

**CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH  
REGULAR CITY COUNCIL MEETING  
May 16, 2018**

PRESENT AT MEETING<sup>1</sup>:

THOMAS A. MASTERS	MAYOR MASTERS
CHAIRPERSON TONYA DAVIS JOHNSON	CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON
CHAIR PRO TEM LYNNE L. HUBBARD	CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD
COUNCILPERSON KaSHAMBA L. MILLER- ANDERSON	COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON
COUNCILPERSON JULIE BOTEL	COUNCILPERSON BOTEL
COUNCILPERSON TERENCE DAVIS	COUNCILPERSON DAVIS
CITY MANAGER KAREN L. HOSKINS	CITY MANAGER HOSKINS
CITY CLERK CLAUDENE L. ANTHONY	CITY CLERK ANTHONY
CITY ATTORNEY ANDREW DEGRAFFENREIDT	CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT

TRANSCRIBED BY:

Legal Transcription, Etc., LLC  
931 Village Boulevard  
#905-148  
West Palm Beach, FL 33409  
(561) 429-3816  
(561) 584-5044 (fax)  
jreitano@legaltranscriptionetc.com

---

<sup>1</sup> List of City Employees, Public Speakers and Others on Page 236 and 237

**CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH  
PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA  
MINUTES OF THE CITY COUNCIL MEETING  
HELD IN THE CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS  
MAY 16, 2018 @ 6:00 P.M.**

[Gavel]

**CALL TO ORDER**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Good evening. I'd like to call the Regular City Council Meeting of May 16, 2018 to order.

**ROLL CALL**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Clerk, roll call, please.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Mayor Thomas Masters?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Present.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chairperson Tonya Davis Johnson?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Here.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Pro Tem Lynne Hubbard? [Pause]. Councilperson KaShamba Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Present.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Julia Botel?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Here.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Terence Davis? [Pause]. City Manager Karen Hoskins?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Here.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** City Clerk Claudene Anthony is present. City Attorney Andrew Degraffenreidt?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Here.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** You may proceed.

## **PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I'd like to take a moment of silence, followed by the Pledge of Allegiance led by Mayor Masters.

[Moment of silence]

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Shall we pledge?

**ALL:** I pledge allegiance to the Flag of the United States of America and to the Republic for which it stands, one nation under God, indivisible with liberty and justice for all.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Let the record reflect that Chair Pro Tem Hubbard and Councilman Davis are now on the dais.

## **AGENDA APPROVAL**

### **ADDITIONS, DELETIONS, SUBSTITUTIONS**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Manager, are there any additions, deletions and/or substitutions?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Yes, ma'am. We have the following additions under community benefits. Item No. 14A, the Pink Queen Foundation, Incorporated, \$500, Councilman Terence Davis to provide support and wellness baskets, assisting with medical copays and provide emotional support to cancer survivors that are currently under treatment. Item No. 14B, National Federation of the Blind in the amount of \$250, Mayor Thomas Masters to provide ongoing support of blind and [stammer], visually impaired.

Under awards and presentations, Item No. 16A, a Proclamation from the Office of the Mayor declaring the first Friday in June 2018 as National Gun Violence Awareness Day.

Under discussion and deliberation, you have additional information, under Item No. 26, related to the compensation study and payroll transparency, discussion and deliberation, No. 1, a letter from the MAG Consultant, No. 2, the implementation report for the managerial group, No. 3, the proposed pay plans, No., 4, Former City Manager's contracts and No. 5, personnel action request of Former City Managers.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** [Inaudible]?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** That approved.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Their requests.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It was already on there.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Ms. Councilman Davis.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I would like to add.., match the \$250 that the Mayor asked for the National Federation of the Blind, the community benefits. I'll match that amount.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Botel.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** I would like to make a motion that we remove Items 20 and 26 from the Agenda. Item 20 relates to authorizing the City Manager to hire department heads. And Item 26 relates to the compensation study. I'm moving that we... Shall I go on?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Well, I wanted an opportunity to see if she was done and then I will come back to you all.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair, I have additional add-on Items from Councilperson.., Chairperson Tonya Davis Johnson to Palm Beach County School District in the amount of \$1,000. Also, Council, Council.., Chair Pro Tem Lynne Hubbard...

[Inaudible dais comments]

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** And the breakdown of the \$1,000 is as follows, Lincoln \$300, Washington \$200, Bethune \$200, and West Riviera \$300.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Say that again. \$300 Lincoln...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** \$300 Lincoln, Washington \$200, Bethune \$200, and West Riviera \$300. This is from Chairperson Tonya Davis Johnson.

That's all I have, ma'am.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, City Manager. Councilwoman Botel, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** I made a motion to remove Items 20 and 26 from the Agenda.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** There's not a motion. You're requesting to pull those Items. [Pause]. Items 20 and?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Item 20 relates to authorizing the City Manager...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** No.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** ...to hire...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** What are the Item numbers that you asked? 20 and?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** And 26.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Miller-Anderson.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well, she's, she's not pulling, is she? 'Cause that's not under the Consent, she just wants to have them deleted because I, I want to keep 26 on here. We have both individuals here. Is Mr. Sherman here? That 26, did it change? 'Cause I'm..., 26 is the compensation, right?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Mhmm.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Right.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** 26 is...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mr. Sherman is here?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** 26 is discussion and deliberation and 20 is also discussion and deliberation.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Did you want to share why you want to pull it, or...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** I, I would.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...and then the 20?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** I was led to believe that if I., that we couldn't have a discussion unless I made a motion and it was seconded.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Well, we need to discuss that because...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...you, you...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** I'm happy to discuss it.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...choose not to.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** I'm, I'm happy to discuss it. The, the reason I'd like to move 26 to a separate meeting is that I believe that we have the OIG coming in to investigate this. Am I correct? I was told by...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair? [Pause]. I spoke with Mr. John Kerry on yesterday, regarding an investigation regarding my pay and he said that he would get it.., get the investigation done quickly, completed quickly, over the next two to three days. An investigator should be here at the City to retrieve all the documents and they'll make a determination quickly.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** And I believe that.., if I may, Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Botel, you are recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** I believe that if we are going to have an independent investigation of the compensation study and the compensation given to the City Manager, that once that investigation is completed, then we can make determinations as a Council.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair, the investigation [stammer] is in regarding my compensation, not the study.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Oh.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Botel.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** In that case, my recommendation is that we have an independent investigation of the compensation study done by someone like the OIG, or some other independent body. I have get.., I'm getting opinions from many sources within the City, and it's impossible for me to make a determination about the veracity of those sources, and I think we need to have an independent person comes in and do a complete study, an investigation of what happened with that compensation study. In the meantime, it is my recommendation that all raises above 10% be frozen until that investigation can be completed.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Well, let's hear from the remaining Members of the Council as to what they desire to do with this particular Item. Councilwoman Miller-Anderson, did you have any comment that you wanted to make?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well, I was not aware of the... I mean, well, I do know that Mr. Sherman said that he submitted the information to the OIG. I was not aware of the information which you're sharing, Ms. Hoskins, in regards to the investigation piece of it. It is.., I know that I have requested for a special meeting for these two Items that are on.., Item No. 26, and because Mr. Sherman was out of town on last Wednesday, I had asked for it to be last Wednesday but Mr. Sherman was out of town

and I felt that both parties needed to be present. And then, Ms. Hoskins was out of town Thursday and Friday, so I was unable to have the special meeting last week. So.., and my, my reasoning for requesting the special meeting was to get to hear from both par'.., both parties, Ms. Hoskins and Mr. Sherman because of the memo coming from both of them. I understood that Mr. Sherman had submitted this information to the OIG but I, at.., in my mind, I was not thinking that that would be tied into the meeting that we had, I wanted it to be more of a fact finding, allowing the two of them to have their time to provide information, being that they were both disputing, for the most part, one another. And, also to talk about the compensation study and the additional information that has come up in the past few weeks, which explained all of the init'.., the actual percentage increases of select employees.

So, with all of that information coming out in the last coup'.., last week or two, a week maybe, that was why I requested a meeting. So, it was more of trying to get information out. With the OIG doing their investigation, I was not thinking that would be something that would be wrapped up in a matter of days. And if it was going to be several months, I would not be comfortable with just allowing it to just go away or not address it for.., until the investigation's done.

Now, Dr. Botel is requesting to freeze the salaries of those that were increased because of the pay study and that would be one of the things in which.., the reason why I put it on here, to talk a little more about that pay study because a lot of things came up since February. I don't really have a whole lot of faith in that compensation study. [Pause]. Is there a problem? [Pause]. I really don't have much faith in the compensation study considering all of the things that have come out. And, because of that, during our discussion, I wanted to have some different information [pause] come out, and then from there, my intention was to have a discussion about that, but if she's asking for.., I don't have a problem with seconding it, but I don't believe this is something that we need to just kinda, like, not do anything about until we're.., whenever the OIG finishes their report.

