

**CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH
REGULAR CITY COUNCIL MEETING
January 16, 2019
6:00 p.m.**

PRESENT AT MEETING¹:

THOMAS A. MASTERS MAYOR MASTERS

CHAIRPERSON TONYA DAVIS JOHNSON DISTRICT 3
CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON

CHAIR PRO TEM LYNNE L. HUBBARD DISTRICT 1
CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD

COUNCILPERSON KaSHAMBA L. MILLER-ANDERSON DISTRICT 2
COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON

COUNCILPERSON JULIE BOTEL DISTRICT 4 COUNCILPERSON BOTEL

COUNCILPERSON TERENCE DAVIS DISTRICT 5. COUNCILPERSON DAVIS

CITY MANAGER KAREN L. HOSKINS..... CITY MANAGER HOSKINS

CITY CLERK CLAUDENE L. ANTHONY CITY CLERK ANTHONY

CITY ATTORNEY DAWN S. WYNN CITY ATTORNEY WYNN

TRANSCRIBED BY:

Legal Transcription, Etc., LLC
931 Village Boulevard
#905-148
West Palm Beach, FL 33409
(561) 429-3816
(561) 584-5044 (fax)
jreitano@legaltranscriptionetc.com

¹ List of City Employees, Public Speakers and Others on Page 153

**CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH
PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA
CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
HELD IN THE CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS
DECEMBER 19, 2018 @ 6:00 P.M.**

(The following may contain unintelligible or misunderstood words due to the recording quality.)

CALL TO ORDER

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Good evening. I'd like to call the Regular City Council meeting of January 16th to order.

ROLL CALL

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Madam Clerk, roll call, please.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Mayor Thomas Masters?

MAYOR MASTERS: Present.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Chairperson Tonya Davis Johnson?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Here.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Chair Pro Tem Lynne Hubbard?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Present.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson KaShamba Miller-Anderson?

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Present.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Julia Botel?

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Here.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Terence Davis?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Here.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: City Manager Karen Hoskins?

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Here.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: City Clerk Claudene Anthony is present. City Attorney Dawn Wynn?

CITY ATTORNEY WYNN: Here.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: You may proceed.

INVOCATION

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Let's stand for a moment of silence, followed by the Pledge of Allegiance, led by Council Member Miller-Anderson.

[Moment of silence]

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: I pledge allegiance to the Flag of the United States of America and to the Republic for which it stands, one nation under God, indivisible with liberty and justice for all.

AGENDA APPROVAL

ADDITIONS, DELETIONS, SUBSTITUTIONS

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Madam Manager, do we have any additions, deletions or substitutions?

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Madam Chair, I do have a., I would like to pull Item No. 5, which we would have to., we need to change the date. Item No. 5 is Resolution No. 2-19. A Resolution of the City Council of the City of Riviera Beach, Palm Beach County, Florida, approving the City of Riviera Beach to host three events in conjunction with Game On race events, and we need to change the dates on that Item.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Further Staff review.

UNK: Mhmm.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Anything else?

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: That's all I have, Madam Chair.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC SHALL BE GIVEN A TOTAL OF THREE MINUTES TO SPEAK ON ALL ITEMS...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Madam Chair? Is., that's additions?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Pardon?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Was that additions?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: She was deleting an Item for...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Oh.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...correction.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Are we doing additions, at this time?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: I needed to go back and do the disclosure, and then...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Then... Okay.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...I'm coming back to it, if that's okay?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Okay. Threw me off [inaudible].

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Okay.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC SHALL BE GIVEN A TOTAL OF THREE MINUTES TO SPEAK ON ALL ITEMS LISTED ON THE CONSENT AGENDA. ANY PERSON WHO WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON A CONSENT AGENDA ITEM, PLEASE FILL OUT A PUBLIC COMMENT CARD LOCATED ON THE TABLE DIRECTLY OUTSIDE OF THE COUNCIL CHAMBERS AND GIVE IT TO THE STAFF PRIOR TO THE ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Alrighty. Are there any additions, deletions or substitutions, or Items...

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: [Inaudible].

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Madam Chair?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Go ahead.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Mr. Da'.., Councilman Davis, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Thank you. I have three additions. The first one is for the MLK Gala for \$1,375 for tickets for the members of the Lindsey Davis Club, Members Club. [Pause]. To offset costs for those tickets. And Staff, the names will be provided later from the Lindsey Davis Center.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilwoman Miller-Anderson, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: For the legal name of the organization, that...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Should be recreation.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Okay.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Yeah.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Parks & Rec.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Parks & Rec, yes, ma'am. So, it'll be an inter department transfer for that amount.

MAYOR MASTERS: How much was that?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: \$1,375.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: \$1,375.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Chair Pro Tem, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: I, I had two more.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Oh, I'm sorry.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Okay. The other Item is, as we're all aware off, with the government shutdown, there's a, a lot of tension and a lot of uncertainties about what's going on across this country, and I wanna propose, under discussion, for the Council to talk about a process that would aid and assist employees..., not..., assist residents effected by the government shutdown, and we'll get into the details in discussion.

And, under discussion as well, as a Member of Council, I have been recently..., received many complaints about the increased insurance rates across the City. I would like to have a discussion on creating a ta'..., task force to address that issue. Reducing the insurance rates.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: One moment.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: What insurance? Like, pro'..., what insurance?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Yeah. Property insurance, auto insurance.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Any insurance.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Any insurance. Yes, ma'am.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: [Inaudible].

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Homeowners. Flood.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: So this isn't insurance that's related to the City, this is insurance related to our personal?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: This is for the entire..., that covers the entire City. I'll get more into the details.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: So the issue is insurance that you want to discuss?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Insurance increases.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: We have a national flood insurance program and those results are, are back but I wanna talk about a task force and how we can structure a task force to help reduce some insurance rates, for our community.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Madam...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Chair Pro Tem, you had a question?

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: What...

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Yes. I wanted...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Oh. I'm sorry.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: I wanted to pull Item No. 6 from the Consent Agenda.

[Pause]

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilwoman Miller-Anderson?

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: I was going to ask for the one..., those that were just added, is it 16A or is it 17 or 18, or what is it?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Madam Clerk, will you give us the..., will you give us the...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: And...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...numbers associated with the additional Items under discussion and deliberation?

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair, the first Item that Councilperson Davis added was a community benefit, so that will be 13A. And, as it relate to the discussion on the government shutdown assistance, that will be 16A, and the creation of a task force regarding insurance rates, that will be 16B.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Okay. And Madam Chair? We're pulling now? You wanted to pull something?

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: No. 6. She said...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Go ahead.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: No. 4.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Anything else?

MAYOR MASTERS: Yes. Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: One moment, Mr. Mayor.

MAYOR MASTERS: Oh, alright.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: No, I'm done.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: You're done? Mr. Mayor, your recognized.

MAYOR MASTERS: Thank you, Madam Chair.

Mr. Davis, on the community benefit for the Lindsey Davis senior, I, I was.., wasn't paying attention too much when you were talking about it. Can you, because I may wanna share with you on that, what, what was the.., what was it for?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Tickets for the gala on Friday night.

MAYOR MASTERS: Okay. I really think that's something that perhaps all of us probably wanna consider because our seniors are our valuable, I don't wanna asset, but they're our bridge builders and they're our golden.., at the golden age and I, I just like the fact that you're doing that, and anyone else, that would like to help to make sure that they're there. I would.., I'm wondering if you would accept me to pay half of that?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: That's fine.

MAYOR MASTERS: Okay. Madam Chair, I would like to.., what would that be? You, you.., you're, you're mathematically calculatable than I am.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: No. You're good, you're good.

MAYOR MASTERS: [Chuckle]. Is it about \$650?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: [Inaudible].

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chari, that would be \$687.50.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: \$687.50., Correct.

MAYOR MASTERS: Okay. That's what I will agree to.

Thank you, Madam Chair.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: District 3 has a request for a table for the gala, I believe, and we will receive an invoice and we will process the payment accordingly. Invoice not...

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: [Inaudible].

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...card. Invoice.

[Chuckles]

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Alrighty. So, we have the order of the revised Agenda.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Yes...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Is that...

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: ...Madam Chair.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...correct? Alrighty.

DISCLOSURES BY COUNCIL

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Any disclosures?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilman Davis, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: I think it was on Item No. 6, the vendor. Is that the one for the foreclosure registry?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Mhmm.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: The one...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Yeah.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: ...I pulled.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Yes. I, I have had a discussion with, numerous discussions with the vendor to talk about, to learn more about the program, as well as a economic development initiative that they're working on, to help the City out. But, I met maybe three times with the vendor.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Okay.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Mhmm.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilwoman Miller-Anderson, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: I had a discussion with Mr. James, for Item No. 14.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Oh. Yeah. So did I. For 14.

MAYOR MASTERS: 14?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Yeah. [Inaudible].

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: So did I.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: So did I. We, we, we all were contacted, I believe.

MAYOR MASTERS: [Inaudible].

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: [Inaudible].

MAYOR MASTERS: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Mr. Mayor, you're recognized.

MAYOR MASTERS: Thank you. I, I do want to put on record, and to notice the public that I was invited by Pastor Altidor, along with other pastors and ministers of this area, and, and the county, as his guest, and on his dime, as well, to go to Haiti for about the fifth..., it was probably about the sixth time. The first time was with Reverend Jesse Jackson. And what he is accomplish'..., trying to accomplish, is a reconciliation between pastors, minis'..., ministers and elected officials. So, while there, as Bishop Masters, I had a opportunity to meet with, and confer with, several bishops, apostles, pastors, religious leaders, as well as elected officials. And, they headed up to meet with the prime minister, and the person that is like the Mayor of all the Mayors in that area, were able to, again, sign a sister city relationship with Port-au-Prince, and with Riviera Beach, 'cause we have a large number of Haitian brothers and sisters that live here in this area.

Thank you, Madam Chair.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you, sir.

ADOPTION OF AGENDA

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Motion to adopt the Agenda.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Madam Chair, before you...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Chair Pro Tem...

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: ...adopt the...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...you're recognized.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: I, I need to check one more thing for... Okay. Alright. It's, it's there. Thank you.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: So moved.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Second.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: It's been motioned and properly second. Are there any public comment cards on the Consent Agenda?

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair, this is the motion to approve the Agenda, ...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: The Agenda.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: ...amended.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: I'm so sorry. I'm ahead of myself.

MAYOR MASTERS: [Chuckle].

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: That's...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: I apologize.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: That's okay.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: [Inaudible].

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Davis?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Yes, ma'am.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Botel?

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Pro Tem Hubbard?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Chair Davis Johnson?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Unanimous vote.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you.

COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC ON CONSENT AGENDA (THREE MINUTE LIMITATION)

CONSENT AGENDA

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ALL MATTERS LISTED UNDER THIS ITEM ARE CONSIDERED TO BE ROUTINE AND ACTION WILL BE TAKEN BY ONE MOTION. THERE WILL BE NO SEPARATE DISCUSSION OF THESE ITEMS UNLESS A COUNCILPERSON SO REQUESTS, IN WHICH EVENT, THE ITEM WILL BE REMOVED FROM THE GENERAL ORDER OF BUSINESS AND CONSIDERED IN ITS NORMAL SEQUENCE ON THE AGENDA.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: We have pulled all the Items and taken care of that.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: We have three Items that still remains on the Consent Agenda, Madam Chair.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: I am aware. I'm just...

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Okay.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...making a comment.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: That's okay.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: So, motion to approve the Consent Agenda.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: So moved.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Second.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: It's been motioned and properly second.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair, we do have two public comment cards on the Consent Agenda. The acceptance of public comment cards on the Consent Agenda is now closed. Bonnie Larson, Lloyd Brown.

MS. B. LARSON: Bonnie Larson.

For those who aren't here or don't have the Agenda, Item No. 4 on the Consent Agenda was the culmination of the Channel 5 lawsuit against Riviera Beach. And, coincidentally, I have an issue with this, so that's why I'm gonna talk about it now. It.., we're gonna end up paying Channel 5 \$50,0009 for their, all their work and their.., to include their lawyer fees. I'm sure it was a lot more than that, and I'm sure we've paid a lot more than that. And it's interesting that on this backup, nobody wanted to sign this agreement. It's here. Let me just make sure I have it right. Okay. And, on the very last sheet, it's reviewed as to legal sufficiency by Andrew Degraffenreidt. He left here on the 11th, so we're kinda behind here. It says Degraffenreidt on here. We have a new Attorney, she's here tonight. Ms. **WYNN**.

[Inaudible comment]

MS. B. LARSON: And, this was reviewed, the Item was reviewed by only one person. It says Attorney Dorothy Mitchell. Dorothy Mitchell's a very long time employee here but she's certainly not the Attorney, and this was not approved by the City Manager, it was not approved by Mr. Sherman, the budget guy., So, there's a lot of funny things about this.

My issue with public records, is I've had an issue all along, and I have to give the Clerk's office a D, as far as supplying public records to me. I went this week to pick up something I had left there last week or so. I always have to wait about a week and I have to allow an hour for when I go there to pick up something. Should be just like this, I put it in, you get it ready, I come over, pay for it, boom, I'm out the door. That doesn't happen. This time, we took twenty minutes. Ms. Claudene knew she had a letter to me, it was an unopened letter. I don't know how I didn't get it, but she tore it open while I was there, saying I'm not gonna get any more public records requests because I haven't paid my \$54 bill. Somewhere in that, in that vein. Now, what happens is, when I go and ask for

public records, almost every time, I get something different, I don't get what I asked for and then there's a \$20 surcharge for deleting somebody's social security number and their address. No. By the time those documents get to you, the address and the, and the social security number have been deleted, but I'm being billed for it. And now, I'm being told I'm not gettin' anymore public requests until I pay that. It was not what I wanted in the first place. I'm just, I'm just tired of it. I'm tired of it.

[Inaudible comment]

MS. B. LARSON: When I, when I ask for a contract, I have to now say every single time, I want the final contract, I want a signed copy of it and I don't want..., don't give me a draft. And I said let's just make that mandatory, every time I ask for something like that, I want the final, with a signature on it. I don't wanna wa'..., waste my time reding drafts. I was told, 'No. You have to put that on there every single time.' I have heard, I think, all the excuses in the book. I think. But then I come back and get another excuse. I'm tired of it. And I understand Tradrick McCoy has filed a lawsuit. Riviera Beach was found guilty...

[Timer]

MS. B. LARSON: ...guilty of not doing this. I think we could file a class action lawsuit, as far as not receiving public requests. I'm tired of it...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you, Ms. Larson.

MS. B. LARSON: ...and the City needs to do something. Riviera Beach was found guilty of it. We need to do something.

Thank you.

[Inaudible audience comments]

MR. L. BROWN: Hello. My name is Lloyd Brown. And...

MAYOR MASTERS: Good evening.

MR. L. BROWN: I guess on this thing, 4, and I'm just wondering, you know, like, when I go to the bank, they take out a certain amount of money for this, and they take out a certain amount of money for that. But like, you know, I usually spend money on the side, you know, wasting it, like, spending it on beer or soda, whatever. But what I'm saying, I have bills that I have to pay. So like, if I keep buying alcohol all, all the time and having fun and not worrying about, you know, the whole structure of where I live, I mean, it's like the City, you're gonna give \$50,0009... Who is that coming from? I mean, is there a department that's gonna be short, or is the citizens, are we gonna be short? I mean, like, I need to get in line for one of these lawsuits 'cause it seem' like it's constantly coming up. Every other week you got a lawsuit coming at Riviera Beach.

And then, I can understand what the guy, Travis, talking about, McCoy. You know, I'm not sure that's his name, but all I'm saying is, is, is everybody up there looking in everybody's back pocket to see what they got? You know? But like ya'll, ya'll are in a

race, but ya'll not together so it's like.., even the people that's coming in, let me tell you something, I mean, \$50,000 is a lotta money. Where is it coming from? What department is gonna be short? Is it gonna hurt the citizens, or who is it gonna hurt? Or should, I mean, people in the Council, when you get things like that, that happen, maybe you oughta pay those things yourself. I mean, you can always pay in installments, 'cause, I mean, the City, we're getting tired of paying all these lawsuits. Like, the lady just said that came up here, I just don't understand it.

You know, okay, it is.., this is another situation too. Alright, I'm glad that we have the right to vote, but I mean, why would you wanna vote for somebody who's spending money on you like that I mean, I wouldn't even wanna catch a cab if every time I caught it, it's gonna be a real high bill to where I can't afford it because I got other things that I have to worry about. But it seem like ya'll really don't care about nothing. You know, I mean, it's gonna effect you, especially if you don't have to pay it. And okay, I'mma.., I'm not even a registered voter and, you know, looking at you people, you make me think there really ain't no reason. You know, where you think you've been getting your votes for, when all us felons been out there not voting? You wa'n't gettin' it from us, so apparently the people who put you in there, they know who they can manipulate. That's why you're in here, 'cause the felons.., I mean, because you pat us on the back and say we got our right to vote, that don't mean we're gonna vote for ya'll because it'll be crazy. I'd rather wait two years, three years and see what happens before I vote for anybody. 'Cause like there're people coming out, they're just coming in. it's like musical chairs, nobody wants to do anything to help the people. Everybody wants to do something for themselves. I mean, you wanna get mad with Channel 12, Channel 5, whatever, and all these lawsuits we're getting, that's not even right, 'cause you don't have to pay it. So, you love that. If you had to pay it, I bet you wouldn't like it.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: That concludes?

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair, that concludes public comments on the Consent Agenda.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you. Item No. 4?

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: I need to call.., we need to call the vote.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Oh.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: For the Consent Agenda.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Oh. [Inaudible]...

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Botel?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: I thought we voted. [Chuckle

[Pauses]

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Botel?

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Davis?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Pro Tem Hubbard?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Chair Davis Johnson?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Unanimous vote.

MINUTES

1. MINUTES OF THE REGULAR CITY COUNCIL MEETING HELD DECEMBER 5, 2018.

CITY CLERK CLAUDENE ANTHONY (561)845-4090

2. MINUTES OF THE REGULAR CITY COUNCIL MEETING HELD DECEMBER 19, 2018.

CITY CLERK CLAUDENE ANTHONY (561)845-4090

3. MINUTES OF THE SPECIAL CITY COUNCIL MEETING HELD DECEMBER 21, 2018.

CITY CLERK CLAUDENE ANTHONY (561)845-4090

RESOLUTIONS

4. CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Item No. 4

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: RESOLUTION NO. 1-19. A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH, PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA, AUTHORIZING THE STIPULATED FINAL JUDGMENT IN THE CAE OF SCRIPTS MEDIA, INC. V. THE CITY OF RIVERA BEACH, ET AL., CASE NO. 50-2018-CA-001557, AUTHORIZING PAYMENT IN THE AMOUNT OF \$50,000 AS COMPLETE SETTLEMENT, AND PROVIDING AN EFFECTIVE DATE.

CITY ATTORNEY DAWN WYNN (561)845-4068

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Is there a motion?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: So moved.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Is there a second?

[Pause]

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Second for discussion.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair, we do not have public comment cards. The acceptance of public comment cards is closed.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Than you. Did you want a presentation?

[Inaudible dais comment]

CITY ATTORNEY WYNN: Madam Chair, we have Mr. Torcivia who handled this case for us, and he's available to answer any questions.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Presentation [inaudible].

[Inaudible dais comments]

MR. G. TORCIVIA: Good evening.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Good evening, Mr. Torcivia.

MR. G. TORCIVIA: Good evening, Madam Chair.

Briefly, this is the matter where Scripts sued the City seeking various text messages. The City went through a process to identify and turn over all the messages that we could find. There were some that were not locatable. So, the City's also gone through a process of trying to ensure that future text messages are gonna be saved. We reached an agreement with Scripts that we're prepared to submit to the court that would settle the case, with no admission that anyone did anything wrong, other than acknowledging that by not providing the records in a timely way, 'cause it did take a couple months to get the records, that the City will pay part of Scripts legal fees of fif'.., equaling 50,000.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilwoman Miller-Anderson, you're cognized.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: So, I wasn't there during the closed executive session, and I'm not sure of how much you can or cannot say. [Stammer] I'm not sure. So, with the settlement, we're basically saying, 'Hey, we don't have them, can't find them, we're sorry, we'll pay your fees,' and that's it?

MR. G. TORCIVIA: That's a good summary of it actually.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Okay.

[Inaudible audience comment]

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: So, but the issue, technically, is not really resolved other than we don't have it, and we can't get it. So, in the future, you said that there have been things put in place to retrieve...

MR. G. TORCIVIA: There's...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: ...any additional matters that may occur?

MR. G. TORCIVIA: Yeah. There were two.., one, I know is in place. The other one I'm not sure if it's been implemented yet. I know it was in your budget that was approved. The first one was to capture as many text messages as possible. The only ones that are not, I'm not saying not being captured now but were difficult, was if you send a text message from one iPhone to another iPhone using what's called iMessaging, that message will not be captured. So, if you send a text message from an iPhone to an Android phone, it would be captured, for example.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: So...

MR. G. TORCIVIA: So, there is software available. Ms. Hoskins and I met with the individual from the IT Department a couple months ago, and he said that it had been approved in the budget and they were going through the process of procuring that software, that would capture all text messages. Actually, what it would do is it would disable the iMessage function on City iPhones. So, if you had an iPhone and were texting me with an iPhone, it would go through, but would go through the normal text messaging world, not the iMessaging world. And I don't know whether that's been implemented yet. I know it's been budgeted, I know that IT was gonna order that system. I just don't know, operationally, whether it's been implemented yet. But it's certainly well on the way. And once that's in place, then all messages should be captured, just the way emails are captured.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Now, my question is, in, in other.., not another case specifically, but in a case where it's a public records case, and if records are not presented to the person that asked of them, is that the norm, to... Say it's something you don't wanna give, and you, you say, 'We don't have it,' or they.., 'We couldn't locate it,' or, 'this is all we have,' and you settle and that's it, and that's the end of it?

MR. G. TORCIVIA: Well, what, what, what's difficult is, since we didn't have certain records, there was no realistic way that either side could prove whether those records are public records or not. Not every text message or email that a public official, a public employee sends, is a text message, I mean, is a public record. So, for example, if you text your spouse, 'I'm on the way home, what do you want for dinner?,' that's not a public record. Even if you're using a City phone or a City email account. But without being able to retrieve those messages, and again, we went back and retrieved as many as we could, we got about forty-five percent of the messages. We were able to find them. But, the ones that you couldn't find, neither side would be able to ultimately prove were they or were they not text messages? And, that was a path that I don't think either, from a

lawyer's standpoint, neither lawyer wanted to run that risk of trying to have a judge decide these unknown records, were they or were they not public records?

So, that's, I think really where, from the lawyer's standpoint, we both said this is almost an impossible case for either one of us to prove. You're gonna spend a lotta money litigating, were they or were they not public records, when there's no proof either way.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Does that conclude your questions for now? Councilman Davis, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Thank you so much.

Mr. Torcivia, thank you. Real briefly, I wanna make sure that, that all the proper information is, is given out clearly and thoroughly about the public records law and what actually, really took place. There was a public records request from Scripts, correct?

MR. G. TORCIVIA: Correct.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: To my phone? Once the public records request was submitted, I was contacted by the City Attorney, Andy Degraffenreidt to make sure that I turn my phone in...

[Inaudible comment]

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: ...to IT, to receive text messages. [Stammer] is that consistent?

MR. G. TORCIVIA: That's true.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: I took my phone over to IT, and gave them the phone, and said I would be back to come pick the phone up after you screen the phone, get the information off. And then we can make sure the Clerk get it, then Legal get it, an Scripts get it. Correct?

MR. G. TORCIVIA: Yes.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Went back to pick, up the phone and the gentleman from IT said, 'Okay. I got everything. It's here on the junk drive.' At that time, I said, 'Well I can deliver the junk drive to the Clerk's office, so we can make sure it's done.' He said, 'Well, typically usually do that.' Is that correct?

MR. G. TORCIVIA: That's..., what he indicated to us is that he had scanned it, put it on a jump drive.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Mhmm.

MR. G. TORCIVIA: But, as you know, ultimately... Well, you can...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Okay.

MR. G. TORCIVIA: ...continue.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: So, I just wanna make sure the story's told and correct, and it's told properly what happened in this City. I then was under the, the understanding that my phone was scanned, all text messages were received, information was given to the Clerk's office, it went to Legal, and Scripts received it. Weeks went by, weeks went by, weeks went by. I get a phone call one day from the City Attorney's office and what did he say?

MR. G. TORCIVIA: That the scan apparently, at least with the IT gentleman at the time, said was that that scan apparently was not successful, he didn't recall 'cause he didn't look at the time to see whether or not it had been successful or not, and he wasn't able to provide the jump drive that he had said that he put it on.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: And that's after he told me that it was successful.

