

**CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH  
PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA  
SPECIAL CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES  
MUNICIPAL COMPLEX COUNCIL CHAMBERS  
WEDNESDAY, DECEMBER 14, 2015 AT 6:30 P.M.**

**CALL TO ORDER**

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Okay. Welcome, everyone, to the City of Riviera Beach. We have a Special City opinion council meeting tonight. Madam Clerk, roll call, please.

**ROLL CALL**

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chairperson Dawn Pardo?

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Present.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Pro Tem Terence Davis?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Here.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilman Bruce Guyton?

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** Here.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson KaShamba Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Present.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Cedrick Thomas?

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Here.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Mayor Thomas Masters?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Present.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** City Manager Ruth Jones?

**CITY MANAGER JONES:** Present.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** City Attorney Pamala Ryan?

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** She's out of the room right now.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** City Clerk Claudene Anthony is present.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Okay. Thank you. I'd like to invite everyone to stand for a moment of silence followed by the Pledge.

## **INVOCATION**

## **PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

(Everyone stood for a Moment of Silence and the Pledge of Allegiance).

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Okay. Miss Jones, do we have any additions, deletions or substitutions to the agenda?

**CITY MANAGER JONES:** No, Madam Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Okay. Do we have any disclosures by the board or by staff? Okay. Do we have a --

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Yes. I need to disclose, Madam Chair, that I -- I don't -- I forget which -- when it was but I met with a few of the pastors that are here tonight in discussion of some of these Code Enforcement issues. I don't remember what day it was but I did previously meet with some of the pastors that are here tonight.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Okay. Thank you for the disclosure. Anyone else?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Sir?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** I had met with many residents of Riviera Beach that are here tonight along with a few of the pastors and a few business owners.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Okay.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Anyone else?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Mayor?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I meet with the pastors all the time on everything. So that's my disclosure. Thank you.

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** Yeah, really? Madam Chair, I did meet a while back -- it's been a while, though -- when this issue first surfaced, tried to work out some solutions.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And, Madam Chair, I did, as well, many months ago.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Okay. And I met, like, a year ago with Reverend Davis. Okay. Do we have a motion to adopt the agenda?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** So moved.

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** Second.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Okay. Madam Clerk?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilman Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** COUNCILPERSON GUYTON?

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** COUNCILPERSON THOMAS?

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Davis?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Pardo?

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Unanimous vote.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Okay. Thank you. I'd like to remind the residents, if you would like to speak on item 1, which is the Code Enforcement Lien issue or item 2, which is the Standby Water Charges and Liens, please fill out a comment card and pass it along to staff. The cards need to be up here prior to the item being read. Okay? We're going to move forward. Item 1?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Code Enforcement?

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Code Enforcement Liens. All right. Who's doing it?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Miss --

**CITY MANAGER JONES:** (Unintelligible) Mr. Davis?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CITY MANAGER JONES:** 'Cause he has the direction.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Go ahead.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Thank you. I called this meeting, and thank you to my colleagues for respecting this. I spoke to many residents, a few business owners in the community, to discuss the major concern about potential relief of Code Enforcement liens and fines.

**\*Special Meeting Discussion Item(s)**

**1. CODE ENFORCEMENT**

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Thank you. I called this meeting, and thank you to my colleagues for respecting this. I spoke to many residents, a few business owners in the community, to discuss the major concern about potential relief of Code Enforcement liens and fines. This has been a major issue across this city for -- as we all know, for countless times. As you know, across America many banks have received many relief but this may be an opportunity where the City of Riviera Beach can give relief to its residents. Times have been hard. Government is designed to create small business that create jobs so we don't have to use Code Enforcement liens as a way to subsidize income for the City. I'm here today to ask for you all to take in consideration of wiping out all Code liens and violation and putting a moratorium together, and that's the main purpose of this meeting.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Okay. Well, let's go to Public Comment. Horace Towns and then Reverend Davis.

**HORACE TOWNS:** Good evening. Horace Towns, Riviera Beach, Florida.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Good evening.

**HORACE TOWNS:** First off, there used to be a time where -- and I'm going to speak about the codes. There used to be a time where people in the community had jobs and they would come in and they would serve on the dais because they wanted to, you know, give back to their communities. It was a part-time job that somehow you guys have managed by mistake to make it into a full-time job.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Okay. Sir, you need to stay on topic. This isn't public comment. This is --

**HORACE TOWNS:** I'm on the clock. Okay?

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** No.

**HORACE TOWNS:** Can I get there?

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Right. But it's Code Enforcement.

**HORACE TOWNS:** Code Enforcement, since you want me to stay on topic, the people on this dais represent the community. And if this is such a major issue to the people in this community, this should be a priority -- a priority item right now. The minutes that

we're in here speaking or you're having those discussions in the community, the clock or the meter or the billing or whatever the liens are steady occurring. My point was, because I wanted to talk about something different, but I want the representatives today to take the residents' city -- and seriously, and not because it's a political time. People say that their things are being politicized and they, you know, are the main culprits. So tonight listen to every resident that comes up here who's taken time off their long day to come in here and speak with you about this issue and do your job in your -- in your position. Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Thank you. Reverend Davis and then Margaret Shepherd.

**REVEREND DAVIS:** Reverend Davis 1273 W. 30<sup>th</sup> Street, Riviera Beach, Florida.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Good evening.

**REVEREND DAVIS:** I had written down a lot of things to say but I'm just going to try to memorize what I -- one of the things. What I want to say to you all today, but when I think about it, it's a disgrace before God where you are treating these people. And I consider you -- you -- y'all can get mad at me. I don't care. You know, you -- you don't -- you don't have me -- Bruce Guyton and Cedrick Thomas, you all vote with Miss -- Miss Pardo every time be a vote. But make a long story short, how can you all sleep at night putting all these liens on these people property?

Bruce said many time he own this city. And he also said that -- that he's not trying to take the people's property. No. You're not taking it. You're robbing them out of it. Any time you put liens on property, about 50 million of us are liens. And if you pass by Bruce house it look -- it looks like it need liens on it. But you all can hate me. I don't -- it doesn't bother me 'cause you don't take -- hire me. I pay you all. Y'all don't pay my salary. I pay y'all's salary. But it's wrong what you all are doing? Okay? All these people work hard out here for their properties. Some of them have left already. They just say can't take it anymore.

Just like CityPlace down there, they -- they sent their Code Enforcement in down there, ran the people out. Now it's a billion dollar business. City of Riviera has been -- have been robbed. Y'all are giving these rich developers all this property and it's wrong what

y'all are doing. I don't care what y'all say. I don't care how y'all hate me. It doesn't make no difference to me 'cause I said before, I don't work for you all. Okay? But it's wrong what y'all are doing. How can y'all sit up and sleep at night, putting all these liens on people's property and it's a disgrace. And I know Bruce get angry. That don't bother me.

But I'm saying to you all that y'all can talk all you want to talk, which is wrong what you're doing, putting those liens on these people. You need to stop, make a vote and take these liens off these people's property. People can't sell it. They can't get a mortgage. So what do you call that? The citizen not crazy. We just gonna knock on doors and get you all out of there, out of this office. And Bruce said that you need a certain amount of education. I don't know where y'all are coming from. Okay? But make a long story short, some of y'all need to resign or do something, because the citizens of this -- and even Singer's Island is talking about these, uh, liens and these water bills and -- and such and such a thing.

And I'm telling you all, God have mercy on us, because I said, people can't sleep at night. They can't drink. They can't eat -- drink water -- everything. There's water going up, sewer going up, everything going up. And Bruce talking about the pipes broke. Well, where's -- the way I understand it is the water bill gonna go up every so often for so many years. And you -- and -- and I don't understand how y'all can represent these people and say that y'all love these people. You don't love them. You all stealing with this people. And Miss Pardo done stay -- she stay on the west -- on the east side. Y'all stay on the west side. Y'all should know these people.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** (Applause). Okay. All right. Wait a second. Whoa, whoa, whoa, whoa. All right. Please. All right. We're not going to tolerate that tonight. This is a business meeting. All right. Margaret Shepherd and then Lynne Hubbard.

**MARGARET SHEPHERD:** Margaret Shepherd, Riviera Beach.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Good evening.

**MARGARET SHEPHERD:** I thank the very -- Reverend Griffin Davis, because every time he get opportunity after church or during church, we talk. The main thing that I know that he's very disturbed about these liens. I want to say to y'all it's something wrong with the sugar in the tank. It's something wrong. I don't care how you sit here and try to justify certain issues. I would like to see pictures of these different properties and how you have to get a dialogue or a database and tell how did they get these liens. I never had a lien before in my life so I'm not quite sure how they go. I don't know if it's political or not. I really don't care.

But the one thing I know that senior citizens and people that go to these jobs every day, they're not making enough money to pay million dollar fines. It's impossible that we -- me, we, are just barely making it. You have to start now from the beginning. Some of you all wasn't even up there when these liens was filed. So if the community is devastated, surely I know you guys have a heart. You've got to be devastated. I'm personally like Reverend Davis. I don't care if you never speak to me. I care less. I'm not talking about y'all. Really, I'm not. The public know exactly what I'm talking about.

Because when they stop me, I have an opportunity to say, "You need to go and vote. It's your problem."

**UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER:** Right.

**MARGARET SHEPHERD:** It should never have got to this particular entity. Million dollar fines? I have a problem with that. Not because of me, because I have a 92-year-old mother that I have to go see about. And surely, what's going on with the people that just can't make it? I urge you all to go back. I think Councilman Thomas say all the codes. Now, some of the people need those codes. Some of the yards need the codes. But I want to say to you all, it's imperative if you are for the people and by the people, it's time for you all to shed these skins and get a grip. Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Thank you. Lynne Hubbard and --

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam --

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Please. And then A.C. -- Reverend Evans.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam -- Madam Chair, as she comes, I want to thank --

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** She's here.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** -- Miss Shepherd for your support, Miss Shepherd.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Okay.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you very much.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Miss Hubbard?

**LYNNE HUBBARD:** Lynne Hubbard, 1405 W. 23<sup>rd</sup> Street, Riviera Beach, Florida. Yes, everything is political from the potholes in the street to the salaries that you receive. All of it's politics. To have character and to want to serve and be a servant of people, it doesn't take a PhD. That's not why we get up there to serve. It comes with commitment. It comes with compassion for other people. You -- you all are not the only ones that degreed. We're degreed. It's a lot of us degreed. But I -- once we come back and we have a degree to serve the people, we shouldn't use that degree to whip people over their heads. We should use that degree to lift up our communities, to lift up our people and to make decisions that's going to improve the quality of life for people. Yes, I'm running for office. Absolutely.

And why? Because I want to make a difference in the community. Not because I -- I want to take whatever I know, whatever I have. But whatever -- but what I can do, what I have the skill sets to do to improve the quality of life for people. We -- every job that come here, every contract that come here, every time there's an opportunity for the people of Riviera Beach to make some money or to get a job or to get a contract, we give it to somebody else. So our residents can't -- they don't have the money to fix up all the

problems that are going on with their properties. We beating them over the head with one policy and creating another rule to kill them on the other end. We're borrowing all this money, saying we're doing redevelopment which should translate into jobs, business opportunities for people; therefore, they'll have the salaries to meet those code enforcement.

But right now you're taking everything from them. You're taking the jobs. You're taking the contracts. You're taking every business opportunity. Then you say, "Go fix up your house." With what? With what? So you package up everybody's property and you give it to developers. You give it to investors. And when they don't do nothing with it, you don't ride by there and put an orange sticker on it or anything in it. Give our people our properties. Stop trying to take people's things. Give people opportunities to come up and stop trying to hold our community down and take it and give it to developers. They weren't here during all the lean times and the bad times when we didn't have any money, when we didn't have \$50 million that we could go and borrow.

But now that they are here and our city is getting better economically, we're the only one that's not benefiting from it. And that needs to stop. We do need to take all these liens off of people properties so maybe they can get a loan to fix up their property. They might even want to sell it free and clear. Yes. I am Lynne Hubbard and I'm running for City Council, District 1.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** (Applause). Please. You need to get – Reverend Evans and then Linton Corinthian.

**REVEREND EVANS:** To Chairperson, Mayor, City Council, I'm here regarding two items and I gave one card up there but I thought that card would cover both there. The Code liens and the water lien.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Right now we're just focusing on the water liens.

**REVEREND EVANS:** Yeah, I know. I understand that. But you're going to come back the second time. I didn't know if I had to put in two cards or not.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** I'll add you to the second one.

**REVEREND EVANS:** Just hold that. Thank you very kindly.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Okay. You're welcome, sir.

**REVEREND EVANS:** Now, my -- my point is with this City liens and -- which are on the properties is causing a lot of our citizens to lose their properties. And I know it's been said on the city council many times before that the City does not take people's property. And I understand that very clearly. I don't -- I don't think the City just arbitrarily take people's property. But we're here tonight to really ask you as a city council to protect the citizens of Riviera Beach -- these are the voting citizens of Riviera Beach -- in lifting all these City liens off these properties.



Give each property owner -- and I know that you can't lift them up for an indefinite period and say, Well, you know, let the properties stay like they are and fix them if you want to or not. There's gonna need to be some time to do it. And my -- my recommendation to you and -- and -- and I'm asking you, as beautiful as all y'all look up there, give everybody 24 months. Just take them off. Take everything off. And I know that you may say, Well, we've got some businesses and we got that, but it's going to be a win-win situation for the City of Riviera Beach and a win-win situation for the property owners in the City of Riviera Beach. Now, while the City liens are on the properties, the owner cannot borrow money to do the repairs, because of the liens.

Even -- even need money to pay their taxes because when the liens are on it running and the taxes run, and then they -- you know, eventually they're going to lose the properties. So what we're asking you to do is to consider taking the liens off. Even though the owners' credit may be bad. Some owners have problem borrowing money to fix them up. Once you take them off, they can get the money. Maybe they can't get it from a bank. They have many private lenders who will come in and work with these homeowners to get monies to do these repairs. So may need 10,000, 50,000, whatever. But when you have these liens running from 100,000 beyond a million dollars on properties, and by the liens running 100 to a million dollars, that means that the taxes are going to continue to run, as well. And what's going to happen, since you don't take the properties, the people are going to lose them anyway but not paying the liens, because they can't pay them.

So what's going to happen then is investors are going to come in here and they're going to -- they're going to buy the houses from you real cheap. And then they're going to

make money, a profit. Put the money in their bank account. So what I'm suggesting is that we take the liens off. And I'm willing to even give my time to work with some of the people who have -- make the connections with the private money lenders if the -- if they can't get it through the bank. Anyone who need that help, I'll offer my services to do so. But we need to give the citizens of Riviera Beach a -- a chance to save their properties. It's not going to help the City to keep the liens on because they just get more dilapidated. They're riding through the city. You can look at all this stuff just hanging around, hanging around. So take them off, please. And, uh, give the citizens 24 months, two years, to borrow the money. 'Cause I know y'all are mentioning an amnesty for six months or something like that. But it takes six months to try to get a loan.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Okay.

**REVEREND EVANS:** And let alone try to fix them up. So it takes longer than that. So I really would ask you to search your hearts tonight in a special way and let your conscience be your guide, please. Take these liens off so that the citizens can keep their properties, get money to fix them up and we thank you very kindly.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Thank you very much, Reverend. All right. Linton Corinthin [phonetic], Corinthian? And then Bonnie Larson.

