

**CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH  
REGULAR CITY COUNCIL MEETING  
August 15, 2018  
6:00 p.m.**

PRESENT AT MEETING<sup>1</sup>:

THOMAS A. MASTERS

MAYOR MASTERS

CHAIRPERSON TONYA DAVIS JOHNSON DISTRICT 3

CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON

CHAIR PRO TEM LYNNE L. HUBBARD DISTRICT 1

CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD

COUNCILPERSON KaSHAMBA L. MILLER- ANDERSON DISTRICT 2

COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON

COUNCILPERSON JULIE BOTEL DISTRICT 4

COUNCILPERSON BOTEL

COUNCILPERSON TERENCE "TD" DAVIS DISTRICT 5

COUNCILPERSON DAVIS

CITY MANAGER KAREN L. HOSKINS

CITY MANAGER HOSKINS

CITY CLERK CLAUDENE L. ANTHONY

CITY CLERK ANTHONY

CITY ATTORNEY ANDREW DEGRAFFENREIDT

CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT

TRANSCRIBED BY:

Legal Transcription, Etc., LLC  
931 Village Boulevard  
#905-148  
West Palm Beach, FL 33409  
(561) 429-3816  
(561) 584-5044 (fax)  
jreitano@legaltranscriptionetc.com

---

<sup>1</sup> List of City Employees, Public Speakers and Others on Page 170-171

**CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH  
PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA  
MINUTES OF THE CITY COUNCIL MEETING  
HELD IN THE CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS  
AUGUST 15, 2018 @ 6:00 P.M.**

(The following may contain unintelligible or misunderstood words due to the recording quality.)

**CALL TO ORDER**

**ROLL CALL**

**INVOCATION**

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson KaShamba Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Present.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Julia Botel? [Pause]. Councilperson Terence Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Here.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** City Manager Karen Hoskins?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Here.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** City Clerk Claudene Anthony is present. City Attorney Andrew Degraffenreidt?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Here.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** You may proceed.

**PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Please stand for a moment of silence followed by the Pledge of Allegiance, led by Council Member Davis.

[Moment of silence]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Shall we pledge?

**ALL:** I pledge allegiance to the Flag of the United States of America and to the Republic for which it stands, one nation under God, indivisible with liberty and justice for all.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC SHALL BE GIVEN A TOTAL OF THREE MINUTES TO SPEAK ON ALL ITEMS LISTED ON THE

**CONSENT AGENDA. ANY PERSON WHO WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS, PLEASE FILL OUT A PUBLIC COMMENT CARD LOCATED ON THE TABLE DIRECTLY OUTSIDE OF THE COUNCIL CHAMBERS AND GIVE IT TO THE STAFF PRIOR TO THE ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA.**

**AGENDA APPROVAL**

**ADDITIONS, DELETIONS AND SUBSTITUTIONS**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Manager, are there any additions, deletions or substitutions?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Yes, Madam Chair. On the Consent Agenda, Item No. 2, Resolution No. 76-18. A Resolution of the City Council of the City of Riviera Beach, Palm Beach County, Florida, establishing time restrictions with respect to discussion and debate for the Mayor and City Council Members on Agenda Items and providing an effective date. This language was revised. Also, additional information was provided to you from the Robert's Rules of Order. That information was emailed to you. Item No. 2.

[Inaudible dais comments]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It's Item No. 3.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** It's 3?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It's Item No. 3 on the Agenda.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Oh, I'm sorry. Item No. 3. Also, Item No. 11, a presentation by Chairperson Tonya Davis Johnson in recognition of beach life guards. That Item will be deleted.

And that's all I have, Madam Chair.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Davis, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I would like to do and, an addition under discussions. Phil Foster Park. And the Item will be the treatment of residents in Riviera Beach..., [stammer], treatment of the residents of Riviera Beach to Phil Foster Park. Accessing Phil Foster Park.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Botel, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** I would like to add an Item for discussion. A discussion of the [pause], how can I phrase this? A discussion of our use of Attorney Bedard going

forward, although we are not in contract with him, our insurance agent is and I wonder if we can discuss asking our insurance agent to, to discontinue his contract.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Botel, if you will recall, we directed Staff to bring back some information. So, before we take, take that action, I believe we should hear what Staff has brought back.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Okay. Then, I'd like to hear that.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you. In addition to the Regular Agenda, a dra'.., I have a draft Resolution celebrating fifty years of home rule, that is being requested by the Florida League of Cities in honor of the fifty years of municipal home rule, and I will bring that up. We'll add that to the regular Agenda.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** What number will that be, Madam Clerk?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** 15A, Madam Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** 15A?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Yes, ma'am. Councilwoman Miller-Anderson, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So, for Mr. Davis, where.., what number is that one going to be? 18?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Clerk.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** For the Phil Foster Park.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Clerk, will you give us the number of that Item, please?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** The add-on by Councilperson Davis...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Your mic...

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** ...[inaudible]...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Your mic isn't on.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** ...Phil Foster Park...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Your mic isn't on.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Can I get some volume, please? [Inaudible]. [Pause].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** While we are waiting, Commissioner Botel, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I'm sorry?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** I'm sorry. I had to swallow. [Chuckle]. I had asked that [skip] put on a future Agenda regarding the home rule request. So, if we can get it done tonight, it would be more the better and we can remove it from that future Agenda.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Here here.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** I had language already in place, so.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I have the language.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** ...[inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** ...get that language and ...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...Botel? I have the language...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** ...[inaudible]...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...that was provided by the Florida League of Cities. I have it here in a draft Resolution.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Great.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thanks. The Item No. for the addition of Phil Foster Park discussion?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, the add-on by Councilperson Davis for the access to Phil Foster Park will be Item No. 18, and the dis'.., add-on by Councilperson Botel regarding Attorney Bedard, under discussion and deliberation will be No. 19.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Madam...

**UNK.:** Thanks.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Chair Pro Tem Hubbard, you're recognized.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** I would like to add two community benefits, please. And I would..., I don't..., are you ready for Items that, that I would like to pull?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** No, I'm not.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Okay. Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** So, you're adding two community benefit Items?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes, ma'am.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** So, would that then become..., what would that become? 9A and B?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** 9A and 9B, Madam Chair, but we need to know the amount and the organization, please.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes, please. Chair Pro Tem Hubbard.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes. Thank you. For Parks & Recreation, it's \$225. And, for Palm Beach County School District, it is \$200.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Is it going to a specific school?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Palm Beach Lakes.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Palm Beach Lakes.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** One moment, Councilwoman...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** What are they..., what is for? What is it towards? Or, what is it being used for?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Chair Pro Tem, would you please share what your community benefits are for?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Palm Beach Lakes is the marching band, the marching band. And, Parks & Recreation uniforms.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Are there any additional additions?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** \$200. And she said 9A and 9B?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** 9A and 9B. 9A will be...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...Parks & Recreation, 9B will be the School District of Palm Beach County.

### **DISCLOSURES BY COUNCIL**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Are there any disclosures by Mayor and Council?

[Pause]

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** No.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Any other Members? [Pause]. I...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...spoke with Matthew...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...from the law firm of Torcivia..., Torcivia, et al.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** So did I, Madam Chair.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I did too.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So did..., Councilman Davis did as well.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** I have scheduled a meeting on the phone with him but haven't had it.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Walter, we're going to need you to turn Councilwoman Botel's speaker up a little bit. And, for the record, Councilwoman Botel is joining us by phone.

### **ADOPTION OF AGENDA**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I'd like to request a motion to adopt the Agenda...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** So...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...as revised.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** So moved, Madam Chair.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Second.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It's been motioned and properly second. Madam Clerk.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Botel?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Hubbard?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Davis Johnson?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Unanimous vote.

**COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC ON CONSENT AGENDA (THREE MINUTE LIMITATION)**

**CONSENT AGENDA**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ALL MATTERS LISTED UNDER THIS ITEM ARE CONSIDERED TO BE ROUTINE AND ACTION WILL BE TAKEN BY ONE MOTION. THERE WILL BE NO SEPARATE DISCUSSION OF THESE ITEMS UNLESS A COUNCILPERSON SO REQUESTS, IN WHICH EVENT, THE ITEM WILL BE REMOVED FROM THE GENERAL ORDER OF BUSINESS AND CONSIDERED IN ITS NORMAL SEQUENCE ON THE AGENDA.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Are there any Members of Council that would like to pull any Items from the Agenda at this time?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Miller-Anderson, you're recognized.



**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** No. 3, No. 8, and No. 9.

[Pause]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Are there any other Items?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes, Madam Chair? Let me go back to my Item. Here, I think it's 11. It's 15, Madam Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Item 15.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** It's under Regular Agenda though.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Mhmm. [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Alright. We have a request to pull Items 3, 8, 9 and 15 from the Agenda.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** We're taking 15... Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Miller-Anderson, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** But Item No. 15 is not a Consent, so.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** I just wanted...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...are we voting...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...[inaudible]...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** She just asked for Items to be pulled. I asked for Items to be pulled. You don't mind.., that comes in its regular sequence...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yeah.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...[inaudible] to be pulled, Councilwoman...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...Hubbard.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So, it's staying on there?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** So, Items 3, 8 and 9 will be pulled from the Consent Agenda. [Pause]. All matters listed under the Item are considered to rou'... I read that. Motion to adopt the Consent Agenda with Items 3, 8 and 9 pulled.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** So moved, Madam Chair.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Second.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Can you explain about 15, what was your intent toward that?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** No. 15 is a Regular Agenda Item. We're pulling Items from the Consent only.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** And so, therefore, we would need to pull it because it's on there for discussion, under Regular.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Not for discussion?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I apologize.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** I meant..., well, maybe I should just, I guess, when we get to it, move to table it then? Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** If that is..., if that is your desire.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** I just wanted to know..., I just wanted to stay within the order that you were...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Right.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...moving.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Within the order, is..., we're just dealing with the Consent Agenda at this moment. It's been motioned and properly second.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, we do have public comment cards for the Consent Agenda. The...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** ...acceptance of public comment cards for the Consent Agenda is now closed.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Lloyd Brown, Tiffany Williams, Rodrigo Hildago.

**MR. L. BROWN:** How ya doin'? My name is Lloyd Brown.

I knew as soon as I signed up for No. 3 on the Resolution you were gonna pull it because I came in and filled it out before.., after you did the Pledge of Allegiance, so I figured it was all fixed, but I see ya'll still doing the same thing again, you know, to where you wait 'til you get in here 'cause I know there's several other people probably filled out on that Agenda Item. And so, what I'm gonna talk about is this, since, I mean, I got this time. You know what, I feel like this, when you have an individual come up here, I may not understand, sitting back there, what, what's the situation because I don't really understand the workings you have down there. So then, when this person start' talking and then this lady say', 'Well, it's closed,' I don't think that's fair because, for one thing, a lot of people, like me, I mean, don't understand some of the Resolutions you got on there. So, we have to hear a couple people speak first, so you can have a pretty good idea. You know, that's like.., well, I can say, it's almost like a preview, you know what's going on. But when you get up here and you don't know what the hell' going on, 'cause you're back there and you gotta wait on an individual to come up here and say a few words about something on the Agenda Item, I think you should at least let a couple people say something so that an individual like me can understand what the situation is. 'Cause really, a lot of things down there I really don't understand. You know? And I know there's a lot of other people out there who's watching this, they probably don't understand either, until somebody get up there and actually explain what's going on with these Agendas or Resolutions, or whatever you're gonna do.

And then, I know maybe this might not be a, a part of what you wanna hear, but, I mean, there's so many different things that's going on around here, and I figure, like, we should have equal time, just like ya'll can talk as much as you want to, we should have equal time to talk because I done seen people come in here and they done talk a bunchy of b.s. and they can talk for thirty minutes, as long as it's good b.s. towards ya'll. But, we get up here and as soon as we get a.., I mean, like, some kind of situation where we're talking against whatever you're talking about, it's like you wanna close the door.

And then, you know, another thing, I mean, I know it's not all a part about it, but I got a minute, I might as well talk about it. I don't know if you ever heard of Nuremburg, that's when Hitler, he made sure that all the Jews, and all the whatever, they couldn't vote, they couldn't do different things. I mean, what I'm looking at in our government today, it's like we're going through the same thing, and I'll say something about it on my public comment, but I's like, it's not right for you to...

[Inaudible comment]

**MR. L. BROWN:** ...tell a person that it's closed on an Agenda Item because, for one thing, let a couple people speak. I mean, that's not gonna hurt because I know there's probably about seven, eight more people that's back here that don't understand like I don't understand it, 'til I hear somebody get up here and explain to ya'll what they're talking about and I can I understand. Then I'll.., I may have a better idea than that individual who knows what's going on. See, you won't get all your ideas in if you don't let people put 'em in the bucket, because you done moved the bucket somewhere else, but we don't need that.

And, as far as ya'll speaking, I mean, I wouldn't care how long you speak 'cause you're gonna do it anyway 'cause you're in control.

But ya'll have a nice day.

[Timer]

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Tiffany Williams.

**MS. T. WILLIAMS:** Good evening, Council. Tiffany Williams, Fire Department, General Employee.

This is for Consent Agenda No. 8, but it was pulled. I just only have one question. I wanna thank you for your support again. I want..., I have a question. I know Ms. Hoskins stated at the budget workshop on August 6, 2018, that she would, not quoting that..., try the positions, they were not at market value, that they would try to kind of negotiate that in somewhere to the next negotiation, in the negotiation process. I don't know if that would come up in a workshop compensation study. I just wanna know so the next management team that comes in, they would be aware of what happened, why this was done and there won't be no confusion or manipulation for the next time. That's the only question that I have, for that part.

Thank you.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Rodrigo Hildago.

**MR. R. HILDAGO:** Hello. I'm Rodrigo Hildago, the union rep for FPSU. I was here to speak about Agenda 8, the Resolution of the contract..., ratification of the contract. Is this the correct time to do so or?

[Inaudible comment]

**MR. R. HILDAGO:** Well, I wanted to personally say that we recognize the hard work the Council has done to instruct its agents to do the right thing in negotiations. I wanted to say that the membership is very eager to have these contracts finally ratified and for it to go through. They ratified it overwhelmingly, over a hundred yeses to only nine no's. And that, we just hope to have this contract speedily resolved so that the members and the bargaining unit can get their wages.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Mhmm. Thank you.

**MR. R. HILDAGO:** That's all.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, that concludes public comments for the Consent Agenda.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you. Item No. 3, please.

[Inaudible dais comments]

[Pause]

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Norma Duncombe.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Ms. Duncombe, come forward.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** Good afternoon.

I'm here in reference to No. 3. And, the reason.., there's not a whole lot to say about this. If Council Members have done their homework, it should not be a dissertation that you have to give that lasts for thirty minutes on an Item. And, you should be able to give us the important information regarding that Item. We're in here and you're time is running out in Council meetings, when things are very important, that sometimes you're not able to deal with. So, I think is.., I'm asking you to govern yourselves the way you want us to govern ourselves, that we get up here and we are to the point and we say what we have to say, and then that's it. And we just make sure it's clear what we have to say. I think you should vote unanimously to stop the long dissertation so that we get business done. We've gotta get business done. We are behind, and we just need to be able to move.

Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair [chuckle], that concludes. This is on another Item that's on the Agenda. [Chuckle].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Ready for the, ready for the vote?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes, ready for the vote.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** We weren't ready.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Hold on.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** We haven't.., nobody.., we didn't talk about 3.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** This was...

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** We haven't gotten to, to that part.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** This was the public comment on the Consent Agenda.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. And we...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Now we're going to...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...didn't vote yet?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Now we're going to vote, and then we're going to...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Unders'...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...Item 3, Item 8 and Item 9.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** [Inaudible] 'cause I thought she said she was done with public comment.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** She...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...for that.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...didn't realize that she had one final card.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I'm just...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** [Inaudible]...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** That's what I'm trying to figure out, what's going on.

[Inaudible audience comment]

\_\_\_: Thank you. I appreciate it.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yeah. I, I just asked, what...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Clerk.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Botel?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Hubbard?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Davis Johnson?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Unanimous vote.

### **MINUTES**

- 1. MINUTES OF THE CITY COUNCIL WORKSHOP HELD JULY 9, 2018**
- 2. MINUTES OF THE REGULAR CITY COUNCIL MEETING HELD JULY 18, 2018.**

**CITY CLERK CLAUDENE ANTHONY (561) 845-4090**

### **RESOLUTIONS**

**3.**

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Item No. 3.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY: RESOLUTION NO. 76-18. A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH, PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA ESTABLISHING TIME RESTRICTIONS WITH RESPECT TO DISCUSSION AND DEBATE FOR THE MAYOR AND CITY COUNCIL MEMBERS ON AGENDA ITEMS AND PROVIDING AN EFFECTIVE DATE.**

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So moved.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Second.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It's been motioned and properly second. You had a question, Councilwoman Miller-Anderson, on this Item?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes, I did. For..., and let me just start off by saying, I totally am in support of this, but I know that when we had the initial voting of this, we really didn't have any expectations or foresee how things would move along. What I noticed from my end, is that there have been times where, if we've already done

our two times at speaking with the five minutes, if another Councilperson speaks with the individual that's doing the presentation or if something else new comes up, that may, you know, say Ms. Hubbard is talking to the person and then something comes up and she didn't continue but that may have sparked another question in one of us, then we're not allowed to come back and gain more clarity on that. That was the only thing I saw going on when we were trying to stick with the five minutes, for the two times at being able to respond to an Item.

And so, for me, I thought that would..., you know, it's kind of..., and if we're doing this for Council meetings, specials meetings... During special meetings a lot of times, it's usually for something that's more of a fact finding or something that is being revealed or we're trying to get more understanding, and I think during that time, as well as, as a workshop, that's the time for us to ask questions. And if, in a workshop we're limited on how many we can ask, that, you know, I see that as being a problem. I'm not trying to be here all day and talk an hour on an Item, but it..., the five minutes, two times, was a problem. I, I think that now the new thing is ten minutes. Is it ten minutes? 'Cause I know that's what the backup said. Did we change it from the five minutes to the two min'..., from, from the five minutes to the ten minutes?

[Inaudible dais comment]

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair? That's what the Robert Rules of Order new backup said.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam City Manager.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Yes. It's, it's ten minutes, Madam Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** No longer than ten minutes.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** No longer than [inaudible]...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Right, right, right. Not..., so, not the five?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Correct.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. But you...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Five each or a total of twenty?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Two rounds of five minutes. So...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** That gives you a total of ten minutes.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** I'll be a total of ten minutes for each discussion, each debate.



**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Right. And, and, say if I ask a question, it only takes one minute to ask a question, you know, I still have another time. But, what I'm saying is, there are times when prese'..., presenter is there and something new may be revealed during his discussion, his or her discussion and if no one else has that same idea to ask the question, then that means that question will go without, if I've already asked..., I've already spoken twice. I think the rounds is [stammer]. I don't know how you put a number on rounds, but I do know when we had several of these meetings when we were trying to time it, that became a problem. I remember Ms. Hubbard saying that, you know, we said..., or, this kinda wasn't working because of the way in which we had it. But, [pause], again...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...I'm in support of limiting it, but it's a problem when it comes to additional information being needed or it comes up, and then I'm sitting here saying, 'Oh, well I can't speak anymore. I've only spoke'..., I've spoken twice already,' but I may have just asked one question and then one more question and that was the end of it. And then, that's end, whether I have another question or not. I think maybe as long as the ten minutes, if we wanna stick to ten minutes, if you wanna ask fifty questions in ten minutes, you still just get ten minutes. I think the rounds is what's kinda limiting you as to how much you can ask, or how much clarity you can get. I'm not saying increase the time. Ten minutes is fine, I would think, but having only two times to say something is where...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...the problem probably comes in at.

That's just my, my thoughts on that. Anyone else?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Botel, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Thank you. I was gonna ask if we could yield our time to one another, but perhaps it's getting resolved by just eliminating the notion of rounds and just giving everybody ten minutes. But, I would be happy, for example, if Councilwoman Miller-Anderson needed to ask another question, to yield some of my time and [breaking up] perhaps...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Let, let...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** ...[inaudible] my...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Coun'...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** ...remarks.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you. Chair Pro Tem, you're recognized.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** I wonder if we would be interested in giving this a try through September and feeling it out a little bit and seeing how it works, and then we can tweak it, if you are so inclined, Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Let me just say this, I believe that when we come to these meetings, we should have reviewed our documentation, with the expectation of, you know, a few questions here and there, we should come here ready to vote. We have spent an inordinate amount of time just going back and forth and, as Councilwoman Botel has said, we are quite loquacious and unnecessarily so, in my opinion. So, Robert's Rules of Order says that no, no Member shall speak more than twice, during the same day, to the same question. Now, if you're talking about workshops, that's an opportunity for us to have discussion and an exchange, but when we're in these meetings, some of the things that have been said is repetitive and it is as if we didn't understand it the first five times, and that is where the time comes in. And we've gotta govern ourselves accordingly. You know, we, we have sat here and gone well into 1:00..., 1:00 a.m. behind a forty-five minute dissertation about something that is relatively simple, or should have been..., information should've been obtained prior to us taking our seats.

So, I'm not in favor of removing the rounds. I think that it's important for us. We've only given this a try once, and it was, you know, it was fairly new, the request. I believe that we are professional enough to go into two rounds of having the discussion. I, I., Councilwoman Botel, I understand the yielding, but the yielding of the time, in my opinion, would just further prolong the discussion and the conversation which is defeating the purpose, in my mind, of the two rounds, and we're saying ten minutes. And so, I believe that we owe it to ourselves and to the constituents that have sat here with us and remained in this building until 1:000 a.m., the opportunity for us to conduct the business of the City at hand and, and move forward.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** That is just simply my position. Councilwoman Miller-Anderson, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So, I totally agree with what you're saying. However, I am saying that there are times when something new comes up. Even though we have these meetings with people, doing our homework, we all do it, so, you know, that is not the issue. A lot of times things will not be disclosed, all the time, in a, in a room, in a meeting. Sometimes it's not disclosed all the time at the presentation, but as we continue to probe and ask questions, then that's when it is brought out. So, that is the reason for having it where we can ask additional questions. I have a job to go to in the morning, so I, I get it. I'm not trying to be here all night either. I mean, that's not my goal. And, like I said, with the ten minutes, I'm not trying to get extra minutes, I'm just saying that there have been times when additional information comes up and then it

needs to have additional clarification with it. If you all are not in favor of it, that's fine, but I do know that if this is a problem, we need to revisit this because..., I mean, no one should be where they can't get an answer from people at the presentation podium.

