

**CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH
REGULAR CITY COUNCIL MEETING
February 6, 2019
6:00 p.m.**

PRESENT AT MEETING¹:

THOMAS A. MASTERS MAYOR MASTERS

CHAIRPERSON TONYA DAVIS JOHNSON DISTRICT 3
CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON

CHAIR PRO TEM LYNNE L. HUBBARD DISTRICT 1
CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD

COUNCILPERSON KaSHAMBA L. MILLER-ANDERSON DISTRICT 2
COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON

COUNCILPERSON JULIE BOTEL DISTRICT 4 COUNCILPERSON BOTEL

COUNCILPERSON TERENCE DAVIS DISTRICT 5. COUNCILPERSON DAVIS

CITY MANAGER KAREN L. HOSKINS..... CITY MANAGER HOSKINS

CITY CLERK CLAUDENE L. ANTHONY CITY CLERK ANTHONY

CITY ATTORNEY DAWN S. WYNN CITY ATTORNEY WYNN

TRANSCRIBED BY:

Legal Transcription, Etc., LLC
931 Village Boulevard
#905-148
West Palm Beach, FL 33409
(561) 429-3816
(561) 584-5044 (fax)

jreitano@legaltranscriptionetc.com

¹ List of City Employees, Public Speakers and Others on Page 153

**CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH
PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA
CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
HELD IN THE CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS
FEBRUARY 6, 2019 @ 6:45 P.M.**

(The following may contain unintelligible or misunderstood words due to the recording quality.)

CALL TO ORDER

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Good evening. I'd like to call the Regular City Council meeting of February 6th to order.

ROLL CALL

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Madam Clerk, roll call, please.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Mayor Thomas Masters?

MAYOR MASTERS: Present.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Chairperson Tonya Davis Johnson?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Here.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Chair Pro Tem Lynne Hubbard?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Here.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson KaShamba Miller-Anderson?

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Present.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Julia Botel?

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Here.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Terence Davis?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Here.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: City Manager Karen Hoskins?

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Here.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: City Clerk Claudene Anthony is present. City Attorney Dawn Wynne?

CITY ATTORNEY WYNNE: Here.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: You may proceed.

INVOCATION

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: We'll stand for a moment of silence, followed by the Pledge of Allegiance, led by the Mayor.

[Moment of silence]

MAYOR MASTERS: Shall we pray? Father, we ask your blessings over our meeting tonight as we deliberate taking care of the City business, that we will do your will betterment of mankind and our residents, and all surrounding areas and people.

Salute the Flag. I...

ALL: ...pledge allegiance to the Flag of the United States of America, and to the republic for which it stands, one nation under God, indivisible with liberty and justice for all.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC SHALL BE GIVEN A TOTAL OF THREE MINUTES TO SPEAK ON ALL ITEMS LISTED ON THE CONSENT AGENDA. ANY PERSON WHO WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS, PLEASE FILL OUT A PUBLIC COMMENT CARD LOCATED ON THE TABLE DIRECTLY OUTSIDE OF THE COUNCIL CHAMBERS AND GIVE IT TO THE STAFF PRIOR TO THE ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA.

AGENDA APPROVAL

ADDITIONS, DELETIONS, SUBSTITUTIONS

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Are there any additions, deletions, or substitutions?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Madam Chair?

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Madam Manager.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Madam Chair, I have the following additions. Community benefits on Consent, Item No. 1A, addition, the..., for the Reentry Center of Riviera Beach, \$350, Councilman Terence Davis to support the Restore our Voice, Amendment 4 voter's registration drive and family day event. Item No. 1B on Consent, community benefits, for Riviera Beach Parks & Recreation, \$300 from Chair Pro Tem Lynne L. Hubbard to support the senior activities at Lindsey Davis Community Center.

Under awards and presentations, addition, Item No. 4A, a presentation from Bernstein & Associates.

And, under discussion and deliberation, I would like to delete Item No. 6, discussion and deliberation to remove Code Enforcement liens from property located at 801 West 1st Street, for property to be sold to a first time homebuyer.

That's all I have, Madam Chair.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Madam Chair?

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilman Davis, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Thank you. I have two Items in particular for tonight, I would like to have added. One is digital signs, discussions and deliberation for digital signs for churches. Ad another one, the second one's gonna be from the office..., the OI'..., presentation on the OIG report. And, if I may, the digital signs, the, the group that's here tonight, it's gonna be very brief. If I could have the support of the Council to take that early 'cause they have a time s'..., they didn't realize that the closed executive session was gonna run this later, to where you can possibly find way to get them, get them in and out on the Agenda. Maybe, like, before awards and presentations, could we just at least hear that issues? It'll probably take about two minutes.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Well, in looking at the Agenda, we just have [pause] three regular I'..., well, two..., one. Well, these are all awards and presentations. I think that we should be able to move through what we have scheduled on the Agenda and get to them. They..., these are just awards and presentations. We have a presentation by the Justice Service Center.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Okay.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilwoman...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: So after...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...Miller-Anderson?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: So after presentations?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Mhmm.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Okay. Alright.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: I wanted to add a community benefits for John F. Kennedy Middle school, to help offset costs of equipment, supplies and uniforms for the girls softball for \$500.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Madam Clerk, that would be 1C?

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Yes, Madam Chair.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: I would like to add 1D, 1E and 1F, community benefits as follows: I'd like to do an interdepartmental community benefits allocation to Parks & Recreation in the amount of \$750 for the Lady Chargers basketball team. Palm Beach Gardens Community High School, Project Graduation 2019 in the amount of \$200, that will be 1E, and 1F, the Riviera Beach Reentry Center, Restore your Voi'..., your Voice event in the amount of \$500 to the reentry program, resource center.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilman Davis.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Thank you for reminding me. Parks & Rec, I have \$1,000 I wanted to interoffice contribution to for the Riviera Beach Heat, semi pro basketball team, girls..., women's semi pro team. That's \$1,000 for the registration.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Are there any additional additions, deletions or substitution from Council?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Uh-uh.

[Pause]

DISCLOSURES BY COUNCIL

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Are there any disclosures?

[Pause].

ADOPTION OF AGENDA

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Entertain a motion to adopt the Agenda.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: So moved.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Second.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: It's been motioned and properly second. Madam Clerk, do we have any public comment cards? Oh, that's only just... I'm sorry.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Correct, Madam Chair.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: [Chuckle]. I'm sorry. Madam Clerk.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Davis?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Botel?

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Pro Tem Hubbard?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Chair Davis Johnson?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Unanimous vote.

CONSENT AGENDA

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ALL MATTERS LISTED UNDER THIS ITEM ARE CONSIDERED TO BE ROUTINE AND ACTION WILL BE TAKEN BY ONE MOTION. THERE WILL BE NO SEPARATE DISCUSSION OF THESE ITEMS UNLESS A COUNCILPERSON SO REQUESTS, IN WHICH EVENT, THE ITEM WILL BE REMOVED FROM THE GENERAL ORDER OF BUSINESS AND CONSIDERED IN ITS NORMAL SEQUENCE ON THE AGENDA.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: There..., are there any Items to be pulled?

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: No.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Alrighty. Do we have any...

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair, we do have a public comment card for the Consent Agenda. The acceptance of public comment cards for the Consent Agenda is now closed.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Okay. Is there a motion?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: So moved.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Second.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: It's been motioned and properly second. Madam Clerk, comment cards.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Fane Lozman.

MR. F. LOZMAN: Fane Lozman, Singer Island.

I., you know, I've talked over the years that any of the community benefits that are doled out, should be on behalf of the City of Riviera Beach. They should not be made in anybody's individual name. One of the things I did notice is today Lynne Hubbard and some other Councilperson, their contributions were at least to entities in Riviera Beach. Why is Tonya Davis Johnson donating money to Palm Beach Gardens High School? I think that's number 1E, Palm Beach Gardens High School? I think that's No. 1E. Palm Beach Gardens.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Palm Beach Gardens High School.

MR. F. LOZMAN: Is that in Riviera Beach?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: It is not in Riviera Beach, however, there are students that live in Riviera...

MR. F. LOZMAN: [Stammer]...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...Beach that attend that school.

MR. F. LOZMAN: The bot'..., there's students that attend schools..., attend school all around Palm Beach County. Money from Riviera Beach has to be designated to entities based in Riviera Beach. You...

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Madam Chair?

MR. F. LOZMAN: ...certainly cannot go ahead and fund pr'..., programs in schools outside of the City of Riviera Beach, that's not what the community benefits package is all about.

[Inaudible dais comments]

MR. F. LOZMAN: So, I have a major problem with funds..., and this started before you guys were up there. The whole idea is that the taxpayers spend \$2.199M more to have Waste Management provide waste service in exchange for a little slush fund that went to Cedrick Thomas and his ole buddies that were on the Council. So, the point of that little slush fund was used to build goodwill and try to get reelected. And I said that slush fund should come to an end, which it hasn't. And I said that slush fund contribution should not be made on behalf of individuals. But certainly, that slush fund, Ms. Johnson, should not go to any entity, school, church, whatever, outside of the City limits of Riviera Beach, and I think you are crossing a line that if you designate what's, in essence, are taxpayers funds, for an entity outside of Riviera Beach, you have a big ethics problem, lady.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you. Councilwoman Botel, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: I had the same misunderstanding when I first came to Riviera Beach about Palm Beach Gardens High School. I couldn't understand why money was being sent there, and then I was informed that seventy percent of our students in Riviera Beach go to Palm Beach Gardens High School, seventy percent. So, it, it really is a Riviera Beach School, by and large.

[Inaudible dais and audience comments]

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Do you have anymore...

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair, that completes public comments for the Consent Agenda.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you.

MINUTES

RESOLUTIONS

COMMUNITY BENEFITS REQUESTS ON CONSENT

1. **JOHN F. KENNEDY MIDDLE SCHOOL -\$500- COUNCILWOMAN JULIA BOTEL - FOR GIRLS BASKETBALL TEAM PROGRAM.**

END OF CONSENT AGENDA

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ANY PERSON WHO WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON AN AGENDA ITEM, PLEASE FILL OUT A PUBLIC COMMENT CARD AND GIVE IT TO STAFF PRIOR TO THE ITEM BEING PRESENTED TO COUNCIL FOR DISCUSSION. MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WILL BE GIVEN THREE MINUTES TO SPEAK ON EACH REGULAR AGENDA ITEM. IN NO EVENT WILL ANYONE BE ALLOWED TO SUBMIT A PUBLIC COMMENT CARD AND SPEAK ON AN AGENDA ITEM AFTER THE RESOLUTION HAS BEEN READ.

UNFINISHED BUSINESS

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: PUBLIC COMMENTS SHALL BEGIN AT 7:30 P.M. UNLESS THERE IS NO FURTHER BUSINESS OF THE CITY COUNCIL WHICH, IN THAT EVENT, IT SHALL BEGIN SOONER. IN ADDITION, IF AN ITEM IS BEING CONSIDERED AT 7:30 P.M., THEN COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC SHALL BEGIN IMMEDIATELY AFTER THE ITEM HAS BEEN CONCLUDED. ANY PERSON WHO WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK DURING PUBLIC COMMENTS, PLEASE FILL OUT A PUBLIC COMMENT CARD LOCATED ON THE TABLE DIRECTLY OUTSIDE OF THE COUNCIL CHAMBERS AND GIVE IT TO THE STAFF BEFORE THE PUBLIC COMMENT SECTION IS ANNOUNCED.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair? We did not do a vote on the Consent Agenda.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Davis?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Botel?

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Pro Tem Hubbard?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Chair Davis Johnson?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Unanimous vote.

PETITIONS AND COMMUNICATIONS FOR FILING

AWARDS AND PRESENTATIONS

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Item No...

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair, we are now down to awards and presentations.

2.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Item No. 2.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: INTRODUCTION AND PRESENTATION BY TERRY FERGUSON REGRADING THE RIVIERA BEACH HOMELESS COALITION.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: I don't see him.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Chair Pro Tem, you're recognized.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: I just wanna state that Dr. Tony Drayton will.., the Reverend Dr. Tony Drayton will be making the presentation on behalf of Ms. Terry Ferguson.

DR. T. DRAYTON: Thank you. Thank you, Councilperson. I'm not Ms. Ferguson, obviously.

[Chuckles]

DR. T. DRAYTON: Two, Mr. Mayor, Council, those who make up this great City, I rise, or I stand to talk about an issue that is ambiguous in our City, and Bridges want' to put some attention to bringing resolve to it. And that issue is the escalating humanitarian problem of homelessness. And homelessness is all over our City. Bridges, briefly, is located on Blue Heron Boulevard. It's a program of the Children Service Council, and Riviera Beach houses one of ten Bridges. Bridges goal is to raise healthy families, healthy children and make our community whole, but it's difficult to make a community whole when homelessness is all over our community.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Correct.

DR. T. DRAYTON: And, it's escalating at a rapid pace. Being a clergyperson or pastor in this City for over twenty-five years, I can tell you, about once a week, sometimes twice a week, I'll get a phone call with families with kids zero to eight, and sometimes older, with no roof over their head. Their pillows become a rock, or the ground, the covering becomes the sky. And I'm faced, we're faced then at that moment of trying to segue or link them into some type of holistic services. We'll..., we have limited funds like everyone else. Personally, I always have to go into my pocket, or call an agency to make certain that that family has a roof over their head that night. The problem that we're facing, with homelessness, is there are certain agencies that have become gatekeepers, [inaudible] and gatekeepers, as to who those funds are disseminated. And, when a family is homeless, or kids are out on the street, there's no, there's no desire to wait for three or four phone calls back, i.e., Bridges comes in..., Bridges come' in..., comes in and now Bridges are forced with the same task of trying to find a shelter for that family overnight. And so, with the disparity of the resolve and funds that are allocated, with gatekeepers whom..., that we cannot control, Bridges reached out to some community partners, and the goal is to formulate a homeless coalition. And the homeless coalition, idealistically, is compromised, and would be compromised, of a multi-facet form that will include a, multi-discipline, law enforcement, emergency workers, medical workers, clergy, you have it. Grassroot person entrepreneurship. And the goal would be to bring an end to the escalating problem of homelessness in our City. The coalition focus is to be entirely in Riviera Beach to give our citizens, especially those who are less fortunate than some of us, a safe place to stay. For example, the last family that I dealt with, along with Bridges and the Homeless Coalition, and there may be some person that's here that are already working with that coalition. We had to come out, we had to come out of our pocket, because we can't wait two and three days to tell a father, with his two daughters, in elementary school, that there's no place for you to stay. And personally, I've had to come out of my checkbook, come out of their check'..., checkbook, Bridges are doing what they need to do, but oftentimes, there's a deficiency, we're parsimonious in a lotta areas, and having funds to, to, to put to this issue, is becoming very challenging. So, the Homeless Coalition is there. Idealistically, someone calls Bridges up, called the Homeless Coalitions, we like to see some funds there, where they can say, 'You know what? It's

10:00 o'clock at night, and 6:00 o'clock at night, but we can assure you that we can address this issue until we get you into some structured services, which may take two or three days.

So, this coalition that Bridges wants to form and populate with Rivera Beach. They want to have a kickoff or what's called a, a call to action.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Mhmm.

DR. T. DRAYTON: And the call to action, I volunteer my time and effort with some others here, to contact our Houses of Faith. And let us, at least begin to address it, in a holistic way. And, on February the 28th, the call to action, I volunteer our place of worship, St. James Church, and email blasts and invites will be going out. We, we need to raise some funds, so, Bridges hands will not be tied. We need to raise some funds, because regardless to where each of you serve, I guarantee you, there's homelessness in your District. It, it transcends color, it transcends economic...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Mhmm.

DR. T. DRAYTON: It transcends status, it transcends class, and it meets us at the, at the, at the intersections of this great City in which we live, work and play. Some folks are trying to live before they can get a chance to play. And I believe that his City is great enough, and we can address resources to the mass homelessness situation and population that we have. And I would propose, or suppose, that each person before me can somehow, just as you are allocating funds to other things, allocate funds to the Homeless Coalition. I'm a proponent [inaudible]. That got me through college. Wasn't for that and academics, so I have no problem with that. But I think there's some things that are called human issues of life that must be addressed. And, what we are asking is that, with this Homeless coalition, that we galvanize our energies, galvanize our funds together, and bring a resolve. In my discipline, there's something, First Testament that says, 'There shall be no poor among you.' And I believe that, that there should be no..., there, there need not be any poor among us.

So, our desire, and our hope is that this call to action, and when we meet, that funds will be brought in, given to Bridges, so they can begin to be the gatekeepers for Riviera Beach, and they can deal with the immediate needs that we find ourself in on a daily basis.

Thank you.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Madam Chair?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Thank you, Mr...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilman Davis, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: I just wanna say thank you to Terry., Ms. Ferguson, and the Bridges Family, thank you to Pastor Drayton for stepping in and filling that gap.

I, I sat through one of those meetings and, and I tell you, it's not just a meeting that tho'..., the people that's taking apart of those committees are serious about you, we here as a community of Riviera Beach, and they're giving their time, energy and they're volunteering to make sure they understand that we, we address these real humane needs in our community. For that to the next meeting, I will be making sure that whatever I have remaining, left, in my community benefits, I give it all to this organization, to support St. James and Bridges together, to make sure that we have that stopgap to address those mothers and fathers who need that, that temporary relief..., to, to address a long term problem.

So, I just wanna say thank you to all of you guys, and all the staff who has volunteered their time and they're giving back.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Chair Pro Tem, you're recognized.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: I want to thank Reverend Drayton on behalf of the Riviera Beach Homeless Coalition. I am definitely proud to be a part of that, and I hope that all of us, or..., will consider giving money to the Riviera Beach Homeless Coalition, as Reverend Drayton said, we, you know, 10:00 o'clock at night, we can find a family that might need a room, and we have to monies there to put them up until we..., until they can get more services. So it's definitely a worthy cause, a much needed organization, and we look forward to the whole community banding together to help, hopefully, one day address the..., end homelessness but, in the meantime, let's [stammer] address the problem itself.

And again, many thanks to the coalition.

MAYOR MASTERS: Madam Chair, Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Mr. Mayor, you're recognized.

MAYOR MASTERS: Dr. Drayton, come back. I wanna ask you a couple questions.

DR. T. DRAYTON: Yes, sir.

MAYOR MASTERS: And I want to welcome you back, to the mic.

DR. T. DRAYTON: Yes.

MAYOR MASTERS: You know the Mayor's, Palm Beach County Mayor's under former Palm Beach County Mayor Priscilla Taylor, brought forward the homeless..., the Mayor's Homeless Coalition, and it's been booming. They've done some great work. I think it's just called the Mayor'..., the Homeless Coalition. I think you refere'..., refenced it earlier.

I guess my question is, who are the members of the coalition? Are they Riviera Beach churches, are they nonprofit organizations, the coalition of..., that's gonna be working with Bridges.

[Inaudible dais comment]

DR. T. DRAYTON: Good question. We met a fledgling group, as met as..., and at the onset, and right now, we have a cross section of officers, persons from the fire department, clergyperson, and it's to grow. This is almost like the parent body, if you will. [Inaudible]. But it no, [stammer], it's by no mean indicate the totality of what that coalition will look like, or the intent of Bridges, what that coalition will look like. Because we, we are all stakeholders to be a part of it. That's important. And want it to be a incipient type of movement from the bottom up..., from the grassroots movement. And so, in my discipline I thought it would be great, at least as..., for, for my discipline, the places of faith, that we have a intricate part in this coalition. Because I discovered that whether their your cong'..., congregates or not, that phone is gonna ring because your church, your mosque, your synagogue and someone gonna say, 'I don't have a place to stay.' So, no, it's not exclusively, just churches, it's the stakeholders of the community. And I believe that's very important to delineate and to announce that, that that's what this coalition is about.

MAYOR MASTERS: Also, the..., I would suggest that you would make some contact with the Catholic charities, who's doing great work as it relates to the homeless, and other population in our, in our City. I think everybody knows where I am with, with the homeless situation and people living under the bridge, particularly veterans, that's just shameful. And I've been involved on a one to one basis with several of the homeless people. We have a relationship and..., the Office of the Mayor, with one our local motels in the West Palm Beach area, that we can just pick up the phone...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: [Inaudible].

MAYOR MASTERS: ...and get people rooms overnight. Because it, it can create an emergency situation until the powers to be kick in.

What I would like tos'..., first of all, I want to make sure that I'm invited to your meetings, 'cause I didn't know anything about it. I know your, your member, Councilman Davis knew, but I didn't know, but I certainly would like to be invited because all of us probably would too because it is something that is on the [inaudible] hearts of all of us. But what I would like to see is a plan. Some type of, what they plan to do, how much..., how the money is to be spent. You know, something. And, and I know you're in the developing stages, embryo stages now, but once that is completed, I, I would like for you to come back and present a specific plan, what the plan of action is. And how much money you would asking from us, from me and others.

That was it.

DR. T. DRAYTON: Okay.

MAYOR MASTERS: Thank you.

DR. T. DRAYTON: Thank you.

MAYOR MASTERS: Thank you, Madam Chair.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: .[Inaudible] Drayton. Councilwoman Botel, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Thank you. I, I so greatly applaud the efforts to help the homeless in our community. You know, a great number of homeless live under the bridge, the Blue Heron Bridge, and a number of people on Singer Island have been reaching out to them to try to help. We've been working with St. Ann's Place, and folks at St. Ann's recommended that the best thing to do for them, would be to give them transportation vouchers because St. Ann's has services, there are some places where there are services. These, by and large, are people who are not looking for a place to live, they, they, they are pretty much under the bridge because that's where they wanna be. And so, we can't force people into a, a residence situation, but we can help them in other ways. And so, I'm just suggesting that I have a group of people on Singer Island who will be very interested in working with you, and helping in this situation.

I, I would also pledge some of my dollars toward this effort.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you.

3.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair, we are now on to Item No. 3.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: OFFICE OF THE MAYOR PROCLAIMS FEBRUARY 11 -17, 2019 AS 2-1-1 HELP LINE AWARENESS WEEK IN THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair, we do not have any public comment cards on this Item. The acceptance of public comment cards on this Item is now closed.

[Inaudible comments]

MAYOR MASTERS: Madam Chair, as you know, back in the day, everyone was aware of 4-1-1, and today we have 9-1-1, but few people are aware of what 2-1-1 is. Many times I've had to refer people to 2-1-1 in those homeless situations, and other kinds of situations that 2-1-1 could just [snaps fingers] give referrals and they were right on top of it.

So, from the Office of the Mayor, City of Riviera Beach, Palm Beach County, Florida.

WHEREAS, many times people need help in meeting life's basic needs; and

WHEREAS, they may experience times of crisis and are not sure where to turn, or to dial, 2-1-1. 2-1-1 is the help line that is central access point providing people of all walks of life, the guidance and support they need; and

WHEREAS, with over 104,000 requests for help jus last year, calls to 2-1-1 are free, confidential, open 24/7 with text messaging...

MAYOR MASTERS: Up to date, aren't ya?

[Chuckles and inaudible comments]

MAYOR MASTERS: ...and online chat, that's also available; and

WHEREAS, 2-1-1 also has specialized advocacy and support programs that include 2-1-1 special needs help line. 2-1-1, Help Me Grow, catching children's development delays early, Elder crisis outreach as well. So they do address the needs of the elderly community, and we really appreciate that because they're the ones that built the bridges'.., bridge where we have crossed, and they are backbone of, of our community;

WHEREAS, 2-1-1, I'm saying it redundantly and repetitively to make sure everybody gets that, 2-1-1, life saving sunshine daily phone calls continue to brighten the lives of local seniors. Wonderful.

NOW THEREFORE, I, Bishop Thomas Masters, Mayor of the City of Riviera, I hereby proclaim February the 11th thru the 17th as 2-1-1 Awareness Week in the City of Riviera Beach and urge all residents to be aware that if they are overwhelmed and in crisis, or just need to talk, 2-1-1 is available anytime of the day or night. 2-1-1 staff can also provide referrals for mental health counseling, substance abuse, healthcare, employment...

MAYOR MASTERS: We gotta get [inaudible] jobs there next time.

MAYOR MASTERS: ...the employment, food assistance, daycare, support groups, Volunteering (the VITA) Pre-Income Tax preparation and so much more. And I personally know because we've made referrals that 2-1-1 has been involved with suicide prevention and suicide cause as well, and you've done a great job. You've help save many lives where people were so depressed that they were thinking about taking their own lives.

NOW THEREFORE, I proclaim, and I have hereunto set my hand and caused the official seal of the City of Riviera Beach, Florida to be affixed this 6th day of February, 2019, attest Thomas A. Masters, Mayor, Claudene L. Anthony, CMC, City Clerk.

MAYOR MASTERS: The City of Riviera Beach, we support your efforts and we proclaim.., we announce and you have done a great job. And I'm gonna ask the audience, let's give 2-1-1 a big hand.

[Applause]

MS. R. GABRIEL: Good evening. Thank you. My name's Randy Gabriel and I am the Programs Manager for 2-1-1. So, all those programs we talked about are the ones that I manage. They are near and dear to my heart, everyone that works at our agency has a heart for everyone that we serve.

I just wanna go over..., when we talk about suicide, you mentioned that we are the National Suicide Prevention Line in this service area. Sadly, last year, our suicide rate went..., calls coming in, went up over thirty-six percent over the previous year.

[Inaudible audience comments]

MS. R. GABRIEL: And eighty-nine percent since 2016. That's a remarkable number. And, we are there 24/7. I'd like to say that we're the only place you can call 24 hours a day, 7 days a week that you talk to a human, which is true, you don't get a recording, you get a real live person. And, we're trained to help people with all kinds of issues, homelessness, child behavior, we are..., domestic violence, and sometimes they just need someone to talk to, and that's what we're there for.

So, for this award and for you attention, your recognition, I thank you. And please remind your friends and colleagues to refer to us because we have no advertising budget, so we depend on you to get the word out.

Thank you very much.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you.

[Applause]

MAYOR MASTERS: Madam Chair, I just want to add, the suicide rate, many of you may not know, but the, the last time I was doing some research and statistics, it was high..., the highest in the teenage group, and it was very high among the young teenage girls. And it was growing. I think she would attest to that, so that's why we really got to get on top of that.

Thank you, Madam Chair and Council.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you, Mr. Mayor.

4.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair, we are now on to Item No., 4.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: PRESENTATION BY JUSTICE SERVICE CENTER DIRECTOR REGARDING RESTORE OUR VOICE AMENDMENT, VOTER REGISTRATION DRIVE AND FAMILY DAY EVENT TO BE HELD FEBRUARY 16, 2019.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair, we do not have any public comment cards on this Item. The acceptance of public comment cards on this Item is now closed.

JUSTICE SERVICE CENTER BULLARD: Good evening, Council...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Good evening.

JUSTICE SERVICE CENTER BULLARD: ...Mayor...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Good evening.,

JUSTICE SERVICE CENTER BULLARD: ...and Madam Manager.

MAYOR MASTERS: Good evening.

JUSTICE SERVICE CENTER BULLARD: I'm gonna bring up, I have a, a flyer to show real quick, so I'm gonna bring that up. [Pause]. Okay. So, while that's coming up.

I just wanted to tell everyone about an event that we're having. We're having a really big event on February 16th, and it's gonna e at the Marina Event Center, and it's voter registration drive, and it's also a family fund day. And so, we have a lot of community agencies that are coming out to participate. We're gonna have the Clerk and Comptroller's office, the League of Women Voters will be there, Palm Beach County Public Safety, Career Source and Palm Beach State College, a plethora of, of different agencies that are gonna be there. And our objective here is to provide some of our folks with these needed sourc'.., resources, and also to register folks to vote, that have been impacted by Amendment 4. And so, just in case you all don't know, Amendment 4 was passed, it was voted through, and it was effective January 8th. And so, we.., a lot of our folks that work in our program, are impacted, directly impacted, as well as their families, by Amendment 4. And so, what we wanted to do was just create a platform where they can come find out information about voting, there's gonna be voter education that takes place, and also, they can register to vote.

And so, just wanna thank Councilman Davis has been a part of our planning process, he's been an advocate for our folks in our, in our program and throughout...

[Pause – Pulling up flyer]

JUSTICE SERVICE CENTER BULLARD: There we go. Alright. So, we can just kinda go through here. So, our.., Councilman Davis has been a advocate for our program and we've done a few programs in the past for our clients. The special thing about this event, is that everyone's invited. It's a family event. And so, we'll have free food, we'll have bounce houses for the kids, Digital Vibes will be there, and we wanna have.., the FLOW mobile will actually be there, and that's the driver's license and ID unit, so if someone does not have an ID, or a license which would stop them from voting, or being able to register to vote, we'll have that onsite, so they can actually register onsite, they can get an ID onsite, they can get a license onsite.

