1 2 3 4 5	CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA MINUTES OF THE SPECIAL CITY COUNCIL MEETING HELD MAY 19, 2020, 10:00 A.M.		
6 7	(The following may contain unintelligible or misunderstood words due to the recording quality.)		
8	CALL TO ORDER		
9 10 11	CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Good morning. I'd like to call to order the Special City Council Meeting of May 19 th . The time is 10:01 a.m. Madam Clerk, would you call the roll?		
12	Roll Call		
13	CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Mayor Ronnie Felder.		
14	MAYOR FELDER: Here.		
15	CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Chairperson Julia Botel.		
16	CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Here.		
17 18	CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Chair Pro Tem Douglas Lawson? Councilperson Tradrick McCoy?		
19	COUNCILPERSON McCOY: Here.		
20	CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Shirley Lanier?		
21	COUNCILPERSON LANIER: Here.		
22 23	CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson KaShamba Miller-Anderson? City Manager Jonathan Evans?		
24	CITY MANAGER EVANS: Present.		
25 26	CITY CLERK ANTHONY: City Clerk Claudene Anthony is present. City Attorney Dawn Wynn?		
27	CITY ATTORNEY WYNN: Here.		
28	CITY CLERK ANTHONY: You may proceed.		
29 30	CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Thank you. I'd like to have a moment of silence followed by the Pledge of Allegiance led my Councilwoman Lanier.		

31	Invocation		
32	Pledge of Allegiance		
33 34	(Everyone observed a Moment of Silence and the Pledge of Allegiance being led b Councilperson Lanier).		
35 36	CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Thank you. Do we have any additions or deletions o substitutions on the agenda?		
37	AGENDA Approval:		
38	Additions, Deletions, Substitutions		
39	CITY MANAGER EVANS: None from staff, Madam Chair.		
40 41 42 43	CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: I am going to add one thank you, Mr. City Manager Anyone from council? I'm going to add a vote with regard to public comments so we'l take that up in just a moment. Do we have any disclosures by council? Can I have a motion to adopt the agenda?		
44	Disclosures by Council		
45	Adoption of Agenda		
46	COUNCILPERSON McCOY: So moved.		
47	COUNCILPERSON LANIER: Second.		
48	CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Thank you. Madam Clerk?		
49 50	CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair, prior to taking the vote we need to react the		
51	CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: I'm going to read		
52 53	CITY CLERK ANTHONY: the communication from Councilperson Miller Anderson.		
54 55	CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: I I was I was going to accept the agenda first and then do that.		
56	CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Okay. No problem.		
57	CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Thank you.		
58	CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson McCoy?		
59	COUNCILPERSON McCOY: Yes. SPECIAL CITY COUNCIL MEETING American High-Tech Transcription Largo, FL 33771 COUNCIL MEETING MAY 19, 2020 2600 East Bay Drive, Suite 215 727-535-1066		

60	CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Lanier?
61	COUNCILPERSON LANIER: Yes.
62	CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Chair Botel?
63	CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Here yes.
64	CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Unanimous vote.

CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Thank you. Okay. I have a communication from Councilwoman Miller-Anderson. I'd like to read that into the record. "Good morning. This is Councilwoman KaShamba Miller-Anderson, and I wanted to make sure I communicated why I'm not present in this morning's Special City Council Meeting.

"First, I have been very transparent as recent as last Wednesday night that although Palm Beach County schools are not physically open, educators such as myself are still very much working and obligated to their eight-hour shift each workday from home. Ironically, I had to physically report back to work starting today to close out the school year. So colleagues, you are very aware that calling a meeting at this time of the day would be problematic for me. Calling a meeting at 10 a.m. when most of your constituents are working, not to mention calling this meeting within a short 24-hour period, has definitely denied many residents the opportunity to view or participate in the discussion.

"For as long as I can recall when scheduling our city meetings whether special or regular, we have always kept all residents in mind in setting a time in the evening when most of them could participate. They have also complained about doing the opposite. The only time meetings were called at odd times of the day, which didn't happen often, was when council members did not want their constituents to be fully aware of the meeting, and they did not want certain members to be at the meeting or it was concerning a life, health or safety issue that could not wait until an evening time slot. Sadly to say, I'm surprised to see how underhanded this meeting was called. If you truly wanted — wanted everyone to participate you would have scheduled it for the evening or tomorrow evening's meeting. Thank you." Now I would like to — Miss Anthony?

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Let the record reflect that Pro Tem Lawson is now with us.

CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Great. Thank you. I would like to pass the gavel to Pro Tem Lawson to make a motion. So I move that we limit public comments to one minute in order to be -- in order that we can all stay at the meeting for as long as possible. Can I get a second or would you call for a second --

COUNCILPERSON McCOY: Oh, procedurally --

CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: -- Mr. --

96	COUNCILPERSON McCOY: I have some procedural questions.	
97	CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Sure.	
98 99	COUNCILPERSON McCOY: So you passed the gavel, and you already acknowledged yourself to give a comment or to make	
100 101	CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: CHAIRPERSON BOTEL, I make may I make a motion? Thank you, Mr. McCoy.	
102	COUNCILPERSON McCOY: No. No. I'm asking	
103	CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Thank you. I'm sorry. Mr. McCoy, what are you asking?	
104 105 106 107 108 109	motion, but I don't agree that you can pass the gavel as being the chairperson. There's no rule that allows you to do such. When you you can only pass the gavel when you have a conflict, and you're and you have something that potentially conflicts that, you shouldn't be participating on that item or that's it. That's the only way that you should	
110 111	CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Well, I have I have legal advice to the contrary. So Miss Lanier, do you have a comment?	
112 113	COUNCILPERSON LANIER: I'd like to make a motion to limit our public comments to one minute based on the nature of the meeting.	
114	CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Thank you. Can I get a second?	
115	COUNCILPERSON McCOY: Second.	
116	CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Thank you. Madam Clerk?	
117	CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson McCoy?	
118	COUNCILPERSON McCOY: Yes.	
119	CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Lanier?	
120	COUNCILPERSON LANIER: Yes.	
121	CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Pro Tem Lawson?	
122	CHAIR PRO TEM LAWSON: Yes.	
123	CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Chair Botel?	
124	CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Yes.	

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Unanimous vote.

CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Thank you. I would also like to have the discussion by 127 council on this topic first and then we'll read the public comments. I think it would be --128 well, that's what I'm going to do. So Attorney Wynn, do we need -- should we make a 129 motion to open the beaches now and then open for discussion?

CITY ATTORNEY WYNN: Chair Botel, the Mayor called the meeting so I think you have to give the Mayor the opportunity --

CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Oh, yes. Sorry. (Unintelligible). Yes. I will do that. I'm very sorry. Mayor, would you like to make a comment?

MAYOR FELDER: Yes. Yes, I would, and first of all I'd like to thank my colleagues. I know it's early morning that I called this meeting just to address some of the issues that we are facing on a daily basis and some of the issues that one of our councilpersons couldn't be here. And I want to ensure our community, our residents that I called this meeting on Sunday because we was being -- getting inundated with calls, emails, and not just to -- because we had such a great amount of e-mails, but I'm making this decision based on the evidence, the decisions that were made by people that I trust that's in our community, as Riviera Beach had been doing a stellar job in this pandemic condition that we've been in, particularly as a city.

I do want our residents to know this, that I have talked to no one about this issue. This is just from the Mayor's heart from the information that he has gathered. So from me, it was no underhanded meeting, no underhanded conversations that took place. I can assure you of that. This is -- this is from the Mayor. And -- and so I just wanted to clean that up. The reason I called this meeting is because, you know, for the past two months, two and a half months, our team from our city manager to our chief of police, to our chief fireman have been following the lead of the county and we have done a wonderful job. This city has -- they have put us on the map that we've been doing that. No other city has been doing in this county.

