

**CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH  
PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA  
SPECIAL CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES  
HELD IN THE CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS  
JULY 17, 2018 @ 6:00 P.M.**

(The following may contain unintelligible or misunderstood words due to the recording quality.)

**CALL TO ORDER**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Good evening. I'd like to call the Special City Council Meeting of July 17, 2018, to order. Madam Clerk, roll call, please.

**Roll Call**

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Chair Tonya Davis Johnson.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Here.

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Pro Tem Lynne Hubbard?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Here.

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Councilperson Kashamba Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Present.

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Councilperson Julia Botel?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Here.

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Councilperson Terence Davis? City Manager Karen Hoskins?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Here.

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Deputy City Clerk Jacqueline Burgess is present. City Attorney Andrew DeGraffenreidt.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Here.

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** You have a quorum.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you. We'd like to stand for a moment of silence followed by the Pledge of Allegiance led by Councilwoman

Kashamba Miller-Anderson.

**Invocation**

**Pledge of Allegiance**

(Everyone stood for a Moment of Silence with the Pledge of Allegiance being led by Councilperson Kashamba Miller-Anderson.)

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Before we begin our meeting, I've asked Interim Chief of Police Michael Madden to come forth just to share some information about the issues that we've been faced with, the two shootings specifically.

**INTERIM POLICE CHIEF MADDEN:** Good evening. Mike Madden, Interim Police Chief. As you're aware, we had a recent spike in shootings in the city ending last night, and unfortunately today we had two homicides, one last night, one, uh, at 11:00, uh, this morning. Uh, you know, this isn't something that we haven't dealt with before. It is never easy on our community. It's never easy on our officers who have to respond to these incidents. Uh, these are -- these incidents are very new. They're less than 18 hours old. Unfortunately there may be some details that I cannot share with you, uh, but I want you to know that, uh, our investigators are hard at work as we speak, uh, trying to find those persons who, uh, committed these crimes to hold them accountable.

We are taking measures to increase staffing. Uh, as of 6:00 tonight, we have more than doubled the number of officers on the street. Over the next 30 days through the remainder of the summer, you know, we -- you know, we do typically see a spike in crime during the summer months. Uh, so rest assured that we do have the number of officers, the resources available to hopefully impact the recent spike that we're seeing.

I do want to urge the public to cooperate with us. Uh, we -- we cannot solve these cases, we cannot impact violent crime in this community without the public's assistance. Uh, you know, we have received cooperation. Uh, in addition to the public's cooperation, we have a tremendous amount of technology that has aided us in our investigations. Uh, you know, we did have a stabbing incident that occurred this past weekend. In a matter of eight hours, due to the technology that we have, we were able to identify the suspect and make an arrest within about eight hours. Uh, we have all those tools and those resources at work on these most recent cases. Uh, we have, you know, cameras and license-plate readers. We have them in the right places. Uh, unfortunately these incidents still do occur.

Uh, you know, I do want to share a phone number, uh, for the public because,

again, we do need your cooperation in order to, uh -- to solve these cases. Uh, you can call this number and remain anonymous. Uh, we would like you to call Crime Stoppers. That phone number is 1-800-458-TIPS. Uh, you can also call your non-emergency number at 561-845-4123.

Uh, again, in the police department, as of right now it's all hands on deck. We have our command staff, our officers, uh, out there trying to make a difference, uh, and, you know, if you have any questions I'll -- I'll answer the ones I can, uh, but we are doing everything we can to make sure that the community stays safe. These incidents that we had, they were -- you know, they were targeted attacks. They were not random acts of violence. Uh, you know, it's likely that these persons knew, uh, the individuals and, uh, you know, we're gonna do everything we can to bring them to justice.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, sir.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Mayor, you're recognized.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you. Um, Chief, as you know, we had a couple conversations earlier today, and thank you for your cooperation and just being right on top of this. I want to commend you for being at the scene last night, and I know you were there for a long time. And it's always good to have the Chief to be -- to come to the scene, and I think there was some cooperation with the, uh, Sheriff's Department. When I got there I saw some sheriff cars there. And that's the kind of effort that it takes, is the law enforcement coming together, working together. I'm very encouraged that we're gonna -- and I know you mentioned at the Alpha Bravo with doubling the officers on the streets, but I do want to say to the -- to the community that, you know, it -- it takes all of us, not just the police, takes the neighbors. You got to -- I think Kashamba Miller-Anderson had something going one time. You see it, tell somebody or -- what was it, say it --

**INTERIM POLICE CHIEF MADDEN:** See something, say something.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yeah. And we have to do that and we have to work together, because if you had 1,000 police officers it wouldn't be enough. They can't be everywhere all the time and at the same time. And as you stated, we have the cameras in the right place, but we just don't know what's gonna jump off, where it's going to be.

But I just, uh, had an interview -- I was actually here. I wasn't late. But, uh, had an interview a few minutes ago with Channel 12 and we talked about some things with them. And one of the things that I do want to announce and

take the opportunity and the privilege to announce to the community, um, I'm led to -- by the spirit to engage the entire community. We're gonna have a Town Hall meeting on crime and violence in Riviera Beach Friday, uh, at 6:30. And if you have any ideas, if you have any suggestions -- I don't know it all and I'm sure none of us up here, no one in this room, know it all. We are always open to any ideas, any suggestions, any plans or any projects that you have that you think would -- would work and -- or work better or work as well, and working together with us, please come Friday night at 6:30, uh, to the City Hall. We will have a Town Hall meeting. The Chief will be here and others will be here to discuss, uh, the crime and the violence in our city and what we as a community can do together. As John Kennedy said, "Ask not what the country can do for you." And in this instance, ask not what the community can do for you but we can do for our community. Thank you, Madam Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Are there any other questions or comments?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** No. Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Thank you.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you, Chief.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Any person who would like to speak on an -- on an agenda item, please fill out a public comment card located on the table directly outside of the Council Chambers and give it to the staff prior to the item being presented to City Council for discussion. Members of the public will be given three minutes to speak on each regular agenda item. In no event will anyone be allowed to submit a comment card and/or speak on an agenda item after the resolution is read or item is considered. We do want you to be aware that if you happen to be in the middle of your statement, your closing statement, at the end of your three minutes, you will be permitted to complete that thought.

### **AGENDA APPROVAL**

#### **Additions, Deletions, Substitutions:**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Are there any additions, deletions and/or substitutions, Madam Manager?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** No, ma'am.

**Disclosures by Council**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Are there any disclosures by Council?

**UNIDENTIFIED COUNCILPERSON:** No.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yes. Office of Mayor has been in contact or has -- has contacted today our State elected officials to invite them to the, uh, Town Hall meeting and I will have discussions in the next day with Bobby Powell and with, um, (unintelligible) because this is their community as well, elected to be. Thank you, Madam Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** You're welcome, Mr. Mayor.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** And also Dr. Robinson from the School Board.

**Adoption of Agenda**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Is there a motion to adopt the agenda?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** So moved.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Second.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It's been moved and properly second. Madam Clerk?

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Councilperson Botel?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes.

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Pro Tem Hubbard?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes.

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Chair Davis Johnson?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Unanimous vote.

**Comments From the Public on Consent Agenda (Three Minute Limitation)**

SPECIAL CITY COUNCIL MEETING  
American High-Tech Transcription  
Largo, FL 33771

JULY 17, 2018  
2600 East Bay Drive, Suite 215  
727-535-1066

**CONSENT AGENDA**

**MINUTES**

**RESOLUTIONS**

**COMMUNITY BENEFITS REQUESTS ON CONSENT**

**END OF CONSENT AGENDA**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Public comments shall begin at 7:30 p.m. unless there is no further business of the City Council, which in that event it shall begin sooner. In addition, if an item is being considered at 7:30 p.m., then comments from the public shall begin immediately after the item has been complete -- concluded. Any person who would like to speak during public comments, please fill out a public comment card and give it to the staff before the public comments section is announced.

**UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

**PETITIONS AND COMMUNICATIONS FOR FILING**

**AWARDS AND PRESENTATIONS**

**PUBLIC HEARINGS**

**COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC - 7:30 PM Non-Agenda Item Speakers  
(Three Minute Limitation)**

Public Comment should be restricted to issues, matters, or topics pertinent to the City of Riviera Beach. Please be reminded that the City Council has adopted Rules of Decorum Governing Public Conduct During Official Meetings, which has been posted at the entrance of the Council Chambers. In an effort to preserve order, if any of the rules are not adhered to, the Chairperson may have any disruptive speaker or attendee removed from the podium from the meeting and/or the building, if necessary. Please govern yourselves accordingly.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** If you would, Madam Clerk, uh, let's call the public comment cards, please.

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Hannah Snow, Brianna Cason, Jaquilla Murph.

**BRIANNA CASON:** Hi. My name is Brianna Cason and I would like to thank the staff and faculty for the students and I with ACT prep. It was a pleasure attending the ACT boot camp program. I hope the City of Riviera continues the program because the teachers not only taught the students learning techniques but life lessons. My ACT prep teacher Miss Kelly and Miss Newton was genuine and encouraging. They gave the students and I -- they gave the students and I wisdom and hope. Attending this ACT program taught me effective test-taking techniques that I can not only use on ACT testing but other assessment as well. Thank you.

**HANNAH SNOW:** Hi. My name is Hannah Snow. I would like to thank the Council members for giving me and my peers the opportunity to be a part of the Empowerment Program. The camp extended my knowledge about the ACT. Without the camp, I feel like I wouldn't have been fully prepared to take the ACT. I was taught helpful skills and techniques to help get a high score on the camp -- I mean on the test. I hope in the future the ACT boot camp continues to help others. Not only was I prepared to take the test, but there were benefits to help me in the long run.

**DANISHA ELLIS:** Good evening. My name is Danisha Ellis and I am here to speak on behalf of the ACT boot camp that I was so grateful to be in. With this camp I was able to learn not only test-taking skills but life strategies. Not only to take a test, but being in this world is also a test. So I was able to learn how to take a test and be able to get through different tragedies that are going on in this world that I can learn myself and go out and teach another youth of my age or someone in the future. With this program, I believe that it shall continue throughout the years for our generations so that they can be able to have the same opportunity as us. Um, not only will they have the same opportunity, but with the next generations we'll be great. We'll be able to make this world a better place. Um, we'll be able to help everyone and I believe that we should -- we all have a voice that should be heard and we all should have education in order to become great in this world.

**JAQUILLA MURPH:** Good evening. I'm Jaquilla Murph. My boot camp experience was very educational but more so empowering. The program ended with me feeling and believing that I could accomplish anything that I set out to do. I also became more aware of the hurdles and pitfalls that I must overcome in order to excel in my academics and life in general. Yes, education is paramount in getting me where I need to be. I am thankful for being given the opportunity to obtain and participate in the program, more so the City of Riviera Beach for executing a program where I can learn and sharpen my skills. I have benefitted tremendously from this program and hope it continues. Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

SPECIAL CITY COUNCIL MEETING  
American High-Tech Transcription  
Largo, FL 33771

JULY 17, 2018  
2600 East Bay Drive, Suite 215  
727-535-1066

**AUDIENCE:** (Clapping).

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, young ladies.

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Andre Henderson, Roseanne Brown, Willis Williams.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Henderson, Miss Brown, come forward.

**UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER:** Miss Henderson is --

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** If folks are not -- if they're not in place, we'll just go in the next name and they'll be recycled. Miss Brown.

**ROSEANNE BROWN:** Good evening, Mayor Masters, uh, City Council, City Manager --

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Good evening.

**ROSEANNE BROWN:** -- and staff. My name is Roseanne Brown. I live at 1090 -- whatever that street is, Big Torch, uh, Street.

The program that employs city youth, I commend you on that program. I am only here to encourage you to keep the program going. Everything that you do -- you know, kids start out as infants and then there's growing pains and all that kind of stuff. Some of us are no longer infants and we still suffer growing pains. The program is going to suffer growing pains, and I encourage you to work with it, provide whatever remedy is necessary. But it is a great program. I am here to speak in support of it, particularly the boot camp.

If you've done anything with public education, particularly with children of color, you know that standardized tests are prepared by people who don't look like them, who don't come from the same cultural foundation, and often they don't do as well on these tests as they could do if the tests were prepared by folk who had some cultural sensitivity to them. So consequently, many of our young people, even those who are honor students, find themselves in twelfth grade and unable to -- they have all the credits. Some of them have 26, 28 credits, only needing 24 to graduate, but because they have not passed a standardized test they cannot get a standard diploma; they get a certificate of completion. This is a kid who could do very well in college. They could get one of the City's scholarships. They could qualify for that, but because they cannot pass a standardized test they don't do it.

And I stand as a witness. I had a granddaughter who was an honor student, but she could not pass one part of the FCAT. She was in remedial reading,

**SPECIAL CITY COUNCIL MEETING**  
American High-Tech Transcription  
Largo, FL 33771

**JULY 17, 2018**  
2600 East Bay Drive, Suite 215  
727-535-1066



an honor student, and the teachers were laughing at her because she was in there, but she had some kind of a phobia and she couldn't pass the test. The boot camp prepares city students to be able to take the ACT in place of a standardized test. And it's amazing, they do much better on that test than they do the standardized test. So that in itself is a reason to keep the program going and continue to help our students. And I'll come back at the next meeting and talk to you about the scholarship program, which that's why I need them to do -- be in the boot camp, so then they can qualify to get one of the scholarships that you so generously award. So I commend you on the program and encourage you to work out the growing pains and keep the program going. Thank you so much.

**AUDIENCE:** (Clapping).

**ANDRE HENDERSON:** Uh, how you doing? Um --

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Good evening.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Please state your name for the record.

**ANDRE HENDERSON:** Andre Henderson, 1160 West 26th Street. Um, I guess my -- my -- the quote I said before -- I said this quote before. "A nation or civilization that continues to produce weak-minded men" -- women you can put in also -- buys its spiritual death on the installment plan."

I'm just telling you, this goes back to people -- Miss Hubbard, if this was your program, you should have had boots on the ground in this and finding out what's going on. If you say children are the most important thing, our most important commodity in the city -- uh, I just -- I look at it and I just go, it looks like somebody had bad intentions to take money. That's what it looks like, whether -- I can't prove it. I can't -- that's what it looks like. I'm not saying it's true, but I'm saying what it looks like because it doesn't make any sense.

You got \$174,000. You got 30 -- 32 enrollees. Well, it was stated at June 6 we had 60. Someone needs to find out why we lost 28. That's 14,784 if you take the 528 that got paid.

So I just need to find out why is it always coming back to a situation where you're -- you're running into this -- this speed bump where you always -- there's always something coming up and it just needs to -- it needs to stop. It just seems like either -- either you're inept, you can't do your job, or you don't know what you're doing in the sense of you don't have people in place, because they got up here and they made you look silly. You couldn't -- Mr. Richardson, uh, Miss Poole -- um, I also wanted to say this real quick.

I wanted to thank Mrs. Grimsley when she did, um -- she -- she did say, uh, to -- to Miss Poole she respected her. I thought that was a perfect example of what we need in our community. I like that. But no one knew who they were reporting to. That's your responsibility. They didn't know. If this is your baby right here, you gotta go through it from -- from -- when -- when you put it on the table and you say, okay, here it is, and it's in your district, you gotta make sure it's there.

And like I said before, I come from a military background. If this happened, someone would have been on the carpet. Somebody needs to find out why these kids were put in this position because it sounds like to me there could have been more kids in this program but it was run so badly that kids couldn't take advantage of it. And that's what my question -- I want to find out why this wasn't done more professionally and what happened to those 28 kids, why they couldn't get through their -- their paperwork. Who was doing it? Because somebody didn't have an email until a week ago. Miss -- Miss, uh, Patsy didn't have an email at all. This is you. And I think it's -- I think it's sad. But we need to stop this and somebody needs to account for this because these are our kids. And we always talk about it. We just had two kids -- two individuals killed in 48 hours. And then you sit up here and you talk about we care about them? Well, when you treat them like this, where's the care?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Madam Chair, please, that is --

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Willis Williams.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** That is awful.

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Reverend Burrs. Willis Williams, Reverend Burrs.

**WILLIS WILLIAMS:** Good evening. Willis Williams, Riviera Beach. First of all, let me commend the entire Commission on putting black kids to work. It's a very important task to keep our kids off the streets during the summer months. You can look all around the country and that is the most heated time it is, in the summer months.

So let me say to all of you, I don't think none of you did not want this program to not work. Unfortunately there were some snags. There will always be some snags in the get-up. But now that you found out what the snags are, you can work through that. This \$174,000, I got a couple of questions I'd like to ask. Will this money roll over for next year so that we'll have some money in the budget, number one, so we won't have to get started late?

The other thing would be is that, uh, I heard some -- someone said that, uh, the kids went to West Palm or did they live in Riviera. I'm gonna refer that to the attorney. If it's tax dollars, regardless of whether it was spent -- the tax dollars was raised in Riviera, whether it was raised in West Palm and a kid wanted to go to something, I think it's always -- if it's tax money, the kids should be able to go wherever the tax dollars are being spent. Am I right?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** It's defined by the public purpose with respect to the motives and determinations of the legislative body. It could be this legislative body, the County legislative body, but they determine the course participants. Philosophically, however, I agree with you.

**WILLIS WILLIAMS:** Okay. Uh, so I'm just saying that these kids need -- they -- they all need our help. Regardless of whether they live in West Palm or they live in Riviera, they all need -- and Mrs. Hubbard, it just seems to me -- and, you know, I'm a -- I'm a stone supporter of yours, uh, from day one and I believe in what you're doing. It's just -- it seems to me that you just -- you're trying to put too much on yourself. Direct authority, give it to them, and they should run with it. If they can't run with it, run them out the door. It's just that simple. It's just that simple because they're gonna try to chop your head off because you're trying to just do too much. Thank you.

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Madam Chair, we had one -- three people that tried to turn in cards afterwards.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I believe the last card that we accepted was Miss Brown. That was it.

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Just to let you know there was two before she came up.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay. So --

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** The reason why I did not accept it.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** No one made me aware of that. We will allow the comments, but moving forward, moving forward, please understand once public comment -- once public comment has been closed, no additional cards will be accepted because there is a period of time that the comment cards are open. So at this point we will accept all three, but moving forward we're going to continue to follow our process.

**REVEREND BURRS:** Madam Chair --

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Reverend Burrs?

**REVEREND BURRS:** -- uh, I'd like to, uh, thank Miss Botel for saying that she would support this program for next year. And it is a wonderful program. I remember when I was employed for the City, I worked at the Public Works and I was a supervisor and we had a similar program. We had children working in every department within this city from junior high up through college. And this nitpicking, it seemed like -- the peoples who are trying to help this program who were standing here, it might discourage them not to get involved next year.

**UNIDENTIFIED COUNCILPERSON:** Absolutely.

**REVEREND BURRS:** At that time we had the program, we had children working in every department within this city, and thank God we had the council united behind it and not nitpicking. Like Willie said, there's gonna be some problems regardless. The nitpick at the council at that time worked together made it successful. This is nothing new. It worked before. Don't discourage the people who are trying to help make this program successful. And that's what it seems like now, somebody shooting darts at somebody because they don't like somebody and they want it to fail and blame somebody.

These are our childrens. We want them to succeed. We want them to get their high school diploma. We want them to go to college and come back to the city and get a job, but that seems like it's not working either because how everybody from everywhere but Riviera Beach. So don't sit here and seem like you want it to work but you don't want it to work. And that's what it seems like to me here, nitpicking. And Mr. Mayor, you put your card in late, uh, Reverend Masters. So you put your card in late.

Take the money what's left and use it over for the program that (unintelligible) put on for the scholarship for -- if need be. So keep the program going. It's nothing new. You're gonna have some flaws everywhere. Somebody gonna mess up. Right here now among your own employees you got problems. So we're talking about children. We had children working from junior high to college in every department within this city. So won't you all stop nitpicking and trying to find problems and blame somebody else and bring it together? Work it out. And that's what it seems like. Ray Charles could see through this and he been dead, that you all are nitpicking at something because you don't like somebody else.

You can't have all the ideas. Work with the good ideas (unintelligible) not yours because somebody gonna get the credit. It's a shame for you all to sit there and nitpick this for hours and still saying how we gonna make it work better next time. It's a problem with you all. If you don't like somebody up there, get outside and go out and fight it out out there and don't do it up here on this -- on this -- on this dais.

The citizens are looking at this all over the city, all over the county, all over the state, seeing how this city is fighting. Seem like the worst council in the whole state. You all fight every time. Get on one issue and discuss it for a whole hour. Do your homework and you won't have to do all that discussion. Do your homework and stop fighting over some -- let -- help -- help these children go to -- get their education. Help them get a job and move forward. Thank you.

**UNIDENTIFIED COUNCILPERSON:** Thank you.

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Mary Brabham and Darlene Cruz.

**MARY BRABHAM:** Good evening. Miss Mary Brabham.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Good evening.

**MARY BRABHAM:** To all of the insiders as well as the outsiders, I just want to say thank you on behalf of myself and my beloved husband, Mr. Angus Brabham, Sr.

The residents has been marvelous. I am okay. I've been vacationing, traveling and just having myself some down time, but now I see that you're making me thrust myself back in here. It won't be good this time. You haggard Mr. Brabham, but I'm ready for war now if you come invading on my territory.

I heard some disturbing comments about Stonybrooks, but let me be brief here. I put a card in. Others put their card in, too, and I know it for a fact. When the item was being discussed, she tells me that I can't speak, but the others spoke. Yes, these are problems. It's functionality, not skillset and professionalism in this program. It was some councilmembers that sat up there and said, oh, this year it was gonna be better because you railroaded Mr. Jonathan Evans, and that program last year was a top-notch success.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** That's right.

**MARY BRABHAM:** And when you take Miss Valerie Grimsley character and professionalism, you bother with the whole community because we know her work skills and her ethics.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Right.

**MARY BRABHAM:** Who was the coordinator of this program? I want that answered, 'cause it wasn't Miss Grimsley. None of this was Miss Grimsley work. We -- we know the work. We know the history. Who was the coordinator? And you're trying to throw poor Mr. Greg Richardson underneath the bus. Shame on you. Take that accountability, whatever has been done,

**SPECIAL CITY COUNCIL MEETING**  
American High-Tech Transcription  
Largo, FL 33771

**JULY 17, 2018**  
2600 East Bay Drive, Suite 215  
727-535-1066

use it as some building blocks to build on it and make yourselves better. Make us better. Don't throw Mr. Richardson underneath the bus. We don't like that. We know what has happened here. If we made some mistakes, own up to them and we all can do better. Because the seeds that we plant, they grow. Either they will grow, if they are not watered, and we are supposed to water those seeds.

I don't come here with no hidden agenda, but if you make me come into this fight here, we are ready. And in this election here, yeah, I love you, but I don't love some of your ways and habits. Because, see, Mrs. Brabham is still working. I'm fresh. I'm fresh now. I'm fresh now. So -- but I love you. I've called the Manager office a couple times. You haven't called me, Karen. I'm still waiting. I'll be waiting when the Manager position comes up.

And one more thing. Last night was said from one of the representatives sits down on that end, I've lived in this city here all of my life and I would not to have my name or my reputation tainted. What do you think about the reputation that you did toward Mr. Evans? He has a family, too.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Miss Brabham?

**MARY BRABHAM:** And we're not angry for what you did, but it was how you did it.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Miss Brabham?

**MARY BRABHAM:** And I told you that night that you would never live it down.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Miss Brabham?

**MARY BRABHAM:** We won't let you live it down, but you can go back and correct these things here so that we can work together and love you like God say that we're supposed to love you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, Miss Brabham.

**MARY BRABHAM:** We don't want to be hostile, but if you make us hostile, we will finish the job that we set out to do. Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, Miss Brabham.

**AUDIENCE:** (Clapping).

**UNIDENTIFIED COUNCILPERSON:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Darlene Cruz?

**DARLENE CRUZ:** Good evening, Council.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Good evening.

**DARLENE CRUZ:** I won't be before you long. I just wanted to say --

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** State your name --

**DARLENE CRUZ:** -- on behalf of the youth in the city --

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Please state your name for the record. I'm sorry.

**DARLENE CRUZ:** I'm sorry.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**DARLENE CRUZ:** I'm Dr. Darlene Cruz.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**DARLENE CRUZ:** I won't be before you long. I just wanted to say on behalf of the youth, um, of the city of Riviera Beach, I commend the program. I think it's a wonderful opportunity for our youth to have these things in place to help them, uh, where the school system may have failed them, uh, to acquire a high school diploma versus, um, a certificate. Um, I also commend, uh, the Council --

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Please pause for a moment. Would you please turn -- whomever that is, would you please turn that off or step outside of the Council?