And so, we'll also have the Public Defender's office there, and they'll be explaining the process of Amendment 4 and how it impacts each of our clients.

[Pause]

And just a quick definition of Amendment 4. It automatically restores the right to vote for people with prior felony convictions, except those convicted of murder or a felony sexual offense, upon completion of their sentences, including prison parole and probation, or probation. And so, it's important for the folks that are registering, there's a grey area now with Amendment 4, and it's based in the completion of sentence, and what does that actually mean? And so, as the new government comes in and they kind of try to break that out, we have the Clerk of Court and the Public Defender's office there because we don't anyone to register that's not eligible to register. It's actually felony. So, we're gonna have those folks onsite, so they can actually do a printout. If anyone owes any court costs or whatever, they'll be able to see that, that day. And, we actually have a plan in place for anyone that has court costs. And so, with the Clerk's office and the, the Public Defender's office, they have a program where you can convert court costs to community service hours. So, if someone owes \$500 in court costs, you can convert that at a rate of \$10 per hour, of community service. And so, we have some of things in place so that we can make sure that we capture everyone in that process.

And so, we're just gonna..., we're inviting everyone out. It's February 16th at the Marina, from 10:00 a.m. to 2:00 p.m. You can bring the whole family. We'll have food and everything for you guys.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilman Davis, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: I just wanna say thank you to our Staff for doing a wonderful job with Mr. Bullard as, as the senior leader.

One of the things we wanna add to this, is Reggie Dee has been keeping a story to himself for a long, long time. He wanted to be here tonight but he will be there on February 16th at 11:00 o'clock. He's gonna tell that story about him being a convicted felon, and for so long, not having his rights restored and what that means to be a part of this event. So, he's gonna have a po'..., about a ten second..., ten minute workshop explaining his story and how this impacting the change in his life, on that day. So, Reggie Dee wanted to make sure I got that information out to let Riviera Beach know that this process is changing his life, and he's enjoying going around... This will be the first time he's ever told his story publicly. [Stammer] he said he was very afraid to do it but, you know, with this Amendment 4, he said he can't hold it, hold it in no longer, so now he wants to tell you his story on how he was able to be successful and come out and do the right thing with his life. So, I just wanna say thank you, Staff, for that.

And also, we wanted to focus on this is not just about registering to vote, it's about all those other services, just like stated. We have a lot of folks with heavy court cots and they wanna get their ID's and driver's license, whether it's child support, whatever it may

be. We have some things'..., they have some things in place to allow you to convert those court costs into community service hours.

In the last event we had, we had a ton of people running at the last minute that heard about it, and they have been so excited about being able to go and apply for a job and show and demonstrate they have some form of ID, so they can move on with their lives and prevent a sense of care for their families.

MAYOR MASTERS: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Mr. Mayor, you're recognized..

MAYOR MASTERS: Thank you.

A couple things. It, it is to be noted that the State Attorney, I'm, I'm not for sure you're aware, said that he would not prosecute those that try to register and for some reason did not realize that there was a probation or they thought they had finished something, they were not on paper, whatever the reason may be, because it's disgraceful that we're getting felons to, to vote and yet, they'll charge 'em with a felony if they register and they shouldn't register. But, thanks that we have a very fair State Attorney, who understood that they should not be charged with a felony. I don't think they should be charged with anything, people make mistakes all the time. But he has stated, on the record, as far as I, as far as I know, that the State Attorney's office is not gonna prosecute. Because, what we don't wanna do, is scare a lot of ex-offenders, who we now call returning citizens, away from registering to vote because they think they're gonna hit with another felony. They've been cleared, now here we go again. Thank you as to the State Attorney for stepping in and helping to alleviate that fear.

The other thing that's important, and this is a good time to state, and I've asked the Clerk, she's, she's checking the record now, but I believe February the 11th? Did somebody say the 11th? Is the deadline?

UNK: Yes.

MAYOR MASTERS: February the 11th, is the deadline for the returning citizens to register to vote, if they plan to vote in the March election. As you know, we had a job fair for ex-offenders and hundreds have already registered from..., as a result of the, of the job fair. But those who are listening and viewing on TV, please note, that you have until February the 11th, if you're going to vote in the March 12th election, providing that you have not been convicted of murder or any of the sexual offenses that, that you talked about.

Also, if there is a runoff, you get a few extra days, even if you, you don't miss the 11th deadline, there's a few extra days that you may get to..., in order to vote in the runoff. But, register. People worked very, very hard that we may have the right to vote. So please register before the February the 16th, providing that you wanna vote in your local city election. And if not, just register and vote whenever you can.

Thank you, and thanks for the great work that you're doing for your program and our program for ex-offenders, returning citizens, and getting them the supportive services. That's why we have the job fair for ex-offenders. When they come out, as you know, recidivism is very high, sixty'.., sixty some percent. But if we can get 'em a job and turn their lives around with all these additional resources, we can get a handle on this, and those numbers can go down.

Thank you very much. Thank you, Madam Chair.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you.

JUSTICE SERVICE CENTER BULLARD: And I'd just like to add, if you have any questions about the, this event registering to vote, or anything, 561-840-3124 is our office number. 561-840-3124. And you can reach any of our staff and they'll be able to help you with anything regarding this event, or registering to vote.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you, sir.

UNK: Thank you.

JUSTICE SERVICE CENTER BULLARD: [Inaudible].

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilman Davis, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: The group, could we hear Item right before we go to public comment?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: I wanna begin public comment at 7:30. I don't know how many cards that we have.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: That's why I was trying to get it done before the.., 'cause I knew this was gonna happen.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Right. But we began our meeting so late, I wanna go ahead and get this underway.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC - 7:30 PM Non-Agenda Item Speakers (Three Minute Limitation) Chair - reads following statement:

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: PUBLIC COMMENT SHOULD BE RESTRICTED TO ISSUES, MATTERS OR TOPICS PERTINENT TO THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH. PLEASE BE REMINDED THAT THE CITY COUNCIL HAS ADOPTED RULES OF DECORUM GOVERNING PUBLIC CONDUCT DURING OFFICIAL MEETINGS, WHICH HAS BEEN POSTED AT THE ENTRANCE OF THE

COUNCIL CHAMBERS. IN AN EFFORT TO PRESERVE ORDER, IF ANY OF THE RULES ARE NOT ADHERED TO, THE CHAIRPERSON MAY HAVE ANY DISRUPTIVE SPEAKER OR ATTENDEE REMOVED FROM THE PODIUM, FROM THE MEETING AND/OR THE BUILDING, IF NECESSARY. PLEASE GOVERN YOURSELF ACCORDINGLY.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair, the acceptance of public comment cards for this section of the Agenda is now closed. Bonnie Larson, Lloyd Brown, Bessie Brown.

MS. B. LARSON: Bonnie Larson.

Multiple things, so I'll talk fast here. Broadway, we..., it was really a bumpy road on Broadway, around the area of Goodwill. I don't know what street that is but it was really bad. They did a temporary fix on it, that was awful, but now someone had done it properly, they repaired the road there in three spots, properly, so I'm wondering who did that? Was that DOT, was it AT&T, who messed up the road in the first place, or was it the City? I'm interested to know who did that. Now, that's a good start, but we have three or four other places on that same stretch of Broadway. You drive in the eastern side, which is towards the..., more towards the stores, and your car's gonna go out of alignment. So, we have three good fixes, now we need to continue. Let's not stop short. Fix Broadway. We still have the RV graveyard on Broadway. We're trying to make Broadway look better but it's just looking worse all the time.

MAYOR MASTERS: Everything looks bad.

MS. B. LARSON: Additions and deletions to the meetings. We've got to put a deadline on this. We've got to. We had more additions and deletions than we did on the normal number of topics. Set a date and that's a deadline. If you don't get in your... Mr. Davis disappeared. [Inaudible]. If you don't get your subject in, then you can't do it, then you have to wait 'til the next two weeks. But let's quit with this add on and deletion, and it's just getting worse and worse by the minute.

We bought the property at 3500 Broadway, which is the old Schooner Inn property. What was our thought process in purchasing that property in the first place? We never heard why we bought that, but now there were surveyors out there and that was interesting because when, before we bought it, there should've been a survey done. I'm sure it was, so why are they out there surveying now? We like to know what's going on in the City.

Also, on about twenty'..., 21st to 24th Street, there're all kinds of orange lines on the sidewalk, what are they doing there? What's the deal with that?

We have..., restaurants have come and gone. If you didn't get to Broadway Joe's, it's too late. They're gone. There's gonna be another restaurant there, it's called La Granja, which is a Caribbean restaurant. I understand there's a full service one on..., here he comes [chuckle], on North Lake Boulevard. I never knew about that, but that's what's gonna be coming in there now. The Hub, that moved out. That's for lease. That was on Broadway near the old..., near the BB&T Bank building. I understand that Soul Food left.

Public Works, I drove by the old Public Works facility, I drove by there today and we have.., and it's sitting there, a Brink's truck, an old Brink's truck and an old food truck. We've gotta make our properties look good. How can we expect citizens and other companies who come in here to keep up their property, if our properties look like slum? Slum landlord, right on 28th & Broadway, still. There's graffiti, there's an old air conditioner on the roof, which has.., probably hasn't worked for a 100 years, their driveway is a mess, they put out old furniture. It's not the.., it's not the tenant's fault, it's the landlord, the owner. They've gotta fix that. It, it makes us all look bad. It's been there for quite some time in that condition. Big hole in the wall on the northside, I brought that up several times before. So what are we, what are we planning to do with those properties?

And, let's see here. Oh, job description for the Mayor. At one of the debates they were asking, 'What would you do as the Mayor?' There must be a job description somewhere. Where can we find that so we know what the Mayor is supposed to do. 'Cause they were asked, 'what would you do?' Well, there must be a job description somewhere. Where is it? So that we know.

Thank you.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Lloyd Brown.

MR. L. BROWN: Hello.

You know, I was listening to the guy that was just up here talking about, you know, register to vote or whatever. You know what's so odd about that? I thought, you know, we already had those rights. And I mean, people might be fightin' for 'em right now, but back then, people died for 'em, why should we have to go through all this to get our rights back, when you took 'em in a matter of minutes? I may not be a felon, but I stand by these felons, 'cause I see 'em every day, that stand on the corners. And then, when you talk about jobs, jobless mean' homeless. I see a lotta churches, they don't hire people from the neighborhood, so I'm not gonna just put this on, you know, the people.., the homeless people. They may want jobs, but now if you go to Labor Pool, you got to take a drug test. And, I mean, there's a lotta homeless people who are drug addicts. So, I mean, but if you had jobs, you wouldn't have homelessness like you have it. If you go ride around the neighborhood, you look at most of these churches, I know he's a minister right down the street from me, look who's doing the lawn maintenance and most of the places around here. You can't get an individual inside the church, who has a lawn service business, where you can pick him up and put him on his feet, and hire individuals around your neighborhood? So, I mean, when you come up here and complain about homelessness, I mean, look in the mirror. I mean, you got a lot to do with it too. I mean, churches, they'.., they're tax free. I mean, look.., where's the money going into a bank that's financing these houses over here, while these people who are building these houses, none of 'em live in the neighborhood. Not any one of 'em. I done' went to three houses being built, and I haven't seen not a single individual I know. When I was coming up, that's all I saw, doing the roads, the lawn maintenance. I mean look, if you go out there and you're gonna hire somebody from outside the neighborhood, you can't say anything about homelessness, 'cause you're creating it yourself. I mean, you're gonna

have to put your foot down too. Don't try to throw it on everybody and say, 'Well, you need help from the City.' Yeah, okay, that's right.

And then the City say you're gonna pull people in here for jobs. I mean, how? I don't see anybody coming in here. And you can't get a man a job who's paying \$1,900 a month for rent, a job at McDonald's and Burger King. You can't get a person to do that.

And another thing, you know these stores in our neighborhood? In Miami, what they did, they sent the Health Department, just to go through without anybody knowing. You know, they found about twenty, maybe not that many but you know how it is with officials, that little, and when I came here, it was that big, well they did about twelve stores down in Miami, and they found that these stores are really dirty. Riviera Beach, you can look over there. How many times you seen a tent over there on the Imperial? Or you seen a tent somewhere? Not never. So you know there's got to be something in there. Straighten out these little, small problems.

And one thing, I'm gonna tell you what the felons told me, they don't really... I haven't registered, and this is what they told me. Until Riviera Beach gets somebody in there that's worth votin' for, what's the use of registering? Anyway, who want' half their rights? Do they put felon money over here to build the City and unfelon people' money over here?

[Timer]

MR. L. BROWN: No. They put it all together. So don't give me half and then tell me that, 'Oh, you gotta pay taxes, but you can only do half the things that everybody else do.' That's b.s., 'cause one thing, I wanna protect myself. I don't live in a gated community, but those gated communities, they got guns. Those are the ones up there in Washington or whatever, who's putting his vote in, they got guns and everything to protect themselves, but I can't have it. What I'm gonna do with a voter registration's card when a brother come in there with a AK-47 shooting at me? What I'm gonna do?

[Audience chuckles]

MR. L. BROWN: Say, 'I live in Riviera Beach, I got the right to vote. Please don't shoot me.' That's b.s.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you, Mr. Brown.

[Audience clapping]

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Bessie Brown, Reverend William H. Burrs, Fane Lozman.

MS. B. BROWN: Good evening. Bessie Brown.

MAYOR MASTERS: Good evening.

MS. B. BROWN: The last time I was here, I, I talked about the [pause] bus stops, in

front of Stonybrook. I said something, Terrence Bailey said something, well, there's no reconciliation 'cause we still have no bus stops from U Avenue to [stammer] Barack Obama. Now, that is not.., that's, that should be taken care of. And I when I ask for this [stammer] for, for an answer, I want an answer because these people in Stonybrook are being displaced. They would have to leave Stonybrook and walk to Congress. Now, Terrence Bailey is not the transportation man, so I need you all to take care of this for, for our citizens. And Stonybrook is already catching hell. And I'm.., I just mean that, you know?

And, right now, our road construction, the construction over in Park Manor [pause]. [Chuckle]. I saw, I saw Terrence Bailey again in our neighborhood association meeting, and he said they're doing bike, what, bike lanes and all of this stuff that's going on and, like I told him... And he was gonna check on my street because of [stammer] where the construction was in my street, it's so, it's, it's much, much deteriorated. And, and [stammer] then you gotta drive through these holes so that I'll be needin' a front end alignment, or flat tires or whatever. But I, but I.., when, when I talked to him, I know how to come back and continue to talk to, talk about it because I want it done. If you're gonna say you're gonna check on it, call me. And I left him messages [stammer] ever since my association meeting. Haven't heard from him. And, and, and they have done.., they have finished the road. I would, I would just like to ask, could someone please get us a copy, or some pictures, of anybody else's road that have been done for the roads on 34th, 34th and H Avenue east and west? Because that is, it's just horrendous. And like I said, the, the [chuckle], the, the things where the water go in, the gutters or whatever, those things are so rusty and so ugly, they look worse than the ones that have been sitting there on F Avenue for thirty-two years. Because that's how long I have lived over there.

Now, we need to do better. If we're paying for [stammer] for things, we need to get the best of services and not have our communities look like, like that. I know there's some construction going on over there on Singer Island at one of the places. I, I would hope that this.., I, I, I.., 'matter of fact, I've been over there riding around to look. I haven't seen theirs looking like that. No, we gotta do better here. And we have to do better here because we, we, we pay taxes, and I want a, an answer and a, and a response to my satisfaction, because now they have actually finished the roads, and smoothed it out and everything, but they never addressed the issue that I had on 35th Street, closest to F Avenue, where 35th comes into, 35th comes into...

[Timer]

MS. B. BROWN: ...and F Avenue. [Stammer], I just need... I don't have a problem. I'm glad we're doing this, but you know what, we need to make sure, if we hire people, that they.., we get the service that we want. But I still want to see a street that [stammer], the way our street look, I wanna see one that has been done that way from the company that did, did the work.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Reverend William H. Burrs, Fane Lozman, Douglas Lawson.

REVEREND W. BURRS: Madam Chair, Council, Mayor.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Good evening.

REVEREND W. BURRS: I, coincidentally, I came by the City Clerk's office and I was listening [stammer] looking at the last meeting you all had, no, not the meeting but this meeting they had with the candidates. And I stopped by the Mayor's.., or, the City Clerk's office and [inaudible] pick up one of these, [inaudible] what's going on, the, the Agenda. Going on the [stammer] on the Council for election, in March rather, and I read this, and I can't.., when I read this, this is ridiculous.

[Inaudible comments and chuckles]

REVEREND W. BURRS: This is totally... How would ya'll sit there and pass something like this here?

MAYOR MASTERS: Are you talking about the amendment...

REVEREND W. BURRS: If ya'll, if, if the citizen passed this, we don't ya'll. Because this amendment says, number one says, the, the Council cannot give the City Manager orders. Period.

MAYOR MASTERS: That's right.

REVEREND W. BURRS: Who's the one giving the orders?

MAYOR MASTERS: You're right.

REVEREND W. BURRS: This has got to be crazy. Why would you all put a.., put something on the, on, on [stammer] for a referendum, for the citizens to say we wanna put the hand.., put the City in the hands of a, and individual, man or woman, and the Council cannot give him orders. Period. Now, this What this sayin'.

MAYOR MASTERS: Absolutely right.

REVEREND W. BURRS: The Council cannot give the City Manager orders. I, I., this is, this is beyond my imagination. The citizens need to know this. I asked that, well, some time ago, when this first came out, I said, 'Why don't ya'll, before ya'll put this onto a referendum, have a, a town hall meeting with the citizens and read these things to them , that didn't happen. See, a lot of citizens will go due to the fact of the problem that we've been having in this City, they'll just go vote because [inaudible] change. And they don't know what they're doing when [stammer], really don't understand what they're doing. Here on here about Council cannot give a [stammer] orders, instruction to an employee. That's been.., you got that already in order. That's already, eh, ya'll don't know this? A Councilperson cannot give orders to anybody work under the City Manager. I'mma, I'mma living witness of that. Used to work for the City. Council come down [stammer] our department one time to go give us an order, we told him to get [inaudible], you don't tell us what to do. The general employees ought to know this, a Councilperson cannot

give a directive to anybody under the City Manager. You don't need this on the Agenda for referendum. Now on here saying that if a person serve on the Council [stammer] a period of time, that they cannot get a job with the City, they cannot get a business with the City. They.., this got to be crazy. I don't understand why ya'll would put something like this for a referendum. And it also says that, now, that if you serve three years, Council served three years,... It shoulda been two, it don't matter 'cause people can vote cha' out when they get ready, then they can't.., three years, what' you gonna do? There's no sa'.., they can't stay.., you, you can't stay out for a term and then come back and run? It doesn't say anything about that. These things shoulda been spelled out much better.

I will say to the citizens, they need to read this and don't go for none of this. This is just garbage. This is just ridiculous. To go to a referendum for the citizen to pass. You.., somebody need to.., ya'll oughta have a workshop with the citizens and let 'em know, don't vote for this amendment, 'cause you're giving your City into the hands of one person, when they become the City Manager. You all can't tell 'em nothin'. This says that.

[Times]

REVEREND W. BURRS: The Council cannot give the City Manager orders. Where does that happen? Who he gonna get his orders from? Who gonna tell him what to do?

Thank you, ma'am. Ya'll need to think about that. And ya'll.., if ya'll.., ya'll already voted this into referendum?

MAYOR MASTERS: It's on the ballot.

REVEREND W. BURRS: It's on the ballot?

MAYOR MASTERS: What you call crazy is on the ballot.

REVEREND W. BURRS: I can't believe this.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Fane Lozman, Douglas Lawson, Bishop Thomas Masters.

MR. F. LOZMAN: Fane Lozman, Singer Island. The five of you are the elected final policymakers for the City. To some degree, the Mayor, because he has certain powers you don't have, he's also a policymaker. The six of you, last summer, directed the City Attorney's office to terminate Bedard and his law firm...

MAYOR MASTERS: That's right.

MR. F. LOZMAN: ...and replace him with another attorney. Lina Busby, I don't know if she's around tonight, she was present, Degraffenreidt was present. They have obfuscated, they have stalled, they have not wanted to do that, they have made excuses, they have said the insurance company's not getting back to them. They've done all kinds of stuff, but do what the six of you...

MAYOR MASTERS: That's right.

MR. F. LOZMAN: ...told the City Attorney's office to do. Now, we have the City Attorney there and I talked to her, and she said, 'Oh well, we sent a memo and this lady's not around, and this person's not around.' You don't need the insurance company's permission to terminate a law firm that disparaged an elected official and brought dishonor to the City.

MAYOR MASTERS: That's right.

MR. F. LOZMAN: You said, 'Fire.' The City Attorney needs to fire Bedard. Once he's fired, she calls up and says give a pool of new law firms and we'll choose one. Lina Busby said that last summer. Here it is six months later. It's not the insurance company to determine the client's lawyer. Say the g'.., say the guy was a member of the Ku Klux Klan, hypothetically, yeah, the lawyer was. You can't fire your own attorney? Sure you can fire your own attorney. The six of you said fire Bedard. He's still there. This new City Attorney doesn't understand that the consent is to fire Bedard, and she has not fired him, and he needs to be fired. You fire him, then you say, 'By the way insurance company, where's our replacement attorney?' If not, she can act as the City's replacement attorney. She's been an attorney going on thirty years, she can figure it out and hold the pieces together. But it's, but I's almost insubordination for the City's law office to ignore what the six final policymakers, who are her boss, told her what to do.

Now, people are saying, we got a big election coming up. I've had some issues, where I haven't been able to come around as much. I wanna tell you, we need some changes up there. And the number one change is, we need a new Chairperson. Tonya Davis Johnson, it's time for you to go. I've been to the Palm Beach County Commission, I've made my comments repeated times about what went on over there, with me and you. You had a lotta nerve, after I spent hundreds of thousands of dollars winning a case at the Supreme Court to have the police come and try to censure me when I had my First Amendment right speaking at this Council meeting. You know, you want the protections of equal protection. You know? My attorney, at Stanford, she won the Windsor case, the gay rights case. Okay? You believe in gay rights, but yet, the First Amendment, we don't believe in that. We are not gonna tolerate anybody sitting up there that is not an advocate for the First Amendment, the other four people are. You're not. It's time for...

[Timer]

MR. F. LOZMAN: ...for you to go. People who have supported me over the years, who do I want up there? I want Tommy Walker to replace you.

Thank you.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Douglas Lawson, Bishop Thomas Masters, Dana Jones.

MR. D. LAWSON: Good evening, Council, Mayor, Chairperson Tonya Davis Johnson, Vice Chair. My name's Douglas Lawson. I'm a resident here in Riviera Beach, an a candidate, City Council.

I'm proud that the Police Benevolent Association endorsed me. I look forward to working with them and working...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: [Inaudible].

MR. D. LAWSON: ...with the youth here in the community.

[Inaudible comment]

MR. D. LAWSON: Our goal is to help with the, the vibe that the police in the community have, in this City, and I wanna make sure that we continue to push, as a City together. I'm up here today because I'm the owner and founder of Infinity Taxes and Beyond, and I wanna announce the Bridge 2 Infinity Camp. The Police Department is working with our City to help save the youth that are here in this community, because the recent shootings in our community are derived from a lot of the kids here. So, the camp that we're announcing tonight is the Bridge 2 Infinity Camp, and it's a summer youth entrepreneurial camp. It's a camp for kids between the ages of twelve and seventeen. We had a very successful camp last year that was completely funded by Infinity Taxes and some of the sponsors. We're looking for businessowners here in the community to associate with the camp that can come along the last week of July, businessowners, leaders and Members of the Council to help with building this camp. So, what our goal is, is to get these kids, and these idle hands off the streets and to support each other. If we can do that as a team, then we can unify together. So, what the Bridge 2 Infinity Camp, it'll be the last week of July. We wanna actually have as many businessowners available possible, and we're looking for sponsors as well. So if anyone is interested in sponsoring and supporting this camp, please, it's the last week of July. Our office is on the corner of Blue Heron and Broadway, 25 East Blue Heron, and we're going to be starting it Jul 28th.

Thank you. Have a great evening, Council.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilman Davis.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: I think we need to reiterate the candidates that we do not use public comments to advocate on for office, but you can talk about your information. And we, we said that on numerous occasions so, I think at some point, we need to make sure that we reinforce that that is taking place for everyone.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you, sir.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Bishop Thomas Masters, Dana Jones, Evelyn Harris Clark.

BISHOP T. MASTERS: I speak as a minister, a pastor and the Bishop of the New Macedonia Baptist Church. You've already seen one pastor speak and how he has spoken about the.., these amendments. I must tell you, as one of the pastors and ministers who are meeting across this City, we share the same sentiment that Pastor Burrs and other ministers are saying to their congregation. One, let's talk about this term

limit thing. [Stammer] it really isn't a term limit. It's just very [pause]. You got two kinds, a conservative and a liberal. This basically says after three consecutive terms, if you're out for a year, whatever, you can run again. Or, if you're the Mayor, you can run for the, the..., your own seat, where you live, or either the Citywide seat. So, I mean, all we're doing is recycling. Or, if you are a Councilperson, and number two, you serve nine terms, uh, three terms, when that term is over, you can run for another Council seat, the Citywide seat, or the Mayor's seat, or whatever. So, you're still gettin' the same people, and the same people voting. It's also very unfair, I've had five terms, I hope, as March the 12th will determine, if we go further but it's unfair to young people that go to college, they come back and we tell them, 'You can't have five terms like the previous Mayor, you can only have three.' We all know up there, it takes at least two terms to even get your feet on the ground, the learning curve. And the third term, you're actually activating and, and getting things done. So, as one of the ministers that I've joined, Pastor Burrs, and other pastors of the City and the churches, as we go from church to church, I joined them to say, 'Vote no.' No, on the term limits. We voted no several times, twice, the residents of the City have voted no and I'm sure we're gonna vote no again.

As far as the year, you can't come back and be employed. We all know what that's about, that's about, in my mind, Cedrick Thomas. Because he left the Council and went to be a police officer. But wait a minute, he was a police officer before he was a Council Member. That's what I think that's all about. So listen, suppose you're an elected official and you want to become an Ambassador, you know, come on, come on people, don't make, don't make this personal. The ethics thing, we already have ethics. Who puts ethics in the Charter? And then this thing here is so ambivalent, it doesn't even tell you what the ethics is. It just says [stammer] there's no due process, it doesn't tell you what the state ethics is, doesn't tell you what the federal is. So, you're going and vote on something in the dark that you don't even know. Pastor Burrs is absolutely right and I'm happy that he pastors and ministers have joined to say to the residents of this City, 'Vote no.' Who has a subordinate person...

[Timer]

BISHOP T. MASTERS: ...under them, like a City Manager, and you can't tell them what to do. Crazy. Join the ministers.

Thank you very much.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Dana Jones, Evelyn Harris Clark, Shirley Lanier.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Good evening.

MS. D. JONES: Hello. I'm Dana Jones. I'm back again.

MAYOR MASTERS: Good evening.

DANA JONES: I haven't heard anybody come to my house and concern me on fixing my cars because they messed up my, my driveway, where I couldn't get in and out my driveway. I scratched up my car, I need it fixed. Now, everybody's up for election, how

are we gonna vote for anybody, ain't nobody listening to the people. And I want to know why I haven't heard from somebody, it's been a while since I've been up here. I've been in Riviera for fifty-six years, I have never had a problem with nobody, but if they give me one, like I husband say, they don't know who they' messin' with. He say' I'm the meanest woman in Palm Beach County. Somebody has to fix my car. Because they shouldn't got somebody' driveway where they can'.., can't get in or out of they' driveway to go where they have to go. And nobody's called me, nobody's said nothin', nobody been to my job. I've been with Walgreens for nineteen years, I'm always at work from 2:30 to 11:00 at night. Nobody has came to see me about nothin'. So, I wanna know, what are they gonna do about gettin' somebody to my house to figure out what they're gonna do about my car.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Madam City Manager.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Hi, Ms. Jones.

MS. D. JONES: Hello.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: If you would please give me your information and I will ensure that we contact you tomorrow. If you would meet me right here.

MS. D. JONES: Okay.

[Pause]

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Evelyn Harris Clark, Shirley Lanier, Doretta Paulk.

[Inaudible discussions]

MS. E. CLARK: Good evening, ladies and gentlemen of the dais. Evelyn Clark.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Good evening.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Good evening.