MR. G. TORCIVIA: That, that was a month or so after...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Right.

MR. G. TORCIVIA: ...your phone was scanned.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: So, a whole month went by after... Now, he told me that the pho'.., it was scanned and it was successful. So I walked away. I did my job. Okay? It went to a Staff member. Then once the Clerk got involved with getting the information, he then started backpedaling. Let's be clear here, I wanna make sure folks understand, I did my job. I did what I was supposed to do in this whole process. I stayed quiet because I understood there's a legal way of doing things and having to protecting the integrity of the City. This individual lied about scanning my phone to me, and lied to the Clerk's office and lied to Staff. And did they resign?

[Inaudible audience comment]

MR. G. TORCIVIA: Well, I don't wanna comment on whether that person was telling the truth or not 'cause I don't know him well enough to say that.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Well, based...

MR. G. TORCIVIA: But he.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: ...upon...

MR. G. TORCIVIA: ...but he has resigned..

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Based upon the documentation that was submitted...

MR. G. TORCIVIA: But he has resigned.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Thank you. I just wanna be very clear to the public of Riviera Beach, when we make decisions in the City, I take this City, this is my home and I love it. And, I did exactly what I was asked to do. Weeks went by and I was never notified that he did not have text messages. 'Matter of fact, he told me everything was complete and ready to go to the Clerk's office.

[Inaudible dais comment]

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: It was weeks later, a lawsuit was submitted...

[Inaudible dais comment]

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: ...to the City, about text messages. But I want you to understand, that I did my job and I did what I was supposed to do. But I can't promise that everyone is not gonna do their job, but I did my job. He subsequently, for some reason, is no longer employed with the City. He had an opportunity to say, for weeks, 'Mr. Davis, I didn't get your text messages.' But he didn't say anything until a lawsuit was submitted. And I have a real problem with that because there's this big myth that Councilman Davis was trynna hide text messages. That's not what took place. My phone was screened, it was scanned, it was submitted, it was provided in a timely manner before anything happened to it. And guess what? I just want folks to know the truth. The truth is, I did what I was supposed to do, that was it.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Okay. Thank you. Madam...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Madam...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Madam Attorney, we should not regurgitate the..., we're here for settlement, for discussion of settlement and not to revisit the issues.

CITY ATTORNEY WYNN: You've had discussions of settlement, you're here for re'..., approval of the Item.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Absolutely. Okay.

MAYOR MASTERS: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Mr. Mayor, you're recognized.

MAYOR MASTERS: Yes. Two questions. I know because people have lawsuits and they sue the City for this, that and the other, [inaudible] maybe they resigned or was terminated, but when the, I was told that the person that resigned had..., it didn't have anything to do with this case at all. And I wanted to ask the Manager...

MR. G. TORCIVIA: I have no...

MAYOR MASTERS: I'm asking the... No, not you. I'm asking the Manager 'cause that's what she told me. Is that true, Madam?

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Madam Chair, and I was gonna speak up. Mayor jumped in front of me.

The person did not re'..., he wasn't..., he did not resign due to this case, he was actually let go for another issue.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Issue. Issue.

MAYOR MASTERS: Okay. The second question, the, the settlement that we're gonna vote on tonight, that's a negotiated settlement. Correct?

MR. G. TORCIVIA: Yes, sir.

MAYOR MASTERS: Was there a figure that was higher than the \$50,000?

MR. G. TORCIVIA: Yes, sir.,

MAYOR MASTERS: And both parties agreed to bring that figure down, is that true?

MR. G. TORCIVIA: Yes. We negotiated it down.

MAYOR MASTERS: Okay. And the fig'...

MR. G. TORCIVIA: But they had some risk too. They were worrying about their risk as well.

MAYOR MASTERS: And the figure that we could have [stammer], was what?

MR. G. TORCIVIA: It was over \$60,000.

MAYOR MASTERS: \$10,000 more?

MR. G. TORCIVIA: Yes.

MAYOR MASTERS: Alright. And I, I don't have any more questions.

Thank you.

MR. G. TORCIVIA: Mhmm.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilwoman Botel, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Thank you. I have a question for the attorney. If we do not vote to pay the \$50,000, what could the [inaudible] outcome be?

MR. G. TORCIVIA: I, I think the question was, if we don't accept the settlement, what would occur? Is that the question?

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Yes.

MR. G. TORCIVIA: Couldn't hear all of it. We..., the case would continue. I'm sure if we didn't settle it, then I would expect that Scripts is going to go back to the judge and probably would [stammer] get appointed and set it for hearing.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilwoman Miller-Anderson, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: And what that, what would that entail, in terms of a hearing?

MR. G. TORCIVIA: Well again, back to the question of were the documents public records, or not. You know? And there would probably be more efforts to discover on both sides, there would be at least one hearing, and probably then a full blown trial in front of the judge and the possibility of an appeal by either side. Again, because this, this.., and just maybe settle the background, the whole issue of text messaging is not unique to Riviera Beach. I mean, there was a case decided by the 4th District Court of Appeals right here in Palm Beach County less than six weeks ago with the Town of Gulfstream, where there was a text messaging case. So, the whole issue of text messaging and the technology involved, we're trying to capture text messaging, is ongoing throughout, I'd say just about every city in the State of Florida where some cities have disabled the iMessaging system because Apple's phones are so well encrypted...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Mhmm.

MR. G. TORCIVIA: ...that you can't get the messages. So again, it's not unique to Riviera Beach. All cities are dealing with, how do you capture things like text mes'... Emails, ten years ago, that was the frontier, how do you capture emails? We had the same wave of these kinda lawsuits a decade ago when email started to become much more common. Now, it's text messaging, which is much more commonly used by everybody, not just public officials and public employees, everybody uses their text. Let's face it, we all do it every day, and phone companies go through great lengths to encrypt them and make them difficult, and you have public records law that says they have to be public. So, you're seeing this litigation all over the state, certainly all over Palm Beach County.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Madam Chair? Just one quick question.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilwoman Miller-Anderson, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: And you may or may not be able to answer this, but how is it.., I.., unless there.., the text messages that, you know, I watch a lotta crime shows, okay?

[Comments and chuckles]

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: So...

MAYOR MASTERS: [Inaudible].

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: ...a lotta times the police are able to get text messages.

[Inaudible comment]

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Now, is it that they're getting.., the phone just happened to be Android phones that these people.., these criminals are using or.., because, I just, you know, this day and age you always hear about, you know, if it's out there on the internet or, you know, dealing with technology, it never leaves. You can always find it somewhere. So, I'm just.., I don't understand, are we unique in where we have been able to keep the text messages from coming up bec'.., and, and other areas have not been able to...

MR. G. TORCIVIA: No. I mean...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: I mean, I, I don't...

MR. G. TORCIVIA: Let me, let me relate a tragedy that occurred a couple miles north of here. You might remember a year or so ago, two young boys were boating in Jupiter and they apparently died and they.., there, there was a phone that was found, and the family went to court to try and get the phone unencrypted and recover those text messages, and as far as I know, they were never able to recover those text messages. They were never able to unencrypt that phone.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: It had been in the water or it had...

MR. G. TORCIVIA: Oh but...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: ...been in something for a while?

MR. G. TORCIVIA: ...it was in the water but...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: So, it wasn't.., it didn't look good. It wasn't a, you know...

MR. G. TORCIVIA: Right. Didn't look good.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: It was old, and messed up.

MR. G. TORCIVIA: But I.., but this.., the idea of, of capturing text messages has been... At this point, there is a solution. Again, there is software now...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Right, right.

MR. G. TORCIVIA: ...that's been created...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Mhmm.

MR. G. TORCIVIA: ...that can.., and it really doesn't open up those text messages, it disables that function, because even the hackers, apparently, aren't able to figure out how do you open up a iPhone to iPhone message? That's still encrypted. Now, you and I both know, you know, just like in Star Trek, sooner or later we're gonna be beaming us up, Scotty. You know, sooner or later, someone will figure out how to unencrypt the iPhone text messaging, but as of now, and I'm not a techie, as of now, that's still not able

to be done, so the solution is, you stop it, you just don't..., you disable the phone from, all City phones will be disabled from able to send iMessaging. That's the solution. Again, I'm not sure where we are as a City in implementing that solution. Again, it was in the budget, I believe IT's purchasing the, the software, and I'm not sure where they are in op'..., making it operational.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Madam Chair?

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilman Davis, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: I'd just like to go back to the closed executive session, and the discussion of, once the entire Council that was pre'..., present, I understand Ms. Miller-Anderson wasn't here, got all the information and got the understanding of the historical issues with the case across the state, and all the information, what actually, what really did happen to the phone, and what I really did, there was a better understanding of what happened versus what was being told via media. And, now we're here today to approve something that, in a closed executive session, was not an issue. For [stammer] once they got the inform'..., well, at least they didn't vet it at the City at the time, because people walked in with one understanding, but when they got all the facts, there was a different understanding that, hey wow, the Councilman actually gave his phone, turned it in, in time and, and was told that his phone..., everything was taken off and it was gonna be submitted to Staff, only to find out weeks later that this did not take place, and that information was withheld deliberately, as far as I'm concerned, in that process, to keep the story going. But, you know, there was a lotta things going on at that time, but, you know, who are we to prove one versus the other? But what we can prove is, that Councilman Davis was lied to, Staff was lied to about when the phone was scanned and what was actually scanned at that time. So, that's something that we definitely can prove. So, I just wanna be very clear on the record, that Councilman Davis turned his phone in on time, properly, scanned, didn't..., didn't do nothing to disable the phone. But, between the time he turned it in, something happened. And Councilman Davis has been asking and ordering for an independent investigation to find out actually, from the time it left me, what really did happen. We can prove that there was any crime, at that time, then we can address that.

But, based upon this settlement, there's no crime done by myself...

[Inaudible dais comment]

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: There was no, only accusations, but there was no crime done and we can go to court and talk all day but both sides are gonna have attorney fees up the yin yang and no one wins. So, at some point, as we break into the new year, we need to allow the attorneys, to allow the expertise, just to move this City forward and get on with, with other cases. But, I just wanna make sure folks understand what really did happen in this case, from me...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you, Mr. Davis.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: ...at this time. I think it's only fair.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Madam Attorney...

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Madam Attorney, do you have a direction for us, as it relates to this settlement, please?

CITY ATTORNEY WYNN: Yeah., I think it's best that you make a decision one way or the other, to vote this up or down. We, we encourage the settlement, in the best interest of the City, and to not incur any more fees and costs, attorney's fees. But it's the Board's pleasure.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you. Councilwoman Botel, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: I'm sorry. I hope you can hear me. At what point and why weren't we told that the information on the phone was professionally deleted?

[Inaudible audience comments]

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: I'm s'.., we're...

MAYOR MASTERS: What?

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: She asked [inaudible]...

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Why weren't we told...

[Inaudible dais comment]

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: ...that the texts were professionally deleted.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: She said, at what point, on the phone, were the texts professionally deleted, did we know that? That's correct, Councilperson Botel?

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Yes.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Okay.

MR. G. TORCIVIA: There was a, a, I guess the question..., when, when was the..., when was it discovered the phone had been professionally deleted?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Yes.

MR. G. TORCIVIA: So, the original scan was mid-January, I think January 16th. That's the scan that Council Member Davis is talking about, where inhouse IT scanned the phone. Several weeks later, sometime in February, the phone went back to IT to be scanned again and, at that point, the IT person indicated that there was nothing on the phone.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: [Inaudible].

MR. G. TORCIVIA: Subsequently, the City hired an outside, independent expert to look at the phone, so that woulda been sometime probably late February, early March, or sometime in March, and that individual had the phone, scanned the phone, had, you know, fairly high tech equipment and indicated that someone had professionally, his words, professionally deleted those messages. It wasn't just like you or I had pressed the delete button, because they generally are recoverable, but he was not able to determine when that occurred. It seemed that it occurred sometime in mid-January, but when in mid-January, whether it was January 14th, 15th, 16th, 17th, just couldn't tell. But it seemed that it occurred sometime in the middle of January.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Mr. Davis, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: To be very clear, so the time that, in January when the phone was first scanned, remember, I was told that he received the information, correct?

MR. G. TORCIVIA: That's what I believe he told you.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Right. Exactly.

MR. G. TORCIVIA: And I was there for your conversation.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Then, weeks went by for the second scan.

MR. G. TORCIVIA: Right.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: The only reason the second scan came up, is because when the lawsuit struck, we.., that's when Staff found out it didn't take place. So then, he was called back to the carpet again, 'Hey, why didn't you say something about this phone?' And then, that's when we found out the second time, but the first time, he never told anyone that the phone did not have the documentation on it. So everybody was sittin' around wondering like, 'Well, why didn't you say anything?' But, the reason he couldn't say anything, 'cause he already told me that it was done, 'cause I said I would take it over to the Clerk's office myself, because I understood we was gonna get hit with a lawsuit. He said, 'Mr. Davis, I have.., I can do it myself. I have a junk drive, and I will submit to the Clerk so I can properly record it.' I said no problem. I left. February came up, the lawsuit hit. I was like, 'What's going on, Staff? I [inaudible] scanned my phone, he told me had everything to submit it.' They said, 'Well, take it back to him anyway.' That's when we found out what happened from the time, the first time versus the second time.

So, I just wanna be very clear that the temperature and the tone of what happened, is very clear about I did what I was supposed to do, something funny was going on and people need to say that.

MR. G. TORCIVIA: Mhmm.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: There is...

MAYOR MASTERS: [Inaudible]...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...a motion and a second on the floor.

MAYOR MASTERS: [Inaudible].

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Madam Chair? I just need to correct a statement that I made. I said that the previous IT Manager was let go. He resigned for another incident.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Okay.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: So, he resigned.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Alright.

MAYOR MASTERS: [Chuckle].

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you. There is a motion and a second on the floor. Did we have any public comment cards? You said no. Madam Clerk.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Davis?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Yes, ma'am.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Botel?

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: No.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: No.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Pro Tem Hubbard?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: No.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Chair Davis Johnson?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: No.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: That motion fails with Councilperson Miller-Anderson, Hubbard, Davis Johnson and Botel dissenting.

[Inaudible audience chatter]

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: I'd like to make another...

MAYOR MASTERS: So that means we...

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: ...another motion.

MAYOR MASTERS: ...go to court?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Mr. Torcivia, I'd like to make another motion, please.

[Inaudible dais and audience chatter]

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: We get in closed executive session and act like this?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: I...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: No, no. I, I need to...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Really?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...understand something. Go ahead, please.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: I'd like to...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Chair Pro Tem, you're recognized.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Okay. I'd like to make a motion that we accept the attorney's recommendation, but that what is stricken from the record, is that the Council did.., excuse me, that the City rather, the City's deli'.., deliberate intent of not turning over the information was not there. It was because of our inability, and we did not have the software to do, to do so at the time. I would like our records to reflect that.

[Pause]

[Inaudible comment]

UNK: Mhmm. Thank you.

CITY ATTORNEY WYNN: [Inaudible], I think it's what she wants stricken.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: While you're looking, Mr. Torcivia and Ms. **WYNN**, I.., and, and, and that I've completed my motion, I want to say that it's because I understand that you, you were saying that this would well exceed \$50,000 in a matter of minutes, whether we win or lose. So, I do understand that and, and we're not saying that we did anything or that we're culpable, we're just saying that something should be put on the record.

MR. G. TORCIVIA: So, there is a.., I, I think the paragraph that you might be concerned about is Paragraph 9 of the proposed agreement, which says, 'Defendants,' that's the City, 'failed to comply with Florida's public records by failing to respond to WPTV's request in a timely fashion, and by failing to adequately maintain records.' And if I understand you correctly, you would like that to say, 'Defendants inadvertently failed...,' as opposed to, maybe, any implication that it was intentional. Inadvertently failed to comply, because we didn't respond in a timely way 'cause they started making that public records request in November, and we didn't get the documents to them until, even the ones we were able to find, until, I think, it was late January/February. So it did.., that was their, I think...

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: And, and, and I get that, but based on what you explained and what you stated, was it was that we didn't.., we did not have the capability

to provide them what they needed, and we, in our search, gave them everything, and most of what we, what we had. So, I just think that, you know, for future records and for posterity, that should be added into the, to the document. Not that we decided to, you know, thumb our nose at the, the law and we just didn't do it.

MR. G. TORCIVIA: Alright. So, you'd like some language added that indicates that the City made an effort, that we produced what we could, and that anything we didn't produce was inadvertent?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Because we...

MR. G. TORCIVIA: [Inaudible]...

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Because we couldn't. Right. So, maybe we should've stopped looking and said that and, 'Hey, we looked for fifteen days, we can't find it, we don't.., not.., because we don't have the capability of, of gathering from iMessenger as you explained earlier, and just, just not to go on and continue, continue to look until they're, until they're exasperated or aggravated. But, our trying and our attempt, based on what you explained, was, I think, a valiant effort.

MR. G. TORCIVIA: Well, there's no doubt in my mind, the City made a very valiant effort to locate these records.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Mhmm.

MR. G. TORCIVIA: And again, maybe for those.., you're aware, but for others, I mean, you know, we went through.., and each of you turned your cellphones back in, even those of you.., some of you had, had your cellphones looked at back in January, as well. And the scan was successful. But, other of you were, were willing to come forward with your phones to even recover some of the text messages that we recover from other people's phones. So, you know, the City... And then again, we hire an outside person to look as well. I mean, the Ci'.., and they recognize that. They recognize that the City took [pause], I called it extraordinary efforts, because normally, you look for the records, you don't have 'em, you don't have them. In this case, the City really went above and beyond trying to find these records. And I think they recognize that in the way this is worded, but...

UNK.: Absolutely.

MR. G. TORCIVIA: ...you're saying you want that worded a little more strongly?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: I...

MR. G. TORCIVIA: You know, we can go back and, and work with them on that.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: And, and, I, you know, and the only reason I say that is because of the way that it appears to the public as if we weren't trying at all, we didn't.., we just weren't gonna give it 'em, that we were just thumbing our nose at the law or the request, and, and I don't think that it's fair on the City's part, the Staff's part, even our part, to let that just go out into the public without stating the case. And, and I wanna say,

you know, I'm glad that you made the presentation that you did, to show the effort that was really put into this.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Absolutely. Tell the real story.

[Pause]

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: So your motion is exactly?

MR. G. TORCIVIA: Your motion to, to...

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: My, my motion is to accept this and to, to accept the recommendation of the Council.., the attorneys, and to, to go back... Now, you might... Excuse me, let me put a [inaudible]. You might find that you need to go back first, but, if we can get that language changed, I say that we should accept this recommendation that you're presenting to us today.

MR. G. TORCIVIA: So, you'd like language.., just to make sure I'm getting the, the motion correctly, 'cause I'll work with the other lawyer and try to get it done, you want language that indicates that the City made more than reasonable efforts to locate these records...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Absolutely.

MR. G. TORCIVIA: And after not being able to locate the records, the City was not able to provide them?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Absolutely.

MR. G. TORCIVIA: [Inaudible].

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: That's, that, that sums it up.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Is there a second?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Second.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilwoman Miller-Anderson, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: So, we just voted down the settlement. Right?

MR. G. TORCIVIA: Yeah.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: With the language, as it's written, yes.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: With the language as it's written.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: So now we're making a motion to try to settle again, but with a couple of words tweaked?

CITY ATTORNEY WYNN: Right. You...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: But...

CITY ATTORNEY WYNN: ...vote'.., you voted down the settlement as.., the settlement as presented.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Thank you.

CITY ATTORNEY WYNN: And now, the second motion is to accept it with some changes to the language.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Okay.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Do you see that as... Madam Attorney, do you see that as being beneficial in this process? I know it is ultimately up to the Board to make the final decision, but would it be your direction to have that additional language added to the settlement? Does it...

CITY ATTORNEY WYNN: If that's the pleasure of the Board. I mean, it's your right to accept or not accept the settlement.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Okay. Thank you.

MR. G. TORCIVIA: And you certainly can... I feel very comfortable going back to the other lawyer with this language, saying we wanna reflect that the City made reasonable efforts to locate the records. The requested records. And I think there's a, a, I don't wanna speak for her, but I think she and her client will accept that. So, if you wanna propose that... You're basically making a counteroffer.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Mhmm.

MR. G. TORCIVIA: Right? Doing this. So this would be a new motion that changes the terms a little bit, and I'll present it to them tomorrow and if they accept it, we're finished. And if they don't accept it, then we'll be back in front of you probably in a couple of weeks.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Mr. Davis, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Mr. Torcivia, so, say this motion is, is approved, will this have to come back before this Board, or it'll have to come back in a closed executive session?

MR. G. TORCIVIA: I, I wouldn't.., if they accept the language that...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Mhmm.

MR. G. TORCIVIA: ...we're gonna add a sentence that said the City made reasonable efforts to locate the records, you approved.., you'd be approving the agreement with as-is, with that one sentence being added...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Mhmm.

MR. G. TORCIVIA: ...if they accept that one sentence, just like that, I defer to Ms. Wynn, but I don't think it would need to come back.

CITY ATTORNEY WYNN: We don't need to come back.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Oh, okay. The only reason I just asked that question because, in, in the, in the Board.., in the closed executive session, there was four Members of the Board in the discussion. I know the cameras weren't on or nothing like that, but there was a very understanding of what this case really mean ver'.., with the two sides. And the two sides understood that one side did everything they were supposed to do to present themselves properly to, to give them everything they want and the other side understood that there was no guarantee that they can win the case. They didn't wanna waste any more money and time, we knew we had a good case, they thought they had a good case. There were no charges filed, there was no wrongful doing. So, we can be kicking this can down the road quite a bit. So, when we get in these sessions and then we get on TV, then we change our temperature, I just wanna make sure we stay consistent on what we're gonna do. I know it's a political season, I know some folks think the text messages are one thing, but tonight, you got some real information about what really happened.

[Inaudible comment]

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: And there was no malicious intent. Staff went over and beyond, like Mr. Torcivia said, even the other phones [inaudible] receive information was requested, only to show the information they did get was, was just general stuff. You know? Talking about hurricanes and working together. But, this is our time to tell our story, which is we did everything we were supposed to do, [stammer], the case didn't go anywhere, there was no charges filed, no wrongful doing, and...

[Inaudible audience comment]

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: ...we don't need to waste anymore.., neither side wanna waste any more time, neither side.

[Inaudible comments]

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: It's been motioned and properly second. Madam Clerk.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Davis?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Yes, ma'am.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Botel?

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: No.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: No.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Pro Tem Hubbard?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Chair Davis Johnson?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: That motion is approved with Councilperson Miller-Anderson and Botel dissenting.

MR. G. TORCIVIA: Thank you very much.

COMMUNITY BENEFITS REQUESTS ON CONSENT

7. RIVIERA BEACH PARKS & RECREATION DEPARTMENT - \$500 - CHAIR PRO-TEM LYNNE L. HUBBARD - SENIOR ACTIVITIES AT THE LINDSEY DAVIS COMMUNITY CENTER.

8. LINCOLN ELEMENTARY SCHOOL - \$500 - CHAIR PRO-TEM LYNNE L. HUBBARD - TO DEFRAY COSTS OF TRAVEL FOR SAFETY PATROLS TO WASHINGTON, D.C.

9. CHILDREN'S OUTREACH, INC. - \$2,000 - CHAIR PRO-TEM LYNNE L. HUBBARD - TO DEFRAY THE COSTS OF THE PURCHASE OF PRODUCE AND GROCERIES FOR WEEKLY DISTRIBUTION TO THE COMMUNITY.

10. JOHN F. KENNEDY MIDDLE SCHOOL - \$500 - CHAIR PRO-TEM LYNNE L. HUBBARD - TO OFFSET EXPENSES OF ITEMS NEEDED FOR THE 2019 GIRLS BASKETBALL TEAM.

11. JOHN F. KENNEDY MIDDLE SCHOOL - \$500 - CHAIRWOMAN TONYA DAVIS JOHNSON - IN SUPPORT OF THE GIRLS BASKETBALL TEAM.

12. LINCOLN ELEMENTARY SCHOOL - \$1,000 - CHAIRWOMAN TONYA DAVIS JOHNSON - TO DEFRAY COSTS OF TRAVEL FOR SAFETY PATROLS TO WASHINGTON, D.C.