So, you know, I, I really would like to hear both sides. I mean, it should be facts. The facts shouldn't change. So, if Ms. Hoskins tells her side and Mr. Sherman tells his side and they're providing facts, then I don't.., I really don't know what would change in between now and the OIG doing their reporting. I would be okay with holding off, maybe until the next meeting only. Now, with that being said, I'm not sure if I would wanna go beyond the next meeting to get that information.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Davis, did you have comments?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Just a point of clarification. So, we're still getting into the position of ordering the Agenda, and this has asked to delete. Is that what...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Is this being asked to be deleted?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** She's asking to delete those two items for discussion.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I'm not gonna discuss it. I think this and Item that.., is an adminis'.., administrative Item. The City Manager, um, there were some things that were discussed that was claimed to be taking place, the City Manager made an administrative decision and responded to it. At this point, if the City Manager wants to continue to move forward with the presentation, whatever she.., it is that she desire' to do, I want to hear at this, at this juncture. If it's something that we wanna wait on the OIG, one thing you can learn about OIG there's many.., they administer a lotta opinions about a lot of cases across the county, but we have to govern our business accordingly and move forward as a City. I support whatever it is that this Board wants to do, but at the same time, it's an administrative issue, and the City Manager, at some point, needs to be allowed to run the day to day operations. And all I'd like to know is, can we just move forward, just runnin the City business?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** One moment.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Go ahead.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Commissioner Miller-Anderson, one moment. Chair Pro Tem Hubbard?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Okay. I think that we should hear, we should move forward with it, this is a lot of stress to put the City Manager under. She's being accused of things that, one, she has nothing to do with, and, and two, the, the fact that.., to get this out in the open, giving her an opportunity to address things that were, that were said, I think that she needs to be allowed to do that so that she can move forward with running the day to day operation and the day to day business of the City. I see two things happening here. One, she's been giv'.., she will be given a chance to address the memo that was sent to her, or the things that were alleged in the memo, and the other thing is that if the OIG thinks that there was something illegal or what have you, then they will come up with that finding and that will be that, but what we're talking about here tonight is giving her an opportunity to address the Council and the public about the accusations and the things that were made in, in that memo.

And, the study itself, the.., 75% of the departments have problem with the study. That's.., that is, that is the problem. So, to... So, it's not like everybody has faith in that.., in the study. There's cert'.., there's a lot of people, the employees, department heads, have a problem with, with the study itself. The Manager surely didn't sol'.., didn't solicit, nor participate in the study, so that too needs to be addressed. If somebody's gonna audit the study that we brought on, that someone else did, then let them audit, let that stuff come out, let it be heard, let it be done, but to keep wrapping this weight around her day after day and putting it off, I don't think that that's fair and that's too much stress for any one person. So, I think we would move forward and let's get this all cleared up.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Mayor, you're recognized.



**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you. I think that this probably the most important Item on this entire Agenda tonight, and I definitely don't believe this is an administrative decision. We're talking [clears throat], excuse me, we're talking about taxpayer dollars and the people are here to hear, tonight, this discussion. And I think in all fairness, this is.., I don't see why this would linger waiting on the OIG report or any other report. The residents of Riviera Beach are here tonight to hear from the Manager, and I would hope the Finance Director. I do wanna hear both sides because I understand there may two different interpretations, but this has been in the media long enough and we don't need to go another day and allow this to germinate in the media anymore, especially when there has not been a press release regarding this matter which I think was a mistake. But, we are here tonight, the media's here and they need to hear from these parties tonight, and this needs to take [stammer], needs to, you know, we need to rock and roll.

And having said that, because it's No. 26, it's probably gonna be three hours before we get there and I think because this is one of the most important Items on this Agenda, and this is taxpayers dollars that we're talking about and the people are here to hear about their dollars, it ought to be moved way up on the Agenda and let's deal with this, instead of No. 26 when everybody may be gone, we're not as sharp at 10:00 o'clock or 10:30, as we would be at 6:00 o'clock or 6:30. So, I don't see any reason why it should stay in that place. So, I do agree with Councilwoman.., Chair Pro Tem Hubbard, I agree with what I heard KaShamba Miller-Anderson say, Dr. Botel, I think there's a little bit of, of, of some truth in all of what was said, we all wanna deal with it, we're just trying to figure out the best way to deal with it. So, my recommendation is move it up, let's deal with it tonight, rock and roll and move on.

Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, Mr. Mayor. Let me, let me say this, we have spoken a couple of times as it relates to not having faith in the study and one of the important components of this discussion would be the consultant. And so, I think that it is important and most appropriate to have the consultant in the discussion to talk about the tenets of the study. You know, none of us are experts in this, but it is.., as a consultant, it is MAG's responsibility to defend the study and the formulas that were used. So, we need to be.., in my mind, we need to be careful not as to disparage this company. We may not necessarily agree with all tenets, but we need to be careful about that. So, one of the.., if we are going to deal with the compensation in its totality, then the consultant needs to be a part of that discussion when that happens.

But, as it relates to the correspondence that was sent to the OIG and the information that has been alleged, I do believe that we need to take that up tonight, allow Ms. Hoskins an opportunity. I have no problem moving the Item up. I think that she needs an opportunity to express her position, as well as Mr., Mr. Sherman stating his, or restating his position as was reported in the memorandum.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Ch'...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I heard Councilwoman Botel.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well, I had asked but you went to Ms. Hubbard because...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Right. Because I...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...you were giving everybody the ...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Because...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...one time.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes. I was...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Right.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...giving everybody an...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Right.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...opportunity. So, if you would allow...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well, I wanted to make mention that the Item's that we're talking about, this particular Item, is..., like I said before, this is what I requested to have a special meeting for, but when it was decided that we weren't gonna be able to have the special meeting, I asked for this Item, I asked Ms. Hoskins to put it on the regular Agenda for this week and I asked for it to be put at the end of the Consent Agenda. It was not put there, and so I had had conversation with her about moving, actually 26 and 27 up. Those were the two that I asked to be behind the Consent Agenda. I don't know why... I mean, it wasn't there but I did have a conversation with her as to it not being there, and I told her that during the meeting I would ask for it to be moved up, right behind the Consent Agenda.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you. City Manager.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Yes. Madam Chair, I would move that we..., well, I recommend that we do move that Item up, if not before public hearings on second reading...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I would like it after the Consent Agenda, the two, 26 and 27.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** We would like... [Stammer], we, we understand your position. Let's hear from the colleagues and, and let's make a determination.

However, were we done with additions, deletions and substitutions other than these two items? And let me say this, I'm not in favor of moving 22, or deleting 22 because there is such a, a gap in, in, in our leadership and we need to allow her to appoint some positions and we had a discussion where we said that we would do that. So, I don't understand the need for it to be back under discussion and deliberation. I don't understand why we're bringing it back for a discussion and deliberation when we discussed this previously and, were actually to have action taken on this at the last meeting.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Botel, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** We may have discussed it, but we did not vote on it and I, for one, would not have voted to allow Ms. Hoskins to appoint department heads. As a matter of fact, this evening, I was making a motion to ask her to be returned to the Finance Department. So, yes.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** So, it...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible]...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** ...would not be my preference to have her be entitled to appoint department heads. She, in my preference, would be returned to the Finance Department, in light of recent events. So, we may have had discussion on it, but we certainly did not have a vote on it. Thank you.

Now, ma I address the issue of Item 26? I'm happy to have it discussed this evening. My primary goal in discussing it earlier was to be sure that we had an external in'.., investigation of this matter. Yes, we can have a conversation this evening between Mr. Sherman and Ms. Hoskins, yes it's fine to get that out in the open, but I would ask... I, I was led to believe, and I unfortunately probably misunderstood what Ms. Hoskins led me to believe earlier, that the OIG's office was coming in to investigate. You, you.., when I said I wanted an investigation, you said, 'Oh, the OIG is coming in to investigate.' I probably assumed that you meant that they were coming in to investigate the compensation study. Now, I understand they're coming in to investigate your salary. I would like to be sure that an external body comes in to investigate the entire compensation study. People were compensated at 100%. Someone went from \$62,000 to \$133,000. That is completely...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** ...inappropriate. The Mayor has the authority to suspend people who do things like that, and I would recommend that he engage in that authority.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** So, as I've said, I'm perfectly happy to discuss it this evening, on the assurance that we can have an external investigation conducted into this matter.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Thank you...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...Councilwoman Botel. Chair Pro Tem.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** You know, I think it's wrong to throw out little nuggets of.., and innuendos just prior to us having a full investigation or discussion. Number one, most of us have worked with companies that have installed new software, and after that we spend more time on it with the company trying to get the quirks out of it. When people are coded and classified, and then something this magnanimous happens, the company goes back, they look at it, and, and it will be adjusted and it will be taken care of. Everybody knows that something went wrong. Everybody knows that it has to, to be adjusted. We've all been in the middle of new software, new programming that has taken place. So, it, it's clear to see if it happens to one group one section, that something went wrong, not that somebody was trying to do something illegal or, or [stammer] or inappropriate, and to sit up here and to say that, that there is a need to move Ms. Hoskins, one of our best and one of our brightest that has been here almost 30 years, in the City...

[Audience applause]

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...without an investigation, without being.., an opportunity to have t flushed out as to what actually happened, just because something went wrong with a study that we commissioned, so now it is.., we're gonna say that she's done something wrong? And we'll just send her back? No. Everybody ma'.., everything.., everybody makes mistakes, certain things happen and all... Hey, even here at this City, we have had software that was brought on that we spent more time with those providers than we did when they were installing it the first time. So, to say that because of this, we need to send her back to Finance, I think that's utterly ridiculous and inappropriate to say the least.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair?