MS. E. CLARK: On my job, we have this program called the Star Award, and whenever a colleague does something terrific for another colleague, we make sure we ack'.., acknowledge that. There are three categories of people existing in the world, the wanters, the wishers and the makers. We could talk about making a difference or we make a difference. On behalf of the Clark Family, we wish to express our gratefulness to Riviera Beach Staff, who have responded to our request to keep our neighborhood safe, clean and valued. And tonight, I would like to start off with Ms. Julia Botel, who takes time to resolve the many unsafe neighborhood problems, as well as being a physical presence in our neighborhood activities. Ms. Botel.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Thank you.

MS. E. CLARK: Next, Ms. Lynne Hubbard and Hope Jeanty, who solely coordinated

the Keep Riviera Beach Clean, Keep Riviera Beach Beautiful campaign in our neighborhoods. My neighbors appreciated the support and have requested a repeat. The Riviera Beach Police Department, over the last four years, have helped turn a neighborhood plagued with drugs, prostitution and other negative activity into one of the most safest areas, in addition to hands-on safe and secure approach by checking in our resident's homes or by telephone. CRA Staff, who work tirelessly, long hours to bring special events and beautification program' with excellence to Riviera Beach. Park Manor residents, special appreciation to Mr. Scott Evans and Staff, who take time away from their families to listen to our neighborhood concerns and ideas about property values. Mr. Arthur Johnson, truly is chasing down and cleaning up the massive amounts of illegal construction dumping, and unsightly debris brought in from other [stammer], other municipalities that our tax dollars pay for. In addition, making sure these people are informed about our City Ordinances and adhere to rules. Code Enforcement, it may not be a popular department, but they are popular in responding to problems, or working out solutions where everyone is happy. And to the Riviera Beach residents, again, we can talk about making a difference, or we can make a difference.

Also, I wanna bring to your attention, starting on Wednesday, February 13th from 6:00 o'clock to 8:00 o'clock, please come to a Riviera Beach community event, learn and...

[Timer]

MS. E. CLARK: ...understand your proposed Charter amendments, speak with community leaders. The choice is yours. It's held at 2831 South Avenue, Riviera Beach, Florida 33404.

I'd like to leave you with a couple of things...

MAYOR MASTERS: Time.

MS. E. CLARK: Come and learn about your Charter and the amendments. The mind is a terrible thing to waste. And I also learned a...

MAYOR MASTERS: Time.

MS. E. CLARK: ...long time ago, is the needs of my...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: She can finish [inaudible]...

MS. E. CLARK: ...father. There's one thing in life...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: I know. She...

MS. E. CLARK: ...that is, you don't trust a pastor that tells you how to vote, and you don't trust a politician...

[Inaudible audience comments]

MS. E. CLARK: ...that tells you how to pray.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Point of order.

[Chuckles]

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you.

MAYOR MASTERS: [Inaudible].

[Inaudible comments]

MAYOR MASTERS: How political is that?

UNK: [Inaudible].

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: They've been fightin' for years.

MS. E. CLARK: This, this is nonpartisan. None of...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Point of order.

MS. E. CLARK: ...this is about you.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Point of order. No exchange, please.

MS. E. CLARK: That's terrible. That's twice...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Point of order, please.

MS. E. CLARK: ...[inaudible]...

MAYOR MASTERS: Respect...

MS. E. CLARK: I'mma grown...

MAYOR MASTERS: ...the Chair.

MS. E. CLARK: ...adult.

MAYOR MASTERS: Respect the Chair.

MS. E. CLARK: I'm a [stammer], I'm a grown...

MAYOR MASTERS: Respect the Chair.

MS. E. CLARK: ...adult woman.

[Gavel]

MAYOR MASTERS: The point., the Chair said point of...

MS. E. CLARK: You do not yell at me...

MAYOR MASTERS: ...order. Respect the Chair.

MS. E. CLARK: ...at all.

MAYOR MASTERS: Respect the Chair.

MS. E. CLARK: ...and tell me what to do.

MAYOR MASTERS: You're not [inaudible].

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Point of order, please.

MS. E. CLARK: We are not peers.

[Inaudible audience comments]

MAYOR MASTERS: Respect the Chair.

MS. E. CLARK: We are not peers.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Walter, please cut the feed.

MAYOR MASTERS: Respect the Chair. Take her out if...

MS. E. CLARK: No. We are not peers.

MAYOR MASTERS: ...she's not gonna respect the Chair. Respect the Chair.

MS. E. CLARK: Control yourself.

MAYOR MASTERS: Respect the Chair.

MS. E. CLARK: [Inaudible].

MAYOR MASTERS: She called you out of order.

MS. E. CLARK: Control yourself. That's twice you...

MAYOR MASTERS: Respect the Chair.

MS. E. CLARK: ...did that [inaudible]...

MAYOR MASTERS: Respect the Chair.

MS. E. CLARK: You don't yell at me.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Shirley Lanier...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Point of order, please. Ms. Lanier, come forward.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: They've been fighting for years.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Doretta Paulk, Willis Williams.

MAYOR MASTERS: That's right, Officer.

[Inaudible audience comments]

MS. S. LANIER: [Chuckle]. Hi. My name is Shirley Lanier. I am a candidate for District 3, the election for March the 12th. I just wanted to comment on an issue that... I heard that they were talking about 2-1-1, they were talking about homelessness, and those are issue that are in our community. I work as a health planner of Palm Beach County government and I administer the HIV/AIDS program for Palm Beach County. We do something called geo mapping, and, and Riviera Beach, and in Belle Glade, is our highest cases. So, when we talk about issues of development, about jobs, we also need to talk about public health. We have a City of 35,000 residents, but our City leads the county, and in South Florida, of new cases of HIV. So, what is happening is that, we do not have any public health in this City, the City does not seem to be concerned about public health here. We have access to grant opportunities that we're not taking. I had said this before, about there are numerous grants that the City can apply for. They don't. There is a grant with the Center for Disease Control, it is a \$1,000,000 healthy cities grant. And, the City of Charlotte, North Carolina got the grant on a two page proposal. It's not rocket science. You learn how to write grants by writing grants. So, what is happening in this City, is that, you know, when you hire people, you don't hire people who have several skills. When I worked at Palm Beach County, I write grants, I write integrated plans, I write strategic plans, I do needs assessments. I have many skills. So, when you hire people, you have to hire competent people, to be able to do numerous things. We don't have a whole lotta money here. We have to be about the business of finding resources, finding public partnerships, finding money that is out there that is not coming out of our pocket, because the, the money is out there, why are we not getting it? We're always, in the City of Riviera Beach, the pass through entity, which mean' that..., that means that somebody else gets the grant and then it passes through to us.

UNK. AUDIENCE: Yeah.

MS. S. LANIER: And they take..., they administer their cut off the top and we're left with monies that's less for services. So, when we talk about services for Riviera Beach, let's talk about public health, let's talk about the fact that we do have homelessness, and we do have people who don't have insurance, because we are leading the county in HIV cases, and that is no joke. That is a serious public health for here.

And I just wanted to say that I'm Shirley Lanier, and I'm running for District 3.

Thank you.

[Audience clapping]

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Doretta Paulk, Willis Williams, J.B. Dixon.

MS. D. PAULK: Good evening. My name is Doretta Paulk and I'm a resident of Riviera Beach, the City.

And, I wanna just speak a little bit about the comment that Mr. Lozman made. Now, this might be a little redundant but I was tryna get ready to come to the meeting tonight, and I heard part of what was said concerning our children, regardless of what school they attend, what school? They reside in Riviera Beach, if they need funds, they should get it, whether they're in [inaudible]...

[Audience clapping]

MS. D. PAULK: ...Bach, Dyer, wherever. If that's our C'..., children in any..., that lives in this City, should get the funds. . Because our children need the funds.

Like I have been mentioning..., and I also would like to know how is a partnership with Attorney Ferguson and the librarian, with identifying children of different schools that need the, the, the tablets or laptops? How is that going? To ident'..., identifying those children, so they can be on an even playing field, with other children. And be able to pass these core measure tests that's coming up? And hopefully, one thing the Gov'..., Governor's doing, getting away with those core measures. And I just hope that helps with the children.

Another thing that I wanna mention is that, I'm the second year of going to this Citizens Academy. This is an awesome program sponsored by Councilman KaShamba Miller-Anderson. And, I learned..., it's very informative and educational. I learned about the City drug court. I was thinking, the Director is Mrs. Scott, and I, I asked, asked a question concerning the safety of when you do have people coming in to the program and going before the Judge, and stating their cases and everything, what about their protection? The employees [stammer] protection, the, the, the..., even the police officers, when she said that they have the Sheriff officers, Riviera Beach is there. But you know what? I was thinking about what happened in Sebring, Florida, near Tampa. This young man just came into that bank, didn't know any one of those people that's hired there, and started shooting and killed these people. We have metal detectors downstairs, why can't we get a metal detector in there, to protect our employees? And also, the citizens that are going in there, the people who are trying to get their lives back together? We need to invest in metal detectors. You have it downstairs, which is [stammer] thankful, and also in the library they have a detection would go off. We need to have it down there for the safety of all our employees. And I, I don't think...

[Timer]

MS. D. PAULK: ...not one employee should be fired or they, the hours should be cut,

to bring this metal detection in place.

And also, on Avenue E, the road..., the pavement is wonderful. You did a wonderful job, City Manager Hoskins, very wonderful job.

And I thank you very much.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Willis Williams, J.B. **Dixon**, Amon Yisrael.

MR. W. WILLIAMS: Good evening, Council. Willis Williams, Riviera Beach.

I have a few things on my list that I wanted to talk about tonight, and I'm glad Mrs. Paulk mentioned one of..., about the, the streets being done. There's a, a lotta sand that's being removed out of the Monroe Heights area right now. We've got all that space that..., where we tore down the Public Works building. At some point in time, we're gonna need some fill. I see all of this sand leaving... I've mentioned this a few months ago about the sand on Avenue E. This may seem very minute to a lot of people, but when you work in the construction industry and you have to go back and replace all of this stuff, when you already have it on..., at hand, it makes a difference. So, I would really take a look at the, the debris that's being moved out of the Monroe Heights area right now, being taken out by truck loads outta the City, that's gonna cost these taxpayers in this City at a later date.

The other thing is, I called over a week or two ago about a public record request. I've been mentioning this about the truck, that, that's in the Utilities Department. Now, they have another truck, and I'm assuming that this probably the, the same truck, but it had to go back in and get re'..., a newer one because that one, from the rental company, had to be replaced. We still have not purchased a truck. I called over to ask for a public records request. I was referred to Mr. Horton, Mr. Horton gave me a call, which I appreciate very much, but it didn't answer my question. I still haven't received the public records request. I wanna know how much money have we spent, this City has paid, for renting that vehicle. That is..., it's getting ri'..., it's getting ridiculous at this point.

The other thing, I came over the day to pay my water bill and I noticed that the line was closed, you can't get to the drive up to pay your water bill. So, come to mind to me is, the Facility's Manager, that's their job. The Facility's Manager. What are these people doing for the money that we pay for each month? They're coming..., I don't see anything being done outta that Public Works Department, when it comes to the Facility Mana'... That seems like an easy fix, that was out there. So if we have to just get on the phone and pick up a, a vendor, to call a vendor to, to..., I mean, your department head can do that. We can..., that's a salary we could be saving.

The, the other thing, there's three or four different houses going up in Riviera Beach. And, I noticed one on Avenue S, it's a 1,600 square foot home, on that lot on the corner of 35th, and it's supposed to be a five bedroom house. I just [stammer], it's unbelievable [chuckle] how you can build a house...

[Timer]

MR. W. WILLIAMS: ...for 1,600 square feet and get that size.

So, there's a lotta things that need to be lookin' at, there's a lotta stuff that we haven't taken care and I'd just like to know when I'll get that public request that I asked for, to know how much money have we spent, from the time that we rented it, and also take a look at this referendum. It's, it's, it's what you call hype of the season right now, everybody's running, everybody's running scared. , so let's take time, breathe. We still have to run the City, the [stammer] the City has to still be ran, and be careful about who you choose to vote. I'm talking about the citizens now, don't pick up on the hype because...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: [Inaudible]...

MR. W. WILLIAMS: ...there's a lotta things going on out there and you really need to concentrate on who you're going to support.

Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you, sir.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: J.B. Dixson, Amon Yisrael, Dr. Phillip Dukes.

MS. J.B. DIXSON: I'm J.B. Dixson. I live on Ocean Drive on Singer Island in Riviera Beach.

I have some happy news [chuckle] to announce. On February 23rd, there will be an inaugural event, which we certainly hope will be an annual event from here on, it's called Singer Island Beach Polo. And there will be polo teams, polo horses on the sand, on the municipal beach, just behind the Ocean Mall. We hope to make this an annual event that will drive tourism to Riviera Beach, and certainly, a good image to Riviera Beach. I think that there's going to be.., I know there's already a lot of media interest in this. There's also been a lot of tickets already sold, and sponsorships. Although we have had a tough time getting this done, and I have to thank the City for its patience in, especially Ms. Hoskins and Mr. Blankenship, and Mr. Gagnon, and Major Lewis from the Police Department, have all helped us do this. We're on a very small budget this year, so we certainly want you all to buy tickets and we want anyone who has a business here, to be a sponsor. But, although we have no complimentary tickets whatsoever, for anyone's friends, we are inviting our Council, our Mayor and our City Manager to be our guests at that event. That's why I've bene asked to come up and invite all of you, and we hope you can attend on February 23rd.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you.

MAYOR MASTERS: Madam Chair?

MS. J.B. DIXSON: And the Mayor, I said.

MAYOR MASTERS: How much are the tickets, Madam Chair?

MS. J.B. DIXSON: What? What is she talking about?

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: [Chuckle]. The City Attorney. The City Attorney.

MS. J.B. DIXSON: Oh, the City Attorney. I'm sorry. [Chuckle]. I'm sorry.

MAYOR MASTERS: [Inaudible]?

MS. J.B. DIXSON: Well, the V'.., there's a VIP tent, always, at a polo match. Oh, before I answer that, those of you who have never seen polo, or don't know anything about polo and don't know if you'd be interested in it, one of the things that we're going to do is have a tutorial. So, the announcer will be there to explain the game, how it's played, in chuckers, etc., etc., so that would... And also, the proceeds, if any, [chuckle], will go to a charity that has.., that teaches Riviera Beach children to ride horses. And they're usually taken out to a farm, far west from here, and also introduced, at that place, to other animals, like goats, etc., that they may not have access to here in the City.

The tickets in the VIP tent, which includes complimentary champagne, are \$100. We are working to see.., we're gonna have a low price for general admission. It's started at \$20. As we sell more memberships, we're making it less. They have not gone on sale yet. We hope to put it at maybe \$5, if we can. If we suddenly got very lucky, we would make it for free, for general admission.

Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Amon Yisrael, Dr. Phillip Dukes.

MR. A. YISRAEL: Good evening.

UNK: Good evening.

MR. A. YISRAEL: Mayor and Chair and Council. My name is Amon Yisrael, Riviera beach, Florida, the Monroe Heights area.

We've had a lotta conversation about Dr. Martin Luther King's dream. The time is now for us to wake up and make the dream a reality. We're at the crossroads now, here in Riviera Beach. We could turn to the left, or go to the right. I'm asking the good people of Riviera Beach to come together. It is imperative that we elect men and women who are positive images in our community. Integrity and ethics is a must. March the 12th, lets go to the right.

Thank you.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Dr. Phillip Dukes.

DR. P. DUKES: Dr. Phillip Dukes, 1217 Avenue U, City of Riviera Beach. Council,

Mayor.

MAYOR MASTERS: Good evening, sir.

DR. P. DUKES: Our next event will be March 30th, from 1:30 to 5:00 p.m., at 1217 Avenue U, in the City of Riviera Beach. This is our weekend Change our Community Atmosphere Rally, for us to deal with the drug retail market, that breeds murder, death, family and community decay. Could you imagine what the paper would say if Riviera Beach takes a zero tolerance against the drug retail market in the City? Now, I know that there a people that truly believe that black...

[Inaudible comments]

DR. P. DUKES: ...communities have to have gangs and violence, but that is a part of the modern day Jim Crow. And we have this because we keep following this Jesse Jackson and Al Sharpton, Marion Berry playbook. That's why we have this all over America, where we live at. Where we live at. All over America. We have these low standards in our community that we, as African Americans, perpetuate, by giving people excuses. Do you know every place in this City where I sold drugs in the '70's, you can still buy it today? I went to prison from Imperial. You can still buy dope at Imperial. Only two places in the City that you don't buy drugs where I sold dope at, and that is the Blue Heron, because they tore it down, and Broadmoor 'cause it don't exist.

[Inaudible audience comments]

DR. P. DUKES: And then, in the '80's, I became the Prince of Crackheads. I went from selling dope to being on dope. So, I see all these cycles. These cycles continue for our children. They're not in North Palm Beach, they're not in Wellington. I have families come from Wellington, North Palm Beach to my place to their children that are in Riviera Beach. A lotta times that's how I got donations, 'cause somebody told somebody about what I do, so they came and found me. It is not right that we allow this to continue in our City, as small as our City is.

Somewhere in America, black folk gotta stand up with everybody else and [inaudible] down to Change our Community Atmosphere. We just had a murder out here on Palm Beach'.., on, on Gardens Road. That murder is tied to our City. Thug life. But the problem is, that we're afraid to speak out because we're afraid.., and then, and this Council, and the Mayor's office, you gotta admit that you're afraid that somebody might do something to you. I've lived with that ever since 2001, when I came outta the streets and began this work, and we [inaudible]. I've lived with that. Our communities are held hostage because we will not have high standards. So, every generation has to go through the same thing, because we won't raise the standards.

So, I'm asking you to support Operation Restore. All of our music is on Broad Jams, B-R-O-A-D Jam, J-A-M dot com, slash Phillip Dukes. We're taking thirty percent of all of our downloads and bringing them into our City to help our City, and our nonprofit, do what we need to do. It's not right that we continue, every generation, every generation about the same thing. When the, when the, when the system begin' to deal with this

heroin problem, they begin [snaps fingers] to clean it up. They cleaned meth up. But they'... But we don't clean up our community, so I'm asking you to support us. Operation Restore, P.O. Box 10111, Riviera Beach,, FL. We're a 501(c). And remember, March the 30th, from 1:30 to 5:00 p.m., 1217 Avenue U.

Thank you so much.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair, that completes public comments at this time.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Okay. We have the addition to the addition to the Agenda with regards to digital signs.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Madam Clerk, do you wanna announce that?

ITEMS TABLED

4A. ITEM NO. 4A

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair, we have Item No. 4A.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: PRESENTATION FROM BERNSTEIN & ASSOCIATES

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: For a...

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Oh...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: From the addition. [Pause]. Yeah. That's something you added at the last meeting.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Hmm?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: The Bernstein presentation was a request from the last meeting. If you recall.

[Pause]

MR. R. BERNSTEIN: Madam Chair.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Good evening, sir.

MR. R. BERNSTEIN: Good evening, Madam Chair.

MAYOR MASTERS: Good evening.

MR. R. BERNSTEIN: Mayor.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Come over to the mic, sir.

MR. R. BERNSTEIN: ...and Council Members. Can you hear me okay now?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Yes.

MR. R. BERNSTEIN: I'm sorry. [Pause]. I'm Richard Bernstein. I'm the CEO of Richard Bernstein & Associates, Inc. I wish to take the.., take this moment to thank you for the opportunity to be your strategic partner for the past four years. We are honored to be your agent of record, and our team, Wayne, Bob, Pam, Articia, Claudia and Denba [sp], we think that we have made a difference in the City of Riviera Beach. We res'.., we received the termination letter from the City Risk Manager on January 8th, stating that our services were no long necessary.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: [Inaudible background comment].

MR. R. BERNSTEIN: On January 8th, Bernstein & Associates received an email from City Risk Manager informing us that our agent of record contract was terminated, and that our services were no longer necessary. The same letter was sent to all the insurance companies that represent the City of Riviera Beach. The relationship with the carrier is for the benefit of the employees and dependents, and the things that we were concerned about, was the non-payments and the late payments, over the last four years. Our relationship with the insurance carrier was instrumental to limit cancellations due to non-payments and late payments. There have been numerous problems over the past number of years, and our relationships were instrumental to keep the services available.

The biggest situation was the list-bill. We directed the implimation of a list-bill from all carriers, in place of a self-bill. That was the very first thing that we did when we, when we became your agents. This would ensure a proper premium payments for the employees and the City. And that was one of our biggest concerns. Other items are of direct involvement, monthly wellness meetings. We provide staff, materials, food for the monthly meetings, to benefit the employees, monthly orientation meetings. We provide staff to assist new employees in their insurance enrollment. We provide a public relations liaison, Articia, to work with Staff and the department heads to increase participation for wellness events. We provide insurance booklets for employees, for insurance covered, offered by the City. Our biggest concern is without our oversight in our relations with the carriers, there is a significant risk of the City's exposures for continued payments and errors, and non-payment issues. Over the past several years, we worked directly with three carriers, Aetna, Unum and Solstice, to waive thousands of dollars to benefit the City. Our most significant role over the past four years, is working directly with the insurance carriers to negotiate a fair renewal rate, to minimize insurance costs to the City and its employees. We were extremely successful, as we were able to [stammer] negotiate renewal rates less than five percent every year since 2014. This allowed the City to save hundreds of thousands of dollars in healthcare insurance premiums, for disability insurance, voluntary life insurance, dental, vision care, and health insurance.

We received praise from City Council Members and Staff over the, over the past several years, specifically for the 4.99 increase achieved for the current fiscal year, under a very difficult financial circumstance. We spent three solid weeks getting that rate down from twenty-five percent to ten percent, and 4.99, because we knew if it was over five percent, it would cost the employees money out of their pocket. And our biggest concern, my biggest concern, Bob Williams biggest concern, is that we negotiated with the City to get that..., I mean, with, with the, with the City and with the carrier, which is Aetna, who represents the City, to get that rate down to 4.99, and that was one of my most important issues that we had since we've been doing your insurance for the last four years.

Most other cities around, their rate increases have been approximately eight to twelve percent, and we've kept everything under five percent. An added..., we added, as we said earlier, Articia, as a public relations, she's worked closely with Staff, employees to increase participation for monthly wellness and, and healthcare. We produced a health fair with forty vendors and a 130 employees. Our track record, and here's the numbers, in 2014, a rate increase was zero. The market trend was 10.56. In 2015, the rate increase was four percent, reduced from the final offer of five percent. The market trend was 11.5%. In 2016, the rate increase was 3.5%. We worked with Aetna to reduce the rate from eight percent to 3.5 and we kept the bariatric surgery, which we put in there at no extra cost for the City, and the market trend was ten percent. In 2017, a rate increase of three percent to Aetna, they asked for seven, we got them to five, and then we got 'em down to three. And the market trend was ten percent. This year, which was the toughest year that we had, our rate increase, as I said earlier, was 4.99. The formula rate was 4.99, the formula rate was twenty-five percent. That's where we started, reduced to ten percent because of the long term relationship [stammer] we negotiated the rate down to 4.99. And if everybody remembers on the Council, we came in early because we saw the trend ri'..., rising, and we were concerned about making sure that we locked that 4.99 into, into place.

[Stammer] due to the impact of the employees, it was one of the biggest achievements in what's the toughest negotiation. Please note that all the rate increases included a twenty-five percent..., \$25,000 for wellness program, initiatives, and the last four years, the bariatric has been included into the program.

Experience in customer service. We have shown the experience and knowledge required for your insurance needs, as evidenced by our performance in and attention to detail over the past four years. Exceptional customer service, we coordinate with City Staff meetings, onsite representation, we have a history of improving benefits with little increase in costs, we created an inhouse one page enrollment summary of all benefits and provided English, Spanish and Creole. Why is that important? Because every company requires an application for each company. We were able to look..., to, to maintain it on one piece of paper, and made it simple for everybody to enroll. Our office can handle all claims issued by the employees and Council Members, covered by the City's contract, and their dependents. We work directly with the carriers to take the burden of the City and the City employees so they don't have that problem. We provide weekly onsite representation for direct access, and interactions with City employees, including City Hall, Port Center, Police and the Fire Department.

In our monthly wellness program, our relationship with the City of Riviera Beach is very important to us, especially with the monthly wellness program is because the importance of the, of the programs are, number 1), a health fair; 2) monthly wellness programs; 3) workforce competition; and we try to educate the employees in prevention. If you notice, we had a, a program on wellness and breast cancer. This is how we set it up, this is what we did to help the employees and to show 'em. And it's very important because breast cancer, as everybody is aware, every major sport, every major thig in the united States, that's a., one of their biggest, and they all wear pink and we that it's very important to care of that for the women of this country. And for the City.

Wellness programs, employees use of the gym. We had a lady by the name of Mandy, who came into the gym, as you can see on the left side. And she was there working with, with the employees to help them so they know how to use the machines and use it appropriately so no one got hurt, and it benefitted them in working out. And that was at our cost, not at the City's cost, that we, that we had this nice lady come in and work with everybody.

We are., why are we., why are we the firm that we have done for the last four years? We feel that we are experts in the field of employee benefits. We were thankful to have worked for you for the last four years, to serve you, the Staff and the 480 plus City employees. We have an extremely experienced team. We have brought in a wealth of knowledge and experience to the health market, for the benefit of the City. We negotiate the best renewal rates possible for the benefit of the City employees. Our goal with our wellness program and out annual healthcare fair, is to help your employees live better, eat better, learn to exercise properly, to be more healthy. A major goal of our wellness team was to increase employee participation, and the vision of the relationship with the City. There's a tremendous track record of minimizing rate increases over the past four years. Relationship with carriers for the benefit of the City employees and dependents. Our team of professionals play a valuable role in the relationships with the City, and on our onsite responsibilities. We have the necessary experience and qualifications to do the job, as represented from our experience over the past four years.

In conclusion, I would like to leave you with this thought, we were thankful to have proven experience and qualifications, our history of community involvement, and our sincere desire to work with the City of Riviera Beach and their employees benefit programs. On behalf of our team, Richard S. Bernstein & Associates, our joint venture partner, we thank you for the opportunity to make this presentation to you. I hope I did it within ten minutes, I tried to...

[Chuckles]

MR. R. BERNSTEIN: ...get it done. I was told that we had ten minutes to make the presentation, so I didn't mean to rush, but I didn't wanna go over my time limit in making the presentation to everybody, And I...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you.

MR. R. BERNSTEIN: ...thank everybody for that opportunity.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Are there any questions...

MAYOR MASTERS: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...from Council? Mr. Mayor, you're recognized.

MAYOR MASTERS: Thank you, Madam Chair.

Mr. Bernstein, for you. I'm still trying to understand what actually happened to you.., to you were our agent?

MR. R. BERNSTEIN: Yes, sir.

MAYOR MASTERS: Tell me.., help me understand, you were fired? I mean...

MR. R. BERNSTEIN: Well, Bob Wynne's my CFO, received a letter firing our, our organization from the, from the Risk Manager.

MAYOR MASTERS: Who was...

MR. R. BERNSTEIN: [Inaudible]

MAYOR MASTERS: ...Marie Sullen?

MR. R. BERNSTEIN: Yes, Ma'...yes, sir.

MAYOR MASTERS: Okay.

MR. R. BERNSTEIN: I didn't wanna create a, a problem so I was trying to be very careful of what I said to the, to the Council.

MAYOR MASTERS: Well, I said this. Okay. Well there's, there's not a question.., there's no question in my mind, isn't any question in my mind, you, you've done an excellent job. I mean, we.., I'm very grateful and very thankful you've gone beyond the call of duty.

But, I guess my question is to the City Manager, at this point. With... But stay there because it's in reference to you. Or the, or the City Attorney. Did the Risk Manager have the authority to do this on her own, without the City Manager's having the last word, or signing on to it?

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Madam Manager, you're recognized.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: The contract that we have, had, with Bernstein, was a two year contract that we entered, that the City entered into in 2000'.., in 2014. That was

a two year contract with two one-year extensions. The City fulfilled..., well, Bernstein fulfilled its two year contract and the City allowed Bernstein to act as the agent of record for the additional two years. After that, the contract ended. So, September 30, 2018, the contract ended and during that time, the City issued an RFQ for agent of record services, and had put together an evaluation team. The evaluation team met, evaluated the responses to the RFQ and submitted their recommendations to the City Council during the December 19th meeting, for a different agent of record, based on two types of scoring, evaluation based on a written proposal and evaluation based on oral interviews.

MAYOR MASTERS: So, the City Council approved... [Stammer] I don't... Dr. Botel...

