 120 days to negotiate a developer agreement that would have real teeth than the one I had with Viking.

So it's -- your first question is, well, wow, should it take us to March 2018 to do it; given the process, I think that that is the conservative window; and it could be streamlined depending on how fast we can put together an adviser to help us with the solicitation and the selection process.

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: Question.

CHAIR DAVIS: Vice-Chair Miller-Anderson.

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: I think we really need to try to speed that up as much as possible because, I mean, we don't have that amount of time to continue to wait. Especially if we're having to foot the majority of the CAM.

You know, you're going to lose the interest of the people if we don't have a lot going on out there or things for people to do.

I understand it takes time to do certain paper work for bidding and looking and marketing and everything but I think we really need to try to fast track it as much as possible. But at the same time effective with -- that we don't want to rush it. But I certainly don't want to slow -- 2018? That's too long. That's too long.

COMMISSIONER HUBBARD: Mr. Chair.

CHAIR DAVIS: Commissioner Hubbard.

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

COMMISSIONER HUBBARD: I think -- you know, I don't want to see us go back out after, quote, unquote, another master development type of situation. I'd like to see us put out some criteria for joint ventures so that we can have some of the better and best and brightest come to do certain and specific things at the marina.

Also it allows local, local business persons, local developers, to join in ventures and to be able to create wealth in our own community.

I think we just went through this horrific experience of a master developer that didn't move fast or work well for us.

I think we should go from the standpoint of joint ventures. So I would like the board to, you know, really consider that; and if we can, you know, we can --

CHAIR DAVIS: Commissioner Hubbard.

COMMISSIONER HUBBARD: Yes, sir.

CHAIR DAVIS: So you suggest something like the community benefits agreement?

COMMISSIONER HUBBARD: Well, not so much like that.

CHAIR DAVIS: With a developer?

COMMISSIONER HUBBARD: Not even like that.

What I'm saying is, different individuals come in and do something. Say, for example, you were looking for a restaurant, or a dress shop, a movie theater, or -- you know, you've got different people coming in. And I'm saying that from this

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

standpoint: That we specify and that we're real clear to people who are coming in to do business, you come in to town, you do your due diligence, you find your local partner so that we can ensure that we're creating wealth with this venture, that we're not just -- all the money is going out of the community.

So say we got a gentleman here that has the means to go in on a movie theater; and someone from the Maggie Jardinson (phonetic) organization came and said, hey, we're interesting in doing a movie theater with you, so you got an equity partner here locally and you got a man with means here, so you're creating wealth in your own town and you're leaving some of your dollars on the table. You don't have just one big person sucking all the air out of the room.

CHAIR DAVIS: You package it out?

COMMISSIONER HUBBARD: Right.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: And to Ms. Hubbard's point, this is why that first bullet point is what that RFP and the selection guidelines are. I expect we would bring it back to you, probably have to bring it back to you twice, maybe three times, so that it reflects what each of you want to see in the selection process of a developer, whether it's a master developer or one individual developer.

As I've said to you in the individual briefings, I think the other thing we've got to consider very quickly is what to do with the Yachtsman site. Because that also predicates on what

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

we're asking the developer to develop.

COMMISSIONER HUBBARD: And that predicates on that easement situation we have.

CHAIR DAVIS: You're right.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: But I don't know if it does. But we're going to find out if that was a condition to close on those easements.

So, Mr. Chair, I don't know if there's any other comments from the board related to the RFP timeline or anything else I presented.

CHAIR DAVIS: Commissioner Johnson.

COMMISSIONER DAVIS JOHNSON: So with regards to the Yachtsman property, do we -- have we done our own appraisal?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: We have.

COMMISSIONER DAVIS JOHNSON: Have they done an appraisal?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: The last time I inquired, about three weeks ago, they had not.

COMMISSIONER DAVIS JOHNSON: Because we need to know what that is. Because I just cannot imagine that we are going to, you know, purchase to pay rent. So I would like to know where their appraisal stands, how far we are apart, because it needs to be market value and at a fair value so that we can move on. Because it seems to me that, you know, we have all these different little pieces and parts to this development that stands to stall it.

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

So I would request, Mr. Chair, that staff have that conversation or get that information from Viking so that we will then know which direction we need to take as it relates to what actions we want to take as it relates to purchasing or whatever options that may be available to us.

CHAIR DAVIS: So submit a letter requesting the appraisal?