[Inaudible comments]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Miller-Anderson, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Can we... Okay. It sounds like we're pretty much agreeing that we'll hear the Item. So, we could just maybe have our discussions that we're having right now, under the Item, because I'm...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...I mean, I'm...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Everybody has to weigh in and, and when things are...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well, I mean we're...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...put out there...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** No...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...we have to have this discussion if, if you..., if you're...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** It's about...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...going to start it.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...agree'... No. Agreeing to keep it on, is what I'm saying. I think everybody has pretty much agreed to keep it on.

[Inaudible comment]

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** That was the question.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Items 22 and 26 will remain on the Agenda.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well, not 22.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I, I, I'm not, I'm not supporting the...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Not Item 22.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...the deletion of Item 22.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair?

]Inaudible dais comment]

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I don't think it's 22.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I'm sorry, 20.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** It's 20.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I'm not, I'm not supporting the deletion of 22.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** 20.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** 20.

[Inaudible comments]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** 20. So.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I mean, I don't support it being on here, just like I didn't support allowing it to happen. But I can certainly.., if we don't have a consensus to remove it, I can certainly make my comments during the time in which we have the Item.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mhmm. That's perfectly fine. So, Item 20 and 26, we will move it...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well, we're not gonna move tw'... You want 20...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Pardon?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** You're talking about moving 20 up too?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It doesn't have to move. It can stay where it is until discussion and deliberation.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** No. Not.., for 20, yeah. 20, you didn't wanna move? You just 20 off?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** She wanted it off.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Right.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** The 26, so.., because we're talking about addition and deletion, I wanted 26...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** We are going to remove... You said you wanted 26...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And 27, moved up behind Consent Agenda.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** That's what you had asked for in the first place.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** That, that...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** But why does...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...was what I init'...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...27 need to be moved?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** 27 is.., because both of those Items are important Items, which...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** All Items...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And those are the two...

[Inaudible comment]

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well, let... Excuse me. Let me say this. Those are the two Items that I asked for, and I asked.., when we had the special meeting, the forensic part came on. I asked Ms. Hoskins would we put those there because they kinda tie in together, to put them both under the Consent Agenda. The forensic audit is intended to...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** We're intended to have a discussion on it because of this whole situation with the compensation study, with the longevity pay issue. And then, from that , in my interactions I have discovered there may be some other areas that need to be looked at. And so, they tie in together, and I think it's a very important conversation to have right behind the compensation longevity Item. So, those were the two that I asked for, to be put behind the Consent Agenda. 'Cause they go together.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Well, we have the... Mr. Harvey, how, how long is your presentation, please?

**MR. R. HARVEY:** Approximately fifteen minutes.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay. I would be in support of placing it right above public hearings.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** That's fine.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** So that we can get through this.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** That's fine.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** So, we will...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Both of them?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...move Item, Item Nos. 26 and [pause], Items 20, 26 and 27.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** 20 doesn't have to move unless somebody asks for that.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I would like...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...for it to move, if that's...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** [Inaudible] you all...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...okay with you?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...want it to move.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** And not you all, we just would just like to have it moved, please.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay, Ms. Davis Johnson.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you. So, we will move Items 20, 26 and 27 right before public hearings. They will come immediately after the presentation of the audit.

### **DISCLOSURES BY COUNCIL**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Are there any disclosures by Council? [Pause]. I would like to disclose that I did have a conversation with Mr. Harvey with regards to the [pause], the audit.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** For Item..., the Item with the filling station, the gas stations, Item No. 17, was that an Item that we actually tabled?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Clerk, was that Item tabled?

[Inaudible dais comments]



**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair, I...

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** If my...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** ...believe it was.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** If I recall correctly, Staff requested that it not be adopted at the previous City Council meeting. There was no motion to table or postpone.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Staff asked to pull it?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** It's the second reading [inaudible].

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Right.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay. So, it's returning.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So there was no motion.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Ch'...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Are there any other questions?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yes. Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Mayor.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Noted that you had a discussion with the, uh, the guys that's gonna do the forensic audit, your name again?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Harvey, Covington.

**MR. R. HARVEY:** [Inaudible].

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yes. Did you also make yourself available to other Councilpeople or the Mayor?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** He didn't call me, I called him, Mr. Mayor.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I need you to answer my question, sir. That's a yes or no.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** He is always available.

**MR. R. HARVEY:** Good day, Mayor. I always make myself available by email or by call, if needed, to all of the elected officials and appointed officials.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I don't remember getting one. Thank you. I didn't get one. Right?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Are there any other disclosures?

[Pause].

### **ADOPTION OF AGENDA**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Request a motion to adopt the Agenda.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** So moved.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Second.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It's been moved and properly second. Are there any comment cards on the Consent Agenda, Madam Clerk?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, before we go to public comment cards for the Consent Agenda, let me do the call., roll call vote for the adoption of the Agenda.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes, ma'am.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Hubbard?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Botel?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** No.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Davis Johnson?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** That motion is approved with Councilperson Botel dissenting.

### **COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC ON CONSENT AGENDA (THREE MINUTE LIMITATION)**

### **CONSENT AGENDA**

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, we do have public comment cards on the Consent Agenda.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ALL MATTER LISTED UNDER THIS ITEM ARE CONSIDERED TO BE ROUTINE AND ACTION WILL BE TAKEN BY ONE MOTION. THERE WILL BE NO SEPARATE DISCUSSION OF THESE ITEMS UNLESS A COUNCILPERSON SO REQUESTS, IN WHICH EVENT THE ITEM WILL BE REMOVED FROM THE GENERAL ORDER OF BUSINESS AND CONSIDERED IN ITS NORMAL SEQUENCE OF THE AGENDA

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Are there any Items to be pulled?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes, Madam Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** From Consent Agenda? Councilwoman Miller-Anderson, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I would like to pull Item No. 5 and Item No. 6.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Are there any other Items? [Pause]. Anyone wanna... That's it? Motion to approve the Consent Agenda with Items 5 and 6 pulled.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Moved.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It's been motioned, is there a second?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Second.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It's been motioned and properly second.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Do you want the vote or you want the public comment cards first?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** [Inaudible].

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Okay. Debra Allen and Lloyd Brown. [Pause]. Debra Allen?

**MS. D. ALLEN:** Good evening everyone.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Good evening.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Good evening.

**MS. D. ALLEN:** My name is Debra Allen. I live at 1234 West 37<sup>th</sup> Court.

I was hoping to hear some discussion on Resolution No. 4118 before I made comment. I'm try'..., I own a home on West 37<sup>th</sup> and I understand that a access road is gonna be put in on that road, and so I would..., wanted to understand it a little more. I thought that Mr. Harvey..., I think that someone would be here this evening to discuss that development? No? No. 2 on your Agenda.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Bailey?

[Inaudible comment]

**MS. D. ALLEN:** Mr. Bailey?

**UNK:** Mhmm.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** [Inaudible].

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair? Do you mind if I get your number and I can have Mr. Bailey give you a call? This Item hadn't been pulled. Or, if it, it's the Council's desire to have Mr. Bailey talk about the Item or?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Clerk, would the... Since she's here for the..., for 37<sup>th</sup> Street, 37<sup>th</sup> Court, can we amend our pulling of the Items to include Item 2? Is that proper or is that not?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Is that the desire of the Board?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Is that the desire of the Board since she's requesting information?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** It's fine with me.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** It's fine.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** It's fine.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay. So, we will pull Items 2, 5 and 6. Thank you. Mr. Brown.

**MR. L. BROWN:** How you doing? My name is Mr. Brown, since she said it.

What I wanna say is this, and I mean, a lot of things I see in your Resolutions, you said I can't talk out of it, but I mean, honestly, I, I think a lot of you people up here are under a lot of stress and, I mean, you brought it up [inaudible] about stress. Okay. Well, it's like a, a job that you do, you know, if you go on a job and it's like a dangerous job, okay? I consider this dangerous because everything that you approve up here, it has something to do with all the people in Riviera Beach. You know, it's gonna affect them one way or another, and if you're under stress and, I mean, I don't see you actually really making... I mean, this may be a okay decision, but when it come down to, like, spending a lot of taxpayer money and stuff like that, I don't think you should be doing any of that. And, not only just because I'm saying the stress, I mean, you're not, you don't have a full house. I mean, it's like you can't complete a puzzle unless you got all the pieces, and we definitely don't have all the pieces over here in Riviera Beach and you know you don't.

These people up here, that we have here., I mean, see, you got your Agenda already there, so you want your Agenda to go through. So, whatever this City Manager' done, it's no big deal to me, you know, 'cause I see this happen all the time. It ain't like nobody, you now [chuckle], it ain't no shock. I mean., and you got to be under stress. And if you can't., you can't tell me you're not because for one thing, I was invited to go to a KKK meeting. You know what I told 'em, I wa'n't gonna come...