13. FREEPRENUERS, INC. - \$500 - CHAIR PRO-TEM LYNNE L. HUBBARD - FOR WORKSHOP TO INSPIRE GIRLS TO BECOME ENTREPRENUERS,

END OF CONSENT AGENDA

UNFINISHED BUSINESS

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: PUBLIC COMMENTS SHALL BEGIN AT 7:30 P.M. UNLESS THERE IS NO FURTHER BUSINESS OF THE CITY COUNCIL WHICH, IN THAT EVENT, IT SHALL BEGIN SOONER. IN ADDITION, IF AN ITEM IS BEING CONSIDERED AT 7:30 P.M., THEN COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC SHALL BEGIN IMMEDIATELY AFTER THE ITEM HAS BEEN CONCLUDED. ANY PERSON WHO WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK DURING PUBLIC COMMENTS, PLEASE FILL OUT A PUBLIC COMMENT CARD LOCATED ON THE TABLE DIRECTLY OUTSIDE OF THE COUNCIL CHAMBERS AND GIVE IT TO THE STAFF BEFORE THE PUBLIC COMMENT SECTION IS ANNOUNCED.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair, the acceptance for public comment cards for this particular section of the Agenda is now closed. Dr. Phillip Dukes, Michael Mahoney, Nora Mahoney.

DR. P. DUKES: Dr. Phillip Dukes, 1217 Avenue U, Riviera Beach, Florida. Council, Mayor's office.

Our next event will be January 26th at 1217 Avenue U, in the City of Riviera Beach. We're gonna start at 1:30. It's our weekend 'Change Our Community Atmosphere Rally'. We've never had a zero tolerance in our City for the drug retail market that breeds death, murder in our youth in our community. Everyone plays a different part in bringing equity to the City, in the African American community. The part I play is to change our community atmosphere. We have gang violence that's growing in our City. I had a little young boy, a few weeks ago, came up on the corner. Right? I'm talking to him, right? He pulls out his arm and says, 'See that, man? I'm blood.' Now, he made sure he showed me that to intimate us, and he's about...

[Inaudible comment]

DR. P. DUKES: ...fifteen, something like that. Maybe seventeen. I said, 'Dude, that's not what you wanna be.' But they watch these other little boys running to cars doing their thing. So, I'm asking the City to support us, don't ignore this movement. And I've already given you the vision. We always say we want people to come back and give to the City and do this, that and the other. Well, I've been here, doing this and I've proven myself. See, the part I play is to help us change our community atmosphere. We do business all over the, all over the City talking about we're gonna bring equity in the City, and we wanna change this, that and the other, but we refuse to stand in the black community and change the drug retail market. Do you know in Palm Beach County there are no white gangs? The'..., I call 'em Opie gangs, okay? There's no Opie gangs.

[Audience chuckles]

DR. P. DUKES: These blacks kids are socialized to this, and we can change that and it has to be in the streets. See, I don't have a ax to grind with any of you on the Council, or the Mayor's office, but no City Council or Mayor's office, since 1982, has done what they're supposed to do in bringing higher standards in the black community. We claim that we wanna do this and that for our youth, but we refuse to dominate our streets.

Now, we could be an example to the whole nation, by what we do in our City, by bringing some higher standards. Now, some people are not gonna like it. They're not gonna like it. Some people don't believe it can help us, because they think that black people have to live like this. We're supposed to have shootings, we're supposed to have drugs, we're supposed to be down. You can't do anything about that, until you go to North Palm Beach and try to set up in front of a store and do the same thing, it's not gonna happen.

So, I'm asking you to support us and help us. Okay? And those of you who wanna support us, Operation Restore is a 501(c) or can send us a donation at P.O. Box 10111, Riviera Beach, FL 33419. On January 26th, ya'll come out. We're gonna have free food. Now, a lotta people do barbecue in the City, okay? But I do a whole different ballgame of barbecue, so ya'll come out and support us and help us and stop being afraid. Do you know I have people in my neighborhood, that I said, 'Ya'll come over, over to the City and talk.' Do you know why they don't wanna come up here? They are afraid. They're scared. They're scared, 'Well, if somebody see me up there, they might do this or that to me.' Now, that's a damnable shame that people feel held hostage in our community, but yet, we say...

[Timer]

DR. P. DUKES: ...we care so much for them.

Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you.

[Inaudible audience comment]

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Michael Mahoney, Nora Mahone, Claudius Knalls.

MR. M. MAHONEY: Good evening.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Good evening.

MR. M. MAHONEY: May I, may I approach and...

MAYOR MASTERS: Good evening.

MR. M. MAHONEY: ...show your photograph? [Pause].

I came here tonight because I have businesses on US-1, Dee's T-Shirts, 2120 Main Street Plaza, 2135, across the street. So, I go back and forth the street, Broadway, almost every day and we have cameras on my building, so I observe the traffic that comes in and out of there. And, when they redid that road there, that, that truck that I've got there, it's, it's going down the wrong way, on Broadway. US-1. It's going south in the north lane.

[Inaudible audience comment]

UNK: Shh.

MR. M. MAHONEY: And, he came down as far as the front of my building, which is basically about 100-150 feet passed the street where he's supposed to turn. So, the reason why he's doing that, he, he actually pulled down the wrong side of US-1 so he could back, back into 22nd Street, which is pretty crazy. I've never seen that before. But, my point is that, on a daily basic'... basis, the traffic along that US-1 corridor, Broadway, I'm asking you guys to, if there was any type of idea to put a light there, that you would continue looking at that because, I called FDOT because I heard rumors that they were gonna move the light from, I think it was 20th to 22nd Street to accommodate the traffic. And there's an ungodly amount of traffic there, coming in and out every day. And the way they designed that road now, is that a lotta cars make U-turns there, and I was hit on the sidewalk there, back in 2014, across the street, but those cars that make U-turns there and they come outta nowhere, and they pull up on the sidewalk, because the way that road's designed, so if, if there's a light there, that would control the traffic, it would slow the traffic down along there. And the other thing I suggested years ago, was to, along that City owned lot between 21st and 22nd Street, there's a, a side.., there's a, a.., two parking spots that go along the street, that would accommodate a police car there. And, my suggestion is, for now, to slow traffic down along there, is to park a police car there periodically because they do that in other cities and it, it seems to work, you know, even though there's a cop not in the car, people see the police car and they might slow down until you can do something with the traffic light.

So, there's, there's other things I need to say and I'll come and say it on that, but if you would look into that, and that street that goes down towards the water from 22nd Street, where they would put that light, that, that street has got some construction going on there right now, and it's Rybovich tearing some buildings down, and now would be the time to explore what they're gonna do with that light, because that street is a very narrow street and it wouldn't accommodate the traffic. Well, it's.., it can accommodate...

[Time]

MR. M. MAHONEY: ...traffic that would be presented if they put a light there. So, that, that whole situation there, with the light in the street needs to be looked at.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you.

MR. M. MAHONEY: If you guys... Thanks.

MAYOR MASTERS: Mr. Mahoney, I hope you called the police when you saw that.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Nora Mahoney...

MAYOR MASTERS: It's okay. We'll talk.

MR. M. MAHONEY: [Inaudible.]

MAYOR MASTERS: You should call the police.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Claudius Knalls, Lloyd Brown.

MS. N. MAHONEY: Nora Mahoney, 2120 Broadway and 2135 Broadway. I would like to show these pictures, please. You can pass it on.

Well, my husband called the police, and I called the police too. They said we're going to send a traffic police officer. Never came. I was waiting until 5:00 o'clock. And, you can see the time that, that the truck came. I think it was, like, 3:00 o'clock in the afternoon.

Well, the reason that I'm giving you these pictures, is because in the 22nd Street, in the City property, there is a lotta debris and garbage from construction. And they use only, like, a small mesh on Avenue E, but that garbage is coming over little by little, with no mesh for whatever they're demolishing and there is a lot of sand coming out. My husband called to the City Manager's office, somebody called him, I called my husband and told him that we're going to solve the problem, and now I find out that Mr. Bailey from Public Works, he say' he's gonna be able to take care of that. He didn't know anything about it. I don't know how you communicate in your different departments, but I'm tired of cleaning my place in 2135 Broadway and 2120 in the mornings, there is a lot of sand. I said what in the world.., I mean, what are they doing? All of a sudden, it's advancing little by little and there is no mesh to stop the sand coming in.

So, can you please take care of that? 'Cause it really looks bad. It looks like the City is getting down. So, place some mesh like in any other city. I saw it over there in West Palm Beach, I saw it over there in West Palm Beach where's there's a lot of construction. So, you need to have a mesh to contain the debris and the sand coming from that place. So, I show you the pictures, I'm not lying to you. Hopefully, you're gonna be able to do something.

And the other thing, every morning I have the ambulance, police officers, driving around because there's accidents, probably. We need to have a police presence on US-1. There's a lot of accidents. There is a lot of people.., I don't know where they're coming from, I never saw them. Probably it's winter time from the north, coming to the south, but we saw a lot of people with ice picker and moving around, they don't know where they're going, so.., and there are people afraid to walk on the sidewalks. Hopefully, you can do something about it.

And the other thing, I know Mr. Davis is not here, I hea'.., I read the newspaper about the cellular that was dropped in the, in the water, hopefully, somebody can find it and we can, we can really solve this problem.

Thank you.

[Inaudible audience comments]

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Claudius Knalls, Lloyd Brown, Doretta Paulk.

MR. C. KNALLS: Good evening.

MAYOR MASTERS: Good evening, sir.

MR. C. KNALLS: Mayor and Chair and the Council, and the constituents of Riviera Beach. My name is Claudius Knalls, and I would like to formally invite you to come and participate in one of the most fundamental exercise of our democratic process, which is debate. Here, [inaudible], Riviera Beach, City Hall, Council Chamber on Thursday, January 31, 2019, from 6:00 to 8:00 p.m., I'll be hosting the Mayoral candidate debate for our great City on the behalf of its residents. This will be a key forum to introduce the candidates and their platforms. Participating candidates including the incumbent Thomas Masters, Gwyneth Felder, Cedrick Thomas, John B. Williams. It is paramount and proper, in a proper functioning democracy, to not just be a voter but to be an informed one. Please either join us here in person, or watch at home, but please stay abreast of the candidates and the issues. These choices affect us all. The opinions of the publics are vital. Please send questions and concerns for the candidates to email address: rivierabeachdebate@gmail.com. Or, they can be left here on the first floor of City Hall, near the City Hall registered offices of Council. We will consider and incorporate all that we can.

Again, thank you for your time and interest. The candidates and I will look forward to seeing you here January 31, 2019 at 6:00 p.m.

Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you, sir.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Lloyd Brown, Doretta Paulk, Margaret Shepherd.

MR. L. BROWN: How ya doing? My name is Lloyd Brown. I'm back again.

What I wanna say is a couple people..., I looked in the paper and they told me about this too, down in Lake Worth, they're gonna start doing something about the slumlords, you know, and I mean, maybe ya'll might wanna get a little information from them.

And then another thing, on Seacrest Boulevard, there's a store just like the ones we have in our neighborhood, they had these machines, the same machines, they close 'em down. They closed 'em down. I guess they musta heard me talking 'cause, you know, like, ya'll are not. And it's like..., me and Ms. Botel, we were supposed to went in a place but, you know, the neighbor told me, he said, 'Lloyd, you know what? If you go in that place, it's gonna be your own kind that's gonna say something to you,' and he's right about that. Because I was explaining to a guy at the Imperial about these machines in there, and he was telling me something. He was defending the people. You know? So, it's like, we don't have so they put these machines in the neighborhood so we think that we can make it. You know, we can get by. One or two people might win, but then, Las Vegas never went broke, so you know that they're not winning the most.

And then another thing that they ask me about, they said the summer's coming and you don't have anything for us to do, like, [inaudible] Calloway amphitheater is not open, and different places. You can't have a party unless the police coming around, you can't do much drinking or walking around the neighborhood, I mean, to relieve your tension. And they were saying, 'Well, you know, we might wanna go over to the beach.' But then, I heard that these people went over there, like, there, there are more, more

boat things, you know, to park boats over there, then there are for the public. And I mean, seems like some of you people, or one of you people, or anybody up there, woulda went over there one day and said, 'Well, the people were talking to me about what's going on over Singers Island, under the bridge,' I don't see how ya'll let Palm Beach County put a private place in there, a scuba diving place. I mean, why don't ya'll put a soul food restaurant under there too? You know and I wouldn't mind going over there, having me something, maybe a yard sale. I mean, that's supposed to be a public beach, but when you get over there, I can't get on the sidewalk and leave my bicycle there because I'm blocking the sidewalk, but if you ever went over there on a day when those people are over there, you got stuck everywhere. You think Jacque Cousteau and all his family done came up, I mean, there's so much stuff over there. And the people I know say, 'Well, you can't have parties, you can't do this,' you close down the Blue Heron, but then you're wondering why people are so violent in the neighborhood. Like we didn't bring these drugs here. I'mma tell you so'.., it's, like, I mean, I hear what Dukes' saying but, you know, those people in North Palm, like I say, they may not have drug places up there but they got the intracoastal where they can bring these drugs. I never saw a tractor trailer pull up in my neighborhood and drop two tons of cocaine down. And I don't know how to speak Spanish, and I definitely don't know how to get down to Peru if I had to go and get drugs. So, apparently, these young guys aren't bringing it in. And if they woulda had drugs in here, before me, the crack woulda came in, I probably woulda been out there shootin' up people too. So you [inaudible] that happened to make this...

[Timer]

MR. L. BROWN: ...what happened. It's not like they just got out there and said, 'Well, we're gonna shoot up the neighborhood.' But you don't wanna go out there and sell drugs with a knife in your pocket and you got everybody else with a gun.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Doretta Paulk, Margaret Shepherd, Willis Williams.

MS. D. PAULK: Good evening.

MAYOR MASTERS: Good evening.

MS. D. PAULK: My name is Doretta Paulk.

And I just wanna commend, in December, hats off to Mr. Danny Calloway and the Mothers Against Murderers, they presented the Lindsey Davis senior citizens, at the senior citizen center, a wonderful, delicious Christmas seafood festival dinner, and it was very, very nice. And I wanna just commend both of them, because Mr. Calloway has done so much...

MAYOR MASTERS: Yes.

MS. D. PAULK: ...for the children, teenagers and the senior citizens of Riviera Beach. And not to forget Mr. Blankenship, he does a wonderful job. Ms. Gwen Oats, Ms. Lucy Cooper, they take very good care of the senior citizens. And I thank you, Mr. Blankenship, we now have a male, a young male working there at the center, and I think that's needed, to have Mr. Derek Ferguson there. That's very much needed in, in the

center, so when people come in there, they know it's not just us little senior citizens, we do have a male figure.., and that, that can help out, and he does help out with the seniors too. Very much so.

Another thing. Now, to talk about Mr., Attorney Ferguson came, maybe three months ago and then he came back again a couple meetings ago, and I thought this was a no brainer. He was talking about the children that doesn't have the advantage of having the platforms of, of computers or laptops. And I know this now being initiated because going to Mrs., Councilwoman Miller's Citizen Academy, which you learn so much. And Mrs. Cobb spoke a little bit on that, so the ball is rolling. But I think when he first presented this, it shoulda been a no brainer. Get our children on a, a even playing field, 'because there's a lotta senior citizens being.., the grandparents are raising their grandchildren. They're living off one check, and this, our children, is the future of Riviera Beach, and when things like this do come up, please, please pay attention and let's go ahead and pass this.

MAYOR MASTERS: Yes.

MS. D. PAULK: Another thing about this water, the water bill. Now, I have.., I get my.., I don't have a box at my home, but I get through the post office box. I just got this. Last week I checked on my mail, I just got this. This is important because people of the.., the citizens of Riviera Beach has really lack of a trust of what's going on with this water. We have some seniors who have compromised with their lungs, COPD, and heart problems, we need to be notified of this so these senior...

[Timer]

MS. D. PAULK: ...citizens can be taken care of. And like you say, we're gonna start a hotline. Maybe we can get a hotline concerning this when situations come out. I think you done a very good job, Ms. Hopkins, but I do feel that Mr. Horton needs to go right back to the water situation. You know, Department. He does.

MAYOR MASTERS: I do too.

MS. D. PAULK: He does. I think you've done a very good job. You know? And another thing, on quickly, I know my time's up, but one quickly. When Mr. Horton said that he ordered the wrong truck and now we're renting a truck because the stature of four men of the stature was too big...

MAYOR MASTERS: Outrageous.

MS. D. PAULK: ...for.., to accommodate the truck that he ordered. That's a waste of money. That's a wa'.., and we're renting out, that's a waste of money.

MAYOR MASTERS: Right.

MS. D. PAULK: And when our water bills are going higher and higher, and who's paying for all these suits? Is our water bill gonna remain higher and higher? This not fair

to the citizens of Riviera Beach. Because I am on one social security check, and I., please think about that. Our...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you...

MS. D. PAULK: ...seniors.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...Ms. Paulk.

MS. D. PAULK: Thank you very much. And all of Riviera Beach, everybody. 'Cause that's a, that's a hardship.

I thank you very much. I appreciate me., you letting go over, over my time. Thank you.

MAYOR MASTERS: You deserve it.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Margaret Shepherd.

MAYOR MASTERS: And I agree with you.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: ...Willis Williams, Horace Towns.

MS. M. Shepherd: To our new City Manager, my name is Margaret... Not Manager, our new City Attorney.

MAYOR MASTERS: [Chuckle].

MS. M. SHEPHERD: My name is Margaret Shepherd, and I do live in prime property, owned, operated by the federal government, which is called HUD. Welcome to the City. My name is Margaret Shepherd, once again. I do live in the City of Riviera Beach. I'm here for a very different program. I thank Mr. Knalls for coming. Now I see why Mr. John Lee Williams is here on the spot, Mayor. You got a good candidate here.

But anyway, I'm here for the Willie Bo Garden.

MAYOR MASTERS: Not worried at all.

MS. M. SHEPHERD: I will be here next week, to the CRA because I'm very disturbed of the money that was spent, I'm very disturbed that we were told that we gonna get a [inaudible], and then they changed it, because I spoke up about how the money was spent. I spoke up and I don't have a dime to my name, but the one thing I can see, as Bessie Brown say, on the backs of the taxpayers. This has got to stop. It was built. It was built. And then we found out they have a consultant over there. I wanna get his record, what is a consultant? And they sent Mr. McCullough to school. The plants dies because the seeding was old. That's what happened, and now we have to go back in the ground, pull up everything and replant again.

MAYOR MASTERS: Mm.

MS. M. SHEPHERD: I'm terribly disturbed. I sat over in Riviera [stammer].., in Riviera Beach Housing Authority, City Manager, 'cause I want you to know the background of this City. We spend money, spend money, spend money, with nobody being accountable for. Somethings have happened and I'm glad the election is coming on, because we put you in office, we were very kind and generous to give you our vote, and then when you get in office, you neglect, as the Mayor say, the [inaudible] senior citizens. I'm gonna vote, that somebody get in office and take care of us. Over at Lindsey Da'.. You're there, Mrs., Mrs. Hubbard and they were so happy to see the gifts but I never heard you say, 'Let's go out to the garden.' This is your District, District 1. This is prime piece of property. You got the fields over there, Cunningham Park, now you've got the Lind'.., [stammer], Lindsey Davis. One of the best pieces of prime property, with the seniors who gave you all, and all, and all. I'm about to retire on some issues. Shoulda been retired, because the doctor say, you need to take it easy. And I have. You haven't seen me here, but 'm here. I'll be back in CRA, I want some answers why Mr. McCullough was pulled, why they've.., well, I know why they zap our money out the account because the bills was going on one person, had a credit card and they bled it out. And now, we're still sittin' in that building. Mrs. Hubbard been there playing checkers, playing cards, we wanna go on trips with the.., with Mr. McCullough, but they zapped that.

[Timer]

MS. M. SHEPHERD: I guess because I spoke out. During the election, I will speak out. It is time that either you get up or get the hell up outta here.

[Inaudible audience exclamation]

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Willis Williams, Horace Towns, Amon Yisrael, Mary Brabham.

MR. W. WILLIAMS: Good evening, Council. Willis Williams, Riviera Beach.

MAYOR MASTERS: Good evening, sir.

MR. W. WILLIAMS: I wanted to welcome Ms. **WYNN**, again, to the City, hoping that her twenty-seven years of experience with the County will structure a lot of stuff that.., in this City has been lacking. Whether it was lacking from Mr. Degraffenreidt or not, I think it started a lot.., before Mr. Degraffenreidt. We, we broke down in the, the Attorneys knowing how to explain to the Council how things should be run. And, it took...

[Inaudible audience comment]

MR. W. WILLIAMS: ...this.., for, for an example, it took the Attorney to, to tell a department head that this is legal. It's not a campaign. You guys shouldn't'sa spent that much time on this. It doesn't take a rocket scientist to understand that this is not political, we need to know. Mrs., Mrs. Paulk, Mrs. Doretta Paulk, pilot class of 1970 from John F. Kennedy. These people come out because now they're senior citizens [inaudible]. They grew up here.

[Chuckle]

MR. W. WILLIAMS: They know what the deal is. So, it's time, and as I say this all the time, Mr. Horton [inaudible], he's upset now, he's gone. But he should been gone.

MAYOR MASTERS: [Chuckle].

MR. W. WILLIAMS: Okay? Bottom line. That truck that I talked about two and a half months ago, that's still being rented. It takes this long to buy a truck? It's ridiculous. That's taxpayer's dollars are constantly being..., [stammer], Mr. Mahone talked about the, the stuff that's [inaudible] all that dirt and stuff. I've been talking about that for three months.

MAYOR MASTERS: Mm.

MR. W. WILLIAMS: I've been talking about that. Now, it's, it's escalating all the way to Broadway. But, Mrs. Hoskins, you said we have a, a deal with the contractor,. We..., but, but somebody needs to get on their behind and tell them they need to clean up their act. There's no [inaudible] truck. Now, they're tearing, tearing buildings down from..., down from my house today, as we speak, and there's no police car, flashing lights, letting people know what's going on here in the community or nothin'. They got bulldozers. I woke up one morning, I thought I was in Iraq.

MAYOR MASTERS: [Chuckle].

MR. W. WILLIAMS: It's just shaking the house and stuff, but nobody's coming over there to see what's going on. I asked for information on two or three different occasions about what's going on [stammer] in, on..., in that area. I have yet, I have yet to get the right answer, 'cause I know the right answer, but somebody gonna have to pay for this one. Somebody gonna have to pay for this, and I'm not kidding. My house..., I, I'm trynna sell my [stammer],. I wanna get the hell out from over there. It's ridiculous. I got to listen to that, and, and smell that. Last summer, we washed the windows in that house so much that, that we just stopped. Dust flying every day, dust flying. The furniture's completely full with dust. It's ridiculous.

Thank you.

[Timer]

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Horace Towns, Amon Yisrael, Mary Brabham.

MR. H. TOWNS: Good afternoon to the Council. Horace Towns, Riviera Beach. I wanna be short and simple tonight., excuse me, I'm a little bit under the weather., but two issues. And as a Council, just asking the Council, even though there's an election coming forward, that there are some issues that still need your attention, and they have to be big concerns. One of the neighborhood issues is the trending issue with the motorcycles. I know that there's nothing that the police can do, but this is one of those times where the Council has a conversation with your local representative, Senator, because, I don't know how many of you come out the door, but it's becoming a big issue, especially after hours with the dirt bikes, up and down the street. So, there's a concern as a resident, that I had.

The second issue that I wanted to speak about is the water. The water is.., the water should be our biggest... We got a lotta big issues.

[Inaudible comment]

MR. H. TOWNS: It's a list. It's the OIG, 'cause of the insurance, we didn't cover that. We got lawsuits. But my issue is the water. The water is essential to life, and there are people that called me and forward the calls and tell them to reach out to the people in their district, but people feel like they're not properly notified. I don't think that we're ever in compliance with the water. There were people that made comments about the water, they stay out west near Haverhill. Water has been a consistent issue in this City, and I've been speaking about for three years. Being proactive as a Board, that's what I'm asking. No matter who's in these seats, we need a new water plant. Water is a major issue, and you have people that can't take a shower, you have people who have become a joke, that we'll use the.., I think the saying is, 'I wouldn't give that water to my dog.'

[Inaudible comment]

MR. H. TOWNS: The thing that bothers me, is the City of Riviera Beach once got a award for having the best water. So, I don't know how we get to this point, with the last two Administrations.

So, I just feel like that should be a major issue. There are gonna be a lotta people campaigning, a lotta people saying these are the things they're gonna address, but do they have a plan to address it? I'm asking this Board that's presently seated, and any potential candidates, water needs to be a major conversation. We need to be proactive and start thinking about the future. Crime is a issue, but water has to be.

Thank you.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Amon Yisrael, Mary Brabham.

MR. A. YISRAEL: Good evening, Mayor, Chair and Council, City Manager. My name is Amon Yisrael, Riviera Beach, Florida, Monroe Heights area.