And so as I look back -- I know we were in a meeting Wednesday, and we wanted to know what the county was going to do about their beaches. And so we called a special meeting for Friday because the county called a meeting that -- that morning. Okay. So I was kind of surprised that the vote went like -- or it was no vote. It was even -- wasn't even put up for a motion. But I was kind of surprised what took place because as I looked back, I believe our team, as it came up, Miss Franks -- from Miss Franks on that -- that showed us how we would protect our beaches. I was very confident that they would do a good job in making sure that our residents would be safe. And if it wasn't, that they would report back to us to let us know that it's not working and we would have the decision then to shut it down.

So not even bringing that up for a discussion, knowing that -- I could understand that if the county was not going to open their beaches, to me it would have been an easier decision to say, I don't think we should open our beach either, because the county's not

opened their beaches. (Unintelligible) vote coming into our city, because you already had two beaches that was going to open and a third beach in Palm Beach Shores that were going to open. It's not going to stop the traffic from coming into Riviera Beach.

What -- the plan that our team put together is they thought it would be better for us to open our beach to alleviate some of the traffic and that we can control our beaches. I have great confidence in our team as I have had for the last two or two and a half months when it come down to that decision. Now, again, it's decisions to be made. I meant -- I'm not saying open the -- the -- the beach and everybody goes. Listen. You have to have wisdom and common sense that, listen, if you have a -- if you're compromised in any way in -- in -- in your health, no, you shouldn't be at the beach. As the Mayor, I won't be to the beach. But I don't want to just say or base it upon myself not wanting to go -- not wanting to go to the beach because whether -- whether I think -- for whatever reason. I -- I don't want to base it solely on me.

I want to base it solely on the facts that we've been given. And I believe our team has laid out these facts. Now, we have a lot more issues. And I want to stand up even before our council members that have been called out because maybe one couldn't be to the meeting Friday night. But you know, everybody know the position he had to take Friday night in dealing with a funeral, couldn't be on that meeting Friday night. And I just want to owe him because I was at his uncle's funeral Saturday, as he asked me to be there to read a proclamation. But, you know, looking at this city and seeing how separated we've become on this issue, I just want to say every issue in this city is important to me as Mayor. Every decision.

And I wanted to say, Listen. We're going to be inundated with this. We have a lot more issues. I know Councilman McCoy, Councilman Lawson has other issues that we need to move on to. This is one issue we need to deal with today, move on so we can tackle other issues. You know, we're getting calls every day about the (unintelligible). I'm getting calls every day about people needs permits and just -- just different stuff. It's -- it's bigger issues that we -- or more issues, not bigger issues that we have to deal with. There are more issues on a daily basis that we have to deal with. And I don't want this to stagnate us.

If we open up our beaches, I'm here to tell every resident it doesn't mean you have to go to the beach. We opened up barbershops. We opened up restaurants. It don't mean that you have to go get a haircut. You choose to go get a haircut. It doesn't mean you have to go to a restaurant. You choose to go to a restaurant. And so if the concern is opening up, listen, the whole country is going through a phase one opening. And so I'm telling residents, Listen. It does not mean you have to go out just because we're opening up. You have to have common sense and wisdom to know, I can't -- I'm not going to go because I don't want -- my parents are 80 years old so I don't want to go around them knowing that I've just been out amongst people. So that's a decision I have to make. But I don't want that decision to be based on what everybody's dealing with.

Now, we have hotels that we have to deal with that -- that our main concern is that

they -- they are managing their own social distancing with their guests. And so we have the decision to make. Listen, we know -- we know I -- I don't want to open up the -- the beaches to say just for economics or a money reason. I want to open up knowing that we're doing the right thing. And I think it is a right thing because we have a good team that's going to keep us informed that if it's working, we can go on; if it's not working.

Second -- second, what -- what makes me stick to this decision is I know that we have testing going on in our city now. And that's one of the big things that when you are opening up your city, you have testing and I -- we have a couple of test sites. And I'll be putting that on the website. Just the test sites throughout Riviera Beach that you can go to. We want to make sure that our people are still getting tested in the areas that we know that's affecting the people the most. That's the black and brown communities. Now, we have these issues that I want -- you know, I know we've become really reactive when stuff happen, but this -- this is some stuff I want to be proactive about. And I'm asking both sides of the city to come together, the east and the west. From Singer Island, I need you guys. I need you guys to care about Monroe Heights streets just like if it was your own streets. I need you -- there's some issues that we have on the west side. I need you guys to step up and work with us along to make sure our residents on the west side is getting a fair treatment. So I want to bring this city together. I think it's time.

I think, you know, of course there are some disparities that we need to talk about, whether it's economics, whether it's health. And I pray and I hope that we get to those discussions, you know, when we get through this pandemic and that we don't wait till it happens again. But we begin the conversation to make sure that everybody in this city have the fair opportunity. So I -- I want our city to -- to really come together today in unity. Let's not be disunified. We have done a great job showing -- our leadership has done a great job. Our council has done a great job in this pandemic. It's not time for us to fall apart now. This is the time for us to come together and build upon what our staff and what our leadership has put together.

Listen, it's -- there is no power on this -- this council. All right? But we have a job to do and we were elected to do a job. Understand that we're not going to please everybody. But we have to make a decision today not based on our feelings, but based on what we know is right. And so you -- you know, you guys have the decision to make as a council. I'm asking that you support the beaches being opened only because -- only because we have beaches open in our city, and when Chief Curd laid out that plan that it would be better for us to open to alleviate some of the traffic that's going to be coming in our city, and we can control our beaches, I'm for that. And -- and I'm asking for your support today that we don't have to linger this out because there's other issues, man, that we have to deal with. This is one we can put to the side and we can go to the next.

But every issue as small as a permit, somebody's calling me to get a permit done at their house, that's just as -- more important to me as -- as working with residents on Singer Island to get the beach open. So let's make a decision today to bring this city together. That's what I'm about. And I -- and I'll leave you with this: Let's do it. And I'm -- I'm requesting that if we make a motion and it -- and it pass, open the beaches at 12:00 today so we can move on to the next thing. Councilman McCoy, I know you have some SPECIAL CITY COUNCIL MEETING

MAY 19, 2020

American High-Tech Transcription

2600 Fast Bay Drive, Suite 215

American High-Tech Transcription Largo, FL 33771

2600 East Bay Drive, Suite 215 727-535-1066

concerns that I want to be a champion for you to help fight some of those concerns. But right now isn't the time to fall apart. Right now is the time for leadership to come together. It's time for this community to come together. We are a resilient city. Let's show it. Let's not let this break us.

And again, to residents, you don't have to go to the barbershop. You don't have to go to a restaurant and you don't have to go to a beach. Hey, you use your common sense to know where you can go and where you can't. But just understand this. The country and the cities and the counties are opening back up. And so this is just my plea to say I believe we should open up our beaches, and this is just me. Nobody else coerced me to say this. I have not been in no meetings, no -- no backdoor meetings. This is your Mayor and you can believe in this: I'm going to make the decision based on how I feel. Whether it's right or wrong, you elected me and I'll live with it whether it's right or wrong. But this is my decision today to open up the beach. And if it passes, I'm going to ask that we give this city manager the authority to open up the beaches 12:00 today so we can move on to our next issues. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Thank you, Mayor. Phew. I think Miss Lanier raised her hand first and then Mr. McCoy. Councilwoman Lanier, please.

COUNCILPERSON LANIER: I just wanted to say of course I support that, but I do want to caution you guys, I'm actually on leave right now for an hour to do this meeting. And 11:15, I have to leave because I do have another meeting for my job that I have to chair. So I just really want to let you guys know that I was not for this meeting being held on today because of the fact that I do have a job and I have to work. So if we can go ahead on and move this meeting along, I am on leave right now and I need to get to a meeting at 11:15, so I do need to be able to make this vote and we can move this forward. So in that vein, we can move this along, please.

CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Thank you, Councilwoman Lanier. We'll try to limit our own comments, have those comments quickly first, and then get through public comments. Thank you. Mr. McCoy?

COUNCILPERSON McCOY: Madam Chair, if I can can I put out the motion or are we doing public comments first?

CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: You can put up the motion.

COUNCILPERSON McCOY: Okay. Members, I move that we direct the city manager to open up both city-owned beaches as well as private beaches as soon as possible.

CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Can we get a second?