And that's my stance on that because [stammer], you know, sometimes it doesn't come out until you ask. And if you don't have but, but that two times to ask it, and it doesn't come out until later, than it's kind of, you know, it's almost like you, 'Well, you, you can't say anything.' And that's not, you know, I don't think that's appropriate. Yes, we should limit our time, 'cause some people will sit here and talk fifteen minutes, on one round and that's not what I'm supporting. I am saying ten minutes total, regardless of how many times you speak. That's what I'm asking for.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Ten minutes total, every time you speak, times five, times the number of Items...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** No. That's not what I'm saying. Ten minutes total. Just total. No..., you will never have more than ten minutes total during that Item. If you s'..., if you, if you mention something, if you talk ten times, if you're at ten minutes, you're done.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** What's the pleasure of the, of the Board? We..., I've heard your comments, we've heard your comments, what is the pleasure of the Board at this time?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** We... As it's written, I'm willing to try it as it's written and we can revisit it if we, if we need to. So, you know.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Are there any further comments with regards to Item 3?

[Pause].

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Let's...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** No.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...give it a try.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Clerk.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Botel?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** No.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Hubbard?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Davis Johnson?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** That motion is approved with Councilperson Miller-Anderson dissenting.

**4. RESOLUTION NO. 77-18 A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH, PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA, APPROVING THE COMMUNITY BASED AGENCY CONTRACT BETWEEN THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH AND THE BOARD OF COUNTY COMMISSIONERS, PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA; AND ACCEPTING CONTRACTUAL FUNDING IN THE AMOUNT OF \$180,000 FOR THE YOUTH EMPOWERMENT PROGRAM; AUTHORIZING THE DIRECTOR OF FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES TO SET UP A BUDGET FOR THE SAME AND AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR AND CITY CLERK TO EXECUTE THE AGREEMENT; AND PROVIDING FOR AN EFFECTIVE DATE.**

**YOUTH EMPOWERMENT PROGRAM DIRECTOR VALERIE GRIMSLEY (561)840-0135**

**5. RESOLUTION NO. 78-18 A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH, PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA, AUTHORIZING THE PURCHASE, TITLE, REGISTRATION AND DELIVERY OF SIX NEW 2018 PASSENGER VEHICLES BY UTILIZING THE FLORIDA SHERIFFS ASSOCIATION CONTRACT NUMBER FSA17-VEH25. SPECIFICATION; #38, #35 #27 AND #25, AUTHORIZING AND APPROPRIATING \$97,000 OF SURPLUS REVENUES IN THE FLEET SERVICE FUND, AUTHORIZING AND TRANSFERRING \$60,000 FROM THE DEVELOPMENT SERVICES GENERAL FUND TO THE FLEET SERVICE FUND, AUTHORIZING THE DIRECTOR OF FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES TO ESTABLISH A BUDGET AND MAKE PAYMENT FOR SAME FROM ACCOUNT NUMBER 503-1129-519-0-6451 FOR THE PURCHASE IN THE AMOUNT OF \$155,428.00; AND PROVIDING FOR AN EFFECTIVE DATE.**

**INTERIM PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR TERRENCE BAILEY (561) 845-4080**

**6. RESOLUTION NO. 79-18 A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH, PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA, AUTHORIZING THE CITY MANAGER TO SUBMIT A GRANT APPLICATION WITH THE FLORIDA DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION FOR THE FLORIDA RESILIENT COASTLINES PROGRAM (FRCP) AND, IF AWARDED TO THE CITY, AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR AND CITY CLERK TO EXECUTE THE GRANT AGREEMENT;**

**AUTHORIZING THE DIRECTOR OF FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES TO ESTABLISH AN ACCOUNT FOR RECEIPT AND DISBURSEMENT OF GRANT FUNDS ACCORDINGLY; AND PROVIDING FOR AN EFFECTIVE DATE.**

**INTERIM DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DIRECTOR JEFF GAGNON (561)845-4060**

**7. RESOLUTION NO. 80-18 A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH, PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA, AUTHORIZING THE GRANT APPLICATION SUBMITTAL AND ACCEPTANCE OF GRANT FUNDS FROM THE U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE – EDWARD BYRNE MEMORIAL JUSTICE ASSISTANCE PROGRAMS (JAG) IN THE AMOUNT OF \$32,911; AUTHORIZING THE DIRECTOR OF FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES TO SET UP THE BUDGET; AND PROVIDING AN EFFECTIVE DATE.**

**INTERIM POLICE CHIEF MICHAEL MADDEN (561) 845-4130**

**8.**

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Item No. 8.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY: RESOLUTION NO. 81-18. A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH, PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA AUTHORIZING THE CITY MANAGER AND CITY CLERK TO EXECUTE AN AGREEMENT, COMMENCING APRIL 1, 2018 TO MARCH 31, 2021 BETWEEN THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH AND THE SERVICE EMPLOYEE INTERNATIONAL UNION, AN ORGANIZATION REPRESENTING THE GENERAL EMPLOYEES OF THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH AND PROVIDING FOR AN EFFECTIVE DATE.**

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Is there a motion?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** So moved.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Second.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It's been motioned and properly second. Madam Manager.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair, this relates to the SEIU contract, which is a three year contract. The first year represents 12% and the next two years are 2% each, with a \$500 payment, once the contract is ratified. The total cost is \$4,698,895. [Pause]. Over the three years.

If you have any other questions.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Commissioner Miller-Anderson, you requested this Item be pulled.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes, that's it. No, thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Nothing further?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Uh-uh.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Do we have public comment cards? No. That was pulled. [Stammer], Councilman Davis, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Thank you. I have a question, for Finance or Ms. Hoskins. When this..., years ago, we was..., there was a recommendation before this Board to switch to FRS system. And, at that meeting, it was..., during the recommendation it was stated that there will be a cost savings associated with the switch to the FRS system. I would like to know, what is that savings and how much total..., exactly is that savings since then?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Mr. Sherman.

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** Yes. Good evening. Randy Sherman, Director of Finance.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Good evening.

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** The first two years were about \$1,000,000 a year. I do not have a number for you for this year but I certainly can, can get you that number. The [inaudible] savings have been reflected in the budgets, and those were the dollars that we used to, not only do the first round..., excuse me, the first round of SEIU and PMSA and Police and Fire contracts, but obviously, as we continue to save, that's funding, you know, additional contractual items.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So, \$1,000,000 a year for sixt'..., is it '15, another million for 2016? Or...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** Yeah. We did it in...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...2016-'17?

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** ...'14, so, if I recall correctly. I think it was, I think it was June of '14 we made...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Correct.

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** ...the conversion? Does that sound right? Right. So, by the time that year kicked around, it woulda been for '15, '16, '17.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So, '15, '16...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** Yeah.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...'17...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** And again, I, I can...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...and '18.

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** ...I can go back and get you those numbers, if you'd like, and I'll provide it to the Board.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Thank you. Appreciate it.

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Are there any further questions or comments from the Board? Madam Clerk.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes, ma'am.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Botel?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Pro Tem Hubbard?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Davis Johnson?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Unanimous vote.

**9.**

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Item No. 9.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY: RESOLUTION NO. 82-18. A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH, PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA**

**AUTHORIZING THE CITY MANAGER AND CITY CLERK TO EXECUTE AN AGREEMENT COMMENCING AUGUST 15, 2018 TO AUGUST 14, 2021 BETWEEN THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH AND THE PROFESSIONAL MANAGERS AND SUPERVISORS ASSOCIATION REPRESENTING THE SUPERVISORY EMPLOYEES OF THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH AND PROVIDING AN EFFECTIVE DATE.**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Is there a motion?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So moved.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Second.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It's been motioned and properly second. Madam Manager.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair, this is the PMSA Group. The total cost over the three years is \$335,438, and this affects approximately fourteen to fifteen employees. And, the percentage increase for the first year is 12%, with the next two years being 2%. And, I believe they have \$1,000 payment, once the ra'..., contract is ratified.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Madam...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Any questions from the Board?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes, Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Chair Pro Tem, you're recognized.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Madam Manager, the, the group that's in this..., in the PMSA, you say there are fourteen..., fourteen persons?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Yes, ma'am.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Are they all in a supervisory position, of sorts?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** I believe so but I can..., I would have to confirm with HR.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** The, the reason I was asking is to..., just to try, trying to see if..., one of the questions that was being asked was about certain ancillary positions were on this list that were not necessarily management or supervisory and I wanted to ask you as to what some of those might look like. Okay. [Pause]. Okay. I was able to get it open this time. [Pause]. It's kind'..., it's kind of random and the reason that I ask..., I see here the police, Police Record Section Supervisor, that would be more of an administrative position and not fall under the police union.



**HUMAN RESOURCES DIRECTOR IRVIN:** Eureka Irvin, Human Resources Department.

The Police Record Section Supervisor is an actual supervisor with subordinates reporting to it.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Okay. So, is it a civilian position or is it a...

**HUMAN RESOURCES DIRECTOR IRVIN:** It is a civilian position.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Okay. Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Are there any other questions?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair? Councilwoman Hubbard, I don't know if you want the list of names or you just wanted...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** No, no.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** ...the...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...I was more or less...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** ...position titles?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...talking about ...

[Inaudible comment]

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...positions, whether or not that police position was a certified position, or was it a civilian position. It didn't indicate. Okay.

Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Nothing further from Council?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** No, ma'am.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Clerk.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Botel?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Hubbard?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Davis Johnson?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Unanimous vote.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

### **COMMUNITY BENEFITS REQUESTS ON CONSENT**

#### **END OF CONSENT AGENDA**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** That concludes our Consent Agenda.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ANY PERSON, ANY PERSON WHO WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON AN AGENDA ITEM, PLEASE FILL OUT A PUBLIC COMMENT CARD AND GIVE IT TO STAFF PRIOR TO THE ITEM BEING PRESENT TO CITY COUNCIL FOR A DISCUSSION. MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WILL BE GIVEN THREE MINUTES TO SPEAK ON EACH REGULAR AGENDA ITEM. IN NO EVENT WILL ANYONE BE ALLOWED TO SUBMIT A COMMENT CARD AND SPEAK ON AN AGENDA ITEM AFTER THE RESOLUTION IS READ OR ITEM IS CONSIDERED.

#### **UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Clerk, there is no unfinished business, correct?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** No, Madam Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Alrighty.

#### **PUBLIC COMMENTS**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Public comments.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** PUBLIC COMMENT SHALL BEGIN AT 7:30 P.M. UNLESS THERE IS NO FURTHER BUSINESS OF THE CITY COUNCIL WHICH, IN THAT EVENT, IT SHALL BEGIN SOONER. IN ADDITION, IF ANY ITEM IS BEING CONSIDERED AT 7:30 P.M., THEN COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC SHALL BEGIN IMMEDIATELY AFTER THE ITEM HAS BEEN CONCLUDED. ANY PERSON WHO WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK DURING PUBLIC COMMENTS, PLEASE FILL OUT A COMMENT CARD LOCATED ON THE TABLE DIRECTLY OUTSIDE OF THE

**COUNCIL CHAMBERS AND GIVE IT TO STAFF BEFORE THE PUBLIC COMMENT SECTION IS ANNOUNCED.**

**PETITIONS AND COMMUNICATIONS FOR FILING**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Clerk.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, under petitions and communications, I would just like to advise the City Council that the Charter Review Committee is moving forward. They next, next meeting will be held on tomorrow, beginning at 6:30. And, as you all are aware, they have sent invitation to you all to come to their meetings. They're looking for your input, and there is a request for a workshop on October 16<sup>th</sup>. I have not heard from anyone as to your availability for that date. So, if you all could please advise whether or not you are available October 16<sup>th</sup> for a workshop with the Charter Review Advisory Board, I would greatly appreciate it.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** 6:00 p.m.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** 6:00 p.m., Madam Chair.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I'm available.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I'm available.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Botel, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Thank you. I have it in my calendar.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** You have it on your calendar?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Mhmm.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, ma'am. Anyone else?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I'm available.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** That's fine.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** That's fine.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** We are all confirmed for the 16<sup>th</sup> workshop.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** It's on my calendar already.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Thank you, Madam Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

### **AWARDS AND PRESENTATIONS**

**10.**

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Item No. 10.

### **CITY CLERK ANTHONY: PRESENTATION BY DISTRICT 3, SUMMER INTERN FROM THE OFFICE OF CHAIRWOMAN TONYA DAVIS JOHNSON**

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, we do not have any public comment cards on this Item. The acceptance of public comment cards on this Item is now closed.

**MS. T. DENNARD:** Good evening.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Good evening.

**UNK.:** Good evening.

**MS. T. DENNARD:** This past summer, I was given the opportunity to come in...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Before you begin...

**MS. T. DENNARD:** ...and be an intern for District 3.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Ms. Dennard?

**MS. T. DENNARD:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Please state your name for the record...

**MS. T. DENNARD:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...and the school that you attend.

**MS. T. DENNARD:** I'm Tiana Dennard, and I go to Suncoast High School.

I was given the opportunity to come in and be an intern for District 3. I was able to attend many meetings, I watched people give presentations on ideas that they wanted for the City. We went on a tour of the District and I got to see a small part of how the City is run. I got to encounter many different pos'.., positions and people of different industries, and I feel like I've learned how to present myself in a more professional manner. I've learned skills that I'm using now, and that I can use once I go off to college and when I'm looking for future jobs. I've been introduced to a field that I wasn't entirely familiar with

before, but now I have a greater understanding of basic government. And that's kind of changed my direction for future..., my future.

So, I would just like to say thank you to, first, Ms. Pascale Reid for coming in every day and working with me, showing me the ropes and..., every time that there was an opportunity for me to engage in a new activity, she made sure I was there learning. I would like to say that you the Chairwoman for allowing an intern to come in and work in your office. And to everyone who made the Summer Youth Employment Program possible. I've been a part of it for the last years and I've learned many different job qualities that I can use in the future.

So, thank you.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** You're welcome.

**MS. T. DENNARD:** And I look...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** You're welcome.

**MS. T. DENNARD:** ...forward to coming back next year, hopefully.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Alright.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

[Applause]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** So, for the record, I wanted to have Ms. Dennard share with you because, as we did her departing lunch, she said to me that, as a result of her summer internship, she has changed the direction in which she intends to go and she wants to now be a business major with a focus in government. So that, for me, was a huge impact to the program and her participation, and I just wanted to be able to recognize her for the work that she did and her commitment to the program, as well as the City sponsoring an opportunity for the youth to get governmental experience and to work during the summer. So, thank you for allowing her to participate.

[Applause]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Commissioner Davis, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I'd just like to say, job well done with our youth. I'd like to say a special thank you to Councilperson Hubbard. This was the vision that she talked about when fighting for this Summer Youth Program. It's given our youth an opportunity to use their talents in their toolkits at a very young age, to give them a vision and exposure of things that a lot of us didn't have the opportunity to do, and I just wanna give her a special thank you for allowing..., fighting hard to get this program for Riviera Beach. We

still got ways for improvement, and keep doing that, but it's because of Councilperson Hubbard on that initiative that we need to definitely make sure that definitely go on notice, on her vision, of what was done years ago and bringing that type of sentiment back to this community. And giving our young folks the opportunity to lead now. It's a different generation, a different time. They don't need to wait to lead, they can be prepared to lead now with the proper support from our community.

Thank you, Councilperson Hubbard.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you. Kudos. And, and I echo those sentiments. Madam Clerk.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, before we move onto Item No. 12, I just wanna announce..., remind our residents that early voting is currently going on and we do have a location here in the City of Riviera Beach. It is at the recrea'..., Wells Recreation Complex. And the hours is from 10:00 a.m., I believe, to 6:00 p.m. For other locations, please visit the City's website at [rivierabch.com](http://rivierabch.com) and we have a link that goes directly to the Supervisors of Elections website, showing the various locations throughout Palm Beach County.

## **11. PRESENTATION BY CHAIRWOMAN TONYA DAVIS JOHNSON IN RECOGNITION OF BEACH LIFEGUARDS**

### **PUBLIC HEARINGS**

**12.**

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Item No. 12.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY: RESOLUTION NO. 83-18. A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH, PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA, APPROVING AN APPLICATION FROM THE PORT OF PALM BEACH DISTRICT FOR SITE PLAN APPROVAL (SP-18-16) TO DEVELOP A NEW CARGO STORAGE AREA WITHIN THE PORT OF PALM BEACH, WHICH WILL REPLACE THE FORMER MARITIME OFFICE BUILDING ON 3.0 ACRES OF INDUSTRIAL LAND AT 4 EAST PORT ROAD, IDENTIFIED BY PARCEL CONTROL NUMBER 56-43-42-33-19-001-0110, LOCATED EAST OF BROADWAY AND SOUTH OF EAST 11<sup>TH</sup> STREET, AND PROVIDING AN EFFECTIVE DATE.**

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, we do have public comment cards on this Item. The acceptance of public comment cards for this Item is now closed.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you. Is there a motion?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So moved.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Second.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It's been...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Second.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you. It's been motioned and properly second. Madam Manager.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair, we have Acting Director Jeff Gagnon here to make a presentation.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Good evening, Mr. Gagnon.

**ACTING DIRECTOR DEVELOPMENT SERVICES GAGNON:** Thank you, Madam Manager, Chair, Council.

You have before you, on the screen, we have an application from the Port of Palm Beach as read into the record, to...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**ACTING DIRECTOR DEVELOPMENT SERVICES GAGNON:** ...convert an existing area that has housed the Maritime office building for a good amount of time, which will be converted to a storage area for the Port. Before you, on the PowerPoint screen, we have an aerial view of the site. The site is completely located within the Port of Palm Beach. It has a Port Future Land Use and an industrial zoning designation. This is just a closer view of the same site. The Planning & Zoning Board reviewed this Item last week and unanimously recommended approval of the City Council. For the record, the Site Plan and other plans associated with the project are attached to the Resolution as Exhibit A. Before you is a Site Plan. Please note the north arrow is point to the right side of the screen, so the right side of this plan is north. There are no new buildings proposed with this development. Again, it'll be a, a storage area. However, the Sit Plan is required being that the use is being modified.

I provided a copy of the Striping Plan because I think it provides a better overview of the proposed use. The boxes that are shown here, are storage locations proposed by the court. You can see there are ingress and egress lanes, some drive aisles that are proposed and the arrows indicating direction of traffic. Additionally, there is additional parking that is provided on the northside of the site as well, to facilitate parking as required by the Port and/or future tenants.

So, City Staff I is recommending approval of this Site Plan application with the following conditions. We recommend approval so long as constructions improvements are initiated within eighteen months of the effective date of this Resolution. Condition two is that future amendments to the Site Plan may be approved administratively, so long as the Site Plan does not deviate greater than 5% from the originally approved Site Plan. Condition three is that this development must receive a final..., certificate of occupancy or

certificate of completion from the City for all approved Sit Plan elements within five years of approval. And condition four is, once approved, the Resolution shall supersede any previous Site Plan approval Resolutions associated with the property.

We also have here tonight, representatives from the Port. We have Commissioner McArthur is present, as well the Port Executive Director, Mr. Almira, as well as Jim Moore, the agent for the Staff, Mr. Smith and also, Mr. Soler is present as well.

I'm here to answer any questions and perhaps the Port Agent or Port Staff would like to make a few comments at this time.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I welcome Port Staff at this time, if there are any comments.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Chuckle].

**PORT OF PALM BEACH VICE CHAIR MCARTHUR:** We'd like to thank you for bringing this Item forward, Madam Chair, Madam Pro Tem, Council Members. We're here to answer any questions you may have.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay.

**PORT OF PALM BEACH VICE CHAIR MCARTHUR:** [Inaudible].

**PORT OF PALM BEACH EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR ALMIRA:** Sure. Thank you. Thank you, Council. I would like to just make a, a statement here.

What you're seeing is an addition'..., capacity for refrigerated containers. That's what we're looking at. These are the type of containers that carry food and Tropical Shipping, or others, may be able to store the container there, plug it into the electric current and then be ready to ship out when the ship comes in. It is done in..., strategically, actually, because, as we all know, in the Caribbean, there's less and less available land for cult'..., cultivating food. That food requirement is gonna be coming directly from here, from the United States. In other words, those individual hotels and resorts that are coming into South Florida to purchase the type of foods, so we wanna be prepared for the additional demand on this type of product. Therefore, we [stammer], with the use of C.H. Mill we came up with this plan and we certainly appreciate you looking at it, reviewing it and, hopefully, we can all get it passed.

So, thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**MR. J. MOORE:** Jim Moore with C.H, Mill.

One other aspect of this project I'll just add quickly is, we are also doing some hurricane hardening. There are existing overhead powerlines and tele'..., [stammer] telecommunication lines which are going to be underground as part of this project. So,



ser'..., services to the north of the Port, at least in this area, will not be affected by future storm events, hopefully, as part of these improvements that we're doing with this parcel.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you. If you don't mind just have a seat there in case there's some questions after public comment. Thank you, gentlemen.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Fane Lozman, Mary Brabham.

**MR. F. LOZMAN:** Fane Lozman, Singer Island.

The first thing that comes to mind is, on this type of modification, where's your three dimensional model? This went on in Dade County, you had to produce a three dimensional model to show how this is going to look relative to other structures around the facility, number one. Number two is, I told Ms. Hoskins at the prior meeting, why is Ga'..., Gagnon making this presentation? He's an Interim Director. Why haven't you appointed a permanent director, somebody who knows what he's talking about. Okay? We've already talked about his behavior when it came to the mangroves on Singer Island and other things, he should not be making this important of a presentation. Number three, obviously, with all these new containers, there's gonna be an awful lot more wear and tear on the roads that belong to Riviera Beach. Has anybody come back to say how they're gonna compensation Riviera Beach for the impact that 10,000, 100,000, or a 1,000,000 more containers are gonna be rolling out of this place that maybe weren't there before because of that office building? Where is the impact on the wear and tear to our infrastructure outside of the Port property? Other communities, when you have an impact on the, on..., especially, Ms. Hubbard, she's always concerned about the impact developments, new development, will have on the existing infrastructure. Has anybody come forward to say, 'Where are the numbers? How many containers come today? How many containers are gonna come a, a month from now? How many containers are gonna come ten years from now?' Who's gonna pay to maintain the infrastructure on the wear and tear from this facility? It's premature to see this. I wanna see a three dimensional model, I wanna see a study to see how this is gonna impact the road, how it's gonna impact the additional tariff.

You know, one of my attorneys at the U.S. Supreme Court, represented the developer of the Port tunnel in Miami. The Port tunnel goes from MacArthur Causeway to the Port of Miami. It was over a one billion dollar project. Okay? Why did they put that one billion dollar tunnel in there? You should go take a, take a drive through that tunnel and see what's going on. They spent over a billion dollars because, as that Port grew, there was so much traffic it created a problem for the, for the regular transition of trucks and cars going through downtown Miami. So, that's why they dug that tunnel. Okay? That was the impact as the Port of Miami grew. Sounds like, from the presentation they gave, the Caribbean food situation, that's gonna continue to grow. I wanna know what the impact is gonna be. As Singer Island's largest landowner, I wanna know how many of my tax dollars, and my fellow neighbors, are gonna go to pay for infrastructure improvements from this pretty significant expansion of what's going on in the Port.