**DARLENE CRUZ:** He is outside. The door's open.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay. Could you -- Officer, please -- I'm sorry. Please continue.

**DARLENE CRUZ:** No, I'm --

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you. Please continue.

**DARLENE CRUZ:** Um, I think it's awesome -- awesome that the students were also given compensation for, uh, the Ingenuity program. Uh, that's a program that I -- I love the name of it. I think it's very innovative and creative. Um, I would like to learn more about it. Um, I -- what I hope, my prayer is that

you continue with your efforts. Um, our students, our city residents, we need this program. Um, they need it more so now than ever before.

Uh, and secondly, I wanted to take the time to say thank you, thank you for the initiative, um, and the work that you're doing for the -- for the youth. I appreciate it. I see it, um, the young people that came up to speak on it, they appreciated it and it was sincere. I sensed it. Um, but I want to address how the City can do better. There were protocols that should have been in place. Um, in order for things to run effectively and efficiently, you have to do them according to policy and procedures.

Um, I know that this is a problem not just with this situation but with other situations and issues. There are protocols being broken. There are violations constantly. There are policies and procedures that are not being followed or simply being ignored, and they go under the radar and unnoticed until things start to spring up. Um, I want to ask the City to really look at these issues because when you don't, uh, answer the call on issues like this, they spring up in other places, and I believe that's why we have a lot of the problems that we have now in our city because of the violation of, uh, State laws and policies and procedures. Um, these protocols and standards are put in place for a reason and I would -- I would pray that you will go back and revise, uh, your - - or refresh yourselves with these efforts, uh, and -- and -- and adhere to them because they're there for a reason. Thank you for your time. Have a wonderful evening.

**UNIDENTIFIED COUNCILPERSON:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Are we still in comment?

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** That was it for that comment section.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Miller-Anderson you're recognized, and then Chair Pro Tem.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Um, I just want to basically start off by saying I certainly have always supported any programs that we do for children. Um, as an educator I would not -- I should not be in the field if I don't. And I certainly applaud Miss Hubbard for wanting to get this done. I know on last year she wanted to get it done. It did come to us at a very late date, and so I recall having concerns with approving it then. But because of the way in which we set it up, which where it ran through the YEP, which is an already-established program, it made it a lot more smoother. The program went -- we didn't -- she -- she wanted the 500. We didn't get the 500 because that just wasn't realistic in that short period of time. And so the program did go through Miss Valerie's program. This year we had the intentions -- I know she kept



bringing it up and wanting to make sure that we could get the program going because she still had the desire to employ the 500 kids. And we all supported that, but on the night of having to, um, approve the budget -- and I keep saying this -- back in April, I had an issue with approving something and not knowing what the plan was. And I felt like from that point up until now we really have not been given a whole lot of detail as to how the program was running.

In regards to the councilpeople taking on interns, I was not aware that our department would be taking students on. Obviously I have no problem with taking one on, but I was not aware that we were to take on students. I did receive a letter from Miss, um -- Miss Brooks and -- with a list of like seven or eight kids on it saying that, you know, they would be placed with us, and I had more questions because I felt like I was kind of caught off guard in regards to them coming to work with us because, as we know, the Council is not here on a full-time basis. Um, our assistants are not here on a full-time basis, but they are here during the daytime.

Um, I understand Miss Davis Johnson put in her own objectives for them to complete -- you know, to make sure that they're able to have a successful, um, internship. And I also had those exact same concerns, which is why I emailed Miss Brooks back asking specific questions as to program coordinator or manager or whatever the title was, if you have a program, you should already have established objectives for them to accomplish. I mean, when they come to you, I should not have had to make up what it was they were supposed to do. That should have already been established. And I felt that I just -- I was not prepared to take them on, and so I did not take any students on. Um, would I have loved to? Sure, but I felt like I was kind of caught off guard with that and did not -- and I asked for, um, additional answers. I never got them back from Miss, um, Brooks. So I guess they just decided to not, you know, place them with me and that was fine, too.

Um, the neighborhood attendants, I have a question in regards to those students. I know -- I think back in June we said we had 15, but it wound up being only five and they did not begin until like the first week of July. So if we could have someone answer that for me, um, that would be great tonight. Um, I know when we're -- we're talking about the children, you know, that -- that's pulling at our heart strings, obviously, but that's -- for me, that's not what this whole meeting was about. It wasn't about, well, you know, it was a success, we -- we put kids to work; we -- we helped the kids with their tests; we're helping them graduate. Sure, obviously all of that is important, but that is not -- don't get confused and think that that is what it's all about. This meeting was more of trying to be transparent and let people know what this program was going about.

Basically we were asked back in April to give us some money, and then we just basically went and ran a program and no one knew what the program was about. No one got an update. We were not provided additional information. We did not have an itemized budget in terms of what those items -- other than, you know, the program coordinator gets this amount of money, the interns get this amount of money. And even with those PowerPoint slides they were -- one from April said one thing, one from June said something, and then the one that we got I believe last week said something different.

So it was a matter of just being able to know how the program was being run, um, also knowing that there was a lot of talk out in the community as to how the program was being run and who was in charge. And Miss Hubbard can definitely speak to that, but as a councilperson, I know that we are not to be a part of the day-to-day operations. And the fact that Miss Valerie Grimsley was not a part of this program was very evident. Um, I had several conversations with Miss Hoskins regarding it and Miss Grimsley was not a part of this program. On paper she was listed as the director, but she was not. She was kept out of the loop. And then for people to come up here and say that she's the one that was being reported to, she was not -- she was not the one that was being reported to. And I'm sure Miss Hubbard can explain, you know, how that ran as well. But as a councilperson, if I'm expected to approve a budget -- I said back in April I wanted to know the details as to how the program was going to run and I have never felt comfortable enough the entire time in knowing how the program was run, and so that's why I felt tonight was more of a fact-finding mission to find out what was going on, because there has been a lot of talk in the community.

I do know that I received a text from, um, a community member because on Thursday -- I believe it was Thursday -- I understood there were some parents and students that were upset that they didn't get paid. And, you know, if they already had an orientation from the very beginning of how the program was to run, the expectation should have already been there as to when they were going to get paid and who was to get paid.

Um, the situation with, um, the program being at Riviera Beach Prep, I know that as an educator who dealt with leases with the school district we are -- unless we have some sort of interlocal agreement, we are not supposed to allow any other organization to be on that property. Now, if an interlocal agreement was in place, then that's understandable. If there was a lease done, I didn't see that in the budget. So I know that the district frowns against people coming on their property and not having the appropriate general liability insurance and having the lease to cover them. So if there was a lease that was done, where does that fall in the budget? And if there wasn't a lease done, did we have an interlocal agreement to cover the district and ourselves?

Um, and then in the -- this back-up for the program overview, which is basically something in which I requested. I had numerous questions, so most of the questions were provided -- um, most of the answers were provided on last week. And one thing that stuck out to me, it said that 90 percent attending students are required to participate in at least 90 percent of the classes to receive the stipend. And so a question for me is, did all of those children receive -- who received a stipend, did they meet the requirements of the 90 percent in attendance? And if they did not, why did they get paid when they did not meet the requirements?

And again, I want to be very clear, I always support children. I always support any program we have for children, but do not get confused or get it twisted that it's about that. It is not about that for me at this moment. It is about the running of the program and just being transparent. No one should be in the dark on the dais about how this program ran or how those dollars were allotted. And that was not always fully revealed to the entire Council. Um, there were times I asked Miss Hoskins. Miss Hoskins was not really briefed on some of the day-to-day or the -- just the way the program was running. Um, and so that -- that's my concern.

Um, like I said, I appreciate Miss Hubbard trying to take this on, but I think Miss Hubbard got a little too deep into it, um, and it prevented Miss Grimsley from being able to run the program effectively as she has done in the past. And when -- if I am to support this program on next year, which I certainly want to, but I will not support this program in the manner in which it was brought before us this time. I cannot do it. I will not do it. Thank you.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Chair Pro Tem, you're recognized.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Thank you. The -- first of all, there, um, is no way that I can be responsible for being in the day-to-day contributions to the program. Then to say that I -- if it's my program, I should know this and I should be involved in the day-to-day. One gentleman came up here and said I should, uh, let the staff handle it. That's who was handling it, the staff, from day to day. I volunteered to be a developer, to get on the phone, to go through my Rolodex, to call people, to try to say, "Hey, would you hire one of our kids?" Those type of things. I sent out a letter to the community asking them would they do the -- the organizations that I'm a member of, I asked them, "Would you, uh, ask your boss? Would you, um, see if you can get some positions for some of our kids?" That's my involvement. For -- because maybe the staff that came to the mike did not answer the questions as one would want them to answer them fully.

You know, um, I take exception to Mr. Henderson saying that maybe I'm inept and don't know what I'm doing. I know very well about this program. I know what this program can do. But because -- but because I was not allowed to be involved in the day-to-day running and the day-to-day operations of it, I could not share all of my past or vast experience in this field. So no -- so a lot of things did happen that probably could have been avoided had I been allowed, but I know that the Council is not involved -- is not allowed to be involved in the day-to-day operations of the programs that are going here.

There's a question about whether I should have sat on the committee and helped to choose the people that were running it. I felt that there was nothing wrong with it. No one brought any, um, concerns about it. The reason that I wanted to be in it, because I wanted to know that we had a half a chance, a half a chance of the program being successful.

Why we started at the last minute last year is the same reason we started at the last minute this year, is because every Council meeting it got pushed and pushed back. We were trying to bring this to the Council since January, but for some reason we couldn't get it voted on. All I wanted to do when I first brought it, let's hire the job developers so they could get on the phone, they can beat the streets and start, you know, rounding up the jobs so when the kids get out of school we would have somewhere to place them. But again, we were pushed back, pushed back, pushed back. And again, everybody was able to say, "Oh, you waited too late to start to -- for it to, uh -- to expect to have as many kids as you wanted to have." True enough. You know, it's, uh, like a former speaker said, to pretend you want it to be successful but yet you don't, and to put things and barriers in place.

There's nothing to hide. There's nothing to steal. We had -- the first year there was \$300,000 allotted. We rolled over the balance, which was 174, to the next year. We used what we had to use this year. We left that money to go to the program for the next year. Nobody is trying to steal anything. We have the presentations. We provided back-up. The, uh, City Manager had provided information, back-up. We have given the Council and the community everything we possibly could have about this program. Did some of that stuff change along the way? Of course it did. It did because we were new at this program, adding the boot camp piece, the educational piece to it. So things worked that way. Things have a tendency to, um, not go -- it definitely didn't go as I expected, but I'm still grateful. I'm still glad that it went as well as it did and -- and to continue to build on it.

And as far as Miss Grimsley's, um, reputation and integrity, Miss Grimsley has run a staunch, stand-up program. I have nothing bad to say about the YEP or the Summer Youth Employment Program. I felt that Miss Grimsley and I worked well together in developing it before anybody even came on. We, um

-- so I don't think that there was any -- so -- so there's no -- me for sure, we're not trying to throw -- we're not trying to throw Miss Grimsley or Mr., uh, Richardson under the bus. I'm grateful for the program being as well as it did, for bringing forth, uh, what they brought forth out of the program. And as anyone and as everyone has said, it was -- you know, there really was no reason for it to start as late that it -- that it did start. There was no real reason for that.

The, um -- I spoke about the Ingenuity and the -- and the -- and the credit recovery and how that worked hand in hand. There was not two different programs running. It was, um -- those kids were allowed to get that credit. The HR -- the -- the problem with getting as many kids processed was that the same one HR guy, he does processing for all the City vacancies and it was only that one guy. So all the people that we had were just stagnant, stagnant, stagnant. I think next year we should have a separate person who will process, uh, the applicants for this program. One person was doing the City - - the City vacancies and the, uh, Summer Youth Employment Program. So I can't say anything bad about what he did. He did the best he can.

We didn't get as many people processed as we could have. We had enough people that were trying to get in that didn't get in that could have gotten in. They just didn't get processed. And, you know, it's -- it was just one of -- one of those things, I guess, that, um, I definitely didn't have any control of because I would have said, "Hey, let's hire another staff member for HR."

The, um -- there was -- we have private persons out in the community like Chen Moore, Bernstein and Associates, State Farm, Marriott, McDonald's, other people that -- private organizations that hire kids. They developed what they wanted the kids to take away from the program and what they could offer the kids. I don't see where I should have given each councilperson a template to say, "This is what I want you to teach the kids. This is what the kids should walk away with you." We're different. We're individuals and the kids that work with us are gonna walk away with different experiences, and I don't see where in the program model there should be a template to say you must make sure that they achieve these different things.

We had -- it was said that things change April, June, and July. Yes, things change. We started off with 100-and-something kids. Some kids couldn't, uh, qualify. Some kids, uh, dropped out. Some kids it took so long, it was time for them to go on summer vacation. Some kids decided that they did not want to do it, to be in the program. Some of them, you know, went and got -- went and got jobs. So -- so there was different reasons.

I never heard any bad talk in the community about the program. There was no -- definitely no intention to keep Valerie out of the loop. I think the most

egregious thing that had been said was that we spent \$174,000. Just because \$174,000 was the budget don't mean that you spent the 175 -- the 174,000. It means that we could go up to. Those were the available funds. But as Miss Hoskins gave the amount of that that we spent, one gentleman understood that because as he said, will that roll over to the next year to get the program going? That's the same thing that we did. And for -- to be transparent, that's why we provided the updates, the weekly spreadsheets and the updates to give out the information and the amounts.

I handled not a dollar, not a dime. We -- we hired -- we -- we hired the kids that we could hire and that was that for this program. So, you know, there is - - there is no ill-intent. There is nothing to hide here. I do believe if I was allowed to have a little more involvement or hands-on experience -- what I was told, I couldn't, uh, be that involved -- I think that a lot of things would not have fallen through the crack; a lot of things would have ran a little differently. But, you know, at least we're -- we're -- we're building something here. And that's the only thing that I can say, is that we continue to learn from our mistakes and we continue to build on -- on -- on what we have.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I'm sorry. One moment, please.

Madam City Manager, I would like to request a full and complete accounting of all dollars spent as it relates to the Summer Youth Employment Program. I would like to have a breakdown of the, uh, student participants and what reports were made. And we just need a complete and thorough report of the Summer Youth Employment Program to be distributed to this Board by Friday, by close of business Friday. Well, let's see. What's today, Wednesday?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** We have till tomorrow --

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Hold on. We have too many -- so by close of business Monday, by close of business Monday, three -- three days from now. Because you have the finances. I know we have the meeting on tomorrow.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** No, no, no. The program does not end until --

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Right. But I want a full and complete accounting --

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Just to date.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** To date.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you. Um, we have, um, discussed this at length and I -- I fully -- I think that we fully understand that there was a lack of transparency -- not a lack of transparency so to speak, but the information was not, um, provided and trickled down in a manner in which it should have. And so, therefore, we are clear on that and I don't believe that we need to prolong the public comments any further because I believe that all positions have been stated up to this point.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair? I do want to ask one other thing. And I did ask the questions --

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Miller-Anderson, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** We recognize that you asked questions, but if you would, so that we could --

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I appreciate it.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Um, so going forward, being that Mr. Richardson is not there, who is -- who -- who are the people reporting to now, Miss Hoskins?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** As of, um, today I will have them reporting to me.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. All right. And then the -- I did ask some questions during the time that I was speaking not too long ago and I want to know was there at least done or did we have the interlocal agreement?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** I was told that we had an interlocal agreement with the School Board. However, I do not have that in my hands at this point. I will, um, ask for it again for tomorrow and I will forward it to you all.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. That's it. Thank you.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I have a question.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Just -- just a quick question.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Mayor, I would like to move to public comment. We are now at 8:15.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** It's just a quick question.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Mayor, you're recognized. Please make your question quick. The public is waiting.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** It'll be -- it'll be very quick.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Miss, uh, Manager, is there any reason why they're gonna appoint -- uh, report to you instead of, uh, Miss Grimsley?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Miss, um, Grimsley has expressed some concerns, so, um, I want them to report to me.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you. Thank you, Madam Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you. That concludes that discussion.

Public comments should be restricted to issues, matters or topics pertinent to the City of Riviera Beach. Please be reminded that the City Council has adopted rules of decorum governing public comment during official meetings, which has been posted at the entrance of the Council Chambers. In an effort to preserve order, if any of the rules are not adhered to, the Chairperson may have any disruptive speaker or attendee removed from the podium, from the meeting and/or the building if necessary. Please govern yourselves accordingly. We want to make you aware that each public comment is three minutes. If you are in the middle of a final statement at your public comment, we will allow you to wrap it up but ask that you not begin any new thoughts. Madam Clerk?

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Andre Henderson, John Miller, Darlene Cruz.

**ANDRE HENDERSON:** Hello, Council. Andre Henderson, 1160 West 26th Street. Um, two things -- uh, a couple things I wanted to point out. We have coming up on Wednesday the two officers that are supposed to be sergeants; that's supposed to be moved into that slot. I want to make sure that we don't forget about that. Uh, I think it's, uh, Resolution 4718.



**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Henderson, that's a closed executive session to be discussed.

**ANDRE HENDERSON:** Oh, I apologize.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**ANDRE HENDERSON:** Um, but, uh, hopefully that gets resolved. Especially with the shootings that we just had, we need to make sure we got, uh, sergeants on the street.

Um, also, um, relating to what we just discussed, uh, Mr. Horton, we talked the other -- yesterday. Um, we have electricians -- electrical companies inside the community that we should have relationships with. Anybody in this -- in this community that the City has an opening for, I feel it would be our responsibility to have a relationship with them so we can put interns in those communities -- or in those businesses so that -- you never know how it works out. I mean, I took an internship as a carpenter and that's what I do now today. But those are the things that kids react to when they're small, when they're young. We all want to be a fireman, a police officer, a carpenter, whatever. So we have to start building relationships in the community with individuals. So if we're gonna call and we're gonna do something, we're gonna take a program, we have to have relationships with individuals in the city.

The other thing that I -- I, um -- I think that we need to understand, too, is that on the dais -- I don't think -- when I say something, I'm not -- I'm not putting it personal, but we had two shootings in the last 48 hours. Um, we're -- we're - - we're -- we're in a state of crisis now where we need to start realizing that what you -- five people are running this city, making decisions. How we react to each other, what we do, what we say, in the past, things that are coming up -- we have these cameras here. We gotta start making better decisions because each district is having an issue and we need to start realizing that we're responsible.

My point I'm bringing out, Miss Hubbard, is that if it's in your district, you're responsible. Same thing with Miss Johnson, Miss Miller, Miss Botel, Mr. Davis, the same thing. If it's in your district, you're responsible. Who else are we supposed to blame? Who are we supposed to go to? Plain and simple. Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, sir.

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** John Miller, Darlene Cruz, Ernestine Gordon.

**JOHN MILLER:** John Miller, 1290 Manor Drive. Uh, I really wanted to speak on the insurance issue and, uh -- but I will -- I will be short here and I'll say there will be no shenanigans. I like that, Tonya, because we gotta stop the shenanigans, that's correct. Let's get to work. And, um, that's the first thing.

And when we -- when we start talking about this insurance, yes, I'm not pointing the finger -- you know what? Look at this. See this? When you point, what comes back? Three. You know, I'm -- I'm not gonna be up here pointing the finger at nobody, and I hope that you don't because I saw that on other issues. I saw Mr. Sherman, you know, get attacked because he brought up the, uh, raises. And I don't think that that -- I mean, in other words, that's something that we really want. In other words, if something's out of the ordinary, I would expect every single one of you to say something about it. There's nothing wrong with that. So, I mean, I'm just using that in retrospect that I'm hoping that we don't do the same thing with this, uh, overpayment of insurance, what happened there. So, um, I'll shut up now and I'll talk when you talk about the insurance. Thank you.

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Darlene Cruz, Ernestine Gordon, Willis Williams.

**DARLENE CRUZ:** I pass.

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Ernestine Gordon, Willis Williams, Officer Maton.

**WILLIS WILLIAMS:** Is this Item number 2 or is this public comment?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** This is public comments. Do you wish to speak, Mr. -- Mr. Williams?

**WILLIS WILLIAMS:** No.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** We are passing. Continue on, Madam Clerk.

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Is Miss Ernestine Gordon still here?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I don't believe --

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Officer Maton, Charlotte Darville, Pauletta -- Doretta Paulk.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Is it -- was it Maton? Morton. Officer Morton.

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Morton. Sorry.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Come forward, Officer.

**OFFICER MORTON:** Members, good evening. Mayor.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Good evening.

**OFFICER MORTON:** City Manager. I'm Officer Morton, City of Riviera Beach Police Department. I currently serve as a school resource officer for the department. I'm also in charge of the school resource -- I'm sorry, the Explorers Program, along with, uh, three other officers, and I just wanted to elaborate a little bit on, um, the Summer Youth Program and our kids.

So -- excuse me -- a majority of the kids that are employed and are working at the police department are from our Explorers Program. There's 11 kids. Uh, they work five hours a day, Monday through Friday. They're placed in, uh, different areas of the police department, such as Records, for example, Asset Management, Administrative Services, Support Services, and etcetera. Uh, the kids are excited about the opportunity that was presented to them and they're also excited about the money, of course.

They, um -- you know, these kids, they don't have a lot of opportunities to make money. They don't have the mentors that, you know, they need in their life and, um -- just coming from my perspective. Uh, these kids are very dear to my heart because this is what I do, you know. This is what my partners and I do. We, uh -- we just mentor these kids. We sacrifice a lot of our time to, uh, make sure they get the proper direction that they deserve. Now, this also -- this program also gives us a better opportunity on top of the exploring to, uh, just properly direct them, and the fact that they're making money, you know, and working for it; it just gives us an opportunity to guide them.

Uh, I remember -- the way I was raised, my father taught me if you save -- if you earn \$10, save 5, you know. And this is the same example that we try to instill in these kids and, uh, just direct them in what to do in reference to when they earn their money, you know, advice about credit, how to invest. You know, I try to encourage them save \$10 a paycheck or \$20, you know. By the time you're 20, 21, you'll have a nice down payment for a house or, you know, just to venture off and do -- buy a car for college or whatnot. So I just wanted to elaborate a little bit, you know, and just to let you guys know that this program is good, you know. It's a positive thing and, uh, we look forward to having it next year. Okay? Thank you.

**AUDIENCE:** (Clapping).

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Charlotte Darville, Doretta Paulk, Horace Towns.

**CHARLOTTE DARVILLE:** Good evening. Charlotte Darville.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Good evening.

**CHARLOTTE DARVILLE:** Okay. Um, I just wanted to touch a little bit on insurance because I can't stay. Um, you know, the people that were involved in the firing of Mr. Evans said it was malfeasance. Mr. Evans was just doing his job and he was uncovering a lot of wrongdoing in this city which people did not like and they didn't want him to keep uncovering all the horrendous things that was going on in this city because a lot of them were involved allegedly.

You talk about malfeasance. Malfeasance is going on rampant in this city. There should be a lot of people let go. And like Miss Miller-Anderson was saying last night, there needs to be policies and procedures written out if they aren't and they should be followed. I worked in accounting and HR for 11 years. Everything was done by the book there and it went through channels; not just the two of us check things, but it went through other channels. But then I know one person that got around things like that because she was very intelligent and she ended up getting prosecuted for what she did.

So there's probably a lot of people in this insurance situation that should be brought up on charges. That's why insurance rates are so high, one reason, for people lying like this. And, uh, the wasting of -- the way that money is spent here is out of control, out of control. There's a million dollars right there, when that fire department out on Blue Heron needs deadly repairs done on it; those men have to live in there. And there's numerous other things around this city that are extremely important, but yet you just waste, waste, waste money.

I mean, it's extremely poor management in some of these areas. The incompetence is rampant, hire people that have no qualifications to do jobs because family members, friends -- so you throw them in there. But that's not the way to do it. But people don't care.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, Miss Darville.

**CHARLOTTE DARVILLE:** There needs to be a lot of transparency in this city. Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Doretta Paulk, Horace Towns, Phillip Dukes.

**DORETTA PAULK:** Madam Chair, and also Council, I would like to waive my right until, um, the second item (unintelligible).

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, ma'am. Thank you, ma'am.

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Horace Towns, Phillip Dukes, Tiffany Williams.