We have had three Utility District Directors. Three. \$30,000,000 was borrowed, I think, in 2004, \$40,000,000 was borrowed in 2016. That's about a total of \$70,000,000. I mean, millions, \$70,000,000.

[Inaudible comment]

MR. A. YISRAEL: Our Water Department has...

[Inaudible comment]

MR. A. YISRAEL: ...water bills have increased every year. Our Water Department has continued to deteriorate. I'd like to ask a question also, is it true that we have about thirteen wells that are down, out of twenty-seven? [Pause]. How do you have three Utility District Directors with continued deterioration? Again, I ask, who is really directing them?

It's very difficult for me to believe that the Water Department can continue to deteriorate after all these years.

I also think it'd'a be good idea if you would give us a update on the \$1.1M, the giveaway, paying people's insurance who didn't work for the City, some of 'em up to forty months. Did we get any of that money back?

[Inaudible comments]

MR. A. YISRAEL: Just a few questions.

Thank you.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Mary Brabham.

MS. M. BRABHAM: Good evening. Mary Brabham, Riviera Beach.

Welcome, Attorney Dawn Wynn. Apparently, you can see. I don't care what advice that you may give this Board, to be direct. To move on, to move it on. Once when we are wrong, or something has gone array, step up to the plate, take the challenge, you'll be much better. Progress will lie ahead of you.

In today's paper here, see, it's never too late to go back and do what is right to do. After seventy years with the [inaudible] park. And the eighty-five years old [inaudible] is still with that lie but justice does prevail. And I say to that, to you as a Board, I've always said, and respect each one of you, a journalist's duty is to write, and I stand here and say all the time, they wouldn't write if you stopped doing stupid stuff. And stupid is what stupid does. That's their profession. Your job is a policymaker, and procedures. And you should not deviate from that, but when you're wrong, you're wrong. Because some of this Board up here is wrong, and I tried to talk to you outta love. Because I care about each one of you, but the question has become, do you care about yourself? When you're wrong, you're just wrong. In today's paper here, here go another article, Lynne Hubbard and Tradrick McCoy. Whatever there has been, and whatever is there, stop doing the stupid stuff. I believe in my heart that you want to do right, but you have to prove it. A man is only worth his worth if he's proven his worth. I made a statement over at the Port, the teamwork is the dreamwork, and the dreamwork is the teamwork, and this makes us all achievers. But, we cannot be achievers when you're wrong, you're trynna justify your wrong into a right. There's a heaven and hell for all of us, and that's including Ms. Brabham too.

So, you have a chance to get it right here now. Not later, but now. Things were done wrong.

[Timer]

MS. M. BRABHAM: And stop trying to justify your wrong and make it right. It won't work. It won't work in God's sight, it will not work for your City. It will only keep your City in a limbo, like it is now. We are better than that, Tonya. We are better than that, Lynne, we're better than that, Miller, we are better than that, TD, and we are better than that,

Mayor Masters. We are. And we, we, we wanna face to say that that sign there is who we are, and we're not liars. And we don't wanna be made outta liars, so stop giving the journalists to write, because as long as you give it to them, they're supposed to write it. And I'm gonna encourage them to write it.

Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you, Ms. Brabham.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair, that concludes public comments.

[Inaudible comment]

5. CITY CLERK ANTHONY: We're on to Item No. 5. Madam Chair, the title that I'm about to read into the record, is a revision from the title that's printed on the Agenda, for this particular Item.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: RESOLUTION NO. 2-19. A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH, PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA, APPROVING THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH TO HOST THREE EVENTS IN CONJUNCTION WITH GAME ON RACE EVENTS, PALM BEACHES TRIATHLON , SATURDAY, MARCH 23, 2019, RUN SINGER ISLAND, SATURDAY, APRIL 20, 2019, AND PALM BEACHES TRIATHLON #2, SATURDAY, OCTOBER 5, 2019, AND PROVIDING AN EFFECTIVE DATE.

PARKS & RECREATION DIRECTOR RICHARD BLANKENSHIP (561)845-3411

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Is there...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: So moved.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...a motion?

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Second.

[Inaudible audience comments]

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: It's been motioned and properly second.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair, we do not have an public comment cards on, on this Item. The acceptance of public comment cards on this Item is closed.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Good evening, Mr. Blankenship.

PARKS & RECREATION DIRECTOR BLANKENSHIP: Good evening, Mayor, Council, City Manager. Richard Blankenship, Parks & Recreation Director.

This was on the Consent Agenda, but I asked that it be pulled because we were notified yesterday that the April 13th, originally April 13th date for Run Singer Island had to be changed by the event maker to April 20th, so I wanted to make sure that the Resolution was accurate.

[Inaudible dais comment]

PARKS & RECREATION DIRECTOR BLANKENSHIP: So, that's why I asked for it pull the Resolution that you will be signing has the proper dates.

If there's any questions, I'll be happy to answer.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Are there any questions from Council, on this issue?

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilwoman Miller-Anderson, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Could he just give a little short presentation for the public...

PARKS & RECREATION DIRECTOR BLANKENSHIP: Okay.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: [Inaudible] happen?

PARKS & RECREATION DIRECTOR BLANKENSHIP: These are three events that have been run in Riviera Beach over the past several years. This wouldn't be the first year, it'd be the..., this is the same company under a different name.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Okay.

PARKS & RECREATION DIRECTOR BLANKENSHIP: The first event is a triathlon. And all three events will include Palm Beach Shores, Riviera Beach, Lake Park and North Palm, I think, a little bit. There'd be the triathlon, in March, there'll be the Run Singer Island, which is a half marathon, 10k and a 5k on April 20th, and then another triathlon in October. We're committed to the even maker and to the City that we're gonna promote it heavily through Parks, within the City to give the citizens some idea of..., that it's there and it's there for their enjoyment, if they so want to compete.

Amateur sports is a great economic driver, so we are dedicated to bringing as much amateur sports to the City as possible.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Mm.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Alright. Thank you. And I'll be in that race. Hopefully.

[Chuckles]

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: That's why I have my juice here, so. I'm getting ready.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: [Inaudible].

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Any further questions?

[Inaudible dais comments]

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Madam Clerk.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Botel?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: I'll do it too [inaudible].

[Pause]

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Botel?

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Davis?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Yes, ma'am.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Pro Tem Hubbard?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Chair Davis Johnson?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Unanimous vote.

PARKS & RECREATION DIRECTOR BLANKENSHIP: Thank you.

6. CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Item No. 6.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: RESOLUTION NO. 3-19. A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH, PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA, AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR AND CITY CLERK TO EXECUTE AN AGREEMENT FOR PROFESSIONAL SERVICES BETWEEN THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH, FLORIDA AND PROPERTY REGISTRATION CHAMPIONS, LLC, (PRC) D/B/A PROCHAMPS, TO PROVIDE REGISTRATION OF FORECLOSED AND MORTGAGED REAL PROPERTY COMPLIANCE SERVICES ON BEHALF OF THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH, IN ACCORDANCE WITH ORDINANCE NO. 4024. PRC SHALL RETAIN \$100 OF EACH COLLECTED FEE AND REMIT THE BALANCE TO THE CITY FOR THREE

YEARS, COMMENCING FROM THE EFFECTIVE DATE WITH RENEWAL OPTION FOR ONE ADDITIONAL CONSECUTIVE TWENTY-FOUR MONTH PERIOD, AND PROVIDING AN EFFECTIVE DATE.

INTERIM PROCUREMENT DIRECTOR RICKEY LITTLE (561)845-4081

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair, there are no, no acceptance of cards on this Item, at this time.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: So moved.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Second.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: It's been motioned and properly second. Madam Manager, do you have any...

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Madam Chair, I just wanted to give you an update. We have..., we entered, initially, into con'..., into a contract with this company back in 2014, and it was a five year agreement. Revenues generated totaled \$329,000 for the five years. An currently, the fee is \$200, so the contractor will keep \$100 and the City will receive \$100. And, we have representatives here, if you would like to ask any additional questions.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Madam Chair Pro Tem, you asked that this Item be pulled. Do you have any additional questions regarding this?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Yes. My question is, with the registration of the foreclosed properties and [pause], when you, when you register these properties, these pro'..., the registration of these properties is for what purpose?

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Well, it he'..., it helps keep the..., helps with Code Enforcement when properties go uncut and uncared for. We've..., we'll be able to go to the list and look up the banks to notify them that they need to take care of the properties. Also, it helps with, you know, keeping the community looking good. We have a easy, easy access to who owns the property.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: The..., my... What I was think of with this vehicle in place, that in order to stabilize our community to create an opportunity for homeownership, affordable housing, if there's a vehicle in place, can this..., this should give a flag, or a notice to the City of Riviera Beach how we can, in turn, take these properties to..., maybe we want to buy them, maybe we want to rehab them, but we want to put them on the market for homeownerships in order to stabilize our communities, not to bank them, not to book them, not to stop them for investors to get a hold of and we continue to create rental properties for investors in Riviera Beach. Homeownership stabilizes communities. Young people, people who did lose their homes from mortgage scams, it gives them an opportunity now to come back and to buy homes, and to get into

a stabilized community. So, if we have a vehicle in place like this, we need it.., to be using it to our advantage, not just for recordkeeping purposes and giving investors a head up. I think that, if we're gonna continue to do this, the contract itself, the services of this organization needs to be laid out in such that it benefits the community residents that are interested in homeownership first, as opposed to just a database for investors to go to.

So, I'd like them to speak to that, Madam Manager.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Madam Chair, please?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: You're recognized, Madam Manager.

MR. S. BLASIE: Good evening, Mayor, Council Members. You just lobbed me a nice soft, soft pitch to hit out of the park.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Absolutely.

MR. S. BLASIE: My name is Scott Blasie. I'm the Government Relations Director for ProChamps, which is the program and the company that you currently contract with to manage your foreclosure registry.

If I may, real quick, to kinda answer your first concerns, this program, the, the nexus of it is to identify properties in your, in your community that are what we determine to be at-risk for being blighted. Okay? And, from a Code Enforcement perspective, without the registry and holding the mortgagee accountable to not only register, but od the property maintenance, Code Enforcement sends certified mail to vacant houses, to the property owner that's left, and then ultimately hires contractors, at the taxpayers' expense, to maintain the properties. This program is proactive. We notify the mortgagee and the mortgagee by Ordinance, is responsible not only to register and pay the fee and give Staff contact information in case there are issues at the property, but more importantly, it requires the mortgagee and their [inaudible] to maintain the property. So, that, that's the first part. It, it's a co'.., it saves resources from the City's perspective, it creates some revenues in the form of the registration fees that we share with the City, and those fees can go back to that program and help in the neighborhood programs.

The second part of it is, your spot on. We.., this registry now has identified, in your case, at least 300 properties in the City of Riviera Beach, that are what we would determine to be distressed. They're in default, the property owners have left and they're a blight and a concern in the neighborhoods. And, we've already had a meeting or two with Staff, and I believe Commissioner Davis, and he mentioned that in his opening acknowledgements, in that regard. That's exactly what should be done with this data, and this program. We know where these, these properties are. They're basically low hanging fruit now for the City...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Absolutely.

MR. S. BLASIE: ...to go identify and perhaps we can assist in leveraging opportunities for the banks can convey the properties, either to the City or nonprofit of your choosing. Ironically, our first revitalization project we did, was in West Palm, but

they're on Riviera Beach's water. I can't remember the name of the street, but ultimately, we put our side of the registration dollars back into the property...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Mhmm.

MR. S. BLASIE: ...with a local nonprofit, fixed the property up, I was directly involved. I'm a retired Code guy myself, and a single mom an two kids were first time homebuyers and moved into that house.

So, those are the things we really wanna do for the City of Riviera Beach. We contract with almost 200 communities across the country, including eleven or twelve right here in Palm Beach County. And, having worked in Boynton Beach for twenty-seven years, and being in the community, Boynton Beach, Lake Worth, Riviera Beach, West Palm, are all clients of ours, and partners, and we would love.., I mean, we're salivating at the opportunity to work with the City, and do the exact things you're talking about.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Well, I definitely would like to meet with you and talk to you about that, because I want to turn the tide on re'.., on Riviera Beach being looked as 60% rental and 40% homeownership. I think that this is a [stammer], if we're gonna do this, this is an opportunity for us to stabilize our community, and I would like to get your information and I would like to talk to you more about the opportunity in doing so.

MR. S. BLASIE: Would love to do so. I actually.., I live here in the county, locally, and the City Manager has our contact information. And, I can be here at your convenience.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Madam Chair?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilman Davis, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: I just wanna say, reiterate, how enthusiastic they were about the conversation about stabilizing the community and creating an opportunity to be the arm to the banks, and really give our employees, our residents an opportunity to get some traditional, unconventional loans and unco'.., unconventional opportunities with this program. They were more than just enthusiastic, they were calling me to setting up meetings, where do we start, who we meet with. We talked about meeting sometime next week with Code Enforcement, to identifying [stammer], putting together a program that we can talk about in various districts, and how everybody can figure out how it's a win/win for this community. They've been in here since, like I said, 2014, I was the Vice Chair at the time and this is one of the programs that I've been excited about to really getting this Board to wrap our arms around, throughout this entire City. This is something that we can brag about, this is something that our children can benefit from, this is something that we can recruit good school teachers and keep 'em here in this community, and not be here for one or two years and leave because of the housing market is so unstable. We need to stabilize good teachers, good police officers, good general employees and let's allow folks to benefit off their own land.

And I wanna say thank you to both you gentleman for being so positive about Riviera Beach and being so consi'.., persistent about making sure that you'd be more than willing to do it, 'cause some of the times, folks come before us and you have ask all these questions, hoping they do the right thing. But this was not the case. They were presenting ideas to me and this means that I was just ecstatic about, and I'm sure [inaudible] in our own independent meetings across the City, that you guys will have some fun'.., a fun time with this particular vendor.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Any other comments?

MR. S. BLASIE: Just to add, our parent company is Community Champions. That's how this business.., that's how this business started in 2009. That was the vision of the owners that are with us to this day about putting our footprint in all the communities we, we work with. So that's, that's the end goal. It's not just to create a registry, you were absolutely right.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Mhmm.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: So, for the vacant properties, we.., I wholeheartedly agree with my colleague with regards to stabilizing our communities, but how are we handling those seriously nuisance properties where you have roofs that have caved in? Do we have the wherewithal, as a City, to have those bui'.., once those buildings are demolished, you.., through the use of infill housing or some program from Palm Beach County where we could potentially build homes for first time homebuyers, is that not an option for us? Because, as you ride through the City, you'll see some properties where the roofs have already caved in and yet, there's a for sale sign on it. And so, what, what are you actually selling? So, is there an opportunity for us to identify those properties that are a true nuisance and then seek to have those demolished and consider some infill housing to further stabilize the neighborhoods? Is that an option?

MR. S. BLASIE: Those... I'm sorry. I'm not sure if that's for me, but...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: For...

MR. S. BLASIE: Okay.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Madam Chair, now, we do have, you know, the Nuisance Abatement Board, and to tell you the truth, we would definitely have to consult with Code Enforcement about making sure those properties are cited and take them through the Nuisance Abatement Board. And I believe [pause] we would have to, as I sated, continue to work with Code Enforcement, and I'm not sure if you have any type program or anything like that, that would deal with those type properties, where they're up for sale. They're not in foreclosure, but they're up for sale, then are in, you know, bad condition?

MR. S. BLASIE: We have some strategies around that. There's als'.., a lot of our communities, such as Lake Worth, have a vacant property registry as well.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Mhmm.

MR. S. BLASIE: And again, the funds generated that come back to the City via the registration, can be put towards [stammer], like dem'..., demolishing those properties.

[Inaudible comment]

MR. S. BLASIE: Always willing to work with Staff and do whatever it takes. Sometimes it requires some Code amendments. It's..., the sky's the limit. I mean, there's, there's all kinds of potential there. I think right now, it's..., we just have the foreclosure registry, but we also specialize in vacant property registry, and also rental.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Madam Chair?

MR. S. BLASIE: Any properties that aren't o'..., aren't owner occupied, we view as a potential risk to the community. We building our strategies around those and everything we've done, will allow that credit we have to give to the Staff that we work with throughout our various communities. Because every community has its unique needs for that community, and unique Staff that has unique problems in that community. So, a part of our job is to collaborate with all involved an come up with something that matches that community's needs.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: And, Madam Chair, we can..., we'll..., I'll schedule a meeting with this group and Jeff and Code Enforcement so we can come up with a plan regarding those properties that are in the condition that you mentioned, so we can come up with a plan. I know I've had several residents to approach me about, you know, possibly buying those parcels and demolishing them and, you know, building new homes on 'em. On them.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilman Davis, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: In the mix of the numerous meetings that we've had, I've been approached by gentleman..., actually, the owner of, of Heinz ketchup. The Heinz Family has definitely considered [stammer] making a contribution in the program that we put in place, to do a, a giveback to the housing program. So, I was able to have some discussion about, we don't have a program officially in place, but how can we launch something that where we can target our City employees first? And, come up with some unconventional funding that we can bill it at a rate that allows us to have equity walking in. And so, those..., so we have a lotta different opportunities out there that..., this is one dear to my heart that I definitely be through all the way during this process, because there's been a lotta work put into this for the last three years. So, the, the, the residents, specifically employees first. You know, when you look at wages and the things that are going on, all the employees don't make the high salaries, but I do believe, if you work in your City, you should have the right to own a house in your City. And this would be one of the programs that we have an opportunity to do that with our employees.

Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you. Anything further, Madam, Chair Pro Tem?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: No, ma'am. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Madam Clerk.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Davis?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Yes, ma'am.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Botel?

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Pro Them Hubbard?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Chair Davis Johnson?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Unanimous vote.

MR. S. BLASIE: Thank you.

ITEMS TABLED

REGULAR

DISCUSSION AND DELIBERATION

14.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair, we're now down to Item No. 14.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Mhmm.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: DISCUSSION AND DELIBERATION FOR UNITED HANDS FOR GLOBAL IMPACT (U.H.G.I.) TO ASSIST THE PUBLIC IN STRUCTURING A PUBLIC PRIVATE PARTNERSHIP (P3) DELIVERY BY EXPLORING THE USE OF 63-20 AND 501(C)(3) BONDS TO FINANCE AND OWN PUBLIC FACILITIES FOR THE PUBLIC BENEFIT.

CHAIR PRO-TEM LYNNE L. HUBBARD (561)845-3686

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair, we do have public comment cards on this Item. The acceptance of public comment cards on this Item is now closed.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: This Item was being brought by Chair Pro Tem. Did you want to lead in with anything, or?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: I would just like to say that the group would like to come forward and make a presentation of an..., of a opportunity for the City, for the residents. And so, we'll give them an opportunity to hear from them.

[Pause]

MR. R. JAMES: Good evening, Council. My name is Reggie James. I'm the CEO and President of United Hands for Global Impact.

MS. T. MORRIS: Good evening, Council. I'm Trinette Morris. I'm the Vice President of U.H.G.I., as well. There's some members that are not present today, [Inaudible] McCray, Sandra Wilkerson and Jason Bonner is here as well. He's in the back by...

[Inaudible comments]

MR. R. JAMES: United Hands for Global Impact is a nonprofit organization geared towards financing infrastructure redevelopment. Our goals are to invest in public projects, such as redeveloping communities and crumbling infrastructures, and give citizens an authentic driver's seat as investors in these public projects. U.H.G.I. is a 63-20 rule nonprofit organization, specializing in finance and infrastructure redevelopment for cities that have reached their debt limit and are looking for innovative ways to finance these projects without having to increase the cost of living so heavily on their residents. U.H.G.I. forms a public partnership, public/private partnership P3, with the governing body in order to maximize public benefit and social infrastructure projects. Some of these projects include stormwater and sewage, residential and commercial redevelopment.

Financing, we offer two forms of financing, tax exempt financing and financing through tax deductible contributions from our federal, state and local municipalities. And also grants from those institutions as well. Tax exempt financing, usually offers lower interest rates, requires 1.0 debt coverage ratio, longer terms, fi'..., longer terms to finance, and also, they finance 100% of the cost and requires no equity in these projects.

The other form of our..., the other form of financing our organization offers is what we advocate, and that's the approach..., the, the advocating of using the imperial design for the approach and funding these projects. What the imperial design does is allow our tax..., it allows out residents and contributors to invest their contribution. We represent as..., we represent that contribution as an investment, in order so that residents could see a financial ROI, a return of investment, on their contribution. The money is raised through our matching mechanism, which turns out..., which turns the property tax base, which makes the Riviera Beach property tax base a part of our, of our member base that we position to go after those federal grants and municipal contributions. The surplus that is created from these particular projects, we, we recycle them back into the community, and invest them in projects for residents that need new ho'..., new windows, driveways, roofs, we feel that as taxpayers, as the, the people that will contributing the most...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Mhmm.

MR. R. JAMES: ...it's our job to make sure the public receives the maximum amount of benefits that these particular markets are bringing. And that's what we do as our [inaudible]...

[Coughing]

MR. R. JAMES: ...organization.

MAYOR MASTERS: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Mr. Mayor, you're recognized.

MAYOR MASTERS: Now, the first sentence, we offer two forms of financing.

MR. R. JAMES: Yes.

MAYOR MASTERS: Does that mean that you've already acquired the financing, or what does that mean?

MR. R. JAMES: That means, once.., after we analyze the need, which is how much money is going to be needed to redevelop this specific, specific projects, we choose the best funding mechanism in order to go about doing that. So, authe'.., authentically, it happens after the fact, like, we have to find out what your specific needs are, funding wise...

MAYOR MASTERS: Mhmm.

MR. R. JAMES: ...and then go after them. That's based on the approach that you all choose would be best for the citizens.

MAYOR MASTERS: Is this the same program that you've been talking about for years?

MR. R. JAMES: Yes, sir.

MAYOR MASTERS: The co'.., like, back in, in the day that I'm from, they used to call it a co-op kinda thing that, that they had in Chicago that was very, very popular.

MR. R. JAMES: Yes, sir.

MAYOR MASTERS: What is the...

MR. R. JAMES: ...It's a form of it.

MAYOR MASTERS: What is it exactly that you're asking the City to do?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: [Inaudible].

MR. R. JAMES: We're asking...

MAYOR MASTERS: [Inaudible]....

MR. R. JAMES: ...the City...

MAYOR MASTERS: ...the entity here.

MR. R. JAMES: Like, the, the license is being..., is, is needed to redevelop our library, our City Hall and, and our fire stations. We're asking the City that we channel and universalize all of our redevelopment projects, and development projects. We trace the tax dollar that will be used in the projects and give it, its, its rightful representation as an investment. So that the money that is contributed, is not just taken from our tax bill, but it's recycled and given back to them with interest.

MAYOR MASTERS: I wanna make sure I understand. You're asking the City to...

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: [Inaudible].

MAYOR MASTERS: ...to put, put up some money up front or to?

MR. R. JAMES: I'm asking the City to allow the, the dollars that would be used towards funding infrastructure rate development, to be represented in a way that it is an investment, it is seen as an investment contribution by your taxpayers, in order for them to receive a return on that, that dollar that is being .

MAYOR MASTERS: Well, I'm glad you got Trinette with you 'cause I know her and she's a great person to have on your team. The best cook in Palm Beach County. [Chuckles]. Thank you.

[Chuckles]

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Any questions?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: [Inaudible], I wanna ask you this for, just for example sake for the, for the general public. For example, with the water bill Riviera Beach, we..., right now, for example, we have borrowed money on the water bill, so our water bill increases for..., increases every, every year.

MR. R. JAMES: [Inaudible].

MS. T. MORRIS: Right.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Right now, we're not able to write our water bill off as a tax deduction.

MR. R. JAMES: Uhuh.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: But say that same money, that same loan is borrowed through a 63-20 certification...

MR. R. JAMES: Yes.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: ...while we borrowed it, we borrowed it from BB&T, or whatever bank we got it from, we didn't borrow it under a 63-20 certification, but we borrow this money, or restructure or refinance this debt...

MR. R. JAMES: Yes.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Now when I pay my water bill, every month, at the end of the year, I get to write that whole twelve months off as a tax deduction?

MR. R. JAMES: It will be based on the percentage of what is left after operational costs.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Mhmm.

MR. R. JAMES: So we can't claim the entire base, because it has to go towards operating and running your facility, but what is left over, the surplus that is created from that., the water the industry does create, yes, that will be written off.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Oh. Like, on the water bill, I know we see sewer, we see this, we see a lot of things other than the gallons of water, so to that end, I understand that the whole bill itself wouldn't be written off, but [stammer]...

MR. R. JAMES: Those are ticket increases.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: But we will be able to deduct those., some of those charges...