So, I think, you know, Gagnon just tries to slide stuff through. You think..., you're not very sophisticated but, but if I was sitting up there, I'd wanna see a 3D model, I'd wanna know how much more road traffic is coming up there, I wanna know what the setback is to Broadway. There's lots of questions I wanna know, but I can't because I'm looking at some goofy little picture up there, instead of a three dimensional model.

Thank you.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Mary Brabham.

**MS. M. BRABHAM:** Good evening, Chair and Board. Mary Brabham, Riviera Beach.

Apparently, we know that the Port sits in the City of Riviera Beach. [Inaudible]. Anyone that knows, out in California, that port was right there. The port served the hub of that, that community, they tapped into the port's financial gains in order to help their communities. And this was how those peoples there served their community with the hub of their port, located in their city. We know, back there in the day, this little piece of strip of land here, that we said that we want a passageway to come out. The previous Board, that sat up there, the previous Board there, the agreement was, okay, for us to have a road. It's not going to happen. We know it's not gonna happen. The Port is..., they bring in that revenue, not millions but trillions of dollars. We, as a City, should tap into some of that what the Port has, in order to help us build our cities, build our communities. It, it all depends on the meeting of the minds. You have to work with the major companies and businesses that are in our City in order to produce and get the things that we, our City, needs, with their valuable service that they also provide. We know that they are located right there. Where else are you gonna have 'em at? We do not want them to leave outta here, we don't want them to leave. I know that they're not gonna leave, but we also can get them to help us to do the things that we need to do within our communities. And not just our communities, but you, as an elected official... See, this, this, this thing here is a little bit deeper, but those cargos there, the Port needs that space there. You're not gonna get the road. You're not gonna get the road. I've been at FDOT meetings here, where they were saying that they were gonna have an overpass. We said no, FDOT is not gonna do that. So, we have that strip of land there, that's over there, and by the Port bringing in all of this revenue and stuff, we should be able to work with the Port and tap into that to..., so that they can help us do the things that we, that we need to have done in this City here.

So, I say too, now, if you're gonna run that road in there, you tell us. Fane Lozman made, made mention about the wear and the tear on our roads. We know we..., all of our roads, all over this City here. So...

[Timer]

**MS. M. BRABHAM:** ...we just can't pull out one road and do not distinguish between all of the other roads. You can work with the Port, so that there..., so, if our roads become hazardous, that need some improvement, work with them, so that FDOT..., if they're working through FDOT, and any other entity, then this is what you all will have to do.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you...

**MS. M. BRABHAM:** Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...Mrs. Brabham.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, that concludes public comments on this Item.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Any questions from Council?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Botel, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Thank you. I wonder.., I want to say thank you, Ms. Brabham, for her comments and to let her know that we are gonna be working, going forward, with the Port. We have begun to have joint meetings with the leadership in the Port of Palm Beach and we will continue to do that.

And my question for the Chair was,, Madam Chair, when is our next joint meeting with the Port of Palm Beach?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I'm sorry. You'll, you'll have to restate your question. Couldn't hear.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** I'm sorry. I said, when is our next meeting with the Port of Palm Beach?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** A joint meeting of the Boa'..., of... We have not scheduled. We need to...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...schedule, so we will check calendars to...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...schedule the next meeting.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** 'Cause I wanna be sure that we do exactly what Ms. Brabham mentioned, and that is to make sure that we are [breaking up] the benefit of the Port being in our City, for the [breaking up] Riviera Beach and I'm sure Mr. Almira and the administration of the Port will agree that we [breaking up] there, and we also want to be sure that the benefits accrue to the citizens of, of Riviera Beach.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you. Are there any other questions or comments?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes, Madam Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Chair Pro Tem, you're recognized.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Can Mr. Gagnon tell us what [ringtone notification] the potential impact would be... Oh, there he is... If any on the, the roads.., what you projected, I would say, over a three to five year time?

**ACTING DIRECTOR DEVELOPMENT SERVICES GAGNON:** So, I, I spoke with the Executive Director of the Port and he indicated that a majority of the shipping containers for this site, and [ringtone notification] the majority of the shipping containers for the Port, most likely, actually use train, or [stammer], they come in by rail.

Additionally, as far as roadway impacts, the state has made a large commitment to really increase the size of Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard, as far as the major Port arterial roadway, so that, I think, is a, a large indication of the, the state's stance [ringtone notification] as far as the importance of the Port in order to provide adequate roadways to allow trucks to come and go as needed.

[Ringtone notification]

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Okay. The, the majority of 'em, I understand, you said are going to come in by rail, and because of the expansion of MLK, that... But once that's in there and the wear and tear and the upkeep of it is what I think that the.., our residents were speaking of. The wear and tear on, on the road, road itself.

**ACTING DIRECTOR DEVELOPMENT SERVICES GAGNON:** So, I'll bring up, just as a point of reference, the, the size and scope of this, this three acre...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Mhmm.

**ACTING DIRECTOR DEVELOPMENT SERVICES GAGNON:** ...portion of the Port, it's almost.., I don't wanna say dominions in nature, but the impact of modifying this location for shipping containers, as far as trips, you have to think that any trips for passenger vehicles that were associated with that office building, [ringtone notification] that was a multistory office building, will be taken off the...

LH: [Inaudible].

**ACTING DIRECTOR DEVELOPMENT SERVICES GAGNON:** ...road because that building will be demolished. So, I think that.., you know, there really won't be a net gain of traffic or trips generated to the Port. And again, most of those shipping containers would come in by rail.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Okay. And I guess this is back to where.., which is, which is.., which I understand what you.., what you're saying and by us not having the access anymore or the, or the, the additional road, because we definitely can't count MLK, but we are not gonna have that additional street that we talked about at the foot of the bridge. We won't mention that, but the.., now we will have more and more, more traffic on the road, so that is a real concern and I don't want to minimize the concerns of, of the

residents because we tal'.., the reason that we're building it is because of the overwhelming amount of cargo that we will be able to export. So, that's.., so, it is something to be said for it, and I guess in our conversations with them, we need to know how, you know, what.., how we're gonna manage.., how we're gonna, you know, what, what's the compensation for it as well. And, I use that word lightly.

**ACTING DIRECTOR DEVELOPMENT SERVICES GAGNON:** Yeah. Well, there, there will be building permit fees associated with the building permits associated with it, so there will be...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yeah. I, I understand that part of it. Again, I'm just talking about the same thing the residents were referring to, the wear and tear and on the comm'.., community, the trips and things of that nature.

So, those are a viable discussion that I think that when we have the workshop, we need not overlook.

**ACTING DIRECTOR DEVELOPMENT SERVICES GAGNON:** I understand.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Are there any further...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...comments or questions? Madam Clerk.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Botel?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Hubbard?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Davis Johnson?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Unanimous vote.

**ORDINANCES ON SECOND AND FINAL READING**

**13. ITEM NO. 13**

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Item No. 13.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** ORDINANCE NO. 4115. AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH, PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA ENACTING A MORATORIUM FOR UP TO SIX MONTHS AS TO FILING, RECEIVING AND PROCESSING OF ANY APPLICATION FOR PORT PERMIT FOR THE ESTABLISHMENT, DEVELOPMENT OR OPERATION OF A FILLING STATION (AKA GAS STATION) AS DEFINED HEREIN IN ORDER TO REVIEW EXISTING LAND DEVELOPMENT REGULATIONS ASSOCIATED WITH THIS USE, INCLUDING BUT NOT LIMITED TO SEPARATION REQUIREMENTS BETWEEN FILLING STATIONS, PROVIDING FOR THE BOUNDARIES SUBJECT TO THE MORATORIUM, PROVIDING FOR CONFLICTS AND SEVERABILITY, AND PROVIDING AN EFFECTIVE DATE.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So moved.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, we do have public comment cards on this Item. The acceptance of public comment cards for this Item is now closed.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So moved.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Is there a motion?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Second.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** So...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So moved.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...moved.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It's been motioned and properly second. Madam Manager.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair, Interim Director.., I'm sorry, Acting Director Jeff Gagnon is here to give a presentation.

**ACTING DIRECTOR DEVELOPMENT SERVICES GAGNON:** Thank you, Madam Manager.

This is a second reading of an Ordinance that requested by City Council. If you can recall, a few meetings back, City Council approved an Ordinance, I believe it was Ordinance No. 4111? And that enacted a 1,000 foot separation requirement between

gas stations, that are still referred to as filling stations in our Code of Ordinances. During that discussion and during that approval, City Council desired a moratorium to allow Staff to further research what other separation requirements could be supported. So, this moratorium will do exactly that. It's for a period of up to six months. We're anticipating it taking less time than that, and we anticipate bringing back any new information.., the results from our research to City Council at an upcoming meeting, and make a decision on whether or not we can substantiate increasing the 1,000 foot buffer to, perhaps, a 2,000 foot buffer.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Clerk, comments, please.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Fane Lozman, Mary Brabham.

**MR. F. LOZMAN:** Fane Lozman.

Maybe I haven't made my prior point clear, but why do we still have him as Interim Director? How long is that gonna go for? The next five years? Where's the permanent replacement for this man because, just the comment he did to Ms. Hubbard was ludicrous. The weight of a vehicle versus the weight of a tractor trailer, a tractor trailer weighs 60,000 pounds, a car weighs 4,000. If you got a hundred trips by a car versus a hundred trips by a tractor trailer, that's the equivalent of thirty times as much damage to a road. And you just try to b.s. this Council? And we're supposed to believe anything you say? My God. Anybody in this audience would say one trip with a little car, is not the same as a tractor trailer full of tens of thousands of pounds of cargo. You know, you're insulting the people up there, you're insulting the audience. And it's not a joke. We got DEP looking into this guy for what he's done with some mangroves. So, you think you're the smartest guy, you're not as smart as you think you are.

What is gonna be the impact on this regarding, when you look at the gas station, regarding people that purchase that property and it was zoned for a gas station? Okay. And now you're gonna downzone that possibly and take it away from 'em after that six month moratorium is out. So, say the guy built a lot.., he bought a lot that was zoned for gas station, a hundred feet away from another gas station, and now you're gonna say, 'Well, the rule should be.., maybe it should be five hundred feet away. What cau'.., what's the cause of action that that ha'.., that that may have? Has from anybody from Legal said, 'You know, that guy may be [inaudible], and he may sue us for millions of dollars,' you know, what about that? What are the implications if you go forward and you pass a moratorium on, on the distance from one station to another?

But why don't we get somebody that knows what he's talking about. And I'm.., I'm serious. This guy does not know what he's talking about. And we can actually have a workshop with all the misconduct he's engaged on in Singer Island, relative to me, relative to Dan Taylor, [stammer], relative to black residents that wanna go to the beach. There's lots this man should be investigated and talked about, but yet, every time I keep coming here, he's still Interim Director and that is not going to cut it. That's malfeasance on all of you, that you don't demand Ms. Hoskins get a permanent replacement for this man.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Mary Brabham.

**MS. M. BRABHAM:** Ms. Mary Brabham, Riviera Beach.

Apparently, myself and Lloyd Brown, we were coming to the Planning & Zoning Board, talking about the gas stations, and all the stores that impact we the people, that lives over on this side, from every corner of a six or eight mile stretch of City territory. We say that we have had enough of gas stores. You have too many of 'em here now. This is where a lot of the havoc comes from also within our City. Staying open 2:00 o'clock and all, all time of the hour. If we can put the things that are in place to make our City better, our aesthetic appearance of our City better, to keep our City the best place to live, work and play, because that slogan there, we have a lotta cleaning up to do. And this is a starting point to what we can do and what we should do. We have enough of these gas stations here. Too many of them. And it's time for, as leaders, for you to step out of your comfort zone and put the things in place and do the things that this City needs in order for us to move forward with progress, and not degress. Because these stores, they do causes a lot of the problems within our City. And not saying that we don't welcome their business, but when we've had enough, we've had enough. It is a deterrent to coming in, as well as going out within our City. You have a lot of outside traffic that comes in to patronize these gas stores. You should be able to do, do business by 12:00 o'clock at night. You should be able to do business. Other cities does not have this carryin' on, carryin' on. So, it's time, as leaders, you all put the things in place that needs to be put in place. And if this moratorium is gonna serve that purpose there, and do some rezoning..., Jeff, I know Fane is always going after you, but you put some teeth and nails where you need to put the teeth and nails. Because we, as a City, we are also holding everyone responsible because it's time for we...

[Timer]

**MS. M. BRABHAM:** ...as a City, to move out of this zone.

Thank you.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, that concludes public comments on this Item.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Are there any comments from...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...Council? Councilwoman Botel, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Thank you. I have a question for the City Manager. [Inaudible]... I wonder..., I'm sorry. [Stammer] it's hard for me to..., I can't hear myself, so let me know if you're able to hear me.

We had a brief conversation about the possibility of enforcing some kind of a time constraint on these convenient stores that Mr. Brown has repeatedly cautioned us about.



Were you able to do anything about that, to look into the possibility of imposing some kind of a closing hour on them, say 11:00 o'clock or, or 12:00 o'clock so that we could be'.., begin to take action on the [breaking up] Mr. Brown is recommending.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam City Manager.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** I believe Councilwoman Botel is talking about enforcing the time limit on the...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** ...gas stations?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Well, on the convenient stores.

[Inaudible dais comments]

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Mr. Gagnon, please.

**ACTING DIRECTOR DEVELOPMENT SERVICES GAGNON:** Thank you...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Before you begin...

**ACTING DIRECTOR DEVELOPMENT SERVICES GAGNON:** ...Madam Manager.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...let the record reflect that the Mayor's on the dais. Please proceed, Mr. Gagnon.

**ACTING DIRECTOR DEVELOPMENT SERVICES GAGNON:** If, if I heard correctly, I think he question and comment pertain to hours of operation pertaining to businesses, convenient stores, gas stations.

**COUNCILWOMAN BOTEL:** Yes.

**ACTING DIRECTOR DEVELOPMENT SERVICES GAGNON:** That's something that.., it's a.., separate and apart from this Item. It's something we can look at.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes. I know. But, that's.., we're on the topic.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** We will, we will have to take a look at the, at the Code and what the information says so that we can move forward, because I too am looking to find out how these stores got the hours of operation that they now have, and what we can do as a City to make tho'.., those adjustments. So, we'll have Staff prepare that information and distribute it to the Board so that we can take that matter up at a future meeting.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Great. I hope we can do that quickly.

Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you. Are there any other comments from Council? Madam Clerk.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes, ma'am.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Botel?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Hubbard?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Davis Johnson?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Unanimous vote.

### **ITEMS TABLED**

### **REGULAR AGENDA**

14.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Item No. 14.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** RESOLUTION 84-18. A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH, PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA AMENDING THE JOB CLASSIFICATION LIST ADDING AND RECLASSIFYING CERTAIN CLASSIFIED POSITIONS AND PROVIDING AN EFFECTIVE DATE.

**HUMAN RESOURCE DIRECTOR EUREKA IRVIN (561) 840-4880**

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, we do have public comment cards on this Item. The acceptance of public comment cards for this Item is now closed.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Is there a motion?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** So moved.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Second.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It's been moved and properly second. Madam Manager

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair, this is as a result of the SEIU union negotiations. From what I understand, this Item was brought up over a year ago where the..., there was a determination that the classifications needed to be split, based on the JAQ's that were completed by the persons in those positions. So, this is just to correct those issues.

If you have any further questions, I can ask Ms. Eureka Irvin to come up and answer them.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Are there any questions from Council?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes, Madam Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Chair Pro Tem, you're recognized.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Can you explain a little further in changing..., in clarifying the, the classifications?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Ms. Irvin.

**HUMAN RESOURCES DIRECTOR IRVIN:** Eureka Irvin, Human Resources Department.

The classification of Police Technician. There were several different positions or, or class within the one class. And also, in the..., when we were conducting the, the salary study, that was something that the consultant noted, ;that he various persons within that classifications, were doing various different job..., had different jobs, duties and responsibilities.

So..., and then, it was also mentioned in our prior negotiations with SEIU that that classification would be something that we looked at. So, within the classification of Police Technician, we had evidence, we had records, crime scene, as well as traffic, traffic within that. And also, I think there was another Asset Management. And so, that would..., and, and, as I said before, the consultant also recommended that those positions be separated and, and, and properly titled.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Thank you, ma'am.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Are there any other questions?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** No.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Jennifer Lagomasino.

**MS. J. LAGOMASINO:** Good evening...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Good evening.

**MS. J. LAGOMASINO:** ...City Manager, Council, Chairwoman, Mayor.

You've heard from me multiple times over the past year on behalf of the workers in the City, and I am thrilled tonight to see an agreement on that contract. And to be honest with you, I'm going home to celebrate. [Chuckle].

But before I do that, I need to speak on behalf of Police Technicians and specifically, the crime scene unit. The Agenda Item before you, as we talked about [stammer] proposes reclassification of Police Technician. The four jobs that are underneath that category, are vastly different jobs. They are Asset Management, who's the individual who controls and distributes all the supplies for the Police Department. The Evidence Technicians, in that Department, they're community service aides, which are the ones that help the traffic control and nonpriority calls, and then your crime scene investigators. The Police Technician general job summary is a.., jumbled, like Frankenstein, of four different job summaries. And it has four different essential duties and responsibilities. And I do have that job description here if, if it pleases the Council, if you would like to see that. Yet, we all make sixteen sixty dollar'.. \$16.60 an hour. Every employee in the Police Technician classification works hard and deserves a significant raise, but it is your crime scene unit alone that is required to have a college degree. It's your crime scene unit that has been entrusted by this City to document, collect, preserve and to testify to the physical evidence that makes all the difference in the world, when the people of this community are seeking justice.

I could tell you about the sacrifice, the dedication, the physical and emotional toll paid by the members of your crime scene unit, and their families, because of our loyalty, but I cannot do that in three minutes. I've been a member of this crime scene unit for almost four and a half years and I've seen four investigators leave in that time. Two of those investigators, I helped train and they have left to go to other agencies and make higher salaries. This year, I helped train three new investigators, which are in this room, soon to be four, who is also possibly in this room if she makes it through the hiring process. [Sigh]. This, two weeks ago, West Palm Beach posted a job opening for a crime scene investigator coming directly out of school for \$22 an hour. We make \$16.60. We need your help to recruit and to, most importantly, retain the valuable members of our unit. A unit where more of half of us currently live with family members and student loans. We do love our job and we do love the City that we do it for, but we have been drastically underpaid for far too long, and we still show up every day and every callout with a smile on our face, despite it. I witnessed the City produce a miracle here, and.., with the contract, and I'm hoping that you have one more miracle left in you. This contract, all General Employees received a 12%, across the board, pay increase. Even the people at the top of their pay scale. I am asking that you not only vote to approve the Police Technician reclassification, but I am also asking that the proposed reclassification, if.., when that proposed reclassification places us on a new pay scale, that the 12%, the rest of the City...

[Timer]

**MS. J. LAGOMASINO:** ...is receiving, be added to our new rate of pay. Your technicians should not be penalized for having been underpaid and still loyal all these years.

I wanna thank you very much, 'cause even having this heard at this level is more than you can possibly.., it means so much to us. So, thank you very much.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** You're welcome.

[Applause]

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair that concludes public comments on this Item.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilman Davis, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Thank you.

**UNK:** Thank you.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Say thank you to the young lady, and all, all those who work for the City of Riviera Beach for being patient, and working with this leadership, and with our current City Manager. There's been a lotta committed time and efforts, after hours, before hours, and during hours to make this day successful.

The speech that was stated about, you know, getting more money, that's why it's so important that we get more development in the City. We need more tax revenue coming in because, as costs go up, we need more money coming in. You know?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** And that's why it's so important that we push and focus on having great response with the development coming through the City, having a permitting process that is very clean, like we do have. We have developers paying the cost that they're supposed to pay. With development coming, there's a tax revenue coming in. New development makes these miracles come true, that we're talking about. And it's very important, when we have these developments come before the City, we have the same support for those developments because that's what's gonna help fund, you know, you know, these budgets from here.., from now on, because we wanna keep you in the City. You know, I do believe that we've always had the best benefits in Palm Beach County. And, and I know it was very funny how the 12% was voted upon, unani'..., at a great number, and all of a sudden you saw Palm Beach Gardens tell their story on TV about 12%, but Riviera Beach already had voted upon it prior to that taking.

So, you know, we've always been setting the tone about Palm Beach County, whether we get the true story out or not. We always find a way to be creative and making sure that we do what we need to do.

But, thank you all for being patient with us and working with us.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Any other questions or comments from the Board? [Pause]. Madam, Madam Manager, are there.., these job classifications are not a part of the union?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Yes, they are.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** So, she's asking.., the request was to provide them with the 12% that the, that the...

[Inaudible comment]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Did I unders'.., did I understand her correctly?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** The 12%.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** And, Ms. Irvin, if you would come up. We are changing the classification, so if, if, if those employees, and I believe, if I'm explaining this correctly, if their current pay is above the.., or, below the minimum, then they'll be, they'll be brought up to the minimum salary.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** And do we know what that looks like for each of those that are being broken out at this time?

**HUMAN RESOURCES DIRECTOR IRVIN:** I wouldn't.., I don't have the calculations of the individuals salaries right at my fingertips, but I.., just give me a few minutes and I can pull it up and provide that for you.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** But, as it relates to what she was asking, we did not increase the, the job classification list by the 12%.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** We did not?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** No.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** No. That's...

**HUMAN RESOURCES DIRECTOR IRVIN:** That's correct.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** That's correct.

**HUMAN RESOURCES DIRECTOR IRVIN:** We did not adjust the minimum and max of the pay grades.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** And then, what is our normal process when we reclass a position?

**HUMAN RESOURCES DIRECTOR IRVIN:** Well, the individual that is in the position, if their salary is the low, the, the minimum of the, of the grade, that employee is brought to at least the minimum of that classification. If that employee is currently making more than the minimum, that employees receiving, at the very least, a 5% increase.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you. Are there any other questions or comments from Council? Nothing. Madam Clerk.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes, ma'am.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Botel?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Hubbard?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Davis Johnson?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Unanimous vote.

[Inaudible dais comments]

**COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC - 7:30 PM Non-Agenda Item Speakers (Three Minute Limitation)**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** PUBLIC COMMENT SHALL BE RESTRICTED TO ISSUES, MATTERS OR TOPICS PERTINENT TO THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH. PLEASE BE REMINDED THAT THE CITY COUNCIL HAS ADOPTED RULES OF DECORUM GOVERNING PUBLIC CONDUCT DURING OFFICIAL MEETINGS, WHICH HAS BEEN POSTED AT THE ENTRANCE OF THE COUNCIL CHAMBERS. IN AN EFFORT TO PRESERVE ORDER, IF ANY OF THE RULES ARE NOT ADHERED TO,

**THE CHAIRPERSON MAY HAVE ANY DISRUPTIVE SPEAKER OR ATTENDEE REMOVED FROM THE PODIUM, FROM THE MEETING AND/OR THE BUILDING, IF NECESSARY. PLEASE GOVERN YOURSELVES ACCORDINGLY.**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Clerk.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, the acceptance of public comment cards for this particular section of the Agenda is now closed. Deborah MCCOLLUN, Lloyd Brown, Steve White.