**LINTON CORINTHIAN:** Good evening to y'all officials.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Good evening, sir.

**LINTON CORINTHIAN:** I stand here tonight agreeing with everyone that came up here about the liens on these houses. I especially came up here to represent myself. Because it -- I have a lien on my house. And it's, like, ridiculous. The lien what they put on my house it could -- could buy my house three times. Okay? It's been going on ever since '05 in the hurricane when I had a tree and the tree was blowed [sic] down. And it was a fruit tree. Some were blew [sic] down and some were standing straight. I didn't want to cut all the tree down. But they -- they wanted me to cut the tree down. The tree was cut down. The guy was supposed to take the lien off my house. He didn't. He found more situation wrong. I -- I laid the grass twice. And I told him I had no sprinkler so the grass is going to die. The grass died.

Okay. This year I went in the hospital in June and my grass grew up. I wasn't there to cut it. I asked someone to cut it. I don't know when they cut it, how long they took, but he came back -- I know y'all hire another enforcer and he put a 3 -- \$300 price on the lien. Then he send me a -- a packet of -- a packet of paper and it was, like, 300,000. Where in the world can -- must I get 300,000? My house don't even cost 100,000. And so I got the grass cut. I got the trees cut. I got everything done. I live at 1071 W. Second Street. Right now I'm sick. I'm recovering. I have a heart attack. I had stroke. I had kidney problem. I had all kind of situation wrong with me and I can't work. They don't send me but \$480 -- \$88. That can't do nothing for me. And I want to -- I want to, um -- what do you call that? Mortgage your house so I can get some money so I can live. But I can't do anything 'cause y'all got the lien on the house. And I need it to be taken off.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Thank you very much, sir. Bonnie Larson and then Rodney Roberts.

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Sir?

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** Madam Manager, could you get his address for me? Good. You got it? Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Yeah.

**CITY MANAGER JONES:** Okay. This little card (unintelligible).

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Yeah. We'll pass it down. Go ahead, ma'am.

**BONNIE LARSON:** Bonnie Larson. A lot of people have a lot of problems with the codes and I think we can start it, but we gotta fix the problem in the beginning. In other words, don't let situations get till they're \$300,000, like this gentleman. There's no house on the mainland worth \$300,000. \$300 a day, something like that, nobody -- nobody in this city can ever pay that. Fix the problem in the beginning. Work with people in the very beginning. Don't let things get so out of hand. But also we have to look at other thins within the city. And everybody has to be treated equally. You look at the -- the

trailer parks on Broadway. I complained about them several times. Two huge properties bought by the same investor. It looked like a bomb went off in that first one at Southern Court. It looked like a bomb went off in there. And I mentioned it from this podium several times.

Miss Duncombe, who was a former councilperson came to this podium and she said that somebody on the council or the council had negated their fines. We could have owned that property many times over. The same rules have to apply to those people as apply to us. Then they finally demolished the Southern Court. It looked like they hit it with a wrecking ball. You had to see it. It was, like, two weeks, three weeks it sat like that. They were falling down. It was a health issue. It was a security issue. It's everything. How much in fines did they pay? Are we holding them to the grindstone? The -- what used to be the Schooner Inn there near you -- next to McDonald's, oh, for years and years the roof was caving this, this was happening. Where's Code? Now, the other day, a couple weeks ago -- actually, it was a couple of weeks ago, I saw the Clean and Safe gentlemen out there working. They were cleaning that property. They don't come and clean our property. They were cleaning that.

And we're paying the Clean and Safe Program. What are they doing on a private person's property cleaning it? Okay? And -- and we get -- we get the fines. There's no incentive for the people who are fine -- who are -- I don't know what they're called. The people who work for the Code Department, Code enforcers. There's no incentive for them. Because they come around. They try and do a good job. They cite you. They cite all these people. And then what happens? Then the City just wipes out all those liens. So why should they bother going around to look at things? I know there's a couple in our neighborhood for years and years and it's still that way.

Investors come in here and they hope their properties will increase in value but they shouldn't be renting out their property to people in Riviera Beach. Make them live with all those -- their houses are in shambles and whatever. No. If you're going to do an

amnesty program, no investors. Only homeowners. Don't penalize the homeowners when you don't penalize and you just let the investors get off scot-free. If you're an investor, you must have enough money not only to purchase that property but to maintain it, otherwise, you are not an investor. You're someone who's ruining the look of Riviera Beach. And then they just wipe it out. There's people who don't take care of their yards. We get out there and cut our own. You can't afford to do it? You cut it yourself. People don't have money to hire gardeners in Riviera Beach. And now with no water -- water bill went up 50 percent. How are you going to water the grass? It's going to die.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO: RODNEY ROBERTS?**

**RODNEY ROBERTS:** Rodney Roberts, 1581 W. 14<sup>th</sup> Street, Riviera Beach. Good evening. How y'all doing?

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Good evening, sir.

**RODNEY ROBERTS:** I think we've said it time and time again that the fines need to be forgiven and they need to be looked at with a fine -- gone through with a fine-tooth comb to see who needs to be forgiven and who doesn't. But I guess we could just give all the people relief, blanket, and -- and -- and forgive them. It's -- it's really sad that -- I should be speaking to y'all but it's kind of, like, my words are falling on deaf ears 'cause y'all done been in this for -- and I guess it's been going on since before y'all even got up there. That's how -- that's how it is with -- how we are now. But like Miss Miller -- or Miss Anderson was saying, it's -- it's -- it's kind of common sense on -- on a few different levels.

And for y'all not to be able to show the -- the kind of compassion that y'all would want towards the citizens, it -- it kind of makes me wonder how in the hell did y'all get up there. But y'all up there. Jesus. Right? Jesus, for real. Like, where is Jesus? Like, where is the Jesus in y'all? What would Jesus do when the people suffering and -- and -- and going through it and, yeah, y'all -- y'all -- let's -- let's give ourselves a stipend. You know what I mean? I mean, it -- it -- it all goes together. The -- the -- the -- I think there was a decision the other night. We fake left and they went right, talking about we're going to dismiss the -- the -- the -- the developer and the developer, No, we'll walk out first. It was a bunch of BS. That -- that's, like, playing, man. It's -- that's a -- anyway, again, y'all are the reason why the City's in the shape that it's in right now. It's screwed up.

And I don't care how good the image looks that y'all might give to the citizens or how -- how many -- y'all might big y'all selves up and say, Hey, we're doing this; we're doing that. The inside of this city is corroded and -- up. Do you understand? I -- but again, I'm falling on deaf ears. But I'm telling y'all. And look at your -- your people that's running for city council now. They have history. They themselves have history. Some of them were, again, part of how the city is right now and why the developer has such a stronghold on our city right now. So look at that. The codes and fine -- I would love to see a standard. 'Cause a lot of people times black folk be trying to live up to white folk standard when it comes to our yards and our houses. When y'all know we do not have the money that them white folks have. We don't have the jobs that them white folk have to hire out and get their yards that way.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Hey, hey.

**RODNEY ROBERTS:** You understand what I'm saying?

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** You need to direct your -- no. No

**RODNEY ROBERTS:** I -- everybody's here -- I'm -- I'm here for everybody.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Okay, fine.

**RODNEY ROBERTS:** Plus I told you, we're falling on deaf ears there 'cause they don't want to talk. But again --

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** That's not true.

**RODNEY ROBERTS:** -- look at your own financial -- look at your own financial being and -- and --

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Okay.

**RODNEY ROBERTS:** -- versus trying to live up to somebody else's standards.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Right. Yeah. Thank you. Okay. Council?

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Is that all the public comment cards?

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** What do you got? That's the end of Public Comment.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Sir?

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** I just wanted to -- to ask a few questions first before we got into any deliberation. First I want to bring up what I've done thus far to try to get some understanding and -- and try to work through this situation a little bit. The first thing I'll do, I want to -- I want somebody from Code or the Chief or whoever to explain the difference between a fine and a lien. And next, after you do that, I would like to -- you to tell us what powers do we have in dealing with both.

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** Good evening, Council.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Good evening.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Good evening.

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** My name is Cheryl Bostic. I'm the field supervisor for Riviera Beach Code Enforcement. Been in Code Enforcement for 26 years here at the City of Riviera Beach. Certified in level 1, 2 and 3. I'm also certified in Occupational License Specialist. The Code Enforcement process, the difference between a fine and a lien is our first stage of Code Enforcement, we would notify the respondents of the initial violation, give them due process, time to correct the violations. Once the violations have not been corrected, we send them another notice and we send them to the magistrate hearing. Once they go

before the magistrate, we present our evidence. The respondents receive the notice they can come and present their side. The magistrate presents her ruling. She would recommend that they correct the violation with the specified time. It could be 10 days to 90 days or whatever she recommends. And she would initiate a fine to start accruing once compliance has not been met.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** After that whatever period of time the magistrate --

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** Yes, sir.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Okay.

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** She will say 30 days and then we'll go out on the 31<sup>st</sup> day or if they call us prior to that to come back to check it. Once the inspector goes out and check the violations, they send them another notice indicating they have passed or failed the violation. And we also have another process in between that. If they fail, they can ask for an extension. They can ask for an extension for six months, 90 days, but we have to bring it before the magistrate because this is all in the magistrate's power. She has ruled. There's an order.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** And this is still a fine? And I'm dialoguing --

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** This --

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** -- just so I can understand.

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** Yes. This has not become a fine until they have failed the first initial inspection.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** So let me just walk through it slowly just so I understand.

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** Sure.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Code Enforcement inspector sees a violation. They write the violation.

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** Yes, sir.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** And they give that violation to the homeowner?

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** Yes. We mail them out regular and certified mail.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Okay. So the homeowner gets this violation and at that time they have some period to -- to actually cure the violation?

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** Yes, sir. Most of our notices are 30 days.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Okay. So there's no fines. There's no anything that goes with that first initial notice of violation?

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** No, sir.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Okay. And then on that 31<sup>st</sup> day or whatever day the -- the Code inspector goes out to recheck --

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** Uh-huh.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** -- and it's not in compliance, does the fines start then?

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** No, sir.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Okay. What happens then?

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** They would send them another notice.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Okay.

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** To say, "You have not corrected" whatever section codes they have not corrected, and they need to correct it within a specified time.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Okay. So at what point does the fines start?

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** After they come before the magistrate.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** And what time does that usually happen?

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** It could take a year. Some properties have not been brought to the magistrate within a year. We do try to do the sweep and we try to bring them all within the same time. If they were scheduled for the hearing -- like, this month we met on the 10<sup>th</sup>. The respondents would have had 30 days, but we give them a --n at least a 20-day notice to come before the magistrate.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** So after they come before the magistrate is when they get a fine. How long does that stay a fine?

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** The fine can stay for -- until we record the order. We record the orders initially, like, within 30 days after the hearing, or if they have 90 days, the 91<sup>st</sup> day, we could file that to the City Clerk office. It's just an order. It puts the buyers or the title company on note that there's possible fines accruing against the property. It doesn't mean it's a lien. It's not a lien yet. It's just a recorded final order that shows a potential buyer that there might be code violations against the property.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** So at a fine, it -- when -- when it's a fine --

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** Yes, sir.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** -- that means that who -- the property owner can cure that at any time with the -- through the special magistrate process? Or how does that -- how does that go? So I heard a gentleman say that he has several fines on his -- on his - - on his home.

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** Yes, sir.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Three times the amount. How does that get to be three times the amount of the home? A fine.

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** The fines -- the fines run per diem, per day. That means if you have landscape violation, an abandoned vehicle, if you need to paint, you need to install some grass or house numbers, the magistrate will rule that each violation runs for \$100 day per violation. So if you have four, that's \$400 a day. If you have -- it could be \$25. That's per violation. So it would not stop until the inspector goes out or the respondents correct the violation. Once they call us and say they're ready for reinspection, the inspector goes out, take his photos. He comes back. We send them a letter of compliance. It could say compliance with fines or compliance without fines. If it's without fines, they have an opportunity to ask the -- the magistrate to reduce the fines. We have that online where they can make a recommendation to ask for a fine reduction.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Okay. Now, when does this become a lien?

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** The lien process will start after they have failed and the order has been recorded. If -- then the City will bring it back before the magistrate. We have to bring them all back to the magistrate so we start the process where we notify them again that we will be having -- having -- imposing a fine and lien hearing. They're placed on the same magistrate docket. Those are separate items. Once we bring them before the magistrate, we tell them that, Magistrate, this property was found in violation. They did not correct the violation within the specified time of your order. Last year or two years ago you gave -- gave them 30 days and the fine has accrued to \$300,000. We're asking that you impose the lien. She signs that order. We give it to the City Clerk and then becomes a lien.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** And then does it continue to accrue after it's a lien?

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** Yes, sir. We don't -- we cannot stop the fines until they have corrected a violation.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Okay. Now, let me ask you this. Is that a policy decision or is that law?

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** That's a Florida statute. We're not -- we don't -- we don't stop the fines until they correct it. We can work with them, give them extensions before we impose. They can come in compliance and it still could be a fine. Because they did not comply within the specified time of the order.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** So if they -- if -- if they come within compliance, which is what I'm concerned about at this point -- if they're in compliance, are you saying that the liens can still accrue?

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** No, sir.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** So once they're in compliance, the lien stops at whatever --

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** -- date that they complied with.



**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Okay. So let's take, for instance -- how many -- (phone ringing) --how many -- I asked the last time --

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Hold on a second. Whose phone is that?

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** -- I asked the last time to -- to tell me how many -- how many properties that we have that's over \$20,000 worth of -- of liens on them. Were we able to get that information?

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** I was not privileged to that -- that question. I wasn't given that information. I'm not the --

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Okay. Do we -- do we have an estimate of how many properties that we have --

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** Over 20,000?

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Yes, ma'am.

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** As fines or liens? 'Cause there's two different stages.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Let's -- let's do fines right now, then I'll come to liens.

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** Okay. Fines we have about 600 properties but they could be multiple times that they've been cited. Some respondents, unfortunately, have been cited this year and five years ago and three years ago and it -- it's multiple violations.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** So just about 600 violations? Are you --

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** No, sir. Different recordings.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** -- different recordings?

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** Yes, sir.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** And -- but some of those can be two on this property, three on another property?

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** Yeah. And it might not -- some might be 2,500, some might be 300,000. I couldn't give you that information tonight how many's under 20,000.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Okay. No problem. How many liens do you -- do we have on properties?

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** We have approximately 83 actual liens.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Eight-three?

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** Eight-three.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Okay. And -- and of those 83 liens, how many of them are over 20,000?

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** (No audible response).

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** You have a copy of this? Is this -- does -- does everybody have a copy of this here?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** I think we got it (unintelligible).

**CITY MANAGER JONES:** (Unintelligible).

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Yeah, but, you know, if you really look at it, it's not 100 percent accurate because we had a gentleman come up here stating that he has a lien going back to the hurricanes and the lien isn't showing up.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** He's not -- yeah, he doesn't have a lien.

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** He doesn't have a lien. He has a fine.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Okay. A fine.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Right.