MR. R. JAMES: Yes.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: ...off of our, our taxes. So, our e'., so, we're more or less investing into our water bill and we're writing it off at the end of the year, a portion of it?

MR. R. JAMES: Yes. And we know with the amount of incentives that will be given from the federal government to the, to the private investors, it's our goal to make that, the largest base of investors, be the taxpayers. That way, the privatized end doesn't receive so much of the benefit, it ties the public into the financial benefit as well.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Okay. So, what., just for example sake, one more thing I wanna ask.

MR. R. JAMES: Mhmm.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: For., when you talk about the pri'., the private side benefitting and the residents benefitting, one we're saying that the bank, or the lending institutions that the government gives these dollars to...

MR. R. JAMES: Mhmm.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: ...to distribute, they're incentivized by being trustees or overseers of those dollars? But their role is to put 'em out into, to the municipality, too the City, so the communities, at a zero interest rate, or a very interest rate...

MR. R. JAMES: Yes.

MS. T. MORRIS: Right.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: But, how they benefit from that, is the fact that the government allows them to invest or borrow, or lend parts of that money, because otherwise, they wouldn't make any money.

MR. R. JAMES: Right.

MS. T. MORRIS: Right.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Off of it. So, on the public., how it., and, and again, that's our benefits, us a public because the zero, or low interest rate, we, we in turn would get to write, we get to write it off as opposed to just a debt gone...

MR. R. JAMES: Right.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: ...every year.

MR. R. JAMES: So, for..., so for one example, the City needs a new library and a new City Hall. Right? So ultimately, that's gonna come, and the City doesn't have the money sitting aside to go and do it so you're ultimately going to have to go out and borrow. So, wherever you go, wherever you attach that increase to go out and borrow, that now becomes a tax deductible contribution on behalf of your residents, that we take and make it an investment to go after matching based grants. So, we pool all of our resources, all of our monies that we have sitting, and it becomes a base to match from other municipalities, and also our sta'., and at our state and federal level.

This, this, if we do choose to borrow, it aides with the amount that we have to go and borrow, right? And then, it also gives it a guarantee that our residents will receive their money back. And that's what we're really asking in this era, is that we give the taxpayers a strong voice so that they are not overlooked, they are not just contributors to these particular causes, but investors. And I feel like that is just the rightful place as people that will be contributing their money towards these issues [pause], these projects.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: So, you're saying that the monies that's to be contributed is going to come from the taxpayer base? A, a taxpayer base?

MR. R. JAMES: Yes. So, for instance, you property taxes to be used, and positioned, the money that is, that is created from in your general budget, from your property taxes, right? We represent that dollar, and ask the corporations that are surrounding in our, participants as well, to match that contribution.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: I need you to clarify the, the statement that you just made, or just simply it.

MR. R. JAMES: Okay.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: As it relates to.., you're saying my, my property tax.

MR. R. JAMES: Okay. Out of the general budget, I believe... So, we'll just use loose [inaudible] right... Is.., that's, that's accept'.., that's acceptable? To use loose numbers?

MS. T. MORRIS: No.

MR. R. JAMES: Nothing [inaudible], okay. So for instance, say our property tax are in our budget, \$75,000,000 representing the money that's coming from your property taxes, follow?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: I'm , I,m with you.

MR. R. JAMES: We take that same \$75,000,000 and we ask municipalities, and corporations, to match that contribution.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: I'm just not.., I'm not clear on, on how you would.., how you would gain access to the property tax dollars. Is that through an authorization...

MR. R. JAMES: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...by the City? How, you know, how do we make a determination as to how we utilize property tax dollars for a program such as this?

MR. R. JAMES: Okay. So, one form would be through an assessment. Right? We create an assessment that speaks to funding these redevelopment needs. Right? Once that assessment.., after that assessment has been, has been taken and transferred over, that.., after the assessment has been taken and transferred over, we represent that dollar value amount, as the ma'.., the amount that we're taking to represent on behalf.., the same way as we would if we were going to represent to.., on, on that, on that dollar value to borrow. Right? You're represented in the same manner as if you were going to borrow, but you're representing it for grants.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: So then, technically, you're, you're.., would the suggestion be that the Council levy, in addition to those things that currently show up on our property tax bill...

[Inaudible comment]

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...would there be a levying of this assessment to fund the projects that you are mentioning?

MR. R. JAMES: Mhmm. [Pause]. Yes.

MS. T. MORRIS: Yes. Essentially, yes.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Mhmm.

MAYOR MASTERS: [Stammer]...

MS. T. MORRIS: That is one way.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Mhmm.

MS. T. MORRIS: That is one... That, that, that is a possibility.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: And what are the other possibilities?

MS. T. MORRIS: Um...

MAYOR MASTERS: Speak in the mic, come to the mic, Trinette.

[Inaudible comments]

MR. R. JAMES: Another possibility as far as?

UNK: To raise the funds.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: To raise your fund.

MR. R. JAMES: Borrowing would..., is the only other.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: And who would do the borrowing? Would it be...

MR. R. JAMES: The issued...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...the City or would it be...

MR. R. JAMES: We are the conduit issuer, that represents on behalf of the City. U.H.G.I.

MS. T. MORRIS: [Inaudible].

MR. R. JAMES: [Inaudible].

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilwoman Botel, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: I sent a text to the City Manager. Could she read it, please?

[Pause]

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Councilwoman Botel wrote, I want to refer this to the City Manager and Finance for further review. I'm afraid that it won't be understood on the microphone. So, she states that it's too confusing to vote on without a thorough review by Administration. And I'm not sure..., you didn't wanna vote or anything, right, Councilwoman Hubbard? You...

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: No. We... What, what the group wanted to do, was make a presentation. They wanted.., they, I think they, they met with everybody up here. They wanted to have a, a say at the, at the microphone. And I understand the recommendation that they're asking for is just that, to have.., to approve Staff to explore a.., to explore a...

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Okay.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: ...partnership with U.G., U.H.G.I. and that was, that was exactly what they said. They wanted us to, to have a consensus, for Staff to sit with them and explore the possibility of a partnership with U.H.G.I. Is that correct?

MR. R. JAMES: Yes.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: So, yeah. No. They, they, they weren't asking for a vote on anything, they were just making a presentation and wanted a consensus that Staff would sit with them to explore the possibility. And they, you know, they did talk and meet with everybody up here. So, there you have it.

MAYOR MASTERS: Madam Chair?

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Madam Chair?

MAYOR MASTERS: Sorry.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilwoman Botel, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Thank you. I'm fine with their [inaudible].

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: I can't understand what she's saying.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: I'm sorry. Can someone...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: [Inaudible].

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...translate? What was that?

[Chuckle]]

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: [Inaudible].

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: She texts and said, 'Okay. Explore is fine.'

MAYOR MASTERS: Okay. Madam...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Mr. Manager... Sorry. Mr. Mayor, you're recognized.

MAYOR MASTERS: Thank you, Madam Chair.

At some point, after, I guess, after they explore, you look at this, it's probably gonna have to be some kind of workshop if it goes any further, 'cause I don't understand any of it, to be honest. Some of it. I'm trying to understand but it's gon'.., I'm old and slow.

[Chuckles]

MAYOR MASTERS: So, it's gonna take me a little bit more time to, to comprehend this. But what I do know, is that you've been very faithful in bringing this... [Stammer].., I haven't met with you on this. I think Councilwoman Hubbard said everyone else up here but not me. Right? Okay. But you have been very faithful, and you haven't given up, and this is something that you've talked about, and I think that to, to get more buy-in, I think you just have to simplify it. Because [stammer] that, that we can grasp.., even the Staff can, can understand and comprehend it better, because it's somewhat foreign to, to us. It's something that we have not done, and when anything is new, you just gotta give examples and just break it down. And, I know Mr.., one of the Councilpeople used to say, 'Break it down that I can understand it if I was in the third grade.' 'Cause I know you have a degree, and I appreciate the fact that you went and, and got your degree and doing, doing good. Let me just ask one final question. Is this being used anywhere else? In the county or in the state, or anywhere in the United States that you can also bring data to, when you meet with those that are going to sit down and explore the possibilities?

MR. R. JAMES: Yes.

MAYOR MASTERS: Where?

MR. R. JAMES: In multiple municipalities across our state. Whenever you see a fire station or police station, a City Hall, a courthouse being built, this is a form.., this is a license that they use to do it.

MAYOR MASTERS: Okay. Well, you'll bring that to, that information to the ex'.., exploratory committee?

MR. R. JAMES: Yes.

MAYOR MASTERS: [Chuckle]. Alright. That's just my word. Thanks for coming...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Madam Chair?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Madam Chair?

MAYOR MASTERS: ...and presenting this.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilwoman Botel, you're.., I'm sorry. Councilwoman Miller-Anderson, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: I understand you all did meet.., you all met with Mr. Sherman at some point?

MR. R. JAMES: Yes.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Okay. Is Mr. Sherman able just to give his input on what this entails?

MAYOR MASTERS: Well, he, he doesn't understand it, he don't know.

[Chuckles]

MAYOR MASTERS: He's gonna come here and fake it like he know what he's, what's talking about. He's still learning too. [Chuckle]. I'm just kidding, Mr. Sherman.

FINANCE DIRECTOR SHERMAN: Good evening. Randy Sherman...

UNK: [Inaudible].

FINANCE DIRECTOR SHERMAN: ...Finance Director.

Yeah. We've met three or four times, at least.

MR. R. JAMES: Yes.

FINANCE DIRECTOR SHERMAN: I, I think. And I still have a lot of questions. I'm trying to get the same answers that, that you're, you know, trying to ask up here. Basically, again, I think the overall concept is, is if they can get some funds, that they can leverage and get some donations on, it therefore reduces the cost and anything you can get something that's tax deductible, in essence, you're getting the federal government to pay for part of it. That, that's kind of the overall concept. There's a lot more information we need...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Mhmm.

FINANCE DIRECTOR SHERMAN: ...to gather and, and analyze but...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: But are you familiar with the 63-20?

FINANCE DIRECTOR SHERMAN: I am familiar with 63-20's and again, what that does, is it takes our tax exempt borrowing authority, I guess is the proper term, and allows them to use it. So again, whether we go out and borrow tax exempt, or they go out and borrow tax exempt, it's gets you the same, same place. So gain, [stammer] and think of it almost like the CRA...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: I was getting ready to get you that .

FINANCE DIRECTOR SHERMAN: Yeah. The CRA has that exempt borrowing authority. So it's a.., it's kinda similar in that regard.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Okay.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: That's great.

FINANCE DIRECTOR SHERMAN: So I, I like the suggestion, I think, you know, send it to the Manager, we'll sit down, we'll meet again and certainly add the Attorney in and, and it's...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Okay. Thank you.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilman Davis, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Thank you. I would just like to say to, to the young lady and the young man that's standing before us today, it makes me proud to see folks...

MAYOR MASTERS: Yes.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: ...in their own community, really be persistent, being very serious in their research, of giving residents the opportunity of ownership. This is a instrument that you don't see quite often, because when you heard the gentleman speak about the membership, he was talking about you, the taxpayers. You have an opportunity to participate, to make sure that you reinvest in your own water bill [chuckle], in your own infrastructure that you pay every month, and get a return on that investment, and have a voice on it. So, I, I think the community's, as they learn just as much as other learned, it's gonna be probably more than just excited to see something that most cities don't have the courage to even consider. And, to my colleagues, I, I wanna say thank you to them for cons'..., for giving them the opportunity to take us into another space of really delivering something for our own people. And using their resources to help them, so they can help themselves. Too many times you, you look at other cities where the bond companies come before you and they borrow, borrow, borrow, borrow and banks get breaks, the bond people move on to other cities, and the people are left to fit the bill. This is an opportunity where that won't happen.

So, I'm excited about it, you know, and I'm very proud that you..., I'll never forget the first time you came before me. It was bout three or four years ago, you talked about it and you talked about the things that you're gonna do as far as putting the mechanism in place, getting the resources around you, and you've done that. So, I'm excited to see where we go from here. I don't think it's something that we should take lightly, not to say anyone did, but I, I see the vision. And, and you're a young man that I've seen speak this vision to people...

MAYOR MASTERS: Yes.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: ...and I've seen people look at you as if something was wrong with you the first time you spoke, but the second time you spoke, they're like, 'Wow. Hold on.' I mean, we can get a return of our own investment? Nah for real, no you. The bank's gonna do it, why can't you do it for yourself? And allowing the community to participate, I think, is amazing. So...

MAYOR MASTERS: Yes.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: ...just continue being very transparent and, and giving opportunity for you to really take this City to next level with the Commission, as we move forward together with, with this opportunity.

FINANCE DIRECTOR SHERMAN: Thank you.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: But they're still [inaudible around, but I'm excited about it. I, I get it.

MAYOR MASTERS: Right.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: I get it.

MAYOR MASTERS: Thank you.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: I, I'd just like to say thank you for the presentation, the education and the information and we look forward to hearing from you after you meet with Staff and, and learning more about the project.

MR. R. JAMES: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: I echo those sentiments. So, the direction from the Board is to send this to the City Manager, Finance and the City Attorney's office. I, I understand. I'm just wanting to make sure that that is the direction?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Yes, ma'am.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: We do have a public comment card. So, Madam Clerk.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Bessie Brown.

UNK: She said no.

UNK: Is she here?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: She's here. She's pass'...

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: She wants to pass.

[Inaudible audience comment]

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: She said she'll pass, Madam Chair.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: That concludes public comment cards on that Item.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Ms. Lawson has her hand up. Do you have a card for Ms. Larson?

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: I have a public comment card here that does not have it's name on it. I don't know if it belongs to Ms. Larson.

MS. B. LARSON: [Inaudible].

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair, I have one here that does not have a name on it. It may be Ms. Larson's I'm not for certain.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: [Inaudible].

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: If she wants to come look at it and see if it's her handwriting, she, she's more than welcome to do so.

MAYOR MASTERS: Ms. Larson, how could you ever forget your name, to put on the card? Not you.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Is that your handwriting?

MS. B. LARSON: Yes.

MAYOR MASTERS: [Chuckle].

MS. B. LARSON: My fault, my fault.

MAYOR MASTERS: You were just in a hurry, weren't you?

MS. B. LARSON: Okay.

MAYOR MASTERS: [Chuckle].

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: So Madam Chair, the.., she did turn in the card prior to the item.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Okay.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: She just didn't have her name on the card.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Alright.

MS. B. LARSON: I did forget to put in a public comment card. So, wait'll next week.

I'm with Mayor Masters, I'll get it. [Chuckle]. And I would hope that our City Finance Director would've known about this. He said he does, and if it was something that we could've pursued, I would think he would be the one to bring it, rather than us going through a third party. I really don't understand it.

MAYOR MASTERS: [Chuckle].

MS. B. LARSON: But, the things I didn't like about... Oh, you asked a question but the answer was kinda sketchy. How long has this company been in business? [Inaudible] asked if this has been somewhere else and they said, 'Yes. And other cities,' and

whatever. My question is, what has this company done and where? What is their track record? So, that would be my question.

The other thing is, the thing that I didn't like I heard was, our property taxes would go to this company to be used for this. The other thing was, we'd get something back, but we're not sure how much because it had to be after expenses and this, that and the other, so that was very unclear. And the other thing was... What's the other thing? Oh, that we would be able to have a write-off for our water bills. I'd just like us to have lower water bills. A wrote-off, how many people in this City have write-offs when they do their tax returns. Probably not many.

So, this is still very unclear to me and, and we have a Finance Director who's been with us for a number of years, we have a Water Utility Director. These are the people that... No, it's not Water Utility, I'm sorry. We have people within the City who should've brought this up, if it was something that was feasible for us to do and it would benefit, but I don't see this as being a benefit to the residents. I really don't see that. Them taking our property taxes and doing this. We should do it inhouse, if it's a good idea to do. But, as far as the public getting something back, no. I'm gonna say we're not gonna get anything back.

So, that's my question. What has this company done successfully? How long have they been in business? What have they done successfully? Give us some examples of those, just before they do the exploration.

Thank you.

[Inaudible audience comments]

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair that concludes public comments at this time.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you. So again, we are at consensus where this will go to exploratory. That is the direction of the Board.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Yes, ma'am.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Alrighty.

15.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Item No. 15.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair, we do have public comment cards on Item No. 15. The acceptance of public comment cards on this Item is now closed.

DC: DISCUSSION AND DELIBERATION REGARDING THE DISTRIBUTION AND EDUCATION OF CHARTER AMENDMENTS INFORMATION.

CITY CLERK CLAUDENE ANTHONY (561)845-4090

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: [Inaudible].

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Madam Chair, while she sets up, there are.., there will be four, four Charter amendments on the March 12th ballot, and you all spoke about in previous meetings, the importance of educating the voters of Riviera Beach about the four Charter amendments, and by Florida statute, we can use [stammer] City funds educating the public. Ms. Robinson, City Clerk will give a presentation on the Items that have been development to talk about the education piece. And, the PSA, the education, the PSA, the.., any.., a pamphlet, whatever you all feel are.., give us a consensus on that, we need to use to educate the public. Ms. Robinson.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair? Upon the recension of the veto by the Mayor for the Charter.., four Charter amendments that were approved by the elected Board, the amendments were submitted to the Supervisor of Elections Office. But there was a concern about the public being educated about the amendments. Ms. Burgess, Deputy City Clerk, took the.., took on this, well, as assigned this task to see what template we could follow, as it related to educating the public regarding the Charter amendments. She went throughout the State of Florida. Some of the municipalities that she looked into, were the City of Apopka, the Town of Davie, City of Gainesville, Town of Hillsborough Beach, City of Niceville, City of Ocoee, Village of Palm Springs, City of Pinellas Park, City of South Bar, City of Temple Terrace, and Orange County. In an effort to be as economically responsible as possible, Ms. Burgess came up with a couple of ideas that she submitted to the City Manager. One was a trifold brochure. One was a PSA, that will be done in English, Spanish and French.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: [Inaudible].

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: And along with, we will also advertise the, the sample ballot as required by law. You all have before you, some approximate costs that it will.., that we will incur as it relate to this educational piece. If you look at the information that has been provide to you, she provided approximate advertisement cost for the Charter amendments that we are required to do as our special election, and that will be approximately \$1,400 for.., we are required to do two advertisements. It will be.., it has to be displayed. The total cost for both advertisements is approximately \$1,400. That is in addition to our responsibility of advertising the sample ballot, and if we have a runoff but we will.., the notification and publication that we will have to do that.

So, you will see on the paperwork that she sees that the total estimated cost to advertise in the Palm Beach Post as required by the state statute, will be almost \$7,700. We also have to advertise in Spanish, and our Spanish version is advertised in El Latino. The total for everything that we are required to advertise in Spanish will be approximately \$2,600.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilman Davis, you're rec'.., you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: I just wanna catch the..., talk with the Clerk, have that..., when we talk about the Spanish speaking language, have we considered the Creole speaking language as well?

[Inaudible comment]

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: We have a large, growing Creole population.

MAYOR MASTERS: Yes. The Haitian...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: And it, it's...

MAYOR MASTERS: ...community. Absolutely.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Right down below...

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: As it re'...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...[inaudible]...

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: As it relate' to...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Oh, I see it. Way at the bottom.

MAYOR MASTERS: [Inaudible].

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: As it relate' to advertising in the..., in a publication that is...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: [Inaudible].

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: ...driven towards the Haitian community...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: [Inaudible]...

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: ...we are not familiar with one. However, we are required by state law to do Spanish. So, if we do Creole, it will be just to make sure that our Haitian community...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: [Inaudible]...

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: ...is able to see as well. We are not required, it would just be a courtesy. However, Ms. Burgess did put together a brochure...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Mhmm.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: ...and, as required by state law, we will do it in Spanish, but if we will also do the brochure in Creole, we have before you three approximate costs for this endeavor. I took the liberty to try to add some numbers, and for the trifold brochure with, say for instance, 'Can We Talk,' when you look at the Spanish and Creole trifold bro'..., brochure, along with the approximately cost for postage...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Mhmm.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: ...and the approx'..., approximate cost for printing, we're looking at approximately, plus advertisement costs, we're looking at approximately \$57,000. That does not include the PSA. The PSA, we will have to get a Spanish interpreter, we will get a Creole interpreter and we will have to get someone that does sign language. What I have just given you does not include that cost. We were not able to get approximate costs on that as of yet, as of by the end of the day today.

As it relate' to the brochure cost that you see, our..., the legal counsel for the Charter Review Advisory Board was tasked with putting something together. He put what we would consider as a booklet together because of the amount of information that he put in it. As you can see when you look at this, I went with the, 'Can We Talk.' And, what I did was, add up the cost of the postage...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Mhmm.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: ...and the printing for that and advertisement, we're looking at almost \$130,000. That does not include, again, the PSA. What Ms. Burgess also recommended was that we do not put the booklet, put [stammer] together by the legal counsel, we don't print it. That we do, however, put it on the City's website. That way, we will only pay for the translation cost.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Okay.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: But not putting it in print. So, in other words, what we recommended to the City Manager is that we do a trifold brochure, which will look something like this. It will be trifold and it would have all three languages in it.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Mhmm.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: And send it out to our registered voters.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Mhmm.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: So, we have presented approximate costs to you. As you can see, it's not cheap.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Mhmm.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Even with going with the brochure and the p'..., PSA, we're looking at that amount equaling the total cost that we will probably pay for the March 12, 2019 election. So, in other words, the City Clerk's budget, election budget, would need additional funding because we're not funded for this at this time. Also, in addition, this information will not be sent out until after the voter's registration book has closed. And the reason for that, we want to make sure that every registered voter, within the City of Riviera Beach, receives this information. If you all go with the trifold, and we put the information that legal counsel put together on the website, I think that will be the most economical.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Madam Ch'...

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: For us...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Madam Chair?

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: ...at this time.

[Inaudible audience comment]

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilwoman Miller-Anderson...

MAYOR MASTERS: [Inaudible] days.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Obviously, that is very high. So, have we considered, I know we probably were looking at more of print, but possibly doing, I think the Mayor might have mentioned when he was talking about doing the education piece of it, maybe doing a video and have somebody do it in English.., basically, reading off.., [stammer] interview format, read off the information that would be in the, in the pamphlet, have someone do it in English, Creole, Spanish. And then also, you.., it can be put on to social media, it could be put on the website, even the video, put on the website, on, on Youtube. It can be sent out by.., if anyone has an email, but still have the print on the website, still have maybe a print'.., printed version located here, in case someone comes up to the.., comes up to the City Hall and don't have access to the computer or whatever. Some people just like to have that paper in their hand. And, I think there's a lotta ways to get the information out there without having to spend as much money. And especially, you don't even know if people are gonna read it.., not that they're not gonna read it, but I'm just saying, there's a number of ways of communicating that.., versus spending this amount of money for it.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Madam Clerk.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: I totally understand the concern, that's why we did put PSA in there, because we were trying to be fiscally responsible. However, we wanted to give you all the various options that are available and we look for your direction.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilman Davis, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Madam Clerk, with the Charter Review Committee, was there a, a budget impact discussion with this, with the Review Committee, prior to him submitting this information to the Board? The Charter Review Committee?

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: No, this was not. This was done at the direction of the governing Board.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: So, there was never a discussion to talk about what impact the Charter Review items was gonna have on this Fiscal Year for the.., this election?

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: If I understand your cor'.., your question correctly, Councilperson Davis, my apologies, Madam Chair, you're asking if this informational piece, if the cost of this informational piece was discussed with the City's Charter Review...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Yes, ma'am.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: ...Advisory Board. This information regarding educating the public, regarding these amendments, was not at the request of the Charter Review Advisory Board. Unless they came to you all individually, this was at the request of the Mayor and the governing Board.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Okay. Another question. When we did the res'.., when Staff did the research on all the cities' education piece, how many.., what was the timeframe from start to finish, of how long they had a chance to educate the community prior to the election?

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Unfortunately... Madam Chair? Unfortunately, when Ms. Burgess did this research, we found that the majority of the municipalities that she surveyed, they did not provide such a piece.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Wow.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: There was only.., the, the Town of Palm Springs, here in Palm Beach County, they did theirs.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Mhmm.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Theirs was mostly done on the web.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Mhmm.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Other municipalities did not...

MAYOR MASTERS: [Inaudible].