**HORACE TOWNS:** Good evening to the Board.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Good evening. Uh, excuse me. I'm having issues with my voice. I think I really speak on behalf of everyone in the audience. Horace Towns, Riviera Beach, Florida. It is outrageous to spend two hours on one item, speaking redundantly, over and over about the same thing. It is -- I mean, it's -- it's really -- it's terrible for sure.

Um, I started to be theatrical tonight and come in here and wear a fire hat because we have so many fires in this city. And over this year I could do a roll call. We have Stonybrooks. We have crime. We have the murders. We have the job vacancies, the million dollars related to the health insurance, the concrete plant, the water plant, the stipends, the sewage spill, public records requests, the mold in the buildings, and I probably could go on. I wanted to speak on the last item, but, uh, I wasn't able to. Um, but I do respect procedure.

Um, I think anything that you do on a large level deserves time and proper planning. Last year when we had the program that Miss Hubbard wanted, I believe it was either given one month after Mr. Evans came or one month before the kids were getting out of school. And the thing that disturbed me about this item tonight was -- I know, Miss Hubbard, your heart is in the right place, but you spoke like you oversaw the program as the director. And I will say that in my years here in the city, Valerie Grimsley is probably one of the most underappreciated, professional members of this city that we have.

I have faith in this Board this year and I wanted to see some checks and balances, but it seems like we're still missing checks and we don't have any balance. Policies and procedures is what I followed in my tenure in government and that seems to be what's consistently missing in our city. I don't understand why we spend these government dollars so freely. There are many outlets, there are different groups that we could have piggybacked on, supported or spent those monies trying to strengthen those programs, but we spent money and I felt like it was irresponsible. I like the goal of it, but I do believe that it desired proper planning. I think that we have to follow procedure. And this is from me to you, Miss Hubbard. Miss Hubbard, to City Manager, City Manager to Director, Director to staff. That's how things are to

be utilized, and we wouldn't have those issues if for once we followed some policies and procedures in this city. Thank you.

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Phillip Dukes, Tiffany Williams, Mary Brabham.

**PHILLIP DUKES:** Dr. Phillip Dukes, 1217 Avenue U in the city of Riviera Beach, Florida. Council, Mayor.

Uh, on August 12th at the New Macedonia Baptist Church where Mayor Masters is the pastor, the Youth Athletic Association with Mr. Dan Calloway will be having our back-to-school program to encourage our youth. Mr. Calloway and his organization has decided to partner with us and we're supporting them.

On July 28th from 6 to 8 p.m. at 1217 Avenue U in the city of Riviera Beach, we will be having our "We Can Change Our Community Atmosphere" rally. This rally is designed to bring residents out into the community. We're in the heart of Riviera Beach, what used to be one of the worst neighborhoods in the city, working in Parson Heights at the Jiffy store.

Now, we have allowed the drug retail market and thug life to permeate our city. We say Riviera Beach is the best city to live, work and play. It is not. That's that myth. But let's make it happen, and we can. We say that we love the children; we want to build something good for the kids and we want to support anything for the children. Well, we got to change our community atmosphere. (Unintelligible) every generation since 1982. No City Council has had a zero tolerance in this city. Somewhere in America there needs to be a stance against drug dealing and thug life; and you can't just do it through youth programs because when those kids come out of that youth program, go back in their neighborhood and they see all this going on, whatever you put in them get drained out of most of them.

So I'm asking you to support me. I feel like this Council has been ducking me. That's what I feel like. You don't really want to really do this thing for your kids and change your community atmosphere. There is no different than Riviera Beach or North Palm Beach or Palm Beach Gardens. Look at these recent murders. It's all tied with thug life. But you gotta have something on the streets to back up into the home. See, we got some jacked-up homes because of the ideology and the philosophy, and I link it to thug life and this hip hop culture that's antisocial. So we gotta come out and teach. You can't do that without money. You can't do that without money. So I'm asking you to support me. You can't say you really care about these children but you don't want to deal with what's killing them. Yeah, youth programs are good. We need every

youth program that we can get, but we need to become the dominant influence in our streets.

Mayor Masters, I hope you stand with me. I hope you stand with me. Council, I hope you stand with me. I want to thank you for this season, uh, Dr. Botel for supporting. I want to thank Coach in this season for supporting. But I haven't heard anything from the rest of you. Uh, it's not like you don't know me. You know what I do. This is the missing link all over America and what black people need to do in their community and bring everybody together. We're in the backyard of the President of the United States, one of the worst presidents we've had since Harry S. Truman.

**AUDIENCE:** That, I can assure you.

**PHILLIP DUKES:** So what we need to do is stand in our -- and be an example. We can be an example. Why can't we become the dominant influence in our community? What are you afraid of? Let me tell you what you're scared of. These dope boys and these -- and thug life holding us hostage and most of us are scared of what's gonna happen.

July 28th, 6 p.m., 1217 Avenue U in Riviera Beach, Florida. We're gonna have free food. Uh, so come out and support this and support us financially. One more thing. If anybody wants to support us, it's P.O. Box 10111, Riviera Beach, Florida, 33419. Operation Restore is a 501-C organization. Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, sir.

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Tiffany Williams, Mary Brabham, Bryce Graham.

**TIFFANY WILLIAMS:** Good evening. Tiffany Williams, Fire Department.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Good evening.

**TIFFANY WILLIAMS:** General employee. Mayor, Council. Um, I'm gonna speak on Aetna because I don't know how long you guys will be on the issue this evening.

Um, since July 2017, City Admin was aware of the neglect of this issue. September 2017 it was put in an agenda item stating that, "After further review, it was found that the members and employee counts reported to and being used by Aetna to calculate the cost per member are incorrect. Employees that are no longer employed by the City and their respective dependents are still reflected within accounts utilized by Aetna's underwriting group."

You voted on this 3-percent increase. Again, I can't even say you -- deceive you because it was right here in this -- in this agenda item. Quit, retired, and dead, City paid \$1 million. Until June 28, 2018, the residents and employees was -- this was kept quiet. And you speak about accountability and transparency. What if an employee neglected their job duties for four years?

I'm gonna ask the million-dollar question. Who is gonna be held accountable for this? Former city manager Miss Jones was held accountable for the water issue. She was terminated. Interim director Terence Bailey was held accountable for his staff discarding signs. He was suspended.

Since 2014, according to their -- uh, Risk Management memo, your stakeholders has been held accountable, and that's your employees and residents. Human Resource Risk Management could have been -- this could have been assisted by the Finance Department. If everyone is going to use system and human error, then Miss Jones should get her job back and Mr. Bailey should be reimbursed for his suspension.

Conduct its own research. The City of Palm Beach Gardens has their comprehension study on their website and it shows that Risk Management falls up under the Finance Department. Changes need to be made immediately. And I'm gonna close, the Stonybrooks was built approximately 50 years ago and needs to be demolished and rebuilt. Thank you.

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Mary Brabham, Bryce Graham, Tommy Walker.

**MARY BRABHAM:** Miss Mary Brabham, Riviera Beach. Transparency, policies and procedures, those are your keys to good, effective government. And we can have it here in this city here, but you as leaders, you are responsible for that transparency, policy and procedures. You are in this predicament and mess here because you're just like loose-headed chickens. No one wants to do what is right. The residents want you to do right. It's just as easy to do right than it is to do wrong, but sometimes you get set in your ways. And we talk about the meeting of the minds. That's what you all need to have, a meeting of the minds.

You got \$1.1 million that you paid out, dead peoples and everything else. Come on, who does that? Then you want to throw your Finance Director under the bus. It is accountability that starts from the top. Mr. Sherman cannot okay anything without it coming from the top. You don't read the share of stuff in front of your face and you go and put your January Hancock on. We say all the time, read. Make sure you have your I's dotted and your T's crossed because everything comes back to haunt you.



Mr. Sherman and others are not in this all by themselves. When you trim that tree, you don't trim it from the bottom. You start from the top. Now, if something was done wrong there, not just Mr. Sherman should be held accountable; everybody in the Finance Department should be held accountable because the buck stops there. And -- and -- and I -- and I heard a comment saying that once when you come to the podium -- and -- and I think, Manager Hoskins, you said that you took Mr. Sherman off because of comments that came from the podium. Well, you need to do that all around. That puts that character on you. But when you do that derelict, denigrating, deseparation, it leaves that perception like you're picking and you're choosing one from another. You can't do that.

Government all across the land. Look at our President. Look -- look what he has done to us. This law of government here is no better, because you're saying one thing and you're doing another thing and this is what makes you not be effective, good leaders. And we can be that. I'm sure that all of you up there have it in you. You just need to manifest it and do right. But most of all, right comes from within you. And if you don't have it, how you expect for your residents to have it, as well as your employees? Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, Miss Brabham.

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Bryce Graham, Tommy Walker, Joyce.

**BRYCE GRAHAM:** Good evening, Council, Mayor. I'm Bryce Graham. I want to tonight address the crisis that's been going on in our city, and that is gun violence. We've had two shootings in this city within the last 48 hours and nobody has parted their mouth to say anything. This is what I want to suggest, because this city is under crisis when it comes to gun violence. I believe that there should be a state of emergency declared in the city. I believe that we should look for federal government resources to remove violent offenders from our streets. I believe that we should work with the State Attorney's Office to enforce laws against these violent offenders. And number three, I believe that the police department should do their job, because they know who these killers are and we need to get these murders and violent offenders off of our streets. That's what I suggest tonight, and I wish you all, the Council, would work with me and the National Action Network to get this job done. Thank you.

**AUDIENCE:** (Clapping).

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Tommy Walker, Joyce, Douglas Lawson.

**TOMMY WALKER:** Good evening, Madam Chair, Council.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Good evening.

**TOMMY WALKER:** Um, I came to you in a two-part, but I'm gonna just make it a one-part. As I looked at the meeting last night -- in 1972, I was a freshman going to Palm Beach Gardens when Stonybrook was built. It was a good time. I was 15 years old. And over those years we had -- Mr. Roundtree was the first manager there. I know none of you all know anything about that because you all might not have been here. I just want -- I just want to tell you this history and I -- and I -- and make a suggestion.

Over the years I had three sisters that lived there. All of them went on to have ownership, homeownership. My mom lived in Ivey Green until I was in a position that I gave her a down payment that she bought a house over in National Village. And I myself even lived in Broadmoor. Ivey Green and Broadmoor are gone and we keep putting a tourniquet over here in Stonybrook. Now, anybody that understands, if you put a tourniquet on something, you gotta be qualified to take it off or else they're gonna bleed out. We cannot allow them to put a \$13 million Band-Aid over there. The things that they suggested is not gonna work.

I want to put this -- I'm running for City Council and this is our district, Madam Chair, and we can't afford to do this any longer. Year after year, year after year -- our residents, the people over there, they deserve better. The Stonybrook we got right now has failed. It's done. Drugs, crime. It's not designed like it were in the old days. It's been there for 45 years. Now it's just a money-making scheme for other people, and our residents deserve better.

I don't know -- in the military they -- they trained us how to put a tourniquet on, but they don't train us how to take it off because you got to be a qualified medical person to take off the tourniquet. We need to tear it down. Whether we rebuild it -- we cannot allow any of these groups to come in and tell us what we need. We need the tear it down, build it back. If they got \$13 million to put an event center or whatever they want in the middle, let them add another 13 and do the whole thing.

I'm asking you guys to review these plans, take that tourniquet off, let Stonybrook bleed out. And I know in the back end we're gonna have to find somewhere for them to go and it might be out of our pocket. But take the tourniquet off. Let's stop the bleeding. Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, sir.

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Joyce, Douglas Lawson, Bishop Thomas Masters. Douglas Lawson, Bishop Thomas Masters, Pat Fedini -- Fedina.

**DOUGLAS LAWSON:** Good evening, Council. Good evening, Mayor, Chair, City Manager. My name's Douglas Lawson, Riviera Beach, and I'm here to

discuss the -- two parts. The first is that insurance. The insurance issue was brought up tonight simply because it's been a major, major, major scandal. We need to find out who and what was at fault for this. We need to go and get an independent company to come in and take a look at these operations and see what actually happened to rectify the situation, because right now for us to just simply take the word of the Council that it's not going to happen again is not acceptable.

This city does not have faith in the Council to get that done because they allowed over \$1 million to go out the door when there's people that haven't had raises in over three years, when we have people that are working right now that still can't even get insurance, and we're giving it away to people that have deceased, that are retired, and that have left our city. That's the number-one concern.

The number-two concern is that our city violence is at an all-time high. While we were in here discussing Stonybrook for four or five hours, we had shootings going on across our city. We have to be able as a team to work together. Like I said last night, I was in this meeting discussing some of the issues of Stonybrook and we have to work together as a team.

I wanted to present to the Council -- I was gonna wait till tomorrow, but we are doing a Youth Entrepreneurial Camp. I want the Council to be a part of this camp. I want them to be a part of every event that the City is hosting so that they can be engaged and involved because we have to keep our citizens safe. A gentleman said that these youth events are -- you know, they're beneficial but it's -- it's something that's needed. We have to provide social engagement for our community.

So with the Council, I want to invite you guys to our Bridge to Success event. It's July 31st, August 1st, and August 2nd. It's gonna be held at Infinity Taxes in conjunction with Phi Beta Sigma Fraternity, Incorporated. We're teaching our youth about life after high school, résumé writing, credit and banking, brainstorming, business development and multiple streams of income. We truly believe that you have to start with the Council and with the City and work together in conjunction to help the city. We have to heal the city and it starts with us. And this Council, you guys are responsible for it. So we're depending and needing you guys.

I'm not asking for a donation. I'm not asking for any handouts. I'm not asking for anything financially from the Council. I'm asking for the time to speak to these kids, to talk to them about how to be leaders, and that's how we can keep the violence down in our city. Thank you, Council.

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Bishop Thomas Masters, Pat Fedina, Demarcus Brantley.

**BISHOP THOMAS MASTERS:** The young man that just spoke, Douglas Lawson and Darlene Cruz, I'm praying for both of you as you're running for District 5 seat. I want to announce that, um, July 22nd, Family and Friends Day, um, at the Event Center. Um, please come out and support that date. We have a young man right from Riviera Beach who has traveled internationally as the, uh, entertainer. He's been recognized by the Palm Beach Post as one of the best in the local area, Patrick Ulysses Pinkney. He's going to, um, be the guest with the -- with the band.

I also want to announce that, um, Bryce Graham, the young man who spoke three minutes ago, is Prophet Bryce Graham. As you could tell, he -- you'd know he was a preacher just by his demeanor, but he'll be one of the young people that will be involved with us as we once again, uh, address the violence and crime, um, in the city, along with other clergy. So we want to invite clergy. We want to invite all the residents, both sides of the bridge, to come out on Friday at 6:30 p.m. There will be a Town Hall meeting right here in this room and I want to hear suggestions, ideas, programs, projects, anybody that has anything to add to help us, uh, in this fight.

I want to be brief and end this because I want to hurry up and get back up there and hear about this insurance scandal, but in the meantime I want Tiffany to come up and read this letter from Dan Calloway because my glasses are not -- must not be the right ones. So, Tiffany, would you read this letter into the record? Thank you.

**TIFFANY WILLIAMS:** Good evening. "Dear Supporters, the Youth Recreation Association and Mothers Against Murderers Association are sponsoring CAP Day to honor our fallen heroes. Join us for CAP Day on August 12, 2018, at 11 a.m. at New Macedonia Missionary Baptist Church located at 748 West 9th Street, Riviera Beach, Florida, 33404.

"This event will be an opportunity to shine a light on the tragedy that happened at Stoneman Douglas High School. We know the pain still runs deep inside the mothers who lost their child. Mothers Against Murderers Association knows this pain firsthand in dealing with mothers within our association who have lost their loved ones to violence, mainly due to gun violence. In Genesis, Cain was asked, 'Where is your brother?' And Cain replied, 'I am my brother's keeper.' I say unto you, yes, we are. We have to look out for each other and stop the violence. We encourage you to attend and bring the kids. This is definitely a back-to-school, eye-opening moment and the kids' presence is needed.

"We have estimated a budget of \$2,200 to make this a successful event. We appreciate and are most gracious for any donations you are able to provide towards -- towards bearing the cost of these items. Ten cases of ribs: \$850. Ten cases of chicken: \$650. Pigeon peas and rice, string beans, mac and cheese, and desserts: \$500. Plates, napkins, culinary, to-go containers: \$200. Your contributions are tax deductible and presented to the attention of Youth Recreation Association or Mothers Against Murderers Association. With best regards, I am Dan Calloway, Athletic Director."

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, ma'am.

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Pat Fedina, Demarcus Brantley.

**PAT FEDINA:** Good evening.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Good evening, Miss Fedina.

**PAT FEDINA:** I'm Pat Fedina. I am the mother of Tarrie LaTodd Wilder, who was gunned down in Riviera Beach on November 13, 2015.

The things that I learned in the courtroom is very disturbing, how a police officer actually rolled up after hearing five to seven gunshots. He approached two men. One happened to be reported the shooter, who identified later through a photograph. But the disturbing thing is that the defense attorney pointed out was that officer did not even get out of his car when he rolled up on these two men. I've tried to meet with the police department since then. I actually did meet with the police department right after the shooting.

The justice system, we all talk about it. We said that it's broken. Well, I am a witness that it's broken. With all the evidence and everything that was pointed out in that courtroom -- I sat, I watched, I heard, and I can't believe what happened. The judge on that case let this gentleman go on a Stand Your Ground. My son was left facedown with a gunshot wound. I don't even believe that the hospital did surgery on my son. They have that I identified him in so many documents and that's a lie.

We as a community, we as black people, and I'm speaking black-on-black crime, we really need to take this serious. People are afraid to speak up. I'm not. I'm 65 years old. Until the day I die, I'm gonna speak up. It's not just about my child. My son was 42 years old. I cried out to people for help. Yes, he had a record, but he was somebody. We may have a lot of this violence retaliation in all of this. Do anybody really want to know, uh -- question why is this happening? If the justice system is not doing their job, this is where this retaliation is going on.

I actually at the wake, my son's wake, looked three guys in the eyes and said, "You could not have loved my son more than I do. So please, please do not touch one hair on that man's head." There is mothers on both sides of this coin that is hurting. I pray on a prayer line every morning and I pray for the mother of the guy who took my child's life. And I'm gonna say this and I said it before. I'm glad that my son was not the one who took a life.

I'm going to speak to you mothers and fathers. You know what your children are doing. My son and I relationship didn't come together until three and a half weeks, when God led me to go pick my child up just a block away from where he was gunned down. You cannot -- I tried to get the media to tell my story, but unless it's something that can be racial, unless -- if my child was gunned down by a white man or he killed a white man or if it was a police involved. They would have known that Doo-Doo is James Johnson and Pookie is Reverend Johnson.

Something needs to be done. We need to do something. I say where are the -- the media's there when it's something negative. They're there. They want to keep us apart. If the black and white people could -- because it affects all of us. People are gonna be afraid to go shopping, afraid of everywhere. There was a shooting right on Military at Okeechobee where three people were shot. A mother was killed. What has to happen?

I'm praying that all of you will help make something happen. I'm one of the mothers that's willing to stand up, speak up and fight, and find out what's going on in this city, what's going on all over the country. We need to ask the question. These people out here killing. Why? I'm hurt deeply. But I went to the Job Fair and I want to thank you for that, inviting me. I have a nonprofit. I'm not up here to, uh, do a commercial or anything, but I thank you and I appreciate what you're doing because one young man, I closed my office to take him to get his job.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Good. Thank you.

**PAT FEDINA:** Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**AUDIENCE:** (Clapping).

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Our last card is Demarcus Brantley.

**DEMARCUS BRANTLEY:** Hello. Um, I just want to say, uh, just, uh, my opinion, um, I think, um, all assault rifles need to be banned. You know, um, I'm -- I'm strongly behind that, you know, uh, and anything I can do for a mother

that lost her son -- because I'm my mother's only son and I can't imagine, uh, her, uh, you know, uh, burying me, you know.

So, uh, along with that, uh, also I think anger management should be implemented in schools, period, you know, before they get into trouble, like I was; and then later on when they go to jail, then they're starting to learn what anger management is. Should be approached at an early age. It's just my opinion that, uh, anger management should be implemented into schools. All right. Thanks.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, sir.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Demarcus, I'll see you Friday at 6:30.

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** That was it, ma'am.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you. Thank you all for your comments and for your patience.

## **ITEMS TABLED**

### **REGULAR**

### **DISCUSSION AND DELIBERATION**

#### **1. DISCUSSION AND DELIBERATION REGARDING SYEP**

**CITY MANAGER: KAREN L. HOSKINS (561) 845-4010**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Discussion and deliberation, Item number 1.

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Discussion and deliberation regarding SYEP.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam City Manager, do you have any precluding comments, please?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair, the City Council approved the budget for SYEP for, um, the summer of 2018 in the total amount of \$174,000. As we wrap up that program -- that summer program, for FY 18 we had, um, to date a total of, um, nine intern participants, five neighborhood attendants. We had 32 children to participate in the boot camp. We hired one program manager, one job developer, one program coordinator, and one youth advocate. To date, expenditures total approximately \$33,000. As I said, the budget that you approved was 174,000. To date, total expenditures are

\$33,912 -- I'm sorry, um, that's month to date. Year to date is \$40,575, year-to-date expenses.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** 40,000 --

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** \$40,575.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** We have -- that -- that program will end on, um, July 24th. And if you have any questions, I'll be glad to answer them at this time.

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Madam Chair, just to let you know, we do have public comment cards.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Botel, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Thank you. Well, I'm looking at the budget and I see here a year-to-date amount of \$21,519.25.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** That was uploaded on 7/11. Um, to date we've spent -- and that's through today, uh, July 17, 40,575. We did pay the, um, boot camp participants on, um, yesterday. They had their test on Saturday. So we did pay, um, the 32 boot camp participants on yesterday. So that, um, raised the total expenses to date 40,575. At the time that was uploaded, that was last Friday.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** I -- you know, I did express some concerns about this. I voted for this program when we had it before us with -- with reservations. I -- I felt that I couldn't possibly vote against jobs for kids in the summer. There's nothing bad about that. Certainly you want to -- you want to support that when you can, but I had then and I still do have serious reservations about starting a program a couple weeks before the beginning of the summer season. I'm hopeful that we can do something a little more -- with a little bit more planning and forethought for next season if we're gonna do this again.

I also was not -- I was concerned about the fact that we shifted monies from salary items over to support this. If we're gonna have a Summer Youth Employment Program in the future, I would hope that we provide for it in the



budget as part of our regular budget process. I think I'd also like to have some sense of the outcomes. For example, I'm not quite sure what the boot camp was about. I'd like to know what the children learned from that, what the outcomes were, and what the outcomes were from the other jobs that they had.

**UNIDENTIFIED COUNCILPERSON:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Mayor, you're recognized.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you. The 174,000 are either -- of the expenses of 33,000, what I need to know is the salaries, because I want to see if we paid more on salaries giving adults a job more than we did on the children. And it's all about the children for me. So, Madam Manager, would you give me a breakdown on the, um -- the salaries --

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Yes, sir.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** -- for each one of these, and then the total amount for -  
-

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** For the, um, salaries -- regular salaries and wages we spent \$16,914.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** That's the total?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Yes, to date, year to date.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I need -- I'm sorry. Do you want to break that down for me? There's a program coordinator. There's something else, there's something else, and something else. I need a breakdown of each one of those positions. And so that 16,000 out of 33,000 that was spent --

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** No.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** -- on expenses? Clarify that for me.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Year to date we spent \$16,914 of regular salaries and wages.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** So for the, um, program participant, um, program manager, um, I don't have that -- if you'll give me a minute I will break down that cost for you, but most of the, um, expenses for the program is the contract services account, which is 22,366, and that was to pay for the, uh,

boot camp participants. As I stated earlier, there were 32 boot camp participants; and they received a stipend of \$528, and that was to, um, give the children, um, an incentive to attend the boot camp, um, to, um, prepare for the ACT test. And, uh, they took -- as I stated, they took the test on, um, Saturday, so we will get those results.