COUNCILPERSON LANIER: Second.

CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Okay. Thank you. Now we'll have a little discussion by

286 287	us as quickly as possible, then get through the public comments so we can vote as quickly as we can to allow Miss Lanier to participate. Any other comments by council?	
288 289	CHAIR PRO TEM LAWSON: Madam Chair, if we could go to public comment first before I make any comments?	
290 291	CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Okay. Thank you. Madam Clerk, would you read the public comments, limiting them to a minute apiece? Thank you.	
292 293	CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair, Miss Hall will begin to read the public comments that we have received.	
294	CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Thank you.	
295	CITY CLERK ANTHONY: And to accept public comments is now closed.	
296 297	CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Could she speed-read them? I'm sorry. We're not hearing her.	
298 299	CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Okay, Madam Chair. Hold for a moment. Let me grab the public comments from Miss Hall.	
300	CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Thank you.	
301	CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Okay, Madam Chair. We apologize for that delay.	
302	CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: That's all right. Thank you very much.	
303	Comments From the Public on Consent Agenda	
304	(Three Minute Limitation)	
305	CONSENT AGENDA	
306 307 308 309 310	ALL MATTERS LISTED UNDER THIS ITEM ARE CONSIDERED TO BE ROUTINE AND ACTION WILL BE TAKEN BY ONE MOTION. THERE WILL BE NO SEPARATE DISCUSSION OF THESE ITEMS UNLESS A COUNCILPERSON SO REQUESTS, IN WHICH EVENT, THE ITEM WILL BE REMOVED FROM THE GENERAL ORDER OF BUSINESS AND CONSIDERED IN ITS NORMAL SEQUENCE ON THE AGENDA.	
311	<u>MINUTES</u>	
312	RESOLUTIONS	
313	END OF CONSENT AGENDA	
314	UNFINISHED BUSINESS	

315 **PETITIONS AND COMMUNICATIONS FOR FILING**

316 AWARDS AND PRESENTATIONS

- 317 **PUBLIC HEARINGS**
- 318 COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC 7:30 PM Non-Agenda Item Speakers (Three
- 319 **Minute Limitation**)
- Public Comments should be restricted to issues, matters, or topics pertinent to the City of
- 321 Riviera Beach. Please be reminded that the City Council has adopted "Rules of Decorum"
- 322 Governing Public Conduct during Official Meetings".
- Public Comments shall begin at 7:30 PM unless there is no further business of the City
- 324 Council, which in that event, it shall begin sooner. In addition, if an item is being
- considered at 7:30 PM, then comments from the public shall begin immediately after the
- 326 item has been concluded.
- 327 Any member of the public wishing to comment publicly on any matter, including items on
- 328 the agenda, shall submit their comments by email to City Clerk Claudene Anthony at
- publiccomments@rivierabeach.org. The email shall contain the applicable agenda item
- number(s) along with the precise wording to be read into the record; explicit language will
- not be read. Emails without applicable agenda item number(s) will be read under the
- 332 general Public Comment Section. Be advised, public comments will be accepted, for each
- applicable item and the general Public Comment Section, until closure is announced by
- 334 the Chairperson or the City Clerk.
- 335 All email addresses and submitted comments are and will be public record. (Chapters
- 336 119 & 668, Florida Statutes)
- 337 The City Clerk or designee will read public comments into the record at the appropriate
- time for no more than three (3) minutes unless the time limit is reduced by a vote of the
- 339 Council based on the voluminous nature of the number of public comments received.
- 340 If you have any questions please contact the City Clerk's Office at (561) 845-4090 or
- 341 email crobinson@rivierabeach.org.
- 342 STAFF ASSISTANT HALL: The first public comment comes from Mark Fuller: "I
- hope that our city council will execute a plan to open the beach in front of Ocean Mall
- immediately. We should have opened today just as the rest of the beaches on the island did. I believe that the city has the capability to open the beach in a safe and well-executed
- 345 uld. Thelieve that the city has the capability to open the beach in a safe and well-executed
- 346 manner so let's get it done."
- The next public comment comes from Andrea Schroth: "All beaches on Singer
- 348 Island need to follow the same directive. This will prevent overcrowding at portions that
- are open. Plus, we have many miles of beach that will not overcrowd anyway. Opening
- 350 the beach will increase safety by giving all residents in Riviera Beach more space for

recreation." Next public comment comes from Margaret Toy [phonetic]: "Open all beaches; however, close public parking lots. That should do it."

Next public comment is from Danny Brooks: "I'm a resident of Sugar Sands. Please reopen the beach. Palm Beach Shores has limited parking and drop-off only. Riviera Beach could do the same as they screen or limit total parking in the city lot to have capacity. There is no reason to have the deeded walkways blocked as there is no parking available at either access point on Ocean Boulevard. Palm Beach Shores is open from the town beach south to the inlet. The Marriott is allowing guests access. Ocean Reef Park is open. There is no real rational reason that the beach cannot be open."

Next public comment comes from Jim Kane: "Please do your jobs this morning. Refusing to make a motion or refusing to vote on a motion to reopen the Riviera Beach beaches is insubordinate to the City since you work for it. Further, some of you have expressed opinions that you have the authority to keep the private sections of the beach closed. You do not. The hotels, condo associations and one house that front the beach own the property above the mean high tide line. The State of Florida owns the land below. The City of Riviera Beach has no ownership interest. If you continue to prohibit us from using our properties, the City will be subject to significant illegal taking complaint from some of its biggest taxpayers who pay the taxes to live on the beach and own the property. It's our choice whether to use it, not yours." Next comment is from Angela Nank [phonetic]: "Please open Singer Island Beaches. We live in a condo with a private beach. We space our chairs very, very far apart. Even when there is not a pandemic. The sun and fresh air is the best thing for us right now. People are getting depressed. Please reopen." The next public comment comes from Adam Miller: "Good afternoon, Mayor Felder, Mr. Evans, Dr. Botel, Miss Jacobs, Miss Lanier, Mr. McCoy, Miss Miller-Anderson. Please consider opening the beaches. The crowded streets and sidewalks that create more of a public health threat than the beach. My wife is high risk and has a degenerative lung disease that is kept in check by regular exercising in clean air. This can be safely accomplished on the beach. We have three active children that greatly benefit from the beach. We are shocked and disappointed to see that our beaches were not open. I respectfully ask that you would do everything in you power as an elected official to represent the tax-paying people and open the beaches. We have traveled to Manatee County and Martin County and Palm Beach in order to have beach access. If there is no time frame for reopening a beach, a reduction prorated amount in property tax should be deposed as discussed. Governor DeSantis' plan outlines guideline principles for reopening as it states protections of civil liberties and maintaining individual rights measures."

The next public comment comes from Lynn Robertson: "Please open our beaches. We pay a lot of taxes to live on Singer Island. Either open all the beaches or all should be closed. How can Palm Beach Shores be open and Phil Foster but not our private beaches in our own back yard? Just doesn't make sense. Please make the decision to open our beaches. P. S., this is posted on Riviera Beach website." Next public comment comes from Deborah Starks: "Good morning. Please, for all the condos where all the taxpayers in Singer Island who moved here for the beach, please open our beach. I sold

351 352

353

354

355

356

357 358

359

360

361

362

363

364 365

366 367

368

369

370

371

372373

374

375 376

377

378

379

380

381

382 383

384

385

386

387

388

389 390

391

392

my home to retire specifically to come to Singer Island and live on the ocean to spend our senior years sitting in front of the waves on a blanket after many years of very hard work, stress and anxiety. I fear that this virus will be around for a long time and the safest way to live is outside. I don't think all the condo dwellers need to walk or drive to a small beach that will have many people when there's a wide open beach right in front of our door. I lived here 40 years -- I lived here 40 years ago and came back to the same building to make memories in the sunset years of my life. Please don't make me live it inside a small condo. Thank you for your consideration."