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** But it's not on here.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** It's not -- it's not showing up.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Okay. So let me ask you this. How many of these that is liens are residents? Not -- not investors. How many of these are residents of the City that have --

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** That should be on your column when it says Rental. The far right-hand corner.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Okay. So if it says No, that means that it's a resident?

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** Yes, sir.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** If it says Yes, that means that --

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** It's either a vacant property or --

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** -- it's an investor?

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** -- a boarded property or, you know, vacant land. Mostly we don't impose liens against homesteaded properties.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Okay. So the -- the first thing that I would like to do is take all of the -- the residents off of this particular list and deal with them separately.

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** Let me -- let me make a correction on that. We don't foreclose on homesteaded properties. We do --

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Right. You do liens.

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** -- we will impose --

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Right.

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** -- but the City has privilege to do the foreclosure. Code Enforcement does not do foreclosures.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Okay.

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** All right. So I -- I want to -- that -- this is all combined with -- with different Yes, No, Yes, No, and it's 83 of them so I don't want to --

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** Yeah. There -- there's multiple ones on here. Some of them are duplicates because you will see they -- they own multiple properties. And some of them might be the same property three or four times, as I stated. So --

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** So are they -- do they connect? If -- if one property has a, uh -- a lien or fine on it, does it attach to the other properties that they may own?

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** So is there -- is there a reason that we -- that we do it that way, that --

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** It's a Florida --

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** -- why are we -- why is it not case by case?

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** Yeah.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** So if they own --

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** The fines run case by case. But the lien, if they ever tried to get a title search or -- or, you know, refinance, the title company is the one that looks at this and they say this is the lien. You need to settle up with the other cities or other properties because it ties with your name as well as the land.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Well, okay. So if I own 1255 and I own -- 1255 Fifth Street and 113615<sup>th</sup> Street, if I try to sell 1255, is it attached to where I can't sell the other property, either? I can't do anything with the -- the other property, as well?

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Okay.

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** There's the -- the -- the title company is who handles the liens when it comes to that. The City doesn't tell them they can't do it. We will give you a reduction or recommend that you come before council for an imposing of an actual lien for the reduction. They have to make that plea to your body.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** So let me ask you what -- at what point -- and -- and if Miss, you know, Ryan needs to -- to make sure that it's accurate, please do. But at what point does the city council have power to -- to get in this and at what level can we e?

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** Once it becomes an imposed lien, which is the documents that you have before you, they're in your -- your -- your position. They go to the City.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** So --

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** They're no longer in the magistrate's ruling. We have met our -- end of our point once we've imposed our liens. They're the -- why the other --

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** -- so we've -- the Code Enforcement part of this has been exhausted once it gets to this list?

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** Yes, sir.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** So are you saying that the city council can say on these 83 properties that we can just say forgive the liens?

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** It's in the body of the -- the council.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Okay.

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** Or city manager.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** No problem. So then let me ask you this. So we forgive the liens, hypothetically speaking, and then what happens if that property is not -- do -- do we say, Okay. I mean, how does -- how does a -- how does a -- an enforcement program continue to go? If we say, Okay -- say, for instance, I think I heard, uh, Reverend Evans

say, "Let's --" and I've heard him say this before. This is not the first time that he said this. So I -- I -- I have been giving thought to it. We say, Okay. We're taking the -- the -- the liens off this property for 24 months. At that point then that means that the property is going to stay in whatever condition or may not -- maybe somebody will fix it up or -- or do whatever they gotta do for 24 months. But all Code Enforcement or all Enforcement activities would cease? I mean, would we just not -- I mean, what -- what would we do in that? So that -- that person that's not sitting here tonight that's going to be next to one of

these places that we take the lien off, which may be fine. I mean, because it's not getting fixed with the liens on anyway. But what enforcement will -- would happen once that person says, Wait a minute. This property that's next to me has to be in some violation. What do we do then?

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** Well, Code Enforcement would want to go and cite the property to -- ask them to enhance it. We would like for -- we wouldn't want any violations to be released unless they're in compliance and that's --

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** I -- I -- I understand. I'm -- I'm trying to think through all of this. The request has been made to us so I'm trying to think through what happens now. If we say, Okay. You know what? No problem. You're saying that we have the power to do something with the liens once they get to this point.

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** Yes, sir.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** So if this council acted and said, Okay. We will do something with these liens, what happens now when a person that may not be affected by this right now, calls and says, This property is out of compliance. What do we do at that point? If we're saying, You're -- you're forgiven for 24 months?

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** Well, that would be at the body of the council to direct Code Enforcement how you want us to handle that. 'Cause we have a process we have to go through. We would want -- our job is to notify the property owner of code violations.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** I got it. I got it. But you couldn't do that at that point, is what you're saying. So let me -- let me ask this. Miss Ryan? Miss -- Miss Ryan?

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** Yes?

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Are we able to, as a body -- are we able to hold two different standards of the way that we administer any enforcement or can we do that? Can we -- say for instance we say, Okay. Well, at this point, everybody that's from -- from December 14<sup>th</sup> or 15<sup>th</sup> and before, we're going to forgive you for 24 months. But anybody that comes after that, you -- we're going to still enforce the code on you. Are we able to do that?

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Go ahead.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** You can do that but you would have to enter into an individual agreement with each of these homeowners. You would not be able to just make a blanket decision at a council meeting that you want to forgive all liens prior to X, Y and Z for 24 months. You will have to enter into an agreement with them. And after 2 months we'd have to say in -- in the agreement what would occur if they, you know -- some of the examples given were that they would go get a loan to fix up the property. Well, there's a chance that somebody might get a loan and not fix up the property.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Uh-huh.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** Or they might sell the property and pocket the money and leave it in it dilapidated condition. So you would have to try to have some kind of a mechanism and any kind of a document, if you cared. You don't have to. You could just -- you could just forgive each one of them and Code Enforcement would have to start the process over again. And you know, you can work out whether or not that would send a particular message to the rest of your residents. But --

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** right. I'm -- I'm just saying. But legally we could do that? We could have two different standards? So a property that's next door that, because they were on this particular list, they're going to be free for 24 months. But the property that's next door to that that was not on this list, are we able to then say, Okay. We're going to apply whatever our process is to you, even though right next to you, they get a 24-months' reprieve?

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** Well, the property next door probably doesn't have a lien; otherwise they're on this list. So what you're saying is, is that starting from this day on, we're not -- anybody who has a lien after this date will not be forgiven. But anybody before that, you -- you know, you're just -- you -- you are -- you are simply putting them into two different categories and you have the right to do that. You have the right to -- to forgive some liens and not forgive some liens. It -- it is within your -- your purview to do that.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Okay. And who does the forgiving? Prior to this coming to us, who does the forgiving? Who -- who makes all the rules and says, Okay. You can -- you can have it for 10 percent. You can clear it for 5 percent. You can -- because this council never gets involved in that. But who does that?

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** That's the special magistrate. The special magistrate can -- she -- he or she looks at an individual circumstance. They see whether or not it's a commercial owner or if it's a resident, if they tried. If you have a resident to come in and say, Listen. Let me show you this paperwork. I'm trying to get -- you can see where I got three quotes. If you just give me another month, I can get this done. The special magistrate will do that.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Uh-huh.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** And so -- but you just have to keep coming back and explaining how, you know -- that you're moving forward in your attempt to fix your property.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** But that has failed some type of way. It's -- it's -- well --

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** What's failed is that you have property owners who are just not fixing up their property. And it doesn't matter what the special magistrate says. And that's how the properties become liens, because it's my understanding that this process takes anywhere from four to six to eight months sometimes.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Before they get done.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** And they're just not fixing up their properties. They're not fixing them up. So, you know, they want to come in and ask for you to forgive a lien. It's difficult to forgive liens on properties where a person has just, for years -- just refused to fix them up. And then you have a neighbor who says, Well, heck, if they're not going to fix up their property and there's no consequence, then why should I? That's the -- that's what you're talking about.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Right.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** You're talking about the person who says, Oh, you're holding me to the fire but you didn't hold my neighbor to the fire. What is the difference?

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Okay. I'm -- I'm -- I -- somebody else needs to get their questions answered. But I -- I do want to see if there's somebody who can do this pretty quickly to see if, like for the gentleman who just -- who -- who spoke earlier, a resident that has that type of issue, I want to immediately move them to a different process and work whatever we need to work with the -- the residents.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** And -- and let me be clear. It is within the special magistrate's purview and this council does not interfere with that. If you want to direct your staff to say, After so many months, automatically put a lien on the property, and then it becomes your issue. You can do that.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Uh-huh.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** Your staff can do that. Your staff can say, Special magistrate, you've had this process for five years or two years. We now want to take it to the next level which is the council. So we're going to put the lien on it. Under Florida Statutes it says after three months, the City -- the -- the -- the governing body can foreclose on a lien. So you can -- that means you can do anything with it after three months. So --

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Okay. I just -- just to recap, we do have the power to act on this, is what you're saying? We do have the power to act on this?

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** You have the power to act on liens. If this list -- I don't know what this list is. If this is a list of liens, you have the power to act on it. If it's a list of fines, you do not.

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** Not.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** We do not have the power to act on fines.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** Correct.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** But we do have the power to act on liens, which are the 83 that's in front of us?

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Okay. So the other 600 or whatever, we have no power to do that and that is because I -- there's several attorneys around. I just want to make sure that that's a legal thing. It's some statute in Florida Statutes somewhere, correct?

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** Unless we impose the lien, then you can do it.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Unless we --

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** We have to impose a lien --

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** -- for us to --

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** Yes, sir.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** So basically the only thing that we can legally deal with right now is these --

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** Is what you have in front of you. Yes, sir.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Okay. All right. And thank you.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Mr. Thomas, are you done?

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Yes, for now. I'm going to go on.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** All right. Mr. Davis?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Thank you, Miss Bostic, for the work that you do. Really appreciate it a lot. Miss Ryan, Florida Statute 162, please help me answer a question by answering this question. Is it stated based on the legislation intent, give this board the discretion to make -- to have a Code Enforcement board, yes or no?



**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** Yes. You can have a board or a special magistrate.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** So -- so it's at our discretion?

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** Correct.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** So if we wanted to give the residents where they have fines or a lien, it's up to this board discretion that make that decision, as well?

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** No. Once you have -- well, once you've established -- first of all, you don't ever have to do anything. You can just do away with Code Enforcement all together if you really want to.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Correct.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** But you can --

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Now, I'm not trying to take nobody's job. Let's be clear here, now.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** Right. Right.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Okay.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** But you can make a determination as to whether or not you want to have a Code Enforcement board or a special magistrate.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Uh-huh.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** But once you make that decision --

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Uh-huh.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** -- it's -- you're -- you're done with it. For example, when a Code Enforcement special magistrate or board, they enter an order that the property owner disagrees with --

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Uh-huh.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** -- those orders don't come to you.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Uh-huh.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** They -- the -- the property owner has the right to file a claim in Circuit Court the next day --

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Yeah.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** -- you know, within 30 days of the action. So they're an independent body, basically.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Correct.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** So once you created them, there's -- you can't go back and forth. You can't decide to give them some responsibility and not other responsibility.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** But if we choose to in this situation, we do have the discretion to make that decision, correct?

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** As to what -- as to what?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Well, the -- let's say, for instance, the fines and the liens. Let's say we wanted to create a workshop, wipe them all out for 24 months, have a workshop that's gonna discuss how we're going to get residents to the city. Go through a program that states that, You are required to do this, which would get you into compliance, which is Code Enforcement's primary focus. And those that choose not to come, we cannot address that issue. Because after a time frame, those codes and those liens will go back on those who choose not to come. But we have to make a great effort to reach out to those people to get them here to the City in a major workshop to show the people that we truly care.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** Well, as I understand Florida Statutes 162, you do not really have the discretion to get involved with the fine process.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** But the Florida Statute is -- it says we have the discretion whether or not to use a board or not.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** Correct.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** So if we choose not to use the board, we can get involved with the process.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** You have to have -- you know, I don't -- you're -- you're basically saying do you have the right to -- to handle the issue yourself. I don't know the answer to that.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** 'Cause it's -- actually in Florida Statute it says "may." Not "shall." You know, and we have that discretion. 162.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** -- 62.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** And I want to stay consistently with that. But I want to make sure that we do something to help the people.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** Right.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** You know what I mean? And we want to help this city help the people. We want to be very fundamentally sound as we move through this process. I -- it -- there's got to be a way that we can put a program in place after we wipe the fines, wipe the -- the clean slate on liens. Give the people the relief the same way the federal government gave the banks and have a 24 moratorium -- 24-month moratorium just like Reverend Evans stated. Get some people in here that will assist, reach out -- let's get some staff. They gotta reach out to them. Get them here through weekly workshops to say, Listen. We need to sign your up, get you involved in the process so we can get you in compliance so we can get this relief off your back. And we have the capacity and staff to do that. You get -- you get what I'm saying?

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** I -- I do. I -- I do. I do.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** 'Cause the whole purpose of this meeting tonight is to --

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** Right.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** -- wipe these liens out, wipe these fines out. But put together a program that makes it successful.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** Right.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** You get -- you get what I mean? So I'm -- I'm going to be quiet until now. I think I said enough. I'm going to stay consistently with that. I'm going to allow my colleagues to -- I'm sure they have some things they want to share. And go ahead.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Anyone else?

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** Yes, Mr. Chairman.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Yes, sir.

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** First the question to the attorney. Once the property come into compliance, do we then have the authority to wipe out any existing fines and liens at that point?

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** No. You have the right to wipe out the liens. Once they come into compliance, if they have fines, they go back to the special magistrate.

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** Okay. I --

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** And the -- it's that person who wipes out the -- who can wipe out --

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** Okay.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** -- reduce -- usually --

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** Okay.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** -- they don't wipe them out.

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** Wait, wait. Let me ask you this.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** They usually reduce them and, you know, depending on the circumstances -- I can't speak for the special magistrates but that's usually what they will do.

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** Okay. The -- the follow-up question is under our amnesty program, it was my understanding that we could when they came into compliance. That what -- did I misunderstand that?

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** I don't have it in front of me. I'm looking at Miss Bostic (unintelligible).

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** The -- the amnesty program expires the end of this month. It was extended for a year.

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** I -- I -- I know. But I'm saying --

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** and --

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** -- if -- if we have an amnesty program -- I'm just asking a hypothetical question -- they come into compliance.

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** Uh-huh.

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** Do we have the authority to eliminate the remaining fines and liens?

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** They're still under the magistrate.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Uh-huh.

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** Until I am -- we impose, then it's still in the /PHAPBL strait's hand. So if we impose all our fines and then they become --

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** So under the amnesty program, you -- the City had a policy to say that if you will settle for 5 percent then --

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** Right. I have a copy of it here, the amnesty.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** Okay.

**CITY MANAGER JONES:** Wait and listen to the question.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** Right. So the -- does the special magistrate take that into consideration or does he or she automatically say, Under this policy you've come into compliance. I will accept staff's recommendation to reduce your fines to the 5 percent that's listed in the policy?

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** The 5 percent is for commercial property, homesteaded property, is administrative costs and rental property is 2 percent. That was the decision of the board.

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** Uh-huh. So -- and my question remains --

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** -- if they come into compliance, will the only thing that a -- a homestead property, people that live in their homes, the only thing they would have to pay at that point is an administrative fee?