COMMISSIONER DAVIS JOHNSON: Absolutely. Yes, please.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: It could be that formal or I'll make a phone call tomorrow and let you know the answer. And I'll report to you via e-mail. I think it's just as simple as a phone call. They had indicated that they would do that. They have shown a willingness to sell it. And the issue had been on price so...

But I can get that answer and I'll follow up with each of you.

CHAIR DAVIS: Any questions from any other board members before we go to the regular CRA meeting?

COMMISSIONER HUBBARD: One question I had. You was pointing out the first bullet, and that you were going to bring back the different types of selection process, whether it be a master developer or whether it be the joint venture. I think somehow and somewhere along the line we need to maybe try to -- maybe you can discern from each individual when you're having your meetings with them to determine whether or not -- which way do we want to go this time, so that we don't waste so much time

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

putting together an RFP for a master developer if we're interested in doing joint ventures. So we might shave off some time that way if you can, you know, when you meet with the board and get that to develop -- to be able to gauge where each person is.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: And the term master developer could be somewhat misleading. And I am -- as developers are inquiring, I am meeting so I can understand what their interests are before an RFP goes out; and I am under a cone of silence.

But it would be my recommendation even with the ones I've talked to to date that you allow a developer to bid on any of it or all of it. And I think that their track record and their capacity would help you determine if you want to give it to one or to several.

COMMISSIONER HUBBARD: I was saying when you meet with the board members. Not with the developers.

And, too -- I don't think we want one person bidding on all of it unless that one person is trying to be an equity partner in each phase, in each area, with somebody local. The idea is to always have a local person or a local businessman attached to each, each project that we're developing; not for one guy to come in and be it to do all of it. We can't create wealth for ourselves like that.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: And your definition of local? Riviera Beach? Palm Beach County?

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

COMMISSIONER HUBBARD: Well, Riviera Beach first, of course; we always get first preference at home; and then, you know, then Palm Beach County. And, you know, we -- it just depends, it just depends. We can try ourselves local. We might even be -- you know, we might go as far as Broward, depending on what we're doing, or Dade, depending on what we're trying to do. You see what I'm saying?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: I do.

COMMISSIONER HUBBARD: Yeah, I just don't want people flying in, taking everything and leaving.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: That concludes my presentation, Mr. Chair.

CHAIR DAVIS: All right. So that will be the end of this. Thank you, Mr. Brown.

Before we go over to the -- anybody have any questions or comments before we close this meeting out?

MR. HAYGOOD: Well, I think you've got another item.

CHAIR DAVIS: No, this is just a --

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: No, the marina policies and procedures.

COMMISSIONER DAVIS JOHNSON: The marina policies and procedures is a part of that.

CHAIR DAVIS: Are you going to discuss this now, the policies and procedures? Or do you want to take it to the next meeting? Discuss it at the next meeting?

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Whatever -- that might be a question to Mr. --

CHAIR DAVIS: Go ahead.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Do you want to convene the regular meeting and then we can still make it -- modify the agenda?

CHAIR DAVIS: It was advertised on the workshop so let's go ahead and do it now.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Okay. Mark Blomeke from the staff is going to give the presentation.

MR. BLOMEKE: Would you like me to wait until Chair Davis gets back? Did he pass the gavel?

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: No, we're good. Go ahead.

MR. BLOMEKE: Commissioners, good evening. Mark Blomeke, marina facilities operations manager.

So as everyone knows, the Event Center is open for business. And part of running a successful event center is having essential and comprehensive policies so that guests and customers know what the expectations are, that we provide a safe environment, and that we also protect our new asset.

Some of the --

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Mark, I'm going to interject. I know you gave the board sort of a quick update at the level of demand that we got at the last meeting but just for the public's benefit how would you characterize the interest and the demand

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

of the marina, and particularly the Event Center, so we can at least inform the board how critically important it is to know what our authorities are, what we're telling the public.

MR. BLOMEKE: I think by any measure the Event Center building, especially here within the local community, is an unqualified success. The demand has been absolutely tremendous. And most of that demand is being driven by residents here within Riviera Beach.

You know, going to that demand, and that is part of some of the policies and procedures, and we'll go over the pricing briefly, but for the events that we have had year-to-date in regards to, you know, the customer feedback, the people that are utilizing our Event Center, I haven't had anybody respond in any sort of a negative fashion in regards to the pricing that we're currently offering our residents.