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: ...do such as this. They didn't even put a piece on their website.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Mhmm.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: So, we kind of had to, a lack of better, better words, fly by the seat of our pants, and try to come up with something that was most economical for our community.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: And last, the, the one issue I had, while I supported, you know, Charter reviews and Charter discussions, the issue I had with this year is that,

from the time of approval versus between the time of voting, we have a very small window to get this information to the public, so they can have a clear thought and understanding of each issue. We just spent the whole year addressing Amendment 4, Amendment 5, all these different amendment across the State of Florida and folks., and there was some real money spent to get this information out, and folks really went to the polls with some real' understanding of what was going on. But it took some time for us to get there. And, my only concern is that here we are in January, and we haven't approved., and this not on Staff, this Board., and the Charter Review Board hasn't come to an agreement of giving this City enough time to give them the information out, so they can get all the education of understanding all the issues related to just the Charter Review, and all the Charter amendments. And that was my concern from the get-go. I, I had nothing against the Charter Review Committee putting some things together but my only issue was getting some things done in, in a, in a timely manner so that we can go through this entire City and get the information out, so the people can really be clear about every single issue, and not rush to make a decision when they go to the polls in., on, on March 12th. And that was the only concern I had.

That's all [inaudible]...

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Madam Chair?

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Madam Chair?

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Madam Manager.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Thank you.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Just to let you know, Councilwoman Botel text me and she would like to let it be known that she pri'.., she presented the amendments at the recent COSA meeting, and they used materials prepared by the Charter Review Committee. The Chair of the Charter Review Committee is presenting the amendments to her Singer Island Town Hall meeting tomorrow night, and that she could disseminate the information via email for free to all Singer Island, using SECA and COSA. And she also stated that she thought \$130,000 is too much money to spend on dissemination of the information. So, if you all would just... And she also stated that she would like the information placed on the web, and via email.

Thank you.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair? Just in case there was a mi'.., misunderstanding, if we.., if we are directed to do a PSA, that can be done as soon as we can round everyone up and put out, we do not have to wait until after the voter's registration book closed.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: [Inaudible].

MAYOR MASTERS: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: I believe that Councilman Davis, I heard you.

[Inaudible dais comment]

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: That's alright.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: I thought I heard you...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: [Inaudible] just now?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Did you have any... Did I hear you?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: [Inaudible].

MAYOR MASTERS: That was me.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Okay.

MAYOR MASTERS: [Chuckle].

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: [Inaudible].

UNK: The Mayor.

MAYOR MASTERS: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Yes, Mayor, you're recognized.

MAYOR MASTERS: Dr. Botel, I guess, added.., calculated that up, it's \$130,000? Is that...

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Approximately \$130,000. That's if we go with the printing of the book, which is the information that the legal counsel put together. If we go with that, the printing and the postage cost, along with the publication that we're required to do by state statute, will come up to almost \$130,000.

MAYOR MASTERS: If you did no printing at all for the amendments part, how, how much would that reduce the book.., the price of the book? If you just, just used a PSA as, as KaShamba Miller.., Councilwoman Miller-Anderson said, you use your website, Dr. Botel said she'd make sure that both sides are presented to SECA and, an whoever else. How much would, would be saved?

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair? As previously stated, as it related to the PSA, we do not have any, any approximate cost for the PSA. I am quite sure it would be a lot less, way less, then what is presented as far as printed costs. As it relate to the information that was prepared by the legal counsel, the only thing we would do is pay for the translation portion an then it would be placed by Staff on the City's website. So, the cost for that will be no more than, I would think...

MAYOR MASTERS: Minimum.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: ...approximately \$2,000.

MAYOR MASTERS: Minimum.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: As it relate to that portion. And but, you know, we still have our, our publication requirements that we are required to do by state law.

MAYOR MASTERS: Right. But you'll save a lot of money if you, if you went that route?

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: If we went the PSA and just put the information on the web, that will be way cheaper.

MAYOR MASTERS: And then, we could also use Channel 18.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: The, the PSA would run on...

MAYOR MASTERS: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: ...on, on 18.

MAYOR MASTERS: So, any PSA should be zero. Public Service Announcements are free.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: You do have to pay for those, Madam Chair, you do have to pay for the translator and the person that will be here doing the sign language.

MAYOR MASTERS: But, I mean, if you use PSA for radio or anything like that, PSA's are free.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair, please understand that anything you do election related, it has to be translated in Spanish, that is required by law.

MAYOR MASTERS: Oh, okay. Well, thank you for telling me that. Let me.., 'cause I didn't know that. But let me, let me just say this. I, I.., two things. One is, I'm, I'm really concerned that if anything goes out in print, that it is fair and that it tells the pro side, what a yes vote would mean and what a no vote would mean. And I hope that, that that happens, and it's not [pause] spent any...

[Inaudible dais comment]

MAYOR MASTERS: ...other way.

[Inaudible dais comment]

MAYOR MASTERS: And maybe the, the Attorney that the Charter people had was.., could maybe, could do that. But, whoever, but it has to be both sides. You just cannot.., if it's gonna be educationable, then it has to be pro and con. That's, that's my biggest concern.

The second concern I would have is the wait of thirty days, or thirty.., people can register to vote, as you know, up to thirty days prior to the election. Is that, is that correct?

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Voter's registration books for the March 12, 2019 election, Madam Chair, closes February 11, 2019.

MAYOR MASTERS: Okay. Well, basically, about 28, 29 days something. Pretty close. But here, here's the deal with, with that. The absentee ballots go out before that registration is closed, is that correct?

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: That's..., I don't have that information in...

MAYOR MASTERS: Yeah. They...

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: ...front of me.

MAYOR MASTERS: Well, trust me. I think I almost wrote the absentee ballot law, so I do know that.

[Chuckle]

MAYOR MASTERS: They, they go out about six weeks before. So, the people that are voting and we..., even I know, and everyone else knows that pays attention, that the absentee ballot population has tremendously grown. So, I don't want them not to be educated because we're waiting for everyone to get registered, until the books are closed. So, if there's gonna be print, please take in consideration, or find out when the absentee ballots go out. When the military ballots go out, even before the absentee ballots go out. So that is to be taken into consideration.

The, the other thing is the... Well, the absentee and, and the time, there was one more thing that I wanted to say but I don't, I don't remember what it was. But anyway, it'll come back to me.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Madam Chair?

MAYOR MASTERS: [Inaudible] senior moments.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilwoman Miller-Anderson, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: So, the content., you're talking about what was in the backup?

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Yes, ma'am.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: So, but..., does [stammer]. I don't see where it gives the pros and the cons. It, it just basically says what it is.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: If you continue to scroll down, they're by bullet point, the references that he provided.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: [Inaudible] though, it doesn't give you...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: No. It's just the...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...the pros'...

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: No. It doesn't give the...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: You know, if you're thinking...

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: ...pros...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: If you're...

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: It does not provide...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...thinking, like, what the...

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: ...the pros or cons.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...Constitutional amendment...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Right.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: How the Constitutional...

MAYOR MASTERS: [Inaudible].

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...amendments were written out, it gave the pros and the cons...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Right.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...a yes vote means this, a no vote means that. So, this information that was provided, was provided from...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: The attorney.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...Charter amendment attorney?

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Yes, ma'am.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: So, with the content being written, who would.., well, who would be the one to.., would we get that attorney, him to write, or our Attorney to write the pros and the cons?

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Madam Manager.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: I, I think we would use the Charter attorney.., Charter review attorney. I don't know if Attorney **WYNN** want.., wanna chime in or?

CITY ATTORNEY WYNN: We were working together. The problem with giving the pros and the cons in this instance, because the City is paying for it...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Right.

CITY ATTORNEY WYNN: ...is that we don't want anyone to be accused of electioneering.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Mhmm.

CITY ATTORNEY WYNN: So, we can't tell people to vote in favor of something, or that we oppose something, or that we want them to oppose something, we just have to give them the facts. So, this is strictly an educational campaign, with the facts.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Right. But would you be able to give what a yes means and what a no means? That's not saying you're telling them to vote yes or no, but you can just say what will happen...

CITY ATTORNEY WYNN: Any..., what the result is? Yes, we could do that.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Okay.

CITY ATTORNEY WYNN: And I'll work with him on that.

MAYOR MASTERS: The facts are...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Okay.

MAYOR MASTERS: ...[inaudible] both sides of that. Madam Chair?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: [Inaudible].

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Mr. Mayor, you're recognized.

MAYOR MASTERS: It came back to me. I...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: [Inaudible]...

MAYOR MASTERS: ...agree with Councilman Davis, and that's why I have so much pause here as it came to..., and, and so much deliberations to think about, as it relates to the timeframe. Thirty days certainly is not, I mean, [chuckle], we're limiting..., can't get anything out until the books close, which is about twenty-eight..., twenty-eight, twenty-nine days before the election. Now we have limited the timeframe to, to, less than thirty days..., that's certainly not acceptable. But, what you could do, I would say 95% of the people that are gonna vote, are already registered to vote. That's number one. Number two, so, I don't think that the five percent, or the ten percent, whatever the percentage may be, should hold up the 90%. So, I, I envision that we should get this out as soon as we can with the people that are registered to vote, and we already know most of the people that register to vote, don't vote anyway. So, you might even think about the super voters, but if you just want it sent to every registered voter, fine, but, then you can possibly wait and send the second piece out. It would be the..., you wouldn't be ..., I don't think would be..., incur any additional expense 'cause it'd be the same piece and you only pay for what you send out. You send out 5,000, and you send out another 1,000, so be it, but I would want to, and I, I think, at one point I championed, and I stated on the record, that we should have sufficient time to educate the public. And, if we're going to wait thirty

days to educate the public, that., I don't really think that's fair to, to, to the public. So, I would suggest that whatever we're gonna do, we need to start doing it.

Thank you. As soon as possible. Mr. Davis, is that what you were saying...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Yes.

MAYOR MASTERS: ...too? Thank you.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Madam Chair? That would require two mailouts. Once we develop the, the brochure, it would go out right away, and then after the rolls close February 11th, then we would have a, a second mailout.

MAYOR MASTERS: That's what...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Madam Chair?

MAYOR MASTERS: ...I think. If it...

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: If, if...

MAYOR MASTERS: ...goes out...

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: ...if the consensus is to provide...

[Inaudible dais comment]

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: ...dissemination of information, or just do it [stammer], you all need to give us some direction. Would you rather just email, PSA's, website and not send out any documents to the registered voters?

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: One moment, please. We still, we still have to address the translation for Creole, because we., and I haven't heard very much about that beyond our initial conversation because you said that the requirement is for Spanish.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Are we factoring in that cost for the Creole translation?

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair, if you look at the information that was provided to you and [stammer], and copies were provided for the public as well, it was stapled to the back of the Agenda, you will see that there is a cost that's for Spanish, French and Creole. So, when I gave those app'., approximate numbers of almost \$130,000 and the almost \$65,000, that did include the cost for translating in...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Right.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: ...Creole as well.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Right. But we also went back to reducing the cost and not having that exorbitant amount out there, and you said we would pay somewhere in the, in the range of the \$2,600 for the El'.., El Latino, and we still had to pay the \$7,650. So, I'm just wondering where in that dollar figure, was the Creole translation? That's my question.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair, those has to do with publication only. As previously stated, we.., I'm not familiar with a news publication that's geared toward our Haitian community. If someone has that information that they have their own newspaper and can get it to me, we can a al', you know, always get an approximate cost. But we'll.., however, what we will do, is have the information translated in Creole and place it on the City's website.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: And, Madam Chair?

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: And we would do a...

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Oh.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: ...if the, if the Council directs us to do a PSA, the PSA will also be done in Creole.

[Inaudible audience comment]

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: But we have our own internal TEA team. Could we not utilize that for our PSA?

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: We.., Madam Chair, that's what we would utilize, but we still ha'.., have to have someone to come in and speak it.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: No. I, I...

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: [Stammer]...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: I understand that.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: That is.., it's the translator that's the cost regarding that.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Okay.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Yeah. But as far as, you know, our.., we would record it and run it on TV18. I believe that the City has a YouTube channel, if I'm not mistaken, that it will be available on the YouTube.., on YouTube, for anyone that would want to view it on YouTube. So, it will be constantly available. I will tell you that PSA will get the information out quicker. And placing the information, once it's translated, placing the information piece on the website, would be quicker. It would be more economical, and it would be quicker.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Okay. I was...

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...trying to wrap my mind around the, s you talked about the cost for the...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: [Inaudible].

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...PSA's and, and what that really meant. And so, we're talking only, not for the creation of the PSA, but for the talent to be able to speak in either of the two languages that we are addressing.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Those, those that will be translator, as well as one that will do the sign language, 'cause we would need to do that as well.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Okay.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilwoman Miller-Anderson, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Are we required to go and get an official person to do the translation? Like...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Absolutely.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: ...do you have to go through a certain certified person? Because, I mean...

MAYOR MASTERS: You mean, that fake...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: ...all we need is...

MAYOR MASTERS: ...person who did all that stuff?

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: ...someone who speaks Creole.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair?

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: I mean, unless we have to have...

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: It will be for the benefit of the City to go with someone that is certified, just in case the information is incorrect.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: And, and I agree with you on that. However, I'm trying to find out if that is necessary, because you can..., I mean, there... Trust me, I mean, there's a lot of...

[Inaudible dais comment]

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: ...Creole speakers, a lot of Spanish speakers, and some of them do that for a living, that is their job. So, they just..., I don't'

know that they're gonna charge \$125 an hour. I mean, I'm not trying to skip on it, because we wanna make sure the information is correct, but is it required to go through... Are these people certi'.., is this a certified organization that you go through to get interpreters, or...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: We can.

[Inaudible dais comment]

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Say, for instance, like what has been listed for sign language interpretation charges. Global Translation is a company that is utilized by the Palm Beach County Supervisor of Elections office.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Okay.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: They happen to also be able to provide interpretation.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Okay.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: This is the only one that you have been provided. We are still waiting for estimates to be provided by two additional companies. So, we just need a direction ad, of course, as I previously stated, Staff has tried to present all available avenues and approximate costs to you, and we are [stammer], as we presented to the City Manager, we want to do this in the most economical way as possible.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Well, as I suggested, you know, I don't think we need to spend the money for the bulk printing.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Okay.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: I think we can cut a lotta cost by having, you know, doing the interview, however, you know, the interpretation done on TV18, any type of video, where we can put it on the website, email, have a few printed maybe, just, you know, to be here at City Hall, or any other location to, to be like a lobby copy or something. But I think a lot of it can just be done electronically.

[Inaudible comment]

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: By video...

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Whatever the pleasure of the Board is.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: That's my...

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: ...and the...

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Madam Chair?

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Okay. And, Madam Chair?

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Madam Chair?

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Councilwoman Botel has stated that her choice would be digital only, website, email. No expensive mailings.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Information...

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: You could do public workshops in each district for interested voters.

MAYOR MASTERS: [Chuckle].

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: We can't disenfranchise this process.

MAYOR MASTERS: [Chuckle].

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: So...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Okay. Can we reach consensus on this? I think we've gone around and round. We need.., we know that we don't want to do the expensive advertising. Okay.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Okay.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: That's a given.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Okay.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: So, we are not going to print a booklet, according to the comments that have been had here tonight. There will be no [pause], let see. We have on here, the.., we won't do any of the trifold brochures, we're just going to put the information... I understand it is 10:00 o'clock. We need to have a motion to extend the meeting to complete the Agenda.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: So moved.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Is there a second?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Second.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: And it's just open ended? The time?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Yes. [Inaudible].

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: To complete it. We have four additional.., three additional Items. Let's see. No. There's 16A and 16B, which is government shutdown and insurance increases.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: That's gonna take me...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: The task force.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: One minute a piece.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Mhmm. Okay. It's been motioned and properly second. Madam Clerk.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Davis?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Yes, ma'am.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Botel?

[Inaudible comment]

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Pro Tem Hubbard?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: No.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Yes

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: We're not done...

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Chair Davis Johnson?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: We're not done. We had... Yes. We had to extend the meeting so that we can continue the discussion.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Unanimous vote.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: [Chuckle].

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: So, for the, for the translation charges, could we not go back? There.., for the, the companies we have, Advanced Translation Services and Can We Talk, so if they are able to translate the English language into Spanish and Creole, could we not look to engage them in order to do the translation of the, of the information for our PSA's?

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: I know that Can We Talk, if I recall correctly, we did ask about that. They can do the printed translation. I believe when I spoke with Ms. Williams, they do not have a translator that could...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Okay.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: ...come in and do a PSA.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Okay. So, it is then... She said no. So, it is then the consensus of the Board, that we want to do online, TV18, PSA's and community meetings in order to get the information, with regards to the proposed items, to the public?

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Yes.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: And, Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Mr. Davis, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: So, in the community meetings, we would provide handouts at that time? Versus mailers, is that how we're gonna do.., disseminate?

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: We can make [inaudible].

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Well, that takes us back to the trifold.

[Inaudible dais comment]

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: At the very minimum.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Just do it.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: I mean, we just do what we need to do.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: In house.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Just run our own [inaudible].

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Madam Clerk.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: In the event anyone wants to hold an.., a town hall meeting concerning discussion of the Charter amendments, the Office of the City Clerk will make sure that we have plenty of paper on, on, on hand to print this. Please note, that when we print this information, each language will be approximately nine pages. So, with the three languages, that's two'.., a twenty-seven page booklet. And...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: [Inaudible].

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: ...if you have, have a, an attendance of ten to fifteen people...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Mhmm.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: ...the only thing that we ask is that I know in [stammer] as far in advance as possible, because I will have to pay overtime, to have those booklets ready in time.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: But are we.., are.., is your plan to take...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: [Inaudible]...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...all three... Because you are going to have...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: ...[inaudible].

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...sessions that are specific'.., specifically germane to the Hispanic population where you would only have the Hispanic language. I mean, do we want to create such a large number of these flyers?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: [Inaudible].

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: I am required by law.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Okay.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: To do the...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: You're required to have...

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: If, if.., Madam Chair...

MAYOR MASTERS: [Inaudible].

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: ...if we print the informational piece...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Mhmm.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: ...I have to, I am required, by law, to present it in English and Spanish.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Well, I'm clear on that. I'm just...

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Okay.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...talking about the number of copies that will be prepared.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: But no, I mean, I'm not, if someone speaks Spanish... I'm sorry, Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Your recognized, Councilwoman Miller-Anderson.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: So the twenty-seven pages is if that person receives English, Spanish an Creole.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: They will be receiving all three languages.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Because it's all typed on..., together?

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: It'll be altogether, because the one thing you will not know, is who in your audience, speak Creole...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Yep.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: ...or speaks Spanish.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: But, I mean, but, my, my point is, is it not.., are you not able to have this packet is just English, this packet is just Spanish, this packet is just Creole, and then...

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: You can...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: ...they only get that...

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair? You can do that, however, you will be required to it available at your meetings.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Yeah. That's what we're...

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Okay.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: ...talking about.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Yeah.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: So, it'll still be twenty-seven pages no matter what. It'll be a booklet of nine for English, a booklet...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: We'll have 'em RSVP and [inaudible]...

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: ...of nine....

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: ...what language they need. Yeah, you know?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Exactly what...

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: So...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...I was just asking. Okay.

MAYOR MASTERS: That would include the sample ballot too, right? Or just...

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: If the sample ballot is available at that particular time, it will be.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: [Chuckle].

MAYOR MASTERS: Well, I wanted to ask about it. So, I just needed to ask 'cause I'm on that ballot.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Alrighty. So, everyone is clear on what she's doing? Or do...

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: [Inaudible].

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: We know that the City Attorney is going to work with the attorney for the pros and cons for the language.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: [Inaudible].

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: How soon will that be completed?

CITY ATTORNEY WYNN: How soon do you need it?

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: ASAP.

UNK: As soon as...

CITY ATTORNEY WYNN: We'll have to consult with Mr. Wolpin.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: See what his schedule is.

CITY ATTORNEY WYNN: As soon as possible.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Okay.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Mhmm.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: So, language, translation...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilwoman Miller-Anderson, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Did I understand her to say that the translators would not be able to do a video? They're not able to do the video?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Sh'.., what I heard her say, to my question, with regards to Can We Talk, they don't have anyone that can do the spoken translation. So, we would have to identify someone that can do the spoken translation in both Spanish and/or Creole.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: But, would that need to be a certified person or...

UNK: [Inaudible].

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: ...or we just need the one that speaks Creole and Spanish to red it off of the paper?

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair, as I previously stated...

[Inaudible dais comment]

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: ...that we..., it would be in the best interest of the City...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Okay. So...

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: ...for us to go...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: ...can we get someone...

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: ...with a company..., to go with a company that will provide someone, just in case...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Is someone able to do the video? Is that correct?

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: The, the video will be recorded... Madam Chair? The video will be recorded here in the City Council Chambers. And it., the video will include all three languages.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Someone speaking in the...

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: One will do English.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: ...other languages.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: I...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Okay.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: 'Matter of fact...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: I, I...

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: ...it would...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: ...thought I heard you say that you couldn't get anyone to do the video.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Oh, no, ma'am. I...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Okay.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: ...didn't say that.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: And, Madam Chair?

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Madam Chair?

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Walter just provided infor'.., in formation that he could assist with the production and they probably also could fi'... He probably al'.., also could find an on air personality, or someone to...

MAYOR MASTERS: Translate.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: ...translate all three languages or something. So, we'll [stammer] work with Walter also. And councilwoman Botel, no, she didn't have anything.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Yeah. Can, can we clarify how many pages it will be. Can we not...

MAYOR MASTERS: Pages, she said.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: ...do a separate printing for English, Spanish and Creole?

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair, if I understand Councilperson's, Councilperson Botel question is correct'.., correctly, she wants to know how many pages would be for a booklet of English, Spanish or Creole.

We have looked at it, and it would be approximately nine pages per booklet.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Okay. Nine pages each, but not.., let's not print one with all three languages, right?

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: No matter... Madam Chair? No matter what language you print the book'.., booklet in, the Office of the City Clerk prints the booklet in, it will nine pages.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Okay. So, nine pages, and we hand out English, if it's an all English audience, and English and Spanish if there are Spanish people there, and so forth, yes?

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair, if I understand Councilperson Botel's inquiry, correct, she's wondering if it would be nine pages no matter what language. From what we understand, it will nine pages for each language. And, I believe it may be a little more when it comes down to, after Ms. **WYNN** and Mr. Wolpin do the pros and the cons...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Mhmm.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: ...so the booklet may be.., end up being a little more.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: It will.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Because the, the approximate costs that were provided, was based upon the information that Mr. Wolpin did. So, that will increase the cost of translation.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: So, what I have written down here, based on the discussion, we need to have to translate the language, we need to have PSA's and talent acquired in order to conduct the PSA's, and we will need to print the document in the three languages, not fully knowing the total number of pages, although it's initially stated that it's nine pages, but we know that with adding the pros and the cons, that's going to exceed the nine page limit. And, [pause], we want to keep our costs down, as far as possible, so you're going to have to provide to us by way of email, through the City Manager, the estimate cost in order to do that printing, so that we can get the information out. We will contact Attorney Wolpin tomorrow?

CITY ATTORNEY WYNN: Okay.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...in order to determine how quickly we can finalize the document with the pros and the cons, and then moved to translation and, and then the quoting of what the actual cost is once that document is completed.

CITY ATTORNEY WYNN: Okay.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Are we clear?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Mhmm.

MAYOR MASTERS: Here.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Okay.

MAYOR MASTERS: That was a good job, Madam Chair. You...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair, we do have public comment cards on this Item.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Okay.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Alright.

[Pause]

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Bonnie Larson, Mary Brabham, Shirley Lanier, Douglas Lawson.

MAYOR MASTERS: Ms. Larson, you put your name on this time, huh? [Chuckle].

MS. B. LARSON: I'm up here so often, they know my writing.

Alright. So, we've decided not to do the printouts, good idea. So, why are we doing them for the people who come to the public meetings? Or do come to the outreach meetings? Put it up, do a slide show, there it is. The picture of whatever language you have, or when you come to a public meeting like that, you call in advance, say I'm gonna be there, I speak Creole, then you know how many. All this copying in all these different languages, is a big waste of time and money, and, and resources. So, let's not do that, but why not just have a slide show for the people when they come to public meetings. And also, how about Ms. **WYNN**.., okay, so you've to the, you've the proposed amendment, she can do the, if you vote yes, it's this, if you vote no, it's that. And then run it by Mr. Wolpin? Why involve him at the beginning, \$300 an some dollars an hour, or whatever he charges. Let's have.., we have an new Attorney, she seems pretty good, after...

MAYOR MASTERS: She's a very good attorney.

MS. B. LARSON: ...last night. Let's have her do it. A yes or no, that's it. Simple. No slant on it by anybody. That's what I'm worried about at those public meetings, there might be a little slant on things. But, and..., okay, so we're gonna forget the French. Forget that. If we're not required to do the Creole, are we gonna do it anyway? And also, the sign language for hearing impaired, well, if they're looking at it on our website, they don't need to hear. They can..., they just read it.