[Inaudible comments]

**MR. L. BROWN:** ...but Davis... Wait, listen. But Davis came over there knowing he wasn't wanted over there, so he must be stressed out. I mean, that was real stupid to come in somewhere where you're not wanted. So, I mean, the whole, the whole group of ya'll that's under investigation or whatever it is, it's like you're going to a football game and you only got five people and it take eleven for you to have a team. Ya'll don't even have a team up here. You don't have a team nowhere. You don't have a team in the offices, you don't have anything, but you wanna run the City 'cause all your Agendas and everything that you wanna do, you wanna try to get 'em in before they get you out. And see, that's not right. That's not right at all. I mean, I might get up here and ya'll think., but I'm not Lozman, I got an address. Ya'll might be lookin' at me like, 'This man always complainin'.' See? I, I grew up in Riviera Beach, and the., and, and since you black people've been running it, it's been going down, down, down. And that's the truth, and that's a shame. It's like you don't look., you', you're looking at the problems, you know, and don't get me wrong, I'm not racist, you're lookin' at the white problems, you're not lookin' at the right problems. The ones that the black individuals in this neighborhood are having, you're not looking at those things, you're looking way above their heads and you're just neglecting the people over there.

A lot of people told me to come over here and just talk to you because, for one thing, they don't understand nothin' you talk about, they don't understand nothing you're doing. All they hear is you people arguing, left and right, back and forth. It's a Smokey Robinson album, 'Tif for Tat,' that's how it is over here. One say' something, the other one disagree. This one disagree, that one agree. Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, Mr. Brown.

**MR. L. BROWN:** The ones that are in cahoots, they'll agree with it, and it's wrong. You're just destroying the City. I mean...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you Mr. Brown.

**MR. L. BROWN:** ...you're putting a nail in the coffin. [Stammer]...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, Mr. Brown.

**MR. L. BROWN:** Okay. You're welcome, but you're puttin' the nail in the coffin piece by piece.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, that concludes our public comments. I will now call the vote for the Consent Agenda as amended with Items 2, 5 and 6 pulled. Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Botel?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Hubbard?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Davis Johnson?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Unanimous vote.

## **MINUTES**

### **1. MINUTES OF THE REGULAR CITY COUNCIL MEETING HELD APRIL 18, 2018.**

***MAYOR MASTERS DIRECTOR: CLAUDENE L. ANTHONY (561) 845-4090***

## **RESOLUTIONS**

### **2. ITEM NO. 2**

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY: RESOLUTION NO. 41-18. A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF RIVERA BEACH, PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR AND CITY CLERK TO EXECUTE A DEED WITH PALM BEACH COUNTY TO DONATE A 125 SQUARE FOOT PORTION OF THE NORTH SIDE OF LOT 124 OF MOLPHUS HEIGHTS PLAT 1, RECORDED IN PLAT BOOK 9, PAGE 58 OF THE PUBLIC RECORDS OF PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA FOR THE PURPOSE OF PROPOSED ROADWAY IMPROVEMENTS BY PALM BEACH COUNTY AND ACCEPTANCE OF OWNERSHIP OF WEST 37<sup>TH</sup> COURT AND ALLOCATION OF FUTURE FUNDING FOR THE OPERATION AND MAINTENANCE OF THE NEW LOCAL STREET AND PROVIDING AN EFFECTIVE DATE.**

**INTERIM DEPT. DIRECTOR: TERRENCE BAILEY (561) 845-4080**

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So moved.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Second?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Second.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It's been moved and properly second. Madam City Manager.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair, we have Interim Public Works Director Terrence Bailey here to give a brief presentation on the project.

**INTERIM PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** Terrence Bailey.

I provided a..., on the screen, a copy of the plans for the widening of Silver Beach Boulevard. It goes from Congress Avenue to about 300 feet east of President Barack Obama. I'll fast forward through a few of the typical sections and you can see there's a little bit of widening in the Congress area to make it, I believe, three lanes. As you move east towards Avenue S, which is the first City street, the road begins to deviate further to the north, in that area that is currently the scrub that the county has. The question..., or, the, the question by the constituent begins here at Avenue S towards the east. As Silver Beach Road is a Thorofare road, part of the county's standards are that they do not like, and typically do not allow for residential homes to back up onto thoroughfare roads with driveways. So, in this case, generally due to the speed and volume, it's generally a conflict condition that is avoided when possible. So, this road is shifting to the north and a new access road is being constructed from Avenue S, I believe to Avenue P to the east, or maybe it's R. Well, well, we'll get there on the next page. I think it's Avenue R. You can see, and it's a little bit difficult to see on the screen, but the access road will, in essence, be where Silver Beach is now and the new Silver Beach will be 100 feet to the north, allowing pass through traffic with higher volumes and speeds, not to interfere with the residents entering and exiting their homes, and providing them a level of safety.

So, I believe that was some of the essence of the question the resident had. I can get in to more specific detail with the resident later. You will recall that the county came and made a presentation at the Marina Event Center approximately six months ago where a lot of these issues were gone into in great detail. I did have a conversation with county roadway late this afternoon, and next week this project is actually going to be going out to bid for construction. They anticipate approving it at the Board of County Commissioners around September and we should expect to see construction commence the first of the year. As I said, these are..., this is the access road that goes over to Avenue P and, and residents will have an opportunity to avoid some of the high volumes of traffic. As we move east of Avenue P, the roadway, you can see, swings back into the original alignment and you're, you're getting very close to President Barack Obama Highway and the project continues a little bit to the east.

And with that, I hope that that would address the resident's questions and concerns. I can make myself available to the resident to go over very specific questions about their..., which of the houses that this may impact, maybe hers. Again, it's, it's a little difficult to see and I'd have to find the address so we can go over the specifics. And

anything I can't answer, we always have a great relationship with the county roadway and we will bring them in to make sure her concerns are addressed appropriately.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Council'.., Chair Pro Tem Miller'.., Hubbard, I'm sorry.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Mr. Bailey, the Commissioner, Mike Renaud and I, we held an outreach meeting and at that meeting, the engineer, whom.., who has gone now, who has retired, was explaining that those persons living on that street was going to be offered a new driveway on, on 37<sup>th</sup> Court so that they would be able to get in and out of their property on 37<sup>th</sup> Court, and what we would do in, in the, in the interim, they would still have walking access onto Silver Beach Road. So, everybody.., most of the residents found that piece a plus. For example, if they would use 37<sup>th</sup> Court, they.., some people wanted circular driveways, some people wanted regular driveways, whatever their property, you know, could maintain, that was one of the things that most residents found favorable. So, maybe if you could look into that and, with the remaining Staff that Mr. Webb left and show Ms. Allen some of those particular things, I think that would, that would help a lot as well.

**INTERIM PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** No problem. I placed on the screen, an aerial so you can see the specific piece of property that we're speaking of. It is.., it's next to an existing City right of way and it's very close to President Obama Boulevard. It's again, a five foot strip that fronts Silver Beach in order for them to have enough right of way width in order to build the roads to the county standard. In essence, and you will recall we discussed at the public meeting that the county came to, they're gonna need that five foot strip from almost everyone from Avenue P to the east in order to provide nice wide sidewalks that keep people safe as they walk through the neighborhood.

And with that, I'm here to answer any questions.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Mayor, you're recognized.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yeah. I'm still waiting to hear from the resident, Mrs. Allen. I think she...

**MS. D. ALLEN:** [Inaudible].

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...wanted to say something

**MS. D. ALLEN:** Yes.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** And, uh, [inaudible].

**MS. D. ALLEN:** [Inaudible].



**MAYOR MASTERS:** No, no, no. Hold on. Come to the mic.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Please come to the mic.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yes. I wanna hear what you say because whatever you say, that's where I'm at.

**MS. D. ALLEN:** Okay.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** You live there. We wanna make you whole.

**MS. D. ALLEN:** So, Debra Allen, again.

So, if I understand it, where the red circle is, that's where the access road's gonna be?

**INTERIM PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** No, ma'am. That's where the, the... This Agenda Item is to transfer a five foot strip of land to the county so they can build a road.

**MS. D. ALLEN:** I understand.

**INTERIM PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** That is the Item before us.

**MS. D. ALLEN:** Right. But what is that strip? That's what I'm trying to figure out. What is the strip that's gonna be accessed by the county? You said that 37<sup>th</sup> Street is gonna become the access road and then you're gonna move north on Silver Beach, to make Silver Beach wider. Correct?

**INTERIM PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** Yes.

**MS. D. ALLEN:** Am I correct?

**INTERIM PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** Yes.

**MS. D. ALLEN:** Right. So, I'm trynna figure out what part of.., how are you gonna make 37<sup>th</sup> [stammer] 37<sup>th</sup> Street ...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Court.

**MS. D. ALLEN:** ...and make it... Court, and make it an access road.

**INTERIM PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** Okay. 37<sup>th</sup> Court does not exist right now between S and P. If you look at the, the screen, that.., right next to the houses at the bottom, that likeness, that is the existing asphalt for Silver Beach. Where Silver Beach is now will become the new 37<sup>th</sup> Court between P and S. The new Silver Beach... Hold on. Let me... Alright. You see the mouse on the screen?

**MS. D. ALLEN:** Okay. Yeah.

**INTERIM PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** So... we control the mouse. So, there's the intersection of S, the n'.., existing S...