I think when you benchmark our building, our amenities that we're offering, because we do have flat rate pricing and we do have all of our amenities as far as tables, chairs, dance floor, staging, and the built-in audio visual systems, those are all inclusive to that flat rate pricing. Whereas if you were to go to Lake Worth Casino, Lake Pavilion, Gaines Park, the event center they have over there, their pricing is more modeled towards a la carte. So if you want a dance floor, if you want audio visual, you have to pay extra for all that.

So in addition to that pricing, you know, feedback, some of

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

that other feedback is that people have commented that they think it's an unbelievable value that they're receiving for their money that they're spending here within the City.

So going back to some of the basic parameters, the 50% deposit and signed contract on all rentals is a requirement that is in place just like it was for the old Newcomb Hall.

We're open 365 days of the year; Monday through Saturday, seven a.m. to twelve a.m.; and Sunday nine a.m. to eleven p.m.

And I would say to the board that this document, this discussion that we're having tonight, is that we are looking for your feedback, what your constituents are asking, what they want in an event center. So this is a living document. We do have a new building and as we learn to operate it, and when we get more feedback from our customers, there's always going to be room to refine this document, refine these policies and procedures so that we provide, you know, the best possible experience to our customers.

The City of Riviera Beach, we do extend discounted pricing. We'll get into that a little bit later. And we do extend discounted pricing for non-profit organizations both within Riviera Beach and outside the Riviera Beach community.

Event security. Again, this is very similar to the old Newcomb Hall policies; that all events that are serving alcohol or primarily attended by minors -- and we've used the parameter of anyone under the age of 21 years old -- are required to hire

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

a security officer.

Now I'll touch a little more on safety in a few minutes here, because it is something that we are seeking your feedback on.

Public events. So any event whereby the public is invited -- and public event could be construed as a free event much like a, say like a green market; or an event like we had this previous weekend with Mr. Lowe, where they're charging an admission. We do require those customers to have an approved City of Riviera Beach special event permit.

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: I just had a question about the security. So they're not required to have a police officer? They can hire their own person, or whatever, unarmed or armed security?

MR. BLOMEKE: That is correct. And a few slides from now I'll provide some more details on that.

COMMISSIONER PARDO: Hold on a second. Mr. Chair. Oh. I'm sorry. Who has -- is this -- I'm sorry. I didn't see the chair come back.

So is this policy throughout the city? I thought if you were having an event in the city, in a city, you know, facility, you needed to hire, you needed to go through the Riviera Beach Police Department.

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: That's what I thought.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Is that our requirement too?

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: No. Not yet.

MR. BLOMEKE: It is not our requirement, no.

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: What about Newcomb Hall? Was it like that then?

MR. BLOMEKE: Previously it was when it was being run by Parks and Rec. I did have a discussion with A.C. Madden and I'll get to that slide here in a few minutes where we'll get into the details of that discussion.

Pricing. I've already touched on that.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Mark, I'm sorry. Go back to the security. So I didn't know what the follow-up was. Are we requiring -- should we require the use of Riviera Beach police? Or do you want us to see if --

MR. BLOMEKE: Well, let me just go to that slide right now.

So this goes to the perception of safety at the village. So we're currently requiring those customers that serve alcohol or an event that is primarily attended by minors to hire a private security guard that is provided by our contracted security company that currently provides said services for the entire village. And the cost to the customer is $20 an hour with a five-hour minimum.

And then going to your comments, so Parks and Rec and the City requires the hiring of Riviera Beach police officers to service the city events. And the logistics of those events plus the attendance determines how many officers are required. And

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

the city police department determines the number of officers that are supplied for those events.

So A.C. Madden had provided me a chart that Parks and Rec uses to communicate these needs to their customers.

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: I have a question about that.

I know -- so I see from zero to 75 we need one officer. But yet we can go up to 250 and only need two. So for zero to 75 you only need one, so it's one for every 75 people. But two officers for 250 people is one officer for every 125. Who came up with that ratio? I mean is that a standard ratio? Because it just doesn't make sense, to me anyway.

MR. BLOMEKE: Commissioner, I don't have that answer in regards to how this was formulated. This was the chart that was provided by A.C. Madden to me when I asked about the parameters that Parks and Rec uses for hiring Riviera Beach police officers.

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: 250 people with alcohol and two police officers, I don't -- that just doesn't sound like it's enough police.