Um, we also had two teachers that, um, facilitated the boot camp, and that was paid out of the contract services account. The program manager, uh, was paid \$25, um, an hour, and that's for, um, 25 hours a week based on eight weeks. The job developer was paid \$20 an hour at 25 hours a week based on eight weeks. And the coordinator, um, that's based on \$20 an hour, 25 hours a week. Although we budgeted for two youth advocates, we only hired one, and that was at \$12 an hour at 25 hours a week. So, uh, for the program manager, that would have been for the eight weeks, \$5,000. For the job developer, it would have been \$4,000. We ended up with one job developer although we budgeted for two, and one coordinator at \$4,000, and an advocate. We end up with one advocate, and that would have been, um, \$2400 for the one -- for the, um, eight weeks.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** So therefore -- let me ask it a different way. I'm looking at the number of participants, whether they were interns or whether they were children in the -- in the boot camp or the five -- whatever else, neighborhood, the block people or whatever. I total 47. Is that correct? Would that be a total of 47 participants?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** A total of 45.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** 45? All right.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** I'm sorry. Minus four. 46.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay. 46. So we spent over \$16,000 --

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** No. The entire 16 is not for the, um --

**MAYOR MASTERS:** How much did we spend on the 46? How much money was spent?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** I would have to --

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Salary --

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** -- provide that to you later. Um, we do have, as I stated, five neighborhood attendants that we're paying. So, um, that's coming out of the salaries account also. They're making \$10 an hour and they're working 25 hours a week. And they were five young men --

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Uh-huh.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** -- um, that we took off the streets that are working, um, helping beautify the city.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay. And you don't have the information that I'm requesting at this point.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** I have the information. If you give me a minute, I'll add it up for you.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Oh, I thought you said later.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** But that was provided in, um, the agenda item that was presented to you in, um, late April.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay. One final question. You said "we" hired. Who's the "we"? Who's involved in the hiring process? Who hired?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** It would have been -- I would have to call HR to see, um, who exactly was involved in the hiring process.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Who do you have knowledge of? Do you have knowledge of? Do you have any knowledge of anyone that was hired -- that was in the hiring process?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Um, it would have to be either the Human Resources director -- um, I'm not sure if they had a committee, if, um, any of the -- if you know the committee members, Miss Irvin?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you.

**EUREKA IRVIN:** Good evening. Eureka Irvin, Human Resources Department. The HR department was not in the interview process for the, um, staff as well as the youth participants.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** So you cannot tell me who was -- who hired -- who was -- who was that committee. Right?

**EUREKA IRVIN:** Um, that would be --

**MAYOR MASTERS:** You were not involved. You were not involved.

**EUREKA IRVIN:** Correct.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Let me ask Miss Grimsley to take the microphone for a second, and maybe Miss Grimsley can shed light on who hired these people. Miss Grimsley, please state your name and your position with -- uh, with the Youth Empowerment that was somewhat associated with this program.

**VALERIE GRIMSLEY:** Valerie Grimsley, uh, program director for Youth Empowerment.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Who was the committee that hired the people that were given these jobs, were hired for these jobs, the committee?

**VALERIE GRIMSLEY:** Um, I sat on the committee. Chief -- Community Citizen Chief Williams sat on the committee, um, and Miss Hubbard sat on the committee.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Elected official sat on all the hiring?

**VALERIE GRIMSLEY:** Yes.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Uh, did you specifically -- and, Madam Chair, this is my final question. I'll reserve to come back the second time once everyone had - - has had a chance to go around. Did you hire anybody specifically? Of all these people, you sat on the committee, did you hire anyone?

**VALERIE GRIMSLEY:** When you say did I hire, what do you mean?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Did you make any recommendations to the hiring committee for anybody that you felt was qualified to be hired?

**VALERIE GRIMSLEY:** Um, I called four people in -- five people in to be interviewed, but --

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Any of the people you called in, were they hired?

**VALERIE GRIMSLEY:** No.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you. Thank you, Madam Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, Mr. Mayor.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Miller-Anderson, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So I requested for this meeting to take place for a couple of reasons, one of them being that when we first, um, approved the amount for this program back on April 4th, I had some concerns that we did not have a full plan. And obviously I didn't want to vote against having children employed by the City for the summer, so I reluctantly approved it. Um, I was reluctant because I did not have a plan. Um, then in June 6th - - um, actually after the April 4th we were supposed to get an update at some point and we never got an update. Um, I did request that, um, someone provide some sort of presentation during the June 6th meeting, and at that time I believe Miss Hubbard provided that update, um, and went over the different positions and where we were.

Through that particular discussion, I asked for Miss Hoskins to provide the detailed information to the rest of the Council so that we had it. So I was just basically concerned because we had a program running; at no point had we heard any information about the program other than the two times in which the PowerPoint slide was created, um, to show the budget. And it was an overall budget. There was no itemized budget in terms of, um, how the teacher -- who -- who's gonna be paid with the teachers. None of that was concluded in this. And so I asked for the information. I never got it. I did bring it back up, and at this point we're back here now to get the full story as to how the program ran, um, what it entailed.

And, um, I know right now, Miss Hoskins, you provided the numbers with the interns, the breakdown, you had the nine interns. During the meeting, I believe it was the June 6th meeting, um, it was stated that we had -- well, for the test prep, which was the boot camp I would imagine, it was 60 students that were stated that were in the program. How did it go from 60 to 32? That -- on June 6th we had 60. Did we have children that dropped out?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** I would have to say so.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Who can answer it? Who can tell me for sure?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Um, is Miss Poole here?

**UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER:** Who?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Miss Poole, Beverly Poole. She was -- no?

**UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER:** Miss Shirley (unintelligible).

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Oh, okay.

**UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER:** Walking in the door now.

SPECIAL CITY COUNCIL MEETING  
American High-Tech Transcription  
Largo, FL 33771

JULY 17, 2018  
2600 East Bay Drive, Suite 215  
727-535-1066

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well, according to our -- our chart here, the organizational chart, we had Miss Grimsley as the director.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Uh-huh.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So somebody reported to Miss Grimsley. Correct?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Right. Mr., um, Richardson was the program manager.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So did he provide weekly updates to Miss Grimsley about the program or -- because it never made it to us. So who was responsible for that?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** I would have to, um, ask, um, Miss Valerie if he provided weekly updates. I know we met with them a couple of times, Mr. Horton and myself.

**VALERIE GRIMSLEY:** He did not.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** But -- okay. But in the back-up it said that Miss Grimsley -- it said SYEP core staff began reporting directly to Valerie Grimsley on Thursday, July 5th, 2018. Prior to this date, staff reported directly to Program Manager Gregory Richardson. But according to the organizational chart, he should have reported to Miss Grimsley still.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Correct.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** But -- so why wasn't he reporting to her before July 5th?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** July, um -- July 5th -- and I may have my dates mixed up -- he was terminated from the program, so the other staff reported directly to Miss Grimsley.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So -- so from the beginning of the program, which was what, June --

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** It started June what, 7th?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** 7th. June 7th until July 5th, when Mr. Richardson no longer worked there. Who did he report to?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** The organizational chart says Miss Grimsley, but was he reporting to you or --

**VALERIE GRIMSLEY:** Mr. Richardson only reported to me if he had an issue --

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**VALERIE GRIMSLEY:** -- that I needed to resolve as a City employee.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So you -- as the director of this program, were you involved with the program from the beginning of June up until July 5th?

**VALERIE GRIMSLEY:** I did have some involvement, yes.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** What was your involvement?

**VALERIE GRIMSLEY:** Um, making sure City policy was followed, uh, making sure the connection between HR and the program -- meaning the kids' applications were taken to HR and processed. Um, anything else that we needed as far as phones, that type of thing.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** But the daily reporting or giving any updates or just running the program, were you involved in that? Did you direct that?

**VALERIE GRIMSLEY:** No. Mr. Richardson actually ran the day-to-day programs.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. But he only reported to you if there was an issue.

**VALERIE GRIMSLEY:** If there was an issue, yes.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** With the children, it said nine interns and 32 boot camp. I have the Excel spreadsheet here with the children on here who were enrolled in the boot camp and I noticed that it said something about, uh -- quite a few of them said the children were not Riviera Beach youth, um, or they were not Riviera Beach, uh -- they didn't attend a Riviera Beach school. When we designed the program -- and I don't recall -- did we say -- or should these children live in Riviera Beach or attend the Riviera Beach school? Was that a part of our plan?

**VALERIE GRIMSLEY:** My intent was that it was gonna be Riviera Beach kids or they would be Riviera Beach school participants, which means Suncoast, Inlet Grove, Riviera Beach Prep. Those are our high schools.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** For the program last year did -- did we open it up to those outside of those parameters?

**VALERIE GRIMSLEY:** No. They had to show that they were Riviera Beach residents either by mail, school report cards, or ID.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So when they enrolled this year, was the same process followed when they registered to participate in the program?

**VALERIE GRIMSLEY:** Not to my knowledge, no.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Who would have -- who was doing the registering?

**VALERIE GRIMSLEY:** The registering was done by Mr. Richardson, uh, and his staff.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Is Mr. Richardson still here?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** No. He was terminated.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. All right. Also on the boot camp list it shows that some of the students were in the Edgenuity credit recovery. Was that a part of the boot camp? What -- what -- is that the boot camp that we had the 32 kids in? Miss Hoskins?

**VALERIE GRIMSLEY:** Are you asking me or --

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Whoever knows.

**VALERIE GRIMSLEY:** Edgenuity is credit recovery. That's a credit recovery program.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Was that the City's program?

**VALERIE GRIMSLEY:** No.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Was that the boot camp?

**VALERIE GRIMSLEY:** City doesn't do credit recovery. Only the schools do.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. So the students who are on this list -- since Mr. Richardson is not here and he didn't report to Miss Hoskins -- I mean Miss Grimsley, who in here can answer why the Edgenuity



kids are on the list? And did they get -- did they get paid? Does anyone know if they got paid?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Uh, Miss Brooks is -- is that Miss Brooks in the back? Miss Poole?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** That's the other Miss Brooks over there, our Miss Brooks.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** And Miss, uh -- Miss Beverly Poole?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Hello. Hello.

**SHIRLEY MADISON BROOKS:** Shirley Madison Brooks.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Hi. How you doing? And your -- what's your title, Miss Brooks, with the program?

**SHIRLEY MADISON BROOKS:** For what?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Your title with the program?

**SHIRLEY MADISON BROOKS:** Program coordinator.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. So the children who were in the -- who are listed as the Edgenuity credit recovery, that's not a part of the boot camp?

**SHIRLEY MADISON BROOKS:** Yes, it is. However, we have another young lady, Patsy --

**UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER:** She's right there, Patsy, right in the front row.

**SHIRLEY MADISON BROOKS:** Come on. She handled the boot camp and she could tell you --

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**SHIRLEY MADISON BROOKS:** -- everything that you need about the boot camp.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**PATSY AUGUST:** Patsy August.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Hello, Patsy.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Hello. Good evening.

**PATSY AUGUST:** Yes. Good evening. Um, I was hired by the City, um, to be a voice for the students, um, participating in the boot camp at Riviera Beach Prep, the youth advocate.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**PATSY AUGUST:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So in terms of the boot camp, um, component, was the Edgenuity credit recovery -- Miss Grimsley said that is not what the boot -- we don't do that; that's through the school district. So was that a part of our boot camp curriculum that we were following?

**PATSY AUGUST:** I was under the assumption that all the kids were part of the boot camp.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And I appreciate you all being here, but I really have a problem with speaking to the temporary staff and -- and, you know, placing all of the responsibility on them because they should be reporting to someone who is in -- who is a City employee, and I'm not getting that answer right now that we actually had a City employee overseeing the program. Um, the orientation that you all may have -- you said you assumed that that was a part of it. Who would have told you that they were or they weren't a part of the program?

**PATSY AUGUST:** When I, um, went to the school on the first day, um, of the boot camp, which was June 11th, I was sent over there with a list of the boot camp, um, students that were attending.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**PATSY AUGUST:** I was told to meet them over there and have them sign in.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**PATSY AUGUST:** Uh-huh.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So when the children registered for the program, who handled that? That was just Mr. Richardson or one of you were a part of that process as well?

**PATSY AUGUST:** We all did, but I worked under Mr. Richardson.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**PATSY AUGUST:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So with this being a credit recovery program, the director, Miss Valerie Grimsley, said that is not a part of our boot camp. So were these children paid as well?

**PATSY AUGUST:** Yes, they were.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. All right. Thank you. Now --

**SHIRLEY MADISON BROOKS:** Council --

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**SHIRLEY MADISON BROOKS:** May I state something?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Uh-huh.

**SHIRLEY MADISON BROOKS:** Uh, when we first got there and we had to register the kids -- and what we did, we did our intake. And when Miss Patsy went over to, uh, Riviera Beach Prep, the kids, they were in boot camp. They spent half of their time in boot camp and the other in that Ingenuity. Now, no one stated to us -- and we were, us, reporting to Miss Grimsley on a daily base. If this was so, this should have been brought up to us. This never came to us until Mr. Richardson -- he did this Power -- this display, and then she took it and she revised it and didn't say anything to Mr. Richardson or to us. So we are in a dilemma ourselves when we were told to take the kids in the whole program over at Riviera Beach Prep.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Okay. So when we had the program last year, Miss Grimsley, was the program at another location or was it at Lindsey Davis Center?

**VALERIE GRIMSLEY:** Last year the program -- the entire program was ran out of Lindsey Davis Community Center.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And how much involvement did you have with that?

**VALERIE GRIMSLEY:** I had total involvement, and I provided my weekly reports to Mr. Evans.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. And then this year the decision was made to have the children over -- were all of the kids over at Riviera Beach Prep or just a certain group of kids were at Riviera Beach Prep?

**VALERIE GRIMSLEY:** Just the education camp.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** The education camp. And did you make daily visits over there from June 6 or whatever we said the beginning was up until the July 5th date?

**VALERIE GRIMSLEY:** No. In the entire camp I've made three visits to that school.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So Mr. Richardson and the staff were not reporting anything to you? Or when you went over there, what was --

**VALERIE GRIMSLEY:** Actually boot camp was already going for an entire -- almost an entire week before I found out that the boot camp was up and going and Mr. Richardson said something to me about it. Um, he said something about, "Patsy's over at the school. She's registering the kids. She's getting them going." I said, "At what school? And where are the teachers?" So Mr. Richardson brought it to my attention. At that point the boot camp was already moving along. It was in its third or fourth day at that point, which is when I found out. Mr. Richardson had to tell me where the boot camp was being held. I know we were trying to get two other additional schools, which I assume they fell through. So Mr. Richardson said the boot camp was at Prep and that the teachers were already hired.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So --

**VALERIE GRIMSLEY:** And just for clarification, um, I know Miss Brooks stated that Mr. Richardson did do the spreadsheet. Mr. Richardson did start a spreadsheet after we had a meeting, and I said I need to know who the kids are in the camp and who the kids are that are working, where they're placed. At that point I wasn't satisfied with his spreadsheet. So I asked for the files of the kids who were participating, and I went through each and every file and revamped the spreadsheet so we would have clear and concise information.

As far as the staff reporting to me every day, I don't mean you any disrespect because you are my elder, but this staff did not report to me every day. Um, they reported to Mr. Richardson. Um, we had periodic meetings, but we didn't have periodic meetings until maybe three weeks ago. We would have meetings; and in those meetings, we had administration in those meetings.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Who is administration?

**VALERIE GRIMSLEY:** Upper administration.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So, Miss Hoskins, with this program, with it being on last year, um, Miss Grimsley was more hands-on and involved. What changed this year that she was unable to -- it sounds like she was not kept in the loop even though she is the director, but Mr. Richardson was almost the director and didn't have anyone to report to or to take direction from, from the City. Why -- why was there a change in the way the programs were run last year and this year? And it doesn't seem like, um, we had any accountability, um, for the staff. And -- and -- and -- and when you answer that, could you tell me why Mr. Richardson is no longer a part of the program?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Last year I was not, um -- I was the assistant finance director, so I'm not sure how, um, involved the administration was at that time. And I believe it was, um -- when the program was presented last year it was presented by, um, a councilmember, um, Councilmember Hubbard. So the program, um, last year -- like I said, I wasn't intimately involved. I did assist with the budget where we transferred \$300,000 from the CRA money to fund the program. Last year they spent 120,000, um, year to date for the program and they had approximately 70 kids involved.

Now, this year, um, the staffing is different. Instead of having an outside, um, job coach -- meaning last year they had an outside job coach -- they used a temp, um, agency to hire the outside job coach. This year, um, we went through the HR process and hired one program manager. That, um, organizational chart was presented to you all at the April meeting. And, um, also at the April meeting you said you would hire one -- two advocates and the job developer, which went through the, um -- went through HR. We presented you all with a, uh, job description for all of the positions, um, and those positions were advertised. So it was my intent to have those positions to report to Miss Grimsley. Um, if that was not happening, um, initially -- I'm not sure what happened.

Um, and then when administration, um, went over to meet -- to see how the program was going, which was -- may have been about a month or so or earlier, um, sat down, talked with the, um -- with the employees and talked about the program and, you know, reiterated that they're to report directly to Miss Grimsley because we were having issues with some of the paperwork. Although 52 or 65 kids attended the Job Training and Readiness Program, uh, we actually hired, um, way less number. So, um, had issues with the paperwork. And when we would ask for reports, um, we, you know, were told that we would get the reports within the hour. The reports weren't sent till three or four days later. And when we started questioning, you know, "If you have the report now, why is it taking you three or four days to send us the report?" So, uh --

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Who were you requesting that of?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Mr. Richardson. So, um, that's when, you know, we were, um -- we made the decision to let Mr. Richardson go because there were, uh, some issues with some of the paperwork and, you know, providing reports to, uh, management and, uh, Miss Grimsley. So after that, um, event -- that event occurred we asked, um, that the staff report to Miss Grimsley; and that no matter how many youth we have in the program, as long as we have one child that's not on the streets, then it's successful. Um, as long as we have one young man that's not on the streets and not getting gunned down, it's successful. So I was satisfied with that.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** All right. I'll hold on for a minute, anybody else wanted to go.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Chair Pro Tem, you're recognized.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Um, a couple things I want -- one thing I want to clarify first and foremost is about the Ingenuity and the boot camp, and the reason that the boot camp was held off-site in a classroom setting. We were going to different -- we, um, were talking about and planning this program and -- with Valerie, uh, and trying to get this program going. The reason it was off program is for two reasons. There wasn't enough room for a classroom situation for two strategic personnels to offer what we were trying to offer. Valerie Grimsley even so stated, "If you all get some classrooms, um, maybe I can have some classrooms where you get it." We were really hoping to be closer at Inlet Grove, but there was gonna be a cost associated with us going to Inlet Grove and we were able to go to, um -- to, uh, Riviera Beach Prep and we were not going to have to pay, uh -- Inlet Grove is now a charter school and that was -- that was the difference.

They, um -- while we were going around, we were talking to, um, different, um, educators about the fact that there were 400 kids -- this is what piqued my attention and what -- what I wanted to, uh, bring forward to the Council about having a boot camp -- 400 kids was poised to receive a certificate as opposed to a regular high school diploma. So that really got my attention. And as I began to talk with these educators as to ask them what is the problem, why is this the case, they were saying the kids are not passing either the ACT or the FSAT tests; and you have kids that have 3.0s that were not passing the tests and they did not have the strategies to take the tests; while they could read, they were comprehending, but there were certain strategies that they were missing.

What the school had allowed them to do during the year is start with credit recovery and they could get a credit -- they could finish -- getting a credit in the summer and also participate in the boot camp. So they had a two-for-one. And they said, you know, you all are coming to our school and if you want -- if some of your kids are already doing, uh, credit recovery, they can do -- they can -- we'll -- we'll -- we'll allow them to participate in that and we'll allow them to go to the boot camp strategy class. So we asked the teachers -- the two teachers that we had are seasoned strategists for taking the tests and they have had great success.

So we called -- so we talked to some of the, um, people in the school district to see which were the teachers that were really have the most, uh, success with this and could they recommend some of their strategists to teach these boot camps. So those, uh, people were allowed -- the students, if you will, were allowed to work on that credit and take -- and avail themselves of the strategies and to take the test this Saturday when the test took place. We're hoping that they all were successful to pass the test. But it was a two-for-one. They allowed our kids to do credit recovery and participate in the boot camp because they were on -- they were on campus. That's why they were allowed. And, you know, it was -- it was a good thing for our kids -- for our kids to have -- for us to have 400 kids poised to talk about not getting regular certificates but they're going to have, um, a general certificate and not -- they get a regular diploma. You know, I just felt compelled that we needed to do something about that. Somebody should be upset about that. I felt somebody should be, you know, concerned about something like that.

So when -- given the, um -- given that information, it, you know, became a real problem. Dr. Garrett is here in the audience. I met with them to talk about -- her and her former staff to talk about what can we do to get some of these kids graduating. What can we do and how can we do it? She said at a certain time kids are only gonna take ACT. They're gonna be focused on ACT. And what -- the other thing she said that you have to remember, they're gonna not only pass the test, they're gonna have to have the required amount of credits. So if they get the credits in the summer and pass the test, then they're well on their way. So we weren't trying to pay anybody that wasn't a part of the program.

And the way the district is cut up now and the way the system works, um, it's hard to say you live in Riviera Beach, you go to school in West Palm; you go to school in West Palm, you live in Riviera Beach. You might be an academic problem; you might be a behavior problem. And I'm learning all this from these educators that I'm talking to. You might bring your kid out to Riviera Beach because this school is open longer or your kid can get this grade and you can help the kid graduate. So some of the kids might go to school here or live there or what have you, but they're all youth. And, you know, um, as the

Manager said, I think the more programs we have, the more education we try to avail our kids of, the less we hear -- the less we have with the kids and the tragedies that we had in the last, uh, 48 hours.

You know, we've got to keep them availed. We've gotta keep them -- keep them engaged. And so that's -- that's what I wanted to speak to, Ingenuity. Ingenuity is just that, credit recovery. It wasn't -- it wasn't a scam or anything. It was a privilege. It was an add-on, a benefit to the ACT/FSA, uh, strategy that the kids, um, were able to, uh, avail themselves -- to avail themselves of at this point.

The, um -- I don't know, um -- I myself even went over to volunteer, to call, to get on the phone to try to get different employers throughout the community to hire some of our kids to be in this program. I, uh -- we were successful in getting some private, uh, companies to hire the kids for the summer program. We just got on the phone, made calls, talked to different people, see were they interested. You're right, the program started late. We ran into numerous obstacles trying to get out of the gate, to get ahead of this, to get the program going. It was for one reason or another that we were stumped because some -- you know, one person felt it wasn't their idea. The other person felt that it was gonna be a personal benefit. It's none of that. It's these children. And these homicides we've had with children 20 and under in the last 48 hours, it's gonna -- it needs to always be about them.

Yes, we have -- it didn't go as well as I wanted. If anybody remember, I wanted to have 500 kids employed, 500 kids employed. But after I found out about the 400 kids that weren't gonna be receiving a high school diploma, I said, well, you know, it's -- it's -- they have another -- they have other times to go and work; we need to get them educated right now and they can go off to work later. So that kind of changed and -- and just getting out of the gate so -- so late, we weren't able to build a relationship with the community and get all the buy-in from the different companies that I -- you know, I had hoped that we would get -- that we would get.

But, you know, I too, um -- I too as, uh, the Manager said, for the kids that we did serve, for the kids that participated, I am -- I am glad of that. I know that, uh, the Commissioner sent out about 18 questions, uh, and that they -- they -- they were answered. I don't, um -- the only time we had a presentation that I tried to answer the questions. Mrs. Grimsley was sick and she had taken ill and she wasn't here at that presentation. So between me and Miss Hoskins, we tried to answer the questions off the cuff. We didn't have the presentation that would have been -- would have been made.

So, you know, I can come back and address some of the other stuff. I've been taking notes as to some of the allegations that have been made, um, today.



But, um, nothing went wrong or awry with -- with -- with that program at all. Mr., um, Richardson was dismissed. He, um, allegedly did not produce the updates and the spreadsheets, um, and -- and so he was dismissed. But other than that, I -- you know, um, I don't see anything wrong. I hope, uh, Miss Poole, Miss Brooks, um, if you all want to -- I can stop now if you all want to say something.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam City Manager.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Just to answer the Mayor's question about the, um, salaries expended year to date, of the 16,914 expended in regular salaries and wages for the SYEP program, approximately 11,304, um, has been spent year to date for the, um, program manager, the advocate, and the job developer.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Botel, you're recognized. Um, she was -- I'm sorry. She wasn't finished.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** They, um, had something that they wanted to say, Mrs. Brooks or Mrs., uh, Poole.

**SHIRLEY MADISON BROOKS:** First I would like to say to the Mayor and to the councilpeople and Miss Karen, I would like to thank Miss Karen and Mr. Willie to coming over to our site to help us get the proper things that we need to run this program because at first we didn't have anything.