**MS. D. ALLEN:** Mhmm.

**INTERIM PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** ...and the new 37<sup>th</sup> Court. This is the.., it's the existing Silver Beach and the new 37<sup>th</sup> Court will go in the exact same spot where Silver Beach is now. New Silver Beach is up here. See that, that center line? That'll be where the new Silver Beach is to the north of where it is now. So, you'll have an access road where Silver Beach is currently, and they're gonna move the entire road to the north so that residents can back up on a road that only has fourteen people who use it. It won't be a cut-thru, they'll be able to back up and have confidence that there's not going to be people, you know, high volumes of people and school buses zooming by in the morning when they're trying to get out. It's a safety measure for thoroughfare roads to give people the ability to have confidence and eliminate conflicts.

**MS. D. ALLEN:** So, as I understand it then, 37<sup>th</sup> Court, as it.., as, as it is now, people will have the option to put in circular driveways in, in front of their house, so they can come out, as Councilman Hubbard...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** We will have to go back and confirm that.

**INTERIM PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** Yes. The, the... We, we can talk about you're, you're situation. If you're asking can you change your driveway from what it may be today to a circular driveway? That will be a conversation with the county and as a part of the project, we can have that discussion. If, if that's your request.

**MS. D. ALLEN:** Yes. I would like to...

**INTERIM PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** We can r e'...

**MS. D. ALLEN:** I would...

**INTERIM PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** You would?

**MS. D. ALLEN:** ...like discussion.

**INTERIM PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** I'll, I'll...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Would you please...

**INTERIM PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** ...reach out.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...provide Mr. Bailey...

**INTERIM PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** [Inaudible] my phone number

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...with your contact information?

**MS. D. ALLEN:** Okay. Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

[Inaudible comments]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Any further questions?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Miller-Anderson, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** For the Planning & Zoning, did this come before Planning & Zoning?

**INTERIM PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** The project?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm. What you just described. The information you just talked about.

**INTERIM PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** They've been doing this project for about twelve years, so I can't honestly tell you if, in that twelve years the county's...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** The most recent...

**INTERIM PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** ...been designing this...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** The most recent discussion with Planning & Zoning, how long ago was that?

**INTERIM PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** It has not been in my tenure that I've been with the City. But again, this project's been in design for twelve years and it's gone through multiple iterations. You'll remember, there was a roundabout at Avenue S about five years ago and the City decided we did not support that and the county went back and redesigned it again. I don't have an answer for you, ma'am, on when...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Do you know..., I mean, do you know what the feedback may have been from Planning & Zoning at any point, when they had the meeting with Planning & Zoning?

**INTERIM PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** No, ma'am...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Did you do...

**INTERIM PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** ...I don't. It would've happened before my, my career here at the City.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Thank you.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Botel, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Was, was there a public hearing on this?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** There was a...

**INTERIM PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** Well, Planning & Zoning would be your typical public hearing and it would've happened, again, this has been on design for twelve to fifteen years, the county's been working on this project. So, we did have public meetings about six mon'..., we've had actually multiple meetings, and the county's come before this Board at least three times in the seven years that I've been at the City, at our request. And then, there was a public meeting at the directive of Councilwoman Hubbard six months ago at the Event Center, so that all of the individuals who live on Silver Beach, because we knew that they were gonna be doing property acquisition and it would be a question mark of, you know, what the county needed and why. We had that meeting and people got to meet about eight individuals from the county roadway staff, and, and the Council and the City Staff to go over lot by lot, so that everyone could ask their questions on the impact to their particular property. So, yes, there was a public meeting.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Mayor, you're recognized.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you. Good evening, Mr. Bailey. How are you tonight?

**INTERIM PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** Good.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** The..., I'm concerned. I wanna follow up on Councilwoman Miller-Anderson's comment or question. I'm, I'm concerned that what we do for one, we do for all. That we follow protocol, and proper procedures as it relates to what goes before the Planning & Zoning Board and what doesn't go and what doesn't have to go. So, my question to you is, would this project under normal circumstances, would this project ever would have gone before the Planning & Zoning, or is this out of their range?

**INTERIM PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** Because the project operates wholly in the county right of way, I believe that it's out of the range of the Planning & Zoning Board, from a design and construction perspective.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay. Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Are there any further questions? [Pause]. Madam Clerk?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Botel?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Hubbard?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Davis Johnson?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Unanimous vote.

**3. RESOLUTION NO. 42-18 A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH, PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA, ACCEPTING FY 2017-18 STATE AID TO LIBRARIES GRANT FUNDS FROM THE STATE LIBRARY AND INFORMATION SERVICES DIVISION OF FLORIDA IN THE AMOUNT OF \$19,792; AUTHORIZING THE DIRECTOR OF FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES TO SETUP A BUDGET; AND PROVIDING AN EFFECTIVE DATE.**

**DEPT. DIRECTOR: CYNTHIA COBB (561) 845-4196**

**4. RESOLUTION NO. 43-18 A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH, PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA, ACCEPTING THE TERMS AND CONDITIONS OF THE PROPOSED PURCHASING AGREEMENT WITH GALLS, LLC FOR THE PURCHASE OF POLICE AND FIRE DEPARTMENT UNIFORMS AND EQUIPMENT FOR THEIR AGENCIES. THIS AGREEMENT IS IN ACCORDANCE WITH THE SPECIFICATIONS PER THE BROWARD COUNTY SHERIFF CONTRACT #14036AG FOR A BASE CONTRACT PERIOD THROUGH NOVEMBER 1ST 2018. GALLS, LLC WILL PROVIDE THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH WITH SIMILAR PRICING AS SET FORTH IN THE BROWARD COUNTY SHERIFF, CONTRACT# 14036AG DOCUMENTS; AND PROVIDING AN EFFECTIVE DATE.**

**DEPT. DIRECTOR: REGINALD DUREN (561) 845-4107**

**5. ITEM NO. 5**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Item No. 5.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY: RESOLUTION NO. 444-18. A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH, PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA AUTHORIZING THE DIRECTOR OF FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES TO**

**APPROPRIATE FUND BALANCE IN THE MAJOR DISASTER FUND NUMBER 607-00-271000 IN THE AMOUNT OF \$228,800 FOR HURRICANE PREPAREDNESS, AUTHORIZING THE DIRECTOR OF FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES TO SET UP A BUDGET FOR SAME AND PROVIDING AN EFFECTIVE DATE.**

**INTERIM DEPT. DIRECTOR: MICHAEL MADDEN (561) 845-4130**

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** So moved.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Second.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It's been motioned and properly second.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair, this Item is to appropriate fund balance so we can prepare for hurricane season, which starts June 1<sup>st</sup>. The emergency management team met and made the decision that we should not operate our emergency operation center out of this facility, but go to the 15<sup>th</sup> Street facility and to add some.., we need some needed equipment and other supplies in order to move our emergency operations location there. Chief Madden, or Chief Duren can answer any questions that you may have.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I have questions.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Miller-Anderson, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So, my question and, and.., I mean, he can give a presentation, or whoever needs to give a presentation, or whoever needs to give a presentation, 'cause there, you know, there wasn't a whole lot in the backup, but my question regarding these items is, more so of with us approving tonight, we're approving the blanket \$228,000 for you all to move forward with purchasing these items. What would be the procurement process for obtaining these items? Would this be something that will be coming back to us when these items are being purchased or, I mean, when you go out for bid, what will be the process for these?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Yes, ma'am. This Item is only to appropriate the budget and we would definitely go through Procurement to purchase the i'.., the needed items.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** But, what would the process be, 'cause I know some of them.., would it be under your PIN? It's two hundred and eight'.., \$228,000 I see total.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Right.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** But they will be.., it will be purchased individually in sections where it would be coming through you or to sign the contracts, or it's gonna be through Procurement in terms of just calling for the three people to bid on it, or are we gonna do it as a whole... How's that gonna be done?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Little, would you please come forward?

**INTERIM PROCUREMENT DIRECTOR LITTLE:** Good evening, Council. Ricky Little, Interim Director of Procurement to answer the question.

All items that we can purchase using the cooperative purchasing program, we'll use that program to actually acquire those items. Anything that does not fall under that, of course, we'll go out for a solicitation, if it exceeds the \$25,000 limit.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** And do you.., by cooper'.., cooperative, you mean piggyback?

**INTERIM PROCUREMENT DIRECTOR LITTLE:** Yes, ma'am.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Which would come back to us if it's on'.., only come back to us if it's over the \$25,000?

**INTERIM PROCUREMENT DIRECTOR LITTLE:** If it's over the \$25,000.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** That answer your question? Mr. Mayor.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yes. I guess my questions would be of the, uh, I guess the Interim Director Michael Madden. I guess, I guess it would be for you. [Pause]. It was stated that we're going to have to, by the City Manager, that we're gonna have to buy additional emergency type of stuff to go[inaudible] warehouse or the Public Service Building. Now, if we didn't go there and stayed here, would there still be a need to buy additional... Because I know this is where we've been all these years and it has worked fine here. So, if we stayed here, would we, would be saving?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Monies? Or this is absolutely necessary? Whoever wants to answer.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Mayor, one question. Now, last year, when we were here, we had several leaks, as you know, right.., one right here in the Council Chambers, on the second floor in C deck and in, I believe, the City Clerk's office. So, the buil'.., the 15<sup>th</sup> Street building is.., was built after Hurricane Andrew and so the windows are ready, the roof has been repaired, so we felt that that building would be a better place for us to house Staff.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Noted. But my question is, because the leaks have been fixed here, and it was.., been leaking over there. They've got problems over there too. Ongoing. But my question is, are we spending more money moving our emergency preparedness operation over there than we would be if we stayed here, since the leak has been fixed here? And I guess everything else has been fixed...