[Pause].

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Deborah MCCOLLUN? [Pause]. Lloyd Brown.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Come forward, Mr. Brown.

**MR. L. BROWN:** My name is Lloyd Brown. I'm gonna kinda give ya'll a break. I'm gonna talk about somebody who's a little bit more politics. You know, I had a dream, you know, I had a dream I was walking down the street, but then I noticed this bus, right? Little yellow bus. We used to call 'em the buses that, you know, the kinda slow kids rode on. But, looking into the windows, to my surprise, it was full of black politicians. You know, I knew a few of 'em. I mean, there was Bobby, Bobby Powell, I guess that's his name, Bernard Mac, Priscilla Taylor, and that green lady, you know? I also noticed that Alcee Hastings was sitting up there behind the driver's seat, you know, and I'm wondering who's driving the bus? And what happened, right? Then this thing tapped me on the shoulder, it was the driver. You know who it was? It was Jim Crowe. You know, you remember those Jim Crowe laws? I said, well, you know, I mean, he's driving these people around. And I'm saying, 'What they riding with this Jim Crowe?' You know, he came out of the..., he was hiding in the neighborhood for a little while and now he's out and obviously it's, like, you know how you got a semi-pro? Now what's going on now is semi-Jim Crowe, because, you know, the I'.., I, I consider that law of loitering, that's like, you know, people, black people, white people, back in the days we used to hang around these stores because there was a law in the Constitution said you had the right to assemble. So, when they rode through the neighborhood and they said we gotta stop this 'cause too many people are startin' to learn about different things, so they brought this loitering law in. And you know, there's a place in Germany, I don't know what's it's called, Nuremburg or Hitler, he, he had all these Jews, you know, he said, well, because they're Jewish, we're not gonna let them vote, they can't have businesses.

But what I'm really trying to say is the Jim Crowe law, I mean, its semi..., it's coming back, and these politicians..., not ya'll, because ya'll not close enough, you know, to make any decisions like Alcee Hastings. All these years, you've been in there and then say..., I know people like me, I've been a felon for thirty years and in thirty years, there's been people who come in and they're sworn in as Americans, right? Okay. These people are..., you all got the mic off or something? These...



[Inaudible comment]

**MR. L. BROWN:** ...people have been sworn in, you know, and so, like, for thirty years that I haven't been able to vote, these people from these different countries, they've been voting situation just gonna benefit them, while all my black felon'.., these people on there, we haven't had the right to vote. There were three civil rights workers that died for the voting right. If you take anything away, don't take the voting right because that's my opportunity to put someone in there who can change my situation. So, for thirty years not being able to vote, I'm just left out. And it's not ya'll that I'm blaming. I mean, whatever happens over here, you're gonna be held responsible for that, but I think people like Alcee Hastings and these...

[Timer]

**MR. L. BROWN:** ...Priscilla Taylor's and these Booby Brook'.., Bobby whatever, those are the people that should be dealing with that. I'm not blaming ya'll for any of that situation. But, I feel that an individual should have the right to vote so that he can change the situation 'cause you can't change it, you may as well get back on the plantation.

**MR. S. WHITE:** Steve White.

I came here tonight to really pay respects to someone who deserves to be acknowledged. You know, a few years ago, I had an opportunity to work on a project and I sat down with Mr. Herman McCray and Don Wilson and Robby Littles, and a lot of the people who were involved in a movement that took place back in the '60's and '70's and that movement really led to this City having its first black elected Councilperson, its first black Police Chief, its first black City Clerk, first black City Manager. And, as I was talking to these men, one of the names that came up, one of the unsung heroes of that movement, was Ms. Norma Duncombe. And, a lot of people don't realize the role that she played in bringing about positive change in this community.

Also, in 1970, when we were bused, those of us wo lived on the southside of Riviera Beach, we were bused into the old North Shore High School and we had to integrate that school but it was a very turbulent time for us. There was a lot of chaos, we were really going into a very hostile situation, and if it had not been for the support system we had, those of us coming out of Riviera Beach, we really would not have made it. And there was a young teacher there at that time who really showed us unconditional love, support and encouragement, and that young teacher was Ms. Duncombe as well. Now, she didn't know I was gonna do this tonight, but I felt compelled to do this.

And also, some of you may have seen an article in the newspaper fairly recently about the 1957 Roosevelt High School. Over a forty year period, they raised over \$1,000,000, giving out over 1,000 scholarships, and one of the people who was very involved in that project as well, as quiet as it is kept, was Ms. Norma Duncombe. So, I think young people, particularly in this City, should know that when Ms. Duncombe comes to the microphone, she's bringing with her over fifty years of unwavering commitment and service to this community.

So, I just think that we need to acknowledge people like her, and, and let people know that she really has made a positive difference, so she's not just coming here talking, she's really walked the walk, like I said, for over fifty years. And so, Ms. Duncombe, I want to personally thank you for all that you've done.

Thank you very, very much.

[Applause]

**MS. D. HALL-MCCOLLUN:** Good evening, Mayor, City Council Members and City Manager. My name is Deborah Hall-MCCOLLUN and I put in a public comment card. I'm a Riviera Beach resident and longtime Riviera Beach employee.

And I wanted to bring to the public attendance'..., because I've already brought it to your attendance, some issues that are going on at Phil Foster Park, whereas the park is [stammer] discriminating against Riviera Beach residents, and residents from other local municipalities, with two words that contain seven letters. This is it. Lot Full. When you go down to Phil Foster Park sometimes, they have this sign at the entrance and they have the entrance blocked off. The entrance is blocked off a lotta times because it's high tide at Phil Foster Park. During high tide at Phil Foster Park, they allow the dive schools to come in and conduct classes. Now, if you are a diver or if you own a boat and come in with a boat trailer, you are allowed to enter the park. But, if you're me or you and if they don't know you, you will not be allowed in. On Saturday, my husband put together a picnic that he does every year for a back to school for the kids in our neighborhood. He got to the park at 5:00 o'clock in the morning to secure a picnic table. I got there at about 9:45. When I arrived, the entrance was already blocked, they had the sign out, they had the sheriff there, they had the park ranger. 'Lot full, you can't come in.' So, I said, 'But sir, I got, I got for a picnic, can I just come in and drop it off and leave?' And he's like, 'No. You gotta wait, wait until we open.' So I said, 'Well, I live here and I'm a City employee,' and it just so happens I had my employee badge in my purse, that I usually remove when I leave work on Friday. I showed him my badge, he said, 'Well, okay. You can come in, you can unload, and then you have to leave.' When I went in, unloaded, I went to the westside of the park, which I call the back, which is where the pavilions are. Parking lot completely empty. There was only two cars back there, but yet, they had the front entrance blocked. So, I have written letters to our City Council Members, and I thank everyone who responded. I know that everyone has different issues that we're dealing with in the City, far as City Councilpersons. I wanna thank Commissioner Mack Bernard for calling Senator Robert Powell and they said that they are working on it, they're scheduling meetings with our County Administrator. But something has to be done. People are being turned away, people are not being allowed into the park and I believe that we need to take immediate action because...

[Timer]

**MS. D. HALL-MCCOLLUN:**...denying us entrance into a public place, is a violation of our civil rights.

Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Thank you.

[Applause]

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Willis Williams, Fane Lozman, Mary Brabham.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair, while he's coming, I was denied access to the park as well.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair that has happened to me as well, before. About a year or so ago.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** This has to stop.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So, I, I understand what she's saying.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** We are..., we have..., we all have experiences and so, it's going to be important that we participate in a joint meeting with the Board of County Commissioners with the County Administrator. Commissioner Bernard is the District 7 Representative, however, if you all will remember, some years ago...

**UNK:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...Phil Foster Park was taken out of District 7 and placed in District 1. So, we need to be aware that the conversation that we also need to be having is with Commissioner Hal Valeche, who is the District 1 Representative.

Mr. Williams.

**MR. W. WILLIAMS:** Thank you. Good evening. Willis Williams, Riviera Beach.

First, let me thank this Board sitting at the CRA side for the request that I requested on last week at the CRA side. We did..., we were able to secure the date that we needed and we were able to go into inspection tomorrow. The other thing though is that, after speaking to Mr. Gagnon, Jeff Gagnon, in regards to this Ordinance that was written, rewritten for the food trucks that are coming into our City at this time. The intent of this Ordinance was to be onsite at a permanent location. That did not get in the Ordinance, and I'm requesting that..., Mr. Gagnon said that it had to be an initiative from the Council, so I'm asking you to give Mr. Gagnon the, the indication that we need to get this part of the Ordinance straightened out.

The second thing is, Madam Chair, ow, do..., can we speak on the Stonybrook situation at this time, or is that something that, that we need to speak on at, at that [inaudible]?

**UNK:** We can.

**MR. W. WILLIAMS:** We can speak on that now? I'm really..., I don't see anything..., I just see an update in the, in the Agenda, say, just an update. That, that, that kinda bothered me because the last time I spoke here about the Stonybrook situation, and it has gotten worse since then. So, I just..., I mean, an update just is not what we need. We need to do some'..., something seriously need to happen. And one of my classmates that's sitting in the audience now, had to be taken out of there and gone to the hospital and spent several days in the hospital. So, some serious stuff is going on. I just..., we need to take immediate action out there right away.

The other thing is, I'd like the employees of the civi'..., of the City of Riviera Beach to know that their..., the Civil Service Board is now in effect, that they have another out other than the union. The Civil Service Board has met. We are meeting, and if you have any problems or situation that you want our Board to hear, please give us a, a..., let us know.

The other thing also, is Mrs. Botel pulled an Item, or add on an Item or, or..., to the Attorney Bedford or, or Bernard or whatever is, I wanna find out how that's going because I understand that, that there's some issues there. So, we need to really take more responsibility on the issue where the attorneys are making numerous of dollars on this City and not taking this City at heart. And I know Mrs. Miller has requested that some things be done in, in the very near future, but we need to keep our eyes on that.

Thank you.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Thank you.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** We wanna get that on the Agenda next time.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Fane Lozman, Mary Brabham, Nathaniel Wilcox.

**MR. F. LOZMAN:** Fane Lozman.

The Port, I just learned, is an independent taxing district so we don't get property taxes out of the Port. So, my question to you, Ms. Hubbard, is why would you take Gagnon's opinion on what the traffic would be, what the impact of the Martin Luther King Road, nothing like that. If you're, if you're sitting as a City of Miami Commissioner and they wanna expand the Port of Miami, they have an independent traffic analysis come forward. You should say, 'Hey, Port, we don't get any money from your property taxes, you wanna have an expansion, we want an independent property analysis..., an independent traffic study. We wanna know what the impact is gonna be. We're not gonna trust your own guy, he basically works for the Port. He doesn't care about Riviera Beach. I was told that building being torn down, has something to do where the City owns that property somehow. Or controls it. It was not actually in the Port. There was some big meeting at the Port. Some, like, little scam going on that happened tonight. I don't appreciate it. I know that our own guy who supposed to work for Riviera Beach is saying, 'Oh well, it's the same amount of things, a car that weighs 4,000 pounds is gonna have

the same impact as a 60,000 pound car. If you were in the City of Miami, you would have demanded an independent traffic study, not had this guy just make stuff up as he went along. We don't get taxes from the Port, they get grants. They should've coughed up a couple million dollars, upfront. Say, 'You wanna building permit? We want a couple million dollars for the impact, tens of thousands of additional trucks a year are gonna [inaudible] through there. They bring in a quarter million containers a year. They're all going through rail. 'Oh, no they're not.' They're coming in truck all the time. It's just bogus that you buy this nonsense from this guy and don't hold his feet to fire.

Now, let's talk about other nonsense that's going on with your City Attorney. The City Attorney representation to Ms. Hoskins and to the Board that you as an..., that you as the client, cannot fire Benjamin Bedard, is nonsense. The insurance company must provide you a pool of law firms to choose from, or you can hire your own attorney and you can get reimbursed the hourly rate they pay Bedard. This man doesn't want you to fire Bedard. Bedard should be fired for cause just for the putting that prostitute up and attacking the Mayor, and disparaging the City at a federal trial. But, Bedard should be fired for multiple other reasons. Okay? And for him to say, 'Oh, the insurance won't...' Let's say, hypothetically, he's right, the insurance company won't pay a penny for any other lawyer. You can still fire that lawyer and the City can assign Ms. Busby to represent the City. And you say, 'Well, what does Ms. Busby know about the first amendment?' She knows quite a bit, 'cause she was listed on the Supreme Court briefs that the City filed. Okay? So, if she can be on a Supreme Court brief relative to the first amendment, she could defend this action if need be. But that's not the way it is. The way it is, is the insurance company must provide you with other law firms..., 'cause say the guy's a racist, say he's a pedophile, say he's a disgusting guy, they can't force you to keep an attorney you don't want to. You're the client. You can hire your own attorney and get reimbursed, or they have to provide another law firm for you to choose from. And, for Ms. Hoskins to say that, 'Oh, well, Degraffenreidt said we could only keep that attorney,' is not true. We have an inhouse Attorney.

[Timer]

**MR. F. LOZMAN:** Or guys could independently pay for it, but to say we have to keep Bedard, is not true. And he shouldn't be kept. Here why you don't look at the video of Mr. Bedard's witness he put on in a federal court, where the judge and jury were disgusted with what went down with the Mayor. Anybody can go on YouTube and look at that video.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Mary Brabham. , Nathaniel ox, Norma Duncombe.

**MS. M. BRABHAM:** Mary Brabham, Riviera Beach. I would like to send out condolences to Ms. Hudnell. She.., Ms. Hudnell taught us, all over the county from Gifford Florida, all the way down, she taught us to be ladies and gentlemen. She taught us who we were, who we can be and who we shall be. She was one of the most magnificent historians in Palm Beach County. Her knowledge and her wisdom was sought out throughout Palm Beach County. She was M. Hudinell. There will never be any other person that has taught in our public school system, and she taught all the students well. That's why we have always rallied around Ms. Hudinell. So, my family's condolences goes out to Ms.

Hudinell and the Lewis Family and all of those grieving families. As well as Mr. Ed Kunuty, that sits on our Planning & Zoning Board. His wife, Agnes Kunuty, passed away. So, you have my condolences too, Mr. Kuntty.

I would like to encourage the residents to get up and vote. Taxation without representation, that's where you falls at. When you do not have these things done for you, you have nobody to blame but yourself. It is a horizon that, that's all over the land, where things are being said and just government is just full of lies, and that's deceiving our children. Our children feels as if that gives them that avenue to lie, because you sit in high places. That should not be. Residents of Riviera Beach, all over everywhere, get up and vote. Change will only come about if you, yourself, demand that change, and with the change comes accountability. And that stems from you as the voters. You do not have to come in the Chambers and say not one word. Get up and let your be known by going out to vote. Young people a lot is at stake for you now. You're talking about your housing and your education, your funds and stuff that are being cut off, and you payin' low.

[Timer]

**MS. M. BRABHAM:** Get up and vote.

Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you. I would like for us to just take a brief moment to acknowledge the life of Ms. Hudinell, as well as Ms. Kunuty and all those who we have lost. If we could just take a few moments of silence in their memories.

[Moment of silence]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Nathaniel Wilcox, Norma Duncombe, Derrick Dorsett.

[Pause]

[Inaudible dais discussion]

[Pause]

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Nathaniel Wilcox? [Pause]. Norma Duncombe, Derrick Dorsett.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** [Inaudible]. [Pause].

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** [Inaudible] presentation.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Pardon?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** A presentation.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** A presentation on what?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, Mr. Wilcox has IT working on a presentation that he wants to for his three minutes. I did advise that this should.., should've been arranged prior to the meeting.

**MR. N. WILCOX:** Good afternoon. Good afternoon to everyone. My name is Nathaniel Wilcox.

I have, I have very sharp concerns about what's happening at Stonybrook, because what happened at Stonybrook, we have a, an example of Millenia's work at.., in, in Miami. It's, it's supposed to be a professionally managed property, but it's very so'.., very much not a professionally managed property.

[Inaudible discussion with IT]

**MR. N. WILCOX:** Okay. It says professionally managed here, but if you take a look at how Millenia has taken care of the property there in, in Opa-locka, you can see the mold, you can see the, the sewer, you can see the second rate work that they're doing, in their.., in Opa-locka. People are dying, people are reaching out for help but the.., Millenia has failed the people in Opa-locka. You can see the roaches, you can see the mold that people are exposed to right ow in, in Opa-locka and they're talking about spending \$13,000,000 to fix it up here, Stonybrook, here. Don't fall for the lie, don't fall for the okie-doke, because people are getting sec'.., second rate work done on their property.., on the, on the property. You.., is that the way you fix a hole in the ceiling? Is that the way you fix a hole in the roof? Absolutely not. Look at the swimming pool. Talk about professionally managed by Millenia? This pool looks exactly like it is in this picture right now. Millenia, talking about taking over the property in Stonybrook? I don't think so. Mold is on the wall, you have, uh, a shower head that they suppose' to had fixed. Look at that. Would any of you Commissioners live in that? I don't think so. Look at the bathroom tiles that Millenia has failed to give them the proper, uh, utensils to fix and clean those bathrooms and those tiles. Would you live in that situation? I don't think so. You have second rate work that's being done on the, on the..., the windows, the walls there. You have kitchens that are in terrible hard conditions right now. And Millenia wants to come in and fix.., spend \$13,000,000 dollars in your area.

You can see where the Mayor came down and he checked some things out before he even.., before he makes a decision about it and he's already made up his mind because, if you look at what's happening there, by Millenia, supposedly professionally managed group, they're doing a horrible job. They are.., look like they're nothing more than a slumlord. And they wanna bring that slumlord mentality from Opa-locka, here, to Riviera Beach. Don't fall for the oka-doke. Look at the ceilings, look at the, the, the, the...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Air condition vent?

[Inaudible comments]

**MR. N. WILCOX:** The filters. The filters are cut in half. They don't..., you can't even get a whole filter in Opa-locka, by the professionally managed group. And look how dirty it is.

So, we're, we're recommending to you that, don't fall for what all the promises that are being made by Millenia because..., the people are gonna suffer as a result.

**UNK. AUDIENCE:** Amen.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you.

[Applause]

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Norma Duncombe, Derrick Dorsett, Suzanne Allen.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** And Millenia owns that property since 2016.

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** Norma Duncombe. I have a several things here that I need to talk about.

Those persons who went out and got signatures, say, to remove Council Members from the City Council. The first thing I wanna say is that the Council Members did not do anything wrong. Anybody in leadership position, your job depends on the Board keeping you. They did not do anything wrong. And what I would like to say to that group, that man came here, he was making over \$100,000. They fired him, for whatever reason they thought they needed to fire him. He went up north of us and he got another job making over \$100,000. And I'm saying to you..., and he wasn't satisfied, he came back and got another \$190,000. So, he and his attorneys are doing great. What I would like to know, is how many persons in that leadership group, that still has the City in court, how many of you are making over \$100,000? Suppose that energy that you put out for that man, had been put in the things that are needed in this City? For people who really need it. I almost fell outta my chair when the lady said she was paying almost \$1,000 at Stonybrook. That is unbelievable. I'm saying, we need to sit down and talk and get together and figure out what we need to do here to make the lives of the people who live in this City better.

I picked up the new'... And, and the one thing we..., that really bothers me, is our children are going to four different schools. Now, they will recruit them up in Palm Beach Gardens if they play football and basketball, but what about the other kids, in terms of their being prepared for what they need to have in years to come? They don't get that. And we continue to vote for the same person on the School Board who thought it would be, I don't know what, to put a school here in the City for the kids. The next thing I wanna deal with..., and, and, and you shouldn't' vote for her.

The next thing is, I pick up the paper and it says that there's a mansion over on Singer Island has not paid a water bill in six years.

[Inaudible audience comment]



**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** And they were only paying \$200. My little house, they charge me \$200 a month for water. They were only paying \$200 and they said, well, it was a meter problem. That would be just like my getting a car, have an accident and say, 'Well, I'm not gonna pay for that car because...

[Timer}

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** ...I had an accident. You don't do business that way. And it's a shame that we would allow these people to not pay a water and say 'Well, we can't do anything about it. It was a bad mater.' Make them pay for those six years that they did not pay a water bill. You got senior citizens living off of social security, and they could barely buy what they really need. But they have to pay their water bill. This is a disgrace. I wanna what.., I wanna know something is being done about this. These jokers need to pay a water bill for the six years that they have not paid. And, if there was a problem with their meter, they should've reported it.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** Who was the Director of the Utilities six years ago? We need to, we need to do something about that.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, Ms. Duncombe.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Derrick Dorsett, Suzanne Allen, Willie Lewis.

**MR. D. DORSETT:** Good morning. Derrick Dorsett, Riviera Beach.

I just got wind, [inaudible] this morning, in reference to the issue at Phil Foster. About 2:00 o'clock this morning, 'cause I'm up at that time of morning when I can't sleep, and I happened to hear the young lady speak about what was going on over there. Now, I'm from Miami-Dade. Been here since '79-'80. And, as far as I know, as it relates to Phil Foster, that has always been a park for people of color. Why? Because non-black didn't want us over there at Ocean Mall. That was in the '80's and '90's. Now here we are in 2018 and now we have a problem, based on whatever the situation is over there. It seems like discrimination to me, from what was explained to me by this young lady on Facebook. That's one of the reasons why I'm here.

The other reason is, we need to do something about people who have multiple vehicles that they don't drive, that block other people's garbage can. I've been having a problem for the last two and a half years with the neighbors next door to me, at 1463 West 30<sup>th</sup>. I've got Arthur Thomas involved, I've gotten Solid Waste Management involved, I've got the Police Department involved. This is a idiot. These are idiot, nuisance neighbors. I am tired of it. And I want something done. Today. I can't.., these people need.., somebody needs to go to whoever owns that property and talk to them, 'cause I'm not gonna put up with it anymore. These people are trash and I just found out they shouldn't 've been put there. Each one of 'em have felonies, they have.., the husband got six felonies, for robbery and a whole.., I'll pull everything on both of them. From Brevard County, all the way to Miami-Dade. I could show you the paperwork I got on them. And,

I've already filed a civil lawsuit against each one of the independently for harassment. Those are due to go, go to court, one in September and one in October, based on just this alone, slander and everything else they're doing to me.

I'm not gonna put up with it, and I shouldn't have to put up with it, with a.., being a longtime resident in this City. I brought this before you all a year ago. And I know the police are tired of coming there. And I'm gonna keep calling, and keep calling until ya'll get upset and do something.

Also, at the corner of, um, where Wawa is, Gardens Road, I wanna say that's the southeast corner. Since Wawa has been there, there's a lot of traffic that backs up along there that needs to go east. I'm asking that the City look into having a turn lane put there so people can.., no, 'cause if you look there, like, 10:00-11:00 o'clock, traffic is backed all the way down the street.