And we have two officers. I don't know if they know why -- if they do, please share.

MR. McLEOD: If I may, as part of the special event permit, if there is alcohol being served then the parameters of the number of police is predicated on the number of locations serving the alcohol, whether they're going to be having a cash

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

location, collecting cash, that all of those will increase the number of officers that's required. And the police department reviews those special event permits and comes up with that number.

For example at last weekend's event they required seven officers plus a supervisor; and that was based on all of the alcohol being served and where they were collecting cash.

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: Okay. So not just based on participants? Because if we were to look at that it says over 500 you only need four -- well, it says a minimum of four officers. What will -- who determines it should be more? Because it says the minimum number of --

MR. McLEOD: That's the police department that does that.

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: And that's based on, like you just said, if it was cash --

MR. McLEOD: Yeah, if they're serving alcohol, and cash and all that.

CHAIR DAVIS: Excuse me. It says special circumstances may require additional police officers as determined by the City. So that would be the chief of police to make that decision?

MR. McLEOD: Yes, it's the chief that ultimately makes it. It's Major Miller that is the major that's in charge of reviewing special event permits; but the final approval is with the chief.

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: Okay. So this mentions about

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

police officers. What about the part where it talked about the security guards?

MR. BLOMEKE: So based on my discussions that we had with A.C. Madden, our operating model is a little different from the old Newcomb Hall in that we staff all of our events; where my understanding, as it was told to me, that the old Newcomb Hall you would rent, you would show up for the event, the staff would turn the building over to you and then they would leave. So, I don't know, that's what was told to me. I don't know if it's accurate.

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: But they weren't acting as the security guards, were they? The people, the staff?

COMMISSIONER PARDO: No, they had police.

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: Right. They had police then too, right? Okay. So we can decide we want police versus security guards? Is that what we may want to do? I mean, I think we should have police instead of the security guards.

MR. BLOMEKE: That's kind of the point that we've brought up here tonight in regards to getting that feedback.

And here is an illustration for a cost comparison. So the private security at the 20 an hour, with a 5-hour minimum, based on a party of 200, the customer would pay $100 to the security company. The comparative cost, if we use the City guidelines -- and, again, this is based on the minimums of, you know, a 200 person event, we would need two officers at the $30 an hour,

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

plus a $5 per hour vehicle fee, and a $5 per hour administrative fee, it would cost the customer approximately $400 for a 5-hour event.

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: My personal opinion, I think we need a police officer versus the security officer. That's what I would like to see.

CHAIR DAVIS: Or -- I'm going to tell you one of the things that I noticed at least from Parks and Rec, from people's certain events, I heard, like little children's birthdays and they have smaller groups, as far as the cost to rent an officer versus an armed security officer, a lot of times it drive the local person away on a small event. Now this -- that's just for FYI.

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: But you have adults even at children's parties.

CHAIR DAVIS: Well, I know. I'm just throwing that out there because that's where a lot of that came from on the City's side. Whether I agree with it or not -- just kind of giving you a little background on it.

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: I think in the long run, I mean, it's worth it. You'll wind up paying for it later on down the line if something occurs and we didn't have adequate security. I'm in favor of hiring officers over security.

COMMISSIONER PARDO: Mr. Chair.

CHAIR DAVIS: Commissioner Pardo.

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

COMMISSIONER PARDO: I agree with Vice-Chair Miller-Anderson. I would rather see Riviera Beach police there instead of a security guard. And, you know, you need to remember we had an incident a couple of years ago over in Newcomb Hall and we were sued. And, you know, regardless of the fact of having a police officer or a security guard, if something happens, you know, the City is still liable; but I would rather have a Riviera Beach police officer standing there telling me what happened, instead of a private security guard.

CHAIR DAVIS: Let me ask you a question: Do we have an officer that's over there and in the area full-time?

MR. McLEOD: We have private security that works from four p.m. to seven -- until eight a.m. in the morning, Monday through Friday; and then 24 hours a day Saturday and Sunday.

Our ambassadors are there at the park from seven a.m. until seven p.m. nightly.

MR. BLOMEKE: As far as a dedicated Riviera Beach police officer --

CHAIR DAVIS: Well, at least not now, considering we don't have restaurants, but is this being projected in the future? Because restaurants, I mean would they pay -- they're paying CAM to the City or the CRA. My question would be would that be something we could potentially do in the near future once the restaurants are established, to paying a full-time officer, which you're creating a whole other position, to be there

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

full-time? Which will help when community residents go to do small group activities; they may spend a lot of money on the cost of the rental, and then when it's time to hire an officer versus an armed security, then they can still have that option at that time, not right now, because we will have somebody full-time once the private sector kick in.