Now, I don't step out of line and I don't disrespect anyone. We was told to report to Mr. Richardson because he was our person to report to, and we reported to him and he reported to Miss Valerie on a daily base. The only time Miss Valerie came in and we -- we asked her for any emails that we have -- you know, we're supposed to receive anything, we didn't have an email until - - well, I received mine about a week ago and I've been here since June the 4th. And you received yours when? About two weeks --

**UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER:** Two weeks.

**SHIRLEY MADISON BROOKS:** Two weeks prior to me. And Miss Patsy never received one.

We did what we supposed to do. We did it with all the knowledge that we have in that building, working, uh, at Lindsey Davis, over 75 years of experience. We took our -- and took our hat off and tried to do what we had to do to make

this program work and we did not get -- and I don't want to say this very lightly because I don't disrespect anyone, their dignity, nor their character, but we didn't get -- we got little to none communication or anything from Miss Valerie.

Now, I was told this was separate programs because she could only take only 74 kids -- 73 or 74 kids in her program and the rest had to be turned over to us, and that's when we tried to do as much as we could to get everybody placed. We had over 159 kids, applicants that came through. They fell by the wayside. You know, we called. We sent people out to vendors. Some people didn't have the skills nor the qualifications. And with the boot camp, I think it was a perfect idea and I think we need to have that and have more of that in the future. Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Botel, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Thank you. I have a number of questions, but in light of the hour I'm happy to take the answers off-line from City Manager.

Um, in the first place I wondered why HR was not more involved in the hiring process and I wondered how often -- how much in advance of the program the positions were advertised. I wondered, um -- as a school administrator, I wondered how much, uh, previous notice the school district had and what arrangements were made with the school district to use that facility. Um, I wonder, you know, what kind of advanced preparation they had. Um, as a councilperson who was offered the opportunity to take an intern and didn't really know exactly what I would do with that young person, um, I rejected the offer, but I do see that others, um, on Council did. Uh, there were one, two, three, four -- at least four or five interns offered to councilpeople and I wondered what the outcomes were expected and what they were for those young people in the ages of 16, 17, 21. I think there are nine of them who served as interns for councilpeople.

I guess I understand what the outcomes were for the boot camp and for the, um, program to prepare kids for the test. You know, obviously it's test prep and you want to expect the kids are gonna do better on the test. But what exactly were the outcomes intended? And you don't have to answer me now, but I'd like to have at some point an answer. What were the outcomes intended for kind of hanging around with councilpeople? What were they expected to learn and -- and, you know, what were they expected to do over that period of time?

Um, and also, you know, I have in front of me, as we all did, that yellow and green spreadsheet that was marked all over draft, draft, draft, and that's where I thought originally we were spending 174,000 to employ, you know, a small

number of kids. I wonder of those, uh, nine or 10 kids who are marked here as interns, how many of those at 8 and a quarter an hour did we actually employ, or was this just a draft number that was given to us? It's difficult for me to tell looking at the budget, that's the final budget, how many of those numbers were actually children -- as, uh, the Mayor asked earlier, how many were students and how many were, uh, actually adults that were employed.

Um, I also had a question -- and again, I don't need to have this tonight. Um, it was McDonald's and PJ Marriott and Chen Moore and State Farm who employed the students who had actual jobs in outside companies other than the City. I wondered what arrangements were made with them so that in the future we can maybe entice other companies, other private industries, private people to employ our kids. I don't know that I learned enough about that prior to the summer. As a board member in the Tiara, I don't know if we could have employed kids on Singer Island, for example. So I just wonder what kind of tax benefits there might have been, what kind of incentives there might have been for private employers to employ some of these kids, and I think that's the extent of my questions. Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** So the questions that I have to start out with, you indicated that you corresponded with Miss Grimsley, but we need to just cut to the chase because this was an initiative that was brought forth by Chair Pro Tem. Who told you that you were to respond directly to Mr. Richardson?

**SHIRLEY MADISON BROOKS:** Uh, we went by the organization chart.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Whom -- who gave you the organizational chart?

**SHIRLEY MADISON BROOKS:** I seen the -- your organization chart when they presented here at home on the screen. I seen that. That's the one I seen. And they had details of --

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** So I have concern with the mere fact that the folks who are in the position of coordinating and developing cannot provide the direct answers as it related to who gave you your marching orders and how.

**SHIRLEY MADISON BROOKS:** But who gave me the direct to report to Mr. Richardson was Miss Valerie. She -- she -- she told us that we report to Mr. Richardson.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Miss Grimsley, just -- hold on, Miss Grimsley.

**SHIRLEY MADISON BROOKS:** She stated to us Mr. Richardson was our supervisor. And when he left, yes, she gave that direct to us.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Miss Hubbard -- Chair Pro Tem Hubbard, so with this being your initiative, what was your involvement and how did you establish the various positions? Because there seems to be an incredible disconnect with who was responsible for what. We knew that -- we know that this was your initiative. We know, um -- we -- we just really need to understand and flesh out who hired whom, how we got to this point; and the end result is what is the benefit to the taxpayers, what is the benefit to the children that participated and how we're handling that. I mean, that's the real thing. We're not here -- it just seems to me we are playing throw under the bus and we cannot do that. We are not throwing under the bus. What we're simply trying to do is get to the bottom of it so that we can resolve it because this is going to -- I foresee this going on for several more hours unnecessarily so. So if we could just get to the fact of the matter and address it.

And I even see my intern out there and I can tell you, uh, Councilwoman Botel, what my expectation was for her to come in and understand -- uh, get a brief overview of what municipal government is. She's attended some meetings with me and it is for her to understand the exchange between organizations and individuals. So there were definite outcomes for me and expectations with my intern, who's sitting here, and she has an exam coming up but she wanted to be here, to be present and to participate. Would you stand up?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Did you set those outcomes at the --

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** That was my --

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** -- at the direction of the program?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I set those outcomes with the expectation of what I wanted an intern to see.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** You set them, but the program didn't set them.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** That's what I wanted for her, yes.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Because you set them.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes. That's what I wanted for her.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** So we just really need to, uh -- you know, Pasqual Reed of my office, uh, works with her. You know, we met. She came over to an ITE meeting for the Palm Beach County League of Cities. She got to hear presentations of business. She's been able to, uh, have an exchange with me and as well as other people in industry. So that's the whole idea of bringing them in, is about exposure and opportunity. That's what it's for. And I believe that we met the intent of the councilwoman and of this program as it related to how we worked with our intern, absent of anything other than the notification that you wanted to place some students with us.

So back to my original point. Miss Grimsley -- it appears to me that Miss Grimsley was not actively involved in this process. Is that fair to say? I mean, are we -- let me say it this way. Miss Grimsley has indicated that she was not actively involved. So therefore, what we need from you all are really clear answers as to where you received your direction, how you interacted or not interacted with Miss -- with Miss Grimsley, and where the program is now, and how do we get to whatever success we're going to get to as a result of the dollars that we've expended in the people that we've hired.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Madam Chair, you asked, um --

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Chair Pro Tem.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** -- early on, um, what, um -- I think I almost forgot your question for me. But first of all I want to start off by thanking you for, uh, accepting -- I know Miss Brooks said that she was gonna call all of the councilpeople and see if she could get them to take on an intern and, um, some -- some took on an intern and I want to thank you for that. Um, Mr., uh -- Councilman T.D. Davis took on an intern and, um, you and your aide developed a, um, outline of things that you would like them to see. No, we didn't create, um -- and I was not going to, uh, create a, um, outline or a template for the elected officials to, um, do with their intern because our day-to-day operations are different and, um, as you saw Mrs., um -- Councilwoman Tonya Davis Johnson had a wonderful program that she created at the call of Miss Brooks for the -- for the young person that worked with her. And so we're -- we're grateful for that. We did not have to provide the councilwoman with my direction or any outline. She, um, wanted to participate and so therefore she did.

The, um -- once Mr. Richardson -- first let me back up a little bit. The, um -- Mrs. -- I sat on the interview panel. Once we went over the people and we chose the people for the program we said -- we said, "What do you think of this? Who do you think of that? What do you think of -- of these persons?" And that's how we got to the -- to the bottom line of the people that -- that was hired. But -- and I think as Mrs., um, Brooks indicated, Miss Brooks has over

30 years of experience with job development, the County and Head Start. Miss Poole has retired from Work Force Alliance with 30 years of job development experience. When I saw their résumés, of course I was excited about, uh, that coming to the City and the relationships that they might be able to help us build so that we can, um, make and create relationship.

As they pointed out to us, it takes more time than what we allowed ourselves to create those types of relationships. And as they have suggested to us, we must send out letters, start early, and continue to build relationships. It's about relationships. That's how you get people to, um -- that's how we acquire private partnerships for our endeavor. And we just have to keep trying and keep -- and keep building where we, uh -- where we're from. We have, um, to talk about the end result and what we received for the monies that expended.

We have the youth here. We have Dr. Garrett here. We have some of our, um, outside employers here that, uh -- that are gonna speak to that, that are going to speak to what we receive, because the dollar amount for everything is on the paper. We did not waste a coin. We didn't waste a coin. We used - - we were very prudent in everything that was done. We had -- we were approved for two advocates. When we saw that we only had enough children for one, we immediately cut it down to one advocate. We were approved for two developers. We cut that down to one. We were prudent with the dollars that were allowed to be spent in this program. And I think that there might be some angst, you know, because it was, uh, an initiative brought forth by myself, but it's -- that part is okay.

What I want everybody to remember, there is nothing good about children receiving a certificate when they have the opportunity to get a regular diploma. To expose kids to different career paths and opportunities, that's a good thing, nothing else. Now, Mr. Richardson, Miss Poole, Mrs., uh, August, Miss Brooks, anybody can look at their résumés to see that they were qualified. You can look at their history. They're not related to me. They're no personal friends of mine. You can -- 90 percent of you know Mrs. Brooks from the election pools because she covers Lindsey Davis and Mary McLeod Bethune for years. That's where I first saw her -- saw her at.

So, you know, I don't -- I'm not really sure about, uh, what's going on or -- or what -- no one -- and I know all the employees here have hired somebody that they have had to let go; it just didn't work out. Just didn't work out. It happens. So they weren't, um -- Valerie and the management weren't pleased with, um, the -- didn't get their expectations met on that level of reporting. So that was a decision that they were able to make, so they did. But it has -- it says nothing about the success of this program. What it says, if we learn from some of the things that has happened, two, we start earlier, we continue to grow and build and make something good for our -- for the kids in the city of Riviera Beach.

So, Madam Chair, if, um, we can -- I guess we'll soon hear from, uh, the -- from the kids that came out to talk about their experience. Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Mayor, I believed you asked to be recognized. Do you have anything?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yes, I do.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** You're recognized, Mr. Mayor.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you. Mr. Attorney, a question for you. Did you have an opportunity to advise, uh, Councilwoman Hubbard as far as any legal, uh, matters as this program -- in reference to this program?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** I did not.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Did you ever -- was you ever asked by anyone was it, uh, ethical or legal or proper for a councilperson to be involved in the hiring process? That's foreign to me.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** I was not aware she was in the hiring process.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** But now that you are aware, do you feel that is -- is that illegal or unethical? Is there a problem with that? Because we want to -- we're not gonna make the same mistakes going forward. As the Chair pointed out, we just want to move forward to make sure if we made mistakes that we did something --

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** The question is whether or not there's --

**MAYOR MASTERS:** It won't happen again.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Illegal for her to participate in the hiring process.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Put your microphone to you, please, sir.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** The question presented is whether or not it is illegal for her to participate in the hiring process. And without research, as I sit here now, I can think of no prohibition.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Unethical?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** If it ain't legal, it's probably ethical.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Let me ask you this, then. Do you know in your years of experience as a City attorney any elected official that's ever been involved in hiring anybody on a committee? You know, is that -- that's a yes or no.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** The question is inappropriate because it's too broad. You all hire people all the time.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay. Well, you don't want to answer it. Let me move on. Thank you. I didn't -- I didn't think you would answer it.

Um, Miss Grimsley, come to the mike and I'm finished. Hold on one second. Miss Patsy, come back, please. You were hired by the City?

**PATSY AUGUST:** Yes.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Who hired you when you say the City?

**PATSY AUGUST:** I got called by Miss Valerie Grimsley. Um, when I got to the center she was, um, I think looking around for some members that was supposed to sit on the panel with her to interview me, um, but at the end of the day I got, um, interviewed by Mr. Richardson and Miss Lynne Hubbard.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** By Mr. Richardson and Miss -- Miss Lynne Hubbard.

**PATSY AUGUST:** Yes.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** And I guess you -- you passed, so you were hired and doing a good job from what I can see. Thank you for your time.

Miss Grimsley? And I wrap it up with you. Just in case -- if people are listening and viewing this and you don't know the reputation of this young lady as a department head or a program director -- and I will not sit here and allow anyone to imply in any way kind of way that -- if it was anybody else, maybe, yes, but not Valerie Grimsley. I've had an opportunity to work with this young lady since I have been the Mayor and we have never had any complaints. We have never had any problems. She has, um, I guess you could say promoted -- she took this program, the County -- I think there was only five cities at the time that adopted or supported the Youth Empowerment and that was because Valerie Grimsley ran this program and she ran it good.

**AUDIENCE:** (Clapping).

**MAYOR MASTERS:** And, you know, we heard a lot of stuff, you know, going on, I mean be it right, be it wrong, rumors and all that, and people talking about someone looking at it and this, that and the other, which I won't go into, but what I will say is I want you to have the last word, that I'm giving you an



opportunity to say whatever you want to say as it relates to this program based upon the other programs that you have ran successfully for this City. For many, many years you have sweated, worked hard and got grants, got money -- when the City may not have been there, you were there and got grant money from the County and I think we matched. You led, gave leadership under your watch for a building to be built for these children to have somewhere to go and to have Youth Empowerment. And our Youth Empowerment Program has accolades from the County, from the State, and you have earned it. You have deserved it and you have merited it. Please speak.

**VALERIE GRIMSLEY:** Um, personally I think it's a good program. Um, anything to help kids, it's always a good thing, um, as long as we implement it the right way. Um, we did a great job last year. I'm sure we're gonna do a great job in the future. Um, my only thing is I take integrity very, very, very high, um, and I don't like sabotage of character, um, and that's what happened here tonight. So, um, I think next year we'll do a better job and we'll just keep doing what we have to do for the Riviera Beach kids.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you for hanging in there with us. Mr. Attorney, I'm very disappointed at the answer you gave me. Madam Chair, I'm done.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Clerk --

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Madam Chair, may I speak, please?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes, Mr. Attorney, you're recognized.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** I addressed the question you asked and I advised you --

**MAYOR MASTERS:** You want to go back and forth with me?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** No, sir. I just -- I wanted --

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I would not like for that to take place.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay. Well, he responds --

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I would not like for that --

**MAYOR MASTERS:** If he responds, I'm gonna respond.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Mayor, please.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** If he responds, I'm gonna respond.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Mayor, Mr. Attorney --

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** -- we have the business of the City to conduct and this needs to stop.

**DISCUSSION AND DELIBERATION REGARDING AETNA INSURANCE OVERPAYMENT.**

**INTERIM DEPT. DIRECTOR: EUREKA IRVIN (561) 840-4880**

**RISK MANAGER: MARIE SULLIN (561) 840-4879**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** We are now moving into discussion and deliberation regarding Aetna Insurance overpayment. Begin with the City Manager, please.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair, tonight, um, Miss Marie Sullin, uh, will give a brief presentation on what occurred, uh, during the, um, timeline of when the, um, overpayment was made to, um, Aetna and, um, another insurance company. I believe it's a four-year timeline. Um, at this time I'll call Miss Sullin to the podium.

**MARIE SULLIN:** Good evening, Council, Mayor. Oh, Mayor's not here. Madam Manager. Marie Sullin, Human Resources Risk Manager. Um, I want to take the time to go through the timeline of events from the time we became aware of the actual, um, overpayment to Aetna Health Care, and prior to that since the time period are two different carriers at the time, Coventry Health Care.

So basically on October 31st, 2014, the Human Resources director retired, at which time on October 31st of 2014 I was appointed interim Human Resources director. My responsibilities included, um, the HR director's function, the risk manager function, liability claims management, response to interrogatories from third party, response for deferred compensation issues, Workers' Compensation and Disability management, City drug testing program, pre-employment medical testing, safety, FMLA, coordination of Reverend Martin Luther King, Jr., Parade, Health Fair, PFP, etcetera. Those are some of the things that at that time that I was responsible for.

On April 2016, the City insurance technician retired. Please note this retirement brought the vacancy to three positions in the division, with only the risk manager position filled. So at that time, once she's retired, I was the only personnel in Risk Management handling all issues I previously mentioned, including being the interim.

**SPECIAL CITY COUNCIL MEETING**  
American High-Tech Transcription  
Largo, FL 33771

**JULY 17, 2018**  
2600 East Bay Drive, Suite 215  
727-535-1066

On July 11, 2016, we hired an insurance technician. Then on October 24th, 2016, we hired a safety officer. On July 5th, 2017, we hired a benefit administrator, bringing the division to full complement of four personnel. Upon the hiring of the benefit administrator, which was in July 2017, Risk Management began to audit City benefits. At that time we were full complement, so we were able to do so. Prior to that, we were not able to do audits.

On July 2017, Risk notified carrier of discrepancies found during the initial audit. Please note terminations were completed manually at that time. We believe this may have caused the discrepancies found. As a result, now all maintenance and tracking is done through an automated process, reducing the numbers of errors experienced with the previous four years.

On July 2017, staff met with the carrier and broker for pre-renewal meeting. And on August 2017, during the insurance renewal meeting, Finance, City Manager, Risk Manager, broker, carrier representative were there, and Finance Director informed Risk Management of discrepancies within the bills. During the August and September month 2017, the time frame, because of those issues there was a delay in investigating the overpayment occurred. Resources had to be redirected to discover for mold issues, asbestos, water intrusion in police department, City Council's office, library facilities, and we had a hurricane.

On September 20th, 2017, an agenda item was presented to the Council to renew health insurances. In the agenda background it was identified that there were employees who were no longer employed under Resolution number 104-17.

September 26, 2017, Risk requested from I.T. to provide access of former insurance technician data to verify terminations that were completed and maintained -- and maintenance of bills that were completed or incorrectly completed. September through November 2017, received from Aetna three months' credit for all terminated members. From there we had open enrollment from September 2017 to October 16, '17, followed by liability insurance renewal.

December 28, 2017, received an email from Finance confirming original request of data from I.T. was available for review. Prior to that, I.T. had to try to attempt to restore files from the previous insurance technician and we had to obtain files from the previous technician from Iron Mountain, anything that was (unintelligible) to be able to recover to see when terminations were sent out, if they were sent out.

January 2018, reviewed the available data. We sent a bid to Aetna for additional credits. February 2018 through April, we continued to research data from 2014, 2015 year, 2016, and 2017. In addition, obtained access to archived files from I.T. May 2018, we met with the carrier on ongoing audits for credits and open enrollment.

June 2018, Risk, Finance, City Manager met to discuss ongoing audit for credits. Verification of Finance numbers and HR/Risk were done at that time.

June 2018, during that same time, a memorandum was sent to the City Manager to update in response to the citizens' inquiry at the special meeting held on June 25th, 2018. On July 2018 we met with Finance Director to update data for additional credits. Credit will be placed on the July 2018 billing, which means next month. Additional credits will be issued based upon verification of information that we're able to retrieve.

With respect to the retirees and the CRA, from 2014 to 2015, CRA employees were billed along with City employees within the same invoice. The CRA participate in our benefit program. CRA sends payment for all billed personnel to Finance to reconcile. So that is the reason why they were on the bill. CRA did not have a subaccount until 2016.

As it relates to the retirees, retirees are issued a benefit continuation letter upon retirement or, um, resignation, whatever the case may be. A copy of the continuation letter is sent to Finance, Utility billing, and the pension administrator for processing. The pension administrator, who is a third party, uh, that deducts retirees and forward the payments to Finance directly. A copy of the payment list is then forwarded to Risk Management after Finance receives it.

At this point now we have received a total of \$260,000 of credit, um, from Aetna. We continue still working with Aetna in obtaining additional information that we are able to retrieve from archived files from prior employees to forward to Aetna. Aetna is willing to continue crediting us as we obtain information and retrieve data.

So to date, um -- to date, from the 1,101,556.45 we have recouped 240,703.80 and, um, the adjusted balance forward for recoveries is 860,852.65. The difference in the credit was applied to the CRA personnel that were included in our billing and retirees who are actually active and may be paying for benefit premium through pension deduction and/or in-person billing.

What are our action plan with respect to this? We understand there was a failure. We know there was a failure. It obviously has been identified. At this point, um, we have since changed our reporting and our processing with

respect to payment and billings. So reports are dated back two months, where prior we would run a termination report based on the month that we're in and the information would be forwarded to the carrier. With that we basically -- this will assure any missed or late processed termination are picked up from the financial system because at time we may be litigation with an employee and they're not quite terminated yet. They may post it as inactive, and when the report is run they will not show up as being basically terminated because obviously they haven't been terminated quite yet, or depending on the case result based on the litigation matter.

Copies of list invoices are sent to Finance along with payment requests. Retirees' payments from pension administrators are reviewed by Risk and Finance for accuracy. Retirees who fail to make payments will be removed within 45 days for nonpayment. Upon receipt of nonpayment from Finance, Utility Billing Division, termination will be processed to avoid reimbursement limits to the carriers. Because in the past, when a retiree left the City, we provide them a letter. They have, um, 30 days basically to enroll for continuation of coverage, at which point if they do enroll -- and during that time if, for example, the retiree falls ill in the hospital, whatever the case may be, if they're paying in person, obviously they're not able to come in to make payment. But if they're having pension deduction, it's an automatic process, where all of our retirees are not actually processed that way currently.

We did bring that forward to Council about three years ago, wanting all the retirees to be deducted through pension, but there was, um, basically consensus that a lot of retirees basically did not want their pension to be deducted. So that's the reason why we have the two options.

So at this point what we basically -- to make the process much, much smoother and to avoid having additional discrepancies, we basically -- we'll remove the retirees within 45 days for nonpayment. If in case -- in the case that the retiree's actually in the hospital, whatever the case may be, and they're able to make the payments for the month that they were in the hospital, then from that point they would be reactivated, but until then we'd basically terminate their coverage.

So Human Resources have been restructured with respect to the Risk Management Division. The restructure included having a benefit administrator. Prior to that, we did not have a benefit administrator in the department. The benefit administrator will audit the bills on a monthly basis for corrections and termination, and we mean line by line, where previously we had to pay the bills according to the way the bill came in and then reconcile at a later time, where currently we are actually auditing each monthly bill line by line; and for any termination, correction or discrepancy, that information is forwarded to the Finance Department and also to the carrier.

In addition to that, as of November 2017, the City obtained access to easy access enrollment system to directly terminate benefit with the carrier. Prior to that we were sending faxes, we were emailing; from 2014 to 2017 that is. So prior to that we were doing the process manually or writing on the actual bill and sending it over to the carrier for someone to take care of. At this point in time, since November of 2017, we've actually obtained access to the system to be able to do the terminations since we do have a personnel now.

Changes are now made online and credits are posted on -- basically on the next bill cycle. So any changes that the benefit administrator goes online to do a termination, a change when an employee change from family to single coverage, whatever the case may be, then it is credited on the actual -- the next month. So if this is the month of July, any changes that we've made in July will be credited in the month of November.

At this point in time we are still continuing the process of recoveries. As we obtain information, the information is forwarded to Aetna. Aetna credits the account and that information -- the credit is forwarded to Finance so Finance can reconcile. And as we -- as a matter of fact, just a couple days ago we found three additional personnel that were actually processed. The terminations were processed and sent to Aetna and they are going to credit the account.

So it is an ongoing process. We are not done. Um, there's still data to go through and retrieve. We're trying to scrub everything, go through line by line each faxes, email that were sent, any items that were archived, any old bills, where we go through them basically to recover any additional dollars that we're able to.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Does that complete your presentation?

**MARIE SULLIN:** Yes, ma'am.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair?

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Madam Chair, we do have public comment cards.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you. How does this Council wish to proceed? Do we wish to hear public comment or do you want to go through your questions?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** We can go the public first.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Botel, your thought?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** I would like to make a comment and then -- then we can go to public comment if you allow me.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** What is your pleasure, Madam -- Chair Pro Tem?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** We can make our comments and then they can --

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay. Comments, Chair -- um, Councilwoman Botel, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** I think it's safe to say that we were all pretty horrified by what happened. I think the public is horrified and outraged. Um, I certainly have heard from many of my constituents that we want answers. My concern is that I don't think we're gonna get answers tonight and -- and I worry that this might just be the tip of the iceberg.