[Timer]

**MR. D. DORSETT:** Most of 'em wanna turn going east.

So, I just ask that you all look into this.., these issues and somebody speak to me in reference to 'em because I'm tired of living next door to people who are nuisance neighbors. And they shouldn't've even been put there. Had the landlord did the proper background check, and that's the problem we have. We have landlords that are just puttin' people in, and not even looking at the background check.

Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, Mr. Dorsett.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Suzanne Allen, Willie Lewis, Dr. Lydia Smith.

**MS. S. ALLEN:** God evening everyone.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Good evening.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Good evening.

**MS. S. ALLEN:** Suzanne Allen, 1250 West 3<sup>rd</sup> Street.

I'm here tonight on a totally different subject. We had a event August 11<sup>th</sup>, Saturday gone, for the open'..., Alli'..., the Brook'..., Allison Brook Community Center. I know there's been some issues about the name but I have no problem with the name.

But we, the, the Southside Concerned Mothers really needed was a building that we could go to, to bring the children out of the weather and bring families together, so we can all, you know, work better for the community, for all residents. We came up with this idea about a building. And we went to two Councilmen, Cedrick Thomas and Bruce Guyton, years, years ago, and we walked. Bishop Mayor told us we need to get a petition

to let everyone know that we were serious about what we were talking about. We really didn't know we were gonna get Center. We just asked for a house, a building, anything to get us out of the weather, so we can work with the children. So, they came up with the idea for a Center and we finally opened, the ribbon-cutting was Saturday. Tonya Davis Johnson, we love her so much. She brought our dream right on into existence.

So, I'm here today to thank each Councilperson, give 'em a special thanks from the Southside Coalition and Concerned Mothers and we wanna give Tonya Davis Johnson a very special thank you, and let her know that we love her and continue to do good work for the City.

Thank you.

[Applause]

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Willie Lewis, Dr. Lydia Smith, Toya Jackson.

**MR. W. LEWIS:** I need to ask ya'll..., because it's concerning...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Pass it to the Clerk.

**MR. W. LEWIS:** Pass this up? 'Cause it's a case..., 33 year old case that's in the archives and when I talk to you about it, you wouldn't know anything about it.

My name's Willie Lewis. I live at 1381...

**UNK:** [Inaudible].

**MR. W. LEWIS:** ...West 28<sup>th</sup> Street.

I took a contract [inaudible] to retrieve a certain amount of money to take a case for a special need person and some children. The case is in the archives and your Police Department arrested me and I want you to get all the case numbers and the files, and the Baker Acted me, but I'm coming here to the station tonight.

In 1985, there was a case where several family members burned to death, and this lawyer named by Willie Garrett, he used that case..., it was several family members, it wasn't seven, it was several and the case was sued upon a fraud. Now, I'm here because the gentleman..., I have a contract to retrieve his [inaudible] name, named Troy Faulk, Jr. This is the first case that Willie Garret ever had when he come out cuttin' cane. This is a case he never wanna bring forward, and all this things because you never see it because it come' from the archives. These papers here is what Palm Beach Post did and they came and tracked the case for four years, from 1985 to 1989, and they used this against Mr. Troy Faulk, Jr. to say he was using the money. But, Mr. Troy Faulk, Jr. couldn't spell a five letter word. In 1985, Mr. Willie Garret had a case for [stammer] FP&L were worth \$50,000,000. The case [stammer] thirty-three and a third belonged to Mr. Willie Garrett, would be \$16.3333. Mr. Troy Faulk, Jr. case would be, \$33.6667. Sixty-seven cent is the last dollar of the \$50,000,000, belong to Mr. Troy Faulk, Jr. He couldn't read or write.

Mr. Willie Garrett took this money and built his empire and nobody know about it. Mr. Troy Faulk, Jr. lost two houses, consists of \$2.7M. Palm Beach Post did the final edition in 1989. A man with \$32,000,000 lost a \$187,000 home, in '92. How could a man lose this kind of money with thirty-two point million dollars, with the same lawyer, trustee, accountant, power attorney? It's unheard of. And ya'll allowed this. Ninet'.., 2000, he inherit'.., he required Mr. Johnny Cochran. The face, uh, a case against discrimination. In 2000, he gave Mr. Troy Faulk, Jr. a \$2.1M house, \$400,000 for a realtor and \$40,000... In seven years, Mr. Troy Faulk, Jr. lost his house under Mr. Willie Garrett, the lawyer, the attorney, everything. Why is he still on this case? He done broke every rule in the law book.

[Timer]

**MR. W. LEWIS:** I worked for ya'll for twenty years. I'm not here. I want ya'll to investigate Ms. Newman [sp], Officer Crus and Officer Keith from violating my rights, my civil rights, my Miranda Rights and arresting me, and forcing these drugs in me, which I never took a drug before. I'm 67 years old, I've never been to a doctor. This is ya'll Police Department. Ya'll took Ms. Cruz., Ms. Newman and Put in place, when she accused Mr. Danny Jones, I know both of them, I am in part of the case, but Mrs. Newman plotted two times to arrest me. On false arrest and imprison me. And, Baker Act me in a mental institution.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, sir.

**MR. W. LEWIS:** And I came to give Ms. Botel, because I didn't wanna let ya'll see it, I came to let Ms. Botel see the contract and everything so she could give somebody and listen.

And also, people at Millenia, I want ya'll to know Mr. Willie Garrett has been sneaking in the back door to sue Millenia. I have that [inaudible]...

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Dr. Lydia Smith, Toya Jackson, Horace Towns.

**DR. L. SMITH:** Hello. Good afternoon, Council, Mayor.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Good afternoon, Dr.

**DR. L. SMITH:** My name is Lydia Smith, Riviera Beach.

In 2010, five of my family members were killed in the City that I love. And, every year since then, the crime is just steadily increasing or, you know, thereabout. Since I've been back, I've had the opportunity to be a part of a lotta great causes, thanks to some of the Council Mem'.., Councilwoman Lynne Hubbard and, and some of you guys. I really appreciate it. And, with that, I've had the opportunity to partner, or been so fortunate to partner with this young lady, Toya Jacks'.., Johnson, who will be speaking next in the Live in Peace movement. Our goal is to educate and have a better and, and safer City. So, with that, we're asking, or we know that this can happen with the community help. First, I'd like to thank City Manager, Ms. Karen Hoskins, Mr. Blankenship and especially the

Staff at Parks & Rec for allowing us to use Dan Calloway Park, for August 26<sup>th</sup>. On Sunday, August 26<sup>th</sup>, we're having a.., we're giving away school supplies. We're having an event out there to stop the violence that we're inviting everybody out for.., there will be free food, activities, entertainment. So, basically, I'm just asking you all to come out and support and for the community, it is free for everybody, so come on out.

Thank you.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Toya Jackson, Horace Towns.

**MS. T. JACKSON:** Good evening, everybody.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**MS. T. JACKSON:** My name is Toya Jackson. How is everybody doing this evening? I was, I was privileged with the opportunity to be born and raised right here in Riviera Beach, Florida. But, over the past couple years, I have seen a lot of my friends, a lot of my friends children's fathers, a lot of my family members, lose their life to the gun violence in and around our City. So recently, I have had the opportunity to be blessed with people around me who have the like mentality of me, and we have partnered with Dr. Lydia Smith to come together.., and I'm speaking on behalf of all the '70, '80's babies in our City that are just tired of seeing children, younger than us, lose their life to gun violence. And, like I said, I have a team of people who are behind me that are ready and willing to do whatever we can, as young adults, to bring some type of peace and unity back to our cities. So, on August the 26<sup>th</sup>, we are having a back to school, stop the violence little movement that we are putting together out of the goodness of our hearts. And, I'm coming today to invite and ask all of you guys to be a part of, and participate, and whatever it is that you can do to help us to help the community and bring everything altogether. Like I said, I just wanna see love, peace and unity back in this City that people pay to visit. We live here. You know? And our beaches are beautiful, our City is great, we have great City officials, and I just wanna do whatever I can and with the help of the City Commissioners, and all of you guys, we can make this event possibly an annual event, if you guys come together and just help little ole me and my [chuckle] counterparts pull this event together.

So, thank you for listening and, if you do, I really appreciate it, but if not, just pray for us that we have a wonderful event. Thank you.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Horace Towns. Madam Chair, after Mr. Towns, that will complete public comments for this section.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**MR. H. TOWNS:** Good evening to the Board.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Good evening.

**MR. H. TOWNS:** Horace Towns, Riviera Beach.

First off, I would like to say congratulations to the City Council, old and new, on the, let me see, the..., I wanna get the name right, Richard and Annie Brook Community Center. I thought the building was, was beautiful and the artwork was amazing. So, congratulations on that accomplishment.

I guess this will be more towards the City Manager. I wanna ask the City Manager to place it on the Public Works Director's desk, or Utility Director. I don't know who's doing the capital improvement project, but I've spoken before about the projects that's going on now, it's in District 1. I'm just, as a resident, I'm not happy with some of the work that I'm seeing performed. I think the contractors are taking shortcuts, and some of the stuff that I see wouldn't be tolerated in other cities. Most projects require a staging area where heavy equipment is placed off the roadway, as much as possible. Some of the barricades lack the proper lighting, and I would also say that, if possible, could we require the contractor to do some mechanical industrial sweeping? I've endured two nails in my tire already, at the beginning of this project. I really wanna see a standard in Riviera Beach that's observed in any other city. I know we need capital improvement projects. My concern was it being performed during hurricane season, which I think puts us in a position, a vulnerable position. But also, just from a resident to the Board, again, the contractor is placing us in a position of liability for some of the things that I've seen seeing around the City. Someone could easily be texting and driving, run into a piece of tractor equipment that's parked on the corner. Anything could happen that will end up in a, a huge lawsuit on the City's behalf.

So, that's all I'm asking tonight. Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam City Manager, do you have any responses for any of the comments that have been made this evening?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** As it relates to the comment made by resident Deborah Hall, regarding the Phil Foster Park, I believe you sated that we would schedule a joint meeting with the county to work out those issues and..., or address those issues. [Pause]. And I will let Attorney Andrew Degraffenreidt address the concerns of resident Willis Williams regarding Attorney Bedard that is representing the City on the Fane Lozman case. As it relates to [pause], let me see. [Pause]. Mr. Derrick Dorsett, relating to the nuisance..., speaking about his neighbor. I did send an email to the Code Enforcement Administrator to address his concerns, and I did see the police officer speaking to him regarding his nuisance..., or, complaints. [Pause]. Mr. Towns, as it relates to the road project, the Public Works Director will be..., is in charge of the road project and I am in the process of sending an email to him to confirm that the contractor is doing industrial sweeps and setting a standard for riviera Beach, as it relates to construction..., road construction.

That's all I have, Madam Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you. Madam Clerk, we are now at Item...

**15. ITEM NO. 15**

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** We are now at Item No. 15, Madam Chair.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY: RESOLUTION NO. 85-18. A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH, PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA APPROVING THE CONTRACT FOR FINANCIAL ADVISOR PROFESSIONAL SERVICES WITH PFM FINANCIAL ADVISORS, LLC, COMMENCING AUGUST 16, 2018 FOR A TERM OF THREE YEARS WITH UP TO TWO ADDITIONAL ONE-YEAR EXTENSIONS, AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR AND CITY CLERK TO EXECUTE SAID CONTACT AND PROVIDING AN EFFECTIVE DATE.**

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, we do have public comment cards on this Item. The acceptance of public comment cards for this Item is now closed.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Chair Pro Tem, you're recognized.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Madam Chair, I'd like to pull this particular Item because the PF..., PFM and the PFM, LLC, I, I was told the last time that I brought this up, that those are two different companies, and if they are the same companies, the bid is going to go..., it's going to go back out for bid anyway. So..., and the rea'..., and, and let me..., the reason I want to pull it and the reason I want it tabled, so that we can get some more information as to the relationship between the two..., between the two companies. One of the company's handle our BMO', and the other company, I understand, is handling our investment piece. And I just don't think that one in the same company should have both pots of money, or should be handling both accounts, let me just say that..., should be handling both accounts. But, I'm told that these are two separate entities and it's just coincidence that they have the same name.

But, I think we need to look into that a little further, otherwise, we can find ourselves in a situation that we don't have to be in. So again, I would like to ask that we table this Item for tonight.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Second.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Motion...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Botel, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Can we hear from...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Point of order.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** ...Mr. She'...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** One moment.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** There's been a motion...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Can we hear from...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...and a second...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** ...Mr. Sherman before we...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...on a table the Item and there's no...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** ...[inaudible] table?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...conversation after the second. But I remove my second, so we can enter into the discussion.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, sir.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Your comment?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** I asked if we could hear from Mr. Sherman before this Item was tabled because I have the highest regard for PFM. I've used them in my past life, and they are absolutely the best of the best, the crème de' la crème. There, there is no finer financial service. They are the blue chip, if you will. And, so I'd like to hear from Mr. Sherman, please.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Madam...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...Botel?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...Chair, two things.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Botel, when an Item has been tabled, we pull it from the table and there is no discussion.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** And Madam Chair...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes, but...

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** ...I believe...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** I guess I'm objecting to it being tabled in that way.



**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, I believe that Councilperson Davis sated that if there will be discussion, he's removing his second for a motion to table.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Motion to table. Are you seconding?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** To enter into this.., I mean, to enter the discussion.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Thank you.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** And then I'll re'.., bring my second back after the discussion.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Wait. One moment.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** If we're gonna table it, you can't bring...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** There's no discussion...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** One...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...of an Item...

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Motion.., Madam Chair, at this particular time, there is no motion on the, on the floor.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** It is...

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis has rescinded his motion.., his second to table. So, Madam Chair, either someone else needs to second the motion to table, or it dies for a lack of, lack of a second.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Madam Chair, comment, please, ma'am?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Chair Pro Tem, you're recognized.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** The.., I was not questioning the quality, or the integrity, of PFM. I'm not saying they are not the blue chip of this industry. What I'm talking about is our responsibility, and what.., the position that we will be in if we find out that it's one in the same, and how conflicting that would be, and how it doesn't make good sense or practice for us to have bo'.., have one company or sister related companies handling our.., this situation, the BMO and our investments. Never was I saying that anything about their integrity, I'm saying they should not be handling both. That's, that's my point, and that's why I think it's incumbent upon us to table this Item because, at the end of the day, we're gonna be the only ones that are looked at as crooks or mismanagement of funds or something of that nature. Neither one of them can be charged with that or accused of that.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilman Davis, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Before I entertain my second of the motion, one of the things I would like to see happen is that we get a, a independent party just to give us an opinion whether there's the ethics or OIG.

[Inaudible comment]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I'm speaking into it. It just needs to be turned up a little more. Someone from the OIG.

But my second, still stands.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It's been motioned and properly second. Madam Clerk.

[Inaudible comments]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Is that, is that the correct...

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, no. That is not correct, because Councilperson Davis rescinded his second to the motion to table so that there could be discussion.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** So therefore, we now need another motion and...

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** If you...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...a second...

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** ...want a motion to either table, or a motion to approve.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** I move that we table this Item.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Second.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It's been...

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...motioned and properly second.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** ...Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** No.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes, ma'am.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Botel?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** No.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Hubbard?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Davis Johnson?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** That motion is approved with Councilpersons Miller-Anderson and Botel dissenting.

**15A.**

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, we're now down to Item No. 15A, which is the Resolution that has been requested from the Florida League of Cities that all municipalities present a Resolution celebrating the fifty years of home rule in the State of Florida.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Colleagues, I wanted to bring to the attention of the full body, that the Florida Leagues of Cities has asked that all cities in the State of Florida, adopt a Resolution celebrating fifty years of home rule. The draft Resolution is in my possession and I wanted to just briefly cover what the Resolution does say, and it is a:

Resolution of the City of Riviera Beach, Palm Beach County, Florida honoring fifty years of municipal home rule in the Florida Constitution and committing to an educational initiative to help Floridians understand this beneficial right;

WHEREAS, Florida voters place municipal home rule powers in the, in the Florida Constitution on November 5, 1968 during the regular elections as an amendment to Article 8; and

WHEREAS, the power, the power has enabled each city, town and village across the Sunshine State, to consider, adopt, revise or remove its own laws without the need to seek legislative permission from the state and has further served as the foundation upon which every municipality builds its governmental structure; and

WHEREAS, the political climate within the Florida legislature has recently included many attacks on these powers; and

WHEREAS, grassroots measures calling such actions wrong and declaring that local decisions be made at the local level by local officials, must continue so that all legislators clearly understand Florida's home rule as a Constitutional power and one upheld in state statutes; and

WHEREAS, a fiftieth anniversary is a fitting time for all municipalities to engaged their respective citizens to educate them about the Florida Constitution and local laws so that all Floridians may continue to receive the many benefits of home rule.

NOW THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, by the City of Riviera Beach, that this anniversary presents a tremendous opportunity to educate all citizens about Florida's Constitution, municipal government and home rule authority and that all necessary resources shall be provided for such public information, and that the City of Riviera Beach will actively challenge all efforts to reduce or erode this cherished right, and further employ all efforts to ensure state or federal.., state and federal government partners understand that one size fits all approach to governance is not in the interest of Florida citizens and that the tradition of local decision making in Florida is essential to protect, as it provides each municipality the ability to preserve and enhance the myriad characteristics that make each one uniquely special and that maintains its quality of life.

THEREFORE, that the City of Riviera Beach will include this information on its website as a regular Agenda Item for public discussion and within the City of Riviera Beach services, in as many outreach venues as possible.

That is the language that we would like to put forth and would like to have your support from the dais in honor of the fiftieth anniversary, celebrating fifty years of home rule, on behalf of the City of Riviera Beach.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Second.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Are there any comments or...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...questions?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilman Davis, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I would just like to say thank you for bringing that before the Board, supporting this great initiative. And as a Member of the Board of Directors, one of the things I like to do, is request for a presentation from the Palm Beach County League of Cities to come and, and inform the residents of what home rule really mean' and some examples that will impact Riviera Beach in some of the decisions that we may have made or we're going to make in the future, and how there has been an attack from Tallahassee, from the state level, to control our local govern'.., government from the decisions up there.

And I wanna say thank you again for bringing this before the Board, and I will definitely be reaching out to the Executive Direct, Richard Radcliff to come before this Board and give a presentation and some examples of what home rule really means. 'Cause a lotta folks hear it, but we wanna give them some local examples of what's been going on across Palm Beach County, specifically Riviera Beach and how it impacts us from a state level.

But thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, Mr. Davis. And we'll request that that be put placed on our next regular meeting Agenda. [Pause]. Are there any other questions or comments? [Pause]. Madam Clerk.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes, ma'am.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Botel?

[Inaudible dais comment]

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** No. You made the motion.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Oh, and she second it.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Botel?

[Pause]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Chuckle].

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** I'm back.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Oh, there she is.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible]. [Chuckle].

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Okay. [Chuckle].

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Botel?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** If we're still [audio skips] motion to [stammer] put the home rule [audio skips] I'm more than happy to expedite it. I had asked [audio skips] put

on September 5<sup>th</sup> Agenda, so it's wonderful that we can vote on it tonight. If that's [inaudible].

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** What is your vote, Councilperson Botel?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Is it on the..., are we talking about the home rule issue? I had..., I've been out of...

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Yes...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** ...audio...

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Yes, ma'am.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** ...for the last several minutes.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** We're, we're voting on the home rule resolution coming on the...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...next meeting...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** An enthusiastic yes.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Hubbard?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Davis Johnson?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Unanimous vote.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, colleagues.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** You're welcome.

## **DISCUSSION AND DELIBERATION**

**16.**

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Item No. 16.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY: UPDATE ON STONYBROOK APARTMENTS PROPOSAL**

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, we do have public comment cards on this Item. The acceptance of public comment cards on this Item is now closed.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam City Manager.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair, at this time, I'll call Acting Director Jeff Gagnon to the, to the mic to give a presentation on the update of the Stonybrook proposal. As you...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** [Inaudible].

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** ...we'll talk about it later but we are scheduling a special meeting for Monday, August 20<sup>th</sup> to...

[Inaudible comment]

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** ...for the City Council to make a decision on the development of that project.

**ACTING DIRECTOR DEVELOPMENT SERVICES GAGNON:** Thank you, Madam Manager

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** One moment. Councilwoman Botel, can you..., would kindly mute your television.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** I'm back. Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Gagnon.

**ACTING DIRECTOR DEVELOPMENT SERVICES GAGNON:** Thank you, Madam Chair. Jeff Gagnon, Acting Director of Development Services.

As Madam Manager just spoke on the topic of a special meeting that's being proposed for next Monday, which is...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Wait. [Inaudible]...

**ACTING DIRECTOR DEVELOPMENT SERVICES GAGNON:** ...the 20<sup>th</sup> of August.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** One moment, please.

[Pause]

**ACTING DIRECTOR DEVELOPMENT SERVICES GAGNON:** Test, test.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** It's back.

**ACTING DIRECTOR DEVELOPMENT SERVICES GAGNON:** Better?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** It's back., Yes.

**ACTING DIRECTOR DEVELOPMENT SERVICES GAGNON:** I'll speak up as well.

[Inaudible dais comments]

[Pause]

**ACTING DIRECTOR DEVELOPMENT SERVICES GAGNON:** Does this work better?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Pull it up.

[Inaudible comment]

**ACTING DIRECTOR DEVELOPMENT SERVICES GAGNON:** Testing, test, test. One, two, test, test, test.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** [Inaudible] louder.

[Inaudible comments]

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** I think the system's out.

[Inaudible comments]

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Something with the system.

**UNK:** Everybody's low.

**ACTING DIRECTOR DEVELOPMENT SERVICES GAGNON:** I can just [inaudible]...

[Inaudible comments]

**ACTING DIRECTOR DEVELOPMENT SERVICES GAGNON:** Thank you, Madam Chair. I'll, I'll try to enunciate my voice, or enunciate my words.

So, as Madam Manager spoke on, there is a special meeting proposed for Monday, August 20<sup>th</sup> to speak only on the Stonybrook Items. Those are the same Items that were discussed on July 18<sup>th</sup> during our regular City Council meeting. We have two Ordinances and a Resolution associated with the Site Plan. Staff has been working diligently with the Millenia team, as well as with other agencies. We've had conversations with HUD. I know Madam Manager has spent a significant amount of time, as well as Mr. Horton, on this Item. So, part of the reason the Items weren't presented tonight, was we



wanna ensure that we have all the information finalized prior to bringing it back to City Council. We don't wanna bring an Item that Staff considers to be incomplete in any way, shape or form. So, that was part of the reason why it wasn't on tonight's Agenda. Additionally, we feel as if it's such an important Item to the community, and to the City, that it, it does deserve an independent meeting to hear that Item.