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** Yes, sir.

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** So if they had a million dollars' worth of fines, all they would pay is that administrative fee?

**CHERYL BOSTIC:** Correct.

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** Okay. And -- and -- and let -- let me now speak to the issue about Code Enforcement or code compliance. Our community is one that has been probably lenient than any community that I know of, working with the residents. Unfortunately, some people may not have known that all you have to do is pick the phone up and call and they'll work with you. Some don't respond and those fines start accumulating. But we as a community have been very willing and we still are to work with our community. I would challenge anybody who has an issue with our process to go and find another community within our area that does what we do. It does not happen. In other communities, once you get a fine, I don't know of an amnesty program that goes almost indefinitely so that the people can come into compliance.

If it costs them \$200 to bring that property into compliance, if they have 5 million on it, it goes away. This is not anything that follows you. Homestead property, we can't foreclose on it if we wanted to. We never wanted to unto my knowledge. We never have because the law doesn't allow it. We're making this seem like we are -- first of all, let me back up. The city council has nothing to do with that process. Miss Ryan, um, do we impose fines? Do we get involved in that procedure to identify property as a city council?

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** Never. Not at all.

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** Never. Having said that -- but people will come here, "Bruce this, Bruce that," because Bruce tried to make rational decisions not based on politics and emotions. Some people think that that's not a good way to do that. Show me some data, documents and evidence and, you know, we can talk. We have compassion. I have compassion. There's some people -- I'll say this -- come here for self-serving reasons.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Amen.

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** They'll go gather up people in the community, Come on. Let's go over here. Self-serving, and come over here and let's attack those who we can't control. Bruce will never be intimidated or controlled by anybody. And -- and -- and that is why I would be the target oftentimes. I want to do what's good for the masses of the people. We -- we -- we have these little cliques that think that we'll go get a few people. We'll intimidate them. We'll vote them out. That's your choice, people.

For us to compete with surrounding communities and bring people into our community who want to live and invest their dollars, we're going to have to have some standards. Right, wrong or indifferent, we have to have some standards. I have been openly asking for any elderly people that have any code fines or liens to call my office. Any senior citizen. I have people who have said, "Bruce, we will volunteer to help bring the properties into compliance." Because the worst thing that you can do is start talking about wiping out everybody's fine and everybody codes. That open us up to, What about the people who have complied, now, Bruce? What are you going to do with them? Or what about the people that come after that that would like the same treatment? At what point do we realize that this is a can of worms that can mushroom out of control? It sounds good on the surface. Let's just wipe them out. Let's start over. Let's give them 24 -- 24 months.

To me that is the most unwise thing that we can do if we're going to maintain a standard of living. What we should do is what I'm offering, is to help those who can't help themselves. I'm not going to be intimidated. People think that somehow that being an elected means that you're supposed to -- I -- I don't know. Just compromise your standards. I'm not going to do it. I'm going to be there to help the people who want some help. They come to my office and wherever I can help them, I will. The amnesty program, it wipes everything out. If you have a violation, and especially if you're a senior, you come in my office and I help people to correct it. Whatever amount on that property, it is gone. It's a nonissue. It don't follow you.

And no -- the elderly people know you don't have to go try to get a loan. I got people who volunteer to help you. So I mean, we're trying to make this emotional. We're being insensitive. But the real story's not being told, that just bring it to compliance, use the help that's being offered to you, and everything is gone. Except an administrative fee. And I am willing to say that if they bring it into compliance, eliminate the administrative fee, too. Just bring it into compliance. All the fines, all the liens could be gone. That is a rational approach that maintains our standard of living and we don't reduce to a shanty town. A shanty town of those who don't really have any codes and people just do what they want to and the neighbor's complaining, then our phone's ringing off the hook. And -- and the calls that we get oftentimes are about -- or let me speak for me -- about code compliance.

And I see those who -- that call me, they're not in here and they're some senior citizens. And -- and I know that they're friends with some of the people in -- in here. They didn't show their face tonight because you know what they tell me behind the scene? Bruce,

that's the worst thing you can do. What irritates me is that they don't come to that mike and say it publicly. They leave us up here to take the abuse and the personal attacks to make us seem insensitive. But most people understand that the core of maintaining a quality environment is Code Enforcement. That's the teeth. You take that away, what do you have? People will stop acknowledging that to some degree we've got to maintain our property. Where y'all gave it to them, I want it, too. That is not a good idea.

The best approach is an amnesty program where you can get help even as a senior citizen to help bring it up to code and all those hundreds or thousands and millions and dollars goes away. I even think that we should set a cap on how far it should go. It should just go to the value of the property. That -- you know, there are ways that we can deal with it and be fair, but -- and -- and one of the reasons -- one of the things that irritates me is when people try and intimidate me. I don't -- I don't take well to that and people know that. And people text me, "Be cool, Bruce. Keep -- be calm," 'cause I -- I'm - - I'm not fixing to start, you know, compromising because, you know, somebody think that I want this office so bad.

If the people don't want me here, I'm okay with that. My supporters don't like for me to say that but that's -- that's how I feel in my heart. I'm here because I love my community. And -- and -- and because we don't see eye to eye, I don't personally dislike you. I mean, even though some personally dislike -- we disagree on the issues and how to resolve them. But people take that personal. They -- I mean, they go straight for the jugular. We can set a cap on what the fines can run to. The value of the home. You go through the amnesty program. Seniors, you get help. Whatever fines are -- or -- or liens on it, it goes away.

We maintain a quality of life where we can compete with the Palm Beach Gardens, the Lake Parks, the North Palm Beaches, the West Palms. Why do we reduce our standards so low that it doesn't make us competitive with everybody around us? They go spend their money everywhere else. Why? I'm telling you, people, this is something that I feel is getting out of control about let's wipe everything out, when we have rational solutions where we can still maintain our upward trajectory. People are looking at Riviera Beach because a lot of good things are happening now. Some people don't want y'all to know that 'cause they want us -- want y'all to think that we're doing a whole lot of bad up here.

But we have a lot of investors that are coming in, not just east of the railroad track. We have people buying on the west side, too. We have new businesses coming on the west side. That haven't happened in 20 and 30 years. People buying those properties and the people don't want some people to know the positive things that's happening. All they want to do is just drill on what they perceive to be negative. So I would never support anything that will wipe everybody fines out. I will support a cap. I will support helping people correct their properties. Even if you're not elderly, you may be ill. We -- call my office. I -- and -- and that has been the case from the very beginning. But people get in the community and -- and -- and -- and want to demonize and villainize [sic] people because they don't agree with their solution. That's absurd.

And we all supposed to be rational-thinking people, right? So that's my position. I think that it can be done in the manner where we can maintain a certain quality of life and we

can continue to grow and our economy can grow. And with that, jobs are created. And unlike they said, a lot of our local people have been getting a lot of jobs and especially from that development, and I can produce the data, the names and the addresses for people that want them. We have been very, very focused on the jobs that come into our city that's come on public property. Our local residents get the first shot.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** No, they don't.

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** For those who are qualified. That wasn't an option. That was a requirement in our documents. And I can show you the language. So all of this about what we're not doing for -- all political. They don't like for me to talk because I'm going to tell it like it is.

**UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER:** Shut up, then.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** All right. Please.

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** And -- and -- and, Rev, I -- I never disrespected you.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** All right. All right. Exactly.

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** I'm not going to do it now.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Please. We're not going to tolerate that.

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** And -- and simply because we don't disagree -- so -- but I'm not intimidated. People want to go out and not support me because I'm being honest and I'm trying to give a vision of how we can grow and be prosperous where -- I mean, without reducing our standards, that's asinine to me. To me. So the -- the last thing I -- I -- I want to say is that our major problem from what I can see are from absentee landlords and slum landlords. Those are people that have been deteriorating our community. Whether we want to admit it or not, homestead people, they have been trying hard to keep their property up.

Absentee landlords and slum landlords. I'm telling you, people, and we need to be courageous enough to say that we all have to be responsible, to include the absentee and slum landlords. If you're going to go out and invest in a lot of property, keep them up. Somebody said that tonight. That's all we're saying. Don't come in trying to intimidate the council to erase everything and then start from scratch. Just keep the properties up. Those who live in your properties, call my office. Senior citizens, disabled, veterans. There's some people that -- that may have resources to do what is necessary and they don't understand that if I only do that, all those other fines will go away? Yeah. And the amnesty program is expiring in a month and I'm -- I'm ready to put a motion on the floor to extend it another year.

Nobody -- I had an attorney tell me, "Bruce, why do y'all keep extending the amnesty program, because that's supposed to encourage people to get in there under that window and do what they're supposed to do." I said, "Because we love our people and some of



them don't really have that opportunity to come over and do what they need to do." So we've been extending it, which is not normal, because the amnesty program is designed to encourage people, Well, you got a show-up window. You can erase all your fines. Get in here and correct them. We keep extending it. I'm prepared to do it again. So all this about we're not compassionate and we're not being considerate and that, whole bunch of malarkey. And it's self-serving. And I'm not intimidated by it.

And they'll go out in the community and tell people a whole bunch of lies and come in here and then get mad at you when you tell the people the truth. Who does that? So that's my position. We're willing to work with you. We can continue our trajectory upwards in an economically viable community and don't believe all that hype out there like we're being inconsiderate. We're not working with you and -- and we're trying to take your homes and all. Consider the source. And see if they have an ulterior motive. I'm done, Madam Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Okay. Thank you. I'd like to make a couple of comments. We have had an amnesty program on and off for the past seven years. Some people have taken advantage of it. Most have not. Someone got up to the podium a little while ago and trashed some of the developers that came in and took advantage of it. Developers came in about a year ago and they purchased the trailer parks on Broadway. All right? And they had a lot of liens on them. They used the amnesty program. They paid off the liens. They removed the blight from both of those lots and now they're getting ready to develop it. Amnesty program can work. I have -- I can be supportive and I will be supportive of helping residents who are homesteaded and who are on this list.

If you are homesteaded and you can't afford to bring your property up, I am more than happy to help get it that way. All right? And I think most of us on the council would be more than happy to assist you in getting your property up to the standards and then relieve you of those liens. I have a serious problem with the rentals and the commercial properties. Going through this list, we have Stonybrook on the list. Stonybrook owes \$215,500. Stonybrook is slum. Okay? The man that owns it lives in Tennessee. He is an absentee landlord that I believe could care less about the people that live there and about what the property looks like. And there is no way that I would ever support relieving him of that lien.

There are other properties on here that it's very obvious if you go on the PAPA website, you'll see they're commercial. They are rental properties with absentee landlords. And what happens is these absentee landlords live elsewhere but the people that live around these properties have to look at them, look at the blight day in and day out and it brings down the value of their property. We have people coming in here all the time, especially at budget year when we're trying to lower the millage, stating that their property is worth very little. And part of the reason is because of the codes. We don't -- the City puts liens and fines on these properties but people are not paying them off. So the people surrounding them, their property values are going down. Right? They're in a -- they're in a -- they're in a blighted area, also.

You know, I -- I have a really hard time just saying, Okay. I'm going to forgive everything and -- and hope that in 24 months people are able to, you know, bring their property up to

the standards where they should be. The cap, I have no problem with the cap and I have no problem with the cap on residential properties.

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** All right? But when it comes to the commercial properties and the absentee landlords, again, I have a problem with it.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Uh-huh.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** All right? You know, they come in. They purchase these properties and then they're off. And it's left to us. You know, I'll -- I'll take Stonybrook again for the example. Okay. So it's a blighted property. They have the people living in very poor conditions over there. Our police are over there all the time. The City's resources are going over there and this guy is just collecting the rents and could care less about anything else. And it's happening with other properties, too. You know, if -- we'll listen to the rest of the council, but if someone wants to put a motion about helping people who have homesteaded properties, helping them, you know, figure out how to -- how to bring their properties up to, you know, a certain standard so they can get rid of these liens, I'm all for it. There is no way I will support the absentee landlords and the commercial -- the commercial properties. They're just bringing this city down and we deserve -- every person deserves to live much better. All right. Anyone else or we're going to move on? Anyone?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** I'll wait until they speak first.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** You want to make a motion?

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Yeah, I'm willing to make a motion if nobody else is (unintelligible).

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** No.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** All right. Mr. Thomas.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** I got some things I --

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** -- want -- I got some things I want to say once they finish speaking --

**MAYOR MASTERS:** We -- we had --

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** -- before a motion get on the floor.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** For the motion. Correct. Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Go ahead, Mayor.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you. Actually my -- my question is to Councilman Davis. At the beginning of the meeting you were -- you were asking for a moratorium.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Correct.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Would -- would you explain or state to the viewing audience what is the difference between a moratorium and the so-called amnesty plan that we have now?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Well, it -- it just -- it's just a simple way we want to do the process. We can modify the amnesty if we choose to. But the whole sole purpose of -- like I stated -- calling this meeting is to focus on the process that will allow us to give the residents some relief. 'Cause some of the residents live in these absentee landlords' property. So let's talk about -- let's talk about those people. As a matter of fact, you talk about Stonybrooks, and I was on the ground actually being there carefully working with those families.

The -- and to give an update on that, recently there was a meeting held by the residents of Stonybrooks and the calls, the police calls have reduced by 60 percent. So they've done a great job of really being proactive and sharing their voice and having their community meetings and getting some things resolved. But to stay focused on this item, I want to wipe the slate clean, created a process that brings the people in. If there's any volunteers that want to come help the City, they should come to the City and you contact the City. It's the City job to give the residents and create a policy. We can create an ordinance to do this by ordinance that will supersede the -- the magistrate process. Create a process that will allow residents to come to the City Hall and work over 18 months. We talked about 24 months. Okay?

If 24 months is too much for y'all, let's look at 18 months. You come here. You register. You talk -- you bring your property -- you bring your documentation. We get the lenders here to say, Hey, listen. Okay. We do a public announcement. We do a press release. We focus on getting our message out to our own people. Whatever it takes, we need to just do that. Get the people here. Those that respond are the ones that we're going to help. Now, after a certain time period, even if it is 18 months, guess what? It goes back on if they don't respond. Those that choose not to do nothing are going to keep getting what they're getting. But I want to show people that -- business owners that we do care, as well. 'Cause when big developers come here, we give them relief with no problem.

Some developers have come here before. We have waived -- went through amnesty. And if you go look at those properties, those properties weren't up to compliance when that documentation came before us but we still gave them an opportunity through amnesty anyway. But if you want to be business-friendly, great. And we should be. So let's be residential-friendly. And I'm talking about residential friendly to those that are not necessarily in their own property, but those that are renting property. Because now you got a resident saying, Hey, listen, landlord. The City just gave you relief. You better do what you need to do or you're going to have some serious issues, because now the residents are trying to support us support them. Landlords, yes, we've got some

absentee landlords. Let's start, um -- let's do this. If they don't respond, then we call them out.

Let's talk about them publicly if they don't respond at that time. Put landlords on public notice if they don't support a moratorium. And they should be here with the -- they should be in this meeting. This should be a -- a strong call, a strong notice sent out, certified mail to every landlord, absentee or those that's doing a well job -- to respond to a meeting and assisting this city with helping their people that they're providing services for and providing housing for. I'm not going to play the game about, Well, residential, commercial. Listen. I'm here to show out for Riviera Beach and to do something different.