Next public comment comes from Holly Rethcamp [phonetic]: "Please know how can it be all right to open beaches on Palm Beach Shores and not on Riviera Beach side of the island. The real point is is that there are very few people on the private condo beach area. This is crazy. There are more people on the sidewalks, not to mention in the businesses, than on our beaches. Our beaches are outside in a wide open space and air and sun. Germs are blown away or burned up. Please open our beaches." Next comment comes from Angela Nix: "Please reopen the beaches. We live on a private beach. Very few people on it, even before the pandemic. Please, please, please. It's good to combat depression."

The next public comment comes from Chris Zedwick [phonetic]: It says, "Reopen the beaches. Listen to the people, your city manager, police and fire department." The next public comment comes from Hilary Ward: "Dear Council, I respectfully request that the council vote yes to follow the lead of Palm Beach County and open all the beaches of the city of Riviera Beach." Comment from Holly Rethcamp: "Please open our beaches on Riviera Beach, Singer Island. How is it okay to open large county beaches, Palm Beach Shores beaches, not our Riviera Beach beaches? It makes absolutely no sense. It's outside. There's fresh air. The sun burns up germs. The wind blows and breaks up germs. There are more people on our sidewalks than ever on our beaches. Please open our beaches."

The next comment comes from Debra Winward [phonetic]: "Riviera Beach City Council and administration, as a resident of Riviera Beach for the past 23 years, I am disappointed in the nonaction of the Riviera Beach City Council. Sounds like they are telling us it's okay for Florida residents to use the beaches adjacent to Singer Island, though Ocean Reef, Palm Beach Shores and Phil Foster Park, but will make the residents of Riviera Beach who have access to the beach through their residences to go to the county beach and come in contact with numerous people. Purposely enclosing the beaches was because social distancing was not practiced. Now you have your residents and taxpayers come into contact with numerous people through Ocean Reef, etc., to enjoy a walk on the beach. Based on the nonaction, it sounds as though our elected politicians do not want to answer to the public. It afforded the politicians with a way not to debate the issue in public. I would surmise there were many individual discussions on the topic prior to the meeting. I would also expect that the average age for the residents of Singer Island is guite old, and affording them the opportunity." The next public comment comes from Roger Amidon: "Dear City Clerk, in the interest of time, please do not read my letter." My apologies. They sent in --

- 437 CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Madam -- Madam Clerk? Never mind. Go ahead. 438 Keep going. STAFF ASSISTANT HALL: Okay. It says, "Dear Mayor Ronnie Felder, I am 439 440 kindly requesting your urgent attention to the matter of allowing our private beaches to 441 reopen as soon as possible. First I must impress upon you the importance of allowing 442 our private --" **CHAIRPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Clerk, is -- is this Roger Amidon's message? 443
- 444 STAFF ASSISTANT HALL: Yes.
- CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: He said not to read it. He wants us to move -- keep 445 446 moving.
- STAFF ASSISTANT HALL: Okay. Okay. 447
- 448 CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Just read the next -- and you don't have to read the next -- you don't have to say, "This comment comes from." Just read the name and read 449 450 the comment. Thank you.
- 451 STAFF ASSISTANT HALL: Okay. The next public comment --
- CHAIR PRO TEM LAWSON: I'm -- I'm -- I'm sorry, Madam -- Madam Chair, I 452 know we're trying to rush through this meeting, and I know that we want to quickly make 453 this decision 'cause Councilwoman Lanier has to leave. 454 But also taking into consideration, we've all made the decision to be here, I'd like for Miss Anthony to read 455 the names, to read the comments and to stay how we've consistently done within this 456 457 board. Madam Chair. So I -- I -- I --
- 458 CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Right. Excuse me. Mr. Lawson -- Mr. Lawson, excuse me. Mr. Amidon said, "Don't read my letter." 459
- 460 **CHAIR PRO TEM LAWSON:** I -- I understand, but you also just gave her direction 461 to just read the letter and the name. And what --
- 462 CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: No, no, no, no, no, no, no, no, no. She doesn't have to 463 say every -- go ahead. Whatever you like. Just let's keep moving. Go ahead, Madam Clerk. 464
 - **STAFF ASSISTANT HALL:** The next public comment comes from NB in Ocean Drive: "The expanse of beach on Singer Island is pretty much a social-distance beach without the COVID crisis even during season. I've been out there and normally don't want to set up close to any other beachgoer. I personally like a little privacy and it's usually available with or without mandated social networking. Lastly, Ocean Reef is right in the middle of condo row. That just encourages people to congregate in a very small area due to the fact that the rest of the beach is closed. Not opening just doesn't make sense. Sunshine and fresh air would be the -- a healthy physical and mental therapy to all who MAY 19, 2020

SPECIAL CITY COUNCIL MEETING **American High-Tech Transcription** Largo, FL 33771

465

466

467

468

469

470 471

have been stuck inside for weeks and in my opinion no risk. Occasional patrolling might be a friendly reminder to follow the rules."

The next comment comes from Howard Warna [phonetic]: "Please reconsider opening the beaches. I vehemently disagree with most of the council's concerns the past Friday. It's just wrong on many fronts to keep our beaches closed." The next comment comes from Dorina Lanza: "Riviera Beach certainly has the right and authority to close its one and only beach by tomorrow. But that is the limit of its authority. The City does not have the authority to infringe on private and state-owned land. Note that, in fact, the municipal beach is the only beach Mr. Edwards (unintelligible) on May 17, 2020, actually closed pursuant to this emergency order number 20-05, 'A municipal beach will remain closed until further notice.' As far as the Singer Island private beaches and state-titled beaches which are held in trust for public go, this is another story. There are two issues here: Private property down to mean high water line and the state held property to the east of that line. We will first discuss private property down to mean high water line. The beaches, exclusive of the county and city beaches, are private property of the condo owners and John at 5196 N. Ocean Drive down to the mean high water line. The condo owners and John own these back yards."

The next public comment comes from Farah Tonos [phonetic]: "To whom it may concern, as a young resident of Singer Island, I urge you to reopen our private beaches. It is crucial that the council take swift action in reopening the beaches and the -- and (unintelligible) to them. There are a host of reasons why this emanates such urgency. Primarily the health of Singer Island residents is being compromised. By eliminating access to the beach, residents are denied access to an area that will serve to improve their health in this fragile environment that we are currently in. A scientific study recently revealed that of the patients who caught mild cases of COVID-19 illness, 96 percent had normal vitamin D levels. Of those patients who had severe or critical cases of COVID-19 illness, only 4 percent had normal vitamin D levels. This conclusory evidence includes that 96 percent of patients who have severe critical levels of illness were vitamin D deficient. Therefore, by denying residents a medium where vitamin D is accessible and they can safely operate, it is compromising (unintelligible)."

Next public comment comes from Susan Bennett: "Please do the right thing and align the Riviera Beach opening decision with -- with the county. It is time. More problems will be created keeping it closed than opening. The private property portion of the beaches must be governed by the community of owners at each beach site. Now that the county has opened let's not make any of this more complicated or expensive than necessary." The next public comment comes from Jennifer Caruso: "Beaches should be open. This is an open-air venue. Sun, seawater and sand. There is no evidence that coronavirus thrives and spreads in this environment. It's the last place where we should be worrying about the virus spreading. Restaurants, salons, nail parlors, gyms, massage, retail establishments and malls are all opening. If you are worried about the virus being brought into our community, the last place you should be concerned about are the parks and beaches which offer a safe environment for recreation for the citizens of Riviera Beach. Open the beaches. I watched the last meeting, and it sure seemed like most

council members were trying to make political statement against the governor instead of being part of the solution to help get our community opened up and protect our local businesses and workers from economic catastrophe, as well as provide a safe recreational outlet for its citizens. I spent today at Ocean Reef Park instead of my own condo's beach. All was fine, Ocean Reef Park, but why shouldn't I be able to use my own beach a few doors down? Crazy."

And the next public comment comes from John Miller: "Council, please listen to your constituents on Singer Island. Major Josh Lewis and much of the staff put together an excellent plan to keep our citizens safe and under crowd control on our municipal beach. Our 41 high-rise condos and single-family development. I ask you to please open our beaches. It makes zero sense since three beaches are already open on Singer Island. Please listen to your constituents here on Singer Island."