Um, I made a proposal weeks ago I think -- I would have to ask how long ago it was that I asked that we have an RFP for a company to come in and assist City Administration. It may not be just HR and Risk Management where there are issues where we don't follow or have policies and procedures in place that keep us from having things like this happen. How long ago was it, do you recall, City Manager?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** It was, um, 6 -- the first meeting in June. And you emailed me and I, um, said that I would have it at the end of Friday.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** You told me today that staff is reviewing the scope of services now.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Right.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** And it should be out by the end of the week.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Yes, ma'am.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** I would therefore like to suggest that we expedite that RFP and get someone in here immediately if not sooner to see if we can't help City Administration to ensure that we prevent anything like this from happening again. That's my first recommendation.

My second recommendation would be that we -- and I know that this has been recommended by my colleagues on this dais that we do a forensic audit to determine what has gone on here in this city with regard to the money that we have been spending. This is the money of the people, and the people will

demand that we give them answers with regard to this. We're not -- it's 9:15 at night. Last night we were here till 12:00. I doubt that we can conduct an investigation into what happened here in the course of time that we have tonight. And in fact, we're not equipped to do an investigation. We need professional help to come in here, investigate what went on and give us some real answers. So that's what I'm asking for. I'm asking for us to expedite the procurement of a firm to come in here and assist City Administration and the assistance of a financial audit to help us determine exactly what went on.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Did you ask to speak?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Chair Pro Tem and then Councilwoman Miller-Anderson. You're recognized, Chair Pro Tem.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** I want to go on record as saying, um, yes, everybody in the community, including myself, are quite disturbed by what has happened. I understand that we are handling this or we have handled this manually, but I think that as we do an item that we put on the agenda it is routed through a process. Just as if you go into the email, you will see people that are no longer here in the email queues. I think when someone leaves, that person need to be routed through each department, be -- just the employment side of HR, then the financial and risk management to go through I.T. in every department to -- so that we can keep the system clean and purge the records on a continual basis. Even if it was done manually, that I think, um, needs to and should have -- should have taken -- should have taken place. We do -- I am glad that we -- that we now have an automated system to keep up with this data and to bring it, uh, forward. We have gotten some recovery. Do you anticipate that we will be able to recoup the full \$1 million?

**MARIE SULLIN:** I can't say at this time because it's based on the data that I'm able to retrieve from what's been archived, from what's in our internal email system, from faxes that were -- you know, that were sent back from 20 -- we're talking about a period of 2014 to 2016.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** I notice that you mention on 2017 there was a memo indicating that there was something wrong with the -- with -- with the situation. What happened that night that that, um, wasn't brought, um, out?

**MARIE SULLIN:** The memo or the agenda item?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** The agenda item.



**MARIE SULLIN:** Okay. On the agenda item, um, I don't believe anything was said. It was written on there that during the time that Finance was actually doing the audit also, they put it on the background at that time that discrepancies were found that terminated employees were on the account, um, with respect to health insurance renewal and that the accounts -- you know, um, basically would it have an impact. However, Aetna graciously basically gave us a 3-percent rate, um, based upon the actual employees that were there. So they were not counted in. Their claims were not, uh -- basically did not impact the actual renewal nor this renewal because what Aetna did -- once basically we notified them, when we started going through the process of, um, reviewing the discrepancy, Aetna went back and all -- any -- anyone that would have a claim, basically the providers were sent something and the money basically would recoup, stating that they were not with the City at the time and that basically we would not be paying for their claim.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Two things to -- two things to -- to that end. One, based on what you said that there was an explanation to us that there was a discrepancy and that in that discrepancy Aetna was not counting those people with the 3-percent increase that we received that -- that the 3-percent increase that we received that was -- Aetna was providing a refund to us and there was no, um -- there was no, um, financial barrier or decision for us to make on that particular time because those people weren't counted and Aetna was not -- that wasn't going to serve on that item.

My other question is at that time the -- the -- the -- the manager did not, um, say to us what had been put in place or what was going to be put in place to stop this particular, uh, thing from happening again, but what I'm hearing is we were not charged, we -- and we talked about the increase of the insurance -- I mean the rate that we were gonna be charged and that's what the vote was taken on.

**MARIE SULLIN:** That is correct. The vote was taken upon the actual, um, personnel that were here, not terminated or deceased or anything, and we -- it's specifically one person that was deceased. Um, it's not, um, multiples. And in addition, the CRA personnel, they are actually on our insurance, CRA personnel. With the CRA, they are considered a subdivision of our account. So they have to be counted as part of the -- as part of participants of actual enrollees.

So, for example, if CRA have four people and the City have 430, so it has to be counted as 434 because they are on our City plan. They're not large enough to have their own plan separately, so that is the reason why they are counted within our plans. Back in '14 they were still on our plan. And what CRA did, they reconcile at the end of the year, send their payments to -- basically send a lump -- um, lump-sum check to Finance. And Finance can

correct me on that. I don't know specifically, but the payments were sent to them that way.

But to date, CRA still is on our plan. They have a subaccount now. We've since changed that process, where before everybody was mingled in, where now we put different division within the bill where we have City employees, we have retirees as a subdivision, and we have CRA as a subdivision on the bill.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Okay. Um, thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Miller-Anderson, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Um, with the audit that you all did, why did it just go back to 2014? Is that the furthest that you could go back or is that when you all started noticing a discrepancy?

**MARIE SULLIN:** That's when we started recognizing there was a discrepancy.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So prior to that, we're pretty comfortable in saying that it wasn't happening before 2014?

**MARIE SULLIN:** I'm pretty comfortable with the margin of errors.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. And then the -- the notation in the agenda item -- you just cleared it up a little bit, but that item that was written there, that -- to me, that did not give an indication that we were actually making payments for these people that were on the rolls that shouldn't have been on the rolls. Did you -- is that what should have been interpreted from that item the way in which it was written?

**MARIE SULLIN:** The way it was written I would say yes. And -- and I believe Mr. Sherman had elaborated with respect to that -- um, to that agenda item that night. Don't quote me on that, but I believe he did and --

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** No. I looked at -- I looked at it. He didn't.

**MARIE SULLIN:** Okay. And the City Manager was made aware of the actual specific because he actually sat at the table with us when we were discussing this. He saw a copy of the list of the employees who were impacted and, um, he understood that those employees who were no longer with us did not impact the renewal -- um, the renewal dollars nor the rate increase.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Now, do we know if any of these people, um, filed any medical claims?

**MARIE SULLIN:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Did -- did any do that?

**MARIE SULLIN:** But it did not impact because they were all reversed.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** All -- and -- and explain that a little bit to me.

**MARIE SULLIN:** So medical claims, basically if -- for example, um, I'm John Doe. I work here and today I terminated. However, it does take time for paperwork to go through the loop. And so I decide -- I'm already terminated today, but tomorrow I decided I'm gonna go to the doctor and use my -- my insurance card. Well, then when the carrier receive the termination paperwork and see that John Doe used the, um -- the card, basically the carrier can go back and tell the provider John Doe was no longer on the plan, so they are responsible for whatever they utilized. So they are able to do a reversal.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Right. But in this particular case we had quite a few people that were on there upwards of three, four years and -- and they were not removed, nor were they -- Aetna notified. And I know that when we go to the doctor, the doctor always get the -- the front office staff always get the authorization before they see you. And so I would imagine that if they were still on the rolls, their card was authorized for them to use it. So you're saying that even if they were beyond two years, say they were using their, um, insurance two years out, those charges are going to be reversed?

**MARIE SULLIN:** According to my conversation with Aetna, those charges are going to be reversed and they have no impact on our benefit. And, um, Aetna will be here sometime next month. They can basically re-verify what my understanding was. And also we have our brokers here. They can verify that information. This is what we were told.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Can they come up to speak on that, Mr., um -- you can't add to it?

**MARIE SULLIN:** Because at the time when we had the meeting, um, this was what was told to us.

**WAYNE MONEK:** Good evening. I'm Wayne Monek with Richard Bernstein and Associates, uh, Benefits, uh, Manager there. Um, in answer to that direct question, um, probably two parts. Um, when we got involved with the City, we made sure that all the, um, different insurance companies gave a list bill. So

**SPECIAL CITY COUNCIL MEETING**  
American High-Tech Transcription  
Largo, FL 33771

**JULY 17, 2018**  
2600 East Bay Drive, Suite 215  
727-535-1066

the list bill comes; and every month it has the name of a person, and that now allows for this audit, for the tracking and so on and so forth.

As far as the insurance company, in this case Aetna, what are they allowing? Aetna seems to be working closely with the Human Resource Department here in the fact that it was found out that you were paying for -- you were -- you were paying for everybody on the bill and now your audit shows that some of them you should not have been paying for. Um, Aetna has agreed that they will go back X amount of months. In addition to that, they said if documentation can be shown to them, they will go back further. If they find out that somebody was, um, using the plan, they -- and they were to be terminated from the plan, they would, uh, reverse those charges by going back to the providers and saying that wasn't eligible.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** But is that only if we can prove that we did notify Aetna that they shouldn't have been on there?

**WAYNE MONEK:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. And that is the problem, I mean, right? We don't really show where we have notified Aetna that these people should have come off until just recently. And so if we're depending on these charges to be reversed on all, that isn't exactly true. Um, the reversal appears to be only if we can surely say we notified them and I'm not really hearing that we can do that 100 percent. So if we're unable to verify that notification was sent to Aetna to say remove those people, we're now saying that those charges more than likely will not be reversed if we can't prove that we told them to take them off.

**STEVE GUDE:** Good evening. I have to disagree. Um, Steve Goude [phonetic]. I'm the benefit administrator.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Uh-huh.

**STEVE GUDE:** Um, basically what happens in that situation -- and I was a licensed broker -- whenever you notify them -- we notified them of the termination. Once we notified them --

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** When it happened or --

**STEVE GUDE:** Once -- once we notified them as of the audit and we submitted the list to Aetna, we gave them the correct termination date, whether it was fiscal year '14, '15, whenever the date was down. They go back and they reverse the money from the doctor. The doctor -- it's the doctor's responsibility. It's called balance billing. The doctor will balance-bill the

individual. Okay? All claims have been reversed. Any members that -- once we notified them, they reversed all claims.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So -- so -- so a doctor is not gonna have an issue with the fact that they got an authorization that night of - - I'm sorry, that day of the person coming to the office. They did what they were supposed to do. Their office, get the authorization. The authorization said yes, they were in fact on the insurance, and then now two or three years later he's going to be, um, left -- stuck with the bill to go after the patients himself now? They're gonna take the money from him two or three years later and then make him go after the patient to get the money that they had gotten an authorization saying that they were covered?

**STEVE GUDE:** Uh, that would be correct because typically what most -- most doctors, when you go, even with your health plan, you have to sign -- you sign responsibility if your health provider does not cover it. So what happens is, if you -- if you do not have insurance, you're signing as a back-up. So when that plan reverses the bill, you're held liable for that bill. If you knew you were not supposed to be -- your coverage ended July 31st and you went in there two months later to try to go to the doctor, once Aetna or any provider was notified -- they have departments. All they do is go back and they reverse claims. When they reverse the claims, the claims have no impact on your renewal. That's why when we had that initial renewal it was only a 3 percent.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Right. I understand about the renewal part.

**STEVE GUDE:** No. I'm just explaining it as far as claims and everything. Once you notify them, John Doe was terminated July 1st, 2014, and Aetna is notified, Aetna -- they're not -- they haven't gave us the credit as far as getting our money back. They gave us initially three months. Okay? But once we notify them that John Doe had terminated as of January 1st, they reverse all claims after January 1st. That's standard procedure.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Even if it was five or 10 years later we can go back and say, hey, they weren't never with us -- I mean or they've been gone this long, they go back and reverse it? There's no statute of limitations on this?

**STEVE GUDE:** Aetna has given us their word and the standard procedure that if we have a member that was termed, again, January 1st and he went there three, four months later, Aetna takes the money back from the doctor. It's up to the doctor --

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Uh-huh.

**STEVE GUDE:** -- to go get the money from the member.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**STEVE GUDE:** And most providers -- most providers have that relationship. It's carved out in their contract. So that's a whole 'nother thing that -- you know, we don't understand it, but that's a contract thing -- issue that they have.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Do we have this in writing from Aetna to support what's being stated about the charges being reversed? Do we have that?

**STEVE GUDE:** Yes. Yes, we can receive -- get that to you.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. I would like to see that.

Um, I know Miss Hoskins just passed down a paper from the OIG and it says that basically on July 11th, Miss Hoskins did report to the OIG about the concern about the insurance. Um, as we know, that it did come up when, um, one of the residents came up to the podium during the, I think, June 25th meeting or -- or somewhere around in there, um, stating the information. Um, I think I was out sick that night but I was on the phone, and so I did ask for, um, more information to be provided from Mr. Horton, who was running the meeting that night, um, just to find out what was that all about. And so, um, as a follow-up to that, I eventually got some of the information, um, which was the memo that Miss Marie provided and then one that Mr. Sherman provided explaining what had occurred and that the corrections had been put in place as of around December, I believe, or September -- around December I believe it was.

Um, one of the things Miss Marie mentioned, and as I was looking in the memo, the memo read that there was about 300 -- \$395,543 that was credited, but tonight you said 240? How did -- why did that number change?

**MARIE SULLIN:** Okay. The credit given by Aetna is that 390-something. However, we had to split it between the people that were listed as CRA, the people that were listed as retiree, and that's the reason why I went into, um, the discussion with respect to the bill is separated for general employees or all employees in the City, the retirees, and then the CRA. So when the credits are returned, they're returned under a name. That person --

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Switch it out with the other one.

**MARIE SULLIN:** So if John Deer is a CRA employee, when the credit is returned, since Aetna applied all the credits for three months across the board, we have to return that amount to John Deer, who is with the CRA. If the person

is a retiree, we have to return -- hence the reason why for the listing of each person and how much money was returned on the original email that was sent to the City Manager's office to list all the employees' names, how much money that was returned by Aetna. So it was applied across the board based on each division within the bill.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Right, but I -- I don't still understand the two -- where -- so where's the rest? You said 240 tonight and you were still --

**MARIE SULLIN:** 240 for all -- the City employees.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** For just City.

**MARIE SULLIN:** That is correct. Retirees were applicable separately and CRA are applicable separately. When Mr. Sherman, um, did his reconciliation of the numbers, it was separated at that point. And he can elaborate as, um - - as to why he separated that. But those people who are CRA employees, he applied those; that was given for them under that account per se. And then those people who are retirees, he reapplied those to those retirees. So we went back to focus on all the others and that's where the 200-something, um -- the 200 and -- give me one moment -- the \$240,000 was applied to the other group.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Um --

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Can I ask --

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Go ahead (unintelligible). You can go ahead.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair, can I ask a related question?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** You're recognized, Councilwoman Botel.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** I have a question that relates to this same topic. On March 26 you say there's a total to date of \$456,041.45 credit received from Aetna. So this is my point. We are not gonna have a complete investigation tonight. We've already got three separate numbers on the same question. My -- my -- my insistence is that we have a thorough investigation conducted by competent investigators who understand how to do an audit of what happened here. I've asked -- I think I'm -- I'm gonna make a motion that we, uh, conduct a forensic audit to determine what went on here.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Question, Madam Chair, um, before we --

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Well -- well, I have -- I have a question. I have some questions, if that's okay.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Back in a second.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Um, I understand your -- and your -- we can discuss your motion.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Right. (Unintelligible) a second yet.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** But we have a request for a forensic audit in total.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Right.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** So that forensic audit --

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** It's on tomorrow.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Did we already do --

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** A forensic audit is going to be --

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** It's on tomorrow. Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** -- an all encompassing --

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Then I -- then I -- then I withdraw until tomorrow night. Then I'll withdraw it until tomorrow night.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, ma'am.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Thank you. Thank you for reminding me.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Just one question.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Chair Pro Tem, you're recognized.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Thank you, ma'am. Just one question. Do anybody know how the personnel information was leaked to the public, the names -- the names and pertinent information of -- of those people? Because, you know, regardless whether they're with us or not, I just think that their personnel information and their personal health concerns should still remain, um, just that, personal. And I -- I want to know how did that get leaked to the



public as well as, um, anybody else. Do we have any idea what happened with that information?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Not at this point. Um, Marie or --

**UNIDENTIFIED COUNCILPERSON:** There was an email.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** I did ask the City Clerk to go back to see if there was some type of public records request that was, um, input or -- or, um, sent out and, um, I haven't received a response, um, as of to date.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Well --

**UNIDENTIFIED COUNCILPERSON:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I -- I -- one moment. I -- I -- I submit that there was a correspondence on, um -- uh, there was a correspondence from Mr. Horton indicating that specific information had been included and he -- he had asked us -- I'm pulling that email. Um --

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair, if I can comment on that.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** If you would just allow me to finish my thought, please, um, and I will be right there. Um, there is information that was submitted to us. And so, therefore, that information was carried through Mayor and Council, if I'm not mistaken, Mayor and Council and City Management. So it had to come from somewhere here.

**UNIDENTIFIED COUNCILPERSON:** That's not true.

**UNIDENTIFIED COUNCILPERSON:** Madam Chair?

**UNIDENTIFIED COUNCILPERSON:** Madam Chair?

**UNIDENTIFIED COUNCILPERSON:** Madam Chair, I disagree.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Let -- let -- please let me explain that part because we --

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** You can explain that part, but I disagree, Madam Councilwoman.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well, this is --

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** But please continue.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** This is what we need to understand.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** You're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** The timeline. Mr. Amon came to the podium at the meeting on what, Monday, June 25th. Okay? I was on the telephone. I asked Mr. Horton to look into it. Mr. Horton did not respond back until I sent the reminder like on Thursday or something, around in there. I sent an email requesting the notice that was provided that Mr. Amon referenced. Um, at that time there were also additional questions that I asked of Mr. Horton. He then in turn, along with Miss Hoskins, provided the list, the memo from Miss Sullin and the memo from Mr. Sherman. In the process of Miss, um, Sullin sending her list on Friday morning I believe it was, that is when that email came to Council, on that Friday morning. It had already been discussed by Mr. Amon that Monday before.

But what we really need to address is the fact that I did receive an email from Miss Pam Ryan indicating that I was the one that released the list. She was told that I released the list through my email. And I asked Miss Hoskins to please have I.T. go through all of my emails to see whether or not I sent something out. The information had already been out in the community for four days before I even got the list. And we are not really sure if the list that Miss Sullin provided is the same list that Mr. Amon had. Yes.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair? There are two lists. There's the list that Finance worked on back in, um, August, September of 2017 that had the employees' names and, um, their -- their particular, uh, benefits or deductions. That was a huge Excel spreadsheet that had been created. Then there's the second list that Miss Sullin had, um, that was sent out that Friday, um, what --

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Friday.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** -- uh, Councilwoman Miller-Anderson is referring to. Now, Mr., um, Amon mentioned a list on the 25th. So although I never saw the list -- and I'm wondering, um -- because, you know, anything violates HIPAA laws. HIPAA is very strict. You cannot share information, anything with names on it. Um, so I believe there are two lists and, um, I'm not sure -- well, I believe there are two lists. And the list, um, that Mr. Amon has I'm not sure, so that's why I asked City Clerk to look to see if a public records request, uh, was completed and somebody provided that list to him.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So that list obviously that he had on Monday was not the list that was sent to Council, or at least the Council did

not have it before that Monday when he came to the podium. That was provided on that Friday. And, um, like I said, I did get an email from Miss Pamela Ryan, um, the former city attorney, accusing me of having given the list to Mr. Amon; and I did tell, um, Miss Ryan that she can go and do a public records request of my emails and she will see that I didn't even get it until Friday morning and that I would like a formal apology from her because she's accusing me of doing something that is illegal and I didn't appreciate that at all. But I'm -- I'm just curious as to why she felt the need to reach out to me about it. Um, but that's what happened with that. So in regards to who gave it to him, only Mr. Amon can answer that; and, you know, if you want to know, I would suggest we get the answer from him. He's right there in the building.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Well, I would also say -- I would also say that regardless as to how he got it, there was a clear violation of HIPAA by releasing the information and we need to deal with that matter. We --

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And I did in my email ask to find out --

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** May I --

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** That was a part of it, Miss, um, Davis Johnson.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** May I -- may I just continue my thoughts? Please, I did not interrupt you and I would ask you to do the same for me.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I understand.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** But, um, I would still say that we need to have a complete review of how that information was released. It should not be -- we placed the City in harm's way and in a position of liability for having released such information.

So it is quite interesting -- it would be quite interesting for us to know -- I don't know whether or not Mr. Yisrael will be interested in revealing his source, but someone from the inside of this organization shared information that should not have been shared and that is the issue that has to really be addressed, on top of providing us the information as you've indicated, uh, from the benefits coordinator, the letter from Aetna verifying that they are in fact going to, uh, reimburse us.

But, you know, we have some -- you know, we talk about -- we use transparency interchangeably here. We use it to, uh -- to negatively impact or

when we are trying to bring someone, you know, to the forefront, but here's the thing. We're doing it to ourselves. We are the culprits. We are responsible. And at what point do we stop? Yes, we need to make sure that systems are in place. Yes, we need to make sure that, um -- that the staff here is doing the job that it is set to do. But we have so many things that are going on and so much information is shared from the inside that creates this - - this thought that there is something nefarious going on here in this city and I don't believe that to be the case every time.

Do we have challenges? We have been operating on the friends/family benefit for so long, the City of Riviera Beach has operated in a manner that has been counterproductive. I can remember, you know, just asking very early on in my -- in my tenure for the policies and procedures. That's what government operates by. That's what we run by. That's what we're held accountable for.

So we've got to get to a point where those people that are sharing information that should not be shared, they have to be handled accordingly. We have to stop mixing words and stop trying to create these scenarios where there may not necessarily be one, but we owe it to ourselves to be honest. And where is our integrity and moral compass internally when we're trying to destroy the city from inside?

Now, that's just my position. I understand that we all want to know and I want to know because that is something that we should know, how did we miss it, how do we correct it, and I do believe that she came tonight. She provided the information on how we missed it. She provided a plan on how we are going to correct it, and we have to operate in that. But what I will say and what I will ask for those employees that -- that continue to go to the doctor and fully knew that they did not have coverage, where's the -- we need to have the OIG investigate that. We need to have those people held accountable because if you wrongfully accept insurance benefits when clearly you know that you are not covered, there's a responsibility on your behalf. So there are several areas that have to be taken into consideration. We need to look at where we fell down, where our internal controls failed. We have indicated that we put some measures in place so that the internal controls can now catch it, but we also have to find out from those individuals that accepted those benefits and continued to take that card and -- and present it as if they were a viable employee, there should be a review by the Inspector General's Office for that and I would specifically call for that. And as a matter of fact, I will write the request to the OIG to take a look at that in addition to what's being requested for this -- this -- this -- this situation.

We have got to -- if you're -- if you're gonna hold accountability and you're going to ask for accountability, then it's gotta be held across the board because there are some folks who clearly knew that they didn't have insurance. So we

have to deal with that. We have to deal with the internal controls. We've got to figure it out. But I agree with my colleague, we are not going to get to the bottom line -- we're not going to get the answers tonight, but what we do know is that it happened. We know that there are measures that are in place. We know that we have to have it reviewed and then we can come back when we ask for that internal audit, we can then include that in the -- that forensic audit. Forensic audits are a very good tool to tell you where your challenges and shortfalls are. And so we are moving in the right direction as a council seeking this forensic audit and we -- and it should be of every department, every -- every dollar that we've spent. It should be citywide. It's going to be important. And so I don't -- I do believe you said that you are -- you're rescinding your motion because we are going to do the full forensic audit. And I would like to know -- it appears -- I would like to know where we want to take this next discussion as it relates to this.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Miller-Anderson, you're recognized.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I do want to be very clear that that was the whole intent in bringing this to the Council meeting, so that we could discuss what happened, um, so that we can figure these things out. One of the things in my email was to find out who was being held accountable for this, whether it was giving out the list, whether it was not sending an email to indicate that the people no longer were on the rolls.

And so I totally agree with what you're saying. Um, and I don't believe we're gonna get down to the full understanding of what happened tonight and that is why I've asked numerous -- way before this issue even came up about the forensic audit just because of the simple fact we have a lot of issues that have cropped up and I do believe we need to have a forensic audit. So there -- that's the reason for that.