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: The City...

MAYOR MASTERS: ...is shaking her head like she doesn't know anything about that either.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: No. I know, I know everything about it, yes, but I was..., you said the City Council approved, we didn't.

MAYOR MASTERS: Right. How...

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: No. The City Council did not approve the contract. It failed for a lack of a second.

MAYOR MASTERS: Okay. Unfortunate that this happened to you. I don't think it's right. I'm just gonna leave it at that.

Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Any questions?

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilwoman Botel, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Thank you.

You talked about a list-bill versus a self-bill.. Can you explain the difference and what, what impact it might have had on our insurance situation, with regard to paying people who no longer work here?

MR. R. BERNSTEIN: Yes, ma'am. When you have a list-bill, it comes directly from the insurance company to the City, and it lists everybody who's working. And now, if someone has left, it's up to whoever gets that bill to say that person's no longer employed, and if someone new is employed, it's up to the City to add that person. And, for some reason, which I don't know because we don't see what, what's paid and what's not paid, they didn't follow the list bill. And in fact, about a couple months [stammer]..., we got, we

got a, a note from the, uh, saying that they didn't want a list bill and we, we recommended the list-bill for the simple reason that we know, if you have a list-bill, there's no misunderstanding as who's covered, who's not covered, who's entitled to the insurance so that the City doesn't overpay and that employees that don't belong on the plan, are not covered, and the employees that belong on the plan are covered. And that's the advantage of a list-bill, so there's no misunderstanding, no one can say, 'Wow. Gee, we, we didn't cover such and such.' Well, you have a list-bill, it's there, and that's up to you to correct it and, and make sure. And the, and the r'..., the way this came about that this was found out, when we came in for our renewal, and we were talking about the percentage of increases, we came in with 530 employees, when you only had 480. So, this came out in our meeting, and that's what started the whole thing. Now, what we don't know, I don't know, is how far this went back and how long this has been going on. But, my concern is that the City was overpaying a lot of money that they shouldn't be overpaying. And my job is to make sure that you don't do that, and you stay within the boundaries of the bill, and you pay only what you're supposed to pay and not more than you're supposed to pay.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: That answered your question? I, I have a question with regards to the language that's in the..., well, I guess it speaks to the discussion and deliberation... Well, I need to wait until Item 7, because there is a suggestion that if Council is in agreement, all bids can be rejected and the start of the RFQ process can begin again. But, the question that I have with regards to the sending of the letter of termination, was that a part of the procurement process in anticipation of having the Board approve a new agreement, or would we have maintained or had gap, I guess gap services, provided to us by the existing agent of record in order for us to get to the point where we either selected a new agent of record, or had the solicitation out? And this is for Purchasing and the Attorney to answer for me. Because, it just seems to me, typically, when we have a contract that is at its expiration and we are looking to either solicit a new provider, or we renew a c contract or enter into a new agreement, there is that overflow of services. So, I am wanting to know from Purchasing how..., Purchasing and, and HR, how we got to the point of just the simple term'..., termination before we actually had someone in to [stammer] to provide and fulfill the services.

So, can anyone provide an answer to me on that?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: That's not the question [inaudible].

[Inaudible audience comments]

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: [Inaudible].

INTERIM PROCUREMENT DIRECTOR LITTLE: Good evening, Council. Ricky Little, Interim Director...

MAYOR MASTERS: Good evening, sir.

INTERIM PROCUREMENT DIRECTOR LITTLE: ...of Procurement.

The HR Department was notified that the contract was lapsing for the agent of record, so, at that point, they decided that they would go back out for the solicitation, and that's how the process actually went.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: So, in going out for.., so you just, you just terminate... You, you're notified that the solic'.., that the contract is ending, but how do we provide services until we get to selection from the solicitation? We just go without that service being provided to us or having an agent on record?

INTERIM PROCUREMENT DIRECTOR LITTLE: At this particular point, the agent of record services was not needed, so we didn't have to actually keep the agent of record on at that point.

MAYOR MASTERS: Mm, mm, mm.

[Inaudible comments]

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Well, if the agent.., I'm...

INTERIM PROCUREMENT DIRECTOR LITTLE: It wasn't, it wasn't in the cycle where we're.., where they're actually going back out getting new quotes from the carriers, so it was already covered at that point.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Were they working on anything other than going out to get new costs from carriers for the City of Riviera Beach, on behalf of Risk? Was there any other actions, or work being done under the scope of services, that would have continued? Because when, when we hear, or when I hear that they were working on the, the issue of identifying where the, the information lapsed and coverage was paid, that seemed to me to have been an ongoing service. So, I'm just trying to be clear as to what exactly were the services that were still available to be provided under the scope of work, as opposed to just saying, 'Okay. We're no longer in negotiations for healthcare services,' what are the other service that were a part of the contract, that was being performed?

INTERIM PROCUREMENT DIRECTOR LITTLE: That would be a question that HR has the answer. It does not fall under the Procurement Department to make that kind of decision.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: And when a, when a con'.., so, from a Procurement standpoint, when a contract is ending, where services are being provided, you don't weigh in either way as it relates to continued services, until such time as a new contract is put in place?

INTERIM PROCUREMENT DIRECTOR LITTLE: We notify the department that the contract is about to expire and we leave it up to them to decide whether they want to go back out and put an actual solicitation. If they don't, we can't make them do, or act, or suggest that they actually do that.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Under the Procurement Code, is there a

provision that once a contract that has reached its full life, where we had a two year contract with two one-year renewals, is there a provision in the Code that would have allowed you to extend that until such time as we identify a new agent of record?

INTERIM PROCUREMENT DIRECTOR LITTLE: Normally, there is but in this particular contract, that was not there.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: It wasn't there or the, the option wasn't extended?

INTERIM PROCUREMENT DIRECTOR LITTLE: The option wasn't extend.

[Inaudible audience comment]

MAYOR MASTERS: So, it wasn't there.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Madam Attorney?

INTERIM PROCUREMENT DIRECTOR LITTLE: It was not there, correct.

MAYOR MASTERS: Wasn't there.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilman Davis, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: [Stammer], and this is to my colleagues, correct me if I'm wrong, as we.., as this contract was going through the expiration process and Bernstein was the agent of record, there was some concerns and things that we have.., we determined that we're gonna allow the investigation to be completed, with the recommendation coming before, before we make any decision on the agent of record. Is that what we did? When we talked about the investigation? OIG report?

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: I don't remember that.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: I, I.., I honestly don't recall. I will.., I'm happy to go back into the Minutes and...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Yeah.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...look. But I...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: I just...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...cannot tell you...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: That, that, that's...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...[Inaudible].

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: ...what my concern was, 'cause I thought we was waitin' on...

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: That makes sense.

MAYOR MASTERS: The OIG on this.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Before any action take' place with that contact for the, the investigation be complete, recommendation come before, and we discuss, as a Board, on how we wanna move forward. So, that's my concern with this process. I have no problem with contracts and how they're written, but my only concern is that we were waiting for some things to take place, for this Board can review, have a discussion, find out what's consistent and what's not before we make a decision moving forward. That's something that hasn't taken place yet. So, my only concern is that, you know, we should've maintained agent of record month to month, until we had a chance to have a [stammer] a Council discussion of how certain things took lace, and how we wanna move forward, based upon the recommendations, based upon our policies that we have in place and, and what's consistent and what's not, and make the decision from there.

And that's why I didn't.., that's what I didn't even, even address the motion that was brought before with the recommendation of.., the last recommendation of Staff, because I still waiting on a discussion on what took place. You know, there was a suspension that came up but I wanted to hear, see thorough information, data, things that we can read and address and then come back and, and, and improve on that process moving forward. That didn't take place. So, that's my concern, you know, allow this Board to make the decisions to stay consistent with being above board, and working with Staff, our Staff, to make sure they're protected, the City's protected on the current agent of record or the next agent of record that may come in place, on how we move forward. And that, that was my only concern.

MAYOR MASTERS: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Mr. Mayor, you're recognized.

MAYOR MASTERS: To the previous speaker, you're saying that the sus'.., the suspension.., there seems to be moving parts here, but are you saying that there's supposed to be an investigation after the suspension of... I mean, you mentioned that, so how does that tie into this situation? I'm trying to understand you. What you're saying.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: There, there was some review of some information...

MAYOR MASTERS: Okay.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: ...about outside agencies, and supposed to bring some information back for us to review and discuss...

MAYOR MASTERS: Okay.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: ...on how we may or may not wanna move forward, based upon what's been reviewed..., based upon the facts, you know, not opinions, but based upon the facts on we we're gonna move forward. And we're supposed to stay on the month to month cases until that happened.

MAYOR MASTERS: And that was before the suspension, is what you're saying?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Yes, sir.

MAYOR MASTERS: Okay.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Yeah.

MAYOR MASTERS: Thank you.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilwoman Miller-Anderson, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: So, I had stepped out for a minute, but this is just a presentation? Are we addressing this during Item 7, or are we trying to make a decision now?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: We can come back. I just had a question, as it related to..., we..., it is certainly Item No. 7 to be discussed...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Mhmm.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...but, there was some points that were made in the presentation that raised the question as it related to our need for continued service of an agent of record until we selected, and approved, either the incumbent or a new firm. So, I was responding..., my questions came out of response to some of the statements that were made, in order for me to get clarification. But certainly, the RFQ propo'..., the, the RFQ response process is on the Agenda to be discussed.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Okay. So, for... If we maintain them as Mr. Davis suggested for the month to month, is that based only on waiting for an OIG report to come, or there's some other things that's going to be going on while we're doing a month to month?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: And that was the question that I asked regarding what were the remaining scopes of services for the work that is to be performed by an agent of record.

[Inaudible dais comment]

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: That was the reason for that question, in order

to understand what work would be [stammer], what work would be provided under a continued month to month arrangement, until such time as an agent of record is selected.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: But if we had.., if they were still under contract, what would they be doing? I mean, is there more work to be done? I know you sorta asked something like that, so I'm trying to understand.., are we saying we're at a point where we don't need a re'.., agent of record?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: [Inaudible].

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: No, I wasn't saying that...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: No, no. I'm not saying you said it, I was just...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: No, no, no. I'm saying that I was asking the very same question. That was the question that I put forth...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: I guess I, I didn't...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...that I had not gotten...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: ...hear the answer.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...an answer yet.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Okay. I'm.., okay. I didn't hear it yet. So... So, what are we looking to do? What do they need us to do?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Well, I think that [pause] we need to understand, if there is a, if there is an incomplete scope of work that is to be provided by an agent of records, if there is, then that would support continuing with them until we complete our process of identifying either the incumbent or a new agent of record. But the question becomes, can we define what the scope of work is and what's needed?

MR. R. BERNSTEIN: Madam, would you like me to answer that question, as to what we do and what we can do?

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: [Inaudible]...

MR. R. BERNSTEIN: What we have been doing?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: One moment, sir. Do you have an answer, Madam Manager?

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Madam Chair, the scope of work is included in the backup in Item No. 7, as part of the RFQ.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: In here.

[Inaudible audience comments]

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: But is that for.. Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Yes.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: But is...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilwoman...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: ...that for...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...Miller-Anderson, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Is that for a new person coming on, starting, starting from that point? If they stayed on month to month, what wi'..., will they pick up those.., that scope of service, or is there something lingering still from their contract that needs to be...

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: I would have to...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: ...completed?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: [Inaudible].

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: ...refer to HR or Risk Management, if there's something that's lingering, but the scope of work, I'm thinking is typically the...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: [Inaudible].

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: ...basically, the same very month. I know during the budget process, you all directed Staff to basically take another look, look at our insurance program and re'..., rework the insurance program, so we need to start on that early.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: [Inaudible].

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: So there are a lot of things that we need to get moving on, and that's why Item No. 7 is on the Agenda, so you can provide direction on if you want us to throw out the RFQ process, or, um, and start over, and, you know, we just need to get direction so we can move forward.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Madam Chair? [Inaudible].

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Chair Pro Tem, you're recognized.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Thank you.

What concerns me is, for us to throw out the record of'..., the agent of record, as well as to sends a letter to our other carrier Solstice and Aetna prior to us bringing on

someone else. I don't think that we put ourselves in a, a safe position, if you will. While I realize that they've already negotiated the deal with Aetna, we still, oftentimes, have to call to make sure that if there's.., if, if Aetna is not doing this, or Solstice is not doing that, if somebody's not covering this, who do we now call when we don't have an agent of record? We've told Aetna, and we've told Solstice, that we've sent them a letter, a letter to discontinue their, their services, well, while, without us providing ourselves with any, anybody in, in the middle, I think that it's important that we have some kind of representation while we get our new contract in place.

[Inaudible comment]

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: And that is why I think, you know, we could've waited before sending everybody a letter saying, you know, 'We no longer need your, need your services.' Who will negotiate on our behalf? Who will advocate for us in the interim, while we look for another insurance carrier? We've had, you know, quite a few questions with insurance this year, so we should want to keep ourselves insulated, as, as, as much as possible.

So, that would be my concern about them being sent a letter, as well as Aetna and Solstice, to discontinue services when no one had been identified to, to represent us.

[Inaudible audience comment and clapping]

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you, Mr. Bernstein. At, at this point, we will have to take up the discussion when we get to Item 7.

MR. R. BERNSTEIN: The only thing I'd like to leave with you, if I may, ma'am, the biggest concern that you should have, is claims, ongoing claims, because that, that, that causes your rates to go up. And if no one's monitoring those claims, and if no one is having these wellness meetings and no one's have all the things that we talked about in our presentation, that's a detriment to the City...

[Inaudible audience discussions]

MR. R. BERNSTEIN: ...and that could cause your rates to go up. And anybody who understands about insurance, and understands about the services that are provided, we're not in here to, to fight with the Staff, we're here to help the Staff, sand we're here to help everybody in the City to maintain to keep their rates down, because if those rates go up over five percent...

[Inaudible audience comment]

MR. R. BERNSTEIN: ...next year, you're gonna have.., you think that you have a problem now? Wait 'til this.., wait 'til the employees say to you, 'Why, why did my rates go up, and why did I have to pay money?' And that's the thing that we do the best, we're here.., we're not here to get involved in the politics, we apologize for that. We're here really to serve the City, become a partner with you and make sure that the claims are paid, and make sure that we take care of everybody in the City, and keep those costs

down. That's our job, and I think we've been able to do that for the past four years. Again, I thank you for everything that the City has given us, and we, we appreciate working with the City.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you, sir. [Pause]. Madam Clerk, the..., we have the, the addition of the...

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Digital signs for churches.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Yes.

UNK: [Inaudible].

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Pardon?

UNK: [Inaudible].

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Madam Chair? Council. I brought this Item before us today because, as you can see, we're all aware, we're all moving way beyond, almost beyond the 21st Century. A lot of our codes and things have been antiquated and we've been doing..., Staff has been doing a wonderful job of getting us there. One of the questions or concerns that we've been address ing over the last, I'd say six years, has been signage, what it looks like. As you can see, our marquee that we have out front, we put the digital sign to make sure that we can beautify the City but, at the same time, get information out to the public. The Rapids Waterslide also needed a digital sign, and we addressed that issue. The School Board, wanted digital signs and we addressed that issue. My question and concern is, because when a lotta the churches wanna start updating as well when they see what we're doing, they're trying to match what we're doing on this side. And but, I wanna make sure that..., there's one church in particular, that was here tonight, that was here tonight, that was definitely ready to get behind and start moving forward with that process, but I wanted Staff to work with them, because, if its good enough for us to do it, it's good enough for the Rapids to do it, and it's good enough the School District do it, it should be good enough for our churches to update their signs that are in our neighborhoods. And if they'..., they're gonna be providing services to our communities, they should be allowed toe be able to promote those..., that information with a lotta the new digital stuff, with a lotta the new lighting, LED lighting, which is something that we've been discussing, making sure that we can help them provide a level of service.

So, I put this Item on the Agenda tonight. We have a representative here, Mr..., former Councilperson Henry Taylor, from Mount Olive Church.

Mr. Taylor. The pastor was here but...

MR. H. TAYLOR: Good evening, Council. Henry Taylor, Mount Olive Missionary Baptist Church, Riviera Beach, Florida.

We come to you this evening trying to get clearance to be able to install a sign in the front of our church, not renovate the sign that we have because it's kinda antiquated

and we want to install a new sign. And, we have a copy of your Code of Ordinances that says, 'Signs in residential, commercial, public and industrial districts. In District zone RS5, RS6, RS8, RD15, RML12 and RM15, no signs other than home [stammer], home name plate signs shall be allowed, except that places of worship, schools and hospitals shall be permitted to install monumental signs, totaling not more than thirty-two square feet in area, per street front, which shall not be placed within five feet from the property line.

Now, we came to the City, talked to you in person about the sign codes.. They said that we could not put the sign up, only because of one word, digital. This is still a sign. Your code says that we can do it, but yet, instead your department representative said that we can't. We're only following your code.

And maybe I should back up a little bit and tell you about my experiences, and what I'm used to. I have thirty-eight years of Building Inspection and Code Compliance, eight years plus with the city of West Palm Beach, thirty years plus with Palm Beach County Building Department and I held a certificate that was for Building Official. Now, your code reads that we can install this sign because we are a.., exempted, with a total of thirty-two square feet. And we are coming to you tonight to ask you to give us this opportunity. We need you, as Councilpersons, to go ahead and give us the opportunity to install this sign, according to your code. Now, when this code was written, we didn't know anything about the word digital, but we still have a sign. This is a sign, regardless to whether it's digital or not, it's a sign. And your code permits to be able to install this sign. And we're asking you, as Councilpeople, tonight, to give us the opportunity. Give us a vote that says that it's okay. You have done it, you have a sign out there, it happens to be digital. The school has a sign that has a, wants to be digital.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Mhmm.

MR. H. TAYLOR: And here we are, a church, and we.., your code says that we are...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: [Inaudible].

MR. H. TAYLOR: ...able to have it. And we're asking for your permission tonight to be able to install this sign.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Madam Chair?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Chair Pro Tem, you're recognized.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: I.., if based on the code that Mr. Taylor read, if it's silent to the word digital, how can we exclude them from being included in that just because the sign that they want is,, is a digital sign? What reasoning is Staff giving that says that they, that they are giving for not allowing the installation of the sign just because the sign you want is a digital sign? If someone's gonna buy a sign, or a new sign, they're gonna buy one that's up to date as opposed to buying something that's old and antiquated at, at this

time to announce the different events that are going on, you know, in, in the church and in the community.

So, I'm, I'm not understanding, based on what is written, why, or how, how can we deny them? It's in the.., it's, it's in the code, it's already there. How can we deny them access to, to, to get in the sign that they want. And I like to get an answer, or, or either allow, allow them to move forward with their project.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilman Davis, you're recognized, and then...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: I, I...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...Councilwoman Botel.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: ...can wait.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Council' Botel, you're...

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: You know...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...recognized.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: ...they say you should never fight with the press because they buy ink by the barrel. I just sort of feel the same way about churches, they got a direct link somewhere. You shouldn't fight with them.

[Chuckles]

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: I'd just like to make a motion that we go ahead and ask Staff to work with them...

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: [Inaudible].

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: ...to, to, as much as possible, comply with their request. I, I, I can't imagine that there would be an objection from anybody up here to allowing the church to have a digital sign. So, I'd like to make a motion that we do that.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Second.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: It's been motioned and properly second. Councilwoman Miller-Anderson, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: I'd like to hear the answer to Ms. Hubbard's questions. To see what was..., what is the issue? What was the issue? I'm

not aware.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Staff?

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Madam Chair, I would like to call Jeff Gagnon up to speak on that issue.

[Inaudible audience comment]

MR. F. LOZMAN: Point of order. [Inaudible] here all night on that Item.

UNK: [Inaudible].

MR. F. LOZMAN: [Inaudible].

[Inaudible dais and audience comments]

MR. F. LOZMAN: Yeah. [Inaudible].

[Audience clapping and inaudible comments]

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Mr. Gagnon.

ACTING DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DIRECTOR GAGNON: Thank you, Madam Chair. Jeff Gagnon, Acting Director of Development Services.

Unfortunately, prior to tonight's meeting, I didn't have a conversation with Mr. Taylor on this Item. I'd be happy to do so.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: [Inaudible].

ACTING DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DIRECTOR GAGNON: The specific code section that regulates digital signs is §28-125. If you recall, as part of the process to install the digital sign in front of the municipal complex, we had to go through a code amendment process in order to facilitate that. One of the existing requirements is that the zoning is a community facility zoning. I'd have to verify the address, the zoning, future land use, things like that, but we'd be happy to do so. If there is a reason for an amendment, we'll be happy to bring that forward to City Council.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Madam Chair?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Madam Chair?

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: [Inaudible]. He said he couldn't do it.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Chair Pro Tem, you're recognized.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Okay. Why, why is he... Who's the..., who is denying, if it's not you, Jeff, who's denying him a permit for the, for the, for the digital sign?

Because, my thing is, you said we amended it, we amended our code so that we would be allowed to do one out front. Based on what he read, he falls within that category that allows him to be...

[Inaudible comment]

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: ...to be eligible for that. If the amendment did not go back and exclude churches, then again, it only confirms that he's still eligible for a., for this digital sign. So, you know, I, I too would just like to see Staff go ahead, give him the proper papers, and let them go ahead with their projects and not make a case out of everything that really doesn't, doesn't have..., doesn't have to be.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilman Davis, your recognized.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: If, if everyone's done, could we call the question, so we can get to the other issue? We have children that's been up waiting

[Inaudible audience comment]

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: We have public comment..., there are public comment cards.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Oh, okay.

MR. L. BROWN: [Inaudible] I'm ready to vote.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: On this, on this topic?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: On this.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: On this topic?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: There was public... [Inaudible].

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Yes, ma'am. Yes, Madam Chair, there's a public comment card on this Item. Fane Lozman.

MR. F. LOZMAN: And I waive my comment, ask that you call the question.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: And Mr. Henry Taylor has already spoken, so.,

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Okay. Okay. Madam Clerk.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Botel?

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Yes.

[Inaudible comment]

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Davis?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Pro Tem Hubbard?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Chair Davis Johnson?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Unanimous vote..

UNK: [Inaudible].

[Audience clapping]

REGULAR

DISCUSSION AND DELIBERATION

5. ITEM NO. 5

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair, we're on to Item No. 5. We do have public comment cards for this Item. The acceptance of public comment cards for Item No. 5 is now closed.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: DISCUSSION AND DELIBERATION TO ENACT AN ORDINANCE REQUIRING LANDLORDS TO TAKE RESPONSIBILITY FOR RELOCATION OF RIVIERA BEACH RESIDENTS DISPLACED DUE TO UNSAFE AND UNINHABITABLE LIVING CONDITIONS.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Madam Chair?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Do we need a motion?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Chair Pro Tem, this is your Item.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Yes, Madam Chair, and the rest of the Council.

The reason that I brought this to bear is because a lot of our residents in the City of Riviera Beach are effected by displacement when our Department of Development Services may find that a building is uninhabitable and they have to red tag the building, and our residents have to, have to move. Just recently, we, we've had that problem with Stonybrook. While, at the Stonybrook facility, they came and they asked for all kinds of allowances, and they were given those allowances, and yet the conditions seems to deteriorate every day at Stonybrook.

Now, one of the things that subsequently happened was, when the persons were moved, they were moved into places that, that weren't that [pause] habitable, if you, if you will, but we want to put this in place so that it's a policy that's Citywide. It's not just for Stonybrook, but we definitely know that it will help, because there's so many things going on at Stonybrook that the people have to be..., people find themselves displaced, and we need to make sure that if the landlords in this community are going to prey on the least of the people in this community, they know that they have a re'..., that they have a responsibility. So, with water trickling in, buckets being brought in, roofs about to fall in, over in Stonybrook, these people have a responsibility to find places, safe and decent places, not motels that are not for anybody's living condition, but to allow for those persons to take the monies that they would have paid at Stonybrook and find themselves a decent place to live until they can come back to their apartments there at that, at that particular property. People have invested a lot in where they live, be it in Stonybrook or anywhere else, it's not that people want to just get up and leave because it's safe, decent and clean housing. People want to leave because it's not safe and decent.

So, I'm asking my colleagues to say to the general public that if we, the City of Riviera Beach find that location, or any other location, or any other property uninhabitable, that it's gonna be your responsibility to put these persons up. Also, if we're not..., we're, we're gonna have to find, we're gonna have to find and lien these properties, because if you don't find them or lien these properties, they aren't gonna ever do better by, by the residents like they're happening there at Stonybrook. They came in and we gave them the store and till nothing is happening on behalf of those residents over at Stonybrook. So, I'm asking, with a policy like this, that we put..., that we direct Staff to generate an Ordinance on behalf of the people of Rivera, of Riviera Beach. Riviera Beach, as you notice, has become a majority landlord haven, a majority rental community. So, with that said alone, we need to put some policies and procedures in place to protect the residents of Riviera Beach.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Comments from Council.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: [Inaudible].

[Inaudible comments]

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Madam Chair?

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: There's been a request for public comment before we go into deliberations so that the people will have an opportunity to speak.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Bonnie Larson, Lloyd brown, Bessie Brown.

MS. B. LARSON: Bonnie Larson.

Rumor has it that Stonybrook is gonna sue Riviera Beach, HUD and everybody else. I'm wondering, is that why this is coming about now? This, this Ordinance, or this, what is you're.., it's an Ordinance...

[Inaudible comment]

MS. B. LARSON: Anyway, whatever it is. This should've been done years ago. Those people in Stonybrook have been living in filth and, and deplorable conditions for years and years and years. What about the previous owners of it, why didn't we do anything then? Why are we waiting 'til now when we're threatened with a lawsuit to do something?

[Inaudible audience comment]

MS. B. LARSON: And, we gave this new company.., we gave them a street in there before they even became the landlord there. I spoke against it, other people spoke against it, but we gave property to a company which didn't even own it yet. They were the management company there. They didn't do anything when they were the management company, and then we went ahead and gave 'em a street. We lose all of our, all of our leverage when we do things like this. But, these people have been living in filth and squalor for years and years and years, so I'm wondering, someone could.., why haven't we done this before? And also, there are a lot of other, and I'd like to expand the conversation, there are a lot of other properties in Riviera Beach. I know of some that are single family homes, small single family homes, the owner has divided the house, so he, he gets two rentals out of it. Now, there's a required by the Fire Department, and by Palm Beach County probably, they have two exits, and entrance and an exit. Those places that was divided in half only have one. There are a lotta things we need to look into as far as unsafe and uninhabitable living conditions. But, I'd like to know, why haven't we done something before we get faced with a lawsuit? Just like the IG, until the IG comes along, we don't do anything. And why don't we? We need to be proactive and not come after the fact that we're sued.

Thank you.

[Audience clapping]

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Lloyd Brown, Bessie Brown...

MR. L. BROWN: My name's...

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: ...[inaudible].

MR. L. BROWN: ...Lloyd. How ya doin' again? I didn't go nowhere but just to go eat some chicken.

But anyway, I just wanna say this. What she was talking about, it makes sense 'cause there's a house down the street from me, they removed the porch, took the door outta the porch, now there's a door right in the center. It's about, I don't know, there might twelve people living in there, with kids too. And I mean, you call 'em landlords, I call 'em slumlords. Right? There's not just slumlords that's running Stonybrook over there, they're all throughout our City. And, I mean, I'm not ashamed to say this, most of 'em are preachers. I mean, I see a, I see a sign... You know what? There's a sign... I mean, I'm not ashamed to say that because I put my pants on the same way they put theirs...