**ASSISTANT CHIEF MADDEN:** We, we would be spending more because this current facility does not provide the space for us to operate. You know, we're constantly evaluating how we work during these emergency operations and, you know, there were a lot of us crammed in a small conference room for four days during the storm, but the 15<sup>th</sup> Street location gives us more space, which allows for us to use better technology. You know, we have a significant number of cameras and tools that we can use during the storm and all we're trying to do is provide the resources for the emergency managers to make the decisions.., the best decisions for the community. And, simply, the, the biggest issue with this location is simply space.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I understand that and they sure have a whole lot of space over there that's not useable.., using. But, my question again is.., well, a little bit differently this time, how much more money are we spending to make the move over there than if we stayed here?

**ASSISTANT CHIEF MADDEN:** The, the most significant cost for that facility is the emergency backup generator. That's, you know, over half of the cost that we're asking for. The other expenses are, you know... We really have 'em broke up into three categories, the technology, which is the telephone, IT infrastructure, which is about \$36,000.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** But we have a backup generator here, is what you're saying? That there's not one there?

**ASSISTANT CHIEF MADDEN:** Correct.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** And we're spending half of the \$228,000 to get a backup generator over there?

**ASSISTANT CHIEF MADDEN:** Correct.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you, Madam Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, Mr. Mayor.

**ASSISTANT CHIEF MADDEN:** We're spending \$120,000 to put the backup generator over there.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay. So, space is, is...



**ASSISTANT CHIEF MADDEN:** Which that location houses emergency workers in the City regardless of the E'..., EOC operating over there. So, it is something that is needed for the City facility.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay. I made my point. Thank you.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilman Davis, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Thank you so much. In the spirit of peace and cooperation, one of the things I can state that over the last two years, I have stayed with our employees through this process and you can recall as we communicated with the county, you was on that end, we had numerous employees cramping up in this location, but we still had employees at the other facility that we're trying to prepare for. There were times where the winds got too high and the employees got separated, and the best thing we were trying..., I think the Staff was trynna do, doing an evaluation process over the last two years that I've been a part of this process and being with the employees, this is an issue that's been going on for over ten years, the, the safety of the employees as they' be away from their families. And some of the employees sometimes, it's..., they, they have to leave their children, and some of the times they wanna bring their children with them to work, and, and allow some of the families members to allow them to feel comfortable about what things may happen. And I've seen employees been'..., didn't see their families for almost five days. And this is an issue that allows us to be together, coordinate with the public safety, coordinate with Public Works, coordinate with Parks, having all these different employees around the clock, none stop in one facility so we can coordinate and, and protect one another is very valuable to the safety of the employee. And it's very valuable to the reaction time and the safety of being able to go out, make sure roadways are clean, make sure that we have the technical support to do those things. There's a lot of things that took place for those who did not..., could not be here [[stammer] on a 24 hour basis, that, you know, Staff never even brought to Commission, but Staff still had to do a job. And, and this is something I, I totally support on behalf of the residents of Riviera Beach, and employees.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Was that Miller-Anderson.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** My concern that I had, which was the reason for pulling it, and, and asking the questions in which I did was because, um, I, I would have preferred to see a little more backup in terms of what the items may have cost in..., because right now, we're being asked to allocate this amount of money, not really knowing what a backup generator may cost. And, if we're talking about a cooperative agreement, or piggybacking of something we already had, it would've been, you know, maybe if we could've seen some of the actual amounts or something to go on. Because right now, I feel like I'm..., I would be just approving an amount and not really

knowing if we're overinflating this amount. And I do understand the next follow up to that would be, well, it would only be what, you know, we would.., if we.., if, if it comes back that the bids are much lower, then we would not be spending that amount, but the thing is the bids, from my understanding, would be just to ask for three. And I would.., you know, sometimes I have concerns of how we go about doing these things, and so, I'm not comfortable with moving forward with this because of the fact that I don't have enough backup information to support the figures that are listed here. Maybe if we had had some samplings of a, you know, a price range or what we're talking about, but right now it, to me, it just seems like we're doing this blanket amount for these items, not actually having figures to compare it to or verify that it's actually that amount.

And then the other thing is, I know that at one point we were talking about selling the Public Works Building [inaudible] in that area and so now we're outfitting it with, with this equipment and we're getting away from what we had already voted to do. I know we have Public Works over there because of the emergency with the situation of the old building over here, but now we're.., it's almost like we're moving in and we're setting it up department by department. And I know, as the Mayor stated, we have corrected the... And I, I, I totally understand where you're coming from in terms of needing the space 'cause I've been to other municipalities where they have a much larger facility and it's very comfortable for those who need to be there for that extent amount of time, but we did put money into repairing the, the water leaks and I, I believe a few other areas between last year, now we should have had.., I, I believe that we repaired that. So, I don't, you know, I don't wanna say that, you know, we got leaks in here as to why we would need to move, but, you know, if it is in support of trying to make additional space for you all, I, I totally understand that, but my issue right now is just approving this amount not knowing, in fact, if it really costs all of this to do that.

**ASSISTANT CHIEF MADDEN:** If I can answer a couple of those for you.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**ASSISTANT CHIEF MADDEN:** There's a, you know, a series of events this year that the City's been dealing with involving, you know, the closing of the old Public Works Building, again, not knowing if the City was gonna be occupying that space. This simply establishes the budget. We are under a, a timeline that we have been working on. You know, the Committee met and came up with these numbers based on, you know, actual pricing and things that the Committee was aware of and we were simply, knowing that we needed this Council action to move forward with hurricane season upon us, so we're really trying to get the budget established. And, you know, further on the generator, the prop'., you know, the current course of action that the Committee settled on was using a portable style generator that's kinda like built into a truck, or the size of a truck that backs up to the building, so we would really only be retrofitting the building with a connection point. So, we're not really making an investment in the building, we're setting aside a cost that pays for a portable generator, and we kinda established the worst case scenario of cost, which would be the six months of hurricane season.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Are there any further comments from the Board?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yes. Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Mayor...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** No, we're spend'...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...you're recognized.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I said Mr. Mayor, you're recognized.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay. Thank you. We're spending \$125,000 to hook up a truck to, to the building to have a backup generator? That's, that's what we're saying?

**ASSISTANT CHIEF MADDEN:** Yes. Those are the rental costs that you kinda need to plan ahead 'cause when the hurr'.., hurricane comes into the box, as we call it, you're not gonna be able to secure one because they're gonna be low, you know.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** And I've, I've been here too. I know, I know that Councilman Davis was, was here and others. I've, I've been here through those three or four days, space. I mean, it has worked for space, right here in this building. There's rooms that we didn't even touch and I'm sure that the employees made proper preparations for their family members during the expected hurricane. But Chief, my concern is the headquarters for the Police Department is here, the headquarters for the Fire Department is here and we're gonna have something way over there, but our headquarters, which you really need to be act'.., actively engaged is the Police Department and the main Fire Department station. That's my concern of moving. I'm not in favor of moving at all.

Thank you.

**ASSISTANT CHIEF MADDEN:** And those operations, we would have a Deputy Chief assigned to, you know, to run our operations and the Police Chief and the Fire Chief would be in the emergency operation center.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** But your main communications would be here, wouldn't it? For the Police...

**ASSISTANT CHIEF MADDEN:** Yes. But those operations would be run by the Deputy Fire Chief and the Assistant Police Chief.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay. Well, I'm, I'm not in favor of moving. That's just my opinion. Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Are there any other comments from the Council? Madam Clerk, were there any, were there any public comments cards on that?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** No, ma'am. Public comment cards for the Consent Agenda has been completed.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, ma'am.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Botel?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Hubbard?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** No.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Davis Johnson?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** That motion is approved with Councilperson Miller-Anderson dissenting.

**6. IEM NO. 6**

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY: RESOLUTION NO. 45-18. A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH, PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA AMENDING THE BUDGET ALLOCATION FOR THE RECONSTRUCTION OF YACHT HARBOR MANOR ROADWAY IMPROVEMENTS AND AUTHORIZING THE DIRECTOR OF FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES TO AMEND THE BUDGET AND MAKE PAYMENT FOR SAME FROM ACCOUNT NUMBERS 311-1127-541-0-6351, 415-1417-536-0-6306, 461-1127-541-0-6301 AND 140-1123-538-0-6304 AND PROVIDING AN EFFECTIVE DATE.**

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So moved.