So we're on the same page when it comes to that. But what I don't want is for us to -- you know, we keep -- every time something comes up we want to say, okay, yeah, we made a mistake; okay, let's move on; we're gonna fix it. Well, I mean, at what point is it going to stop? And that's the issue I have because, you know, I understand that, you know, at the time in 2014 or up until 2016 or '17, um, there was a shortage of personnel, but we can't just sit here and say, oh, you know, we messed up and, um, well, you know, we just didn't have enough people; and, yeah, we fixed it now, so let's forget that it happened. I

don't think that is being responsible either in terms of watching out for the residents.

And so because of that, I mean, someone has to be held accountable. Can we figure out who it is tonight? No. But we cannot -- and I -- I asked what was done because of what came out of this. What I did in turn find out from the back-up is that there were conversations that had been going on from at least December, different emails going back and forth; but when I asked about it, um, for the follow-up from Mr. Amon, it was almost like it was foreign to everyone. So I was a little surprised that there were conversations that had been had from, you know, going back many, many months but yet no one seemed to know what was going on when Mr. Amon brought that to the podium.

So I am fully, fully in support of an investigation, but we have to be careful even with that because who's going to do the investigation? I mean, are we gonna get somebody that's gonna slant the story like we've had a few other times on other issues? So I -- you know, I have a concern when we're talking about getting someone to investigate it. It has to be someone that's credible, someone who doesn't have any attachment to those involved or -- or the City in general because we have had other investigations done and it always, you know, comes out to be a pretty story when in reality there was a little more to it, but, you know, it's based on who writes it.

So I just want to make sure that we get someone, um, and then we identify exactly how that is going to go or we're going to kick the can down the road. Um, like I said before, I brought this to the forefront because of Mr. Amon bringing it to our attention and it was more of trying to get a clear understanding as to what happened and, um, it wasn't always fully explained. I'm glad to know now tonight we have more information, but that information was not available when the question was initially asked. And so, um, I hear you, Miss Davis Johnson, however, I don't think it's, you know, proper for us to sit here and say, oh, it's done; let's move on.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** And I think you misunderstood my statement because what I'm simply saying is we needed to find out what happened, we needed to find out what controls are in place and how we make sure that it is preventable.

As it relates to having someone that will not write a pretty story, I think that the Office of the Inspector General of Palm Beach County is quite capable of not being swayed by anybody sitting on this dais. I think that they are quite capable of looking at all of the facts. I think that they are quite capable of telling us and taking a look and investigating those people that we talk about who continued to use the insurance long after.

So I believe that having a response from John A. Carey, Inspector General, that he needed the following information that was outlined in the email -- in this letter, this correspondence that was presented to us. I believe that they are the body that has the integrity and moral compass and experience to investigate this and to render a decision that will certainly be made public; and I believe that there is no opportunity there for any slanting or creating of a pretty story because that is not what they have done in my experience in having, um, received their, uh, responses to us. They have never shown us any favor. They have been clear as to what the shortcomings were. They have been clear as to what the next step should be, and they have been clear about coming in and making sure that the things that they have cited is actually implemented and put into place.

So I believe with him responding in the manner in which he did -- he's asked for the documentation. We can get all of the documentation together. And that is not an indication of saying it happened; let's move on. That's an indication of saying it happened; let's further delve into it with a set of eyes that are not connected to this body and bring back the results that will be found as a result of their investigation.

So I'm clear on what the intent was and I'm clear on the fact that we cannot kick the can down the road, and I was certainly not suggesting that we do that. I'm suggesting that the proper authorities be involved to investigate and to render decisions that are going to place us on a path to correct the issues that have happened. I do, uh, believe that staff has taken a step in the right direction to put in the internal controls, but we still need a rendering and a full discussion and a full determination by an entity that is outside of this body.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair --

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair --

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** -- I have just one question regarding the OIG.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** One second. You have to allow someone else to speak.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** No. It's just one quick question, if you don't mind, regarding -- regarding what you just said.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I do. I do because you've had the floor and the Mayor would like to speak, if you would please just allow.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Go ahead.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you. Mr. Mayor, you're recognized.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yes. Um, leaks every day in the White House, every day. Every day there's leaks in the White House and there's leaks in this administration every day, one way or the other, every day. It's all over the place.

**AUDIENCE:** Every day.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Um, what I'm concerned about is who knew what and when did they know it and what did they do about it and who did they report it to. I am -- I am just, um, in a state of shock that a citizen came before us and informed us about something that I was not aware. That -- that bothers me. And if it had not been for that citizen, I'd probably still be in the dark, period. Um, Palm Beach Post, thank God for a free press, Channel 5, Channel 12, Channel 25. Thank God for the press because a lot of things I would not know if we did not have a free press in this country. Now, what I'm concerned about --

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Excuse me, Mayor. Madam Chair, it's two minutes till. What's your pleasure?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It's two minutes till 10:00. What is the pleasure of this Board? Is there a motion to extend the meeting?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Make a motion to extend till no later than 10:30.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** We still have public comment cards.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Oh, okay. Well, until --

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** How many do we have?

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** About 12.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Until we finish with the public comment.

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Twelve.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** There is no second.



**MAYOR MASTERS:** So what does that mean?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Mayor, if you would allow me one moment, please, sir.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I would allow you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you. We need a second. There needs to be determined a time. So is it 10:30? Is it 11:00? There was no second (unintelligible).

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well, can we see if all of those people are here? They may not even be here and they may not be -- it's kind of hard --

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** They are here. They've been waiting to speak.

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** You have one minute.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Second.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** So I'll make a motion that we extend the meeting until 11:00. That should give us time.

**UNIDENTIFIED COUNCILPERSON:** 10:30.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** 11:00. Is there a second for 11?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Second, second, second.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Clerk?

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Councilperson Botel?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes.

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Pro Tem Hubbard?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes.

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Chair Davis Johnson?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Unanimous vote.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I would like to request that we move to public comment. Folks have been waiting to, um, make their statement on record. So is there any opposition by this Council to move to public comment?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** None whatsoever.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Is there any opposition --

**MAYOR MASTERS:** No opposition, other than I need to finish my statement.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Miller-Anderson, any opposition?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** No. I had asked for them to speak earlier, before we started.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Any opposition, Miss Botel, for public comment?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** A plea for brevity.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Well, they -- they do have three minutes. Uh, Mr. Mayor, I would ask that you allow the public to please --

**MAYOR MASTERS:** No. No, absolutely not. I -- I was interrupted in the middle of a statement. I am disrespected from time to time.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Oh --

**MAYOR MASTERS:** That's wrong.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay. Mr. Mayor --

**MAYOR MASTERS:** That's just wrong.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** -- I am not disrespecting you. I simply asked -- I made a request. If you would please continue, make your comments.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** It was a statement.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Go ahead, Mr. Mayor. Please continue.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** My statement is this. I just need to know who did what, what did they do, who did they tell. It's like Watergate to me. It's a scandal.

**AUDIENCE:** It is.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Pointblank. And it doesn't take a rocket-science degree. After you do your investigation, there's only two people that can discipline. And I haven't even heard the word. I mean, because we're gonna do this and put this in -- in place has nothing to do with the fact that it happened. And when things happen, people should be held, um -- is the mike still on? Okay. Accountable and responsible. And the two people that can discipline anyone because of this action is the City Manager and the Mayor. And at the end of the day -- I'm just waiting on the reports. The City Manager will do whatever she's gonna do. And if she doesn't do it or whatever, then I will do whatever I can do, which is -- which I don't think suspension -- it rise to that. I think some heads need to roll and some butts needs to be kicked and somebody need to be fired, period. Thank you. I'm done.

**COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC - 7:30 PM Non-Agenda Item Speakers  
(Three Minute Limitation)**

*Public Comment should be restricted to issues, matters, or topics pertinent to the City of Riviera Beach. Please be reminded that the City Council has adopted Rules of Decorum Governing Public Conduct During Official Meetings, which has been posted at the entrance of the Council Chambers. In an effort to preserve order, if any of the rules are not adhered to, the Chairperson may have any disruptive speaker or attendee removed from the podium from the meeting and/or the building, if necessary. Please govern yourselves accordingly.*

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Clerk?

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Andre Henderson, Bonnie Larson, John Miller.

**ANDRE HENDERSON:** I apologize for smiling. I just -- it's -- it's not funny. It's just --

**AUDIENCE:** No. It's sad.

**ANDRE HENDERSON:** Only thing to keep from crying. It's just, uh -- but what I will say, I ask these questions, how does this happen? Thank you. How does this happen? Um -- uh, what is being done to prevent this in the future? Um, some of the questions -- some of the issues that were brought up, um, I would like to -- when the gentleman said that, um, they do reverse billing, I

don't know anything about that, but it's just common sense, um, and it seems like common sense would be to -- if a person was fired or they quit or they -- they're dead, they wouldn't have insurance.

But -- so common sense would be if I went to a provider and it was -- they gave me the credit and they said, "Okay, it's okay, you have insurance," and then find out I don't have insurance and then -- it just seems like that's just -- that's part of why our city's being sued. That's part of why things are -- things are happening, um, that -- that we as -- we as the public have a right to know. And I also want to say this, too. The general employees are negotiating with the City. How in the heck are they supposed to trust you when you just lost \$1.1 million?

**AUDIENCE:** Right.

**ANDRE HENDERSON:** 2014 to 2016. And what happens if you go back further?

**AUDIENCE:** That's right.

**ANDRE HENDERSON:** How much money is that? So it's like -- I -- I get what everybody's sitting there and -- and -- and -- and the part that made me laugh is how people can ask how did this get out. The question is, why didn't you do something when Jonathan Evans was gonna bring this up 10 months ago? That's the issue. Why did you let this go 10 months? And now we're having this discussion about this like this is brand new. This is not brand new.

Malfeasance is when somebody does something wrong, either by a politician or a corporation. You fired Jonathan Evans for malfeasance. The only person I see is malfeasance is somebody who's on that dais that allowed whomever staff or whomever would have happened, \$1.1 million and you're arguing with the general employees about a contract and they're supposed to trust you? I mean, come on now. I mean, you gotta be real. You gotta be -- common sense. And then to ask the question, it's just tone deaf to say how this got out. It's tone deaf. I'm glad it got out because we would have never known.

And the budget, you said we were gonna be over budget next year. In 2022 we're gonna be \$3.2 million over budget. That's what the budget says. Well, I don't think so. You gotta redo your books, then. And if you go by -- if you do a forensic study and go through everything, what are we gonna find? What are we gonna find? It seems like I'm asking common-sense questions, but common sense would be not to -- I mean, you had a dead person on there. I mean seriously? I mean -- and I'm not making light of it, but I'm just saying it just doesn't make sense to me when you're so harsh on the general employees.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, sir.

**AUDIENCE:** (Clapping).

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Bonnie Larson, John Miller, Darlene Cruz.

**BONNIE LARSON:** Bonnie Larson. Mr. Henderson only got two and a half minutes, just for the record.

I'm very sorry that we had to ask tonight who leaked this. That makes us look even worse than we were before. We should be able to know everything that's going on in the city. We're all in this together. We all have to handle it together. And this is absolutely a carbon copy of what happened when we had the Water Department fiasco. Miss Jones hid it from you. Mr. Argemia [phonetic] hid it from you. Only when the fines got too, too big that they couldn't -- they couldn't write the checks themselves did it have to come up.

You were not informed. And I'd like to know tonight who on the Council knew and who did not know because it smacks of the same thing. Miss Jones was put on suspension. Eventually she was fired. Mr. Argemia was fired. Mr. Evans for doing the right thing, for -- going to bring it up and see how we could solve it, he was fired before he got to mention it. So we're withholding information from the public and it's not right.

What I heard tonight was how it's been fixed or how we're gonna fix it in the future. Don't want to know how it happened in the first place because now we've got all this extra work and all this extra fiasco here. The Finance Department, they get the bills. In any corporation or government, they get the bills. The Finance Director does not open it up and look at the bills and check them out. He's got a staff. Staff do that. Staff should be sending those bills to each department, and each department should verify the bills.

We can't say, well, we'll do it later, we'll do it next month or we didn't have enough staff. No. If you're a department of one person, you have to have someone guarding the taxpayers' money. That's very important. You can't just say, oh, well, we didn't have enough staff, but now we do; now we're okay. No, that is not okay. So many people knew about this and now they're scurrying to defend themselves, or here's how we're gonna fix it; let's -- let's concentrate on that instead. No.

How did this happen in the first place? Because it's gonna happen again. You have incompetent people who don't look at the bills. The bills are our taxpayers' money. The CRA was on our -- our plan. I can understand that, but we haven't billed them or they haven't done it.

Um, okay. I'm getting short on time here. And, you know, people need to be careful what they put on. You asked about the two -- 2014, why was it brought back to then. People need to be careful. Haven't they heard you need to be careful what you put on Facebook and other social media? There's someone on there who said -- they had a big operation. Gosh, I didn't know I still had Riviera Beach insurance. Well, they must have given their card to the doctor, to the hospital. So don't -- don't pretend like you didn't know you had Riviera Beach insurance. You did. Can we make those cards good for one year so they have to renew their cards or something?

But, no, just to say what happened -- and for Miss Pam Ryan to call you and accuse you, Miss, um, Kashamba Miller, well, shame on her, when she was being investigated. She suddenly resigned and went to Torcivia, and now it's Torcivia's group who's calling and -- and saying that you leaked. Nah. Gotta fix it and it was -- I'm really sorry that you asked tonight who leaked. It's too bad when the residents know more of what's going on in this city than we learn from the Council. That is a shame. Thank you.

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Darlene Cruz.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Just for the record, my question was not who leaked. My question was about the sensitive information that was leaked, and that is a reasonable question to ask because we have a responsibility to protect that information. So that is just a point of clarification as to what I asked, not as it relates to who leaked the story because we all knew back in September -- I apologize for cutting into your time. But we all knew back in September and this wasn't addressed throughout the remaining portion of September -- I'm sorry, of 2017. So it's not as if we are all, uh, blameless in this matter. Coach Miller?

**JOHN MILLER:** Yes. John Miller. Listen, uh, this is a big issue. And, you know, I'm hearing all this -- basically to me a lot of it's gobbledygook, about as far as the money coming back. I don't know why we're worrying about people that used the cards and doctors. Who cares about that? We care about what we paid, what we paid out in premiums. Let the doctor worry about getting the money from the other people if they -- in other words, if they were illegally -- illegally using the cards. Right? We're worried about getting the money back. What is the number now? Is it 800,000? Is it 600 -- I'm not sure what the number is, but let me tell you this much. It's too much.

So all right. We have an issue and we're all gonna try to work forward, right, to straighten this the hell out, period. But, you know, my thing is, is if you look at this, obviously -- obviously you knew about it; and my problem is, is since September. Evans was gonna bring it up and then he couldn't bring it up because he's gone. All right. So take him out of the equation. He can't be

blamed. You can't blame him, Miss Hubbard. You can't put his name -- or -- or her because she was in Finance at that time. It's not her fault. But who knew about it? Who knew about it in September? I think that -- you know, in other words, you can't hold this back, similar to the water bill. We're tax-paying citizens. We pay a lot of money in taxes and we just -- I waited here for four hours to finally talk for three minutes. Four hours, seriously. And the thing about it is, is that let's not keep -- and I understand the HIPAA laws and you're right, Tonya, but let's not take the cart and put it in front of the horse. We had a fire here and we're not worrying about three flat-screens that got burned up. Let's get to the problem with the fire. Let's -- let's straighten this fire out.

But I really think that you all owe us an apology, whoever knew anyhow, to the citizens of Riviera Beach to say why would we not know as taxpayers. I mean, look, we go -- I can understand giving raises, but we had -- we had a white elephant in the room that you knew about. The big white elephant was there that we had maybe \$1 million out the door and we're worried about giving big increases to directors or whatever. How could you do that when you knew you had this in the background and that eventually it was gonna float back up? I mean, I don't understand it. That's common sense. You would wait at least until you got this out before you'd ask for a big raise, wouldn't you? I mean seriously. I can tell you right now there shouldn't be raises. There should be deductions. I mean seriously. Think of the taxpayers. I'm not here to throw spears at anybody. Think of the people that are paying the taxes. Thank you.

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Darlene Cruz, Willis Williams, Tiffany Williams.

**DARLENE CRUZ:** Good evening, Council.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Good evening.

**DARLENE CRUZ:** Dr. Darlene Cruz. I just wanted to quickly mention, um, Risk Manager Marie Sullin stated that, um, the monies that the 2014 errors were allocated, uh, in different ways. She -- she mentioned City officials, CRA employees, and I want to say City employees. Were those the three, uh, allocations that were mentioned earlier?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Retirees.

**DARLENE CRUZ:** Thank you. Retirees, uh, CRA, and general employees. Um, my question tonight is when, um -- when you're discussing the totals and then you're breaking them down and allocating them to different -- under different subtitles, um, is it normal to discuss or, uh, reveal the breakdown? Like is that, um -- is the breakdown, uh -- what's the word I'm trying to come up with?

Um, I just think that it -- when it was mentioned or brought up it wasn't clear. Um, there was a \$24,000, um, amount that went -- of funds that went to City employees, but now I may have the names wrong now. Um, and then there was a total amount, uh, that -- that Aetna credited for 30, uh -- \$39,000 refund. I was a little confused on -- on that. Um, and I was just wondering in the future, um, can they be a little bit more descriptive in the breakdown? Um, because it confused me. I'm sitting out in the audience.

And the second thing I wanted to address was, um, someone does need to be held accountable for the errors that have occurred. And, um, on the record I just wanted to say that I absolutely agree with the Mayor, um, in his statement earlier that, um -- that this person needs to be dealt with. This person is ultimately responsible for a major error. This is not a minor error. This is a huge error. And this is, um, at the cost of taxpayers' dollars. Um, and I -- I am -- in support of the Mayor in his statement stating that heads will -- heads should roll, um, as he finds out the results of this outcome.

I really think someone needs to, uh, reprimand, fire, remove, however you do it, uh, this individual because this is a huge issue for the City. It ought to not be, but it is and, um, I was, uh -- I was just in awe of finding out about it. I didn't even know about it. When I found out about it I was -- it provoked me to come tonight and just learn more about the situation and why it got to this point or how it got to this place where it is now. Uh, and that's all I wanted to say on tonight. Thank you.

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Willis Williams, Tiffany Williams, Mary Brabham.

**WILLIS WILLIAMS:** Good evening again. Willis Williams.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Good evening.

**WILLIS WILLIAMS:** I'm not sharp, trust me. Nothing faze me with this city. We're -- we're going to the extreme now. And I talk about -- because I've been here so long. There used to be a time where you had an entry interview, you had an exit interview, and people knew you were leaving. What happened to that, that process?

Miss Sandra Wooten, who retired I think back in 2014, all of this went down the tube after she retired. These -- for whatever reason, the process was not taken care of. People did not do their jobs because, number one, they didn't learn Mrs. Wooten's job. Okay? They didn't bring anybody in there to train, and so that meant an employee had gone that had done all of these things that you highlighted here tonight on that TV screen. Nobody else was doing them, so they had to go.



I agree that we need to go after the individuals who say that they didn't know that they had insurance and we were paying for it because if you had a Social Security check and you got overpaid, the government will come after you. So you need to go after them people if they used them insurance cards and I agree with you.

I definitely, definitely, wholeheartedly agree with the Mayor. Somebody got to be fired on this deal here. You just can't let this one go. I mean, it's just that simple. You cannot sit here and cradle somebody, say, okay, we made a mistake; we're gonna -- we're gonna -- we're gonna wash it clean and we're gonna start over new. No. You start over new with a new employee.

**AUDIENCE:** Right.

**AUDIENCE:** And hire --

**WILLIS WILLIAMS:** And you hire qualified individuals that know what they're doing. Now, I sit here and I -- I (unintelligible) all the time and you hear me, but it seems like, you know, it go in one ear and it comes out the other because I don't see nothing that I've said in the last six months that has come to fruition. You gotta do something. You ain't did nothing.

It's an election year and everybody's running to the podium. I'm not running for anything. I want you to know right now I'm not running for nothing, nothing, but I am gonna continuously -- because you -- you made it a way where I got to pay these taxes on these houses, so I'd like to be living somewhat comfortable. Please do something. You all -- you all give -- give us a relief. We done took \$1 million? Can you imagine what kind of relief on the water bill we could have got? Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, sir.

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Tiffany Williams, Mary Brabham, Douglas Lawson.

**AUDIENCE:** I would like to give my time to (Unintelligible).

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** We don't do that. We don't do that.

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Mary Brabham, Douglas Lawson, Bessie Brown. Miss Mary Brabham?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I'm sorry. We -- the question was asked as to whether or not time could be passed on. It has been the policy and process of this board not to pass time from one person to another. Is that not our process?

**SPECIAL CITY COUNCIL MEETING**  
American High-Tech Transcription  
Largo, FL 33771

**JULY 17, 2018**  
2600 East Bay Drive, Suite 215  
727-535-1066

**MARY BRABHAM:** Miss Mary Brabham, Riviera Beach. We are at this point again. On September the 20th of 2017, your previous manager that was fired, you all were supposed to have a workshop on this. He tried to prepare you as a board for this same thing. And from September 2017 to where we are now, then all of a sudden you want to fire somebody.

Forensic audit need to be done. Where was all of this here when it was on the table then? Miss Brabham is not disputing that we do not need that forensic audit done, not just for that department but every department in the City. I keep saying that you all can stop separating the oranges -- the oranges from the apples. An apple is an apple, and an orange is an orange, and a spade is a spade. It has been mismanagement, fraud all over this place here. You're taking money here. You're robbing Peter to pay Paul. You're spending here and you're spending there.

I think in one of these last meetings Bishop read a letter. Mr. Evans was trying to prepare you for that, too, because eventually if we do not rein in our spending, this city will be in receivership one way or the other. You got \$1.1 million here and you will not recoup all the other monies. That could have been paying some of these general employees. Yes, the general employees makes this city here. You cannot do without them. We as citizens, we cannot do without them. And it is always right to do right by them as a board.

And then you wonder why these peoples keep coming to the podium and talking about it. Oh, you done ran my time, but I was sitting out there and I done timed them. When these other speakers come up here, they goes on and on, but this is what your clerks do. But that's okay. This will all come to an end soon, and very soon. And some, and some you just -- you -- you -- you just got to go. I -- I -- I gets it. We gets it. But you box it down. Make your case. Make your point. You don't have to go into it over and over and over. You get it. We get it. Your means are bogged down here and this is unnecessary.

In the next election we're gonna get people up there who will sit on that desk and listen to us, we as residents, and we're gonna get government that is for the people and by the people to do what's right. And it's no harm toward anyone, but this is what we want and this is what we will get. Thank you.

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Douglas Lawson, Bessie Brown, Reverend Burrs. Bessie Brown, Reverend Burrs.

**BESSIE BROWN:** Good evening. Bessie Brown. I actually came --

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Good evening.

**BESSIE BROWN:** I actually came tonight not to say anything, but you stay so long on the other issue, too, I just decided I have something to say. I don't have much to say. I just wanted to say that, um, on the meeting of 9/20/2017 there was a resolution to continue health insurance coverage with Aetna Health Care. And there was a statement in here that says, "After further review, it was found that the members and employee counts reported to and being used by Aetna to calculate the cost per member are incorrect." This is the back-up that was submitted on 9/20. And, um -- and then it got to the bottom -- then -- then at the end it said, "The City Manager recommends a future Council workshop dedicated exclusively to the discussion of health insurance."

Now, I don't think -- everybody that was at that meeting and this back-up, all of you are at fault because it happened then. So these are the things that you need to look at when -- when things happen. And just -- and after that even I was so surprised that somebody even leaked it. That's even worse. But it was public records on 9/20. And that's the only thing that I really wanted to say to you all because you -- there's no need in finding fault. Everybody's at fault when you don't carry -- you don't carry your business -- handle your business like you should and when you have -- when you actually have an agenda, and the same agenda you have the public have out there. They have a book to look in.

Now, the calling -- you know, finding fault with people, we need to stop that. Handle -- handle this business when you get it and then you won't have to wait what, almost 10 months later? September? It's like, um, almost 10 months later. This could have been taken care of about 10 months ago.

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Reverend Burrs, Doretta Paulk.

**REVEREND BURRS:** Madam Chair, Mayor, Council. Uh, Reverend Burrs. I totally agree with my Mayor. Something need to be done. I heard, uh, just a few months ago, less, a young man was fired from the Water Department, which shouldn't have been fired, for less offense of this.