And if you want something different, you gotta create a shock sometime. This is our opportunity to do just that. I'm not going to waste a lot of time and keep talking for 20 and 30 minutes to sound well. I want an amnesty program. Matter of fact, I'm going to put it on the floor. I'm going to make a motion to put an amnesty -- wipe out all the liens, all the fines for 18 months. And for staff to go back and create documentation of amnesty program -- not amnesty but a moratorium and bring it back at the next meeting to discuss how we can create relief. And we can bring it back as a resolution or however -- however it so -- so may be. Would a resolution, Miss Ryan, be better for that?

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** (No audible response).

**MAYOR MASTERS:** So basic --

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Would a resolution --

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** Yes. Whatever you decide to do tonight will have to be brought back.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Have to come -- brought back, correct.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** In a formal document.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Yes. I'm -- I'm willing to put a motion on the floor to wipe out all fines and all liens pending a moratorium with the documentation coming back to this board with staff's recommendation showing how do we move forward and how do we help people. And then we can make a decision from there.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** And that basically would get people --

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Hold on a second. There's a motion on the floor. Is there a second.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** No, what -- there's not a motion on the floor. He said he's willing to put one.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** I made a motion.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** A motion.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** I made a motion.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Oh.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Is there a second?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** But I --

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Second.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** All right.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Question.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Go ahead, Mr. Thomas.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Okay. First, in Mr. Davis's motion, he said fines and liens.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Right. And --

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** correct.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** And originally I heard staff tell us that we don't have the power to do anything with fines. Is that still accurate or did something change when I went out of the room?

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** Nothing changed (unintelligible).

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** It's accurate.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Okay. So -- all right. No problem. So I'm -- I'm -- I'm almost there with you, Mr. Davis. But I -- I'm not there with -- with all of them so --

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Well, let me clarify that issue, then. Attorney Ryan, via resolution can I address this fine? Yes or no?

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** You know, I don't know. I mean, I'm going to be honest with you. This is the first time I'm ever hearing anything about this. So we have not had an opportunity to research it. I just looked at the statute. The statute only addresses fines in terms of a Code Enforcement board.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Board.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** Or a special magistrate. So I really --

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** And it says "may," correct? Not to cut you off. I apologize.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** No. It does say "may."

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** It does say "may," which means we have the discretion as this board --

**MAYOR MASTERS:** May.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** -- to assist the magistrate when making -- making a decision, correct? Via resolution.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** You may.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Thank you.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** I -- I -- I -- no, no, no. You may have that authority. I -- I don't want it to be --

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** So which means my motion may be okay.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** Correct.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Thank you.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** But -- and so that's why I want -- that's one of the reasons why we would have to bring something back because I definitely would want to research this.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Thank you.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** I would not want (unintelligible) --

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** I -- I appreciate that. And we can address that then.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** Sure. Sure.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** You know, at the next meeting, you know? We just don't want to --

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** We -- we're listening and taking notes and --

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** And then we come back and what we need to hash out, we move forward from there.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** So the motion's going to give people a reprieve for 18 months? That's what you --

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Yes. Yes, sir.

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** Madam Chair?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I'm -- I'm good with that.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Hold on a second.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** (Unintelligible).

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Wait. Mr. -- Mr. Thomas still had the floor.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** No respect (unintelligible).

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** I -- I'm -- I'm a little bit uncomfortable with blanketly doing that. Now, there are -- I have gone through this list. And I'm willing to make an amendment to your motion or I'll just make a fresh motion. But to say to a Stonybrook, We're going to forgive your liens with the condition that's in there, I'm not willing to do that at all. And any of the other commercial properties that are on here, I'm not willing to do that.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Madam Chair, just to address this issue since we want -- I want to make Councilman Thomas very comfortable.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Hold on a second. Mr. Thomas, are you done with your comments or you want him to address it?

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Let me just give him the other things that I have --

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Go right ahead, sir. You have the floor.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** -- on here, as well. And I prefer to make a fresh motion but if that motion is to -- to stand, anything that's -- anything that is -- is commercially owned must come out of this motion, period. And then I want to talk more about the properties that are rental properties. But if you want to give a blanket reprieve to any of the residents that live in those homes, I'm 100 percent with you. But it's going to have to be -- and I'd prefer to put the addresses inside of the motion that I -- I want to deal with.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** Wait. I believe I had next.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** I was gonna -- no, I was trying to address this issue so --

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** Oh.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** -- you can move forward.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Are you done with --

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Yes, ma'am.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** -- Mr. Thomas? All right. Go ahead, Mr. Davis.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Thank you. I appreciate it. Just for time sensitivity, we gotta understand, this is not a final decision. This is a recommendation for staff to bring some information back so we can hash -- hash all that out then. Because what I'm saying in that moratorium, that we're -- we're going to send a notice to those residents, to those property owners, as well, in the commercial, because we want to show that we're business-friendly. Say, Hey, Stonybrook's owner, you need to come down from Tennessee. You need to be here in this specific meeting date, certified mail, as well as a phone call. And if he chooses not, so those loan -- those liens and those fines go right back on that property if they choose not to show up. And now that way we can have a sense of accountability for the commercial properties' owners at that time. And we can discuss all this stuff out in the next meeting when staff brings it back. And you can add all your stuff into it and whatever other colleagues want to do, then we can go through that process. But --

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** But the --

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** -- all I'm saying is we give them a time frame. We put a notice of a meeting that we're going to have here at this city.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Madam Chair, I just want to clarify the motion so I understand it.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Give them plenty of time to respond.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** I just want to clarify.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Go ahead.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** It's okay?

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Well, no. Ask Mr. Davis to restate his motion.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Okay.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** My motion is to wipe out -- to create an overall -- a -- a moratorium that allows us to wipe out all liens and all fines.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** But a moratorium doesn't do that.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** No.



**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Correct.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Okay.

**CITY MANAGER JONES:** (Unintelligible).

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** No. Let -- let me be very clear. I said the first motion -- the motion was to wipe out all liens and fines and then create a moratorium. That's what I stated. Hold on.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Wipe out all -- go ahead.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Wipe all liens and fines. Create a moratorium for 18 months where staff with the -- and then staff will draw up a resolution coming back stating that we -- creating a process that states that we're going to have a public meeting to -- that all property owners and all property -- whether they're renting or owning a property, come back -- come to the city, just like we're having now. Give them three months, four months to actually -- let's say we do it in 90 days. They come back, let's say in March. They come to the City. We have a meeting to address this. If the commercial property owners don't show up for that meeting, guess what? All the -- the commercial properties. Them specifically. The other meeting's separate for the residential. They're homesteaded. But we're going to give commercial, the rental property owners, the actual owners of property who are renting property, we're going to give them 90 days to come to our establishment. If they choose not to show up, then all their codes and liens go right back on their property.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Okay.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** So we address them for -- separately from the homesteaded properties.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Are you willing to take commercial properties out of your motion?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** I'm going to leave it in my motion specifying that, in fact, it's very clear that I want the commercial property owners to show up to a special meeting to the city, here.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Okay.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Sign up. Understand what we want from them. And if they choose not to move forward on that, and they don't show up, all those that don't show up, immediately go right back on to their record.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** So all you're doing, you're setting it aside and giving them 90 days to get (unintelligible).

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Exactly. But the residential, those are wiped and they come through the amnesty and we talk about the things the other council members have stated on this board. But the same token, I'm trying to be business-friendly. Say, Listen, now. We're not liking what you're doing but let's start from scratch here. Come to the city. Let's have a conversation. Our staff is here. You're on notice. If you choose not to come, guess what? We've done our job but those who come, the residents who have homesteaded properties, that's a separate -- that's a separate issue that's dealing within that -- within that motion. Those, the volunteers that want to come help them, they can be here, as well, just like Councilman Guyton stated before. He got -- there's people that -- here in this city that can do the work. Lynne Hubbard's Ministries or whoever they may be, they all need to be here in that meeting so we can understand how we move forward as a team in Riviera Beach.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Miss -- Miss Ryan, if a -- if a substitute motion is made, we have to address the substitute motion first of the -- the original motion first?

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Substitute.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** Right. But it depends on what you're -- if you're doing a totally different motion then maybe you should just wait and take care of his motion. But if you're amending his motion --

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** I don't want -- I don't want to amend his motion. He's been clear that that's the motion he wants.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Okay.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** Right.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** All right. So there's --

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** -- there's a motion and a second.

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** Yeah. Well, Madam Chair --

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Yeah. And --

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** -- on the question here, should this pass, this would be the beginning of more deterioration in our community. This is a can of worms that is going to be setting a precedent that we could never live down. Twenty years from now, people are going to be looking back at this action wanting the same consideration and not take care of their property and then use this motion as a reason why not. We have an amnesty program. We have people willing to help them bring it up to code. Why we're going to do something that will create mass confusion? 'Cause we can't even get the motion right on it. I mean, you know --

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Call for the question.

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** -- we want this motion, a substitute motion, no, we don't commercial. No, no, no, no, no, no. The rational thing to do in my opinion, use the amnesty program, help people get their property up to standards, and all those fines go away. Why are we going through saying that we're not even going to have any enforcement for 18 months? That's what the moratorium is. That mean you stop doing something.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Right.

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** For a while.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Right.

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** Who does that?

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Exactly.

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** This is the most ridiculous thing I have ever heard in all my life in government, and I've been in government all my adult life. This is crazy. And it's all for political reasons.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Hold on. Listen.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** If -- if we wanted to do this or they wanted to do it, why did they wait to right before an election? You've been here two years, three years. But you wait until right before an election when you're trying to get support and then you put something out, to me, that is very ridiculous. We have rational options to keep the quality of our life. We, as black folks, as they like to say -- but now looking -- I'm done. I'm done, Mr. Chairman.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Okay. So there is a motion and a second. Madam Clerk?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I --

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** **COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON.**

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** -- one second. So I didn't get a chance to make any comments?

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** I didn't hear you ask for the floor.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well, I was getting ready to.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Okay. Go ahead, ma'am.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I've sat here and I've listened to everyone and, you know, we've talked about the wiping of the liens. We've talked about it, you know, bringing down the city. We've talked about taking out commercial. I mean, we've gone here, there, all over the place with this. And I just want to -- maybe I need to just -- I did second this. I want to make -- be very clear. I did second it so that he could say what he need to say. I do understand the point of holding our commercial owners to a higher standard. They do have the money. They did invest in -- into the properties and -- and it is expected for them to uphold their side of the deal when they do that. I do have a concern, though, for those that -- the residents that do live in the homes and they're not the home -- the owner of the property. They're actually renting. So I'm kind of caught in between all of that. What I want to know is that with this not imposing or having the moratorium for the next 18 months, how does that -- how does that affect us? And -- and -- and I ask that to say if we do that for 18 months, people don't keep up their properties. They can just do that and nothing is held against them for that.

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** That's right. That's a moratorium.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** That's a moratorium.

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** That's a moratorium. That's crazy.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** No, it's not crazy.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Hold on. Miss Miller has the floor.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** I want to respond to what she stated.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** He -- he can -- well, I was trying to get

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** (Unintelligible). 55

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Stop saying it's crazy, then.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Wait. I got the floor.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** You want to answer it?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Thank you. Go ahead.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Thank you so much for listening, Councilman Miller-Anderson. Let's let cool heads prevail here. You can have your own opinion but don't call it asinine; don't call it ridiculous. Just say, Listen, I just choose to disagree with how you make your decision. But what I stated was we create a public meeting for everyone to show up, those property owners. Let's say 90 days from now. If the residents or a

property owner -- let's say we have a whole full day. It might be a Saturday. If the residents or the property owners don't show up within those 90 days -- that -- that meeting 90 days from now or from whenever the staff bring the language back, they all go right back on to the property. They don't even qualify. 'Cause what you're saying is we invite you here to go through a process, a onetime process.

If you don't show up, you -- it -- those liens and those fines go directly back on that property. And in amnesty, you're right. It does freeze it. It's -- we're trying to help those that want to help themselves. Okay? 'Cause a lot of business owners, quite frankly, some of them are struggling, too. Some of those business owners are right here within this community. People think we have landlords just outside this community. We have landlords within this community, as well. All I'm stating is we can argue about the language all night but we have another meeting to discuss this because staff haven't drawn anything up yet. And then we might -- I might come back with a different option.

But let's put something down at this time to bring back to -- to discuss and let's look at staff bring a rough draft back so we can move forward. I can sit here all day and have an argument about my opinion and just try to talk about people and what's people gonna say about this meeting? This motion have great intent to bring people into compliance. Those that's willing to show into a meeting in March after the election -- and the reason I put this motion on the floor when I could, because for two years I couldn't get a motion even second in this meeting. But now we got somebody up here that does have some common sense and wouldn't understand it -- not to say some of y'all don't 'cause at times I do get a -- I do get a second.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Okay.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** But now I know either they don't agree, they'll at least second it for discussion and show that we're working together as a team. I'm just trying to get something moving forward and stop wasting the taxpayers' time so we can set up for the next meeting because that's -- 'cause -- 'cause staff have to go back legally and say what we can and can't do and then bring it back like Miss Ryan stated. She need to look at this more. So we'll wait till she come back, based on the motion that's put on the floor, and then we discuss it from there. And then she might say, Well, you might want to do this; you might want to do that, based on my legal findings, and then we go from there. And that's a whole 'nother separate two-hour, three-hour meeting versus waiting an hour -- wasting an hour to talk about a motion that's on the floor when we're just trying to move forward to the next meeting. This is not saying something's happening immediately today. It's for language to come back to us in the next meeting to figure out which way we want to go. That's all.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. But I'm -- just so I'm clear --

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Uh-huh.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** -- at the -- but part of the motion says to wipe out the liens.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. So we wipe them out but we'll be waiting for other language to come to see how we will move forward?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** No.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Or we're going to --

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** It's -- it's to -- it's to wipe out the -- wipe out the liens and codes.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Uh-huh.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Immediately pending when -- immediately pending, that -- that we're going to set a meeting date.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Uh-huh.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Ninety days from the -- the language has to come back. Ninety days from -- that we come back in a meeting and we vote on it. Let's say it's the first meeting in April or whatever, last meeting in March. Let's say that. The first meeting we have in March after the election.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Uh-huh.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Once that happen, we'll discuss, Okay. Now. We've got a date set up when we're going to come back. Well, let's say it's in March. Those liens haven't been wiped out, then fine. Staff has sent notices out, certified notices, made phone calls to all those landlords.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Uh-huh.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** They come to here, the City of Riviera Beach on a Saturday morning. We're here from 9:00 to 3:00. We -- you know, we do town halls. This is an opportunity where you open up the City Hall to really do something very significant for the entire city. Those that don't show up, immediately they're not in compliance. They're not -- they don't qualify. They go right back before the magistrate and they take care of that situation there. But those that day, if I'm a --

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** But --

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** -- if I'm a landlord and I say, Hey, by the way, the code liens are -- are lifted. Now, what do I need to do as a landlord to get this in compliance right now?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** But let me -- but let me ask you. And I'm -- and I'm -- I'm -- I really want to support you on this.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** No, go ahead. Take your time.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** But if we're wiping them out, why would we come back three months later for a meeting? Or is it some -- I --

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** No, wiping them out pending. There -- there's a meeting.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Okay. So we're not actually --

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Not -- not today.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** -- gonna wipe them out?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** No. No.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** You're setting them aside.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Setting -- setting aside.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** They're not going to wipe them out today.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Okay.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** This is setting up the language for her to bring back.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** So let's say there's a meeting in March, the second -- the first meeting in March after the election. We have a date set up, let's say, for a specific Saturday. They all will come, residents, property owners, whoever they may be.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Uh-huh.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** They come to our -- we have an amnesty program here. We have everybody here in this room. We have some people invite some services, volunteers, and we're going to create a plan. Staff have got time to create a plan on how we're going to move forward.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** If those property owners do not show up for that meeting --

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** -- immediately, they don't qualify for what we're trying to do today. This is a short window to give you something big to do with your life.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Uh-huh.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So in other words, so we would freeze as of tonight --

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** -- whatever, then three months later we'll have a meeting, talk about how they can --

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Public -- a -- a -- a public meeting.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yeah. Right. Right. So that everyone can come up and discuss how they can figure out how they can --

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Right.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** -- take care of their liens or wipe them out or whatever.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Uh-huh.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And then at that point those three months will allow us to have time to figure out how to --

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** To create a plan on how we're going to structure something here on a Saturday.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Uh-huh.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** A full-day Saturday. I don't -- I mean, we need to do what we gotta do.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And then if they don't show up, then that means --

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** That's on them.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** -- they didn't --

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** -- it go right back --

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Go back to wherever --



**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** -- to where -- it go back.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Go right back on them. Boom.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** To where they were.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Yeah. Liens, fines and everything else.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. I -- I can support that but --

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Immediately.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** -- I -- I don't believe that motion said that. At least that's not the way I interpret it when it was said. So I just want to make sure it says what it -- you know, what you want it to mean.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Well, that's -- that's -- I'm -- I'm interpreting, being very clear now so that way there's --

**MAYOR MASTERS:** (Unintelligible) set aside.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** -- that way it's in the record.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Set aside (unintelligible).