COMMISSIONER HUBBARD: Maybe we can mix up the option. If they're having youth events, definitely you want the kids -- I mean, excuse me, you definitely want the police officers if you're having any kind of birthdays or teen dances or whatever, you definitely, you know, want the kids (sic). For example, if I was having --

CHAIR DAVIS: A seventies party.

COMMISSIONER HUBBARD: Okay. Okay. If I was having a luncheon in the middle of the day, I would not suspect that my guests would call for the police. I suspect we would be all right with the armed guards that we have. But -- and I think it depends, I think we should go over some of the types of events that we want to definitely have the police to. And we don't -- you know, because we know when it comes to children and youth, like Councilwoman Pardo pointed out, we had a major incident there before when we had the youth at Newcomb Hall; so I would say just looking at that, if I were going to have a luncheon there that ran for four hours, you see how it would really impact my bottom line, and I would have a bunch of old people

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

there.

CHAIR DAVIS: I didn't say that.

COMMISSIONER HUBBARD: So says our chair.

COMMISSIONER PARDO: Mr. Chair.

CHAIR DAVIS: Commissioner Pardo.

COMMISSIONER PARDO: One thing I think -- and I totally understand, you know, if the seniors are having a lunch there, you know, it's a bridal luncheon or something. But this is my concern: We're living in a totally different world right now. Okay? This world is crazy, crazy. And you just never know what kind of nut job is going to go down to the marina, you never know, and walk in and he might or she might just slip through the front door and then go into one of those rooms and something happens. And, again, I would feel comfortable knowing that there was a Riviera Beach police officer standing by that door. And, you know, that's what I'm saying, it may be a little more expensive but at the end of the day you have the finest standing right there protecting you.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Do you want to make that a requirement? Or are you comfortable that working with the City and the police department, that it is a judgment.

CHAIR DAVIS: Yeah, because the chief is going to analyze -- well, their department is going to analyze the situation, whether -- my thing is we got -- I think this is something that should be workshopped again and brought back,

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

because it has a lot of little small things that we can always tweak.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: This is a workshop.

CHAIR DAVIS: Because what happens is this is a small simple event, the cost of law enforcement can really drive the local person away. So let's kind of workshop that and figure out if they're paying for police and it's say a luncheon for my great grandmother and she brings some coffee and tea for a few of her friends, somebody may be packing but it ain't -- you know, that's something we have concern. We do want to show protection.

VICE-CHAIR MILLER-ANDERSON: You just don't know about people these days.

CHAIR DAVIS: You don't know about people. But if they can't afford it then where do they go now?

COMMISSIONER DAVIS JOHNSON: Mr. Chair.

CHAIR DAVIS: Commissioner Johnson.

COMMISSIONER DAVIS JOHNSON: So is there a consideration just as we have a consideration for pricing for the Event Center, and there is a discount that's offered to City of Riviera Beach citizens and residents? Can there be a discounted process for the police to incorporate in their fee? But what you all are saying, you're saying reducing -- you're saying to have the police reduce it.

CHAIR DAVIS: This is their salary.

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

COMMISSIONER DAVIS JOHNSON: So $30 per hour. Okay, that's salary. But is there somewhere that --

CHAIR DAVIS: We can come back on our side, on the Event Center, yeah, we can do it that way. That's already in our policy already on the salary's side. To ask them to cut into their overtime pay, they already feel like they don't get enough as it is.

COMMISSIONER DAVIS JOHNSON: Okay. So there are pieces and parts to this. Maybe not the officer's salary, but they got to drive the vehicle over there in order to get there; so I mean there should be somewhere that there can be an adjustment on the side. So if you're going to look at it, then just look at how we can reduce it on their side with the exception of the salary.

COMMISSIONER HUBBARD: I agree.

CHAIR DAVIS: So do you want to bring something back?

COMMISSIONER DAVIS JOHNSON: Bring it back.

CHAIR DAVIS: I'm comfortable with that.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Anything else, Mark?

MR. BLOMEKE: So as we get ready to enter the next fiscal year and, you know, based on the feedback from the customers, and the overwhelming demand that we received, I feel that our pricing is extremely competitive.