[Chuckle]

MS. B. LARSON: Does that make sense? Why would have to have a sign language if they're reading a document?

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: [Inaudible].

MS. B. LARSON: So, like I said, if it's..., as far as printing it, ah, I would say no, as far as the public meetings. They can come here. But, Ms., Ms. **WYNN** is quite capable of writing yes means this, no means that, and then run it by Mr. Wolpin just to be absolutely sure. But forget all these printings.

Thank you.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Mary Brabham, Shirley Lanier, Douglas Lawson.

MS. M. BRABHAM: Ms. Mary Brabham, Riviera Beach. Do what we need to do to make our democracy work. Everyone does not come to the Chambers and look at a slide. We have a multi-culture community here.

[Inaudible audience comment]

MS. M. BRABHAM: And we have a lot of Creole, Haitians. And then, too, look at your books, and compare how many Haitians versus French. You can also look at those strategies too, but it should be advertised in Creole, Spanish and English. Now, if it's French, I know some French people, they live over on the Island over there, but compared to over here...

MAYOR MASTERS: Creole, yeah.

MS. M. BRABHAM: ...look and see how many that you have, an make this democracy work here. I also thought about perhaps putting some type of literature in the water bill. You know how we get our water bills? I don't know how much a, a little flyer, a written up piece of..., a statement, you know, with the amendments because there's only four of 'em. It's only four of those amendments, and it will give the general public some insight too, of what these amendments are. But you must make this work to accommodate the culturism of this entire City. Everybody does not have a website, everybody does not own a computer. You know, some of these nationalities, you know, they're struggling just trying to make, make their ends meet. A lot of 'em do, do not come to this Chambers here and see a slide up there. So, as a governing Board, that makes policies and procedures, it is ways to accommodate this. Look at the roster. I'm thinking more or less, it was stated

here that you have [stammer] approximately 22,000 registered voters. Use some strategy here, look at see where ya, where ya, where ya vast majority...

MAYOR MASTERS: Super voters.

MS. M. BRABHAM: ...of your Creoles, Haitians, Hispanics, Americans, you know, that's what we would do, and then that would too give you some roundabouts here. You can do some [stammer] letters and distribute them out to the nurseries. You know, the little kids..., I think that's a nursery. In the church houses, schools, you know? It's a lotta ways here that we can step out of the box to get the language so that all of our multicultural...

[Timer]

MS. M. BRABHAM: ...community can understand it.

Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you, Ms. Brabham.

MAYOR MASTERS: One of the previous...

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Shirley Lanier, Douglas Lawson.

MS. S. LANIER: Hello. My name is Shirley Lanier, lifelong resident here, I the City of Riviera Beach.

MAYOR MASTERS: Pull the mic down to you, please.

MS. S. LANIER: Also, the Federal Garden neighborhood. I'm also a candidate for District 3 Council seat. I'm also..., was a member of the City Charter Review Committee and I think, he's not here, Davis made a suggestion that because we were so late getting the information to the Council, that now we're behind the 8-ball in terms of trynna get the information out. But I wanted to have him to recollect the fact that he voted to disband the Charter Review committee and we sat, we sat on the sidelines for six to eight months waiting for the county..., waiting for the Commission to come back and give us the go ahead to finish our job. So, if we would've, you know, kept going while we were going, we would've had the information and the amendments to the Council way before this time, the way it is now.

And I also would like to say that I've heard a lot of information about how the Charter Review did their job, there was all this talk about, you know, we could've did this, we could've did that, but, you know, these advisory committees are volunteers. We come to the City, I'm a part of the li'..., the Library advisory Committee. I'm the Chair of that Committee, and we spend our time coming to these advisory committee meetings and nobody pays us any money, and here, at the Council, nobody pays any mind, because we bring recommendations back to the Council, nothing happens with them. We have, we have come before this City Council with the library, in terms of the, the grant that they received for a \$1,000,000 and there's nothing has been done to be able to move this project forward, for the library for the City. The City's library is, is, is a disgrace for this City, of this size. And we have nothing here to show for it. We have gotten the grant from

the state for a \$1,000,000 to be able to move a project forward for this City, and nothing has happened here. And it just..., it..., everything that happens at this Council..., and, I want to be clear about who I say when I talk about the Council, I am excluding Miller-Anderson and I'm excluding Botel, because they never vote that way. We have people who vote in these situations where it's costing the City money. We just spent \$50,000 for somebody who lost their phone, who couldn't get the information out. It's, it's totally ridiculous. I just can't even..., I can't even fathom the amount of money that is being spent and lost in this City. That \$500,000 was just thrown away by City Council Members, and that money could've given us a tax break, it coulda lowered our property taxes. Money on insurances that people that don't even..., don't even work here anymore, and they're getting paid for their insurance. It is outrageous. That we sit here and allow this...

[Timer]

MS. S. LANIER: ...to continue to happen.

My name is Shirley Lanier. I'm a member of the Federal garden neighborhood and I'm running for District 3.

Thank you.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Douglas Lawson.

MR. D. LAWSON: Good evening Council, Madam Chair...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Good evening.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Good evening.

MR. D. LAWSON: Mayor.

MAYOR MASTERS: Good evening, sir.

MR. D. LAWSON: I wanna just commend the Carter Review Board, the first one that was disband, and the second one that brought the amendments to the table. They brought 'em to the table to try to allow for our citizens to have an option to vote on these amendments. Yet, I'm hearing a lotta residents are leaning towards voting no, just because they don't have enough time and aren't educated on the process, and they're not..., don't have enough time to see what's going on with the actual amendments, so they're hesitant to change that, that bloodline, that heartbeat that actually runs our City, that Charter. So, right now, for us to have this proposal on the table for \$130,000 to spend on disseminating information to our residents, I think we just have to find all the most cost effective ways. Like Madam Chair said, there's, there's other cost effective ways and I think the Council's on the same page with that, but other municipalities are not spending that kind of money to disseminate this information to our constituents. So, we don't need to step out and do something that's not common to other cities. Let's go ahead and just keep it cost effective and do what's needed. Now, with the residents, we have to provide that information to them so that they can be educated on that, but finding those ways

through the PSA's, through the emails, through the local.., through the local meetings. That's what we need to do.

Council, thank you. Have a great evening.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Madam Chair, that concludes public comments on this Item.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: So, you're clear on your direction?

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: I am, Madam Chair.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Okay.

16.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Item No. 16.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY: RATIFICATION BY CITY COUNCIL RELATING TO
SUSPENSION OF RISK MANAGER.**

MAYOR THOMAS A. MASTERS (561)845-4145

MAYOR MASTERS: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Mr. Mayor, you're recognized.

MAYOR MASTERS: Thank you. I'd like to first pass down...

[Inaudible dais whisper]

MAYOR MASTERS: ...Exhibit 1. Before I pass out Exhibit 1, the defendant, I will use that term...

[Chuckles]

MAYOR MASTERS: ...Marie Sullen, who sent an email to the City Manager, stating that she would be in attendance at this meeting, and also wanted to know what would be my grounds of.., for the suspension. Did not respond to that part because the Charter does not require me to, to do that, other than do what I had.., what I've already done, and was to notify her through the Manager, on why she was being suspended and that was sufficient. And anything else would be presented at the Council meeting tonight. Before I go through the Exhibits, I need to ask the City Attorney a question. I know this is not a court setting or hearing, but when a person doesn't show up, does that mean that it's.., the case is won by default? Does it mean.., what does it mean?

CITY ATTORNEY WYNN: Not in this instance.

MAYOR MASTERS: Okay.

CITY ATTORNEY WYNN: Yeah. It just requires the Council to either approve or disapprove your action.

MAYOR MASTERS: Okay. But, in some instances it, it does mean that if they don't show up, other than.., but not this instance, but there are instances when a person doesn't show up to plead their case, it's, it's.., the judge would just throw it out.

Madam Manager, let me pass down, and... Basically, we'll go with, with this first. I don't think there's any disagreement that the [pause] person that was suspended, the Risk Manager, is responsible, accountable for this action. There may have been others, but they're gone, basically. But I don't think there's any question, and I think when you see the video, I'm not gonna show much, just a few minutes, I think there's.., I think she realized that it was her responsibility to make sure that this didn't happen. I think that, on the questioning by Councilwoman KaShamba Miller-Anderson.., you won't see it, but it's further down, that the litigant said that, basically, she was overwhelmed, and had a lotta different things going on, a lotta different duties and responsibilities and they were sending stuff out manually and emailing, but at the end of the day, it was the Risk Manager, and I see it, that certainly had responsibility here. In the corporate world, over \$1,000,000, we wouldn't be talking about suspension, but in the corporate world, I would guarantee you, someone would've been fired, months ago. But this is not corporate world, this is the Mayor. Okay? Roll tape, Exhibit 1.

[Inaudible dais comments]

[Pause]

UNK: The volume.

MAYOR MASTERS: No. She doesn't start right away.

UNK: Oh.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: I think I watched [inaudible].

MAYOR MASTERS: This is Marie Sullen, the Risk Manager who's to here tonight.

[Video plays – 03:20:00]

MAYOR MASTERS: [03:22:16] All positions.

[Video continues to play]

MAYOR MASTERS: [03:22:51]. At that time.

[The video continues to play]

MAYOR MASTERS: [03:22:47]. Delayed.

[The video continues to play]

MAYOR MASTERS: [03:24:35]. Thank you. In the interest of... In the interest of time, we're gonna cut the tape.

[Video stops playing]

MAYOR MASTERS: We'll cut the tape there but it, it is clear that the Risk Manager gave a lot of different things that was going on, whether that's called rationalization or justification, or just things that.., so many things going on, but her responsibility and duty should not have been impacted and change as Risk Manager.

Exhibit #2, at this time. Do you have it on the screen? The job description?

CHIEF OF STAFF ISAACS: No. We didn't have it.

MAYOR MASTERS: Okay. For the benefit of the public, the essential duties and responsibilities... I'm gonna ask the [pause] Debie, the Chief of Staff to read this, because her eyes are much younger. [Chuckle].

CHIEF OF STAFF ISAACS: Debie Isaacs, Chief of Staff. The job description and essential duties and responsibilities of the Risk Manager are: Administers and make recommendations pertaining to all elements of the City's various insurance programs relating to records, audits, premiums, policy expiration dates, claims, processing and, etc.

MAYOR MASTERS: And you did say all, correct?

CHIEF OF STAFF ISAACS: All.

MAYOR MASTERS: Thank you. No. 2.

CHIEF OF STAFF ISAACS: No. 2. Represent City and contacting doctors, attorneys and insurance carriers in program matters and litigation.

MAYOR MASTERS: Okay.

CHIEF OF STAFF ISAACS: 3. Assist the City Attorney's office, insurance carrier, City Attorney in preparing defense of litigation and compensation proceedings. No. 4, converse with City Attorney's office concerning legality of program transactions.

MAYOR MASTERS: Okay.

CHIEF OF STAFF ISAACS: Administers independent contractor insurance coverage, develops risk identification procedures...

MAYOR MASTERS: Go back, go back a little bit to the last six words, that you said.

CHIEF OF STAFF ISAACS: Administers independent contractor insurance coverage.

MAYOR MASTERS: Okay.

CHIEF OF STAFF ISAACS: No. 6, develops risk identification procedures.

MAYOR MASTERS: That's a Risk Manager, right? Develop risk...

CHIEF OF STAFF ISAACS: Identification procedures.

MAYOR MASTERS: I dentification procedures. Okay.

CHIEF OF STAFF ISAACS: Mhmm. Develop., No. 7, develops accident prevention and loss control methods procedures and programs. 8, prepares and presents all pending claims at Incident Review Committee meetings.

MAYOR MASTERS: All. The word all was there, right?

CHIEF OF STAFF ISAACS: All pending claims, keep abreast of any new developments concerning potential loss exposure through litigation and legislation...

MAYOR MASTERS: Repeat that one...

CHIEF OF STAFF ISAACS: ...decisions.

MAYOR MASTERS: Repeat that one. Keep us...

CHIEF OF STAFF ISAACS: Keep...

MAYOR MASTERS: ...abreast

CHIEF OF STAFF ISAACS: ...abreast of any new developments concerning potential loss exposure.

MAYOR MASTERS: Okay. That's, that's basically enough. That's enough to show you that is the Risk Manager, at the end of the day.

CHIEF OF STAFF ISAACS: But one more, it says, formalize programs to reduce insurance costs.

MAYOR MASTERS: Okay. We're talking about over \$1,000,000, and I do know over three hundred's been recovered. At this time, I have concluded the presentation of this case. I would ask the Council to sustain the three weeks, which is five days, working days, that I have sent into the Risk Manager.

I do wanna say that Ms. Sullen has, has made sacrifices in her job. I do realize that she has come from Miami every day, trekked back and forth, which is a sacrifice, and I really asked the.., I did try to de'.., to miti'.., to lessen the fifteen days, where it wouldn't be fifteen consecutive days, but I was told that I couldn't do it, and I wanted to make sure this done before the year end. But because of the Christmas time, I waited until after Christmas to, to this, and it shouldn't go another day without any action taken. I did speak to the OIG Director. What's his name?

UNK: Mr. Kerry.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Mr. John Kerry?

MAYOR MASTERS: Yeah. I did speak to Mr. Kerry, and he told me that he has advised cities not to wait for their report to come out before the City [stammer] would decide to take administrative or discipline.., discipline action. He also stated to me on the phone that it's probably gonna take months before the OIG report is available to the public, and that would've been months of pay with someone that I feel is responsible. And was negligent in their duty.

I ask the Council to sustain the Mayor's suspension at this time. Thank you very much.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: So moved.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Second.

[Pause]

[Inaudible dais comments]

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Any comments from the Board?

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: No.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Were there any comments? It's been motioned...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: I, I have a question.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilman Davis, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: How long is here suspension?

MAYOR MASTERS: Five wor'..., three weeks, which is five...

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Fifteen days.

MAYOR MASTERS: ...working days.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Fifteen days.

MAYOR MASTERS: Fifteen days.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: And it's on the grounds of what, again?

MAYOR MASTERS: Elective.., of duty. The, the Mayor has two duti'..., two things that we can suspend, one for misconduct.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Okay.

MAYOR MASTERS: The other one is neglect of duty or negligence.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Who?

MAYOR MASTERS: An elective duty is the, the one [inaudible] we sent to the, the Manager, to give to Ms. Sullen.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Here's one of the things that I have a concern with, and the issue is, nothing sh'..., I just felt that nothing should've been done regarding that Department, until the investigation's complete from the OIG, so we can get some findings and recommendations. One of the things I will support, just off the top of my head is, is a suspension with pay until a complete investigation is complete.

MAYOR MASTERS: Okay. Thank you.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Mhmm.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Mr. Mayor, in the policy and procedure, you said you.., the, the decision was to suspend for neglect of duty is that.., I'm, I'm looking here, category 1, category 2, category 3. I'm just trying to understand the time associated with the suspension and how that measured out?

MAYOR MASTERS: Well, it's, it's, it's, it is the discretion of the Mayor as to how many days that the Mayor feels is time for the crime, could've been longer. We suspended the, the water person sometime.., I mean, the, the Manager over a, a month. It was a month. But, it was upon the fact that I felt that she was responsible and should be held accountable, and disciplined for the neglect and the mismanagement of the insurance benefits, that has been reported all over the world. In the media, Post and on all the TV stations, and social media.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: And it, it's your belief that she is solely responsible for this, and that there are no other suspensions to come as a result of this?

MAYOR MASTERS: Well, that may be, and we may look into that, down the road, and certainly as the OIG develops their investigation, but as far as I can see, based upon the job description, and based upon her own statements, that she was overwhelmed and things.., and just signed off on things and was not really, in my mind, paying attention. And that's why I do feel that she, if anybody, should be held responsible.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Are there any other questions from Council? [Pause]. Madam Clerk, do we have any public comment cards on this?

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: No, we do not, Madam Chair. Councilperson Botel?

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Davis?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Yes.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Pro Tem Hubbard?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: Chair Davis Johnson?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Yes.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: The vote is unanimous.

MAYOR MASTERS: Thank you, Council.

16A:

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Item 16A, please.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: ITEM 16A IS COUNCILPERSON DAVIS DISCRETION REGRADING ASSISTING AFFECTED RESIDENTS BY THE GOVERNMENT SHUTDOWN.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Thank you. This is gonna be extremely brief. I'm sure that everyone's been watching what's been going on with the government, when are people are gonna get paid, families have to eat, they have to move on with their lives, but they're working and waiting for an opportunity to get paid, to move on with their lives. And one of things I wanna talk about is utilities and.., 'cause we know water is very essential. Yes. I want this Council to support me to ask Staff to propose a Resolution that allows the Council to aid Riviera Beach residents that are impacted by the government shutdown with utility services. Something more like a.., develop a, a deferment payment plan, at least until the government gets back going so that folk's water don't be turned off, as they continue working without pay, or without.., with furlough, whatever their situation may be. And this is for Riviera Beach residents only. We just wanna make sure that we take in consideration that what happened to one, happened to us all. Could you imagine working a job and not getting paid? Having to take care of your children, having to take care of your parents and still having to pay bills? I would just ask this Council to ask Staff to work on a.., development a deferred.., deferment, a payment plan, for utility services for government employees who live in the City of Riviera Beach, who are impacted by the, the shutdown?

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilwoman Miller-Anderson, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Are they goi'.., are you suggesting when they try to come up with the Resolution, come up with the criteria?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Yes.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: I mean, what is it that the...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Mhmm.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: ...people need to provide in order to...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Right.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: ...verify that they are impacted?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Yes, ma'am.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: And so...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: And bring it back before this Board.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: ...they bring it back...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Mhmm.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: And then, the monies to.., so, it's just a deferment [inaudible]...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Until they get paid.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: I would like to see how many people we're talking about. I don't know how, I guess, if people apply, get a survey of how many people are being impacted. Who would be interested in it, so we know how many people we're talking about, and then we'll know how much money we're talking about being deferred.

Obviously, there's a lot of research that need' to be done. Are, are you aware of any other cities, or any other...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: We'll be, we'll be the first City in Palm Beach County to take on this initiative.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Are there any outside of the county, that we...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: No.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: ...could look at?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: No one's done it. We'll, we'll be the first to set the tone.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: So, you wanna be a trendsetter?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: No, we will...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Alright.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: ...be a trendsetter, as a community.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Okay. So, I would like to see some research done with.., they are to come back with it.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Mhmm.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: To come back with the information on how they would determine [pause], how to.., how many people we're talking about, what's the financial impact and just basically, what, what, what are the risks and the impacts of it for us.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Okay. And...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: The criteria. Just the whole process, how that would look.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: I think that's important for us to have to, to be able to know what the potential dollar value would be, how many people would be effected, how we can do it. And, and then the other piece, for me is, what's going to be the, the.., you're say defer their, the cost of their utility service?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Yes, ma'am. They're not wiping it out, they're just... As you are aware of, people are working every day, not getting paid, having to fit their bills, having to pay for gas, having to pay for food...

MAYOR MASTERS: [Inaudible].

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: ...need water, need money. Just something that allows them to say, 'You know what? We have relief in our community. We're thinking about those that provide a level of services to this government.' And why not Riviera Beach? And I've been watching the news every day, every single day on this issue, and I'm asking myself, 'Well, how are, how are folks eating?' [Inaudible dais comment]

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: And how, how are they taking.., how can you wake.., how can you wake up every day, go to work and still provide for your family? And every situation is unique but I say we can do something in Riviera Beach for all our residents, who are impacted by this. So, we gotta start with something. We don't know how long this is gonna take place. It can shut down tomor'.., it can get back started tomorrow, but we can't wait on that. Someone has to take on an initiative to do something. On the private sector, AT&T did do a deferment for phone bills. And...

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Madam Chair?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: ...AT&T set the tone on that, form the private sector. But from the governmental sector, local government, Riviera Beach will be the first to do that.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Madam Chair?

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilwoman Botel?

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: She, she text me something.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Oh, go ahead.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: Thank you, [inaudible].

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: She, she's reading your text.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: [Inaudible]. Thank you.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Madam Chair, Councilwoman Botel would like for you all to consider assisting Coast Guard families in some way also. They are a part of our community. And she also stated that we would have to look at our bond documents to ensure that., I know they state that no one gets free water, but a deferment, we would have to look into that. And she said, which is okay with her, but we would need to consider that also.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Mr. Sherman, is there a provision in any of the bond documents that you can think of, that speaks to deferrals?

FINANCE DIRECTOR SHERMAN: Again, Randy Sherman, Finance Director.

No. I don't think the bond documents...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: No, it doesn't.

FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN: ...would cause us any problem, 'cause we're not giving them free service.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Yeah. We're just...

FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN: And we currently allow customers to sign Promissory Notes. You know, we typically request a payment and then we'll defer, you know, their delinquencies for several months. So, I think we're okay in that regard. I'm just tryna., 'cause, 'cause in this instance, I don't think you want to require the initial payment like we do now.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Right.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Mhmm.

FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN: You'd want a total deferment.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Yeah.

FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN: So, I think..., so, I think we can do it.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Mhmm.

FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN: I just have to think about it a little bit more and we'll bring something back.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Madam Attorney, will you review the language to ensure that there is no issues with the bond language, the bond documents lang'..., language versus what the intent of the Board is?

CITY ATTORNEY WYNN: Yes. I'll, I'll get with Mr. Sherman and we'll handle it.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Okay.

FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN: Okay.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Alrighty. So, is it...

MAYOR MASTERS: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...is it the consensus of getting the information, understanding the number of individuals that are federal employees, which would be inclusive of Coast Guard, would it not?

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Yes, ma'am.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Yes. It's everyone.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: So we're talking federal employees.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Homeland Security...

MAYOR MASTERS: That are impacted, right?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: DA. [Chuckle].

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: The City of Riviera Beach residents who are federal employees, who are impacted by the government shutdown.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Correct.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Is what we are looking to, to find out.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Is this City of Riviera Beach employees?

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: No.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: No. Residents.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Not employees...

MAYOR MASTERS: Residents.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: ...just residents.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Residents.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: [Inaudible].

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: 'Cause they're the only ones be payin' for water anyway.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: We...

MAYOR MASTERS: Ma'..., Madam Chair?

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Yeah.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Right.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Mr. Mayor, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: [Inaudible].

MAYOR MASTERS: Just to put on the record, since Dr. Botel put the Coast Guard and you made it clear it's, it's more than the Coast Guard, but I do wanna put the TSA agents because they're really being hit hard, and I know several TSA agents who live in the City.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Well...

[Inaudible dais comments]

MAYOR MASTERS: Yeah. I do. So...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: [Inaudible] know...

MAYOR MASTERS: ...I just wanna put that on the record.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: ...employees.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: About twenty...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: All...

MAYOR MASTERS: [Inaudible]...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...federal employees.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: [Inaudible].

MAYOR MASTERS: I just wanted to specify them.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: All federal employees...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: It includes them.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...who are residents of the City of...

MAYOR MASTERS: I got it. I know.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...Rivera Beach.

MAYOR MASTERS: I know.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: But, we have a lot of TSA [inaudible], you're right.

[Inaudible audience comment]

MAYOR MASTERS: Yeah. A...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Homegrown.

MAYOR MASTERS: ...whole lot of 'em.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Yeah.

MAYOR MASTERS: I think I'm affect by this shutdown by the President.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: No. You ain't affected.

MAYOR MASTERS: Yeah, I am.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: You're not.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Staff, you're clear on the direction?

CITY ATTORNEY WYNN: Yes, we...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: On the information that is to be brought back?

CITY ATTORNEY WYNN: [Inaudible].

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: How soon?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: I mean...

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Just...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: You've, you've got...

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: You wanna have it... Yes. It's gonna...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Reasonable time. I mean...

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Okay.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: You know? I would like to see it in the next meeting, but I'm reasonable. [Chuckle].

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Okay.

CITY ATTORNEY WYNN: Okay.

16B.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Item 16B.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: ITEM 16B, MADAM CHAIR, IS AN ITEM THAT WAS PLACED BY COUNCILPERSON DAVIS REGARDING CREATING A TASKFORCE TO ADDRESS THE INSURANCE RATE INCREASES.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: This is an Item, I've been approached by numerous members across this City, as a Councilperson, asking questions why car automobile

insurance is so high in Riviera Beach, why homeowner's insurance, in certain areas, are high. And just asking different questions, and I've seen this maybe three times this week. And, what I wanted to do was ask this Board to direct the City Manager to help come up with a task force that's included by executive members from the Police, Fire, Community Development and Risk Management, to work on the, the National Flood Insurance Program, our systems report that we have, and come up with some strategies that will us [stammer] improve the reduction of insurance rates, with a task force.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: So, let me understand. You're saying create a task force to deal with the rates of insurance that are germane to this community?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Yes, ma'am. So, we have a document... Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Mr. Davis, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: So, we have a document, the National Flood Insurance Program, it's a part of a community'.., community rating system report, that's already completed. They will sit down and review this report. Amongst reviewing this report, they'll be allowed to come up with some strategies, based upon the information that they have, to come up with.., giving some deliverables that will allow us to give an opportunity to have reduced insurance rates in different disciplines. For Riviera Beach residents. [Pause]. So, the task force I'm looking at an executive member from the Police Department, Fire Department, Community Development, and one from Risk Management.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: What's the pleasure of the Council?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: I don't have a problem with it.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: What is the pleasure of the Council?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: I love it. Tryna help the people.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: [Stammer]. They're gonna bring the information back?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Do you have an opinion?