Next public comment comes from Kay Randy [phonetic]: "Hello. I'm a resident and live at 2700 N. Ocean Drive of Riviera Beach. I would like to request that you keep the public beaches closed since you may have an influx of people who are not social distancing. These beaches are not set up for that. I think that's the right call and those should stay closed. But I do think that our private beach which gets just a small number of residents should be allowed to reopen. We are social distancing at our pools in the building and setting up lounges more than six feet apart. We should certainly be able to do that on our private beach. Thank you for considering that."

The next public comes from Albert Seria [phonetic]: "Dear City Council, Riviera Beach has always been amongst the best communities in Palm Beach. I believe we should be one county in opening our beaches. There is a reason for opening everything together as part of one large community. By keeping our beaches closed, you are telling our residents that they're not ready to practice the guidelines put forth by the CDC of social distancing, wearing masks, washing hands, etc. While the majority of the state is opening their beaches, we remain closed. We are a smart and respectful community, and we should be given the benefit of the doubt that we will use safe practices as we have for over two months now. Please trust and be fair to your citizens by opening the beaches now with the rest of the community."

Next comment comes from Ben Starring [phonetic]: "As a resident of Singer Island, it is -- it is kind to where I was to roam the beach. Sun, saltwater and heat kills viruses, three things found in bountiful -- bountiful supply in our back yards. Please open the beaches." Next comment is from Tom Fresco [phonetic]: "I feel that the private beaches should be open because, number one, our beaches are never crowded. Number two, we have inherently social distancing even before the pandemic. Three, the public do not have access, nor public parking. Four, no beach means that people are crowding our one sidewalk on N. Ocean Drive. And five, sun, salt and fresh air, some of the best natural medicinal remedies."

Next public comment comes from Deborah Liberati: "Please, please, please, open the beach. This is ridiculous. I pay 10 grand a year for this. Hello?" Next public comment comes from Barbara Richard [phonetic]: "To whom it may concern, as a resident, SPECIAL CITY COUNCIL MEETING

MAY 19, 2020

American High-Tech Transcription

2600 East Bay Drive, Suite 215
Largo, FL 33771

homeowner on Bimini Lane, Singer Island, I ask you to please open all beaches on Singer Island. As a health care practitioner I implore you to allow people to go to one of the best beaches on the planet to heal our bodies. We all imminently know this to be true. Fear has driven us to ignore our instincts. Even if more people become infected with COVID-19, do not close our beaches. We the people have elected you our officials to represent us."

Next comment is from Nancy Cano: "Decision makers, thank you for your time and efforts you have extended during these trying times. As a condo and beach owner on Singer Island, I have supported your decisions in the past until the one you made Friday evening. I see no need or benefit to keep the private and public beaches closed while those right next door are open. Please rescind your previous decision and open the beaches." The next comment comes from Randall Tuller: "Good morning. The City does not have the power to close privately owned back yard. Similarly, the City does not have the power to close privately owned beaches. Private property owners have the right to use their private property. Thank you." Next comment is from Holly Rethcamp: "If there is not enough time to read my comment at the meeting (unintelligible) --"

CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Madam -- Madam Clerk I think you read hers already. Thank you.

STAFF ASSISTANT HALL: Okay. So the next one comes from Marvelous Washington: "Thank you to the councilpersons that put public safety before politics by voting to not open our beaches. Opening the beaches before the Memorial Day holiday will attract tourists from other states and counties and particularly residents of Broward and Dade County. The City does not have the resources to ensure social distancing is happening once the beach is open. Not to mention we shall not continue to put staff in harm's way. Why can't we wait until after the holiday to open up the beaches to actual residents? There is a reason Broward and Dade Counties are not opening their beaches until May 26th after their Memorial Day holiday. Please continue to put people before politics." The next comment comes from Mike: "Open the beaches or you'll all be voted out. Stop with the liberal anti-American fearmongering. Read the U.S. constitution which is the law of the land, not your autocratic anti-American liberal policies." The next comment, was already read by Councilperson Miller-Anderson.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: No. And she submitted a public comment.

STAFF ASSISTANT HALL: Okay. This is her public comment: "Good morning. This is KaShamba Miller-Anderson, and I wanted to put on record that my hesitancy -- hesitancy to reopening the beach when we had the discussion on this past Friday continues to center around the concern of doing it just prior to a major holiday when the beach is highly attended. The fact that our county has not seen a consistent 14 days of declining numbers for new cases as outlined by the governor and president to reopen into different phases. Unfortunately the governor did not leave the decision to local governments to reopen industries such as restaurants, liquor stores, gyms, hair salons, etc., as some have pointed out, so unfortunately we have no say in that. For some reason he chose to leave the decision about the beaches to us, so I've tried to weigh the SPECIAL CITY COUNCIL MEETING

MAY 19, 2020

importance of health concerns along with the concerns of those wishing to access the beach. Many constituents from the island have reached out to me via e-mail, and I have communicated back to all of you that reached out to me over the weekend and assured you that I would certainly be open to addressing this issue at a future meeting."

The next public comment comes from Donna Martell: "My husband and I are in support of opening the beaches. Like everyone, we have been stuck in the house since March, and as long as people keep it the six-foot rule, we feel that would not be a problem as the beaches here are never overloaded. We also pay taxes for our back yard which go to supporting the programs at Riviera Beach, and imagine if someone told you that you couldn't go in your back yard. We vote yes, respectfully." Next public comment comes from Lynn Sporitis [phonetic]: "Council, the Water Glades Condominium approve opening all beaches on Singer Island. If you do not want to open public beach, at least open the privately owned beaches. Really don't believe you have authority to close privately owned beaches, but to put this issue to an end please vote yes. Thank you."

Next public comment comes from Angela Nank: "Please open beaches. I live at the Ritz Carlton with a private beach. We are never close together. It's good for our health to be outside." The next public comment comes from -- it says E.H. Clark-Barr [phonetic]: "Greetings, City Council. The executive order states the restrictions still in place are the CDC guidelines of limit gatherings to no more than 10 persons and beachgoers must adhere to social distancing. Department of Homeland Security identified Palm Beach County as one of three emerging COVID hot spots in the U.S. If you think human nature is going to abide by these safety guidelines to minimize a continued spread -spreading of COVID-19, you would be mistaken. The coronavirus death rate is just shy of 100,000 dead American citizens (unintelligible). No one is advocating, telling anyone what to do and are stripping privileges away. Privileged people never experience the type of authoritarianism and COVID-19 is no comparison. This is about solving the devastating coronavirus pandemic locally and not having Riviera Beach added to the Palm Beach All epidemiologist scientists warn the best way to lower County hot-spot list. unpredictable coronavirus pandemic curve and protect everyone is to stay home or wear our mask in public." Next public comment comes from Kimberly Jackson: "Good morning Chair, Mayor and council members."

CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: I -- I'm not hearing you, Madam Clerk. Is anybody else hearing the clerk?

CHAIR PRO TEM LAWSON: You're mute -- you're muted, Miss Anthony. You need to unmute your computer.

STAFF ASSISTANT HALL: Okay. All right. This public comments comes -- comment comes from Kimberly Jackson: "Good morning, Chair, Mayor and council members. I, too, was against the opening of the beach until I heard the City's plan to ensure safety distancing. It seems pointless not to open the beach, especially since surrounding beaches have opened up. However, I continue to have concerns of other resources the City will have to expend managing the beach. My input would be to allow the County's lead in restrictions. We will not be able to fund the management of social SPECIAL CITY COUNCIL MEETING

MAY 19, 2020

SPECIAL CITY COUNCIL MEETING American High-Tech Transcription Largo, FL 33771

2600 East Bay Drive, Suite 215 727-535-1066 distancing and policing the beach for a long period of time. You may want to consider implementing the plan during holidays and weekends, not every day for an indefinite period of time. At the end of the day we need to be responsible for our actions. If you determine that these scores are not abiding by the rules set forth, shut the beach down. Also, there seems to be a lot of confusion surrounding the notion that there are private beaches in Riviera Beach. This needs to be researched and explained to the citizens. Did we sell our public beaches to private entities? If we did please provide an explanation on how that transaction happened."