**UNK:** Second.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It's been motioned and properly second. Madam City Manager.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair, this Item is only.., it was approved earlier, the construction contract was approved earlier and the purpose of this Item is only to realign the budget. After we looked at the Avenue O project, road project, realized that some of the budget allocations needed to be realigned and that was.., that's the purpose of this Item.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Miller-Anderson, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So, I wanted to know exactly what, what was the detail on changing the amounts for the.., 'cause it was what? The stormwater bond, went from \$886,000 to [pause] \$2.8M. And then the street bond went from \$5.6 to \$3.7M. So, what was.., what happened to cause to make the change for those two line items?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** And while we're preparing to ask that question, the Item says that we are, we are appropriately matching our costs to the appropriate funding sources, so my question is, why weren't the appropriate funding sources identified at the onset of the contract? And we can have Mr. Sherman come up. This is...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...a Finance Item.

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** Good evening. Randy Sherman, Director of Finance and Administrative Services.

Yeah. When we first contemplated doing these road projects, we.., public Works laid out a very elaborate, detailed schedule of the costs that they were anticipating for each individual road and set out four separate project areas, one in each District. Public Works met with the Councilperson representing that District, and I apologize, at large, you weren't [chuckle], you didn't get anything.., any input into this process. But, each Councilperson identified the roads, Public Works went back and then they created a very detailed line item budget for each project. Now.., then, when you're looking at the road projects and you think about those, you got your above ground so you actually have your roadside, that's the City's responsibility, you have the water and sewer that's below ground that the Utility District is paying for it. Then you have the stormwater which, as you know, we account for the, we account for stormwater as a separate entity. We use the spreadsheets that were prepared by Public Works in order to size the bonds, so we actually have bond money but from the City side, the stormwater side and the Utility District side. As the projects came in and went out to bid and the construction [stammer] contracts brought forward, Public Works would make the decisions on how those bond proceeds were being spent and being allocated. As, you know, I've been told several times, it pretty much was coming out a third, a third, a third, obviously, depending on the specific project, you know, there would be some fluctuation in there.

When we got around to the final of the four projects, which is the Avenue O, which is Item 23 tonight, and started looking at the money, it wasn't.., the allocation we're getting wasn't fitting and we were trying to figure out why it wasn't fitting. So, we went back. Mr. Bailey went back to his files and relooked at Singer Island because Singer Island also looked out of whack. If you look at, as Councilwoman Miller-Anderson pointed out and you look at that Resolution that got adopted, that stormwater isn't the third. It.., and it's really out of alignment. So, Mr. Bailey went back, he looked at it, provided us a new budget allocation for Singer Island and this is the Resolution that corrects 127-17 and, again, puts it line. So now, when you come back and you look at the new budget allocation, the City side is a little bit higher, it's not a third, a third, a third. But again, it gets that stormwater number where it really needs to be and then, by adjusting the City side and the stormwater side, that made Avenue O actually work with the Resolution, again, that you have on 23.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. Thank you.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Mayor, you're recognized.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you. We're on the, the Yacht reconstruction.., the Yacht Harbor Manor?

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** Yes.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay. My, my concern, would that be.., is rather, that the representative of Singer Island, they have a new elected representative and, and I know you.., it wasn't an oversight on your part, it was just kinda overlooked, but I just would.., for me to be comfortable with moving on this project, I, I certainly would like to know if the new Councilperson of Singer Island had an opportunity to review this because I think it's important that we should definitely, and no disrespect to other representatives or, or geographical areas but certainly, I hang my hat on recommendations from the individual who represents a particular area. So, I'm wondering, um, Dr. Botel had.., has had any, whether the City Manager or you, any opportunity to review this recommendation of this Resolution.

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** I did not speak to the Councilwoman but I just wanna [pause] clear...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** [Inaudible].

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** ...this doesn't change the project and it doesn't change the overall budget, it just changes which bucket the money is coming out of.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I, I understand.

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** And, and let me state 'cause again, I know...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I'm not suggesting changes, but...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** No, no, no.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** But, I understand what you're saying, but just in protocol...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** Yeah.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...that would be my...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** And let me, and let me add something here too 'cause the City of Riviera Beach really hasn't issued a lot of debt in the past and these projects are eligible to be audited by the IRS, 'cause again, they are issued tax exempt bonds and, at the end of project like this, similar to what we had to do with the Marina, but the Marina we had to do it because of all the grants we had, this we will have to do at the end. We will actually have to go back when the project is through and make sure that the way the dollars were spent, were spent out of the right bucket. So, we may actually come back at some other point and say, okay, we need to adjust down the line because maybe these numbers weren't the [chuckle] exact numbers. Again...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I, I...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** ...the numbers that we're getting are all estimates. We're allocating it out to the p'..., the funding sources that we have. There may be some more adjustments coming down the line.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I do understand, Mr. Sherman...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** [Inaudible].

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I guess my follow through question...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** Yeah.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...is to the City Manager. Ms. Manager, in your orientations with the representative from the Island and also of your..., have an opportunity to brief her on projects that would be in Dr. Botel's area, did you have an opportunity to do that or, or have you done that?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Mayor, are you speaking of the capital projects plan for that area or just this particular project?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I'm speaking of this, but [stammer], I mean, it could be the capital for the whole area, but this is what's..., what I'm speaking of, No. 6.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** No. I did not meet with the.., with Councilwoman Botel regarding this Item. We don't have an Agenda review date or set up for..., to review Items on the Agenda. However, when Councilwoman Botel was first elected, we, as a team, all department heads met with Councilwoman Botel and, you know, discussed projects and the budget and their operations. And, you know, that's, that's about it.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Well, I guess my question or comment, point of clarification, Dr. Botel, have you had an opportunity to.., do you, do you.., are you comfortable with this?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** I am, thank you.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank I am too. Thank you.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilman Davis, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Thank you so much. Just for point of clarification, as the [inaudible] representative, I did sit through three public meetings.., Mr. Sherman, to hear the resident's concerns and working with Staff at the time to make sure that all issues were addressed and this project did follow through and sup'... And I sit through all the District meetings as a large, as a supportive person, so when I get here, I know exactly what's going on and the residents know I am concerned about the issue.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, sir. Are there any other comments, any other questions for Mr. Sherman? [Pause]. Madam Clerk?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes, ma'am. Yes, ma'am.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson

Hubbard?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Botel?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Davis Johnson?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Unanimous vote.



**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Let it be...

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** I...

### **COMMUNITY BENEFITS REQUESTS ON CONSENT**

**7. OPERATION HOPE, INC. - \$500 - COUNCILWOMAN JULIA BOTEL - FOR 2018 SUMMER CAMP.**

**8. OPERATION RESTORE - \$1,000 - COUNCILWOMAN JULIA BOTEL - FOR BACK TO SCHOOL CITYWIDE TALENT SHOW.**

**9. CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH PARKS AND RECREATION DEPARTMENT- \$500 - COUNCILWOMAN JULIA BOTEL FOR LINDSEY DAVIS COMMUNITY CENTER GARDEN CLUB.**

**10. O.J. ANDERSON SCHOLARSHIP FOUNDATION - \$1,000 COUNCILWOMAN JULIA BOTEL - FOR COLLEGE SCHOLARSHIPS FOR HIGH SCHOOL STUDENTS.**

**11. THE PINK QUEEN FOUNDATION - \$500 - CHAIRWOMAN TONYA DAVIS JOHNSON - FOR SUPPORT TO CANCER SURVIVORS.**

**12. O. J. ANDERSON SCHOLARSHIP FOUNDATION - \$750 CHAIRWOMAN TONYA DAVIS JOHNSON - FOR SCHOLARSHIPS TO HIGH SCHOOL STUDENTS THROUGHOUT PALM BEACH COUNTY.**

**13. MARY MCLEOD BETHUNE ELEMENTARY SCHOOL \$600 - CHAIRWOMAN TONYA DAVIS JOHNSON - TO DEFRAY THE COST OF THE VOLUNTEERS APPRECIATION PROGRAM ON MAY 14, 2018.**

**14. YOUTH RECREATION ASSOCIATION AND MOTHERS AGAINST MURDERERS ASSOCIATION - \$250 CHAIRWOMAN TONYA DAVIS JOHNSON - TO SUPPORT THE MEMORIAL DAY BASH ON MAY 26, 2018.**

### **END OF CONSENT AGENDA**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** That is the end of the Consent Agenda.

### **PETITIONS AND COMMUNICATIONS FOR FILING**

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** There are no petitions and communications for filing at this time, Madam Chair.

### **AWARDS AND PRESENTATIONS**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Awards and presentations.

**15. ITEM NO. 15**

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY: PRESENTATION – “RIVIERA BEACH CLEAN – RIVIERA BEACH BEAUTIFUL”**

**CHAIR PRO TEM LYNNE L. HUBBARD - (561) 845-3686**

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** It's 15.

[Pause]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Chair Pro Tem.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Good evening. Madam Chair, Mayor and Council.

I believe that we as policymakers have the political will to promote cleanliness and basic beautifications of the entire City and the communities that it is made up of, it will go a long way to create sustainable communities as far as economic development. Here are four components that we can use to start a Citywide Riviera Beach Clean – Riviera Beach Beautiful initiative. The Great American Cleanup type projects, the landscaping of City entry signs, basic mandates for our corner stores, creating a special corner store overlay. Lastly, but definitely not least, the eradication of trash piles throughout the entire City.