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** That way it's in the record.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Can you just do a fresh one?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Hold -- hold on.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Can you do a fresh one?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** No, I'm just going to state --

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** If you can't do a fresh motion, then it's too convoluted.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** No, no, hold -- hold on. Hold on. First of all --

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Wait, guys.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** -- she asked me for clarification.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Okay. No problem.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** I gave her clarification.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** You got it.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Everybody on this board agree and I'm just trying to move forward.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** No problem.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Right.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And that's --

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** -- that's what I want, too. That's what I want.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** That's -- I clarified the -- I clarified the motion. That's what Miss Councilman Miller-Anderson asked for.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I think -- how should it be said?

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** (Unintelligible) --

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** Call the question.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** No.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** No, no, no.

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** Oh, I'm sorry.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Hold on.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Wait, she still has the floor.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** No, no.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** And then we'll call the question.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Because I -- I -- like I said, I want to support him. I -- I -- I'm agreeing with what he wants to do but I -- I -- I just don't -- I can't say yes to that motion because it doesn't -- for me it doesn't say what we just discussed.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** So make it fresh.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** That's the only thing. And so --

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** So what would you like for me to do?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I mean, I can --

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** You say it; I'll do it.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** -- I --

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I think if you use the words "set aside" rather than "wipe out," I think that would do it.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** I -- I would amend my motion and as "set aside" the liens and the fines pending the language that comes back in return as we set up a future date for a meeting to address these issues.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Okay. Are you good with that? Is your -- does your second still stand?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So we're basically freezing --

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** -- them as of today. We won't apply any more liens or fines --

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Correct.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** -- until we come back for the meeting?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Yes.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** Well, I think his motion is that we'll come back with something before --

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Some language to come back before we set a meeting.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** Right. We're not doing it starting tonight.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Not starting tonight.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Okay. All right. So that was the motion and a second. Madam Clerk?

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** I just have one quick question.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Is the second -- does the second still stand?

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Yeah. She said yes.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes, it does. Yeah.

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** Okay. I'm going to have a question if it still --

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** One quick question. We have a Code Enforcement Department. What are they going to do for 18 months?

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** I guess furlough.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** We're -- we're not talking about --

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** No, we ain't talking about no furlough.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Maybe we could bring that back in 90 days, too.

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** What --

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** -- what are they going to do if --

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Well, you know --

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** -- if it's a moratorium, which means all that stops? What is that department going to do for 18 months? Will -- will somebody answer me, there's?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** I can talk about it after this motion is dispensed.

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** Okay. After the motion. Okay.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** And then we can discuss it at that time.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well, let me -- the 18 months, I didn't hear 18 months right now.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** That was his motion.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Oh --

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** (Unintelligible).

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Huh?

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** That was in the motion.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** That was in his motion.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** Okay. The motion -- the motion -- the motion that I have written down is to set aside all fines and liens for 18 months for staff to bring back a -- some kind of a moratorium --

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** In 90 days.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** -- which would establish -- I didn't get the 90 days.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** A meeting in 90 days. A public --

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Let's -- let's just do the whole motion over if you can.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** I asked for that. He didn't want to do that.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** 'Cause that -- that's not what we just said.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** Also, I -- I'm kind of wondering what -- does that mean Code Enforcement does not impose any new fines or liens on new -- on other properties?

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** That's what you said.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Right. That's --

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** We're not going to -- so we're just not going to do anything?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** No. Not impose the --

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** That was his motion.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** -- fines. Not impose the liens but not fines.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Okay. Point of -- point of order, Madam Chair.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** Okay. And also, just so you all know --

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Point -- point of order, Mr. Chairman.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** -- (unintelligible) --

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Yes, sir. What's (unintelligible)?

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** It is imperative that Mr. Davis restates his motion because of what it implies. No one understands because it keeps being added. A moratorium means just that; there will be no Code Enforcement.

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** Stop. That's what it means.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** That -- that's what I'm saying. So he needs to restate his motion so that we all understand exactly what he's trying to do.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Okay. I agree with that, sir.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Madam Chair? Madam Chair? A moratorium is on the issue that --

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Go ahead.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** -- that's -- we discussed in the hand. Whether it's Code Enforcement liens or was it Code Enforcement fines. But I will discuss -- I will amend -- I will restate my motion to be very clear here.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Go ahead.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Because I do want Code Enforcement to continue setting fines, but I want the liens to stop while the fines are still working, because we still want to make sure the people understand we're out there keeping them in compliance 'cause that's the main focus. I don't want to take them from their main focus and give them that kind of vacation that people are suggesting. But I want them to be able to go out there and still continue doing fines but no more liens until we address this matter.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Okay. Please restate your full motion, sir.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** I -- I will state a motion that this board, at the very next meeting, that staff bring back language that states a meeting the -- a meeting -- there will be a public meeting in -- in March after the election. The first meeting in March after the election that talks about they will invite residents and property owners to the City to address liens, fines for compliance. If they don't respond, those liens and fines will immediately go right back on to that property.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** (Unintelligible) set aside (unintelligible).

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** To set aside with the -- with the set aside. I mean, that's in there. I mean, with the set aside for 90 days until we decide on what the meeting date is going to be.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Miss Miller, does your second still stand?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I do want to second this but I -- I'm -- I'm so serious. I really want to make sure that the motion is clearly -- it's clear to everybody.

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** Right.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** Madam Chair, may I offer --

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** I'd like to hear what -- I'd like to hear what every --

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Hold on.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** -- I'd like to hear from the rest of the board to hear exactly what part -- I hear what Councilman Miller-Anderson is asking for.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** All right. So there's no second on that motion?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Not right this second, no.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** All right. All right. There's no second.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** No.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Attorney Ryan had a suggestion.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well, go ahead.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Madam Chair? I will restate a motion so we can be very clear and I will -- I will chop it up a little bit more, 'cause that seems to be a little too much going on in that motion and I will definitely correct myself on that with making a motion to freeze all liens and fines for 90 days pending that staff come back with language on how we move forward.

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** (Unintelligible).

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** No. No. No. No, moratorium on -- on -- on liens. But the fines -- well, I want to freeze all the -- all the -- all the, um -- yeah, the liens. But the fines will -- they can continue to fine people out there but I definitely want to freeze the liens from now.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Attorney Ryan would -- had --

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Come back for 90 days.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** -- had a clarification, Madam Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** So that's the motion. Is there a second?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Can I -- can we let Miss Ryan say what she was getting ready to say first, please?

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Well --

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** Well, the -- the --

**MAYOR MASTERS:** To try to clarify --

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** Yeah.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Okay. There's a motion.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** You've gotta have a second.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** Okay. This was going to be my suggestion.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Can't -- can't say nothing 'cause there's no second on the floor.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** I wanted to suggest that --

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I want to hear what she has to say.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** -- perhaps Mr. Davis could put exactly what he wants in writing and just allow me to research the issue of whether or not we can even do it, because, you know, we're talking about putting all of this stuff together and I don't even know if we can do it. I really don't. And I don't know if I will have a response which would be --

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** I'm fine with that.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** -- a -- yeah. A written response in --

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Yes.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** -- at -- within the next couple of weeks and staff having some kind of a presentation -- you know, a presentation with a -- a resolution. It's just going to be too much to get done.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Good job.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** But if -- yeah, if you can do that,

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yeah.



**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Thank you.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** Put it in writing and I will research the issue to -- and send out a memo.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** It shouldn't be -- it shouldn't be this hard to do good. But yes, I -- I agree with you, Miss Ryan.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Have it by the next meeting. Will it take 30 days?

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** I appreciate that.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** How long do you think you'll -- how much time do you need to research it?

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** Well, I'll -- I'll have something researched and -- but Mr. Davis -- I kind of have an idea.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** I will -- I can get some -- I'll get something to you, as well, to help out.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** But if you can get something to me by your next --

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Yes.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** -- not -- not Wednesday's council meeting.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** The next -- the next one. Yes.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** But by your next council meeting I'll have something for the council in writing.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** That's what I'm saying.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Okay. So that's it with this item? We're going to move on now?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** I mean, I -- I would like to take a stab at a motion.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** All right. I gotta go.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Go right ahead, sir. Stay.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** I think that -- oh, go ahead.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Go ahead, Mr. Thomas. You have the floor.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Unless the board wants to go with what Miss Ryan has suggested.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I'm -- I'm good with that.

**COUNCILPERSON GUYTON:** I do. Yeah. I do.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** All right. Thank you.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** But I would like to hear what --

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** All right. We're going to move on now. Item 2, Standby water charges and liens.

## 2. *STANDBY WATER CHARGES & LIENS*

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Okay. We will go to Public Comment first and then whatever's going to happen. Reverend Evans and then Mr. Lewis.

**REVEREND EVANS:** Yes. I'm Reverend Evans, A.C. Evans.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Good evening again.

**REVEREND EVANS:** And of course I -- what I'm about to present to you tonight --

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** I'm sorry, sir. Please go ahead. Please sit down.

**REVEREND EVANS:** What I'm -- what I'm presenting you tonight, I'm -- I realize that you probably won't be able to do anything with it. But I want the -- the city manager and each of you -- whoever want -- takes a record of it, make a note of it, because this is in regards to my property at 1211 Avenue U, Riviera Beach, that I've been -- have an active water bill I pay every month. At about maybe 20 years ago -- I'm sure the Planning & Zoning can check that out, I did a day care center there. And I had two lots, 39 and 40. And I had a water meter on both lots. One was 1201, one was 1211, but the City requested before they gave me approval for the day -- the City, Riviera Beach requested this -- before they even give -- approved my license for the day care center to do a unity of title. You understand what that is, right?

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Yes.

**REVEREND EVANS:** Yeah, a unity of title mean that instead -- rather than having two properties, you got one property.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Uh-huh.

**REVEREND EVANS:** So if I only one property I don't need two water meters. And the other one, I don't even know where it is. It's been sitting there for 40, 30 years or whatever with a standby charge running on it that's -- now it's up to some 30 some thousand dollars for the water. So I'm just saying make a note of this because I will be coming back probably with an attorney next time. Because I know that I have something legal on this, because the City of Riviera Beach, they set the standards that I couldn't -- I had to do a unity of title, which mean I'm putting both lots together, which is only one property now. Still one property. Lots 39 and 40 on Avenue U. It's like -- it's one property and -- but -- but I'm still -- got two water meters sitting there and I've got an active bill going on 1211 and then the standby charge running on 12 -- well, 1201 Avenue U, which has been running for years and years and years. And I'm not using it, don't have no reason to use it 'cause I only have one property there. So I'll be getting back with you on that. I won't take up your time tonight.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Wait, Reverend Evans, I have a question for you.

**REVEREND EVANS:** Yeah.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** So when did you first bring this to the City's attention?

**REVEREND EVANS:** Well, I'm bring -- you have it on the agenda tonight. I'm bringing it tonight.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Right. But were they aware, you know -- were they aware that you were having this issue?

**REVEREND EVANS:** Well, I'll talk to -- I've -- I've talked to the city council once before about it in my -- in my comments. But --

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Okay. Mr. Sherman's going to get with you.

**REVEREND EVANS:** Okay. But -- but I -- I -- I would like to talk to someone about it 'cause I definitely do need -- other than coming and bringing an attorney back, make sure we get this straight.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Right.

**REVEREND EVANS:** Because I -- legally I know that if they -- if the City insisted on me putting the property in one, making one property, I shouldn't be having two water -- two water meters running and I'm paying on one every month.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Okay. Mr. Sherman right behind you, he's going to talk to you. All right. Thank you. Okay. Mr. Marocosan [phonetic] Lewis. Is he still here? Rodney Roberts and then Avon Atkins. Rodney?

**RODNEY ROBERTS:** Yes. Yes. Yes. Rodney Roberts, 1581 W. 14<sup>th</sup> Street, Riviera Beach, Federal Gardens. Public Comments. A lot of talk going on. One things I -- one thing that I did understand about fines and liens is that you can fast-track the fines and make them liens so that they can go -- you can go ahead and do what you want to do with them at that point in time. So if you want to, I mean, give the people relief, you can make it happen. Wow. This is -- it's a -- it's -- it's a lot. It's -- it's -- it's something about a person that tries to make everybody else feel like they are less intelligent or like they're dumb or like somebody -- like somebody's after them. Like somebody's trying to get them. And --

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Uh-huh.

**RODNEY ROBERTS:** -- it -- it -- it seems nuts to me. But I try to be understanding of everybody and, you know, what they -- what they say and what their perspective is. But we have to -- we -- we have -- we're going to have to come to some sort of -- of -- of medium. And I don't think that medium should be, as I perceive it to have been for over the past decade, the gentrification of the people that settled this community. And I don't -- I -- I -- I don't think that it should be, you know, making -- making life harder for people. People -- as a board, I think that you all should be trying to make life easier for people. Easier.