The next public comment comes from John Thompson: "I have previously sent in a comment about how bad it is to keep the beaches closed. Please feel free to read my comment." The next comment comes from Diana Albanese [phonetic]: "Please open the beaches with no unlimited restrictions. Riviera Beach is a wide beach, and I want the ability to walk and sit in the chairs. I can't think of a safer situation you can provide for your residents than this. I heard the letter last week the beach services is doing and I think it's excellent. Please open the beach -- please open. The beach is a wide open space and according to the CDC, the virus does not live in heat or humidity. Why is this simple yet effective fact overlooked? All the hoopla of Jacksonville opening and all of the negative media shaming it, their numbers are fine. There is no uptick in cases. Please open with no restrictions."

The next comment comes from Will Robinson: "Good morning. I wanted to make my voice heard as a resident of Singer Island. It is common sense to reopen the beaches at this point in time, and keeping them closed is just serving to piss people off. If people want to stay home, then they can stay home. But it is not the place of government at any level to mandate the closure of public property for public good. You can vote to keep the beach closed, but I will exercise my democratic right by finding each member who voted against reopening and making sure they are not elected the next time around. You are supposed to represent us. Open the beach as soon as possible." The next comment comes from Pamela --

CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: You're -- you're -- could you unmute again, Madam Clerk? Please unmute. Thank you.

STAFF ASSISTANT HALL: Okay. I don't know what's happening there. Sorry about that. The next public comment comes from Pamela Calabrese: "Keeping the beach closed is not based on scientific -- science or health. It is about control. You are not our babysitters and we are not five-year-olds. You have been voted into office to represent us, not the other way around. You are there to serve. We are not here to serve you. We the people voted you in and we can vote you out." The next one, she's got another one, Diana Albanese: "Please read my --"

CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: No. We're just reading -- we're just reading one comment.

STAFF ASSISTANT HALL: Okay. The next comment comes from Kelly Davington [phonetic]: "I, 100 percent, want the beaches to open with no restrictions, SPECIAL CITY COUNCIL MEETING

American High-Tech Transcription

Largo, FL 33771

MAY 19, 2020

2600 East Bay Drive, Suite 215

727-535-1066

please." The next one is from Dorina Lanza, and it says, "Yes, open the beach." The next one comes from Constance Rappaport: "Hi. Just casting a vote to open condo beaches, please." The next one comes from Hilary Ward: "Dear Council, I am rescinding this e-mail."

COUNCILPERSON McCOY: We've heard from her already. We've already heard from her.

CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Yeah. You can move -- you can move on. Thank you, Mr. McCoy.

STAFF ASSISTANT HALL: The next one is from Madeleine Irving: "Good morning, everyone. We're here again asking the board to rethink your decision of keeping the main municipal beach closed. I can't agree with the prior decisions of the board regarding the closing of the public and private beaches. If the other surrounding beaches had remained closed, then that would be accepted. Unfortunately, this is not the case. If a plan was proposed, then why wouldn't we trust the proposed plan and hear the residents? Safety precautions have been proposed, and the city manager and staff worked to ensure that when our residents leave their homes to visit the beach, the City thought of them. Please don't be like the prior board and disregard the residents' decision to want their beach open." The next one -- that was a repeat. And this one is from Sylvia, "Please reopen Riviera Beach -- please open Riviera Beach public and private with no restrictions." And the final comment --

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Uh-uh.

STAFF ASSISTANT HALL: Oh, sorry about that. Okay. The next one is from Lynn Robertson. She has said, "Read my name and, yes, open the beaches." Claire Brenowitz said, "I respectfully request that you reopen our beaches, and maybe a good idea to limit the hours that they are open or if you think it's wise to limit the available public parking. My personal experience has been that even when Riviera Beach's parking lot is full to capacity, the beach has plenty of room to social distance. Our police force patrols the beaches on their beach buggies and would be available to remind the public of the rules or to notify the city councilors of any issues that may suggest the beaches should be shut down again. In any event there should be a clear public vote by the councilors so we residents of this city can understand each person's position clearly."

And the final public comment comes from Jetelsa Brown [phonetic] -- I'm sorry, from Catherine Bruda [phonetic]: "My name is Catherine Bruda. This is my comment card from 85, 1920 regarding the opening. I called the Mayor's Office early this morning. I was surprised to not only have someone answer my call but someone to make time and have a discussion and update about today's meeting. She was very patient and thorough. As a citizen of Riviera Beach for 30 years, my mother for 40 years paid lots of taxes and put up with a lot. We championed the city police, fire rescue and commissioners. We ask that you please keep the beaches closed until after Memorial Day. Our lifeguards are overwhelmed. Our first responders are are overwhelmed. Our police are overwhelmed. Our sheriffs are overwhelmed. Please keep beaches closed until after

724	Memorial Day as the town of Palm Beach is. We are not ready. Traffic. Parking. Please
725	keep beaches closed until after Memorial Day like the town of Palm Beach, Miami-Dade,
726	and get a plan together for phasing in parking, social distancing, etc. Do you have staff
727	to wipe down and sanitize playgrounds on the beach, bathrooms, showers? Are parking
728	spaces six feet paced? We are not ready to open." That concludes public comment,
729	Madam Chair.

CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Thank you, Madam Clerk. Mr. Lawson, did you have a 731 comment?

ITEMS TABLED REGULAR

DISCUSSION AND DELIBERATION

1. OPEN UP OUR BEACHES

CHAIR PRO TEM LAWSON: Thank you, Madam Chair. Mr. Evans, do we have a date yet when Broward and Dade will be reopening their beaches?

CITY MANAGER EVANS: We do not have a date when Broward and Dade will be reopening their beaches. From the information that we've heard through administrative circles as far as city managers and county administrators, they're possibly looking for reopening after Memorial Day weekend.

CHAIR PRO TEM LAWSON: Okay. So I'll continue with the quick comments, then. Did -- Mr. Evans, did you schedule any meetings with anyone from the public discussing reopening the beaches, and if so, were there any notes from these meetings?

CITY MANAGER EVANS: Anyone from the public? No, there was no discussions with anyone from the public. There was discussions with my peers as I was selected to serve on the beach committee with colleagues throughout the county.

CHAIR PRO TEM LAWSON: Okay. And you did advise us on the meeting of those colleagues from the county to discuss the status of that. Did you guys take notes from those meetings, as well? Did you take notes?

CITY MANAGER EVANS: I believe -- I -- I believe some meeting minutes were collected by the County. But I don't think it was any action-oriented items. It was just what some of the options may be.

CHAIR PRO TEM LAWSON: Okay. And at the previous council meeting, Councilwoman Botel stated she actually went to the County meeting two Fridays ago and stated that the city manager sent her. Is this true?

CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: The city manager --

CITY MANAGER EVANS: | -- | --

SPECIAL CITY COUNCIL MEETING American High-Tech Transcription Largo, FL 33771

759	CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: told me about the meeting.		
760 761	CHAIR PRO TEM LAWSON: I'm sorry. I'm sorry, Madam Chair. I'd like for Mr. Evans to answer.		
762	CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Sure.		
763		CHAIR PRO TEM LAWSON: Thank you.	
764 765 766 767	CITY MANAGER EVANS: I I provided the information that the County was having a meeting to Councilperson Botel. And obviously in light of all the comments and e-mails that we've been receiving as a result of the beach, I said it would be a good opportunity for her to at least watch the meeting at minimum.		
768 769 770 771	meeting, Councilwoman Botel stated that she was sent by the city manager. So I just want to know if you had given her direction or a stance to take on behalf of the city when		
772		CITY MANAGER EVANS: No, sir.	
773 774	actual	CHAIR PRO TEM LAWSON: Okay. So Madam Chair, when you went to the meeting on behalf of the city, your statements were	
775 776	behalf	CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: I think I excuse me, Mr. Lawson. I did not go on of the city.	
777 778	the city	CHAIR PRO TEM LAWSON: Okay. But your title that you gave was the chair of a council and that you had been sent by the city manager.	
779		CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: I made it clear when asked by	
780		CHAIR PRO TEM LAWSON: Uh-huh.	
781 782	city.	CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Commissioner Weiss that I was not representing the	
783 784 785		CHAIR PRO TEM LAWSON: But in regards to your title, Madam Chair, if you're presenting the city, you were there as Julia Botel from the Tiara Building, not as the f the city council and not sent by the city manager, Madam Chair.	
786 787	openin	CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Mr. Lawson, do you have a comment about the beach gs?	

discussion by your colleagues, Madam Chair.