So, I'm here to answer any other questions you may have.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** We'll go with public comment, please. Thank you.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Andre Henderson, Norma Duncombe, Mary Brabham.

**MR. A. HENDERSON:** I, I guess this is just an update. There's no voting going tonight? So, I'm just gonna put out my opinion what I think we should do.

It's probably unpopular but I think it should be torn down and it should be sold to Tropical or the Port for expansion. But the only caveat I say is that,...

[Inaudible audience comment]

**MR. A. HENDERSON:** Excuse me?

[Inaudible audience comment]

**MR. A. HENDERSON:** Alright. My only caveat is that I think the City should buy this property and sell it. Because, the issue at hand is road, Stonybrook Road, and the zoning. So, we know where this is gonna lead to, we know who wants to buy this property. As I pointed out before, Summit tried to buy this property..., bought this property in 2003 for \$5.1M. Global Ministries bought this property in 2012 for \$12.2M, and now we have Millenia. I think, since it's a private property, it's up for sale, they can do what they want with it, we can't give up that road. If we give up that road, that's what's gonna happen. But I honestly think, this, this should be given..., or not given, we should take the windfall of the profits, and, and sell it to the Port, or sell it to Tropical because I don't think we have room in, in our City for this property. We need to help our residents out, and we need a three prong strategy, the upward mobility. And I can say that it's coming from Stonybrook..., not from Stonybrook but Broadmoor. When Broadmoor was knocked down, and tore down, it wasn't as bad as Stonybrook. So, what we should do is the same thing we used there, is that we should slowly phase out our residents, when we phase 'em out, get 'em into housing. We need to take this, this piece of property and sell it. If we own it as the City. And, because we've been going through this for forty-four years, but in the last fifteen years, we've had a headache of people coming in saying they're gonna do something with this property and they don't do it.

So, that's my issue. I'm not gonna take up too much more time but I just wanna state my, my strategy in this, that we should, we should try something different because this is not working what we're doing now.

Thank you.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Norma Duncombe, Mary Brabham, Doretta Paulk.

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** Norma Duncombe.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Good evening.

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** This situation at Stonybrook, number one, is government subsidized, isn't it?

**UNK:** Yes.

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** Right?

**UNK:** Mhmm.

**UNK:** Yes.

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** Okay. And the people who are in position of ownership, they're not doing what they're supposed to do. In other words, they are subsidizing themselves with salaries of probably two, \$300,000 a year and they're not reinvesting in the place. What I would like to know, we set standards of other place in the City, why don't we have inspections there and desman that, not just wait until everything is falling apart, but demand that they have.., maintain the standards that are supposed to be maintained for living quarters? And, as a government subsidized place, why can't this.., and, and I'm not really sure of where you come in, the City comes in, in terms of what you can require of them. But, I know one thing, if you pull it up, they are subsidizing themselves with hundreds of thousands of dollars in salaries for their.., whoever else is involved, family members, everybody.

So, what part does the City play in terms of, just as my house, if I had it in disrepair, the City can come in and slap, you know...

**UNK. AUDIENCE:** Fines.

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** ...all kinds of fines on it. Why aren't we doing the very same thing with that place because those people are important. Those children there are important. So, you can let somebody else come in there and it will be the same thing unless the City goes in... And I'm not talking about people going in to make a show, I'm saying put standards there, have the inspections and.., on a regular basis, so that people are living in a place that is decent. Children are living in a place that's decent. They're not letting them live there if they don't pay the rent. So, with the government subsidy, as well as the rent that they pay, it's big time money there. And I think we need to step to the plate and do what we're supposed to do, not just stand out there and take a picture and make a comment, but let's do what needs to be done.

Thank you.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Mary Brabham, Doretta Paulk.

**MS. M. BRABHAM:** Ms. Mary Brabham, Riviera Beach.

I saw the video, Mayor Masters that you did. Apparently, you over there to Opa-locka.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I did.

**MS. M. BRABHAM:** The question should've also be asked too, did you go and talk with management over there to see what, what, what precautions that they put in, in place to measure, to, I would say assess some of the damage that that was done. I always say, it lived in Opa-locka. Am I correct?

[Inaudible comment]

**MS. M. BRABHAM:** The same thing that I said here before, I will not deviate from what I said. It is a HUD, it's under the guidelines of HUD...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** That's right.

**MS. M. BRABHAM:** ...but it lives in the City of Riviera Beach. I will not deviate from that. We need to do what we need to do as a City. It lives in Riviera Beach. The City also had a responsibility, just like over in Opa-locka over there. See, when you're black, that doesn't mean that you can be treated any kinda way.

**UNK. AUDIENCE:** That's right.

[Inaudible audience comment]

**MS. M. BRABHAM:** Each entity here has a responsibility to make it work for their residents, as well as tenants. And the question should be asked, who got it like that? The tenant that lives there. The mold that is there, it comes from nobody being on guard, putting the hammer where the hammer needs to be. And making things stick, crossing those.., dottin' those i's and crossing those t's, like I've always said. The projects can work, but it's what the effective leaders do in order to make it work. Whether or not Millenia has it or not, maybe they were not over on guard over in Opa-locka. I strongly suggest that you should've gotten...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Oh, I did. I spoke to...

**MS. M. BRABHAM:** ...with them...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...the management...

**MS. M. BRABHAM:** ...over there...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I did.

**MS. M. BRABHAM:**...as well.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I did.

**MS. M. BRABHAM:**To hold them accountable for those residents as well, because the City has the job, the Council has a job too. It should've been ins'.., inspected on a daily or quarterly base'. They had a education component over there, they had [stammer] GED classes over there. The residents tore it up. See, Ms. Brabham know because...

[Inaudible audience comment]

**MS. M. BRABHAM:**...Ms. Brabham has been in over there.

**UNK. AUDIENCE:** Huh?

**MS. M. BRABHAM:**A lot of that stuff there, they had computers over there and they were stolen. See, some of those peoples just coming in there to live also. But, things were...

[Timer]

**MS. M. BRABHAM:**...put in place over there...

[Inaudible audience exclamation]

**MS. M. BRABHAM:**...but you just needed that leadership... Yes they were. See, Ms. Brabham lives in that area [inaudible]...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mrs. Brabham.

**MS. M. BRABHAM:**Ms. Brabham lives in that area...

**UNK. AUDIENCE:** I go there.

**MS. M. BRABHAM:**...so I'm quite familiar with the things that has gone on over in there. It is more good in that place there, then it is bad. The older ones...

[Inaudible audience comment]

**MS. M. BRABHAM:**...need a place to stay.

[Inaudible audience comment]

**MS. M. BRABHAM:**It needs to be cleaned up and cleaned out.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**MS. M. BRABHAM:**And the City has...

[Inaudible audience comment]

**MS. M. BRABHAM:** ...a duty to put nails in there to make it live'..., livable for the ones who desire to continuously to live over there.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, Mrs. Brabham.

**MS. M. BRABHAM:** We have to have affordable housing [inaudible]...

[Inaudible audience comments]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Doretta Paulk.

[Inaudible audience comments]

**MS. D. PAULK:** Good evening. My name is Doretta Paulk.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Good evening.

**MS. D. PAULK:** And, the situation, I feel that these people who are living in Stonybrook is deplorable. I think the Council should step up and help these people and, as we say from Opa-locka, the Millenia owns that property and how that property is totally deteriorated. It's, it's not even sound for even a dog to live in a place like that.

[Inaudible audience comments]

**MS. D. PAULK:** We have to go., and also, Council and people, we have to go and make HUD accountable. Now, if it takes going to the State Attorney to help with this, these people should not be living like this. We do not live in a third world country, we live in the United States of America. The children..., if someone called Division of Children and Family of a situation of children living like this, they would come in and wanna remove these children.

**UNK. AUDIENCE:** That's right.

**MS. D. PAULK:** They should not be living like this. And I don't think it's all the people who live in that complex.

[Inaudible audience comments]

**MS. D. PAULK:** The problem. Because, the mold certainly couldn't be caused by the tenants who live there.

**UNK. AUDIENCE:** [Inaudible] it can.

**MS. D. PAULK:** It is, it is from probably the roofing, the leaking, the hurricanes, the weather that we have. So, you can't put it all on the people who reside in this complex. I think this complex, to me, in my opinion, need' to be torn down and refurbished, start it over, because these people need somewhere to live. We just can't put these people on

the street. And if people are paying \$1,000 a month to live in a situation [pause] deplorable as that that is very sinful. And you, as Councilmen, City Manager, the Mayor, you got to help these people. Because they should not still be living in these conditions. None of you would even want to live like that. None of you. You wouldn't even wanna live one day, one night, 'cause I certainly wouldn't want to. So, help these people. Even if you have to get to HUD, if you have to go to the State Attorney, there is an outlet for this situation. And let's do our jobs to help these people. And the children of our City. And I hope that, you know, when we come back, it's.., as far as Millenia going.., if you all are gonna vote for this, I don't think you should because you see the situation in Opa-locka, where there surely isn't any caring for the people who live there.

[Timer]

**MS. D. PAULK:** So, I hope that when you vote on this, it will not be a vote to have Millenia have any parts of this.

[Inaudible audience exclamation]

**MS. D. PAULK:** Thank you.

[Applause]

**UNK. AUDIENCE:** Great job, great job.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair that completes public comments.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Are there any comments from the Board?

[Inaudible comments]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** We have the meeting com'.., coming up, so I'm going to reserve comment.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Well, the...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Chair Pro Tem, you're recognized.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** The only thing that I can say to that, is that the situation is deplorable, and that we are...

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** [Inaudible]...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...working with HUD, talking.., we're in discussions, we're trying to make sure that we can do whatever and everything that we can to get the people in a better living situation. There is... I'm definitely not in support of Millenia moving forward with building a project out there. I'm.., you know, I've, I wish that they would use more of their funds to relocate the residents until the place is, is gutted. Secondly, or, we.., or, one thing... I'm gonna tell ya what I really would like the Resolution

to be, is that they put in a, a pot of money that would afford every resident to move into the open market for at least one year. So, if that place is going to be, one, either gutted or either rebuilt somewhere else, people will have a one year, not to worry about their rent, but living in safe, clean and decent housing, because, as it's often said in this same room, there is a lot of rental property in Riviera Beach and throughout this county. So, I'm just saying something, like, if they put up a bond of money, and we use that money to relocate people throughout for a period of one year, either we build a new complex or they will have gutted and re'.., did that one, or demolished that one altogether.

So, that's what I hope that would happen out of this, and I don't want any of the residents to think that we are not working to try to resolve this situation, because it's not like talking, and it's not that easy but we definitely are working on it. We were able to get a couple things done. Those people that were moved to work with the School Board and to get the bus so that they're kids could continue to go to school, to remove the barbwire fence that was up. We were able to do.., to, to get that done. So, just doing as much and everything that we can.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Any further comments from the Board?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Mayor, you're recognized.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you. I was just sitting here thinking about the, the history, the advocacy of the Stonybrook complex. I'm gonna take you back. Councilman Cedrick Thomas convened a meeting with the owners, and with HUD.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** [Inaudible] Terence Davis, I don't think was a Councilman at that time, but I remember him advocating on behalf of many, many tenants who were living there. He had them to come to that podium, one by one, by one by one. So, I do know that he was involved on the ground before he became a Councilman, and then after. I know I've been involved, on the ground with Stonybrook a few times as well. Councilwoman, Councilwoman Lynne Hubbard has been on the ground involved with working with the residents. So, we have.., I know the three of us have been on the ground at one time or the other and, and I do know when we had a, a mass demonstration out there to highlight the deplorable living conditions by the management, which was Millenia, that all of us were there. Chair Tonya Davis Johnson.., well, every'.., everyone you see except.., with the exception of the City Manager, we were there, along with Congressman Alcee Hastings and, I think, some of the county elected officials, we were there. So, on and off, one of us, if not two of us, we have been involved with Mill'.., with the, the ministry there, and then with, what was it, G'? What's it called, the, the owners?

[Inaudible comment]

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Global? And then, I've gone to Congress, spoke to HUD, right at the table. It was five of them and it was one of me. I had Danny Jones on the, on the line, who was the Assistant.., maybe the.., no, the Acting City Manager, Assistant or something, at the time. We spoke for about.., the meeting was about forty-five minutes

to an hour, and I told HUD exactly what I thought about them, which I blame them also, because they are responsible to a great extent, on what goes on, on their properties. They're paying money.., they're giving money to the management to maintain proper, healthy living conditions.

Now, let me just say this before I forget. August the 28<sup>th</sup>, is, is a historic day. It was the march on Washington. Dr. King gave a, "I Have a Dream," speech. But Dr. King died a few years later. He died fighting for poor people, and for decent living conditions. It was called the poor people's campaign. Maybe some of you weren't even born then, but it was during that campaign that he was assassinated before he could get it off the ground. Yet, here we are, 2018, and we're still talking about sanitary housing conditions for our people. Now, we protested at Stonybrook until certain things had to happen before we would stop. And some of those things did happen, but after that, it seems like when the spotlight is gone and when the media is gone and when the protestors are gone, we're right back where we were.

**UNK. AUDIENCE:** Yes, sir.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I travelled to Opa-locka because I wanted to see, Madam Chair, I wanted to see a property that they owned, not managed, but owned. That's a big difference. And you saw the pictures of a property that they owned, and own today. They purchased the property and I got some Opa-locka people here, I believe in, was June or July of 2016? Was that the date? Shalanda, was that the date? That Millenia purchased the property?

**UNK. AUDIENCE:** [Inaudible].

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Two years ago. Two years plus. Here we are in what? Kinda approaching mid-August, 2018. The property that they own, the property that they were responsible for, as owners, in addition to management, was to make sure.., you got people with buckets [pause] buckets under air conditioners. Buckets. You saw the pictures, under leaking faucets in their apartment. Owners. I went to another property they manage, which is in Orlando. I'm trynna think of the name, Windsor Cove. Shameful. It's.., whether they are in Opa-locka, whether they are in Riviera Beach, or whether they are in Op'.., or are in Orlando, I've seen the same pattern, as owners or managers. Managers of record, and I question that. 'Well, who's responsible?' 'The manager of record.' They're paid 'x' amount, thousands of dollars to maintain the property. Last but not least, they had another property that they owned, and they own today in Kansas City. The.., I think it's called Englewood. The ceiling collapsed on a 16 year old girl. So, can't no one in this room tell me anything about Millenia that I don't know. But, what I do know, all I need is two votes to sustain the Mayor's veto at the appropriate time. I cannot support Millenia as owners or managers because of what I have seen.

Thank you, Madam Chair.

[Audience exclamation]



**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you. Are there any further comments from Council?

[Applause]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, Madam Clerk.

**17. ITEM NO. 17**

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Ch'... Madam Chair, we're now at Item No. 17.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY: DISCUSSION AND DELIBERATION OF THE FORENSIC AUDIT SERVICES**

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, we do have public comment cards on this Item. The acceptance of public comment cards for this Item is now closed.

[Pause]

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Manager.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** This Items is brought to you based on City Council action at the July 18<sup>th</sup> meeting, where you voted to have a forensic audit, and you, you recommended that Staff bring back a scope of services. What I've provided to you are four, four options that you can consider tonight. The option that I am recommending is Option No. 4, and if you wanna discuss that option or provide additional recommendations or input. I also, earlier in the week or last week, I provided you an email from the Office of Inspector General where he, he offered his services as it relates to the forensic audit for health insurance that he stated that his office would be willing to do. But, as it relates to forensic audit on several different City departments, again, the Option No. 4 is the option that I am recommending, but, you know, if you wanna have additional discussions related to that option, we can at this time.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Miller-Anderson, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** In regards to the OIG looking into the insurance one, that's separate and apart from the forensic audit, per se, because that, you know, the..., when this was brought up, this was well before the insurance came up. So, it wasn't specifically for the insurance, so I guess that is a re'..., the report, or referral to them based on that coming up, as to how they got involved in that?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Manager.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Yes, ma'am. The.., as I stated, they're interested in doing the forensic audit on the insurance piece.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Now, if you wanted, I didn't know if you wanted to roll the insurance piece over into this piece or just keep it separate? What, what your desires are.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well, like I said before, when this was first brought up, it was well before the insurance came up.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** That's correct.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And so, I mean, if that.., if the insurance is something that you would've referred to the OIG anyway, that would be appropriate, I would think, to refer that to them to look into. But, at the same time, while they're doing their, their scope of services, if it leads them into that, I don't see... Well, one of the things is with the OIG, I know they take a very long time. I mean, the timing of it may drag on for three, four, five months, when we really don't know how long we would.., it would be before the forensic audit kicks in as well. I just don't want it to be where if they have to go down that road and look at something into the insurance, that we say, 'No, don't do it because the OIG is looking into it,' because the.., maybe I'm not clear, but with the OIG, they.., is that something they always do, forensic audits? Because you're looking for some sort of wrongdoing. Is.., I mean, they would refer it to the State Attorney, is that what the direction would be if the OIG was doing this?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible] make a recommendation [inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Because, if it's the forensic, you know, I mean, they will act.., just like in these options, it's stating that if there was some wrongdoing or criminal activity, or illegal [stammer], fraudulent activity, that would be something that they're specifically looking for, but I don't know that the OIG has traditionally gone in looking for that specifically when they do their reporting.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** If I may interject. They typically do. They do an evaluation of systems, they do an evaluation of what was possibly done improperly, and what negligence there was, and they provide a report. And, in some instances where there is a direct indication of, of sever wrongdoing, there has been a recommendation...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** To the State Attorney.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...to the State Attorney's office on behalf of the client. So, they would go in and do a very complete and thorough review, they would look at our systems, what was in place at the time and, and I, I believe that.., that that was a part of the conversation. And I, I'm not opposed to pulling the insurance piece out. That is just my, my, my comment on it. But, I know that...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** [Inaudible]...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...they do a very thorough review and whatever recommendations that need to be made on behalf of the organization, they put it to you in a report and they make you aware of what.., you know, they, they give you the findings, they ask you about.., they, they give you an opportunity to address how you are going to cure the findings and then they move forward.

Councilwoman Botel, I hear you. May [stammer].., you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Thank...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I was doesn't done yet.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** And sh'.., oh, one moment.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** I...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** One moment, please. Councilwoman Miller-Anderson is not done.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So, okay. And that's fine with the insurance piece, with the OIG, if that is something you would've done anyway. You know?

With the different options that we have listed here, I just.., I noticed that in Option 4, you mentioned doing it just between 2013 and 2017, whereas, the other options had.., going it.., going back to 2008. What was the.., why did you select a different timeframe for Option 4?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** We can expand the timeframe. I just.., in, in rea'.., reading that option again today, we can also stretch it out to.., through whenever they finish the audit. That was just a, a start date that was recommended but we can expand it prior to the thirteen'.., the Fiscal Year '13 date, I believe was originally in there, but just know that, you know, the costs...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** ...are gonna go up.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes. Right. I understand that. It's just that Option 1, 2 and 3., or, at least 1 and 2 had 2008...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Right.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...and Option 4 was 2013.

With the... I did notice on one of the..., on Option 3 though, we..., it has Forensic Audit Citizen Advisory Committee. Can you..., are we familiar..., is there another city that has done something similar like this or where di that part come in at?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** That that was one of the options that the Finance Director recommended.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** I know there are various advisory committees that sit on..., that served, like, on audit committee or budget committee and I'm not sure where he pulled that information from, but that, that was one of the items that he had recommended.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** A question to..., on, on that forensic audit. Just the Forensic Audit Citizens Advisory Committee, because I know that the City of West Palm, at one point, operated an overall audit committee. So, there's a suggestion here just for the forensic audit, or are we talking in totality for an audit committee?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** It was just the forensic audit committee.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Oh, okay. Are you..., do you still have questions?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Do I have another second time to come back?

**UNK:** [Chuckle].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** You, you have...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I'mma hold...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...a second time.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I'm trynna strategize here.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Are you timing?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Nobody else was being timed. I was watching.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Why are you not timing?

[Inaudible comment]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** We just put the Resolution [chuckle] in place.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** She hasn't been timing nobody. Uh-uh.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I'm good.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Continue please.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** No, no, no. I'll come back.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yeah.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Botel, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Thank you. I have had [call breaking up]...

**UNK:** She's breaking up.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** You're, you're, you're quality is very poor. We can hardly make out what you're saying, Councilwoman.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Let me close [breaking up].

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I can't hear her.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Something to do with the connection. [Pause]. While we're trying to get...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Is that better?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...our technical... Try again, please.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Is that any better?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** That's a little better.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Is that better?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Just a little. Go ahead, proceed. We'll see if we can make it out.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Can you hear me?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Better, yes.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Okay. I have been in communication with the Inspector General and just this afternoon, he said that he would be happy to, number one, conduct the audit [inaudible] the insurance situation. And, I think that we should move as expeditiously as possible to get that done, as long as we all agree that that can be sectioned out from the rest of the audit.

I do think, however, I, I, I like Option 4. I, I like the idea, however, [inaudible] Option 3 [inaudible] provide for citizen oversight. I think there are a number of people in the community [breaking up] communication with two of them are who are, or who have been themselves in their work lives, financial auditors and they have offered their services on a volunteer basis. So, I think that we [inaudible] people in, in the community and take advantage of volunteers. But, I just hope that the Inspector General will also weigh in on, on the RFP so that we would know that we [inaudible] his backing [inaudible] RFP and perhaps even [inaudible] either select a firm or, or actually [inaudible] on our behalf.

So, I think that we oughta begin, first and foremost as I, as I [inaudible] with using the OIG, his office, to do the audit for the insurance portion of it, and then moving forward, if we can, either we [inaudible] rest of it, or [inaudible] craft the RFP.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you. Chair Pro Tem, I believe you asked to be recognized.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes. I think that the dates should go.., run through this year.., this year as well. I don't.., if we go back any further than 2013, I.., my understanding is that, you know, we would just be taking up a big debt. Anything that we're looking for, or that they're trying to show us that we are off the path or something wrong, it will lead them into certain directions and lead them... And, by them, I mean the auditing company because, as far as the health sit'.., the health insurance situation, I have no problem with the, with the OIG handling that. That's, that's, that's fine. But, for the rest of the audit that we're doing for the, for the City, I think that if we start with a, a small amount, if you will, and just mere fact of following the dollars and the money, it's gonna tell them just how far they might need to go back, and if, if they can get the answers they need in, in a small volume, we will have the answers. If they have to.., if we look like we have to go back further, then that story will reveal itself as well, and that's just how.., that's just how following the money works and is going to work. So, I think that doing it any further than 2013, I think... When you say up to 2017, I still think that this year, 2018, needs to be included in that so we can have a up to date audit of what's, of what's going on. Because we're at the end of our fiscal year, as it is. Madam Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Are there any other comments? [Pause]. So, the question becomes, we have been provided with three options, and I think that before we engage any further, we'll go ahead and hear the public comments and come back for final discussion.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Fane Lozman, Mary Brabham.