Like, I -- and I -- I don't -- I don't -- I might not understand everything that government does but I see that it seems like the pressure that should be applied to people that have money is -- is not applied and the -- the -- the pressure that -- for people that they don't have money or they might not be involved in -- in -- in policy and community, it's -- it -- it's put over there on their backs. And I -- I just don't think that it's fair. I think that you all have way more sense than you -- than -- than you're showing, as far as I'm concerned. Take it how you want. I'm just saying when -- when -- when you have the chance to do right by people and to treat people fairly and to give people relief, you don't. And it's been going on again, like, since before you all got here with the different councils in the past and it's just come to this -- to this head. The same way with the water bill. You said that it should have been -- problem should have been being fixed decades ago but they were left unfixed. And now this generation has to take on --

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Right.

**RODNEY ROBERTS:** -- those -- those bills. And -- but again, we have to have -- we have to find some sort of medium to do that, to help that situation out, because the amount of money that the bills are going up, from what I'm hearing, is not -- is not going to work for the people that's -- that's here. So I tell you --

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Thank you, sir. Avon Atkins and then Bonnie Larson.

**AVON ATKINS:** Good evening. My name is Avon Atkins, 1464 W. 31<sup>st</sup> Street.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Good evening, sir.

**AVON ATKINS:** I'm retired. I have a -- an apartment or a duplex. And last month my bill's like \$40 on a standby unit that's -- which is my son. He's in the Navy. And my bill where I live at in the -- in the -- the second half of the duplex was, like, \$55. To me that don't make any sense. Why should I be paying a \$40-a-month standby on my son -- a duplex apartment and I'm in the front there paying \$55 a month? Why is -- why is it so high for a standby apartment or -- or meter in that case? You understand what I'm saying?

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** I totally understand. And we're going to --

**AVON ATKINS:** My water meter for the -- for my son's unit is -- is \$40 this month. The unit where I live in and stay in is \$55. Previously that water standby meter was 27.27 a month, which I could -- you know, you -- you deal with it. That's not too much. But that's a big jump.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Okay. We're going to have Mr. Sherman address the standby issue. As far as I'm aware, we didn't raise the standby. Is your -- you mentioned that your son is in the Navy? Is he deployed?

**AVON ATKINS:** No, that's -- that's immaterial. I'm saying that that unit --

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Well --

**AVON ATKINS:** -- is a duplex.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Right. I understand that.

**AVON ATKINS:** My son lived there before he joined the military.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Uh-huh.

**AVON ATKINS:** So it's empty. So it's -- like, it's a standby meter and it's -- it was previously 27.72, something like that, a month. This month it's, like, \$40.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Okay.

**AVON ATKINS:** For a standby.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Want to say something? Say something.

**AVON ATKINS:** And also I'd like to say, you know, I've been sitting here. A lot of people left because, I mean, you guys -- I mean, you're doing your job. You know, you've got different communities. But I mean, this is ridiculous. The only guy up there that seem like he had any sense is Mr. Davis. I mean, what he proposed was simple, concise, to the point. And you got a lot of people, I don't know, showboating. But me as a citizen, come election I'll know who to put in office.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Okay. Thank you. Bonnie Larson and then Margaret Shepherd.

**BONNIE LARSON:** Bonnie Larson. I know Rodney Roberts and sometimes we agree and sometimes we don't. I don't like anyone -- I'm saying this to him. I don't talk behind his back. I don't want anyone coming to this podium and say, "You white people have money so you can pay. You white people have higher standards than we do." We all live in this city. We all have bills. Our water bills went up. Mine went up 50 percent. And I said at the last meeting, think about those people that have four or five kids. Everybody takes a shower every day. What are they going to do? And this gentleman just said \$40 for a unit that's not even -- that's not even being used. We have -- all right. Let's talk about that. There's something called a base readiness charge. And that's exactly what he was talking about, is you get charged whether you're there or not, whether you use one drop of water. You're still going to get charged that base unit. Why is that? Why is that? It -- it doesn't make sense.

The -- the Utility Department is an enterprise which means it makes money for the City but that is totally unfair if you're not doing it. Then later on in the documents it said something about the base readiness charge would not be charged -- would not be assessed if a meter removed and structure demolished. So you have to demolish your structure not to have a base salary [sic]? That's ridiculous. As -- absolutely ridiculous. You wonder why people are -- can't afford to pay. And -- and what is it? Okay. So what is that base readiness? It said in there that that was an expense of the Utility Department to keep the services available for you should you use it. What expenses are there to keep that water line ready? I don't understand that.

So you have to now remove the water meter and demolish your buildings in order not to have that. It's just not fair. Discontinuous fees. Yeah. There's a minimum for that. That's what he was talking about. Charges are assessed by ERU. It said that in the backup. What is an ERU? When we have things like that, let's spell it out so people know what you're talking about. Then it said here -- I didn't understand this, either. It said, "When the South Water -- South Florida Water Waste Management imposes their restrictions, then we have a surcharge." Why is that? So the Utility Department's making a lot of money, even on people who don't use their water. And you know, I don't understand. The best thing that this -- the council can do is reverse that resolution which said our water bills are going to go up every single year.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I agree.

**BONNIE LARSON:** Now, the document said that there's a potential for increasing in 2016. That resolution says it'll go up every single year. Why is it? There's enough money in that fund. You know, our water -- our -- our drain -- we don't have drainage. We don't have things. When we bought that industrial property, money was taken out of the Utility Department. When everybody got a \$12,000 raise, that came out of the Utility Department. There's money there but we're being charged. Even if we're not using our water. What is the -- what -- what does it cost to have your water available to you? That doesn't make sense. So let's reverse that resolution. Get rid of those yearly raises for the water bills.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Yeah. Margaret Shepherd and then Ira Herbert.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I agree with you, Miss. Yeah.

**MARGARET SHEPHERD:** Margaret Shepherd, Riviera Beach.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Good evening.

**MARGARET SHEPHERD:** Let -- let me first say to all of you, I think that you did the best that you can do. I think a lot of this was given to you all. Although Mr. Thomas started out to do this project, got a little sidetracked. But you know, let's -- let's be reasonable. Mr. Davis, I think you did a bumper job of bringing this back together again. My water was shut off. My water was shut off. My water is included in my rent. And the water was shut off. They see on the door there's oxygen in that house. The guy came by one day and he says, "I'm not going to touch your water. I see the sign." I think it's very insensitive that people that are ill, something should be noted on the record like with FP&L. Noted on the record that electricity cannot be shut off without them notifying me. The landlord got no such letter. The water has almost doubled. He wanted to know who was in the house. Nobody in there but me and God. Certainly I don't think God was doing nothing but looking over me.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Miss Shepherd, you're so funny.

**MARGARET SHEPHERD:** No, Mayor. I'm telling the truth. I'm telling the truth. I -- I -- I tell you, I -- I'm just baffled with this. So we can -- we can bash Reverend Evans. He led the charge. But something should have been done a long time ago. Because something happened. And I'm not going to blame anybody. Something happened. And -- and Mr. Davis and all of you trying to find out what happened, but the City done bash each other for what, two and a half hours. And it's cold in here. Let me tell you that. It's absolutely ice cold. I can hardly walk. Although it's cold at Hilltop, you all. It's kind of cold in there. I know it's kind of cold in there.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** They don't freeze you at Hilltop, though, do they?

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Hey. Hey, hey, hey, all right. Please. Please.

**MARGARET SHEPHERD:** I'm just saying it's cold. And -- and -- and not -- I'm just making a joke that -- to save some type of energy. You know, you have seniors here that -- you know, to sit here all night for this to talk about our water bills, electricity and all of that, you guys have to get together. It should have been a workshop. Should have been a workshop. It shouldn't have come to this. But I think all of you -- and I'm not going to bash one another. And Mayor, before I go, he said something and I -- and -- and I should have said it Wednesday night. I don't care where I get out of my car, I don't care where I go, my neighbors, what I -- Mayor, I will be supporting you this year. Through with it.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you. I appreciate your support.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Ira Herbert and then Reverend Davis.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you, Miss Shepherd, for your support again.

**MARGARET SHEPHERD:** You're welcome.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Evening, sir.

**IRA HERBERT:** I want to say good evening. This is my first time physically coming before you.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Well, welcome, sir. Thank you.

**IRA HERBERT:** But I do -- I do watch you on your television. And I -- I think you guys are doing an awesome job and I definitely wouldn't like to be in your shoes. And so I -- I -- I don't come to bash anybody. I come to encourage you. I know you -- you have difficult decision that you have to make. And all the time you don't have the necessary information and data that you need to make the decision you make. And you give -- you guys give me and others that comes up here three minutes to discuss their issue and you don't interfere with us. My only request is in watching you guys, that don't continue discussing an issue and beat it to death if you don't have the necessary information to make a decision. That would cut your meeting short, get your agenda finished and the people could go home. So I love you guys. I just want to offer that information to you. I've been on councils and meetings before and I know how difficult your situations are. So I just plead to you and say that I thank you for the job that you're doing. It is some highly -- subjects that does come up that require more in-depth knowledge and understanding of how to come up with the best decision for that. All the time you can -- may not make that decision on the spot. So sometime you do have to call your staff and other necessary persons in to allow the necessary discussion time to bring back the best solution for the peoples of Riviera Beach. Yeah, I pray my strength in the Lord and God bless you.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Thank you, sir. Appreciate that. Reverend Davis and then Lynne Hubbard.

**REVEREND DAVIS:** Reverend Davis, 1273 W. 30<sup>th</sup> Street, Riviera Beach, Florida. You know, I sat here for almost two hours now. I sat up there looking at y'all. And I'm telling myself, Y'all got a problem up there. These people out here in the City of Riviera need help. Water bill going up every year for about four or five years. They can't even drink it. How they're going to water the grass with it? And I'm talking the Code Enforcement lady, it's a disgrace if your water -- if your grass turn green, they'll charge you \$250 a day with 8 percent interest. That's \$96,000 a year. And y'all sit up there. Davis brought a thing for you all to take these lien of these people property. What's wrong with that? These people live out in the City of Riviera. Let me make -- make -- let me make a long story short. Some of y'all work for these rich developers and I know you work for some of the rich developers. And I believe y'all are getting on them -- some of y'all are getting on the money take before them -- these rich developers and you can't do anything but -- let me



say also that CityPlace down there, this city council has a right to make decision -- you are the boss of this city. The liens down in CityPlace, same thing happening out here. They got together and told the Code Enforcement put a lien on people property. Now they -- all the people from down there have gone and they have a billion dollar development down here. Now, the -- you know and I know that these people, these rich developers want this property from Singer's Island back to Military Trail. They're putting a lien on these people property.

Some of these people can't afford it. Y'all are talking about come up -- bring it up -- up to par. They -- they don't have the money. People don't have a job. They're on welfare. Some of them are not even on welfare. It seem like to me that some of y'all should just say, Look, the -- I live out here. The people live out here. Let's give them a -- take this -- let Davis take these liens off. Let's start all over again. There's nothing wrong with that. These people work hard. They -- for years. Some of them 55, 80, 90 years old. They work hard to get these homes. And y'all are letting these big developers come in here and take these people property. They want to make a -- a Las Vegas out of this city, and y'all know what's going on. On Eighth Street down there, Martin Luther King Boulevard, they knocked out everything down there. You give them the marina worth millions of dollars for 50 years. I mean, you're taking everything from them. What do they have? What -- I -- and I say to myself, What kind of heart do y'all have, taking these people property? Y'all know y'all are doing them wrong. God isn't going to bless you, some of it. Let me tell you that right now. And I want to say God gonna short some of your days.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Lynne Hubbard and then Henry Van.

**LYNNE HUBBARD:** Lynne Hubbard, 1405 W. 23<sup>rd</sup> Street. I'm coming to you because of the increase in the water bill. The water bill is extremely too high for a lot of people. That has to be reconsidered. One of the things that Reverend Davis did mention was the fact that it's kind of like a two-edge sword. You can't afford to water your grass, and if you don't water your grass you're going to get a fine. But if you do water your grass, you can't afford to pay your water bill because your water bill is extremely too high. So we're in a Catch-22 situation out here. And we -- I'm asking for me and my neighbors -- because yes, all of us are standing out on -- in front of our houses discussing this, how can we win with this situation? If we let the grass die we're not going to get a permit to pour it all cement. That's not going to fly.

If we don't pay it, we're going to get a fine. And if we do pay it -- I mean, if we do water the grass, we're not -- we're not going to be able to afford those water bills. So we're in a bad situation. Earlier it -- it was said that the sewage water line item or budget was the only one that we didn't exhaust totally. So I would like clarification on that and to find out what was the purpose to increase that -- that bill for us. The standby charges. We have new water meters. We've done a lot of work that's underground. So there's really no increase to say that we have bad water lines, bad water pipes and stuff like that. There's no increase to put this burden on the citizens right now. Especially at the same time when we are giving ourselves a raise. And we cannot pay the burden of it because those water bills -- well, you must open those water bills. Those water bills are just extremely too high. And we have got to do something about that to give relief. And remember, we have a lot of senior citizens and older people on fixed income in this -- in this

neighborhood. So I know that, you know -- that y'all can find some way to find -- to go within yourselves, bring that back and get that burden off of the residents here in the City of Riviera Beach. Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Henry Van?

**HENRY VAN:** I'm Henry Van. I live at 1667 S. 25<sup>th</sup> Court.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Evening.

**HENRY VAN:** I've been there since 1966. What brought me here with this water, I was working out of town for a while and I came to town on Sunday. I got seven sons, two dogs and a wife. They had no water. I said, "Well, who turned the water off?" They said they don't know. I went out and looked out there. Somebody had took the meter out. I went over there and got my drill rig and went home and I think that's the fastest well I ever drill. When Dodd came I had me a well drill. I am a well driller. I'm a well driller. And I drill me a well and got my family some water and they're -- but I think somewhere in this I didn't want them taking a chance of their health. That's what I didn't want. And I just left it alone.

And over my shop, the same thing. They got a piece of pipe run over there. In 1988 they tore it all up, left me half a sidewalk. Three years ago the -- they forced me to put a driveway in there. Forced me to put a \$2,300 driveway in there and put the water back. And I found the pipe that they're talking about they had. And I went over to City Hall to talk to the city manager at that time and it was shameful the way he talked to me so I left. And I ain't said nothing to nobody since. But the water bill, the -- the standby is still going on. Now, what is the standby? There's no meter there at either place. No meter. Now, what's the standby? That's the question I want to know. That's why I'm here.

**SHELBY LOWE:** Madam Chair, I'd like to speak. My name is Shelby Lowe, and I had been helping Mr. Van -- I've been helping him since I've been out of office. And he had some lien violations. We've cleared those up. He's come into compliance. And his situation now is that he has thousands and thousands of dollars worth of standby charges. These imaginary charges that are holding his property -- he has his property under seize with these standby charges. Now, we pay for the meters. I know we pay for them. I know. I've been a part of the process. And once you put the meter in the ground, that's it. It's my opinion that these standby fees need to be capped at a certain rate; that they don't accumulate to a point where they get so expensive the customer can't pay the rate. And number -- and number two, the interest on the standby fees accumulate with that. This man wants to bring his three properties up to code, which he's already done, and take those liens off his property. But most of his liens now are just standby charges. Thousands and thousands of dollars of standby charges. Now, the -- the water rates cannot -- you can't forgive water rates.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** Uh-huh.

**SHELBY LOWE:** We understand that. This guy isn't -- isn't receiving any water. So if he's not receiving any water, why do the -- the liens and the rates, the standby fees, continue to accumulate?