788

789

790

791

Chair, 'cause you made comments to our county commission in regards to your concerns

of reopening the beach as the chair of the city council without a vote being taken nor a

CHAIR PRO TEM LAWSON: I'm make -- I'm -- I'm currently making them, Madam

792	CHAIRPERSON BOTEL:	I made it very clear that no vote

CHAIR PRO TEM LAWSON: Yes, Madam Chair.

CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: -- I was asked if a vote had been taken, and I made it very clear that no vote had been taken.

CHAIR PRO TEM LAWSON: Oh, yeah. Absolutely. That was as requested by the mayor of the county asking if a vote had been taken. But when you went your comments were that you were representing the council so that's why I ask--

CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: No, no. I don't -- Mr. Lawson, excuse me. I never portrayed myself as representing the city.

CHAIR PRO TEM LAWSON: Okay. So my question was for Mr. Evans, as our city manager, so that we can understand, because I want to make sure that all discussions are had as a council so we can come to solutions together. Whether we're in agreement or disagreement with reopening these beaches, I want to make sure that all discussions are had together as a council, 'cause the preceding Wednesday we had a meeting and that discussion never came up. Yet from your statements at the county meeting, you stated that Mr. Evans sent you to the meeting. So if you misspoke, I understand. But that's why I want to have some clarity before we proceed.

CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Are you done?

CHAIR PRO TEM LAWSON: No, Madam Chair, I'm not.

CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Go ahead, then.

CHAIR PRO TEM LAWSON: I want to make sure that I have it on the record that I am not in favor of reopening the beaches. I believe that as of right now that we should not be opening the beaches prior to this holiday coming this weekend. Because visitors will be traveling from all over the state to come to our beaches here in Riviera Beach. This is going to put a strain on our staff. This is going to put a strain on our residents, and it's going to be a detriment to our community if we continue to push forward without restrictive measures in place.

I understand that there's certain things that Mr. Evans and his staff has put together. But there is going to be an onslaught on our beaches over the next few weeks. And if we don't fall in line with some of the other surrounding counties that are not opening their beaches, I think we're going to have major issues here in this community, which is going to be a complete strain on this community. So I am completely not in favor of actually having these beaches reopened prior to this holiday. I would not mind my colleagues supporting a plan to reopening them after the holiday or to put in some additional restrictive measures to restrict the attendance of our beaches. I believe that in Boca they've actually restricted the -- the parking. The only concern I had with that is the shopping in our Ocean Mall. I would not want to restrict the parking and then restrict the

business that's actually going to these businesses. So I want us to have an additional plan, additional conversations prior to rushing to opening this meeting. We did have a meeting on Friday and discussed we had a no vote. There was no motion made. There was no discussion. So our mayor did actually ask to have a special meeting this morning where I would have actually liked the full complement of the council to be here and had this meeting tomorrow at the Wednesday meeting. But I'm here to discuss this conversation so those are all my comments, Miss Botel.

CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Thank you.

CHAIR PRO TEM LAWSON: Madam Chair. I'm sorry.

CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Thank you. Councilwoman Lanier or McCoy, do you have any further comments before we call the question? Mr. McCoy?

COUNCILPERSON McCOY: Thank you, Madam Chair. So Mr. Evans, and you know, I've been asked to watch the Friday meeting and I've been just that busy I haven't had a chance to. Has there been a discussion on how we arrived at the beach closure? I mean, for the purpose of the public. Because I think we know as members.

CITY MANAGER EVANS: I don't recall there being any specificity with regards to the beach closures as part of the conversation on Friday.

COUNCILPERSON McCOY: Okay. So was this an item that was brought up to city council for us to make the decision to close the beaches?

CITY MANAGER EVANS: No, sir. This was under the executive order that was articulated by Governor DeSantis' Executive Order 2070 that effectively closed the beaches. City staff then followed the county's order to effectuate that on the local level. So it was a directive from the governor's office, and then we came into compliance with what the county was doing and other municipalities.

COUNCILPERSON McCOY: So if we came into compliance with what the county was doing, then why is it an issue that we have to vote on it? Is there a local order that was done by the manager?

CITY MANAGER EVANS: The city council specifically asked for a special meeting to discuss the elements as it relates to the possibility of reopening the beaches. So when the city council asked for the meeting to be held and then the city council -- there was not a motion that was proffered to reopen the beaches. And it was abundantly clear in the Friday meeting that it was the board's desire not to reopen the beaches and discuss that in a subsequent conversation. City staff complied with the desires of the board, the majority of the board.

COUNCILPERSON McCOY: Follow-up: Abundantly clear?

CITY MANAGER EVANS: Yes, sir.

SPECIAL CITY COUNCIL MEETING American High-Tech Transcription Largo, FL 33771

COUNCILPERSON McCOY: But there was no vote?

CITY MANAGER EVANS: There was no vote 'cause there was a motion that was requested to reopen the beaches. The motion was not offered so the beaches were to remain closed. And all the elected members on the board stated their position on the matter, which is memorialized in the public record.

COUNCILPERSON McCOY: Okay. And based on that, so had there not been a vote or had there been a split decision, and I think it was four members there -- had it been, you know, you got two that were in favor or two that was against it, where would that leave you, Mr. Evans, if the decision had to be made?

CITY MANAGER EVANS: The item would have failed and the beaches still would have remained closed.

COUNCILPERSON McCOY: Well, not necessarily voted. But I mean, if you had two members that actually expressed some concerns and two members that thought we should be opening, where does that leave you as far as the ability to move forward absent of a vote?

CITY MANAGER EVANS: The same thing. The beaches still would remain closed 'cause it's not the desire of a majority of the board.

COUNCILPERSON McCOY: Okay. So -- okay. All right. Good enough. So I --

CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Thank you, Mr. --

COUNCILPERSON McCOY: -- I just want to make sure that I remind members, last week Monday on the 11th, I requested a special city council meeting for the 13th, which was Wednesday. And now as you know, I had four items on there pending the pay policy, the PBA collective bargaining agreement, the local state of emergency and the last item was phase one, city of Riviera Beach reopening plan. And unfortunately three of the members of the city council didn't vote to support hearing that item being discussed.

So you know, I think this is something that we very well could have gotten ahead of because it's not just about the beaches. We have other operations that are pretty much closed down. And you know, even when we did meet in Councilperson Lawson's meeting, that special meeting on the 13th, I said specifically I would like to see that we just allow the manager to have that authority as opposed to coming back for a meeting, even though I voted for the meeting. It just seems like, you know, that's a decision that could have been easily taken care of by the manager.

So I conclude with this: I -- I -- I support opening the beach simply because I don't want to micromanage anybody, especially those individuals that have private property, and we know how important that is for all of us, that it is adjacent to the beach and they want to be able to access -- access it. And two, I want to see if we can have the conversation on perhaps during your comments on tomorrow regarding the plan for -- and

I think Council -- Chair Botel might have been involved in the conversation -- the Ocean Mall and the -- the accommodation for those restaurants.

CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Yes.

 COUNCILPERSON McCOY: Because if we're going to be open, you know, I think at the very least we need to work with the management team and figure out --

CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Yes.

COUNCILPERSON McCOY: -- a way to kind of make sure that we're accommodating. But, you know, obviously I don't want to live in fear and I'm very conscientious. But I don't want to, you know, hold anybody to any further restrictions. I think we've all been impacted by this. And, you know, my initial thoughts on it was we -- perhaps we're not ready. But I wanted to at least start the conversation. It would have been nice to have it last week as opposed to after the fact. But nonetheless, we're here now, and I -- I'm going to support reopening it so that we can move on from this item . So thank you, Madam Chair.

CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Thank you, Mr. McCoy. Miss Lanier, if you have nothing else, we will -- 'cause I know you're in a rush. I will make a very brief comment. I appreciate what the mayor said at the beginning of this meeting. It was eloquent and very well said. I respect the opinions of my colleagues with whom I disagree on this matter. I have the highest respect for KaShamba Miller-Anderson, her intelligence, her caring for this community, and I understand that this community is highly vulnerable to this disease. And we would never want to put anyone in danger, which is why I agree with the mayor. Please don't go to the beach. If you are a vulnerable person -- I'm 72 years old with an underlying heart condition. I'm not going to go lay out there on the beach, and I encourage you not to lay out on the beach if you're in that vulnerable population.

I am heartsick at how this issue has divided our community. People on the island against people on the mainland, it feels like two years ago when I ran and everybody was trying to secede from Riviera Beach. That has reared its ugly head again. We can't let that happen. We have to be united on this. And so I'm hoping that we can have a vote to open the beaches. I -- I -- I won't say too much 'cause I know -- I know Miss Lanier has to go. So if we could call the question -- we don't have to actually call the question. Madam Clerk, could you -- we've had a motion and a second, Madam Clerk, if you could call the roll.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson McCoy?

COUNCILPERSON McCOY: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Lanier?

COUNCILPERSON LANIER: Yes.

938	CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Pro Tem Lawson?		
939	CHAIR PRO TEM LAWSON: No.		
940	CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Chair Botel?		
941	CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Yes.		
942 943	CITY CLERK ANTHONY: That motion is approved with Councilperson Lawson dissenting.		
944 945	CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Thank you. Mr. Evans, did you have any comments to make about the process now?		
946	DISCUSSION BY CITY MANAGER		
947 948 949	CITY MANAGER EVANS: Yes, Madam Chair and members of the board. Staff will begin moving removing the barricades on the island, and we should have the beach open by 12:30 today.		
950 951 952 953 954	CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Thank you. I I think I can hear a roar coming from the crowd out there. Oh, no. That's the ocean. I I sincerely thank you for having this meeting. I know, Mr. McCoy, we could have dealt with this sooner. And I appreciate that And by the way, I have told people absolutely without question that you were not available on Friday because of your unfortunate loss of a family member.		
955 956 957 958 959	And I want to reiterate to Councilwoman Miller-Anderson that really there was nothing underhanded about this. I think the mayor's concern was to try to get this beach open as quickly as possible today so it certainly wasn't meant to be underhanded. And I apologize if that gave the appearance of that. Do we have any comments by the city attorney that was the city manager's comments. Anything else, Mr. Evans?		
960	CITY MANAGER EVANS: (No audible response).		
961	CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Thank you. Comments by city attorney?		
962	DISCUSSION BY CITY ATTORNEY		
963	CITY ATTORNEY WYNN: No, thank you.		
964 965	CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Thank you. Council committee reports? Statements by the mayor and city council starting with the mayor?		
966	CITY COUNCIL COMMITTEE REPORTS		
967	STATEMENTS BY THE MAYOR AND CITY COUNCIL		
968	MAYOR FELDER: No statements.		

SPECIAL CITY COUNCIL MEETING American High-Tech Transcription Largo, FL 33771

CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Thank you. Mr. McCoy?

COUNCILPERSON McCOY: Thank you. I'm going to be brief. Thank you, Madam Chair, for reminding me that I was dealing with the funeral. I wanted to say something about it, and I actually didn't have the intention to say something about it. But some of these e-mails were quite alarming, and there was some very disparaging things in there that I didn't show up because I didn't want to take a vote on the item and I was a coward and those kind of things.

And, you know, I certainly respect people's opinion and whatever they want to say, but I think the disparagement doesn't have to be included in your e-mail in order to make a point, you know? And let me tell you, I think I've had the David and Goliath fight for an election. So I'm certainly not threatened by anybody saying that they'll raise a million bucks for my opponents or that I, you know -- I'm here for public service. And when my season's done I go home. You know, I go back to what I was doing. So, you know, I respect the -- the diplomacy that we can have without the -- you know, the unnecessary jargon and insults. So -- but, you know, it is what it is, and I appreciate you participating, but I will hope that we can kind of do it a little bit more fine-tuned as opposed to name-calling. So thank you. That's all I had, Madam Chair.

CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Thank you. Miss Lanier? Councilwoman Lanier, any comments?

COUNCILPERSON LANIER: I just wanted to say that, you know, I was in support of this before, but I also want to ensure that we do have this public health component attached to this beach opening. This is one of the main reasons why I was very adamant about making sure that if we're going to do this, that it is done with the utmost caution for public health in terms of people coming to the beach, social distancing and, you know, the whole works on how we have to make sure that people -- I mean, we know that there's going to be, you know, some issues in terms of there may be cases, there may not. But who knows. But we do need to make sure that there is going to be an abundance of caution and also there's going to be a public health component to this reopening.

CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Thank you. Councilman Lawson?

CHAIR PRO TEM LAWSON: Thank you, Madam Chair. Just my comments are that I was -- I was fairly disappointed. I -- I -- I truly believe that I had the best interests in my -- all of our residents, and I know our residents believe that they want their voices to be heard and we've heard all their voices.

And we as a council, we can have amicable discussions. We can have disagreements. We can have this dialogue where we may not agree on certain topics and that is okay. That's why the five of us were elected, including our mayor, as well. And if we decide to move forward, we will all be in support of these decisions to make sure that it's done in the best interest of the entire community. I'm in all support of Mr. Evans and the staff to do an amazing job. I am very cautious to the -- the health and wellness of our community. I know Mr. Evans will do the best he can to protect the

1009 residents of our city.

And moving forward, I just want us to continue to push forward. Councilwoman Botel, I've seen some of your comments that you've been making to residents in support of your colleagues on this dais, and you understanding that we can agree to disagree, we can move forward with amicable solutions and make sure that we work together.

So the only announcement I want to make is that we're currently having a free produce giveaway over at Wells. It'll be running until 12:00 so residents, if you have a chance to go over to Wells, we're going to be doing free produce for our residents today. Today and also Friday. So thank you so much.

CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Thank you, Mr. Lawson. I just want to remind viewers that we will be having our regularly scheduled meeting tomorrow. In fact, we have a special CRA meeting prior to tomorrow night's meeting at 5. Am I correct about that, Madam Clerk? 5:00 tomorrow, CRA?

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: (No audible response).

CHAIRPERSON BOTEL: Thank you. Thank you. And I want to remind people, I -- I have asked to continue these -- the feeding program that we've been running out of Valley of Love Ministries. I haven't gotten a response back yet from FLIPANY which is the organization that provides us with the food. So if I do get a positive response and we can continue the feeding program through the summer months, I would urge you to contact your school principal and ask that your child's name be included if you cannot -- if you do not have transportation to the regular feeding sites. If you've got transportation, then please, by all means, go to Lincoln, go to Suncoast. But if you don't have transportation then use the -- the Valley of Love and your principal. I think that's it. If nothing else, then we will adjourn this meeting. Thank you.

ADJOURNMENT

- 1034 (CONCLUSION OF MEETING)
- 1035 Transcribed by: slw/slw/ms

APPROVED:	
RONNIE L. FELDER MAYOR	JULIA A. BOTEL, Ed.D CHAIRPERSON
ATTEST:	
CLAUDENE L. ANTHONY CERTIFIED MUNICIPAL CLERK CITY CLERK	DOUGLAS A. LAWSON CHAIR PRO TEM
	TRADRICK MCCOY COUNCILPERSON
	KASHAMBA MILLER-ANDERSON COUNCILPERSON
	SHIRLEY D. LANIER COUNCILPERSON
MOTIONED BY:	
SECONDED BY:	
T. MCCOY	
K. MILLER-ANDERSON	
S. LANIER	
J. BOTEL	
D. LAWSON	
DATE APPROVED: AUGUST 5, 2020	- MAV 10, 2020
>>=: 1/1 1 7 1 1 N/1 N/1 H 1 N/1	MAY 10 2020

American High-Tech Transcription Largo, FL 33771