**MR. F. LOZMAN:** There is another option that you guys all forgot about. And that option is the Auditor General of the State of Florida. The Auditor General, at the request of Liz Wade, went to the Joint Legislative Audit Committee [inaudible] 2006 and talk about all the corruption and misconduct that was going on here. The Joint Legislative Audit Committee, which had Atwater on at the time, and Pricilla Taylor, they directed the Auditor General of the State of Florida to conduct an audit of the City of Riviera Beach. That report was 2000-075. In that report, it talked about the jazz festival, it talked about the tiki bar, it talked about all kind of mis'... It talked about excessive legal services, over \$800,000 was being spent on legal services outside the City of Riviera Beach, and all these areas of misconduct and misappropriation of fees. Then..., that would be for 2007-075. I have a copy of that on my phone. Once that audit was done, the City had the chance to respond to the audit findings and then, within eighteen months, they had to do a follow up order. And the follow up audit was report 2009-060. So, this is done at no cost to the City. The Mayor, you oughta contact somebody at the Joint Legislative Audit Committee, talk about this million..., over \$1,000,000 worth of, of insurance fraud or whatever you wanna call it,. You oughta talk about we don't have a definitive proof but there's an investigative reporter who's saying that there's fraud as far a..., there's been tremen'..., hundreds of thousands of dollars of legal fees that have not been paid by the insurance company, they've been paid by the City in my case. So, they're working on that story to try to confirm that to see if that's true 'cause Degraffenreidt says it's only been \$100,000. Apparently, it's hundreds of thousands, if not more. So, I think, just on the insurance alone, gener'..., Mayor, I would call up, reach out to the Joint Legislative Audit Committee, say you want them, you want the State of Florida Auditor General to do an audit and then we don't have to have our forensic auditor..., forensic audit.

Now, the, Members up there that have not read those reports, you can download 'em off the internet, or I can email 'em to you, but that's the way to go. We should not have to pay any money, have the Auditor General of the State of Florida come back and do what would be the third audit in the last eleven years because the City is still having a, a tremendous financial misconduct that you could be paying insurance for people that are dead or been fired for years, that warrants intervention by the state to take a look when somebody that's really specialized in that. So, I would say we're not gonna spend any taxpayers money, we're gonna go back to the Auditor General and say we still got some issues, we want you to look at it. And then, if there's criminal finding, then the Auditor General refers that directly to the State Att'..., no, excuse me. If there's criminal findings, it goes back to the Legislative Audit Committee, and then they refer it to the State Attorney for a criminal investigation, which they did. I have a copy of that letter also.

[Time]

**MR. F. LOZMAN:** It was signed by the Joint Legislative Committee, then it was sent to [inaudible] asking for a criminal investigation. So that's the way to do it.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Mary Brabham.

**MS. M. BRABHAM:** Mary Brabham. Mary Brabham. Brabham, Riviera Beach.

What was Option No. 4?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam City Manager?

**MS. M. BRABHAM:** What was Option No. 4?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** We'll address...

**MS. M. BRABHAM:** Okay. You will address that? Okay. You also made mention about Option No. 3 and that's pertaining to the Citizen's Advisory Committee, with the forensic audit. The OIG, we, as residents, we've been watching this too. Because we said that in order to put the house in order here, that we..., you, as leaders, you need to do the things that need to be done, in order to put this house in order, and put it on a new course. This is what we, as citizens of this City as said. And I'm not banking on any election, I'm banking on the things that we need to do now to put this City in order.

So, that was the question that I wanted..., those two things that I wanted to a'..., answered, and I also would like to know what departments that you all came up with to have, you know, if we proceed with this forensic audit done here. This City needs it. We do need it. The OIG, let them do what, what their part..., what they're supposed to do. We need some indepthness in this City. This will be a course for this City, and stop just trying to just parlay it out, because this is what has happened with the leadership from then until now. Now, you'll also..., it's going in dialoguing on how far back? We say as far as it needs to be done, to bring it up to speed. This is worth it. It is worth it for the City, and it, it is worth it for we as taxpayers. It is a big [inaudible] investment for our City. It can nothing can take the place 'we putting things in order. So, whether you sit there or whether you do not sit there, the City will be on a course, and perhaps we will not deviate from that course of leadership. You have..., you sit at the helm now, so it's time to do the business at hand, and do it right. And not half...

[Timer]

**MS. M. BRABHAM:** ...step it, but to do it right.

Thank you.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair that concludes public comments on this Item.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** There is a question and Ms. City Manager, would you give a quick overview of what Option 4 is, please?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** The scope of work for Option 4 included Human Resources/Risk Management, it also included the review of existing controls and compliance with controls, identity areas of risk or fraud and misconduct and recommend



improvements and best practices. It rela'.., it also included [stammer] systems testing. This says when evaluating City systems, the contractor will take into consideration the impact of access controls, software controls, network and data control. It also included cash testing. That included cash receipts, revenue collection, accounts payable, treasury, budgetary compliance. And since you all are considering the OIG for the risk management piece, I wanted to add benefits exposure, including but not limited to, health, life, dental and dependent care insurance. The.., also, as it relates to Option 4, the final report would include an, an evaluation of the City's internal accounting and operating controls, review compliance with these controls, evaluate risk or fraud and misconduct, recommend enhancements to strengthen the City's practices and additional recommended practices and resources, i.e., personnel equipment technology.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Do you have any further questions or comments?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** With the... I, I did, you know take a look at the information that Mr. Lozman brought up about the state, but my only concern with that is that, that was done and, you know, I don't know that anything really changed because I am looking, there seem to be still some similar patterns that continue beyond these years. So, I, I'm.., obviously, I don't wanna spend any money but I don't feel it'll be a waste of money. I, I know before we talked about it being an RFP, but that's what we're looking at, right? And I think, at the time, I talked about having an RFQ qualif'.., looking at the qualifications where they would do the presentation to us and then we would select the people from there. And so, as opposed to doing the RFP. And if I'm not saying that properly, can Mr. Ricky Little, kinda tell me the difference between the two, and how that would look and play out?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam.., do you mind if...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** ...I call...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...Manager.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Mr. Little, if you would come up, sir.

**INTERIM PROCUREMENT DIRECTOR LITTLE:** Good evening, Council. Ricky Little, Interim Director of Procurement.

The difference between the RFP and the RFQ, the RFQ actually gives us a list of qualified vendors that would actually perform the service versus the RFP which does similar things, but it also includes a price proposal for actually doing the work. And, as it stand with the Council doing selection of the actual vendor, that's not appropriate.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mhmm.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** With them doing presentations with...

**INTERIM PROCUREMENT DIRECTOR LITTLE:** Prese'... Presentations should actually be done to the selection committee.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mhmm.

**INTERIM PROCUREMENT DIRECTOR LITTLE:** And, as I understand, Council Members are not part of any selection committee.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** That's correct.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** That has happened.., other municipalities have done presentations before. What's the difference... When we've done presentations before.., well, I don't think when I was here, but I've seen them done before, before the Council. So, how is that different?

**INTERIM PROCUREMENT DIRECTOR LITTLE:** In my opinion, that was inappropriate.

**UNK:** Mhmm.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** But other places have done it, but it's not illegal?

**UNK:** We don't do...

**INTERIM PROCUREMENT DIRECTOR LITTLE:** Uh...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Hmm?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** We don't do it on the county side.

**INTERIM PROCUREMENT DIRECTOR LITTLE:** No.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** You know, our Council was never involved because your Council.., your Commission is ma...

**INTERIM PROCUREMENT DIRECTOR LITTLE:** Is the voting.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** They are the voting...

**INTERIM PROCUREMENT DIRECTOR LITTLE:** Correct.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** They approve the final contract, so if we were doing it, we were doing it improperly.

**INTERIM PROCUREMENT DIRECTOR LITTLE:** Correct.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I've seen in, I think Delray?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Mhmm. Where that was done as a presentation for their large redevelopment. So, I would really like to know how they got away with doing that, and nobody called 'em out on it. I, I want to look a little more into that, because it's been done in quite a few places but if it's been done improperly and illegally, then obviously, I'm not supporting that but I don't wanna find more information on that, 'cause I've seen it done many places. Yeah. It's been done. I, I can't say that it was right or wrong, but I've seen it, so I would like to find out a little more about that. But, so, okay. So, that takes care of that part of it, but I'll, I'll look into that part. Thank you.

Now, with the Option 4, I hear the 2013 is there. I'm just still curious as to how did we define that date? Where's that date coming from? Why...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** It's, it's five years. It will be five years if you...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So, you are gonna include...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** ...include '18.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...the 2018?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Right.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** You will go through to the...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** If you went the...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Oh yeah. That is on there. I, I would like to probably go back a little... I was looking at '10. I know that would probably boost up the price of it, but to go back maybe to, like, 2011 and then maybe if they're able to kinda give us a price range of how it would differ between 2011.., starting at 2011, 2012 or 2013.

And then, for Option, including... Looking at Option 3, it says letter 'c', the capital 'c' towards the end...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Mhmm.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I didn't see that... No, it is there, I'm sorry, it's there. What was left out of 4 that was in 1, 2 and 3? Was there anything? That was different? Or was 4...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Well...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...just a combination of everything?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** It was a combination of everything. It didn't have the committee.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Right.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** It does not include the committee.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Right.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Um...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And.., I know what the part was.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** And then it added the testing of the following areas.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** It was.., Option 3 in the first paragraph. If we could add this. It may be in 4 but it's not as clearly defined as it is in Option 3 on the first paragraph,

'These findings and recommendations shall include cause and consequence of any instance, if any, of criminal activity, illegal acts and potential fraudulent activity or civil liabilities.'

That's not in 4 though, right? I didn't see it.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Where, where, where are you at in the...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** The first paragraph of Option 3.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Last sentence.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** The la'.., yeah. The last sentence.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Oh, okay. Alright.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I would like to...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** We can move...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...see that in 4.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** I agree.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And, I think that's it for me. I mean, I would be in support of 4.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yeah. Thanks.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Botel, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Thank you. In order to move this process forward, would it be possible to make a motion this evening that we ask our City Manager to begin the conversation with.., more than begin conversation, that we enter into an agreement with Office of the OIG to conduct the audit in regard to the insurance portion? And then, we move forward with the RFP for the rest of it? I would like to make that motion.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Did she make...[stammer]. Did she make the motion?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** You are mak'... We, we can'... Your, your, your comments are broken, so, I did make out that you would like to make a motion for us to move forward with office of the Inspector General on the insurance piece and...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes. I...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...issuing an RFP for the second? Is that your motion?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes. I would like to make a motion that we move forward with the Office of the OIG for the insurance portion.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Second.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It's been motioned and properly second. Madam Clerk.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Botel?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Hubbard?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Davis Johnson?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Unanimous vote.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Alrighty. The second part of that is to.., do you want to go ahead and state your second motion?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes. I make a motion that we [inaudible] 4, with the addition of the items in Paragraph 1, mentioned by Councilwoman KaShamba Miller-Anderson, and the addition of a committee of

[Inaudible dais comment]

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** ...laypeople from the community, with experience as outlined.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** S'... well...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I will second for discussion 'cause there was something else I added. I don't know if that was changed.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** So...

[Pause]

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Can I talk?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Miller-Anderson, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. [Chuckle]. For the... I, I had mentioned about going back to 2011 [stammer], but that wasn't a part of the motion. So...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** I'll amend my motion.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. And then, in regards to your Forensic Audit Citizen Advisory [stammer] Committee, as listed, it.., I did have a concern with B, if we're going to add that, I would like to see it be City...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** I agree.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...residents.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** I'll amend.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Madam Chair?

[Pause]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Chair Pro Tem, you're recognized.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** The Citizen Advisory Committee, I think we should actually wait on, on that piece, until we get it straightened out with the professional auditors, as to not to convolute the process. Not to keep the community out, but to allow them to be able to come in and work diligently and focus on what we're do'.., what we're asking.., tasking them to do. I say going back to 2011.., if it's not any... We should have a base somewhere for them to start from, based on the audits that we've had. So, when they get to a point where they have to go further and further back, I think we should wait until.., if that comes up, if that becomes the issue, if that.., if this, if this particular point begs that they need to go further and further back, then again, I say that that will show itself. That will come up. But, if there's no be gap in cost, then, let them do it, but I think we need to find out what the cost would be.., how much adding additional years would bear to this project.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** That's what I...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...I said. That's what I said.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Botel, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Can we issue the RFP with two different times?

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Two different times...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** [Inaudible]...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...for what, please?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** One, one going back to 2010 and one going back to 2013?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** One, one....

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** To get an idea of the costs involved in the different years?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Chuckle].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Well, [chuckle], in the, in the RFP, you, you either place your dates...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Waste of time.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Or you don't. You can't put in alternative...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...timeframes. You need to state going forward, so that they will know how to bill. They're not going to do two billings based on two separate times. So, if we're going to...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yeah, but I'm asking... I'm asking if we can issue an RFP asking for a response for one timeframe and a response for another timeframe. I mean, when we issued an RFP for the Marina Distract, [breaking up] example, we said, 'Give us back an, a proposal for this set of [breaking up] and a proposal for [breaking up], if you would.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Miller-Anderson, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** But what I said earlier was saying, if we can have them break it down, you know, what the cost would be from 2011 and 2018, 2012 to 2018, within their proposal to give those amounts by the.., by that category. Because...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** That would be fine.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** That.., I mean, that's kinda what I'm, you know... We're not putting out separate RFP's for each one of 'em, they would just give an itemized, you know, breakdown of what it would cost if they did it from 211 to 2018 or 2012 to 2018, or 2013 to 2018. We wouldn't need anything beyond that because we're, we're definitely gonna stick with the 2013 to '18, so within that proposal, just give a breakdown of it.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I will put, put the RFP criteria and design in the hands of the Procurement Department. If we want to break it up into.., if you want to put the different timeframes [pause], so be it. I, I am just not in support of issuing multiple RFP's. We need to keep it clean, we need to keep it...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Uh-uh.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** We need to make sure that any proposer that is responding is clear as to what is being asked, because that will ultimately ref'.., reflect the responsiveness of the solicitation responses, so we need to be clear and very focused as to what it is that we're looking for. So, am I understanding that we want to be able to request a price from 2011 to 2018, 2012 to 2018, and 2013 to '18?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes.



**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Ca'... Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Chair Pro Tem, you're recognized.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Can we...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Chuckle].

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...ask a lot simpler if we ask from 2013 to 2018 and what would each additional year be?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I mean, that's...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** [Inaudible]...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** That's what I'm saying, yeah.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** That's, that's exactly what we're saying.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yeah.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** But...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** That's exactly what we're saying. But, because we are the subject matter experts, I think that...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** [Chuckle].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...they understand...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** [Chuckle].

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** [Inaudible] understands what...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...we're trying to get to.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Thank you.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** And, and not professing or wanting to be the subject matter expert, what I'm saying, in an effort not to put out..., and I don't think anybody wants to put out more than one RFP, I was just saying it could be..., we could ask the question

[stammer] from 2013 to 2018, and to.., and at the same juncture, ask what would each additional year cost?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** And I think that that could...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...be done in one...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yeah.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...in one RFP.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yeah.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** We're saying the same thing.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** That's what we're saying.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** We are. We're saying the same thing.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** And, and your point is taken.

[Chuckles]

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Alrighty.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** But I don't think we should [inaudible]...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...[inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Pardon?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** I think it should [inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** City Manager understands, just so that we are clear, the City Manager understands the direction that this Board is going in and so, therefore, we would heavily rely upon the City Manager working in conjunction with the Procurement Department to make sure that this solicitation mirrors exactly what it is that the Council is requesting.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Chuckles].

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yeah. And I would say that because, you know, if we got...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Chair Pro Tem, you're recognized.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** If you got a department listed...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Your mic.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** I was only saying that because if you got a department listed, you don't want to make..., put them in a compromising position. That's what I was pointing out, but thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilman Davis, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Never mind.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** You..., you don't...

[Chuckles]

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair? We'... Madam?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Miller-Anderson, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** We will see the solicitation before it goes out to make sure that it captures everything that we're talking about?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** If, if that's your desire but...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I would like...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** That is not our...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Go ahead.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...process. Go ahead.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** One question. What, what was the final decision on the committee? Did you all...

[Inaudible audience comment]

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** ...do a consensus or no?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Well, you know here...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...here it says in Option 3 that, 'During the course of the investigation and prior to a final report being presented,' but I want to know that during the.., I wanna know what will be.., what will be the actions of this committee during the investigation. Because, what I do know is that an outside agency is not going to take its lead and its direction from an advisory committee, it is going to specifically be the language that is contained in the RFP and the scope of services that will ultimately come out in that contract.

So, can someone please explain to me what the role, during the course of the investigation, will be for the advisory committee? And, I can understand the final report and having some input and having some questions, especially if these individuals are going to be experienced and knowledgeable in sound business practices and financial management, for public sector financing. So, can someone please tell me what the role will be during that time, so that we are all clear both community and Members of Council?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Mr. Sherman.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** And while he's coming, Madam Chair, I just wanna quickly announce while he's coming.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** You're recognized...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Family and Frie'...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...Mr. Mayor.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you. Family and Friends tomorrow night. That's the 16<sup>th</sup> of August, 6:00 p.m. We have a terrific eight-piece band. You don't wanna miss it.

Thank you, Madam Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, Mr. Mayor.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** [Chuckle].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Sherman.

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** Yes, Randy Sherman. Alright. Randy Sherman, Director of Finance.

The way, the way..., again, I went out and I pulled RFP's and RFQ's and, and pulled the language. I'd have to go back to my notes to find out which community I pulled this from and maybe we could contact them to get a little bit more detail. But, the way that I read this, the first time I went... Is that this is sort of your working day to day group that the auditor would work with, the auditor would report to. They would review findings, they review drafts, they could follow up on any questions or anything, but ultimately, at the end of the day, it says audit committee and the auditor that would bring the audit forward to you, you know, for final Resolution. Again, in West Palm Beach, they do have a, I'll call it a full time audit committee. You know, it's volunteers, it's appointments, that meet maybe monthly, but the internal auditor brings the reports to that committee before the reports are finalized. It's just a.., it's another set of eyes, it's, it's people who are focused only on this one issue. So again, it, it's, it's just kind of a go-between, between the auditor and the Council. But again, I could, I could back to my notes, find out what community I pulled this one from and I could pass that information on.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** He's talking kinda close to the mic.

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** Batteries, we need batteries.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** [Inaudible].,

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Davis, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Mr. Sherman, I, I believe, and I could be wrong, the Port of Palm Beach did do such, such like that, similar about two or three years ago, so you might wanna reach out to Manny as well, at the Port of...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...Palm Beach. Yeah. I think they...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** We, we can do that.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...I remember they put something together.

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** That's a good idea.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Does anyone else have any questions or comments? So, I would like to have Mr. Sherman provide that information to us. We can look at the incorporation of it, but there certainly needs to be clarity of, of row.

So, at this point, there was a motion and second on the floor.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** With the modification.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** With the... [Pause]. With the modifications for the inclusion of language for Option No. 4.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Right.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** That was the motion.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I don't [inaudible]...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** There was a motion and a second...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...on the floor with the requested modifications, the adding of the language from the last sentence of Paragraph...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Chuckle].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...I'm sorry, Paragraph 1 of Option 3, adding that to Option 4. The other issue was looking to obtain multiple date ranges and the inclusion of the Citizen's Advisory Committee. Were those the changes? Were those the modifications?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes. With the exception of Item B.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I mentioned the years? With the, with the modification of the years.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Madam Chair?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Chuckle].

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** [Chuckle]. I don't think we should add...

[Chuckles]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Chair Pro Tem.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** I don't think we need to add the advisory committee to this one.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I apologize.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Can we bring...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Well, we can bring the, the advisory committee back, it does not need to be a part of the RF'.., the RFP.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Right.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** So, can someone amend the motion to extract that, please? Maker'.., who's the second of the motion?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I was the second.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Are you willing to remove your second so that the maker of the motion...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes. I [inaudible]...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Maker of the motion, would you please remove the creation of the...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** In the essence of moving it forward, I'll remove that...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** You're removing what specifically, for the record please?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** The committee.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** I will remove the requirement to add the Citizen's Advisory Committee.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay. The motion...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...has been modified, the second still stands?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Clerk.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Cou'...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Davis.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** All I...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I got one question. I haven't asked much, but who's gonna be responsible for reviewing these Minutes and this video and making sure they put this information together properly?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** So, I read Minutes.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Stammer].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** And I follow up with the Staff. And I believe that the Clerk should be reviewing Minutes, and providing, especially in light of the language and what has been requested...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...she will be responsible for extracting that out and making sure that it is clear.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** In translation?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** In both.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Of the intent.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** There is no.., as you are aware... Madam Chair, my apologies for not asking for the floor, our Minutes are verbatim, so there will be no interpretation. The words that have been stated, as far as the motion is concerned, is the words that will be included in the Minutes.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No. I'm talking about...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, ma'am.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...I'm talking about the RFQ.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Mhmm.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Anything further, Mr. Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I'll just.., I'll just wait for it to come back.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, sir. Madam Clerk.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Botel?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?



**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes, ma'am.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Hubbard?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Davis Johnson?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Unanimous vote.

[Inaudible comment]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Discussion by the City...

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair? No. We still have Item No. 18 and No. 19.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I'm sorry, 18. Oh, I'm so sorry.

[Inaudible dais comments]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I Forgot about that.