[Chuckles]

MR. L. BROWN: And anyway, God love' me just like He love them, so I have the opportunity to say what I gotta say and I'm gonna say it. The churches need to do more too, not just..., you know, they, they mostly own a lotta these houses around here. I mean, there's a place on 29th Street, you got a sign right out there, it's behind the PDQ, right down from the park, there's a big ole sign say, 'City taxes in progress.' And the building that was owned by the [inaudible] is torn down. So, you're telling me you took our taxes to tear that building down? I mean, that's, that's taxpayer money being used to do something for the City? Well, there's a couple people who need their fields cut in their vacant lots. Are ya'll gonna go cut them for free and use the City money? I mean, explain to me what that sign is doing there. I can't understand it. I mean, how are City taxes gonna tear down, because the man' brother's a preacher? I mean, that's..., and then I hear the man, with the sign, right? He want' the sign in front of the church, but you give all the stores all t these opportunities, they got everything going on in these damn stores, but this man can't get a sign in the front of the church. That's a shame. But they cam gambelize the stores, they can sell you food until it's gone. I mean, you know, you don't want me to talk. Stonybrook, I mean, that's not, that was been like that. I used to scrap back there, it was bad years and years ago. Ya'll just trynna act like you opening up your eyes, it just started. That's bull. It's been that way, you knew it, everybody knew it. When you went in there you knew it, you knew the drugs were in there, you knew what was going on 'cause I used to go in there and buy drugs, so I know too. And you knew it. Now here it is, you cou'..., acting like those people in there anyway. One thing I'll say is this, you don't wanna live in a place like that for no twenty years, that's a place for you to step up. Ya'll done' got these women in there feeling that that's supposed to be the rest of your life. Just have kids and stay in there and be taken care of. That's what the people want you to do, they want you to stay in Stonybrook. Nah, give them another opportunity. Like you say, don't put 'em in no raggedy hotel, and definitely don't put 'em in no man' house who got liens on 'em, so he can say, 'Well, we're gonna give somebody a first time owner,' that's just so that you can say in another way, 'We're gonna fix this man who' got these liens, these preachers. And I'll be honest with you, that's..., most of the houses around here are owned by preachers, and they are slumlords, they're not landlords, they're slumlords. And I'm not ashamed to say it...

[Timer]

MR. L. BROWN: ...I really don't care, 'cause they can't do nothin' to me. I mean, they may have enough money to get a hitman for me, but that's about it.

[Audience chuckles and clapping]

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Bessie Brown, Anand Perala, Noam Brown.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: [Inaudible].

MS. B. BROWN: Good evening.

What I'd like to say, I'd just like to say, I'm, I'm..., I commend for trying to get this Ordinance [stammer] prepared, because it shoulda been done a long time ago. Because ever since 2012, when Global purchased these properties, and nobody's watched Global, and Global really did nothing, so now it's continued and continued. Now it's all worse. It's some'.., you all, all of you need to go over there and see how much boarded up, blue tarps, red s', red stickers. It's horrible over there. You know? And, and.., but you all did not listen to anybody in here when they, when they came and asked for this, and asked for that, and you just agreed and gave them... They had so many fines and stuff, you, you worked with them on that. We do, we do all the working with and get nothing. Absolutely nothing, and our people continue to sit in these places and suffer. And, 'matter 'fact, one of the young ladies told me she went to the meeting last month and they said, oh they're not gonna knock down any walls, they're just going to.., they're just gonna paint over 'em.'

[Inaudible comment]

MS. B. BROWN: We know there's mold in all those places. Has, has anybody gotten a mold specialist for inspection to say that there's no mold in these places? Especially when you move the people out and it's all closed up and locked up and hot, with leaky buildings, you're gonna have mold. And, and, and, I mean, we have to do better for, for our people and society alone. These people are in a bad place, we know it's a bad place. The, the previous owner did nothing and, and then like, like Bonnie said, the people don't even own it, but they're buy'.., you know, but we've, we've given 'em all these opportunities. Have they started anything?

[Inaudible comment]

MS. B. BROWN: Have they started anything over there? Honest, and matter 'fact, they got these big white things on the ground, along the sidewalk, I don't even know what those are. I have no idea what those could be, but, but they're just doing, you know, sitting along, waitin' around, and, and, and they're not being held to, to, to be responsible for whatever they asked ya'll for, 'cause, 'cause you gave it to 'em. Has anybody asked them what's the progress? We need to do better. I mean these people are.., and, and then nothing is getting better. They were out there the other day, Tuesday, the roof fell in... Rooftops.

UNK: Mhmm.

MS. B. BROWN: You know? Something is wrong. And something is wrong with you all for not making it...

UNK. AUDIENCE: [Inaudible].

MS. B. BROWN: ...better. Honest to God. And you..., and it's time for ya'll to stop...

[Audience clapping]

MS. B. BROWN: ...sittin' up there, like you don't have..., and you don't know what to do. You know, go out there and look, and make them tell you what'..., what's the problem.

[Inaudible audience comment]

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Anand Perala, Noam Brown, Adam Wasserman.

[Inaudible comment]

MR. A. PERALA: I'm from the Palm Beach County tenant's union. I just wanna say, there were several families we spoke to that wanted to be here so they could give their opinion, but they can't sit here all night listening to, you know, people give speeches. So, several had to go home, but they were here earlier.

What's been said, has already been said because, you know, we told you so. There was a whole group of people, you know...

[Inaudible comment]

MR. A. PERALA: ...here last summer and Millenia flew in their high-priced lawyers and lobbyist and pitchman and gave you this whole dog and pony show. Here they are, now it's February. I'll tell you what, I was just there, the conditions are deplorable. They haven't..., there's no progress has been made. The entire top building..., all of the top units in Building J have been red-tagged 'cause they've been flooded. It's just..., it, it..., and, and even, like, the laundry room, like last summer tenants made a list of seventy demands. One of the ones they wanted was the laundry room fixed. It was a simple demand. Millenia corporate representatives came down, then they came back and said, 'Well, we'll get it done by July.' It's still not fixed. It's February. The tenants I just spoke to, the tenants, they're gonna have to drive all the way to Mangonia Park to the laundromat to do their laundry. That's how little this company cares about the welfare of these residents.

And it's time..., you know, you gave, you gave them the benefit of the doubt. You said, 'Okay, we'll give 'em a chance,' well, you gave 'em a chance. Now, it's time to make them pay. Hold them accountable for what they're doing, 'cause they really are not [chuckle], they're not taking care of this property at all. It's deplorable. The entire eastern side was boarded up, there's tarps over the roof. You know, it's just... I [stammer] the conditions, they're, they're not taking care of it. They're not investing any money. All the, all the, all the whole little graphics and, like, PowerPoint display they showed last summer,

they said they were gonna make it all beautiful. And Tommy Mignona was up here saying, 'Oh, we're gonna, soup to nuts, soup to nuts, we're gonna repair the whole thing from, you know, down to the boards. Nothin'. And there's nothing that's done.

So, you know, if this, if this is a Ordinance that's gonna extract some money of them, at least move tenants who need to be relocated because the conditions are putting the health of these children at risk. There's children on nebulizers, I'm sure you know, because they can't breathe. You know? When we were there last summer, some of the women, elderly women were sitting outside in their chairs, and then they..., [stammer] because the mold was so, ah, intense, they couldn't even breathe. But they ha'..., they were told by the landlords that they couldn't sit outside because it's a security risk, and they're elderly women. But I mean, the, the..., I would jus think, you know, that there's so much I could go on about.

Just, just..., you, you need to start holding Millenia accountable. If this Ordinance is a way to hold them accountable, and help these tenants move to safer, healthier conditions, then I think you should do something about that.

[Audience clapping]

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Noam Brown, Adam Wasserman, Cindy March, Fane Lozman.

MR. N. BROWN: Good evening.

I just wanna also speak in support of, of this Ordinance. You know, I wanna thank Council Member Hubbard for bringing it forward. I..., I mean, just hearing, already, the last couple people speaking about this, I, I would..., it would be great if we didn't have any public comment, you could just vote on this and vote the right way, but obviously, this is what's needed. I mean, not only six or seven months ago, you know, when this was brought forward and, and all of the issues that were brought up about [stammer] Millenia's negligence and the conditions at, at Stonybrook but, again, this is..., been happening for years. And, and I also, you know, wanna echo what the previous speaker was saying about, you know, there's a lotta people sitting in the section where I'm sitting that are not here anymore, who are from Stonybrook who have kids. There's no way that they're gonna sit here for three and a half hours waiting to speak.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: [Inaudible].

MR. N. BROWN: ...while other people, you know, are able to kinda squeeze in. The conditions over there are, uh, are horrendous. They have at least six buildings that have major roof leaks, they're drilling in buckets into the walls as a solution. I mean, really? [Stammer] I'm..., the, the, uh, the mold situation, for months and months of having people literally sick, hospitalized for, for their breathing issues, and this is still going on. And so, if the issue is going to continue, if we're not vote, at least, on this kind of Ordinance to protect the citizens, I mean, to protect the residents of, of Riviera Beach, and Stonybrook in particular, but obviously it's not just about Stonybrook, this is about the whole City, then what, what..., there's something else going on between..., some sort of a relationship

between Millenia and whoever is protecting Millenia. We're not protecting the people at Stonybrook but we're ready to protect this huge company that's coming in and buying this, this, you know, taking control of this land and not taking.., and, and not taking care of, of the properties at all? And not taking care of the people? I mean, it's re'.., like, what.., who are you protecting? Are you protecting the, the people in Riviera Beach, or are you protecting Millenia? And, if you're prot'.., not protecting Stonybrook, the people at Stonybrook, why are you protecting Millenia? What's going on there? So that's something to look into. Okay? There's a lotta issues related to this. If you're not already up on it, just, just read up, ask, go, visit...

[Timer]

MR. N. BROWN: ...and talk to people.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Adam Wasserman, Cindy...

[Audience clapping]

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: ...March, Fane Lozman.

MR. A. WASSERMAN: Well, I really didn't wanna be back here to say we told you so, and not just us but plenty of others. But, every single thing that we told you would happen once Millenia got the property and ya'll gave them everything you did, has happened. Conditions there, worse than ever. To talk again about the tenants who had to leave, a few things they said to me is they're tired of coming up here and telling ya'll the same exact shit every single time [chuckle]...

UNK. AUDIENCE: You said the right word.

[Chuckles]

MR. A. WASSERMAN: Every single time, getting up here and telling ya'll the same thing, they know it's on deaf ears, except for Lynne Hubbard. Thank you for, you know, bringing this proposal up tonight. But, yeah, I mean, pay lip service to the tenants but they know it's garbage.

So, and other things that they told me before they left is that, you know, their three options right now, it feels like, they can either stay in Stonybrook, where their children and them are dying, they could go on the streets, or they could go into a rat hole that's just as bad as Stonybrook. So, those are their three options right now, and that's why this Ordinance is so essential to relocate them to actual safe housing. So, other things, lets see, one gentleman said, 'Oh, I feel like ya'll sold us to them.' I mean, it's what ya'll did. Four of you at least. Except for Lynne Hubbard. So, what else? Just the presence of property management here, coming here, probably factored in to the tenants having to leave on top of the time crunch, trying to talk to them out in the hallway. Who knows what was offered or intimidated, what kind of intimidation happened. Well, that's the frequent kind of intimidation that happens in this property.

So, lets see, besides the J and I Building, you have the A Building, the N Building, the G Building, the K Building, all have massive roof leaks. They all need to be red-tagged right now. But you know why they're not red-tagged? Because code knows if they're red-tagged, guess where they're going? To that shithole in Town Suites that is just as bad as Stonybrook. So, we need, like, a massive code crackdown on that entire property, and the tenants being relocated to actual decent housing. Right now, code's hands are tied, they're hamstrung. They.., so, that needs to happen. The slum'.., and as other mentioned, the slumlord Ordinance is way pasted overdue, needed to happen years ago. Besides the point, it needs to happen right now. Not just for Stonybrook, but for plenty of other slumlord afflicted tenants, who we organize with. We don't just work with Stonybrook, but plenty of other tenants, so, needs to happen now.

Thank you, Councilwoman Hubbard.

[Audience clapping]

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Cindy March, Fane Lozman...

[Timer]

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Samson Kpadenov

MS. C. MARCH: Alright. I come before you all 'cause I was in this meeting when, I don't know how many of you all, but ya'll voted for these slum people to come into Stonybrook. And the reason why I'm speaking, it touches my heart 'cause I have a niece out there, that got put out Tuesday night with four kids. The only person that I know, on this panel that voted against the bullshit, was Lynne Hubbard. We need to put these politics aside, these personal vendettas aside, and get this Riviera Beach running the way it's supposed to be run. Ask yourself the question, is this where I wanna live? Is this the way I would wanna live with my kids? Now, you're gonna have DCF steppin' in, 'cause then they're gonna wanna know why the kids not in school. Because they don't have adequate clothes on they' back, or they don't have a decent place to live, or they' in the hospital, thinking that their mom or the dad don' neglected them because the bullshit they livin' in too. If you're the manager, would you wanna stay in Stonybrook? Property owners, would you all wanna stay in Stonybrook? It hurts my heart, and it really hurts my heart because my niece is the Building Official over here. She had to go put her own first cousin out of Building J Tuesday night, with four kids, calling me crying. It's hard. Ya'll need to do better. Ya'll talkin' about don't vote for Lynne Hubbard, don't reelect Lynne Hubbard. Let me tell ya'll somethin',...

[Inaudible audience comment]

MS. C. MARCH: ...Lynne Hubbard got your back. You know what you got but you don't know what you're gettin'. But Lynne Hubbard got your back, not Erica Davis that's snortin' cocaine, not Tommy Walker that's...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Ms. March...

MS. C. MARCH: ...smokin' crack.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Ms. March.

MS. C. MARCH: Okay?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Ms. March.

MS. C. MARCH: No, I'm gonna say what I wanna say, and how I wanna say it.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Ms. March...

MS. C. MARCH: Hey...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...I cannot...

MS. C. MARCH: ...I'mma say what...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...let you disparage...

MS. C. MARCH: ...I wanna say...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...people.

MS. C. MARCH: ...and how I wanna say it.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Point of order, Ms. March.

MS. C. MARCH: Ain't no change of order. I'm changing my order...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Point...

MS. C. MARCH: ...for ya'll to get them people up outta Stonybrook.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Walter.

MS. C. MARCH: Because I'll tell you what, don't nothing better happen to my four nieces and nephews over there in them horrible conditions. You put yourself in them shoes.

UNK: [Inaudible].

MS. C. MARCH: You put yourself in them shoes, Tonya. Would you wanna live there? Let me ask you that question. When it was [inaudible] months ago, some of you Councilpeople went back over there and said there wasn't nothin' wrong with that building. I'm not calling no name, 'cause I'm not here to defame none of you all. So, don't tell me how to speak when it comes down to my blood. Blood has always been thicker than water. And don't you get it messed up.

[Inaudible audience comments]

MS. C. MARCH: You all have a good night.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you.

[Audience exclamations and clapping]

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Fane Lozman, Samson Kpadenov, Delores Williams.

[Audience discussions]

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Point of order.

[Audience comments]

MR. F. LOZMAN: Fane Lozman.

I supported Lynne Hubbard last time. She had the guts to call it straight up, along with the Mayor. You're number one responsibility, at the end of the day, is the safety and welfare of the residents of Riviera Beach. Now, obviously, we can all look what's going on up here tonight. There's one Chairperson up there, and the most important Item on the Agenda's going off at 9:30, after all the families left.

UNK. AUDIENCE: Mhmm.

MR. F. LOZMAN: The Chairperson shoulda taken that Item and made it number one, realizing there's children, they have to go to school in the morning. It's past bedtime.

UNK. AUDIENCE: Yep.

MR. F. LOZMAN: But it goes to show that Tonya Davis Johnson could care less about Stonybrook. Lynne Hubbard, the Chair Pro Tem, it's important to her. And I congratulate you, Ms. Hubbard, but if you go back to the Minutes, you'd see I, I supported you back then too.

Where did the..., we run wrong last time? Gagnon. He was the big piece of the puzzle. He's acting as an advocate for the landlord, or the developer, whoever the hell that guy was with the road and all that, instead of the taxpayers of this City, or the residents of the City, the people that live in the City. You have to make a decision..., I don't mean to say taxpayers, I mean, the people that elected you, the residents. 'Cause some residents are not taxpayers, but the residents of this City put you guys in office. You are responsible to them. You're not responsible to Gagnon, you're not responsible to some slumlord, you're responsible to the residents that voted you into office. You know, the best City to live, work and play. Who the hell woulda wanna live in a City, when you have people living worse than dogs in kennels? I mean, I've gone, gone by that place, it's horrific, and it's been going on for a long time. I mean, you have to have a fundamental change, not only in some people sitting up there, one person at least, you

need to have a fundamental change in the departments that allow that to go on. Where is the accountability? We want accountability. We want accountability with a Chairperson. We have Interim guy., the City Manager has an Interim guy who's been there for years. Interim for what reason? Go back and see who pushed you guys to vote the way you did. Jeff Gagnon did. One of the reasons I supported Lynne Hubbard a few years ago, she realized Gagnon was a cancer in this community, that he had to go. Well, it's time he does go. He's more worried about mangroves on Singer Island than he is people's lives and the quality of life. That's not gonna cut it.

Ms. Hubbard, I congratulate you for staying with it, not being intimidated in the process and, you know, this may go... You know, this may, if you think about it, this may go a lot further than this. This may have to be looked at on the federal side. Maybe somebody needs to go to the Fair Housing Administration. There must be a federal...

[Timer]

MR. F. LOZMAN: ...question that people can't live like this, and it really needs to be looked at deeper. [Stammer], I'll do what I can to see if we can come up with some solutions outside the City because, because the City Staff are inco'.., are incapable of dealing with this problem. Thank you again, Ms. Hubbard.

[Audience clapping]

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Samson Kpadenov, Delores Williams, Erica Frazier.

MR. S. KPADENOV: Councilperson Hubbard, I'd like to thank you again for bringing this Resolution forward. The, the roofs have collapsed on Buildings I and J in Stonybrook and, once again, I'm here to tell the four of you, we told you so. Lynne Hubbard told you so. Mayor Masters traveled around this state to see how these slumlords do business, and sent you videos telling you so. I called each of your offices telling you how this was gonna go, and now suddenly you care because there's lawsuits.

I wanna point out to you.., well, first of all, I'm gonna, I'm gonna tell you the future. Since I've already told you so once and you didn't listen, maybe you'll listen when I tell you the future now. We're coming up on the anniver'.., we just passed the anniversary a week ago. A week and a year ago, Millenia, the slumlords, paid \$247,000,000 to buy a buil'.., a building in Cleveland, Ohio. That's a quarter of a billion dollars. I looked at CAFR, your [stammer] Comprehensive Annual Financial Report, and, and the City of Riviera Beach has about \$153,000,000 on hand. They spent twice that on their headquarters, that nobody lives in. Alright? They spent \$20,000,000.., they're spending \$20,000,000 right now to renovate the outside of it, and they're gonna come here and tell you that they can't afford to do this. Because they're liars and they're gangsters and they're slumlords.

If you let the people suffer like this, this is gonna haunt you, this is gonna follow you to wherever your political careers are, because trust me, when you decide to run for state rep or whatever, I'm gonna let you know. Right now, I'm gonna let everyone in the world know that people like Sherrod Brown and Rubio take filthy, blood money from these

people. And I'll make sure that they know that you do it too. Alright? So, it's important that you take care of the people who live in Stonybrook right now, that you don't let these people lie to you or, as it looks like right now, lie with you, about the conditions and what they're gonna do. They went and told the residents that, in November, that they couldn't begin with the Site Plan, that you approved to them, that we told you they weren't gonna follow through on, because we didn't have a Governor. We've never not had a Governor in this state. We had a Governor from, from..., four years ago, there was an orderly transition of power, and they came and tried to lie to these people, 'cause they think they're uneducated and say we can't move forward without a Governor.

You need to listen to, to, to Councilperson Hubbard and then follow her lead, because only 3 of you up for election this time, but it's coming back around. Alright? So, please, please, please. I know I've come at you with anger. Please do the right thing b the people of Stonybrook. You've had every chance to do it so far, now the situation's desperate and there are lawsuits com'..., coming down your neck. You're gonna need that money. And if you let Millenia keep telling you that they don't have any goddamn money, then you're gonna be on the hook for it.

Thank you for your time.

[Audience exclamations and clapping]

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Delores Williams, Erica Frazier, Deidra Puryear.

MS. D. WILLIAMS: Chairman and the Council, everyone that's up there and to all the residents here.

I don't live out there in Stonybrooks, I have niece there, and I was here with the citizen patrol [inaudible] Ms. Young..., these kids was walking in, the oldest girl look like she was about ten, eleven. And she had these little set of twins, about like two years old, and another brother, and I was wondering, 'Where's your..., I wonder where the mother is.' And, so I say, '[psst sound],' I said, 'Where' your mom?' She said, 'Oh, she's coming.' So, when the lady came up to me, I say, 'Those your kids in there?' She say' yeah, then she started telling us about where she live in Stonybrooks. It's nothing...

UNK. AUDIENCE: Pull the mic up.

MS. D. WILLIAMS: ...been done...

UNK AUDIENCE: We can't hear you.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Bring your mic down.

MS. D. WILLIAMS: Oh, you can't hear me?

[Inaudible audience comment]

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Pull it down.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Pull it towards you.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Pull it closer to you.

MS. D. WILLIAMS: Says nothing's been done for her and she had about s'..., eight kids. Eight kids. I said, 'You got eight kids?' And she say, 'They moved me three times and they put me in a motel that was so dilapidated and just so awful.' Now, my niece live' there and she up on one of the side., the [inaudible], but the lady was telling me, the way they move them., the way they moved them back into Stonybrooks after from the motel or whatever, the whole topo of the building caved in. You know, we had all that rain, all that rain last week. Wa'n't that awful? No, it wasn't awful, it was good for whatever God wanted it to be, but it was worse for those dilapidated buildings out there. And it, eh, she said, it caved in. The only reason I didn't red-tag it, because she was in that building. But the building is caved in and the water is running from the caved in roof, down to her side. She got the mop from underneath the sink, tried to keep the water up. No. I wouldn't wanna live there. Everybody might not have the incentive to move, that's all they feel like they, they can survive by.

But that's not what [inaudible] only one of you up here that's tryna see about the citizens that you want to vote for you, keep you in office, or vote for you for something else, that need' t o be done. My niece stayed in there when they put the tag on her door. Her kids., it was so full of roaches, she went and., we helped her get some type of spray. If you put a slice of bread down, and you turn and walked to bathroom, you come out, you can't even tell there was a slice of bread, so many roaches on it.

[Inaudible audience comments]

MS. D. WILLIAMS: She has a five year old. I told her, if a roach or something crawled in [stammer] in her ear, that baby's gonna be sick., Even, not only the child, the adults too. It was all over the bed, everywhere. You had one of your code enforcer come out there, there was so much roaches [inaudible], he had to shake his pants leg in the pleat to get the roaches off him when he walked out the building.

Now, I don't know what ya'll say, I don't know nothin' about this law firm or what they're talking about. I mean, this company here. Well, they say, ya'll was a slumlord where you go.

[Timer]

MS. D. WILLIAMS: It says here, I can't tell you what the people say, I don't know. But here, what have you done? There's some buildings on 28th Street, why couldn't ya'll go get some of the city, ya'll get those buildings fixed up, put those people in there? Get these people that've been many years, you don' had so many different people there, project managers and all like companies come in. That's shoulda been [inaudible]say why now, but do it now. Now is the time to get it done. No need in waiting. I don't know [stammer]...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you.

MS. D. WILLIAMS: ...some of the Council, I had more expectation of you. Only one of you caring about these people? That shouldn't be like that. We want ya'll to work for them and get this [inaudible], Ms. Hubbard. And ya'll vote for Ms. Hubbard.

[Inaudible audience comments and chuckles]

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Erica Frazier, Deidra Puryear...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: [Inaudible].

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: ...Millenia.

MS. E. FRAZIER: Good evening.

My heart is so heavy. I can't believe that I'm actually here. I didn't even wanna speak because of last.., what happened last year, and when you guys voted Millenia in.., Millenia in, and believed this, and then didn't follow up. I don't understand. All I can say is, so many people don't believe it, it's gonna change. We got people there that didn't even wanna come with us 'cause they say you're not gonna listen. You didn't listen the first time, why waste their time coming up here now? I'm asking each and every one of you... Alright, lets say you made a mistake, lets say you really believed Millenia was gonna do the right thing. We see Millenia's not doing the right thing. You guys are responsible for making change. You guys, this is your job. [Pause]. This is your job. You gotta make it right. You gotta make it right. And this Ordinance that Madam has put before us, lets make that.., lets start with that. It just hurts my heart. People don't even believe in you no more. And I couldn't e'.., they didn't wanna even think.., and the parents that came, they felt disrespected that this was not important. And I saw somebody up here getting ready.., it looked like they were giving.., 'cause they were saying so much.., how well people were doing and they some kind of or'.., uh, some kind of certificates they were giving and, and I was saying.., they were saying they did this is this community, they did that... I said, 'Well, let these people come down here to Stonybrook.' If t hey made changes and, and improved this neighborhood, why not there?

All I'm saying, you guys gotta do the right thing. People talk about God, about church and stuff like that. Well, if you're God-fearing people, hey, you gotta do the right thing, guys. You just gotta do the right thing.

Thank you for listening.

[Audience clapping]

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Deidra Puryear, Millenia, Chris French.

MS. L. VARNER: Good evening, Council members, Madam Chair.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: [Inaudible].

MS. L. VARNER: My name's Leslie Varner. I'm an attorney. I was recently hired to represent Millenia in terms of its Stonybrook property. So, I would first like to share some facts, present you all with some facts concerning the operations and resident relocation. This past summer and fall, Millenia performed the necessary repairs to the several units that were initially identified by the City. All required repairs were completed.

[Inaudible audience comment]

MS. L. VARNER: Above and beyond the repairs identified by the City, Millenia performed additional repairs to many of the other units. For those units that require temporary tenant relocation while repairs were being made, Millenia offered, provided and paid for temporary housing for over forty households. Millenia is currently housing twelve additional household member for temporary housing, and those were for the buildings that we're having some issues with. Since October, the management company has processed over 1,000 work orders, making daily repairs, addressing tenant service requests on, on a daily basis. Stonybrook residents are encouraged to submit service requests whenever they have an issue or, with their unity, or concerns related to their unit. The onsite staff addresses those concerns promptly and daily. The management company performs regular inspections of the apartment units in several buildings per week, in order to proactively identify potential maintenance issues, address residents' concerns and prioritize service calls. The management company, along with Millenia Housing Development, conducts monthly resident meetings, to have open discussions with its resident and community stakeholders to address their concerns and questions about ongoing operations of the property, as well as the timing of the development project and status of the City plan review process.

Now, with regard to the acquisition and redevelopment efforts for the property, Millenia acquired the property January 3, 2019, one month ago, and has been working with the City to obtain the necessary building permits that would cause the substantial...

[[Inaudible dais comment]

MS. L. VARNER: ...rehab of the property. Millenia will continue to work with the City to ensure the safety of our residents, that is our paramount concern also. Time is of the essence with respect to the rehab efforts and Millenia is working to have the City expedite the permitting process, so we will need your help in that regard.

[Timer]

MS. L. VARNER: Millenia wants to maintain a, a close working relationship with the building officials.

[Inaudible audience comment]

MS. L. VARNER: I've met with Ms. March earlier this week, and I am encouraged that we will develop a, a relationship that supports our efforts and some of your concerns.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you.

MS. L. VARNER: Thank you.

[Inaudible audience comment]

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Chris French.

[Pause]

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: He's gone.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair, that completes public comment cards for this item.

[Inaudible comment]

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Madam Chair?

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: [Inaudible].

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilman Davis, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Thank you. First, I just wanna say to the residents that, that, that came out but could not stay, thank you. We, we heard you, and we hear your concerns. When this came before us a few months ago, one of the questions and concerns we talked about were two things, what were our options at the time, and what was the plan? As we talked about the financing, the gap financing to, to get this approved, there was serious concerns when that was gonna take place. In the [inaudible] program, which I did have some concerns and hesitations because, as you all know, I've been following this process since 2011. I did state, on record, that this should be brought back before us for the new year to see where their financing is, and see what the status, the status on the permits they're apply for the Site Plan, is it gonna be gutted? Is it gonna be fixed? Is it gonna..., what type of plan they had in place. Here we are in February, discussing this process. A storm applied pressure and something happened. My only concern is, making sure that those residents know that we're gonna do everything we can, and that we actually do care outside of the politics, to get this going. And I commend Councilperson Hubbard, because she has always stood fast with her position, and I commend her for that.

I didn't know anything about a lawsuit until someone just mentioned it at the microphone. I spoke to a few residents over the weekend, I think it was Friday and, and Saturday about what was taking place. And, and I was getting mixed feedback, but one of the residents was saying, the sad part about it is, we had a lotta people who had great relationships out there and it's been splitting the families up, as far as the way they've been able to kinda cohabitate together as a community and really do some great things in Stonybrooks.