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: No, I don't. No. I, I don't, I don't oppose it, I just would like to have more information, more details. That's all. On how it...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: How it looks.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Yeah.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Yeah. It's a task force...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Before we make any decision...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Yeah.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: ...decision on.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Mhmm.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: ...anything.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Go with it.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Alrighty. So then, we are going to have Mr. Davis provide additional information on the task force, and any information...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Sure.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...that is necessary to be addressed through the creation of this task force. Mr. Davis, when can you have that information made available to us for consideration?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Next meeting. Well, prior to the next meeting so you can have it.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Okay. So, then the request is to have you provide additional information for our review and consideration before any action is taken on creation, or not, of this task force.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Yes.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Mhmm.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Alrighty. Alright, Madam Manager?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Is that [inaudible]?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: [Inaudible]. Alrighty.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Well, Madam Chair?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Oh.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Mr. Davis, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: I, I think allowing me to meet with this group to, to bring up some criteria's and for something we oughta take a look at, will require for me to meet with members of .., senior member from Police, Fire, Community Development and Risk Management to really give you something to bring back to review.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: I'm sorry. What, what would be the need to involve our City Staff at this...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Someone e from...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...particular time?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: ...the Police Department, Fire Department...

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: The criteria.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: ...Community Development and Risk Management to review the National Flood Insurance..., our rating system report, so we can discuss some of the strategies and what that would look like. And what would be some of the things that we're looking at?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Is this [inaudible] task force?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: So, where's the community involvement in this task force?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Well, it's gonna come from the Staff level, those who have all the information. And, if we wanna add a community member or two, we can do that, no problem. But, a lot..., this particular task force is gonna give the residents as much..., we're gonna have some town halls and discussing it. They can open..., and have sit down forum with the Staff, that won't be an issue, but this is a task force to help the people. So, we'll just be reviewing documentations that we already have, that's been sitting around for quite some time, and it's time to pay some attention to it and find out how we can benefit from it.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Well, I guess before [stammer]...

[Inaudible comment]

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: I thought the request was for you to bring us additional information before the creation of the task force, before we vote to say, 'Yes, we want to have a task force.' So, I thought that you would gather...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: No.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...the information...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: No. So, Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Mr. Davis, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: The, the purpose of this, is to create a task force to give us a very clear mission, which is to lower the factors that, that impact insurance rates. I need a task force to review the report that we already have, to help us, give us some strategies to make recommendations to the Board, to take a look at. We can have community meetings on it, but this is simple..., putting a group of people in a room to review some documents, to make a recommendation to lower Riviera Beach residents' insurance rates. As they review the factors.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Madam'...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Well, I am not sure that I fully understand. I, I understand that you want to create the task force, but I would, would like to understand is the, the very same documents and information that you will provide to the individuals that you named, could you not distribute...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: No.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...it, distribute that to us, as a body, so that we could review it?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: That's not what.., that was not my intent of the con'.., when I was...

MAYOR MASTERS: I unders'...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: ...agreeing to.., what I was agreeing to that we already have documentation that the City has, at the Staff level.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Right. But...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: The only doc'...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...we, we've never...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: The only document...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...seen it.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Like I said, it's been sitting on the shelf, we all have things that we do. I'm saying, let's get it off the shelf, let's put a task force together to review it and discuss bringing back strategies that's gonna impact...

[Inaudible dais comment]

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: ...the factors [stammer] of insurance ratings.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Madam Chair?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: That's it.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Okay. And what I'm simply saying to you...

[Inaudible dais comment]

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: No.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...Mr. Davis is, is, take it from the shelf, allow us to review the information before we go through the process of creating the...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: No...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...task force.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: [Stammer]...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: I, I just want to be able to review... Is it, is it unreasonable to ask for the information to...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Listen...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...so that I can a frame of reference...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Listen...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: ...for what it is that you're speaking about?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Listen, any frame of reference that you'll have, is the information they're gonna present to us. We're all gonna get a copy of this document for us to read on our own, we're gonna have folks from different disciplines across this City, Fire, Police... You know, when, when you start talking about insurance rates, they look at your police report, your crime ratings, they look at what type of crimes for certain insurances. There, there's certain questions that we don't have those disciplines to go through. And that's why I asked for Fire, Police, Risk Management and Community Development to read the documentation that we have. Okay? I would just ask questions throughout this City about some', through various people from this.., from different parts of the City, and I had to come up with a strategy, and told them tonight, that you know what? You know, I get with my think-tank group of people to say, hey, what can we do to help the people lower their insurance rates?

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Madam Chair?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: And this was something.., this was the best strategy that came up, which is creating a task force to, to put the information together, and bring it for you to review, and if you need more, than this Board can ask for much more information. We can continue this on, to however long it takes...

MAYOR MASTERS: I think I...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: ...but the...

MAYOR MASTERS: ...have it.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: ...ultimate goal...

MAYOR MASTERS: Help you out on that.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Go ahead, Mayor.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: I'm sorry.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilwoman Miller-Anderson...

MAYOR MASTERS: Oh.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Is it that we have to create a task force? It sounds like it's just something that the..., those department heads could get together, through the direction of the City Manager, and then, if that's an initiative that you wanna tag your name to, then just like we did earlier, have the presentation done, and then we go from there? I mean, what, what's the purpose of a task force?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: The task force will get together to make recommendations to this Board. We have an issue in this community, a concern from many people across this community, that's asking questions about why certain insurance rates are so high.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: No, I understand that part.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: So, what they would do is, they'll review this document, it's called the National Flood Insurance Program Community Rating System. They would go through this pro'..., go through this document...

[Inaudible dais comments]

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: ...together as a group, and look at the factors that will impact the ratings, whether they're going up or going down.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: I understand...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: And bring that...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: ...that part.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: ...information for the Board, for us..., for ultimately, you can have the ultimate decision on it.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Right.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: So, we all have initiatives that we all support. Is this an initiative? Absolutely.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: So, that's what I'm saying, what is the point of a task force? Can't..., would the same thing be accomplished by have those individuals just take a look at it, do the same thing you want done, without..., and it comes from the direction of the Manager, and then it's put on the Agenda as a discussion Item, and...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: I, I made...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: ...they do the same thing.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: I made a commitment...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Oh.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: ...to various people in the community...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Okay. To...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: ...that I would ask this Board...

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: ...but it had to be a task force?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: I'mma say it again.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Okay.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: That I would ask this Board to support a task force to come together to help them, as community. Which is not just them, it's everyone.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Okay.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: It's nothing..., it's within the law, it's within the way government runs.

[Inaudible dais comment]

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Task force..., there's county task force, they have state task force, we have municipal task force. So, a City task force to help folks to lower their insurance rates, I do believe they will be excited about what they may or may not bring. You know? That's all I'm saying. I mean, trying to help the people. I mean, it's a task force. [Stammer] is it something [tamer] I sat down and thought about, yes. I sat in three meetings for quite a long time and hear these concerns, and we had to figure out what's gonna work. And, and I had to make phone calls, call the folks, call different people to figure out, well, what makes sense? They said, 'Well, one thing you have to do, it has to be a legislative decision.' So, one of the legislative decisions I can think of is a task force. That's a legislative decision.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Okay. But... Madam...

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: [Inaudible].

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: So, can we bring all of that back to us, what that would like, why, why..., What's the difference in a task force and just department heads meeting together?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: It's a na'... Go ahead, [inaudible].

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: It's a what?

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: [Inaudible].

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Are you asking the question of the Manager?

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: I don't know. I was, but...

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: [Inaudible].

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Yeah. I mean...

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: [Inaudible].

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: I'm interested in bringing all the information back.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Interesting.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: How can we accomplish what he wants to accomplish, but not make it...

[Inaudible comment]

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: ...so convoluted?

[Inaudible comments]

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: I don't wanna take his idea, but I, I don't...

MAYOR MASTERS: [Inaudible] bringing it back.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Just bring it back. That's all.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: It's coming back.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Okay.

MAYOR MASTERS: Okay. Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Mr. Mayor, you're recognized.

MAYOR MASTERS: Yeah. I just.., I, I understand Councilman Davis' task force, what he wants to accomplish, but I just think he can just do it. As an initiative from the Office of Terrence Davis. I do it all the time.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Yep.

MAYOR MASTERS: Different initiatives that he is interested in and goi'..., work through the, the Manager to have the department heads meet with him...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Yeah.

MAYOR MASTERS: Whether you call it a task force, a white ribbon committee, a blue ribbon committee, just do it, and get them together and, and whatever facts come out and once you all get your facts and get the, whatever it is, then, then bring it back to the Council...

[Inaudible comment]

MAYOR MASTERS: ...and, as an initiative or something that the Council can sanction what needs to be done. What I think you oughta just do it through your office and just be done with it. I don't think there's really no need to bring it to the Council...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Madam Chair?

MAYOR MASTERS: ...now. I think, just, just do it.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Madam Chair?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Chair Pro Tem, you're recognized.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Yeah. [Stammer]...

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: I agree wholeheartedly with, with the Mayor. This is his idea, it's his start, it's an initiative that's needed. Let, let him do it. We all have our different ideas. Some of 'em we bring to the dais, and some of 'em we just do. So, either he can, you know, just do it, or we can sanction and support something that another colleague is doing.

[Inaudible comment]

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: You know? It's, it's, it's semantics. You're calling it a task force, a committee, what, what did the Mayor say? A blue ribbon committee, a white ribbon...

MAYOR MASTERS: A white ribbon, whatever....

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: ...committee. Whatever, it's...

MAYOR MASTERS: Just do it.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Let's just do it and see what comes of, of it.

MAYOR MASTERS: Are you okay with that, Mr. Davis?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: I'm fine with it.

MAYOR MASTERS: Okay. Good.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: I'm just...

MAYOR MASTERS: [Inaudible].

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: ...trying to be courteous...

MAYOR MASTERS: Okay. Fine.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: ...to my colleagues.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: [Inaudible].

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Okay.

MAYOR MASTERS: I support it.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: ...department heads [inaudible].

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you, Mr. Davis. We look forward to the information that will be provided from this initiative. [Pause].

That concludes the Agenda.

BOARD APPOINTMENTS

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: We are now.., are there any Board appointments?

[Pause]

DISCUSSION BY CITY MANAGER

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Discussion by City Manager.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Madam.., Madam Chair, just an announcement. And I believe I sent out an email. On February 11th, there is a, a scheduled workshop with the School Board Staff and Dr. Debra Robinson with the City Council. That's February 11th at 6:00 o'clock p.m.

[Pause]. That's all I have at this point and Dr. Botel did send me an email to make an announcement on her behalf. So, when you get to her name, I would like to make an announcement.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Okay.

DISCUSSION BY CITY ATTORNEY

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Discussion by City Attorney.

CITY ATTORNEY WYNN: Yes, Madam Chair. Announcing a closed executive session pursuant to Florida Statute 286.011, Public meetings and records, 8(d). In desire [inaudible] concerning litigation, I am requesting a time that the City Council can be available for a closed executive session on the McCoy v. City of Riviera Beach case. The next City Council meeting is scheduled to be held on February 6, 2019. Can Members of the Council meet prior to that meeting?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: No.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: [Inaudible]. Which is that? What, what date?

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: February 6th.

CITY ATTORNEY WYNN: February 6, 2019.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: That's before the...

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: What's that Monday, Tuesday?

[Inaudible dais comments]

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: That's Tuesday?

CITY ATTORNEY WYNN: Yes.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Mhmm.

[Inaudible dais comments]

MAYOR MASTERS: February the [inaudible].

[Inaudible dais comments]

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: February 6th?

CITY ATTORNEY WYNN: Three weeks. Three weeks from today.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: I believe I heard yes from Councilwoman Botel. Mr. Davis?

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: 5:30?

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Botel?

CITY ATTORNEY WYNN: 5:30?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: 5:30, February 6th.

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL: I'm okay.

CITY ATTORNEY WYNN: Okay.

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Councilwoman Botel said okay.

CITY ATTORNEY WYNN: Therefore, a closed executive session will be held on February 6, 2019 at 5:30 p.m., at City Hall, 2nd Floor, in City Council Chambers in the case of Tradrick McCoy v. The City of Riviera Beach, Lynne Hubbard in her capacity as an elected official of the City Council, Claudene Anthony in her capacity as City Clerk and Custodian of Records. Those persons in attendance will be myself, City Attorney Dawn **WYNN**, Don Stevens, Special Counsel, Olds & Stevens, Mayor Masters, Members of the City Council, City Manager Karen Hoskins. The subject matter of the closed executive session shall be confined to settlement negotiations or strategy sessions related to litigation expenditures.

Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you.

CITY COUNCIL COMMITTEE REPORTS

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Are there any City Council Committee Reports?

[Pause]

STATEMENTS BY THE MAYOR AND CITY COUNCIL

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Statements by the Mayor and Council, beginning with the Mayor.

MAYOR MASTERS: Thank you, Madam Chair. You're so delighted to always call me first, and thank you.

Family and Friends Day, tomorrow night. What, what is that, that 17th? Thursday at 6:00 p.m. and we have the sensational Motown Magic, a/k/a Intonations. It's one of our top bands. And we have another band, and some other local talent. Don't stay away because you think it's gonna be cold. It's not gonna be col, come and enjoy it. It's all free.

Also, the.., I was very disappointed yesterday that the job fair that the Utility Department announced for over a month on Channel 18, with the text that went up over a month, only six people showed up at the job fair. That was a very disappointing, very embarrassing moment for me, that.., when someone comes, he was here from Georgia, right here in this room and we only got six people out. No one spoke to me about the job fair. I think some people know that I've been called the jobs mayor but, for some reason, I was left out of the loop. The last job fair I had, was City sponsored, a few weeks ago, maybe a month or so, we had over 400 people there and it was at the Marina. So, I encourage the, the young man that was doing the hiring, and he said all six of 'em were not qualified. I did encourage him, don't give up. We have more than six people in the City of Riviera Beach that need jobs, and they are willing to train them, unless.., train them, but they do need to have a little plumbing experience. So, I have set a date. I'd like for the Manager to take note, for February the 5th. We will have a job fair, a real job fair, not six people that will show up, under the leadership and administration of the Utility Department. That's what happened. It will be February the 5th, if that date is available, at the Marina. And it will just not be for the young man, as far as the putting the new meters in, but it will also be for other major employers. And this is not for the ex-offenders, because the major employers that will be invited, will be those that probably cannot hire ex-offenders, but just hire people who have pretty clean backgrounds, other than misdemeanors. So, I'm asking my Councilpeople to be involved and to participate and to contact and help the Mayor promote this, and we need to show this gentleman, Charles is his first name. I can't think of his last name. That we can have a job fair and get more than six people to show up, after advertising for a month. It was a disgrace. And a shame.

Last but not least, the voting for ex-offenders. Ex-offenders can.., I did meet with the representative from the Supervisor of Elections office today, and the Governor is sending them through, so there's not any hold up for ex-offenders to register and the good news is, they're gonna be, be able to register to vote in the next election. In March. And all those 400 people that.., please, go register, right away because the books will close twenty-eight to twenty-nine days before the election. If you are still on paper, like,

probation or parole or restitution, and that has not been cleared up, then you are not eligible to vote. And if you do, it's a felony. So, there's a 800 number that you call, and I don't have it in front me, or the elections office, and they get the information like that and tell you that you're good or you're not good. But whatever you do, look into it.

The, the Office of the City Attorney, I think is in the Public Safety building, that's temporarily while they're renovating, but I hope that it's soon because we..., I'd like to have an Attorney here on, on the premises because that's where we..., that's where we, the body, operates. So as soon as that can happen, I would ask the people to expedite it for we can get our Attorney here with us. And until that happens, maybe if, if some hours can be set up where we know the Attorney will be in the City Hall building, then I, and others, well, Staff here, in talking to the elected officials, will be able to meet here. If something can be worked out.

Last but not least, I feel very strong, very strongly about what Mr. Davis brought forth, about the, the federal employees that have been impacted. And as soon as an..., and I don't really wanna see them have to wait two days. You don't know how it feels to not have a check, and you're working, but as soon as the counsel, legal counsel and whoever else can fix this and work it out, I will probably..., not probably, I will call a special Council meeting to get the approval. I just don't want them to have to wait another two weeks. It's already a hardship. So I, I just want to say that.

Happy Belated New Year. Thank you, Madam Chair.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Madam Manager, you're reading Councilwoman Botel's comments?

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS: Yes. Councilwoman Botel asked that I remind viewers that the quarterly Singer Island town hall meeting will be held at the Marina Event Center, 200 East 13th Street, tomorrow at 6:00 o'clock p.m. We will hear about Phase 2 of the Marina project, the community garden, the Charter amendments, and the City's water quality issues. The venue is beautiful and there is plenty of free parking.

That's all I have, Madam Chair. She has, Madam Chair.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you. Councilman Davis.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: I just wanna say Happy New Year's to all the residents of Riviera Beach and the business owners who choose to do business here in our community. Just happy to see everyone make to 2019. Congratulations, Ms. Wynn on your first meeting.

MAYOR MASTERS: Yes. Congratulations.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Great to have you here. [inaudible] that, you know, we are in the, once again, election cycle. Be patient, do your research, um, take pride..., continue to take pride in your community with the understanding that at the hot election year, we get a lotta necessary, and unnecessary, media., But let's continue to work well together as a, as a community because, when you work well together, great things

happen. We may differ on issues, but do not display any separation amongst the community. We have testing coming up soon. To the parents, please encourage and spend a little more time with the young folks in your home to make sure they have good meals before they go on to school for testing, preparation. And all those things. I think as we approach testing, we must encourage everyone to do the extra mile, do the small things that matter because our young folks, when they leave the house and know that someone loves them and do a little extra more for 'em, getting that extra hug, they do a little bit better on testing. That's important.

I have one issue. At the next Council meeting, I would like to see a presentation, from the last three to five..., three to four years, a presentation from Bernstein of the work that was done, of the time of them working here in Riviera Beach as the agent of record. Usually we get a status update, a presentation. That's never taken place. That I reca'..., that I can remember. I would like to see that done at the next Council meeting.

And that'll be all.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Councilwoman Miller-Anderson.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: I would just like to say Happy New Year and welcome Ms. Wynn. Also, we have our Citizen Leadership Academy. It's up and running, and we've done a couple of sessions. We can always accept more people to come in, but there is a attendance requirement, so there's a total of ten sessions, and if you miss two, you will not graduate. So, you want your diploma at the end, but I, you know, I encourage everyone, you're welcome to stop in. One meeting, two meetings, whatever you'd like to do. It's every Tuesday at 6:00 p.m. to 9:00 p.m. Children 6th grade through 12th grade are welcome, and as well as adults. We still have a few more seats, so please find your way over to the Marina on Tuesdays 6:00 to 9:00 p.m., and you will get a chance to learn a lotta about our departments. And that's the whole concept of the Citizen Leadership Academy is to educate our residents and our business owners of the operations and functions of our City. So, it's, it's meant to be an interactive and fun learning experience for you but, at the end of the day, it's for you to be a, a better community leader, more educated community leader. So, Tuesdays, 6:00 to 9:00 p.m. And the last session ends, I believe, March 5th. So, every Tuesday up until March 5th. You can stop by the Marina. 6:00 to 9:00 p.m.

And that's it for me. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you. Chair Pro Tem.

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD: Happy New Year to everybody. And, I would also like to tell the senior citizens of the Lindsey Davis Center that that participate in, in the garden there, this is the first that we heard of the batch of seeds that we poor, that did not grow, or that came to the Lindsey Davis Center, the resident that brought it to us. As she said, I'm always over there, I'm always sponsoring something there, but again, this is the first I've heard of the community garden not flourishing or receiving any bad seeds or products. So, definitely, we'll look into that, but if you don't let us know what's going on, then we won't know that, that there was a bad batch. So, I definitely am there often enough to...

for anybody over there to tell me if something is going on. So, be sure and let us know, and we'll always get.., we'll always get an answer for you.

Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you. Mr. Blankenship, if you would come and please give us a reminder about MLK events coming up.

PARKS & RECREATION DIRECTOR BLANKENSHIP: Good evening, Council, Mayor, City Manager. Richard Blankenship, Parks & Recreation Director.

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS: Mhmm.

PARKS & RECREATION DIRECTOR BLANKENSHIP: We're within the eleventh hour for our kicking off our MLK activities. Tomorrow morning at 11:30, we will have the senior luncheon, which is at capacity. And then on Friday, we'll have the gala, which is also sold out for the first time in, in quite a while. We can't wait to host Ms. Yvette Miley, Suncoast graduate, Riviera Beach native and the Senior Vice President of NBC and MSNBC news. And then Saturday, at 10:00 a.m., the, the parade will kick off at the corner of Congress and Blue Heron. I know Ms. Franks has sent you all some guidelines on where to be, and when to be, and how to be, and all that kind of stuff. So, we got a whirlwind weekend coming up. It looks like the weather's gonna cooperate and we hope.., we invite everybody to come out to the parade and have a great time. The Family Fun Zone will again be at the UPS lot. And we just look forward to a great weekend. And then, we're not done after Saturday, the film series kicks off the following Monday.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: What is it?

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Film series.

PARKS & RECREATION DIRECTOR BLANKENSHIP: Film series. We're, we're not.., we have a film series that the library is sponsoring.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Oh.

PARKS & RECREATION DIRECTOR BLANKENSHIP: And it'll be at the Marina Event Center. And it.., when you get your souvenir booklet, the, the schedule will be in there.

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Okay.,

PARKS & RECREATION DIRECTOR BLANKENSHIP: Any Questions? Alright. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: Thank you. I would like to thank the Concerned Mothers and the Southside Coalition for a wonderful job for providing a holiday meal and gifts to the children of the Riviera Beach Heights community. We were able to host the event in the Brooks Community Center, which is a lovely venue, and it was very nicely attended and I certainly want to thank the Parks & Recreation, as well as Public Works, for the services that were provided for that event. We do have an opportunity to officially

go into the center. I believe that all things have just about been finalized for that center. So, we will look to host our meeting for the south'..., south end of the community.

I just need to obtain a date for our Charter amendments review. We can host it in that center. So, Mr. Blankenship, we'll work with you to coordinate a date in the very near future to host that meeting in the community center.

Thank you all so much for bearing with us tonight. We know that it was a very lengthy meeting. We appreciate your time and patience and attendance.

ADJOURNMENT

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: And, with there being no further business, I just want to wish you the very best of 2019. We stand adjourned.

[Gavel]

]End of video]

City Employees, Public Comment Speakers and Others

BONNIE LARSON.....MS. B. LARSON
LLOYD BROWNMR. L. BROWN
GLEN J. TORCIVIA, ESQ.....MR. G. TORCIVIA
DR. PHILLIP DUKESDR. P. DUKES
MICHAEL MAHONEYMR. M. MAHONEY
NORA MAHONEY.....MS. N. MAHONEY
CLAUDIUS KNALLSMR. C. KNALLS
DORETTA PAULKMS. D. PAULK
MARGARET SHEPHERDMS. M. SHEPHERD
WILLIS WILLIAMSMR. W. WILLIAMS
HORACE TOWNSMR. H. TOWNS
AMON YISRAELMR. A. YISRAEL
MARY BRABHAMMS. M. BRABHAM

PARKS & RECREATION DIRECTOR RICHARD BLANKENSHIP
PARKS & RECREATION DIRECTOR
BLANKENSHIP

PROCHAMP GOVERNMENT RELATIONS DIRECTOR SCOTT BLASIE
MR. S. BLASIE

U.H.G.I. PRESIDENT/CEO REGGIE JAMESMR. R. JAMES
U.H.G.I. VICE PRESIDENT TRINETTE MORRISMS. T. MORRIS
FINANCE DIRECTOR RANDY SHERMANFINANCE DIRECTOR
SHERMAN
SHIRLEY LANIER.....MS. S. LANIER
DOUGLAS LAWSONMR. D. LAWSON
CHIEF OF STAFF DEBIE ISAACSCHIEF OF STAFF ISAACS