**AUDIENCE:** That's right.

**REVEREND BURRS:** For less offense of this. And I'm waiting to see what's gonna happen behind this. Something need to be done. I agree with Miss Botel. Maybe you need to do an investigation and include all this into the investigation and get this mess cleared out. It's just -- it's just ridiculous.

Now, one thing it brought out to me, that the City got money. Doing the wrong thing with it, but it got some money. Now, if they got some money, why don't they give these employees their raise and lower our water bill instead of giving

it to -- thank God for the insurance company; they're going to try to reimburse and working with the City. Somebody dropped the ball and you got to deal with it. Don't sweep it under the rug.

You got to deal -- the Mayor made a (unintelligible) point. You need to listen to it because the citizens is tired of just wasting our taxpayers' dollar. I understand that you all can't do everything. You can't do everything. You depend on your department heads. And when they drop the ball, you deal with them. When you all mess up and (unintelligible), they fire you all. That's what so many people are saying; they're tired.

Now, I don't -- I don't have anything against any of you all sitting up there. If you all run -- I'm gonna say it loud. I'll vote for every one of you all sitting up there right now if you're running, because I'm not running for anything. I'm not looking for a job. Don't want no job. My wife keep me too busy. I should be asleep right now. You all stay here too long discussing issues. Know what you're gonna talk about. Study your agenda. If you don't understand the issue, call your department. You could talk with them, but you can't give them a directive. You all need to get a lot of this information out of the way before you get here. You shouldn't be here no 11, 12:00 in no meetings. Stop rehashing everything over and over. One person says something, you got to go back in rebuttal. Leave that alone. Do like they say. Do an investigation on this situation and deal with it. Somebody got to go. That young man at the Water Department should not have been fired for less of offense than this. We're watching you all on this one.

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Our last card is Doretta Paulk.

**DORETTA PAULK:** Good evening. My name is Doretta Paulk and I just want to comment about the situation with the insurance. And I think that the start of this really was with Mrs. Sullin, uh, taking on -- I think she took on too many -- because when she told me, uh -- was explaining to everyone about her title, she had about four or five titles that she took on other than Risk Management. So I think that's probably where the breakdown started. I think you need to consider that, and consider not trying to have her unemployed or fire her, you know, because she mentioned all the titles that she had to take on when she started and I think that should, you know, be in consideration. And I think there was more, uh, different players in this situation that this is just, I think, the tip of the iceberg. And I think, just like, uh, Councilmember Botel said, we should have a forensic audit of all the departments because this is chaos and corruption in this city that I feel is going on. And for the general employees not to get a 3-percent raise and we have lost one-point-something million dollars is outrageous, insane. This is not right. This is not right. And I also want to ask, uh, the City Manager, the raises that you gave these two, uh, employees, did you rescind those? Are they still in play? Because that's a lot

of money to have been given to the interims that I feel -- because that could have been used for the little 3 percent the general public, you know, requested over and over.

So I think we need to just think about our people who, uh, works for the City, who gets the least amount of money and do a vast amount of work out there in the conditions of the weather, because they do a very good job in my opinion. That's my opinion.

And Stonybrook, um, totally -- I hope the vote comes down to demolish it totally. Do not put a Band-Aid on this. People living like this in substandard, uh, living conditions, it's disgraceful, disgraceful. And I just -- I'll be here tomorrow to see how the vote comes out and I just hope you all do decline Millennia to be a part of any of this. I thank you very much for giving me this opportunity.

#### **DISCUSSION BY CITY MANAGER**

#### **DISCUSSION BY CITY ATTORNEY**

#### **CITY COUNCIL COMMITTEE REPORTS**

#### **STATEMENTS BY THE MAYOR AND CITY COUNCIL**

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Miller-Anderson, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Um, the question I wanted to ask earlier was in regards to the, um, Miss Hoskins, uh, providing the report to the OIG on July 11. I just want to know what prompted you to do it at that point in time, um, considering you had already been working on it for several months. What prompted you to do it on the 11th?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair, I had not been, um, working on -- staff I assume -- I believed were working with Aetna to get, um, the, um, credits, um, that they had -- they were requesting obtaining the information. And as you see in the email, um, to Miss Sullin, um, I mentioned, um, Aetna and us going out for bid and where we were on, um, receiving those credits. So they gave me that dollar amount of 400-and-something thousand that we had received, um, to date.

And then after, um, Mr., um, Amon mentioned the, um -- mentioned that he had, uh, a document with names on it, um, and in speaking with staff, um, I felt, you know, that I should call the, um, OIG to see if we, um -- what they

could do, what assistance they could provide to us as relates to this. Um, I know they look at, you know, us following our policies and procedures and, um, they do a little bit more of digging than, um, what, uh, we -- what was provided to us from Finance and Risk Management and just wanted to get an independent, um, report from an outside agency.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. And I -- I think I had asked one of those questions about, like, was it everyone between 2014 and 2017, um, that left from the City, were they -- were those -- was that list everyone that left in between that time or were there some people that may have been removed or some that may not have been removed? Um, I do understand that Mr. Evans' name was not on the list, so he obviously was removed. So is that the human error part where some people were removed and some weren't removed? I guess that question would be for Miss Sullin.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Yeah, I would have to defer to Miss Sullin.

**MARIE SULLIN:** Basically when we run a termination report in our system -- so, for example, if someone is, um, terminated today, their actual paperwork may not have come to the department, to HR, within that period of time. So if the report was ran that day, then they were not listed on that report. Or if we received the information, the information's entered by HR as a personnel action request. Then at times, because there are money still due to that personnel based on hours or sick time that needs to be paid out, they may be placed as inactive. So when the report is run, it's run for a termination and it's not picking up the inactive employee. So this is how some people may have been lost in the process.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Um, and then I had asked the question -- well, Miss Hoskins just brought it up about the email for, um, I think it was back in April when she was asking about, um, the reimbursement or what was the status of it because of it possibly going back out -- I had asked a few times, um, what would have been the deadline for us to go back out to bid? I mean, when should that -- if we were going to do that, when should it have come to us to decide to go out for bid?

**MARIE SULLIN:** When the agenda --

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I think I remember --

**MARIE SULLIN:** I'm sorry.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I'm sorry. I recall -- I think I asked during the meeting a couple weeks ago when we did the vote on the insurance, um, I guess it was too late to go out for bid, and so I had a follow-up question

by email asking at what point should it have come to us for us to be able to make the decision to go back out for bid?

**MARIE SULLIN:** I believe I sent that information to you all, but I -- but I would say it would have been during that time that would have been your option to say let's go out for bid and that would have given us ample of time basically to complete an RFP for the purchasing department to, um -- to send this information out, and then it takes usually about -- and they can correct me. It usually take about three to four weeks. It has to actually be advertised. Once all the response come in, then it would be provided to the brokers and then they would make recommendations to us, and then it would be brought to the Council to vote on based on, um, how the recommendation come in from the brokers.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So what -- what month are you saying, around the April time? Is that --

**MARIE SULLIN:** So I -- yeah, around the time that we brought the agenda item to you. That would have been the time because that -- because open enrollment is usually done, um, August/September because our benefit is effective in October. So going sometime in April, May, June, those are usually the time that we would do out a bid. So it would be sometime - three to four weeks. So no more than that -- you know, no more than that, give or take.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** But it wasn't put out to bid, though. It wasn't brought to us so that it could go out for bid.

**MARIE SULLIN:** That was not the recommendation of our brokers.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. And I don't think, um -- you may have sent that information, the follow-up question and answer to Miss Hoskins.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** But I don't think you ever forwarded it. I don't recall.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** I did.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I'll have to look again.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** I sent it to the entire Council.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Um, recent? I mean, I don't recall

--

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** (Unintelligible) Friday.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I don't recall seeing it, but I'll look again. Um, so that -- my concern really -- and I would be interested in finding out -- you know, seeing exactly how some people were removed and some weren't, um, because I just -- you know, that to me just -- I mean, you either had time to do them or you didn't have time to do them, um, but to, you know, put in a concerted effort to make sure some are removed is -- you know, I just don't understand how that possibly could happen.

But, um, like we said, the whole point is to get down to what it is that happened. We know part of it. I do want to know the full story of it, um, as everyone else does, and I do and have already said that someone or some people need to be held accountable for it. And I do believe in transparency, so I'm glad this did come up and was brought out so that it was more clear to everyone exactly what was going on. Thank you.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Chair Pro Tem, you're recognized.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Um, definitely we want -- we are glad that, um, this is brought to light, but what my concern was merely and my question was about one's personal information; and I was clear in saying that what I'm concerned about is a person's, um, medical records, their Social Security number, their birthdays, what have you, the person -- the personal information.

It has been said that Mr. Evans was fired for so many different reasons and that he was about to uncover this situation, too. Nothing has happened in the last few months Mr. Evans was not about to uncover or bring to light. When this came on that day, on September the 20th, and was on the agenda, if that -- if this issue -- to me, the way it was presented, if it was a clear issue and he had a clear, uh, concern with it, I think that that should have been an item within itself, not buried in the middle of a renewal and, um, fashioned in a way -- fashioned in a way to say, hey, okay, this has happened and we've got, uh -- we've got the rate; we're gonna get, um -- it's gonna be returned, so let's move on. And basically that's how -- that's how, you know, that it seemed to have fashioned. This wasn't no great reveal that was about to be, um, revealed, if you will, by -- by Mr. Evans.

Now, if one wants to say he was proposing a workshop and we were getting ready to go into workshop to discuss this, then I can go along with -- with that, that that was gonna be the topic of the conversation at the workshop because surely when -- when -- when we asked for comments and it was brought to the floor for discussion, if this was to be revealed, that was the point at which he



would have done that. So I think to say that, um, this was one of the reasons that he was terminated I think is quite disingenuous. This had nothing, nothing to do with it -- with -- with it, if anything. Thank you, Madam Chair.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Mayor, you're recognized.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you. It was on the agenda for September the 20th. And however it was on the agenda and however Mr. Evans was going to bring it forth, my question is after that -- and this is to you, Miss Hoskins. After that, was there any reason why this was not brought by you, um, as City Manager to the Council?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Repeat the question, sir.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** And you may have answered it before because I may have stepped out, but if I hadn't -- if you have answered, then I apologize if you've given answer. It was on the agenda September the 20th, the date that Mr. Evans was fired. And I'm not here to say he was fired because of that because I've always felt that his firing was unjust. But the question is, after that, did you -- obviously you had knowledge of it, but after that, was there any reason when you became Manager that you did not bring this matter forth to the Council?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Because -- well, you all were already notified in September and, um, I was under the impression that staff was working -- working with Aetna and receiving credits, um, to, you know, get our full reimbursement. Um, and then in April, um -- or end of March when I sent the email regarding, you know, the status update, um, that's when I questioned staff about the update regarding the credits and I was, um, informed that we had received the 400 and what, \$35,000 in credits, um, not, um, really knowing, um -- I think, uh, Mr. Sherman had sent something in December, so I just -- I thought staff was working on, uh, getting those credits.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay. So from September -- we're in July. Did you have in your mind at any point that you were going to bring this to the Council?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Well, um, if you looked at the email, I said that it's gonna come up, uh, during, uh, discussions when we go back out for RFP for Aetna. I thought it would have come up during, um, the CAFA presentation. It is a significant event, uh, booking a receivable of about \$900,000, that it would have come up then, but it didn't, um, during the CAFA presentation, um, and -- no. I mean, that was it.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** But you didn't bring it to the attention I mean --

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** No, I did not.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** -- during those months. Okay. Um, I just want to be -- and I'm finished questioning you.

To, um -- to Miss Sullin, I just wanted you to know that I have not called any names tonight about who -- because I don't know. And it may -- it may be that -- may be more than one. Could be two, three, four, five people that should be held responsible and accountable. So I can't call names because I don't know, you know, but whenever it falls out or shakes out, then at that point whoever is accountable, whether it's two, three, four, five, then, um, hopefully it will be prepared to -- Management will be prepared to deal with it. If not, the Mayor will.

Amon is here, uh, tonight, Madam Chair, and to the City Council, and his name has been thrown around several times and I would, uh -- and he did indicate that he is willing to make a statement. I would ask the Council at this time to provide him an opportunity since his name, uh -- and he is the one that brought this -- the citizen brought this to the attention of the Council and the Mayor. Would you, uh -- would the Council or the Chair, uh, allow him to speak? Um, Mr. Amon, would you come forward, please?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** One moment, Mr. Mayor. You know --

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Well, you didn't answer. You didn't say anything.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** You didn't give me a moment. I was -- I was -- do I have a moment to -- to gather my thoughts?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yeah.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** We have -- we continuously are out of order and you, as Mayor, perpetuate some of this stuff just --

**MAYOR MASTERS:** No, I disagree with that.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** You may disagree, but this is --

**MAYOR MASTERS:** That's wrong for you to say that. You don't have the right to say that.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** This is my position, Mr. Mayor. I do have right to say it.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** No, you do not. You don't have the right to accuse me.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It's not an accusation. It's a fact.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** No, it's your --

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It is a fact.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** That's your opinion.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** We are in the middle of a discussion. Mr. Amon Yisrael has been in this building -- I saw him earlier. He had every opportunity to put in a comment -- a public comment card. Why, then, do we wait until such time as now to want to interject the fact that Mr. Yisrael is here? He's been here. He knows this process. This is nothing new. And we are continuously changing our policies at -- at a whim. And -- and you all -- there is -- I -- I am growing very frustrated because there is a very concerted effort from this dais to interfere, to make it appear as if I am incapable of running this meeting and changing processes, throwing out that we've done things differently. I have given every person that has sat in this capacity of Chair the utmost respect. I have given you, Mr. Mayor, the utmost respect, but the same is not being returned to me. So in light of that fact, I'm going to say no, it's improper because he's been here.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Can I ask for a ruling from the Council to overrule the Chair --

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** The Council -- the Council may --

**MAYOR MASTERS:** -- at this point to allow him to speak?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Well, if the Council chooses to overrule, the Council may do so.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** It takes three people.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Miller-Anderson, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I do recall seeing Mr. Amon come up with a card. I don't know at what point in the meeting he came up to bring it. It may have been afterwards. I'm not sure. But I do -- I do -- he actually said he was okay, back a long time ago, with coming up and addressing the issue. Um, unfortunately I didn't realize he was trying to get my attention. So

I -- because I brought his name up and I'm sure some other people did, I am okay with him coming and speaking. Um, I'm -- I'm fine with it. And it's nothing -- doing something different from -- the situation is what's leading that to happen. It's not like we're just grabbing people out of the audience and say you can come and speak. So this is a different situation. So I'm okay with it for this --

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Roberts' Rules of Order says that, too. Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Whatever the pleasure of the Council is, I will certainly abide by it. Would any other member from the Council like to (unintelligible) since we are a body of five?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Three minutes.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** I support your decision and your position, Madam Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Botel?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** I'm -- I'm fine with having him speak as long as he's brief. Of course I am. Well, no --

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** No, it's okay. Of course. It's okay.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Chair -- chair, I mean --

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It's okay. Let's -- let's -- let's not belabor the time. Mr. Yisrael, if you would please come forward and make your comments.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you, Madam Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Please begin your comments, Mr. Yisrael.

**AMON YISRAEL:** Yes. Good evening.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Good evening, sir.

**AMON YISRAEL:** Amon Yisrael. Mayor, Chair, Council. Um, I will say this. There are more than, uh, Chair, your employees in the City that's aware of this. It did not come from Kashamba. It did not come from any of the employees. Uh, there are people in Jupiter that knows about this. There are people in West Palm Beach that knows about this. And just for the record, the insurance company knows about it. Uh, it did not come from your employees.

Uh, I made it aware as a taxpayer. Uh, it is our taxpayers' money. And just wanted to have clarification on it. That's all I asked for, uh, when I came and -- and notified. I'm beginning to wonder, um, was it not spoken of or dealt with. I would hate to think it was something that was gonna be hidden, but there are more people in, uh -- in the area that knows about this than -- than your staff, Chair, uh, City Manager. There's -- there's much more than that know about it. Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, sir.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair, just one quick thing if you don't mind.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** You're recognized, Councilwoman Miller-Anderson.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And I -- I do want to put on the record, too, that Mr. Jay Jerome Taylor did reach out to me a day or two after the meeting to say that he had information. So I don't know where he got his either. And I did make that clear, that I was aware of two people, before I did put in my request. So I don't know -- and Miss Hoskins, you know, revealed that there are two separate lists. I don't know where the other list come from, but I think she did mention there may have been another one created from something. But, um, I did want to go on record that Mr. Taylor did reach out to me as well about it.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** He reached out to me as well. We have -- we have discussed this matter. Are there any, um, final -- there's comment from the -- Madam City Manager, do you have any comments?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** No. No, ma'am.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** No? Comments from the Council starting with the Mayor? Please, we have seven minutes.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay. I'll do it -- I'll do it within one minute. Um, just a point that I do want to make for clarification. Do not want anyone to take it personally, but Roberts' Rules of Order, which we're governed by, whenever there's decision by the Chair, Roberts' Rules of Order gives the Council the right to overrule that and that's what I asked for, or to hear the matter.

Um, Friday is a very important day in this city. Friday at 6:30 p.m. we're asking all residents and anyone who has any ideas, programs, projects, that will help our police department, elected officials, administration to do something about this ridiculous violence and homicides that we are experiencing in this city.

July 22nd, Sunday night at 7 -- not 6, but at 7 p.m. -- Family and Friends Day will take place at the Event Center, um, with, um, Mr. Ulysses -- Patrick Ulysses Pinkney, local young man who's gone all over the -- around the world, Japan and other places. You're gonna miss a treat. Thank you, Madam Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Botel?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** I try not to make snide remarks about other people in Council, so I'm gonna refrain from saying anything about the snide remark that was made about me.

I do want to make a few comments. I want to remind City Manager that we are -- we do have that RFP out. I hope that we act expeditiously to, uh -- to make sure that it gets taken care of. Uh, you -- you responded to an email that I sent you earlier about the investigation of the compensation study that was supposed to be conducted by the Inspector General. You said that the Inspector General was not gonna be investigating your raise but that you would raise the issue of -- with the Finance Director as to the status of the compensation investigation as it relates to other staff members. I hope that you follow through on that. I appreciate hearing about that as soon as you do.

Uh, I would like to know how quickly the advertisement for the City Attorney's position will be -- will be posted. You told me that, uh, you would send out an email asking if other councilpeople want to weigh in on that job description. I hope that gets taken care of as quickly as possible. Uh, I also sent you something about wanting to have a presentation from a HUD representative about what our options are for the people living in Stonybrook. I'd like that to be done as quickly as possible. I think that I was informed that you worked today to some degree with HUD to try to find some alternative housing for them. I applaud that effort and I hope it has some -- comes to some fruition. Thank you.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam City Manager.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** If I may have, uh, Mr. Sherman come up. He sent the, um, information to the OIG regarding the raises. I don't know if, um, he's received any information back from them or not.

**RANDY SHERMAN:** Randy Sherman, Director of Finance and Administrative Services. Um, the information that I have received back is that it has been referred to, uh, another office for investigation. I don't know if it's all or part of the matters that I raised, um, but the letter I know has been referred to another

office. The IG I guess didn't feel that maybe it was in their purview but possibly someone else's.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Hold on. I do want to make a comment -- make announcement. So I know 11:00 is when we're cutting off. So if she's done --

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** I wanted to finish -- um, Mr. -- Mr. --

**RANDY SHERMAN:** Oh, sorry.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** You -- you made -- I'm sorry. Am I out of turn?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** No. Go ahead. Go ahead. You may finish.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** I just wanted to follow up on what you were saying. You -- you -- you said that you didn't know whether it was in part or to the total issues that you raised. Could you tell us, uh, quickly what were the issues that you raised outside of this, if any?

**RANDY SHERMAN:** Um, some of the -- some of the other issues were, um, what I'll call discrepancies in the -- in the flow of the pay grades that -- that were coming out on the reports. Um, one of them had to do with a, um -- a date which has been corrected and that's -- that's not an issue. Um, and then -- I'm trying to think. I think there was one other one. I -- I don't have the letter in front of me and I apologize, but -- but there were, I think, five issues in -- in the letter. And again, they've referred it. Um, and again, I don't know if they're looking at all five issues or if they're only looking at one of the issues. I'm not sure.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Miller-Anderson.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Um, tomorrow the, uh, Riviera Beach collaborative meeting that we have monthly at the marina has been canceled and we will pick it back up in August. Um, this Saturday, the 21st, we will have the Riviera Beach education collaborative listening session from 11 to 1 p.m. at the Lindsey Davis Center.

Um, Miss Hoskins, where are we with the City Manager, um, names that were submitted? I think the last thing was, um, everybody prioritized their name -- their, um, names?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Right. Everyone, um, prioritized their top three and, um, after the -- there were a total of nine names submitted. So I went back and asked them to, um -- well, they gave me their top three and then I went back and asked them to, uh, give me their number-one choice. So, um, they -- I received their number-one choice. All -- all the ones that -- all the Council members that participated, uh, received the final names, uh, last week. And then, uh, with -- I asked Human Resources to --

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Wait a minute. You said -- so just the people who submitted names got the final list of people to be interviewed?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** No.

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Madam Chair, excuse me.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** I didn't say that. I said I sent out an email to everyone --

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Madam Chair?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** -- to the Mayor and --

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Excuse me.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Excuse me.

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** You have two minutes.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I plan to bring this up so that she can give us an explanation on tomorrow night during the meeting.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. And that's fine. Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And then the Stony -- did they go out for inspection today?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** They went out at, um --

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** 1 p.m. today.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** -- 1:00 today.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Were most of those places able to be back open?



**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** I did not see an email reporting back the, um, issues, what the, uh, follow-up was.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. But I do want to get my question answered. So with the City Manager, you said that those names that were submitted, the final ones, you said that they will be sent to everyone or to the people that provided the names?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** No. I sent out an email to everyone.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** With the final people?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** With, um -- asking everyone to give me their top, um -- their number one. So every -- the three councilpeople responded. So --

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** But you just sent that to the three people.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** No.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** No.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** I --

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** You sent the list of names of who those people were, all of those names of -- I mean whatever the names of the people are?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** No. I sent out an email asking -- saying that we had a workshop scheduled for June 12th --

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** Excuse me again, Madam Chair. If you're gonna extend the meeting, you need to do it now.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** We can take this up on tomorrow.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I'll -- I'll -- I can stop so that you can go ahead if you need to make a comment.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** We'll take this up on -- we will take this up on tomorrow. I have no comment, and I believe it's 11:00. We can take this up and she can provide us all with the information.

Uh, to Councilwoman Botel, I said "of course" and if you -- if that offended you in some manner, I did not intend it offensively. I simply said "of course" in

response to your response. So I'm not being snide. I am growing -- I am frustrated, of course, and I think that everyone up here probably should be based on actions that have taken place, but I will leave it at that. We will pick up our meeting --

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** You're taking it out --

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I'm not taking it on you.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** -- on me.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I am not taking it out on you.

**DEPUTY CITY CLERK BURGESS:** It's now 11:00.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** And I -- and I apologize professionally to you.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** I accept your apology.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Miss Hoskins?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Yes, ma'am.

## **ADJOURNMENT**

(CONCLUSION OF SPECIAL COUNCIL MEETING)

**APPROVED:**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**THOMAS A. MASTERS**  
**MAYOR**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**TONYA DAVIS JOHNSON**  
**CHAIRPERSON**

**ATTEST:**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**CLAUDENE L. ANTHONY**  
**CERTIFIED MUNICIPAL CLERK**  
**CITY CLERK**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**LYNNE L. HUBBARD**  
**CHAIR PRO TEM**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**KASHAMBA MILLER-ANDERSON**  
**COUNCILPERSON**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**JULIA A. BOTEL, Ed.D**  
**COUNCILPERSON**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**TERENCE D. DAVIS**  
**COUNCILPERSON**

**MOTIONED BY:** \_\_\_\_\_

**SECONDED BY:** \_\_\_\_\_

**L. HUBBARD** \_\_\_\_\_

**K. MILLER-ANDERSON** \_\_\_\_\_

**T. DAVIS JOHNSON** \_\_\_\_\_

**J. BOTEL** \_\_\_\_\_

**T. DAVIS** \_\_\_\_\_

**DATE APPROVED:** SEPTEMBER 5, 2018

**SPECIAL CITY COUNCIL MEETING**  
**American High-Tech Transcription**  
**Largo, FL 33771**

**JULY 17, 2018**  
**2600 East Bay Drive, Suite 215**  
**727-535-1066**