And just kind of to touch on that real quickly here, I had provided a benchmarking slide for everybody to see so that you could get an understanding of who we benchmarked the new

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

building against. We've got about eight other different venues. It's not all apples to apples. All venues come with different amenities, they have different pricing, different hours, different things that they offer their customers. But I tried to equalize that pricing for a nonresident event rate at each of these venues over say a typical wedding rental period of about eight hours. So there in the middle of the chart you can kind of see the old Newcomb Hall pricing. And the pricing that we set, if you look at the total average cost, excluding Jupiter, because Jupiter if you're not a resident the pricing is really onerous towards the customer. I guess they're saying, you know, maybe they don't want nonresident people utilizing their facility. So when you kind of take that out, our pricing is just a little bit below the average of the other venues here in Palm Beach County. And, again, they do not include -- the big thing to understand is that they do not include the amenities that we're offering our customers. That's the key. That's what really gives us our competitive advantage.

So we had some questions about discounts, and those varied per venue. But to give you just a simple snapshot of what other venues are offering their residents, it spans the gamut anywhere from 11% for Lake Worth residents at the Lake Worth Casino, down to 75% across the bridge here over at Palm Beach Shores Event Center. And these are the discounts that we're currently extending to residents, Rivera Beach based non-profits, and

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

non-Riviera Beach based non-profits.

And then just as far as next fiscal year consideration, I think there's room, you know, as we look at the budgeting for next year for a nominal price increase of about 10%.

And our security deposit that we currently are at, $250, which when you compare that to some of the other venues, Lake Worth Casino at $1,000 and Lake Pavilion at $500, I think there's some room there that we could go up, but I think we also -- at least I always keep in mind to be sensitive to local area residents in that we are a low income community. The deposit requirement for the old Newcomb Hall was $200.

So when we bring these items back, if it pleases the board, we can bring back a proposal to demonstrate a 10% increase in our current rate structure and as well increase that security deposit, which is part of our policies and procedures.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: And I would add to the board too that given the negotiations we're having with the restaurants, where we are negotiating a percentage of the gross, we would have some wiggle room to discount if someone who is renting the meeting facility is having one of the restaurants cater, because there is sort of that indirect revenue benefit that we get and that's beneficial to us and to our restaurant tenant.

And I don't know, Mark, if we need to state that in the policies. But I think those are some of the things that we'll have the flexibility to do once the Event Center is fully

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

tenanted.

CHAIR DAVIS: So let me ask you a question. So the restaurant that we just currently approved, so it's being requested that they allow to have exclusive?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: No. Well, they have an exclusive over a certain price up to eleven a.m., for a breakfast event.

CHAIR DAVIS: And CBRE makes money off that as well?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: No.

COMMISSIONER PARDO: No.

CHAIR DAVIS: Oh. That's separate? Okay.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: If you all don't have anything for Mark, I've got a couple of things I'd like to bring to the board's attention and for some direction in terms of the policies.

CHAIR DAVIS: For this?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Yes.

CHAIR DAVIS: All right.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: To the board and, Mark, on page 4 we disclose a refusal of cancellation of use. But I'm looking at some disclosure that we would give someone notice that we have the right to cancel the event the day of for any non-authorized use or permits.

For example, it was brought to my attention on Saturday that the non-profit was charging for parking; and I authorized

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

that to stop and to cease. I was told it did not happen.

Had I been told --

CHAIR DAVIS: Who told you that?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: My staff.

CHAIR DAVIS: Well, let me address what happened between that organization and your staff. That organization was having discussions with your staff about where the parking on the Event Center location for people who have disabilities. So at that time that parking was exclusively for volunteers, people for the boat that was coming over, plus, because we so limited on parking, for those who have a disability. So when that was given, that was done.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Mr. Davis, I was told that --

CHAIR DAVIS: Let me -- I was standing there when the conversation was going on, because I had a conversation with your staff, because your staff was very aggressive with those kids that were out there from Suncoast High School, and he could have had a better tone the way he conducted himself.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Did anyone charge for parking on city-owned land? You weren't here, Rod. This question is to you, or Neimah.

I got a text. Did anyone charge people to park on city-owned land?

MR. McLEOD: Yes.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Okay. Did we tell them to stop?

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

MR. McLEOD: Yes, I had a conversation saying that directions from you that we were to cease charging parking on city-owned land.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: And did they stop?