We are charged, we have a policy in front of us today that is very clearly in favor of not just this community, but all communities and landlords across Riviera Beach, and I

support this policy, and I do care. And I'm gonna stand steadfast on that. I received numerous calls from the tenant union and I called right back, whether it was an email or phone call, and I told you then, and like I told back then, once the new year come, we have a chance to review... I didn't know we would review it at this.., under these conditions. I didn't know the roof was gonna cave in, but I did, and it's on record, say, bring it back for the New Years so we can find out what's going on. And stand clear to that. I just encourage you guys to support what Councilperson Hubbard's presenting today, and understand that this is not a first time this has happened, this is number three. During the storm, the last hurricane we had. In 2012 we had a storm in July, same thing happened, with the previous owner. So, you now, I have to stay professional. I can't go the mic and curse and, and really express my emotions how I truly feel, but this is gonna pass, and whatever Staff is asking for you to do based upon the code and law, and we ask you to expedite that, pay the fee and we're gonna work with you to get this done as soon as possible, because no one win but the families. I don't wanna hear any excuses, from no one, other than the fact that we did everything we could to get the residents in position to know that everyone here cares. And this is not a policy decision, this is a life decision. And I don't do this to stay elected and get elected, I do this because I love m community. And I told you then, if you need me, if there's something going wrong with Staff or the community, you have a City Manager to reach out to, and if it gets critical, let us know. 'Cause [inaudible], we coulda addressed this a long time ago, but like Ms. Williams stated, you know, this storm really exposed the process. And now we're in the position where you gotta do something now, so I encourage you to work with Staff, don't hesitate and I'm sure Staff is gonna work with you. Ladi March has always been very passionate and professional, no matter what folks say about this community. So, I just look forward to you guys just doing the right thing, but I'm gonna support this Resolution tonight.

Thank you.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Madam Chair?

[Audience clapping]

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Chair Pro Tem and then Councilwoman Botel.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Earlier, the.., Ms. Larson mentioned, 'Why now? Is it because we're being sued?' No, it's not because we are being.., because we're being sued, it's, it's because in researching and finding tools that were accessible to us, that we could put in place to force, or to have some type of leverage over slumlords, this was found. So, when I found this, I put all the samples together and brought it before the Board. I don't have a problem with people suing, or going to the courts for relief, that's what we're supposed to do. We live in a, a, a democracy that allows.., that, that, that allows us to do so.

The, the other thing about what's going on at Stonybrook, we're not going to be bullied into giving permits or inspections to allow you to do what you claim you need to do. There's certain things that you're gonna have to do before you get those things. We

went for that the last time. We gave ya'll the kitchen sink and still you did nothing. So now, you're gonna come back and tell us, 'Well, we can't do anything else until you give us some more.'

[Inaudible audience comment]

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: No. No. No more. Do what you're supposed to do, and you cannot blame our Building Official for representing the people and the City of Riviera Beach like they're supposed to, to be doing.

[Audience clapping]

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: That Development Service Department is there to protect us, to protect our residents, and they're not there to bow and scrape and be intimidated by, by the landlords over there. They don't have to. We have them there for a reason, and because of their expertise and their skillsets, we expect them to hold ya'll to the Florida statutes that would allow us to feel like we are looking out for the residents of, of Riviera Beach. And we must look out for the least of us. All of us are, are supposed to look out for the least of us. But no, we can't give you anything else until you do right with what we've already given you. You.., we, we took you... Well, some people took you for your word and thought that you were gonna do right by us. You didn't do right by, by us then, and so now we give you some more for you not to do right by us. I mean, the way people are living over there, I mean, just the presence of driving into that place, they have the, these armed guards, the, the way, the way the place is, everybody is standing around.

People, you know, I can understand why somebody say they feel like they've been sold to, to Millenia. It's, it's, it's really ridiculous and because the people are suing us, that's not why I'm bringing it. If that's all the people have at their disposal, is to file a lawsuit, then so be it. They should file a lawsuit. It's, you know, it's up to us to do something different that they would not have to file a lawsuit. So, you know, I say to us, we need to tell our Staff to enforce the law. Just enforce the law. Do your job and enforce the law, and if.., and, you guys.., and, and we need to put in place something that will fine you on a daily basis until you do right by the residents over there in, in Stonybrook because if that place is that deplorable, I'm sure the fines that we put on other companies, we need to place them on you. We need to lien that property continually, until you do, until you do right by the residents.

No, I do not support Staff moving forward with anything until they see ya'll do something. We've done something, now it's time for ya'll to show up, and to do something because, no, you haven't, you haven't done anything at all.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilwoman Botel, you're...

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...recognized.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: I, I...

[Audience clapping]

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: ...have some questions for...

[Audience clapping]

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: I have some questions for our City Attorney and for Mr. Gagnon. Are we, in fact, being sued, are we, in fact, a co-defendant in a lawsuit with Millenia? And, does that in any way.., does passing this Ordinance, or considering an Ordinance like this, have any bearing on that lawsuit in terms of it appearing to be retaliatory?

CITY ATTORNEY WYNNE: My office has not received.., has, has not been served with any lawsuit from Millenia.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Oh. [Chuckle]. Rumor's, rumor's.

CITY ATTORNEY WYNNE: That's the first...

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Mr. Gag'...

CITY ATTORNEY WYNNE: ...I've heard of it.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Thank you. I, I wanna say before I ask my questions, I have spent time at Stonybrook. I've been with Ms. Amanda and Ms. Evelyn, we've, we've, we've seen the conditions there. Believe me, nobody is more passionate about trying to make a difference in the lives of those families and children than these two ladies, and I hope we can help them succeed in that endeavor.

Mr. Gagnon. [Pause]. Can you please explain to me what the hold up is with regard to providing a permit so that Millenia can begin to make these changes? Every day that goes by, that we do not permit Millenia to make these changes, to make these improvements, is another day that people have to live like that, in those conditions, with the roaches and the holes in the wall. Those things can be fixed, but we have to expedite this process. Can you please explain to me what has been the hold up?

[Inaudible comment]

ACTING DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DIRECTOR GAGNON: Well, to provide a, a summary. The statement made by the Millenia team is factual, as far as the communication has been open in between the Millenia team and City Staff. We had a team meeting, I believe it was in November, followed by a team meeting in December. We had a conference call as recent as last week and there are some outstanding City comments based off of our preliminary plan review of the initial submittal. So, we're

waiting for a response to those comments currently. That's the current status.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Are you asking them to do something out of the ordinary? What kinds of things are you asking them to do that they haven't yet done?

ACTING DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DIRECTOR GAGNON: Within the correspondence provided to the Millenia team, it, it's very technical as far as specific, Florida building codes that we are asking a response to, as far as the plans not satisfying those specific Florida building codes. I, unfortunately, don't have that correspondence with me tonight. I'd be happy to provide that to the Council, or anyone else that's interested in that correspondence.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: I, I just can't understand why it's been so long. I mean, I understand that certain things couldn't happen at the state level because of..., or the federal level rather, because of shutdowns. That, that's unfortunate that that happened. That was..., that caused part of the delay, but I don't understand why there's been such a delay on our part. I mean, I, I just..., I., this is critical that we get this project moving. These people are living in awful conditions, and we can't allow this to continue. And I, I, I...

[Inaudible dais comment]]

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: ...think there's a difference between a level one determination and a level three determination. Is that part of what's going on? That they think that they have a level one determination, and we think it's level three? Please explain that to me.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: One moment, before you answer. Madam Clerk, it is now 10:00 p.m. We need a motion to extend the meeting to complete this discussion.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: So moved.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: What is the timeframe for the extension, please?

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: What's the rest of the Agenda look like?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Until we finish the Agenda.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: You have two Items.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: You have three, Madam Chair. You had another add-on that was done by Councilperson Davis, as related to the discussion and deliberation on the OIG report.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Can we wait on that? Can we wait on that?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: We can table it.

[Inaudible dais comment]

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: I'll do it in my comments.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Okay. So, we really only have two. So, I, I make a motion that we extend the meeting to the Agenda's complete.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Is there a second?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Second.

[Inaudible dais comment]

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: It's been motioned and properly second. Madam Clerk.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Davis?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Yes, ma'am.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Botel?

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Miler-Anderson?

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Pro Tem Hubbard?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Chair Davis Johnson?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Unanimous vote.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Level one, level three.

ACTING DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DIRECTOR GAGNON: Yes, ma'am.

The ongoing conversation has to do between the determination of thresholds as far as the scale of the redevelopment. There's a ongoing discussion between level one and level three, based on the scale and scope of the plans. It is the Stonybrook team's understanding that it's a level one, however, the City Staff determination has been made that it's a level three, which...

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Based on?

ACTING DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DIRECTOR GAGNON: ...requires... Based on the scope and scale of the renovations proposed.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: [Sigh]. Okay. I, I just..., I'm, I'm hoping that you are doing everything possible to expedite this. I'm hoping that we're not just dragging our feet to make this...

[Inaudible dais comment]

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: No. I won't make that comment. I, I will make this comment, not for Mr. Gagnon. I don't have any political aspirations. I took this job on because people asked me to run for this position. So, to make a comment about political careers, you can take this political stuff 'cause I don't need it. I'll go back and be retired the way I was.

UNK. AUDIENCE: [Inaudible].

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: That's not what I'm here..., that's not what I'm here for, but I am here for these people who live in Stonybrook, in those conditions. And my plea to you, Mr. Gagnon, is to expedite this. Please, let Millenia get this work done as quickly as possible so those people don't have to live in these conditions.

Let me also say this, one more thing, about this Ordinance. This Ordinance that was proposed in the backup to us... Thank you, Mr. Gagnon... was done in Jackson, Michigan. The vote [clears throat] excuse me, in Jackson, Michigan on the Tuesday, January 15th meeting, came before Council and it was approved before Council. However, what, what was not provided to us and what I had to research myself, was that it came before the Jackson Council again on the 29th of January, and at that point, it was tabled. It was tabled because the Jackson Council felt that they didn't have enough information about due process in this. They didn't have enough information about the impact, not only on the people who might be relocated, but on the landlords. I am completely in favor of holding landlords accountable for the conditions under which people, to who they rent, are living. Completely. But to, to jump into something that was tabled in Jackson, Michigan, which was not provided to us, when, when we haven't even taken a look at due process when there might be some, some legal ramifications if it looks like we're being retaliatory. I, myself, would hope that we would consider this, consider taking a look, asking...

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: [Inaudible].

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: ...Staff to look into it, perhaps do some more research to see what other communities like ours have done, but not to jump on board with Jackson, when Jackson isn't even onboard.

Thank you.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Madam Chair?

[Inaudible audience comment]

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Let me allow...

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: I just [inaudible].

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Chair Pro Tem, you're recognized.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Thank you, Madam Chair.

The, the fact that, in between the first reading and the second reading, as usual how developers are able to get to Council and it didn't pass on the second reading doesn't mean that we, as Council, have to follow suit. If you read the top of the Ordinance, it says allow Staff to go back and draft something that's befitting for the City of Riviera Beach. It didn't say befitting for Jackson...

UNK. AUDIENCE: [Inaudible].

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: It said betting for the City of Riviera Beach. So, whether or not Jackson was able to carry the ball into the endzone is one thing, it does not negate the fact that we still need something place. And for, for us to understand.. I, I don't see how we can say that them not getting permits in a timely manner is keeping them from doing the necessary things that they need to do over at Stonybrook. That's ridiculous. If, for one minute that we thought that a permit that was needed was going to help put Stonybrook into a path that it needs to be, why would we hold the..., why would we hold the permits up? That's not what's going on over there at'tall.

At this point, I put this on the Agenda so we can get some understanding.

UNK: [Inaudible].

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: I'd like the Building Official to come forward and state why permits are not being given, and what the real status is of going over there. Mrs. March-Goldwire, , please.

Thank you.

BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH-GOLDWIRE: Ladi March-Goldwire, Building Official for the City of Riviera Beach.

I would like to first start out by saying that if, in the event there are any permits required to make immediate repairs to the current conditions, the Millenia teams has always been aware that they can do that. Repairs associated to roof leaks, structural damage, the code allows for whether I grant it or not. The ability to pull an emergency

permit, or make the necessary repairs and file a permit application the next day. The current conditions are different from the conditions that they are proposing and asking for approval for down the line.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: [Inaudible].

BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH-GOLDWIRE: I explained to them, on several occasions and spoke with the young lady here, when the roofs fell in and we came out on Tuesday, I advised them, 'You don't even have to bring me the specs, which are absolutely required in most cases. Because of the current conditions on the building, and because there are serious exposures to the elements, just bring me the bare minimum. I was told that that would happen the next day. It is today and I haven't gotten anything. And has been par for course over much of the existing conditions.

If we move forward to what the proposed conditions is, it's evident that there's been some conversation with regard to level one and level three, 'cause that's a very technical term. So, someone has already spoken to you and advised that I have not been in agreement the level one repairs. Level one repairs, in layman terms, is commensurate with fixing a lightbulb, fixing..., replacing fixtures, perhaps changing walls. Their argument is they're not reconfiguring spaces. However, every time that they've presented to you as a dais, they've indicated that they would go down to stud and make full repairs. So, when you get into a level one repair, that is not happening. I have gone over the plans, in spite of the fact that they were already approved for a third party vendor, a third party person to come in and approve their drawings and conducted a plan review anyway, to expedite their request. And, in that review, we determined that they in fact are making significant changes, however, they refuse to install changes that are absolute requirements. Stonybrooks has been on fire watch since August. That means that someone is responsible for walking the entire premise and giving a thirty minute account of whether or not the building is safe and free from fire hazard. That's been since August. Currently, outside of that manual effort, there is nothing that alerts to fire, there is nothing that alerts to smoke damage, there is nothing that gives anybody a heads up that something could possibly go wrong. That's been since August. They don't have a notification system, they don't have a sound system, they do'..., they don't have the bare minimum.

I asked them, as a result of the current conditions, the o'..., the date of the building and when it was constructed. The fact that they have old electrical systems, I asked them to install a firewall from the second floor through the roof and they are giving me pushback on that. That firewall would allow our first responders the opportunity to actually save some lives, because current conditions don't allow for that. And so, if you have a project wherein as you have all of this money to put it back together the right way, you can't bring me a plan and ask for me to grant you approval at level one. I've told them I will not do it. I'm not sure why the conversation keeps going back and forth because, ultimately, that decision is at the discretion of the Building Official. So, unless they fix it the right way, we can't do it.

Now, for the current conditions, the roof that's fallen in on several buildings,

buildings that have had roof failure for months. When I first got here, the roof came off in the hurricane, we had the buildings damage from the fires. Permits associated with that, they absolutely can do and we will do, I will do, immediately, but their response to me has been, 'We would like to take these repairs up with the proposed conditions,' or, 'with the proposed renovations.' They're not interested in fixing current conditions, they're interested in me giving them a permit to do proposed conditions at level one, at level one. No firewall, no system, no electrical panel change out. No, that, that's unacceptable.

[Inaudible audience comment]

BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH-GOLDWIRE: That's unacceptable. And they want me to grant them the permission to do their repairs under the existing building code. Well, they can do that, but there's also a element in the code that says, at the discretion of the Building Official, if it is apparent that improving the current system, bringing the buildings up to code, will inc'..., it will increase and improve the life safety of the residents, then I get the option to ask them to do something different, and that is what I've chosen, because they've not done what they've promised me they will do. They have gone to everybody else to ask for passes. There are 216 doors at Stonybrooks, passes are not allowable. We've had too many incidences where it's problematic.

So, current conditions should not be confused with the proposed conditions, number one. Number two, if they would just do the bare minimum, I can assure you, I will walk the permit over there to them. That has not happened. I've been presented with every element of intimidation that you can imagine. And it is upsetting. I have, and am willing to give them whatever permits they need, but I will not forego the code to give it to them. And that is the end of it. That is, that is where I am with it. I don't know what else to do. They have hired a third party team to override me, as they did when I found the violations before, and if that's the route they want to go, then that's what they have to do but I'm not going to sign [stammer] on it because they're ultimately going to need a certificate of occupancy. Twenty years from now, they will wake me out my bed if there's a fatality and take me where everybody wants to se me, and that is jail.

[Inaudible audience comments]

BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH-GOLDWIRE: And I don't wanna do it.

[Audience clapping]

BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH-GOLDWIRE: I can't do it.

[Audience clapping]

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Um...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Madam...

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Madam...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: ...Chair?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: ...Chair, the reason...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Madam...

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: ...that I wanted to...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: One moment. Councilwoman Miller-Anderson.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: [Stammer]...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Were you not finished?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: No, that's...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Well, she called.., she called her up.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Yeah.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Yeah. You called her up, so, you have something else to say before we go into others...

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Yeah. The reason that I called her up was because I wanted to.., and she, and she's left the room, but.., is, is because I wanted the people to understand, nobody is playing games and none of us should play games with the, with the lives of the people. Clearly, it was stated that, in a nutshell, they are not trying to do the extensive changes that need to be done, they wanna do the superficial changes and they want to wait on the substantive changes until they get ready to do the, the gutting of the place and their full rehab, and we can't wait for that with roofs falling in and things, and things of that nature. And I think it was quite misleading to, to try to pre'.., to present it some other way. And, you know, as a, as a Council [stammer] my, my, my colleague stated that we should everything that we could to help them to move forward, and I think we are, and I think we have but what we can't do is go back on our word and allow them to do it halfway. They've gotta do it right for, for the life safety of th'.., of those residents. So, it's not like they aren't being giving permit, that I hope everybody heard what the real story is.

UNK: May I ask if you would give us an opportunity to respond to some of the [inaudible]...

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: We've heard enough [inaudible]...

UNK.: ...[inaudible].

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: I would like to hear.

UNK.: [Inaudible].

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Well...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: [Inaudible].

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: We're not trying to go back...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: One moment.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: ...and forth.

UNK. AUDIENCE: That's right.

UNK.: [Inaudible]...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: One moment, ma'am.

UNK.: Sure.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: We still have Council Members that have to weigh in.

[Inaudible audience comment]

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilwoman Miler-Anderson.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Okay. I do realize that the basis probably for this proposed Ordinance surrounds Stonybrook and, of course, you know, no one, I'm sure up here, is against trying to make sure that the safety and wellbeing of our residents are priority number one, but my question is, with this Ordinance that we're proposing, we are talk'.., we're not only talking about Stonybrook, this would apply to landlords that have single family homes, duplexes, commercial, a number of areas, not just the multi-family complexes. Correct? Am I correct on this?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Yes. But...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Okay.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: ...we would give Staff enough to, to craft this.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Mhmm.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: To fit the City of Riviera Beach and the things that we, you know, would like to see in it. Ours will not be verbatim to...

UNK: [Inaudible] mic.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Ours would not be verbatim to Jackson's. This is just a draft, a template, something that gives us a guide to start from, a base, a, a jump off point, if you will.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Okay. And, and, and with that, and that was kinda where I was going is, is that I do wanna have an opportunity for Legal to weigh in, for Jeff to do his due diligence. Because I., what I don't want to do is create an Ordinance that is appearing to be specific for one particular organization or, or building, or company. Because, you know, we've had troubles in that regard in the past, of creating, or changing an Ordinance for one particular case. And so, I don't want to do it because of that reason.

I., in, in regards to the, the items that Ms. March spoke about, and those from the representatives of Millenia, I do., I don't know that tonight is the night because it is getting late and there are other questions that I have regarding the status of Millenia's renovations. And, I can't fully say tonight, I came in with an update on where were with that. So, for me, that is not really playing much into it. That is an issue that I do want to have an answer for, for sure, but I do not... That, for me, is not factoring in, if this is an Ordinance that we feel that is an issue or a problem that we're trying to solve across the City, and it is, and it is., it is an issue. I know absent landlords, that's an issue for us as well. And so, I would think that, when the language is crafted for us to be., for it to be brought back for us to vote on, for the tw'., the two votes, that we have all of those things ironed out, we, we know specifically the impacts of all of this, how it would impact, you know, the smaller companies, the smaller individual landlords. And, and just all of the different options and ramifications that we need to be aware of.

So, if there's due diligence that has not been done thoroughly, I, I will not be supporting it until I know, and I'm very comfortable in knowing, that we're covering all bases, and we're not designing an Ordinance specifically for one organization. So, I have no, no issues with him going and, and doing his due diligence and doing the research to be able to identify what this will look like. I am in support of that. I would like to see it. Of course, it's gonna come back to us and have some dialog as to how we're going to get there, to make sure that cover all of our bases legally, you know, and just, you know, not... 'Cause we don't want to penalize those who... Because what, at what level., I, I know you said mainly, like, red-tags for places that are inhabitable, but, you know, I want it to be very specific as to what that means. And, in regards., I know there was some controversy in the Stonybrook case back when the red-tags were initially put on, and that came from our own legal counsel outside, Torcivia's group, so there was some, you know, there was some controversy behind the red-tags that were put on then. So, I just wanna make sure that those red-tags that are put on, it, you know, it is a ser'., not saying that she didn't put., she put them on there and there was no life safety issue, but there was some controversy behind the initial red-tags that were put on. So, I just wanna make sure that all of that is cleared out and thoroughly vetted before we surely make, sure that., before we go through that. Okay?

And that's., that, I mean, I pretty much... That's where I am with it.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: I have a question as it relates to the collapse of the roofs, the roofs as reported. What, what tis the relocation plan and where?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: [Inaudible].

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: No one... I have not heard anything mentioned about that. We have roofs that..., roofs that have collapsed. Were these in buildings that were unin'..., uninhabited or were these a combination of buildings that have folks somewhere around it? I've not heard any plan for that.

I too do not have an issue with creating language that will address the Citywide issue of relocation care update. I don't think that we should craft something specifically for one organization. It should be for everything that is around, but most pressing right now is Stonybrook. And yes, I met with Stonybrook, yes, I, you know, I, I get the correspondence, I read and I have been following. So, it's, you know, it is critical that the work that was promised when we sat and we voted from the perspective of 4 to 1, to say, 'Okay, Millenia, we hear you, we support you,' and I was a part of that vote, because I wanted to believe that there was an opportunity for Millenia to come in and take over where Global failed. And there was a heartfelt statement that they were going to take it down to the studs, they were going to make the necessary repairs and bring it up to standards. And so, the opportunity to do that is now, and we have got to get to the point, with this particular issue, where we've now..., Millenia has now taken over the property, and we've just gotta move it. We can't stall it, we cannot throw up unnecessary roadblocks to prevent us from getting to the point that was made when we made the vote to allow them to come in and to make the necessary repairs when we saw the plans, when we heard everything that they had to say. It is now time to show us. And I don't believe that the residents of Stonybrook can wait six more months, nine more months for this to happen. The conditions have got to change. They, they just absolutely must change.

MS. D. WILLIAMS: [Inaudible].

UNK. AUDIENCE: Yeah.

MS. D. WILLIAMS: [Inaudible].

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Point, point of order, order, Ms. Williams. Please.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: [Chuckle]. Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: So, an..., a Citywide Resolution, we should entertain that. We also need to take a look at what Florida Statute Chapter 83 says, when we're crafting this language, because there is a housing..., there is Fair Housing..., or landlord tenants st'..., statute that we need to address. But we've got to do something because we are such a heavily populated rental property community, and we need to make sure that all rental property, throughout this City, is maintained and safe and affordable housing is provided.

My, my point...

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Madam Chair?

MS. D. WILLIAMS: [Inaudible].

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Point of order. I, I said..., I said, Ms. Williams, for Citywide. [Pause]. Chair Pro Tem.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Thank you, Madam Chair. Thank you for your comment, because that was my initial statement and, and recommendation, that this be something that is Citywide, because the..., because Riviera Beach is much of a rental community, so it, so it would behoove us to, to make it Citywide. Definitely it needs to be the City in its entirety, and no..., the only thing that I'm asking for tonight, is that we give Legal the authority to look at this and to craft something that they can bring back, that would benefit the City of Riviera Beach so that we can have first reading, so that we can have a second reading. And, our own... It, it did seem that our own legal group spoke more on behalf of Millenia at the last meeting than they did on behalf of the residents, and the, and the red-tags were looked at as if they might not have..., should have..., they might not have been there in earnest, but as we can see now that it's evident..., if we look at that list, and we look at the units that are having trouble, there's, there's a lotta crossover and that alone tells us that they were there properly.

The, the one thing that, you know, I'm asking, and the only thing really that I'm asking, is that we give Legal the direction to create an Ordinance that would cover the entire City. Yes, Millenia is the posterchild because they're front and center right now, and they would immediately be effected by [stammer]... And there's, you know, there's no telling who else will be effected by it, but right now, you know, they're more visible, they're more visible. Like, like it was stated, there's 216 doors over there, so they'..., so it gives us a prime example of what we should allow in the other community.

The other thing that I'm asking the Council to do, [pause], force them to make the immediate repairs that they need to make. Not wait 'til they get ready for their o'..., their, their overhaul and their big redevelopment. Then, that's when they're going to fix the, the roof? That's when you're gonna stop the leaking? No. There's things that you have to do right now. And you..., and if, if you need a permit to do those things, then so be it, but nobody is gonna wait 'til you go and gut this place and then repair it so it'll be habitable. And that's what you're, and that's what you're asking, and I think that's unfair to put us in that position. And it's also unfair to the residents of the City of , of Riviera, of Riviera Beach.

So, if we would... Do we need a vote, Madam Chair, to, to, to ask the Legal Department to craft something that they can bring back and present on our..., present to us that this might fit the City of Riviera Beach. No, it won't be a cookie cutter or a carbon copy of what's happening in Jackson.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Cou'... One moment, Councilman Davis. Madam Attorney, that can come through Staff direction?

CITY ATTORNEY WYNNE: I would prefer it if you gave me a vote. If you'd like to

do it by consensus, then I'll go with hat, but I would prefer a vote.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Okay. I'll make a motion.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: One moment. Councilman Davis.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: I, I was prepared to make a motion to do just that. So, I make that motion that Staff go out and bring back information that's consistent what..., Citywide, with an Ordinance that allows to have the accountability that we was asking for today.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: I second that motion.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: It's been motioned and properly second.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Davis?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Yes, ma'am.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Botel?

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Pro Tem Hubbard?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Chair Davis Johnson?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Unanimous vote.

[Audience clapping]

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: May I ask, ask a question, please? What is your plan to address the immediate repairs? Who can come up and speak?

MR. M. SOLOMON: I am Matt Solomon. I'm an architect who was brought in to help speed up the process, because we've got a set of plans which describe what the proposed work is going to, going to execute. There are conditions at the property that are terrible, and so, as of Monday night when I first got wind of the conditions of the roofs, and understand that Monday night the Building Official and the Fire Department went to the property and inspected Building J, there.., they determined that the roof structure itself was not compromised, but the roof itself is in tatters. And so, there was a repair that was

very poorly done in, in the past, under previous ownership and it's my opinion, as an architect, that needs to get stripped down and replaced in its entirety. That's Building J. So, what I did on Tuesday morning when I arrived at the site, I was lined up with the contractor from..., he's actually a Riviera Beach roofing contractor that's done a number of residential properties, so his superintendent and myself walked on top of four buildings, including the, the two Buildings I and J, which are in the worse shape, to develop a scope of work. So, at the end of the day, one of my tasks was to look at what was proposed and the existing conditions, and to, and to make sure that by this immediate work that we're propo'..., that is being proposed to, to Millenia as ownership currently, that it aligns with what we're proposing to do in the future and [stammer] we're not shooting our'..., ourselves in the foot by doing something that might be in'..., unaligned with what the proposed improvements are. So, I provided the specification and plan information for what we're proposing to this roofing contractor, because he, to be honest, is one of the few remaining contractors that'll come to Stonybrook and, and do the work because so many contractors have been burned by prior ownerships, over the genera'..., over the years. So, Millenia is, unfortunately, left with a, a small selection list of people that will actually come onsite. But, these guys are willing to do it. They reviewed the specs this morning after they..., we worked on the scope of work yesterday. And so, I spoke to the owner this afternoon and so he's preparing a proposal that we're presenting to the CEO of Millenia tomorrow, soon as we get it in our hands. The, one of the important things to note is that it's true and we appreciate that Ladi March-Goldwire, when she was out, I understand that she basically said, 'You get me a permit with..., a permit application, you might walk away with a permit in hand.' She wants to turn it around that quickly. So, that's really appreciated that they want to go by the proper process, which is not kinda do the work and ask for forgiveness later, which has unfortunately been some of the actions that's happened, I understand, in, in several locations. But, be that as it may, there, there is emergency repairs that allows that. But I think for this case, the important thing to do, because we need to set a standard for the improvements that may occur before we even get to the major rehab, that it just goes in a team effort between the City of Riviera Beach and the property wherein we can have an application properly processed, where we can review it together, rather than review it, it sits on someone's desk and it comes back in a couple weeks.