**18.**

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Item No. 18.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY: DISCUSSION AND DELIBERATION ON THE ACCESS TO PHIL FOSTER PARK**

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** ...which was added on by Councilperson Davis.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilman...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...Davis, you have comments.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So, I guess, you know, we put this Item on the Agenda to definitely show the community that we.., they have our support. The same type of energy that we just put into that last Item, I would like to see us put into our residents. I don't.., I would like to see that, you know, we get an expedited meeting with the county

staff to talk about what's been taking place. And spend the same type of energy that we spent on this Item, on protecting and taking care of our residents to have access to Phil Foster Park.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** And, just to see how long it's gonna take..., maybe next month, really soon. At least, something..., a meeting scheduled that's between the two staff members to at least, to get the dialogue going. I would..., I definitely will offer my services to be there with the two staff, and maybe Commissioner Valeche, or Mack Bernard, whoever it is that represents that District, to at least say, 'Hey, this is a situation that's been reported. We need someone there tomorrow morning,' you know, 'making sure that..., [stammer] this upcoming weekend, making sure that this is being handled properly before we get to a meeting. I mean...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I agree.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yeah. The same type of energy we put in this last Item, we need to put into our people.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, sir. Are there any comments from the Board with regards to that discussion? I do want to state for the record that I immediately reached out to Commiss'..., Vice Mayor Mack Bernard and Administrator Baker to make them aware of the issues that we have been facing here, as it relates to Phil Foster Park. I just sent a correspondence to ask the Vice Mayor if he had scheduled the meeting because the initial meeting is to be held with Administrator Baker and the appropriate staff. And, as soon as that information is provided, I will certainly share it with the City Manager so that she can share it with the Council. So, you know..., so that we can plan to, perhaps, have the Vice Mayor and Administrator come before us. I do know that our Parks Director, Mr. Blankenship, has indicated that he would be happy to reach out to the park rangers, but I think that we need to elevate this a little higher than the park rangers...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Mhmm.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...at this particular time. So, I would suggest that we invite Vice Mayor to come as our District Representative, but we will also need to have a meeting with the representatives who is responsible for Phil Foster Park, and have him come before us... Invite him to come before us to discuss our concerns.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Davis, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** And, could we have Ms. Hall, maybe, at that..., maybe available, maybe for a phone conference during that Staff meeting, so we can make sure that it is very clear about what happened back in 2017 versus this year? And, we have a

very clear direction about where we wanna go as a City, and where all this information came from so we can make sure that, you know, everybody's on one accord.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** She has been invited. And I believe that...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...Vice Mayor Bernard reached out to her.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Good.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** So, she is included and we are on top of that.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Mayor, you're recognized.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I'm sorry, Vice Mayor to Mayor, I certainly would like to be involved in the discussion since we have a Mayor from the county and the Mayor for the City of Riviera Beach should definitely be involved as well. So I.., please include me in whatever.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** We will.., you will be included as we are inviting him to come here before the Board, since we all cannot accompany each other to the meeting, so we are going to do a.., have him come.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** If there's a conference call, make sure I'm on, on the conference call, Madam Manger.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Sure.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, Mr. Mayor. Any further discussion on that Item? [Pause]. Thank you, Mr. Davis.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** You're welcome.

19.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Item No. 19.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY: DISCUSSION AND DELIBERATION REGRADING ATTORNEY BEDARD**

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, we do have one public comment card on this Item. The acceptance of public comment cards for this Item is now closed.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Degraffenreidt [pause], at the last meeting, I believe there was a request to have you look into the changing or removing of Attorney Bedard from services. Do you have a report for us?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** [Inaudible]. Sorry.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** I, I, I can report to you that I have not found an avenue to do that successfully, without subjecting us to liability. And I respectfully request the opportunity to give that opinion to you in writing.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay. Are there any other comment'..., other comments or questions?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Miller-Anderson, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** What type of liability are you suggesting? Is his contract not the same as the other attorney contracts where they can be...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** There's some laws that address the relationships between clients in a business setting and, and their lawyers. There is a particular tort that I'm concerned with us subjecting ourselves to, as well as the limitations imposed on me, as lawyer, by the Florida bar, in getting in the business relationships of my colleagues. And I'd like to express that in writing so it'll be clear.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** But..., what..., well what was discovered, or what were you working on in the past couple weeks since Dr. Botel asked for that information to be looked into?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** I was trying to find a way to approach the insurance representatives in a fashion that would reflect your desire to remove Mr. Bedard from the case without imposing upon his business relationship that exists already, with the insurance carrier.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Question.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Chair Pro Tem, you're recognized. Councilw'..., wait. Before you begin, Councilwoman Miller-Anderson, did you have anything further...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** No.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...to ask?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Uh-uh.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Counc'..., Chair Pro Tem, you're recognized.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** While, while the attorney is being paid by the insurance company, he still represents us at this point. Is that correct?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** You are par'..., you all are the parties he represents, yes.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** So, [pause], his business relationship exists because he is representing us and we have a carrier that covers our legal obligations, so he still kinda..., he still works for us?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** But there's a point when he starts representing their legal obligations to you.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Their legal [pause] obligations...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Because they're the insurance carrier. There's a point in the litigation where they are required to pay for the representation, and the judgment if one comes. But, in the process of doing that, after you've covered your deductible, for lack of a better word, they pretty much control the litigation.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** The insurance company?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Yes, ma'am.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Do you think that we could [pause] get some type of opinion from this insurance company, or position from this insurance company, as to where their head is in this particular case? Right now?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** [Inaudible].

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Yes, ma'am. I probably..., actually, I know where their head is.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** So, maybe they can send us something, or maybe they can come and, and present to us...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** If.., if I'm understanding you correctly, you would like them to express to you what their position is in response to the Supreme Court's Order?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Right now, what are they...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Yes.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...thinking? Are they thinking they wanna move forward? Are they thinking that they want to go...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** From my last discussions, the impression I got is th'.., they indicated to everyone on the conversation, they're prepared to move forward.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** So, when you say everyone on the conversation, who was all on the conversation?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Me, Ben, Lina, the adjuster and.., and the adjuster.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Move forward to what?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** I... So, my concern, I guess, is if we.., if, if they're saying that we don't have any say in the matter, then I think they should more or less...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Express that to you?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Put that into writing or reduce that to writing, or either come here and...

[Inaudible comment]

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...and state that particular case. If that's the case.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** I will, I will present that request to them.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Because, my only concern is Mr. Bedard dropped dead, they would have to get us another attorney.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** They would pro'...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** No.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Yes, ma'am.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**UNK.:** Wow.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** I mean, that was just a, a...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I'm sorry.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...that, that's probably was an extreme example, but you know what I mean. [Inaudible]...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** But they have other...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...wishing them any bad luck.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...lawyers that were working with them, so. They would probably still use the same firm.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Firm?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Yeah. [Stammer]. He would not be...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Firm.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...the only...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes. And they might...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** You know, it's not...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...and they might not. But...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Yes, ma'am.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Okay.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** I will ask them to present to you what their position is.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Okay. Thank you.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Yes, ma'am.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Mayor, you're [inaudible]...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I, I do believe..., and, and I understand..., I hear what the Attorney is saying, but after all we are, we are the..., we're the one paying the bill..., we're the client, here. We, we should be in charge. And I've, I've dealt with insurance companies before, and if there was an attorney that the insurance gave, gave me and I didn't want that attorney, I'll just say I'm just not satisfied with him. Period. And then, they would give another..., give, give me another attorney. That's the way it worked for me several years ago. So, if, if this Council is not satisfied, for whatever reason, with that attorney, we should have the right to say to the insurance company, 'We're not satisfied with attorney A, or attorney B, and we would like for you to give us another attorney because we don't, we don't..., no longer want or need the service of that particular person because we are not satisfied. And I believe that the Council has that right to say that. Point, blank. That's what I think.

Thank you.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Botel, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Thank you. My concern is that the insurance company, notwithstanding, it seems like we're throwing good money after bad here. We, we need to get out of this case as quickly as possible and get..., and be done with it, and put it behind us. And it seems to me that Attorney Bedard is not [sight] feeling the same way. And..., so, I would encourage us to do whatever it, it takes to get out of this situation and, and move forward without Attorney Bedard. I, I don't know that having the insurance company present to us is gonna make any difference because won't it be through the [breaking up] of Mr. Bedard? I mean, will someone else from the insurance company be coming to tell us some different story? I don't know. It's a dilemma.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** An further comment?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** I'm done.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Miller-Anderson, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So, essentially, we're..., we won't..., we would be stuck with someone and don't have any say about that? I don't, I don't quite get that. Where does that come from where we're not able to determine if we're not satisfied with someone?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** The contractual relationship you have with...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Pull your mic...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Pull your mic, please.



**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** The contractual relationship you have with the insurance carrier, gives them the authority to control the litigation when they're on the hook for paying the money. For lack of a better description.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Except [inaudible]...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. Can...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** That's just a business decision.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Can you just provide that., what that language is in writing?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** I'll provide you the language and I'll have them present it to you.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** You said you wanted them to give you a response and that's what I'm going to do.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you. Madam Clerk.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Fane Lozman.

**MR. F. LOZMAN:** Fane Lozman.

I had a conversation with Lina Busby. Categorically, she said the City could fire Bedard and the insurance company has to provide somebody else to represent you. The insurance company has to pay for your litigation expenses, they have to provide you with a pool of law firms, then you choose one. Hypothetically, if Bedard was a racist, they can't force a majority black City to have a racist representing them. If Bedard were a pedophile, if Bedard was engaged in criminal conduct, you as the client, pick the attorneys. And these are the options you have, provide us with a pool of law firms, we will pick one or we will hire our own attorney and you give us an hourly reimbursement that you give, give Bedard, and if that covers it, fine, if not, we'll pay the difference. 100%, as the client, you have the right to pick your attorney. Okay? And for this man to say something different is completely contradicted by Lina Busby, it's completely contradicted by lawyers I've talked to all over South Florida. You are the client. This man., you should tell the insurance company., show them the video and say this man we're firing for cause. He disparaged the City, he disparaged the Mayor and he's done a horrific job. For twelve years, he has got'...

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Ma'...

**MR. F. LOZMAN:** He lost a state eviction case.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Hold, hold on one second. We're gonna pause your time. Please do...

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...out time.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** The time is now 10:02. What's your pleasure?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Extend the meeting for fifteen minutes. Mr. Lozman will pick up his time at 1:53 and we will continue with the business.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Second. Uh...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It's been motioned and properly second. Madam Clerk.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Botel?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Hubbard?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Davis Johnson?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Unanimous vote.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**MR. F. LOZMAN:** Bedard and his cli'.., and his.., Roberts.., they lost the [stammer], the state eviction case in March of 2007. This case started in August 2006. When they lost that case, they were embarrassed. They lost to a pro se guy in a three day jury trial. From 2007 until today, they have been obsessed with harassing me, with dragging on a case that could've been tried years ago. Why did they drag it on? Because the more [stammer].., they, they harassed my mother, my brother's a Lieutenant Colonel in the Air Force, my old girlfriends, they got my finan'.., they all kinds of stuff, but every time they do something, they can bill more and more money and harass me. This case could've

been decided years ago but they drugged out the discovery, they drag it out. Bedard wants to try this case all over again 'cause he can bill the insurance company another millions dollars. But that's not why we're firing him, we're firing him for what he did to the Mayor, we're firing him 'cause he did a terrible job at the Supreme Court as co-counsel. We're firing him because Lina Busby says, 'Sure, you can fire him. You're the customer. You tell the insurance company, you bring us someone else.' This guy should've been fired by the insurance company after what he did to the Mayor and the City in that federal courtroom. And you should give him direction, say, you know something? We can fire him and why not Lina Busby or you represent the City? You were on the Supreme Court brief, you know the case. You should make a motion today to fire this guy for cause and you tell the insurance company to bring you back a pool of other law firms and you'll pick one, or give you an hourly reimbursement and you'll go hire another attorney. But Bedard does not want this case to settle. He will never settle this case. That \$100,000 settlement was in bad faith. I got legal bills of \$800,000. Okay?

And the other thing is, local investigative reporter says that what this man is telling is not true. That the City has spent hundreds of thousands of dollars on this case, not a hundred grand. Or is it a hundred grand every year? A hundred grand one time? They're saying it's a hundred thou'..., hundreds of thousands of dollars un'...

[Timer]

**MR. F. LOZMAN:** ...in unreimbursed costs.

And the other thing is, I gave this money..., I gave him..., I helped pay the legal fees through the citizen's..., to fight the Marina, so I think he's conflicted out, because he represented me, he represented Lynne Hubbard, he represented other people in the Marina deal. So, I think he's conflicted out to have anything to do with me, because he represented me and these other people, and if he keeps on doing that, then we'll file a complaint with the Florida bar and s'..., and ask why you're even getting involved in this because you represent..., because you had represented me and the other people in the Marina issue.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**MR. F. LOZMAN:** How's that?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Attorney, you're recognized.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** For the record, indicate that I never took a dime from Fane Lozman...

**MR. F. LOZMAN:** Oh, yes you did.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...and never represented him. And if you would like to make that complaint to the Florida...

**MR. F. LOZMAN:** [Inaudible].

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...please proceed.

**MR. F. LOZMAN:** I sure will.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**MAYOR MASTERS:** What's the... Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Mayor, you're recognized.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I, I would like to know, what is the, the, the desire of this Council, as it relates to this particular attorney? Do..., is it..., does the Attorney wanna give the direction to the attorney, that we have now? And I'm just asking a question.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, Mr. Mayor.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I don't have a...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** [Inaudible]...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...vote and I can't make anything happen.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, Mr. Mayor.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Chair Pro Tem, you're recognized.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** I think, [pause], Madam Chair, and to the Mayor. I think we should get the letter from the insurance company, or the position from the insurance company as to [pause] a response to our desire and to what, what are they looking..., what is their position right now? What are they looking to do? Are they looking to move forward or do they..., you know? Just get some feedback, some feeling of their position at this, at this point. While we don't, you know, don't appreciate what Bedard did and if we, you know, if we..., even if they move forward, it doesn't necessarily have to be with him.

The second thing is, I'm trynna see where we are with our right to choose an attorney even if they have to pay for it.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Is there a consensus to have that action go forward, on behalf of obtaining information from the insurance carrier before making a final decision?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I can wait.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay. So, we will allow the Attorney to provide the correspondence as indicated.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Question.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Miller-Anderson, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Is there a time for him to bring it back? We're saying for the next meeting? 'Cause...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** The next meeting?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yeah.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Degraffenreidt, we will anticipate and expect a response from the insurance company. Actually, you probably can give that to us in writing before the next meeting. Because you're going to do a confidential correspondence. So, we will have that, two weeks? One week?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Sure. Yeah.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes, to which?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** I, I.., I can probably have both those of things to you in two weeks.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay. So, we will expect it.., each of Member of Council will receive a correspondence.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Yes, ma'am.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Botel, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Thank you. Could we also get a report on the amount of money?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Of what?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Sure. She wants to know the amount of money.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** We spent, with regard to this case.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** You can hear good.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Pardon?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** You can hear good.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** [Chuckle]. It's that grandma hearing.

[Chuckles]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Alrighty. That concludes that discussion. We are now.., it is eight minutes after, and we have remaining discussion by City Manager, City Attorney, Council report.., committee reports and statements by Mayor and Council.

## **BOARD APPOINTMENTS**

### **DISCUSSION BY CITY MANAGER**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam City Manager.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair, the special meeting for Monday, August 30<sup>th</sup>, that has been confirmed?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** 20<sup>th</sup>?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** I mean, yeah. August 20<sup>th</sup>? That has been confirmed, right?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I believe I...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...passed the...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...document to you.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** That is confirmed.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** So, if you would please look at your calendars so we can reschedule the capital workshop.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** We can...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** ...have that workshop on Tuesday, August 21<sup>st</sup>, if your calendars are clear. On Wednesday, you already have scheduled, the CRA meeting and budget workshop. I'm not sure how long that's going to take.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilman Davis, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Is there any reason why we have to have this meeting on Monday, with Stonybrooks?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes. We would like to have a discussion and to be able to hear from..., as Mr. Gagnon presented, it was going to be an update. The principals will be here, so we...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Stammer]...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...we need to have that meeting.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Here's my...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** [Inaudible]...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...issue.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...issue.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Here, here, here's my issue, and it's just me speaking.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mhmm.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Last week, we met Monday, Tuesday and Wednesday. We st'..., we keep..., we have more budget items that we need to discuss. This issue needs to be resolved. So, you're saying come Monday, Tuesday and Wednesday again, of next week?

**UNK.:** No.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** We're saying that on Monday, we have USD.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Correct.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** So, the special meeting will be held immediately following. So...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...we're not asking anyone to come out a second time.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** And then.., now we are asking for, potentially, the capital.., the capital...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** [Inaudible].

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Workshop.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** That was...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Budget workshop.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ... that was set for Monday already, correct?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Right.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** But there's the suggestion. We have CRA. We can confirm with CRA...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...the amount of information so that, since we will be here, we can address it at that time.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Not Tuesday?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** How much time do we need for our capital projects budget without rushing through and to be able to entertain the questions of Council? Do we have an idea?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Are we following the Resolution you just passed?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** [Chuckle].

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** [Chuckle].

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** We've been [inaudible] that time a couple times.



**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I, I think that one would be.., we could relax for that because we...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Right.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...do have to...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...ask questions about dollars.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Couple hours? Two hours? Two hours?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** How long is the agenda for the CRA meeting?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Not long.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** So, they have their regular meeting and they have their budget workshop after their regular meeting.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It's not posted yet so I can't tell you.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Maybe we should have the capital budget [inaudible]...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Tuesday?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Well, let's see here.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Or, we could do the 27<sup>th</sup>. August 27<sup>th</sup>. Nope.

[Inaudible dais comments]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** And you need to transmit by when?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Oh.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** That meeting is scheduled for September 6, so we would have to post on Thursday the 30<sup>th</sup>.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So, Tuesday the 21<sup>st</sup>? Why can't ya'll come back?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Tuesday the 21<sup>st</sup>, is what she was asking for.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I'm fine.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I'm fine with the 21<sup>st</sup>. Mr. Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yeah.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay. Councilwoman Botel, are you..., does your schedule allow for...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible] Tuesday...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...the 21<sup>st</sup>?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...Tuesday.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** [Breaking up] wide open.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I'm sorry.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Absolutely.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Absolutely?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you. 21<sup>st</sup>. So, we need a motion to schedule that? We will entertain a motion please to schedule...

**UNK:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...the capital plan budget workshop.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** So moved.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Second.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It's been motioned and properly second. Madam Clerk.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes, ma'am.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Botel?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Hubbard?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Davis Johnson?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Unanimous vote.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay. Anything further, Madam Manager/

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** No, ma'am.

### **DISCUSSION BY CIT ATTORNEY**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Discussion by City Attorney.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Nothing [inaudible]...

### **CITY COUNCIL COMMITTEE REPORTS**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Are there any City Council committee reports? I have one I will defer to the next meeting.

### **STATEMENTS BY THE MAYOR AND CITY COUNCIL**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** We will start with our statements by Mayor and Council, starting with the Mayor. Mr. Mayor, you're recognized.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you, Madam Chair. This'll be about thirty seconds. I, I know you really have a tough job as, as Chair and all the Chairs do, but I, I think that..., I don't think we should allow anyone to come in and defame a prominent attorney like Willie Gary. I don't know what he was talking about but I do know that Willie Gary is very prominent attorney and I just wanna put that on record, that when people come here and defame whoever, and whatever they say, they sh'..., I don't think they should have the right to just say something and they don't have any evidence of anything, they just blab it off. But, Willie Gary, I don't want us to be sued by Mr. Gary because we...

[Inaudible comment]

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...someone made a statement. So, I just wanna say for the record, that Willie Gary is very prominent and he has a business up the road, Stuart or somewhere up there, and he has taken a lot of wonderful cases for a lotta people, and have won them. And I respect his, his legal expertise. And experience.

Thank you, Madam Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, Mr. Mayor. Councilwoman...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** That was it.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...Botel, any comments?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** I'll pass.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Davis, any comments?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I'll pass 'til the next meeting.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** We have one, one...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** [Chuckle].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...minute.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I'll pass.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Chair Pro Tem?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** I'll have to pass since there's one minute.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I'm going to take this one minute to say the following...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Alright. There you go.

[Chuckles]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I would like to thank the City of Riviera Beach Staff from City Administration, Police and Fire, Public Works, Parks & Recreation, Procurement, every department, Human Resources, and our volunteers for helping to present a wonderful ribbon cutting and soft grand opening. To the Concerned Mothers Association, to the Southside Coalition and to the Family of Mr. and Mrs. Richard and Annie Brooks. We thank you all for the contributions that you have made to the children of Riviera Beach and we are certainly looking forward to a grand opening later in the year. But thank you to each and every Staff person. If I had your names, I would call them individually, but do know that collectively, I am thanking you for all that you did to make that a wonderful event. And I would be remised in not thanking Mr. Stephens for being there to record the momentous occasion. So, thank you all from the very bottom of my heart and I'm sure that this Council agrees with me that a job was well done.

## **ADJOURNMENT**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** There being no further business, we stand adjourned.

[Gavel] [End of video]

**City Employees, Public Comment Speakers and Others**

LLOYD BROWN.....MR. L BROWN  
TIFFANY WILLIAMS .....MS. T. WILLIAMS  
RODRIGO HILDAGO .....MR. R. HILDAGO  
NORMA DUNCOMBE .....MS. N. DUNCOMBE  
FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR RANDY SHERMAN  
FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN  
  
HUMAN RESOURCES DIRECTOR EUREKA IRVIN  
HUMAN RESOURCES DIRECTOR IRVIN  
  
SUMMER INTERN TIANA DENNARD.....MS. T. DENNARD  
ACTING DIRECTOR OF DEVELOPMENT SERVICES JEFF GAGNON  
ACTING DIRECTOR DEVELOPMENT SERVICES GAGNON  
  
PORT OF PALM BEACH VICE CHAIR PEYTON MCARTHUR  
PORT OF PALM BEACH VICE CHAIR MCARTHUR  
  
PORT OF PALM BEACH EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR MANUEL ALMIRA  
PORT OF PALM BEACH EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR ALMIRA  
  
JIM MOORE .....MR. J. MOORE  
FANE LOZMAN.....MR. F. LOZMAN  
MARY BRABHAM .....MS. M. BRABHAM  
JENNIFER LAGOMASINO\.....MS. J. LAGOMASINO  
STEVE WHITE .....MR. S. WHITE  
DEBORAH HALL-MCCOLLUN .....MS. D. HALL-MCCOLLUN  
WILLIS WILLIAMS .....MR. W. WILLIAMS  
NATHANIEL WILCOX .....MR. N. WILCOX  
DERRICK DORSETT .....MR. D. DORSETT  
SUZANNE ALLEN.....MS. S. ALLEN  
WILLIE LEWIS .....MR. W. LEWIS  
DR. LYDIA SMITH.....DR. L. SMITH  
TOYA JACKSON.....MS. T. JACKSON  
HORACE TOWNS.....MR. H. TOWNS  
ANDRE HENDERSON.....MR. A. HENDERSON

DORETTA PAULK .....MS. D. PAULK  
INTERIM PROCUREMENT DIRECTOR RICKY LITTLE  
INTERIM PROCUREMENT DIRECTOR LITTLE

**APPROVED:**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**THOMAS A. MASTERS**  
**MAYOR**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**TONYA DAVIS JOHNSON**  
**CHAIRPERSON**

**ATTEST:**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**CLAUDENE L. ANTHONY**  
**CERTIFIED MUNICIPAL CLERK**  
**CITY CLERK**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**LYNNE L. HUBBARD**  
**CHAIR PRO TEM**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**KASHAMBA MILLER-ANDERSON**  
**COUNCILPERSON**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**JULIA A. BOTEL, Ed.D**  
**COUNCILPERSON**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**TERENCE D. DAVIS**  
**COUNCILPERSON**

**MOTIONED BY:** \_\_\_\_\_

**SECONDED BY:** \_\_\_\_\_

**L. HUBBARD** \_\_\_\_\_

**K. MILLER-ANDERSON** \_\_\_\_\_

**T. DAVIS JOHNSON** \_\_\_\_\_

**J. BOTEL** \_\_\_\_\_

**T. DAVIS** \_\_\_\_\_

**DATE APPROVED:** OCTOBER 3, 2018