MR. McLEOD: They reduced the north parking lot by doing the handicap and cruise, but the rest of it continued.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: So what I would propose for the next iteration of this policy, I'd like to --

CHAIR DAVIS: Let me ask you this question before we go on further. When they have the boating events, do they charge for parking?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: No.

CHAIR DAVIS: I've seen them charge for parking.

COMMISSIONER PARDO: No.

CHAIR DAVIS: I've been there --

COMMISSIONER PARDO: I've been there too.

CHAIR DAVIS: -- and actually paid for one of the events.

So I find it really ironic that when they charge for parking -- because Viking gave this organization permission on their lots to charge for parking.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: That's different.

CHAIR DAVIS: Yes.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: That's different.

CHAIR DAVIS: Okay.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: That's different. I was told

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

that in our north lot, the lot closest to the Event Center, that someone was standing at the corner of Broadway and 13th charging individuals to park as early --

COMMISSIONER PARDO: As 2:00.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: -- as like nine a.m.

MR. McLEOD: No, that was -- nine a.m. was on the overflow lot on our CRA property. They didn't start on the north lot until the afternoon about 4:00.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: So even on our property?

MR. McLEOD: That's correct.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Did we give anyone authorization that they could charge for parking?

MR. McLEOD: No, sir.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: So my only recommendation is that we need some language that gives us the right and that we let the individual know that we have the right to cancel the event on the day or during their event if there is any non-authorized use.

CHAIR DAVIS: Let me ask you another question. Are you not proposing that a local non-profit is not allowed to create jobs in this community?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: I don't think that's the issue, Mr. Davis.

CHAIR DAVIS: No, I'm just asking -- the CRA is designed to create jobs so if this is going to create an opportunity for

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

local kids and churches to raise money in the parking lots, what would be the problem with that?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: I think that's a question for your board members.

CHAIR DAVIS: No, you brought it up. The board members --

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: What I brought up was the fact that we allowed someone to lease our facilities; that it was never disclosed -- or we never allowed anyone to park -- there are other users in the marina going over to Peanut Island. I don't even know if we had an impact on the grant for the slips. But, you know, we couldn't differentiate who was going to their boat or a dinner cruise or over to Peanut Island to be charged for parking. It was never asked and permission was never given. And it should have just stopped, period.

I was told that you gave authorization --

CHAIR DAVIS: Do you -- I'm going to ask you a question. Do you have a plan in place -- let's be clear here -- that's going to allow non-profits to come and create jobs for their organizations in this city?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: I don't understand that question.

CHAIR DAVIS: Well, if you don't understand that question -- listen -- I'm done talking with you.

Go on and say what you gotta say.

COMMISSIONER HUBBARD: Let me say this about the parking.

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

I was over there very early, I would say anywhere from nine back and forth to maybe three-thirty. And we were using that, we were using the gate. No one ever -- I didn't see anybody charging for parking. No one ever asked us for any money or approached us for any money. And we were just -- once we came in our cars, then we came in a pickup truck, nobody ever stopped us and asked us for money off of C Avenue at the north end gate where we were coming; because we came over there to scope out the place first, and then we went back and we got our tent and we came to put it up. But no one -- now they might have started asking after 4:00. But 9:00 in the morning they weren't asking for money. And they weren't taking any money. I didn't see anybody taking any money. Because we was out there an extremely long time; and then we left and we went to go and get dressed because we had another event, and we couldn't even stay to that event but we had invited people so we were out there putting up a tent.

The other thing about the parking, I'll say this, is that on the land, on the land that Viking had allowed them to use, I think that is okay for the people to charge. Now on city-owned land, if somebody, you know, we can get that clear, if it's a non-profit and we're going to let them use it to make money or whatever, then we can. We probably won't have much land to do that anyway, because if we're getting ready to go into our own paid parking program that won't be an issue of discussion

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

anyway.

But right now I have -- we've had Jazz on the Beach -- we had free transportation to Jazz on the Beach. There were people charging people over at Wells Park, which was free parking, to get on that trolly and go over. We couldn't very well stop that event because somebody was being slick and charging on this side of the bridge and nobody really knew that you wasn't supposed to pay. They just were paying the people as they got on the trolly because they were asked for the couple of dollars. I don't think that we should -- we could never in the middle of an event shut down the event, especially like what we had, the jazz event that we just had.