So, that's been offered and..., by the City, and so, that is the plan, that tomorrow we get the proposal... I wanna make sure that the owners and, really the residents, as, as partners in the property, are properly protected and this roofing contractor doesn't throw something up there that is exactly the same as the one that I saw was on top of Building J. So, it's important that we get something in writing, that has the proper warranties and so that we get something that we, we can 'force..., enforce them to do by them providing us everything in writing that's..., that qualifies them to execute this prop'..., this roofing repair in some'..., in two buildings, and proposing a replacement in Building..., at Building J.

So, that's the status.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Does anyone else have any questions with regards to this? I, I heard all that you said, I..., I'm just still trying to get to the immediate

things that need to be addressed where they may be leaks or other issues. I know you have your day to day items that are being addressed through the requisitions that are being put in place by residents.

For the major issues that are a s'..., a serious bone of contention, what's the plan? I understand needing to do the, the work of the architect and getting the information for the roofs, but I'm, I'm talking more so about the internal conditions of units.

MR. M. SOLOMON: Yeah. You're really, I think, describing three different tiers of work.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Mhmm.

MR. M. SOLOMON: There's work orders, there's major repairs, both of which are handled by property management, and there's the major rehabilitation, which is a partnership between the City of Riviera Beach, U.S. Department of HUD, State of Florida, Millenia, the residents and the stakeholders. That's a big, uh, effort just unto itself. But, the first two pieces, which are work orders and major repairs, the work orders, I think we explained earlier, that Les'..., Leslie Warner..., Varner described, is that the forty or so units that were red-tagged, the City of Riviera Beach has cleared, or essentially accepted the work for, I understand, all but two? All but one. So, I think that the property is, to my understanding, is on top of the, the units that have either been red-tagged as of the end of the year. Now, the Building J, the second floor of Building J, has been red'..., red-tagged in its entirety. The se'..., several units in Building I, on the second floor, have been red-tagged, because of the rains that happened before and over the weekend.

So, that is a new development, of course. And so that beget..., is what takes us to the next step, which is the major repairs. So, the major repairs are what I described in terms of what we're trying to get as a proposal and then a permit approval tomorrow. It..., the one other thing that I'd like to mention is that the, the buildings onsite which are currently boarded up, there's a Hurricane Irma building, Building B, that is unoccupied. There are units in Building D and F and G which had fires in them, and so those have been remediated, meaning that once the fire hoses are done putting out the fire, you have to come in and you have to clean out the refrigerator, you gotta clean up all the wet material. We did, or Millenia and Riviera Beach, did discuss the fact that, 'Okay, we've got this big effort that's coming down the road, does it make sense to patch together units and then have people living in those units in Building B or the fire units, when it might make more sense to wait until the big effort because then you're just doing the work twice. It's a waste of money, it's putting people in possibly in harms way. So, those buildings are boarded up, the place doesn't look, uh..., it looks like a war zone, to be honest, when things are boarded up like that. I mean, I was in Building B in the past couple days because the task that Jeff Gagnon and Ladi March-Goldwire had asked of, of the, the architect and the project team is to essentially represent the plans that have been submitted with more accuracy, the existing conditions that you see on the site. So there's, there's your typical building, which is..., has a typical scope of work. And that typical scope of work is, and there's been talk about gutting to the studs. The, the..., what's been proposed to my knowledge, is not removing drywall and going down to the studs, it's actually taking the, the floor finish off, it's taking the lightbulbs and the light fixtures, the,

the bathtubs and the toilets, all the kitchen cabinets, removing all that and bring them back but without taking things down to the studs. But, the exception to that is that in Building B, the hurricane damage was so extensive that there's no drywall left because they couldn't leave a hazard where the drywall's wet and the.., it creates a moisture and mold situation. So, in that building, it is down to the metal studs and, therefore, the scope of work for that building is different than what the typical building is. And so, that's really been the discussions that the City and the development and architect team have been trying to hammer out over the past several months so that the, the.., the plans that were originally submitted and presented to the plans reviewer, would show a more typical condition and just highlighted a couple anomalies, let's call it, was not enough in the, in the eyes of the City. And I tend to agree with that.

And so, the, the task, as of our meeting last week, to the architect, has been to ta'.., essentially building an, an entirely separate set of drawings for Building B, in particular, but find a way to accurately and appropriately represent Buidli'.., or Unit G-203, which has a very unique condition, it's all burned up. So how are you gonna do that when everything else around it has a different scope of work because they're not all burned up? So, it's a very.., it's like, it's a bit of a puzzle that we're putting together that not only satisfies the City and the residents, which are.., which is the goal, but also that the contractor has something accurate to develop in terms of the scope of work. So, the [stammer] architect, after.., I went into Building B and spent half a day there yesterday so I could make sure that he understands where there's a cracked [stammer], a cracked sanitary pipe, and so he [stammer] represents that accurately, from one side of the building to the other, so that we've got that separate set of drawings so that it goes back to that third party plans reviewer, he makes, or they make their determination. If, as a whole, with the typical buildings, which the majority of the projects and these unique conditions, like Building B or G-203, or etc., that they're all represented and in that case, what level of alteration, level one, two or three, that falls under, then it's their decision as the hired plans reviewer to see how that falls under the code. And I think what's important is that, what we've been talking about since the initial meeting after the plans were submitted on November 5th, when we had our first meeting after that, Ladi March-Goldwire requested that, as she mentioned, she as code official, has the authority to request an address.., a way in which to address life safety on a property. That's a very grey area, um, as to how far you go. Do you.., can you request of a developer to spend \$10,000,000 more on a \$50,000,000 pro'.., \$15,000,000, project after the bank and HUD and so'.., some other people have already kind of accepted that, that scope of work that's at \$15,000,000? We.., so, we're trying to figure out where in that, in that additional scope we need to fall that addresses the City concerns, but also we get.., we enable the, the other partners in the project to sign off on it.

So, what the proposal is right now is, that we're working with Jeff and, and Ladi on is that the architect will revise it to reflect the existing conditions and if it's determined by the plans reviewer that it's a level one, that there is'.., there are call it a menu of items that increases the life safety beyond that minimum of what my.., a level might.., level one alteration might require. Just as a minimum. So, the first thing, which is something that was discussed with the Fire Chief over a year ago, which is a fire alarm and strobe system that's beyond the minimum required by level one, which essentially means that, if there's

a fire, all the smoke detectors in a particular unit that's on fire, all goes off at the same time, and also alerts a, a strobe that's on the front of the unit. 'Cause the problem from the Fire Chief's perspective is that when he's come onsite, he has not been able to identify what unit, or what a problem is, or what emergency that's going on, so they've been having to search around the 216 units. So, we got a proposal that was designed by the architect and signed off by the Fire Chief, that this combination of alarm and strobe system and interconnected smoke detectors is the best way that he'll accept, as a.., an improvement of life safety of the property.

We've taken the, the steps with the contractor to engage with local sprinkler contractors because, even though it might not be required by level one, it.., we need to make sure that there's the water pressure and the elements that will enable a sprinkler system. And if it makes sense, then we're going to offer that as well. But...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Mr. Sh'...

MR. M. SOLOMON:...so those are the points that we're discussing right now.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you, Mr. Solomon. [Pause]. Are there any other questions that you...

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: [Inaudible].

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...all have? Pardon?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: [Inaudible].

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Chair Pro Tem, you're recognized.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: One thing I want to point out is that the Building Official stated that you were way passed level one at this stage of the game, in the repairs that need to, to be made. And that, the third party reviewer that you brought to the hearing, is a Building Official that had worked here for twenty years and had not cited or inspected Stonybrook and it had been able to live to that condition into where we find ourselves today. The.., you are paying a third party reviewer, but yet, the.., it's kinda like you guys wanna get away from paying for as much as possible. You want us to review the pla'.., you have a third party re'.., reviewer that's gonna say what you want him to say, but you want us to review the plans without paying for a plan review, like every other contractor is asked to do. So, if our Staff is gonna review the plan, you're gonna have to live by our plan review, and you're gonna have to pay the price. Our plan reviewers don't have to go back and forth with your plan reviewers. If you want your guy, and you're paying your guy, or either you want our guy and you're pay our guy and live by what the plan review recommendations made by our Staff, not to ask us for plan review without an application, or to pay for that and then bounce them off with this guy, who used to work for us who never thought enough of the people in Stonybrook to inspect it and require that the previous owners keep it out of dilapidation as it is now. So, that's the guy that, that you're, that, that you have. So, you.., but, in everything that you said, I think part of the cost for you to do business, is going to be putting those people in temporary lodging that's safe

and decent, while you go ahead and do what you wanna do over there. If those people were out of there and you wanted to take your time and do your ultimate renovation to this building, then that's one thing. Do that. But, you still have to [stammer].., you provide safe and decent relocation. And, there should be a relocation plan that's approved by the City also. That's what we need to start requiring, a relocation plan. Not to give them ten, fifteen, twenty days. You don't make any repairs in the unit, but yet, you bring them back and shove them in the unit because you're tired of paying rent somewhere else. That shouldn't be.., that should be the case. So, you're not going to be able to have your cake and eat it too. None of us are in this situation. None of us are. We know you don't wanna double pay for, for patching it here, going back, gutting it and doing your ultimate renovation.

So, the only thing I would like to see, or to say is, if you're gonna put 'em in there, any contractor should be able to tell you how much time it's gonna be for the ultimate remodeling or renovation, and that's what you paid for and then move them back in. If we weren't trying to get away with not paying, or cut corners, we wouldn't, we wouldn't be having this conversation because I find it very simple to say, 'Hey, if I was a general contractor, it's gonna take me three or four months to do this, you're gonna need to move the people out of this building over here for three or four months, and we'll have you back online. Once you come back online, you move those people in and then you do the next building. So forth and so on. Or come up with your own relocation plan, one that is going to [pause] meet in the middle for you, and meet in the middle for the residents and, and the City.

But I wanna take this opportunity to thank my colleagues for agreeing to have Staff to bring us back a draft of an Ordinance that we can put in place for the entire City, and in that we'll have our own relocation plan and our own requirements. So thank, thank you all.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Madam Clerk.

7. ITEM NO. 7

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair, we're now on to No. 7.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: DISCUSSION AND DELIBERATION REGARDING AGENT OF RECORD RFQ PROCESS.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair, we do have public comment cards on this Item. The acceptance of public comment cards on this Item is now closed.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Madam Manager.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Madam Chair, during the December 19th meeting, Staff presented to you a contract for a new agent of record, which was the Gehring Group, however, that.., the motion failed due to a lack of a second, so we are here to get direction

from you on how you would like to proceed with the current process, if it's your desire to throw out that process and for Staff to start over. We are here to get those, those answers tonight.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Are there any questions from Council?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilman Davis, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: I, I wanna take care of the original issue, which my issue was, until we made a decision, that, that cancellation shouldn't have took place. I would like to see Bernstein reinstated retroactive to the date of the cancellation, and then we can discuss the other issue.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Is that a motion?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Madam Attorney?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: I make with a motion.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Second.

CITY ATTORNEY WYNNE: That would entail us entering into an emergency contract with Bernstein & Associates, which we can do.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Okay.

CITY ATTORNEY WYNNE: I don't know for sure whether it makes sense to be retroactive, whether there's anything you could.., you would do now, for those months that we haven't had an agent of record, or whether we should st'.., just start now and pick up with that scope of work until you all make a decision as it relates to the agent of record. A permanent decision. Because you still have that solicitation out there. And so, that's another issue that you're going to have to deal with.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Madam Chair?

CITY ATTORNEY WYNNE: But we can, we can certainly draft that emergency contract, bringing Bernstein & Associates back on as agent of record.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: And would be the length of the emergency contract, and how would that... I, I guess it.., you spoke about the final decision of the Board, so we don't have a timeframe, so to speak, as to how long that emergency procurement would be in place.

Councilman Davis, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Two things. Until we make a final decision on the agent of record, I wanna address [inaudible] because that's something that was too critical, the, the decision shoulda been brought before this Board to make that type of decision for us. So, that's why I present retroactive, 'cause it should've never happened without this Board' input.

Two, whatever this Board decides to do moving forward with it, I support what the governing body wants to do. But my motion was to approve it retro, back from the original cancellation date that should've been brought before this Board, understanding the critical issues that we have.., been going on. If that was something that was recommended, they should've brought it to this Board and say why they wanted to put it out, and then we coulda made a decision to support it one way or the other. And I have no problem supporting Staff, if that was.., if they could present that case but there's a lotta information that I'm sure the agent of record would have presented to us, or Staff, that would put us in a different position. But I just wanna try and make the, the correction with the whole process, how it was done. I have no problem with Staff, I just felt that shoulda been [stammer] Sta'.., our decision, considering the circumstances of everything that's been going on with the insurance issue.

That's all.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: I, I...

UNK: I...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...just need a, a, a point of clarification. Are you suggesting that each time a contract expires or is due for expiration, Staff needs to bring that back to us?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Or are you...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilman Davis...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: I was addressing...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: ...the fact that this is a unique situation, with the understanding there was some things taking place at the time when Bernstein was a month to month contract, we.., I know at least I was waiting for the investigation to come back for us to have a discussion about what took place on.., with the insurance issue. You know, there was a vote to make a decision with the Risk Manager which I thought we should've waited for all this stuff to come back before we took that vote, but I supported

what the Board wanted to do, but I wanted to make sure everything was completed before a final decision was made because I didn't want anything to jeopardize the integrity of, of what we were trying to do with the procurement of this process. This was a very unique situation, and that, that, that's all I stand on. I mean, any normal situation, absolutely not, but you're talking about an insurance matter, we had a lotta things taking place, we, you know., and, let... If it's critical., this was unique. This is something that don't happen every day. It was very clear that we had some things that we had to resolve, the Mayor took action on, on the matter which, you know, I have to respect. I wanted some more time to vet so I can the stuff to come back from the OIG, just the recommendation, then we can decide whether they recommendation based upon facts or based upon opinion that we can address the facts only, before anything takes place moving forward. And protect the integrity of the position, and that's how [inaudible], when you said we're gonna suspend Marie Sullen, I wanted her suspended with pay until everything was done. Because I didn't want an investigation to go halfway through and we act as if it didn't happen and someone come back otherwise, or confirming what the Mayor's, you know, saying.

So, I was just trying to protect the integrity of the process that we had in place.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you for your clarification. I just wanted to make sure that the statement that was made was not indicative of the fact that that was the expectation of us moving forward on contracts that expire. So, thank you.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Madam Manager.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: If I may, the OIG is not auditing the..., or doing a forensic audit on the agent of record, their forensic audit is on the offboarding process.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: [Inaudible].

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Doesn't that answer...

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: The OIG is performing a forensic audit on the offboarding process, or the termination when employees terminate from the City, they're not looking at the agent of record...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Well, the agent...

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: ...process.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: ...of record was directly involved with, with, with the information, if I stand corrected, right?

UNK. AUDIENCE: Right.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: They're not involved in the offboarding.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: They're not?

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: That's City Staff only.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: So the agent of record is consol'..., going back and forth with the City Staff on that issue? There's no communications between the two parties? At no point?

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Not that I am aware of.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Is that true?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Ques'... [Inaudible].

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Chair Pro Tem, you're recognized.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Madam Manager, wasn't...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: [Inaudible].

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: ...it stated earlier that the list of...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: [Inaudible] stated.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: ...that, that was..., that the list of persons that no longer worked..., that they were, that we were being..., that we were basically asking the company to take them off... We were basically telling the company, hey..., that they, they, they're no longer working for us? So, there were two processes, and one of the processes would tell..., would... We would tell them, 'Hey, this comp'..., this person is no longer working for us,' and that was a recommended process by the agent of record, that would make sure that we didn't fall into that. And if I'm not mistaken, it was called a list process, as opposed to another process?

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: That's correct. He did mention that but, if you remember, when the issue with the overpayment came up, it was Finance that pointed out that there was a difference between the number of employees that Aetna had on their list versus our terminated..., versus the actual employees that the City was paying for.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: That's what the agent of record [inaudible].

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: But, from t'..., but even..., but, you know, even though, I guess that's not the real issue form 2015 to, to now, it's Finance, it's Risk Management, it's HR, it's, you know, it's insurance...

MAYOR MASTERS: [Chuckle].

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Everybody, I guess, knew something about the overpayment. But all, all I'm saying is just trying to get some... Like, the Chair was trying to, to get some clarity on, on the role, or just the mere fact to..., that the agent of record

still somehow, everybody is till in'..., involved in..., involved in, in this process and we...

MAYOR MASTERS: Right.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: ...we need to keep it as..., we need to, to, to at least distinguish that one thing, if nothing else. The two dif'..., the difference between the two processes and which a..., the insurance company will, will look at our terminations, the one that you were saying that the OIG is doing a forensic audit on now, they're doing an audit on our..., on the process when, you know, I really thought that they were looking into...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: [Inaudible].

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: ...the figure itself and the amount of money, and what was..., how much was lost and, you know..., and that that..., the process would've, of course be examined, but the dollar amount as to what, you know, we actually lost, when did we start to lose it, how..., when did we first come about knowing that the overpayment was taking place? You know, all of that is what I thought that would be brought back to us in reference to the OIG's forensic report on that particular debacle.

MAYOR MASTERS: Madam Chair?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Yes, Mr. Mayor.

MAYOR MASTERS: Thank you. I just want to make sure that I put it on record. I just..., I, I, I just don't think the Bernstein company was treated, was treated justly or, or fairly. I don't see how in the world they could not have made the short list, period. And, I need to ask Mr. Bernstein this question. Do you feel that the evaluation that you received was biased and partial? And that you did not receive a fair chance to remain the agent of record? Please help me with...

MR. R. BERNSTEIN: Yes, sir. In fact, I have a copy. I'd very happy to share it with everybody up there. And if you see the certain questions that were asked, like, example, the project understanding. We got a seven. It said past experience, we got a seven. If you look at everybody else, [chuckle], they got anywhere from a nineteen to a fourteen, eighteen to a fourteen, and we're the ones that, that know the, the project. The new people bidding...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Madam Chair?

MR. R. BERNSTEIN: ...don't know what we know.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Point of order.

MR. R. BERNSTEIN: And, it said the experience of, of staff, the qualifications. Some people got six or seven points higher than us. And if you look at it, sir, it doesn't look like it, you know, and I'm not..., but, if you look at the numbers and you look at how it goes across the board, we made lines so you could all see it, uh, there's some things

that, that are questionable, in my mind...

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: [Stammer]...

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Madam Chair?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: [Stammer]...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Point of order.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Okay. One, one second. Both of you, one second. Pass this down.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Point of order.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: One, one minute, Mr. Davis. Okay. The.., Mr. Mayor, at.., I don't think we're trying to debate tonight whether or not Bernstein was being treated fairly, whether they did or did not, you know, make the short list. The reason for them having the presentation, was merely for them to show us what they had done for us in the past, and the services that they, they had been able to provide. If we decide to go back out for an RFP, they will then get to respond and show their wares, giving everybody else who responds, an opportunity to show their wares. So, we don't want them...

MAYOR MASTERS: I, I understand.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: ...to take this opportunity or this stage, if you will, to plead their case as to say they had been, you know, mistreated.

Now, if we, you know, the.., if we're going to, if we're going to have them serve as our agent of record for the time being, as Mr. Davis is proposing, that's one thing. We go ahead and we do that. But, I think it would only.., it only behooves us to stop here, decide whether or not we're gonna put it back out for bid, and allow everybody else to bid and everybody else to show their wares.

MAYOR MASTERS: That's fine. I just want it on the record because it sh'...

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: I think that that would be...

MAYOR MASTERS: It never should've happened this way.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: And, Madam Chair?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Um...

MAYOR MASTERS: I understand.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: One second, Madam Manager. Mr. Davis, was there something you wanted to say?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: I just wanted to stay consistent with the process that, you know, there's a bid protest process. So, I didn't want us to just..., to do this without going through that process.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Right.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: And, I think...

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: And that...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: ...you were speaking towards that with the, with the Mayor's point. I just wanted to make sure that I go on record on that, that, you know, that, you know, nothing against Mr. Bernstein. I have a great deal of respect for him, but there's a process for the protest process. I just wanna address the issue, currently, like, Ms. Wynne has stated, Attorney Wynne, about it, the emergency contract retro and get that issue resolved before I move..., moving forward on making a decision, period, because I don't wanna get away from the original decision versus about how we move forward, then, we can address that issue moving forward.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: And that's my very point, that we keep in, in a framework that doesn't take us out'..., outside of our scope, or our purview, what we have the right to...

MAYOR MASTERS: [Inaudible].

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: ...to, to govern at this stage of the game.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: [Inaudible].

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: So, that's why I was asking...

MAYOR MASTERS: [Inaudible], Madam Chair?

MAYOR MASTERS: ...the Mayor if we could...

MAYOR MASTERS: That's fine. Is there a motion on the floor ?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: ...shut that line of questioning down and allow the, the Madam Manager to have her comments now.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: That was one of the comments that I was going to make, that if Bernstein & Associates felt that they were treated unfairly, then we do have a protest process.

CITY ATTORNEY WYNNE: Which has passed.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Which has passed, right.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Mhmm.

MAYOR MASTERS: That's why I put it on the record. Madam Chair, I have a question. Is there a motion on the floor?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: It is a motion and a second on, on the floor to allow them to be the temporary agent while this goes out for bid. Did...

MAYOR MASTERS: I'd like to make a motion.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: ...I cite that correctly, Madam Clerk?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: It was retro.

MAYOR MASTERS: Maybe restore it, right? Retroactively.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: The motion was to make them the agent of record, to retro it. Nothing was mentioned about going back out, uh, putting it back out...

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: That would have to...

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: ...on the street.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: ...be a second motion?

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: That would have to be a sec'..., separate...

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Yes...

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: ...motion.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Yes, ma'am. Okay. So...

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: And that motion was seconded by Councilperson...

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: [Inaudible].

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: ...Botel.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Yes.

MAYOR MASTERS: Very good motion.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Okay. So we can... Excuse me?

MAYOR MASTERS: No. I was just saying, that's a very good motion [inaudible].

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Okay. So, if we can call that question and dispose of that part now.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Madam Chair?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Yes?

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: May I ask the maker of the motion if he would consider an amendment to keep them as agent of record until the OIG report is complete?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: I make that amended motion.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: I second that.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Okay. Let me say this, though, as she explained, the OIG report is not answering any questions...

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: But it will answer some questions...

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: ...to, to...

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: ...about what happened then.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: ...to what, to what happened, it's talking about our process of... There's two different things now.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: But I think it might uncover some things...

MAYOR MASTERS: Gives us some insight.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: ...that would be relevant.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: And, and okay. That's, that's...

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: He's amended it, and I seconded the amendment.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Okay. Madam Clerk.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Davis?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Yes, ma'am.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Botel?

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Pro Tem Hubbard?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Chair Davis Johnson?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Unanimous vote.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Okay. Thank you. Madam Char, the next part of this was going to be whether or not we were going back out for, for, for bid. That, that would have to be a second part. So, do you wanna take it from here or...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: You can continue on.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: The... Okay. Is there a motion to send this.., or, to send this out for bid?

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: I make a motion that we send out it for bid after the OIG report comes in.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Okay.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Second. Well, I guess it'll come back before us and we would discuss it.

UNK: Right.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Okay. Second.

MAYOR MASTERS: I thought that's what we were gonna do in the first place.

UNK: [Inaudible].

MAYOR MASTERS: Yeah. I'm, I'm good with it.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Right.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Ma'...

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Madam, Madam Manager.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: And, I must notify you that we met with the OIG and I think they gave a estimated time period of about six to eight months before the report is issued.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: From what point? Now?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: From now?

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: From... When did we meet? January? December? Early January?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Agent of record

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Madam Chair?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Yes.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: I can't see who's Chair.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: I am, right now.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: [Chuckle]. Thanks. So, it seems to me that, given the presentation we've had this evening, this Bernstein Group has been providing us with the excellent service. I don't think it's gonna harm... harm us in any way to keep them on as agent of record until we can see what... There might be things that are uncovered, and I just think that's up to us to say, 'Okay, let's wait until that comes in and then we'll go out to bed,' given that we have an agent of records that's done an excellent job for us.

MAYOR MASTERS: Absolutely.

UNK: Okay.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: So, that...

MAYOR MASTERS: [Inaudible].

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: And the second still stands?

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Yes.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Mr. Davis'...

MAYOR MASTERS: Madam Chair...

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: ...second still stands?

MAYOR MASTERS: ...and we freeze everything.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Okay. Madam Clerk.

MAYOR MASTERS: [Inaudible].

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Botel?

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Davis?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Yes, ma'am.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Pro Tem Hubbard?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Chair Davis Johnson?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Unanimous vote.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Thank you.

MAYOR MASTERS: Good.

[Inaudible comments]

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair, we did have public comment cards [chuckle] on that item.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: We did?

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Yes, ma'am.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Is there anybody that, they..., do they still wanna make the comments?

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: It's Tradrick McCoy. Mr. Tradrick McCoy, Ms. Bessie Brown, Mr. Willis Williams.

[Inaudible comments]

MR. T. MCCOY: Good evening. Am I allowed to speak because I think my comments are fruitful..., I mean, fruitless, at this point.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Well, there was an oversight, Mr. McCoy. You are welcome...

MR. T. MCCOY: But a decision has been made, correct?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: That is correct.

MR. T. MCCOY: I've only been here since about 6:00 o'clock, and I just think it's a little disingenuous that we find ourselves in this process again where decisions are made with no public input and I'm being asked to come speak now, so it really doesn't matter what I say.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Madam Chair?

MR. T. MCCOY: Wait, sir. Please allow me to finish my comments, because clearly you guys didn't respect the fact that we come in these meetings, wanna give input on how government is ran and what I seen tonight, this completely circumvents every evaluation committee, every advisory board, every process that's put in place when you decide to undo a recommendation, when you decide to let the agent of record come up here and present something to ultimately protest a decision that was made.

But, as far as I'm concerned, this should've been already done and over with when we selected a new agent of record. And I'll have you to know something, the agent of record is not paid by the City, so whether you know it not, he's still getting paid so you didn't have to do a motion to renew his contract. Essentially, the agent of record is already getting his residuals, so what you did was fruitless. And I think we're just kicking this can down the road and the IG has nothing to do with it. We have to start making good policy in Riviera Beach. And the last thirty minutes of allowing this guy to come up here and say that, was just completely fruitless. And the Garrett Group, they should file a lawsuit for you guys doing this because, completely what he did was inappropriate and to go in and try to address the scoring method, and for the Council to sit here and allow it, that's a problem. There's no integrity in this process when you can allow people to vote on Items and then make a recommendation, and then after they're not selected, come back on two separate Agenda Items and plead their case again. Now, how is that fair?

Those are my comments.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Bessie Brown, Willis Williams.

MR. W. WILLIAMS: I'm not gonna beat you up. It was, it was just a mistake and I, I was right there and it didn't bother me, so, I just want... My question is simply this, is that when you asked did they want a list, a progress report of the people that were not..., and they said no. That bothers me. I don't understand why they did not want that.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Mhmm.

MR. W. WILLIAMS: And again, Mayor Masters, this thing.., this discussion about this money that was spent or lost between the, the young lady who used to spend it. It goes deeper than that because there was some other people that should've been suspended on this, and this goes all the way down to... And, and this is why we have an internal auditor. City Manager, you need to have your internal auditor, as well as the OIG..., but he needs to do..., he [inaudible] every third Wednesday, first and third Wednesday, and I haven't seen nothing that he's come back and said to you guys, 'This is a problem in this City.' We're paying these people to come here for forty hours a week, and I never see a report done or nobody ask for a report from your internal auditor. What in the hell are these people workin'..., what are they doing? They're just coming in here, going to lunch and going home? This is ridiculous.

Again I say, you need to find out why did they turn down this list? Who turned the list down? Why did they..., why not did the..., if you were... If I was paying one of my

employees and subsequently I stopped giving him insurance, and still paid him and he wasn't around, somewhere in my, in my housekeeping there's a problem. It just don't seem fair to me that you, you put all this weight on that one person. You need to make sure the auditor do an investigation, 'cause there are people shoulda been suspended or fired behind this..., or lost that we're taking.

Thank you.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: [Inaudible].

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Madam Chair?

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Madam Chair?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Oh.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: One minute.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: [Inaudible]...

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: ...Did I hear... Oh. Okay.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Any other comment. I'm back.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: You shoulda told me you were back.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: [Inaudible]. I'm sorry.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Okay.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair, that completes Item No. 7. We're on to Item No. 8, unless Council has additional comments.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: I have on comment, Madam Chair.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Chair Pro Tem, you're recognized.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: When..., I hope that the public note that when the speaker started to go into the mechanism of the evaluation and the scoring method, we immediately shut that down and we asked the Manager..., the Mayor, excuse me, Madam Manager..., we asked the Mayor to discontinue that line of questioning and he did. We stopped the discussion immediately on the evaluation process. So, no we did not allow a bid protest to take place on, on the floor. When they started down that line of questioning, we want the public to know, that we immediately said that we're not gonna go in that vein. We're gonna stop that and take our vote as to their continuing, and where we're going to go, whether we're gonna go back out for bid or not.