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Has he had a meeting with Mr. Sherman?

**SHELBY LOWE:** We met with Mr. Sherman. Mr. Sherman -- we've been trying to negotiate a settlement and --

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Okay.

**SHELBY LOWE:** -- 'cause he wants to pay something but --

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Right.

**SHELBY LOWE:** -- I mean, his -- his bills are up to almost \$80,000 in standby fees.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Okay.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** That's crazy.

**SHELBY LOWE:** And that's an imaginary charge. You know? It's just a charge that, I mean -- the meters cost a couple hundred dollars. You know, but if you cap that standby fee at \$500, that's the cost of the meter. And what else do you have to pay for?

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Okay.

**SHELBY LOWE:** But this guy has -- is burdened with all these liens on his property and he's 90 years old. He's been working in the city all his life. He knows how to get water. That's why he, you know -- he's able to survive.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Right.

**SHELBY LOWE:** But had it not been for these liens. You know, he wants to make sure his family is all right after he retires.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Okay. All right. Thank you.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair?

**HENRY VAN:** My -- my grandkids --

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** All right.

**HENRY VAN:** -- in particular.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Okay. All right, sir. We're going to help you.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Yeah.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** I -- I -- I'm asking permission to speak.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Well, go ahead. Yeah.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** If you --

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Well, go right ahead.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Okay. Mr. Sherman?

**DIRECTOR OF FINANCE & ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES SHERMAN:** Yes, sir.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** First of all, is the -- the fee that was just given, the amount that was just given, is that accurate? \$80,000 for standby charges?

**DIRECTOR OF FINANCE & ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES SHERMAN:** It's about \$90,000 on the -- the -- there's \$55,000 on the three properties. And then once you add in the interest charges, it comes up closer to \$90,000.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Okay. But why -- what is -- why -- why are we doing that? What is the -- what is the purpose of us having a standby fee of that much and adding interest to it? What is -- what is the purpose of it?

**DIRECTOR OF FINANCE & ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES SHERMAN:** Okay. Keep -- keep in mind nothing has been paid on those accounts for over 20 years. So I don't want anybody to think that this is a -- you know, was -- was -- was short -- short term.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** What do you mean nothing has been paid over 20 years?

**DIRECTOR OF FINANCE & ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES SHERMAN:** Those -- those -- those --

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** You mean, the -- it's been standby fees?

**DIRECTOR OF FINANCE & ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES SHERMAN:** -- that \$55,000 goes back over 20 years. Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** No.

**DIRECTOR OF FINANCE & ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES SHERMAN:** And -- and the three properties all have liens on them. Okay? So you have your 8 percent interest that's required, according to the lien. That's how you get from the 55 to the 90.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Right. I'm -- I'm not so worried about the interest.

**DIRECTOR OF FINANCE & ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES SHERMAN:** Uh-huh.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** We can waive that.

**DIRECTOR OF FINANCE & ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES SHERMAN:** Yeah.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** I'm -- I'm -- I'm worried about it being -- I'm worrying about it accumulating to \$50,000. That's just a lot of -- of -- of -- of fees for a standby. So if they don't pay the standby fee --

**DIRECTOR OF FINANCE & ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES SHERMAN:** Correct.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** -- does that mean that no one has been living in the house for 20 years or --

**DIRECTOR OF FINANCE & ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES SHERMAN:** It means that the house has not been -- or the property has not been getting any water delivered to it, yes. That's true. Now, a couple of the parcels are -- I mean, if you just have a vacant property, okay, yeah. You're -- you're not getting any water service to that property.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** So, I mean, can we not just pull the meter and not have any standby fee?

**DIRECTOR OF FINANCE & ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES SHERMAN:** And on one of the properties that's exactly what they did. And their standby fees stopped. Okay? But again, that still has a lien on it. You know, and you still go through that process. Now, we do tell people that if you want the meters removed, okay, and your property has been demolished, which means there's nothing there for us to be serving, okay, we do stop those charges. But as soon as you need that service back, now you have to pay the impact fees. So a lot of the property owners weigh whether they want to stop the standby and then come back at a later point and pay the impact fees or if they just want to continue to pay the standby.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** So how long has it been since you've been meeting with the gentleman that we just heard from?

**DIRECTOR OF FINANCE & ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES SHERMAN:** Oh, at least six months. That's about right.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** And -- and we can't come up with some type of remedy over the six-month period?

**DIRECTOR OF FINANCE & ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES SHERMAN:** Well, again, we -- the -- the \$55,000 that's on those accounts, that's the standby fee. We -- we can do things with the interest, as you stated. We can do things with the late fees, as you stated. But the fees that are charged, we don't give free service. There -- there's no, you know -- and the standby fee is part of your water rate. You know?

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Okay.

**DIRECTOR OF FINANCE & ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES SHERMAN:** I mean, and again, maybe -- maybe -- let me just explain. Your -- your water -- your water bill that you get has a -- a fixed component. That's your readiness charge. That helps cover all of the capital costs. Not just the meter, but to get the pipes to you, to build a water treatment plant. I mean, that's the entire infrastructure of the system. That's what your standby fee pays. So if you've got 13,000 customers, they all pay their portion of that capital -- of that capital plan. And then you have your variable. That's where, you know, you get charged your -- your \$2 and change for a thousand gallons of water. So if you're not getting service, you pay the standby so tomorrow you can get service if you want it. Well, then you pay the variable.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** I get it. But after 20 year -- let's not even say 20.

**DIRECTOR OF FINANCE & ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES SHERMAN:** Uh-huh.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Let's say after five years.

**DIRECTOR OF FINANCE & ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES SHERMAN:** Uh-huh.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Why did we not just go and say, Hey, you're not getting service. We'll take the meters so we don't have to charge you those fees?

**DIRECTOR OF FINANCE & ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES SHERMAN:** If the property has been demolished, we can do that. If there's nothing on that property, we can do that.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** So if --

**DIRECTOR OF FINANCE & ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES SHERMAN:** But again, that -- that's -- that's the customer's, you know, decision whether they want to make that -- because again, once you do that, now they're subject to the impact fee. The day they come back and they want service, they have to pay the impact fee.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** I understand you gotta pay the impact fee. I'm just -- I'm trying to get to these --

**DIRECTOR OF FINANCE & ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES SHERMAN:** Yeah.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** -- to this point where we can do something. I mean, I did not know -- I didn't hear them say that this was over a 20-year period so I didn't know that -- I thought that number was -- was a little outrageous. But over 20 years I guess it's -- it's not. But you know, that's still quite a bit. You know? What's that a couple thousand dollars a year just in -- in -- in -- in standby charges.

**DIRECTOR OF FINANCE & ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES SHERMAN:** Well, and -- but keep in mind, there's three properties.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Okay.

**DIRECTOR OF FINANCE & ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES SHERMAN:** Yeah.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** 2,200 a year for -- okay. What happens if we do come up with something? Is that something that we could do what -- how does that -- how does that play into this if we come up with some type of cap on the -- on the -- the -- the standby charges?

**DIRECTOR OF FINANCE & ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES SHERMAN:** You would have to go back to your rate consultant and have them build that into your rate study. 'Cause again, when they came through and they did their rate study, they looked at your fixed costs and they allocated it out to every customer in the system. If you're going to go back and change that formula and say, Okay. Well, if you -- if you don't pay, then, you know, you're going to cap -- they would have to build that in and allocate those capital costs differently.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** But he hasn't paid it in 20 years. So what would be the difference? What would be -- that's -- that's where I'm -- I'm -- I'm having trouble connecting. If he hasn't paid it in 20 years --

**DIRECTOR OF FINANCE & ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES SHERMAN:** Right.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** -- we've still been covering these costs. We -- what's -- what's been happening with that? How -- how -- how is he avoiding paying his fair share?

**DIRECTOR OF FINANCE & ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES SHERMAN:** Well, and if -- and I know you probably don't recall but if you go back to when we were first talking about utilities years ago, there's over \$5 million of that sitting out there. And what that's done is you can't do your capital projects. You know, and it -- and it's delayed some of those capital projects in the past. You do what you can. You know, maybe the rates needed to be a little bit higher to account for those uncollectibles. Okay? But -- but that's what you have to do. It's either you collect it, you know, or you don't do the projects.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** And we can't do a settlement?

**DIRECTOR OF FINANCE & ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES SHERMAN:** You -- you cannot write off those dollars. You -- you have all of your bond and legal documents. You know, you have a contract that, again, there's no free service and you have a responsibility to collect the charges that you have.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** I -- I understand but I'm saying can we do a settlement? That's not giving it free. It's just giving him at a reduced cost.

**DIRECTOR OF FINANCE & ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES SHERMAN:** Well, again, what we had talked about was the interest that we can, you know, obviously make an

adjustment on. The late fees we can make an adjustment on but you can't take away the charges that, again, every other customer has paid.

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Understood. That's all.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair?

**COUNCILPERSON THOMAS:** Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Mayor?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you. I just want to commend and compliment Mr. Lowe for being the -- an advocate with this for this elderly gentleman. And especially what he said was really heart-touching and warming. He said since he's been out of office. That -- and that's -- people hear that. Since he hasn't been in office he's been working with this gentleman to try to get some justice. And that's what we all should do. You know, whether we're in or out of office. Think about the people. And I want to commend and compliment as we say, Shelby Lowe, for standing with this guy while you are out of office. You just didn't go away. You still stayed close to the people and that's what other people should do when they're not in office.

**SHELBY LOWE:** Thank you.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you, Mr. Sherman.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Okay . All right. So, you know, what's the deal here? What are we -- what are we doing here?

**CITY MANAGER JONES:** So I -- and I really need to -- how difficult is it to go back to the bonding agency and documents and have that redone with that consideration as it relates to the standby?

**DIRECTOR OF FINANCE & ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES SHERMAN:** You would have to -- I don't -- I don't -- I think you said bonding -- I think you --

**CITY MANAGER JONES:** Well --

**DIRECTOR OF FINANCE & ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES SHERMAN:** -- well, mean the rates.

**CITY MANAGER JONES:** -- the rating.

**DIRECTOR OF FINANCE & ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES SHERMAN:** You have to go back to the rate study and, you know -- I -- I mean, clearly can talk to them. I mean, I'm not sure anybody does that that I'm aware of. But we can go back and see if he can rework, you know, the capital charges. But again, if -- if -- if you don't want to take capital projects out, then that just means everybody else is going to, you know, have to -- have to pay more. You know, you still need to raise a certain amount of dollars to -- to pay



those capital charges. So if you want to go back and look at some type of cap on standby it's, you know --

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** And -- and that's the part that would make sense to me.

**CITY MANAGER JONES:** To me, yeah.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** So, you know, instead of someone accruing \$80,000 over 20 years, if they get to a certain point, then that's it. And -- and maybe we could put something in there. If they reach a certain level, then there's no negotiating with them.

**CITY MANAGER JONES:** As well as you don't give them the choice as to whether they keep the meter or not.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Correct.

**CITY MANAGER JONES:** And want to pay impact. You take it.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Take it. And then that's the end of it.

**DIRECTOR OF FINANCE & ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES SHERMAN:** And again, that -- that could be a City policy that you -- you make. The City makes that choice.

**CITY MANAGER JONES:** Yeah. Yeah. Because --

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** So --

**CITY MANAGER JONES:** -- if -- more than the value of the property doesn't make good sense to keep adding on --

**DIRECTOR OF FINANCE & ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES SHERMAN:** Right. I --

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Agreed.

**CITY MANAGER JONES:** -- standby charges.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** So maybe you guys can work something out and bring some language back to the council?

**DIRECTOR OF FINANCE & ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES SHERMAN:** Be happy to re-engage the -- the rate consultant and talk to them about that.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Okay. Okay. Does council have anything else?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS:** No, ma'am.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Oh, I do. I have -- not on this.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** All right.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** But when you come back to us for final comments.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** No. This is it.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay. Well, I have a -- I have something to say.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** This is it. Okay. So you'll work with Miss Ryan.

**DIRECTOR OF FINANCE & ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES SHERMAN:** We'll do that.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Mr. Aurigemma. And you'll bring something back to us.

**DIRECTOR OF FINANCE & ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES SHERMAN:** Yes. Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Okay. Mr. Sherman, thank you.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you, Madam Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** All right. Yeah. Quickly because we're ready to adjourn.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Attorney, the -- the water bill with -- with the rates with -- was that done by ordinance or resolution?

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** Water bills?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** No. The rates. The increase that we did.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** That was done by ordinance.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Yeah.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay. What would have to happen in order for that to be reconsidered? Because I'm -- I'm telling you, people from all over this city are outraged about the increase for that, as well as the stormwater. The -- the storm thing. I just need to know. I'm just asking a question. And I have that right. How could -- what's the process of that? Can that be reconsidered? Does it have to be brought back before the board or what?

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** Well, you would have to start from scratch because it's will be been approved and --

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** Two (unintelligible).

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** -- I think the rates have already been implemented. So if you wanted to change the rates, you would have to bring it back as an ordinance and start over again.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay.

**CITY ATTORNEY RYAN:** It's not an issue of being (unintelligible).

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Well, I just want to be on -- on the record and I close by saying as the Mayor of this city, I am too -- I am also outraged of the increase. The storm thing to be doubled, I think it's outrageous. I do not accept the City's position that it had to be doubled in order for us to move forward as it relates to our -- our health and public sanity -- not sanity. That -- that -- that, too. It's crazy. To be -- whatever I'm trying to say. It's late. Yeah, it's late. But that's -- that's my point. I just think it's outrageous and we should do something about it. I'm with the people on -- on these issues. Also I want to put the council on notice that I'm going to be spearheading a petition drive soon to put on the ballot -- not this ballot but on the ballot to go back to the warehouse issue. And that the City Hall -- new police station here and the new Public Works where -- where it exists and the fire station remain open. We're going to go back and get the signatures and put it on the ballot because the people don't want the warehouse. Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** All right. There's no more business on the table.

### **ADJOURNMENT**

**CHAIRPERSON PARDO:** We are adjourned.

**There being no further business, the meeting was duly adjourned at 9:37 p.m.**

(CONCLUSION OF SPECIAL COUNCIL MEETING)

**APPROVED:**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**THOMAS A. MASTERS**  
**MAYOR**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**DAWN S. PARDO**  
**CHAIRPERSON**

**ATTEST:**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**CLAUDENE L. ANTHONY**  
**CERTIFIED MUNICIPAL CLERK**  
**CITY CLERK**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**TERENCE D. DAVIS**  
**CHAIR PRO TEM**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**BRUCE A. GUYTON**  
**COUNCILPERSON**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**KaSHAMBA L. MILLER-ANDERSON**  
**COUNCILPERSON**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**CEDRICK A. THOMAS**  
**COUNCILPERSON**

**MOTIONED BY:** \_\_\_\_\_

**SECONDED BY:** \_\_\_\_\_

**B. GUYTON** \_\_\_\_\_

**K. MILLER-ANDERSON** \_\_\_\_\_

**C. THOMAS** \_\_\_\_\_

**D. PARDO** \_\_\_\_\_

**T. DAVIS** \_\_\_\_\_

**DATE APPROVED:** \_\_\_\_\_