What we could -- if there is -- if we agree that they aren't going to charge for parking, then we will stop them from charging for parking. But to stop the whole event, ruin everybody's day, and people paid for their tickets. And they're looking for -- and they're more interested in enjoying themselves than they are what they paid for the ticket, I don't think we need to put that in place because that opens the door for a whole lot of other things to happen.

CHAIR DAVIS: One thing I'll suggest. And just bring back a policy or something, so that you can put in this agreement on special event parking for a non-profit, if they're going to host an event.

COMMISSIONER PARDO: Mr. Chair.

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

CHAIR DAVIS: And be proactive with that portion. But to take something so innocent and great for this community...

Commissioner Pardo.

COMMISSIONER PARDO: Okay. Well, you know, what people do on Viking's property, I really don't care. You get approval to do something, I don't care. As long as it's within our code, you know, people can do what they want to do. But on City property, if we're going to charge for parking, I believe that money should come to the City. You know, that property belongs to the taxpayers. And, you know, I don't think we should be giving, allowing anyone the freedom to charge on city-owned land.

And I brought this up to Mr. Brown yesterday -- no, on Monday. I received calls Saturday afternoon -- well, one call from someone saying since when are you guys charging for parking? And they were going camping over on Peanut Island, and they were charged for parking. And I asked Mr. Brown, and he didn't know anything about it.

So, you know, we definitely need a policy for the parking. But I am not in favor of allowing the non-profits to charge for parking on city-owned property. Let them, you know, work out some kind of deal with Viking or the other businesses around there. But, no, at the end of the day the money belongs to the City.

CHAIR DAVIS: One thing that was brought -- and me and the

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

gentleman below had a conversation. Because of the special events you have, sometimes you can have so many people, is to restrict that north end lot for the disabled volunteers. Because a lot of people can't walk, that they have a disability or something like that. Because there ain't but like I think 109 parking spaces on the north end, to my last count. So bring back a policy, I support that. But special events -- I mean if you go to a Miami Heat game, you go to a Dolphin game, you're going to pay for parking for a special event, no matter whose property it's on.

This city -- this organization, the CRA, is designed to create opportunity and jobs and change the culture of our community. And if that means creating a weekend so that people can make money on a special event, and to raise it for a local non-profit, for football, basketball, cheerleading, and all these entities, I'm not opposed to that either.

But I do want to see a policy that gives us some direction on how we can govern. Because they do have a deposit that would be at risk if they was to create a problem with that policy. So if they have disregard for that policy and we can keep that deposit, then we can do that. But to allow one person to be solely in control of an event, at their discretion, I can't support that.

MR. HAYGOOD: We'll come up with some remedy that would match the problem.

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: And I would just add, Mr. Chair, I mean this is new to us and we're trying to develop policies. And I don't know about the statement just one person would control.

One thing I would respectfully ask of members of the board, as you observe or if you attend events and you see issues that relate to things that we need to do, if it's a safety issue obviously address it with the staff; but if it's a policy issue, like someone charging for parking, and if you felt that they should charge, I would hope that you would contact me and that we discuss it and not create a situation where my staff is sort of befuddled as to what their responsibilities and authorities are.

CHAIR DAVIS: Correct. Because right now we don't have a policy. So this is why we're discussing this today.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BROWN: Well, but what was clear is that we didn't give anybody authority to charge our visitors to park on city-owned land.

CHAIR DAVIS: And you didn't say no.

Any questions by any members of the board?

Motion to adjourn the workshop.

COMMISSIONER DAVIS JOHNSON: So moved.

(Proceedings concluded at 8:45 p.m.)

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

C E R T I F I C A T E

THE STATE OF FLORIDA)
)
COUNTY OF PALM BEACH)

I, Claudia Price Witters, Registered Professional Reporter, certify that I was authorized to and did report the foregoing proceedings at the time and place herein stated, and that the foregoing is a true and correct transcription of my stenotype notes taken during said proceedings.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand this 2nd day of August, 2016.



CLAUDIA PRICE WITTERS
Registered Professional Reporter

Electronically signed by Claudia Witters (301-073-648-3400) 824219dd-a061-47a1-addb-84beb26f0603

ADJOURNMENT

The Budget Workshop was adjourned at 8:45 P.M. The minutes were approved by the Board of Commissioners on _____.

_____
Terence Davis, Chairperson

_____
Executive Director Scott Evans

/cw
Florida Court Reporting