So, I just want to clarify that because some people can say stuff over and over and the public'll think it's true, and that didn't happen here tonight.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Absolutely.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Ma'...

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Thank you.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Madam Chair?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilwoman Miller-Anderson, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: I, I do want to know if we could have the answer regarding that list bill being denied, Ms. Irving can provide an answer for that? Is she aware of that situation? You're not aware? That would be Ms. Marie?

[Inaudible comment]

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Okay. Would you [inaudible], Ms...

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: I'll, I'll ask...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: ...Madam Manager?

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Yes.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Thank you.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilman Davis, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: I was trying to, to let the speaker know that I was gonna ask the Council to take another vote after hearing the public comments and those considerations to have the Clerk call the vote again. Out of respect for the process, but unfortunately, you know, he was a little emotional and wouldn't allow me to try to help address the issue that he was complaining about. So, now we had public comment. I think it's only fair to the public, everyone that spoke, that we do..., we address the question again.

[Inaudible comments]

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Nah, nah. No. It's...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: It's done...

[Inaudible comments]

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: All ya gotta do is call the question again. That's it, with the understanding of the fact that we had public comments and our Staff made a gen'..., just a genuine mistake. I mean, it happens sometimes but that don't mean we can't correct it.

[Inaudible dais comment]

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: That's okay, we, we...

[Inaudible comments]

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: The, the...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: We just take...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...vote has been taken.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: ...two second.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: The vote has been taken [inaudible]...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Okay. Well, I stated it on record. So, I'm fine with it.

BOARD APPOINTMENTS

8. ITEM NO. 8

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair, we're on to Item No. 8.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: PLANNING & ZONING BOARD APPOINTMENT OF ALTERNATE BOARD MEMBER, MR. ANTHONY BROWN, TO A REGULAR BOARD MEMBER STATUS.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: We do have a public comment card on this Item. The acceptance of public comment cards on this Item is now closed.

[Inaudible comments]

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Who's presenting this? Will this be Mr. Gagnon?

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Yes, ma'am.

ACTING DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DIRECTOR GAGNON: Thank you, Madam Chair.

The Item as read into the record is somewhat self-explanatory. Mr. Brown has been an alternate member on the Planning & Zoning Board since April of 2017, and Staff is requesting City Council to move him to a permanent member position.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: So moved.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Second.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: It's been motioned and properly second. Public comment.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Tradrick McCoy.

MR. T. MCCOY: Good evening, Members. Tradrick McCoy. I am a candidate for Riviera Beach City Council, District 1.

Thank you. I've had the opportunity to serve as a member of the Planning & Zoning Board for [pause], since 2012. I think that's a little over six and a half years or so, give or take, and it's really a honor to represent the City in that capacity, and I really enjoy volunteering. I was reappointed back in June, and I serve on the board with a group of fine professionals, who I hold in high regard. So much so, I even offered to allow someone else to be nominated, but nobody seemed to have wanted the nomination to be the Chairperson. And I must say, you know, back in June, there was a understanding that there was gonna be some other applications of individuals because Ms. Hubbard so candidly pointed out that she had a, a list of people that wanted to apply. That's been eight months ago. And I think it's disingenuous that we have a Board Member, Mr. Anthony Brown, who ironically is in the industry, he's a professional surveyor, and he's in the alternate role. So, what that essentially means is, if a new board member comes on, they're gonna have voting rights and he's not. And I have an issue with that because that guy has came to the meetings, I mean faithfully. And I think it's more than, it's more than needed that he becomes a regular members. And the idea that we were gonna get some other applications, July, August, September, October, November, December, January, February. It's purely personal as to what happens in this City and how the politics works. It's not about Tradrick, it's not about any Councilperson Member. Let's try to do the right thing because it's the right thing.

Please appoint Mr. Brown because he is a diligent Board Member and we serve as volunteers. Maybe a thank you? A little appreciate goes a long way but he does deserve it and I would ask that you please appoint him as a regular member. And we have three vacancies. So, whoever those individuals are, Ms. Hubbard, there's still time before March 12th, you can get an application in to get 'em appointed, 'cause I am running for Riviera Beach City Council, and I'm asking the public to vote for me. And by the way, with great honor and privilege, I did get the PPA endorsement on Monday, so thank you and please vote Tradrick McCoy on Tuesday, March 12th.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Chair Pro Tem.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: The idea that there some dissention about Mr. Brown being appointed is absolutely false. While I can reali'.., [stammer] Mr. Tradrick McCoy's need to campaign in his three minutes of fame on TV, let's not be a blatant.., tell a blatant lie.

[Chuckle]

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: When Mr. Br'.., when it was brought to my attention that Mr. Brown was interested in serving in a prominent.., in a permanent role, I was all for it and said, by all mean, to have Mr. Brown to be the permanent person in that slot, as opposed to me going out to bring someone else. So, when it came to my attention that Mr. Brown had an interest, I had no problems with that. And for Mr. McCoy's three minutes, he got to show you exactly the kind of person he is.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilwoman Miller-Anderson, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: So, is he able to be put into the vacant...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Yeah. That's the motion.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: I thought it said alternate board...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: No. He's currently an alternate being asked to be moved into a primary seat, which would be a permanent seat.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Sorry.

Inaudible dais comments]

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: You see it now? Alrighty. So, Madam Clerk.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: I don't have my glasses.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: It's okay. Would you like mine?

[Chuckles]

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Davis?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Yes, ma'am, [inaudible].

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Botel?

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Pro Tem Hubbard?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Chair Davis Johnson?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Unanimous vote.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair, the last Item that was added on was the discussion and deliberation on the OIG report.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: It was a presentation. Thank you, Madam Clerk.

I just wanna state real briefly to the residents of Riviera Beach, in this great City, and take the next few seconds just to say thank you for those who have been reaching out and being positive through everything this City has been through.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: [Inaudible background comment].

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Yesterday afternoon, I received a email from the ethics commission to say that all charges and allegations are dropped, and that the OIG, based upon the facts, not their opinion, do not have grounds to.., any findings at all, between me and my assistant and the things they allege happened in The Palm Beach Post. So, I just want, you know, to encourage them to do a real investigation on the people that are trying to hold cities like Riviera Beach down, Belle Glade, Pahokee, Lake Worth, who continues to get hit by OIG reports. Remember, to make a recommendation. And while we try to do a professional thing, focus on the facts. And people should be making reports on the facts, not their opinions. And I just wanna say thank you to those with the ethics who did a professional job, looking at the facts and kept the integrity of the process. I want you to hear it from me, and you will continue to hear it from me, it is a hot election year and some folks have a different agenda, at that level and everyone cannot be ethical. But we did what we were supposed to do, we provided the proper response, and in that response, they saw right through the response and they understood it. Now, it probably will not get reported properly. The gentleman from The Palm Beach Post contacted me today and he stated that he reached out to someone, to the ethics commission, and no one would respond. So, here's the writer's story, we would like to find out where he's getting his facts from.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair, Mr. Lozman did put in a public comment card regarding that representation.

[Inaudible audience comment]

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: He's gone? Fane Lozman?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: [Inaudible].

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Let me thank you all for being here and remaining with us as long as you have.

DISCUSSION BY CITY MANAGER

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Discussion by City Manager.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Yes, ma'am. I have one Item that I would like to bring to your attention. I currently have over five weeks of accrued vacation on the books, that I need to use before April 19, 2019, which is my DROP date. There is a conflict between the DROP, DROP Ordinance and my contract as the City Manager. The DROP Ordinance states that I forfeit all my pa'.., all payment of sick and vacation time. We're talking about vacation time at this point. And my contract states that I must be paid out upon termination of the contract. So, at this time, I will be using my sick and vacation time if.., between now and April of 2019. April 19, 2019, that's five weeks [pause that I need to take. If I don't take it, then I lose it.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilman Davis, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Madam Attorney, do we have other options to address this matter?

CITY ATTORNEY WYNNE: Yes. The other option that you have, is to amend the Ordinance as it relates to that DROP position that discusses the forfeiture of sick and vacation time. And, we would amend to state that her contract prevails. It would only relate.., the amendment would only relate to our current City Manager.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: And, and it won't put us in any legal position.., from any other positions in the City?

CITY ATTORNEY WYNNE: That's correct.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Okay.

CITY ATTORNEY WYNNE: I spoke with the pension attorneys today. They've done it in the past...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Mhmm.

CITY ATTORNEY WYNNE: ...for a fired Police Chief in another jurisdiction.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Mhmm.

CITY ATTORNEY WYNNE: It can be done.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Okay.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilwoman Botel, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: I make a motion that we amend that...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Second.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: ...per the Attorney's advice.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Second that motion.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: It's been motioned and properly second. Were there... No, public comment cards. It's been motioned and properly second. Madam Clerk.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Cou'...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Question.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Cou'..., you have a question?

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: So...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilperson Miller-Anderson, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: So, we're amending this, you're not taking your vacation time? You were only gonna do that because you needed to use it? Or, are...

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Right.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: ...you still planning on taking...

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: I, I would...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: ...some time?

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: I would take some time, but not the entire five weeks.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: What? Four? What? How many?

[Chuckles]

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: One.

[Chuckles]

UNK: One week.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Don't know yet, or?

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: No. [Chuckle]. It may be...

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Depends on her [inaudible].

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: ...I don't wanna say, I'll be held to it, but... [Chuckle].

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: So, that'll come back to us and...

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Yes.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Okay. And we'll...

CITY ATTORNEY WYNNE: The Ordinance has to come back...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: [Inaudible].

CITY ATTORNEY WYNNE: ...on first and second reading, yes.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Okay.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Just make sure [inaudible]...

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: So, are we talking about the twe'..., are you gonna bring it back on the very next meeting?

CITY ATTORNEY WYNNE: Back on the 20th. I think...

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Okay.

CITY ATTORNEY WYNNE: ...we should bring it back as soon as possible.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: So, have your dates ready on when you're...

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Yes.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: ...planning...

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Yes, I will.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Madam Clerk.,

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Botel?

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Davis?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Yes, ma'am.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Pro Tem Hubbard?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Chair Davis Johnson?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Unanimous vote.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: And, Madam Chair, just one more thing. Dr. Robinson, District 7 School Board Representative, has requested that the workshop that she had originally scheduled for February 11th be moved until after the election. She would like to hold that workshop on April 8th. This workshop is with District 7 and the..., and school Board Administration.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Do you have any response to the any of the questions that were asked....

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: I'm sorry. What was..., when was it scheduled?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: April 7th.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: February 11th.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: It was originally scheduled for February 11th but she would like to have it on April 8th.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: But you wanna know now...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Yeah.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: ...if we can...

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: If you would just put it in your calendar, or let me know now if you're available. I, I'll...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: It's a Monday.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: ...send out an email...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: It's a Monday.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: ...to follow up.

[Pause]

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Okay. Well, we can send it..., if you, if you don't have it available, we can send our response to the, to the Manager.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Also, we've talked about the rain that occurred last week. There were several buildings, City buildings that were effected by the, the rain, so we would like to hold a workshop with you all to give you an update on, you know, moving forward with either construction..., looking at P3 again or just, you know, if you wanna just renovate this campus.

[Inaudible comment]

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: But, we do have a lotta, of water intrusion that we need to address. We're..., we've been piecemealing it. And if it's you all's desire to continue to piecemeal or, you know, just take care, care of it all in one..., at one time? So, I will be sending out an email regarding a workshop to update you all on the conditions of the buildings. As you know, I think I spoke with most of you all, but the City Manager's office will have to move over to the Public Safety building temporarily due to water intrusion.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Okay.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: That's all I have, Madam Chair.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Well, along the lines of you bringing back a workshop, the other issue that we have not addressed is the intended use of the infrastructure sales tax dollars. We have not identified specific projects and there has been money that has been forwarded over to the City, so we need to, in that discussion, include discussion on the infrastructure sales tax allocations, as well as the oversight committee. Those were things that we have just not done, that needs..., that need to be done.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: So, Madam Chair? So, can we add that to...

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Yes, ma'am.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: That's my request...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Uhuh.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...to add it.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Okay.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Mhmm.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Thank you, ma'am.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Yeah.

DISCUSSION BY CITY ATTORNEY

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Discussion by City Attorney.

CITY ATTORNEY WYNNE: Yes. Just an announcement for closed executive session. Pursuant to Florida Statute 286.0118(d) Public Meetings and Records, and it is a desire to obtain advice concerning litigation. I am requesting a time that the City Council's available for a closed executive session in the matter of Marisa Vega Trew v. City of Riviera Beach, Case No. 502017CA009339XXXMBAD. The City Council meeting is scheduled for Wednesday, February 20, 2019. Can Members of the Council meet prior to the regularly scheduled meeting?

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Do we have a...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: [Inaudible].

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: ...Utility Board meeting that night?

CITY ATTORNEY WYNNE: No.,

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: At 5:00?

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: The Utility Board meeting is the 25th.

CITY ATTORNEY WYNNE: Correct.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Oh, okay.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Huh?

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: I don't know why I had it in here.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: February 25th?

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Yes, ma'am.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: The 18th...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: No. The 18th is the...

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: The 18th is a holiday.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: That, that...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Oh, so we're pushing it to the 25th?

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Yes.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: No one's gonna tell us?

UNK: I know.

[Chuckles]

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: This..., what... Can you tell us what this case is or... No? Okay. Should we already know?

CITY ATTORNEY WYNNE: If that date works, I can continue with the rest of the announcement?

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: I don't...

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Sure.

[Inaudible discussions]

CITY ATTORNEY WYNNE: [Inaudible].

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Unfortunately, not at 5:00, for me.

CITY ATTORNEY WYNNE: A closed executive session will be held on the 20th day February, 2019 at 5:30 p.m., at City Hall Council Chambers, 600 West Blue Heron Boulevard, 2nd Floor, Riviera Beach, FL 33404. Those persons in attendance will be myself, City Attorney Dawn Wynne, Special Counsel Don Stephens, and Lonnie L. Olds, of Olds & Stephens, Mayor Masters, Members of the City Council, City Manager Karen Hoskins. The subject matter of the closed exec'.., executive session shall be restricted to settlement negotiations and/or strategy sessions related to litigation expenditures.

I have nothing further.

CITY COUNCIL COMMITTEE REPORTS

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Are there any Council committee reports?

[Pause]

STATEMENTS BY THE MAYOR AND CITY COUNCIL

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Statements by the Mayor and the Council. Mr.

Mayor, you're recognized.

MAYOR MASTERS: Thank you. Thank you, Madam Chair. I think my mic's off. It's back on.

I wanted to ask the, I guess the Manager? When are we going to have the educational sessions or workshops or whatever..., not workshops but, we're supposed to be getting something on Channel 18 as it relates to the four amendments, and giving both sides, or educating the public. Are there any immediate plans as it relates to the PSA's that we talked about? That the Council talked about?

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Madam Manager.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: The brochures are already available and being handed out. The PSA is also available. They were putting the finishing touches on that, and Walter, would you please peep out., I think we were supposed to receive a., the completed PSA either today or tomorrow.

MR. W. STEPHENS: [Inaudible].

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Oh, play it.

MR. W. STEPHENS: [Inaudible].

MAYOR MASTERS: No. I don't need to... I...

[Inaudible dais comment]

MAYOR MASTERS: I'm good.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: So, that's the final?

MR. W. STEPHENS: That's the draft. The final should be here tomorrow.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Okay.

MAYOR MASTERS: So, this is when we give both sides of each?

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Yes.

MAYOR MASTERS: And we give the pro and cons?

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: The pros and cons.

MAYOR MASTERS: Now, also, I guess the..., you or the Attorney, the Charter Review was sanctioned..., Committee was sanctioned by the..., by us, by the Council. So, when they present or give..., go out, are they under the same umbrella that we are, as far

as giving both sides of the issues? If they were sanctioned by the City as the, as the Council? If we speak,. We cannot be partial as Council Members or Mayor.

CITY ATTORNEY WYNNE: They're private cit'...

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: [Stammer]...

CITY ATTORNEY WYNNE: ...they're private...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: I just...

CITY ATTORNEY WYNNE: ...citizens. They're entitled...

MAYOR MASTERS: So, it's a private...

CITY ATTORNEY WYNNE: ...to their opinions.

MAYOR MASTERS: Even though they were sanctioned by us?

CITY ATTORNEY WYNNE: They're private citizens.

MAYOR MASTERS: Okay.

CITY ATTORNEY WYNNE: Yes.

MAYOR MASTERS: Alright. Moving on. The President of the United States gave the State of the Union message a couple days ago. As you know, it's traditionally been in the month of February, and I am presently working on giving the State of the City Address at, at some point. I., during the., when I spoke earlier as to respect the Chair, directing those comments to Ms. Clark, I did go back and I just wanted to make her., wanted her to know, it wasn't personal at all. I didn't mean to be disrespectful, if she took it that way and I personally apologize. So, I wanna say it publicly, to anyone else who heard that exchange.

Also, we're gonna be doing something that I don't think hasn't been done on this level. I think it's the first Friday in March, we will have about thirty colleges and universities in the local area, including some out of the local area, like, FAMU, and also Bethune, probably Morehouse, from Atlanta and others, with the Bible Institute, they have a satellite office here. We'll bring together about thirty-five colleges and recruiters for young people who are interested in going to college and university. This will be held at the Marina and, in addition to that, we will also have a technical part as well for those young people that would like to enter into some type of trade. We will have technical schools there, the unions, whoever they want to have., apprenticeship programs or whatever. That's going to take, take place as, as well.

I think that's it, Madam Chair. That's all I've, I've written down. Thank you. Family and Friends Night will be soon, the third Sunday., I'm sorry, third Thursday of this month. We are having two great bands that everyone likes, one is the Franchise Players., I

mean, Franchise something, and the other one is the Derek Mack Band. Very popular. And, and as a tribute to Renee Holmes. Thank you... and Black History Month.

Thank you, Madam Chair.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you, Mr. Mayor.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Did she die?

MAYOR MASTERS: That's it.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Did something happen to her?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Mr. Davis...

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: What happened to her?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...you're recognized.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Did something happen to her?

MAYOR MASTERS: Pardon me?

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Renee? Did something happen to her?

MAYOR MASTERS: No, no, no, no. Just, in honor of, of her. She's going through some things and we just...

[Inaudible dais comment]

MAYOR MASTERS: Maybe that's not the right word, but...

UNK. AUDIENCE: Honor.

MAYOR MASTERS: Honor. We wanna honor Renee Holmes for the work she has done in our community.

Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Mr. Davis, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: I just wanna...

MAYOR MASTERS: Educator Anderson. [Chuckle]. Thank you.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: I just wanna say thank you to the residents for being patient with us and, and being there with us through everything, the good and, and the bad. And, we have more good than anything, so we have to keep praising all the great things that we do in this City.

Just wanna also acknowledge, we have some great young men from Riviera Beach. You know, we have the NFL draft that's coming up soon. We also have the NCA signing day. A lotta young men who are getting ready to sign and go off to college, really soon. We have basketball season closing out, we have some young ladies who have been doing really well in basketball in the collegiate level. And, some is about to get some scholarships in the upcoming year, so I just wanna wish all of you well. As well as track and field season is in, which is my favorite season. Suncoast girls, go Chargers. Getting ready...

MAYOR MASTERS: Go Chargers.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: ...to make another run at the state...

MAYOR MASTERS: Go Chargers.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: ...championship this year. So, hopefully, you know, once this election is over with, we can dial it down and I can have some of my colleagues and kinda come and watch our young ladies get it on across the state. So, definitely invite you out.

MAYOR MASTERS: The Chargers, right? Go Chargers.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Yes. And that'll be all. I think enough's been said tonight.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you. Councilwoman Botel, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Thank you. Just again, a reminder that we have Singer Island Beach Polo coming on February 23rd. It's gonna be a really great event, and I hope everybody can come out and support it.

Also, wanted to let you know that the Riviera Beach Comm'..., there's a Riviera Beach Community event for you to learn and understand your proposed City Charter amendments on Wednesday, February 13th from 6:00 to 8:00 p.m., at 2831 Avenue S in Riviera Beach. So, it's important that you educate yourself about those amendments.

And that's all I have to say. Thank you very much.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: [Inaudible].

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilwoman Miller-Anderson, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Ms. Hoskins, I, I., I know I stepped out quite a few times. I'm not sure if you addressed the questions that may have come up during public comment, but the one in regards to the Stonybrook bus stops. , I know Ms. Bessie continuously asks about them. I remember that question did come up before and

we even drove by there.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Mhmm.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: And they're not there anymore, right? So, what... I know that has come up a few times and, you know, we even went out there but then I thought they said, when you..., somebody looked into it.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: I took a meeting with Mr. Williams of Palm Tran. He's no longer there, so I have requested a meeting with Mr. Clinton Forbes, who's the Director of Palm Tran. When I took the meeting with Mr. Williams, we discussed the proposed relocation of the bus stops and it was not to Congress, because I expressed to him that we have mothers with small children, and that was just too far of a trek to make. And so, I did reach out to Mr. Forbes who has agreed to meet with me, because the plan shows the bus stops being closer to...

[Pause]

MAYOR MASTERS: Stonybrook?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Closer Stonybrook, but almost near the [inaudible] sign for Harmony Heights, which is closer than where the bus stop was actually placed. So, he assured me that he would take a look at that and as soon as we have that meeting, I'll be able to report back. I'll send an email and the Manager can send that out, as it relates to the placement..., the proper placement of the bus stop as was originally proposed.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Okay. Thank you. And then for the paving on..., the patchwork..., well, the repaving...

MAYOR MASTERS: [Chuckle].

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: ...of .., resurfacing of Broadway, by Goodwill, do you by any chance..., did you get the answer and..., as to who did that? Did we do that or was it AT&T, or what organization?

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: I know the City didn't do it, so it was either AT&T or, or DOT.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Okay.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: But, I'll have to check with Staff. And I think it was DOT. I remember receiving a, an email.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Mhmm.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: But I'll, I'll have to double check.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Okay. And [pause] I think that is it for me. I just wanted to give an update regarding the Citizen Leadership Academy. We completed our fifth session on yesterday, and I appreciate all of the presenters, the department heads that have been coming. The participants have truly enjoyed your sessions. I know Mr. Sherman has been there, Mr. Blankenship, Chief Duren, Mr. Littles, Ms. Claudene. And, of course, a number of others but those that are here tonight, we truly appreciate you taking the time out. The citizens are very excited every week they come, and they're, they're looking forward to receiving the information that you all are presenting to them. So, thank you so much for that. And for those of you that are coming up, know that they do keep track of who gives the best gifts, so make sure that you [chuckle]...

[Inaudible comment]

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: ...come, come well prepared. They'll let you know if you don't. So. [Chuckle]. Ms. Claudene can tell you..., attest to that, right?

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Mhmm.

[Chuckles]

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: She gave a sticker. They said, 'No. Not a sticker.' She gave 'em a sticker. Yeah. But that's okay.

[Inaudible comment]

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: We understand, we got some budget cuts going around in certain places.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: [Chuckle].

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: But again, no seriously, we, we truly appreciate it, and they're there 6:00 to 9:00 o'clock every Tuesday night and they're very excited about coming and, and receiving that information. So, thank you again. And we have five more sessions, so. Those of you that are still out there that may want to participate, you are more than welcome to attend. Just provide me with a, a call or an email to let me know that you'll be coming so that we can be prepared for you when you come. Alright? And I appreciate all of you that have been attending. And some of you came for a second time, so thank you.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Chair Pro Tem, you're recognized.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Madam Chair and to the, and to the public, I wanna thank the Staff for the great job they did with the MLK celebrations, the senior citizen luncheon, the, the gala, our great speaker, even though she was from Suncoast. The [chuckle]..., the..., it, it was great and we...

MAYOR MASTERS: I hope she [inaudible]

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: We, we... Just teasing my colleagues. I'm from Gardens. Then we, we thank, you know, I just wanna thank Staff for the hard work that they did and everything that was, that was put into it. I wanna.., I, I do wanna caution the public, as well as the Staff to, to understand, environmental injustice is just as bad as social injustice, and when we sit around and we allow things that are not good for our health, in the short term and the long term, we con'.., we will continue to pay for it. You know, I am, you know, I, I support redevelopment but what we, what we, we're being asked to do as far as Stonybrook was concerned, that's a form of environmental injustice.

[Inaudible dais discussions]

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Some of the things that we talk.., and, what... And the other things that we talk about, I, you know, once we take a vote up here, I'll go along with it. While I don't support the polo on the beach, it's only because I think it's environmentally unsafe and unsound for the public and for.., as a whole, but I.., but if that's what, you know, the general public wants to see on a, on, on the beach, than that's what, that's what we shall have. So, I want to, I wanna caution us about everything that, you know, glitters is, is not gold and I thank everybody for coming out tonight to stand up for, and to support the people over in Stonybrook.

So, thank you and have a good night.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: And finally, on Friday, February 8th, we will celebrate the third annual Love is in Bloom in the community garden. All members of the public are encouraged to come out and visit the garden, see it as a venue. And this is an opportunity for you to network with your neighbors. This is an adult only event and we just look forward to having you join us.

ADJOURNMENT

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: And with that being said, we stand adjourned.

[Gavel]

[End Of video]

City Employees, Public Comment Speakers and Others

FANE LOZMAN.....MR. F. LOZMAN
REVEREND DR. TONY DRAYTON.....DR. T. DRAYTON
2-1-1 PROGRAM MANAGER RANDY GABRIELMS. R. GABRIEL
JUSTICE SERVICE CENTER MR. BULLARD
JUSTICE SERVICE CENTER BULLARD

BONNIE LARSON.....MS. B. LARSON
LLOYD BROWN.....MR. L. BROWN
BESSIE BROWN.....MS. B. BROWN
REVEREND WILLIAM H. BURRS.....REVEREND W. BURRS
DOUGLAS LAWSONMR. D. LAWSON
BISHOP THOMAS MASTERSBISHOP T. MASTERS
DANA JONESMS. D. JONES
EVELYN HARRIS CLARK.....MS. E. CLARK
SHIRLEY LANIER.....MS. S. LANIER
DORETTA PAULKMS. D. PAULK
WILLIS WILLIAMSMR. W. WILLIAMS
J.B. DIXSONMS. J.B. DIXSON
AMON YISRAELMR. A. YISRAEL
DR. PHILLIP DUKESDR. P. DUKES
BERNSTEIN & ASSOCIATES CEO RICHARD BERNSTEIN
MR. R. BERNSTEIN

INTERIM DIRECTOR PROCUREMENT RICKY LITTLE
INTERIM PROCUREMENT DIRECTOR LITTLE

HENRY TAYLORMR. H. TAYLOR
ACTING DIRECTOR DEVELOPMENT SERVICE JEFF GAGNON
ACTING DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DIRECTOR GAGNON

ANAND PERALAMR. A. PERALA
NOAM BROWN.....MR. N. BROWN
ADAM WASSERMANMR. A. WASSERMAN
CINDY MARCH.....MS. C. MARCH

SAMSON KPADENOVMR. S. KPADENOV
 DELORES WILLIAMSMS. D. WILLIAMS
 ERICA FRAZIERMS. E. FRAZIER
 MILLENIA LESLIE VARNER, ESQ.MS. L. VARNER
 BUILDING OFFICIAL LADI MARCH-GOLDWIRE
 BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH-GOLDWIRE
 ARCHITECT MATT SOLOMON.....MR. M. SOLOMON
 TRADRICK MCCOY.....MR. M. MCCOY
 WALTER STEPHENSMR. W. STEPHENS

APPROVED:

THOMAS A. MASTERS
MAYOR

TONYA DAVIS JOHNSON
CHAIRPERSON

ATTEST:

CLAUDENE L. ANTHONY
CERTIFIED MUNICIPAL CLERK
CITY CLERK

LYNNE L. HUBBARD
CHAIR PRO TEM

KASHAMBA MILLER-ANDERSON
COUNCILPERSON

JULIA A. BOTEL, Ed.D
COUNCILPERSON

TERENCE D. DAVIS
COUNCILPERSON

MOTIONED BY: _____
SECONDED BY: _____

L. HUBBARD _____
K. MILLER-ANDERSON _____
T. DAVIS JOHNSON _____
J. BOTEL _____
T. DAVIS _____

DATE APPROVED: **MARCH 6, 2019**