Recently, we had a few Great American Cleanup events takes place in the City, one in the Monroe Heights area and the other in the Riviera Beach Heights area. Several more are being planned throughout the City, and we are asking everyone to take part in the campaign to keep Riviera Beach Clean and Riviera Beach Beautiful.

The City entrance signs. The second way is to landscape the entryway signs to the City and to the neighborhoods, making them beautiful focal points. You'll see how the sign is supposed to look, and should look, based on the renderings from the landscape architect. The entryway sign, at the City's entrance on Australian and 1<sup>st</sup> Street was financed by Florida Power & Light. Florida Power & Light has monies to maintain their properties, wherever their properties might be. We have one on 1<sup>st</sup> & Australian, we have one on 1<sup>st</sup> & Dixie, and Florida Power & Light has money for that to be maintained. Well, they came out and they brought their architects, they brought their engineers and ultimately, designed the Intel project and paid for it and turned it over to the City of Riviera Beach.

This is that... Excuse me. Go back one, one more. Go back to... Excuse me. [Inaudible]. Just wanted to say another thing about the entryway sign, when we commissioned the projects of having entryway signs done in the City of Riviera Beach, landscape and irrigation was a part of the major entry sign. The contractor, however, didn't include the landscaping and irrigation project in what they did. However, they did not charge us for that either. So now, in order to finish the project, so that it looks like a project that we deserve in the City, we will have to issue an RFP for the landscaping and the irrigation to be done. This is what the.., this is what we anticipated would happen in the City and this is how it is now, but we want to bring the entryways to Riviera Beach up

to landscape and aesthetically pleasing focal points, and it should be all over the entire City.

Now, the third component is the strength in our Land Development Regulations, create an Ordinance to address the corner stores, the convenient stores if you will. It hasn't been that no one wanted to enforce the corner stores, force them to do better, it's just the way we always seem to find ourselves bound by existing laws. Until we find loopholes that we can use to change them in our favor. At this point, we do have certain regulations on the books that we have found ta'.., and in talking with Mr. Gagnon, such as there's a limited amount of posters that they're supposed to have in the windows. The securing of their garbage cans and maintain, and maintaining the enclo'.., enclosures. I feel that if we are allowing extended hours, we have to assume that they're making money and they can put some of those funds back into their building. This, this is a sketch that shows simple things that they can do when they start to invest into their buildings, things that don't cost very much. As, as you see, the, the painting in the front can be done better, the paving of the, of the parking lots. These stores are anchors into the community and they need to be treated as such, and they.., we need to.., what laws that we have, what Ordinance we can put in place, we need to do that so that they can know, and they can see that we're taking the community serious'.., seriously. That's just another view of the, of the same building. This is another prominently placed corner store in the City. Due to development services, the City, the City.., as I said, the City does have existing regul'.., regulations on the books, that can serve as a kickstart to this initiative. And again, one of them would be the 25% coverage of the, of the frontage. This, this is, this is a wider view of that, of that same property.

Now, as for the interior to these stores and to these corner stores, it takes a collaborative effort where we have to have the Public Health Department, we will have to have our public safety, of course, and our Code Enforcement to go in to, to change the things that are going on inside of, of the corner stores. What we can do, that's what we should do. Start with them and [stammer] to, to make them invest in their properties or, or discuss the length of time that, that they're open. And again I say, for someone to be open as long as they are, they're making money, they're not there for nothing and we should require that we go forth and, and... Among ourselves, we have to create that political will. Do we want to do this, and this is what it will take in order for us to move forward.

Trash piles. The plan would be to fill in every trash pile and replace it with a landscaped site. Placing at each site two signs, one sign that would be an Ordinance stating the fact that illegal dumping is not allowed. Also, we would then insert another sign that would say no trash piles, Riviera Beach Clean – Riviera Beach Beautiful for you, by you. We wanna tell the community that we need their buy-in and this is for them and it will have to be by them in order for us to maintain it. The.., we will solicit cameras in certain areas to track down the illegal dumpers. We.., if we're able to establish a fund, I would like to use other rewa'.., I would like to offer rewards for information connected to the identification of these illegal dumpers in the, in the City of, of Riviera Beach. One thing that we also will do is a massive educational campaign. We will hang door hangers or church fans, but we would definitely insert in everybody's water bill a flyer about what

we're trying to do. We are committed to picking up all bulk trash in the City of Riviera Beach. If you put it on your sidewalk, on your day, in front of your house, as long as you don't put it on the swale because the big machines dig holes when we put it out there on the swales. If you put it on the sidewalk, we're gonna take all of that away. And what I'm hoping for is that, one day when someone comes out to dump, they'll say, 'Hey, what happened to the trash pile?' And they'll remember the campaign that we launched to say no more trash piles in the City of Riviera Beach. Riviera Beach can be clean, and Riviera Beach can be beautiful, and with all of us working together and creating a political will among ourselves here, we can definitely start to do something to that end.

Thank you.

[Applause]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Any comments or questions from the Council?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilman Davis, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I would just like to say, Councilperson..., Vice Chair Hubbard, job well done on the initiative. These are the things that brings uniqueness to each individual Councilperson that we bring to our various districts, and to this Board. I couldn't've thought of a better idea of making sure that our community understands the great asset we have and how we can even improve our property values, our quality of life, our self-image, and, and creating a plan of this magnitude..., and a lot of these stores that, that you presented on the board today, I grew up seeing a lot of these stores look the same way since I was a little boy and to come up with that type of concept, you know, I look forward to whatever steps we need to take first, reaching out to all the property owners and working with those in the community to see such a great plan come to fruition.

I had no idea that this presentation was gonna be of this magnitude. I'll say a job well done.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

[Applause]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Any further comments?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yes. Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Miller-Anderson, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I definitely appreciate the program initiative being brought forth, I just had a question about the renderings that were done. I know I stepped out for a second, I didn't know if the renderings, were they prepared by City Staff or did we go out to, to have someone design them? Or how was that done?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** City Staff helped me to do them with Photoshop because they're not just, they're not the actual renderings exactly for that particular building or, as you can see., like, on the second one, it was a little longer than the actual, but it shows you in detail, it has the same heights, the same size so it can give you a, a visual. So, they were able to., not as techy as I would like to be, but I wanted to, you know, a clear idea as to what I, what I was doing. So., and my legislative aide, she's a little bit better than me, so...

[Chuckle]

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...we all kinda pitched in and made it happen.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. So, we didn't have to procure any services for the renderings? It was just mainly done by inhouse Staff?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yeah. That was done inhouse. No, we didn't pay anybody outside to, to do those renderings.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Thanks.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Botel, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** I just wanna add my kudos. You know, as an old New Yorker I'll say, Rudy Giuliani once said that when you clean up the guys., when you clean up the little crime, sometimes the big crime takes care of itself. And I think a lot can be said about trying to do things to make the place look better and, and, and hopefully that spills over to other things too. So, I, I applaud the idea that we can make Riviera Beach look cleaner and, and I hope that'll spill over to other areas.

Thank you. I appreciate it.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Thank you.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Mayor, you're recognized.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I certainly don't believe too much what Rudy says about anything, Dr. Botel, but that's another...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** [Chuckle].

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...another discussion. Especially these days. Maybe he is saying what the truth is. I don't know, but anyway.

My, my question is, is this going to.., is this gonna be kind of Citywide? Are we going towards a, a City.., this is gonna be Citywide or is it...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Definitely a Citywide project. That's why I wanted to make sure that I put it in there that it was a Citywide... Riviera Beach is too small to just clean up one spot and not clean up the whole spot.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** So, thank you for the vision. And, of course, we all want the same thing, Citywide. All of our districts.., the City belongs to the people, all of us, so I.., is there going to be some type of plan or recommendation that, that the City Manager will bring forth in order to implement these beautiful changes? Is this...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Abso'...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...going..

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Absolutely.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** In due time?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** And that will...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** So, this was just to introduce us to the concept?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Introduce you to the concept, to create the political will to do it because I would hate to have Mr. Gagnon and his Staff and Mr. Bailey and the City Manager in.., get started on something of this magnitude and there's no political will from the dais to, to do it.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I wasn't suggesting, suggesting that.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** No, no.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you. Are there any further comments?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Botel, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** I'm just wondering if it were the folks from the National Gun Violence Awareness group that might have just left.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I'm not sure but I'm getting ready to go into public comments.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you. Madam Clerk, let me read the statement. It is now 7:41.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** PUBLIC COMMENT SHALL BE RESTRICTED TO ISSUES, MATTERS OR TOPICS PERTINENT TO THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH. PLEASE BE REMINDED THAT THE CITY COUNCIL HAS ADOPTED RULES OF DECORUM GOVERNING PUBLIC CONDUCT DURING OFFICIAL MEETINGS, WHICH HAS BEEN POSTED AT THE ENTRANCE OF THE COUNCIL CHAMBERS. IN AN EFFORT TO PRESERVE ORDER, IF ANY OF THE RULES ARE NOT ADHERED TO, THE CHAIRPERSON MAY HAVE AN DISRUPTIVE SPEAKER OR ATTENDEE REMOVED FROM THE PODIUM, FROM THE MEETING AND/OR THE BUILDING, IF NECESSARY. PLEASE GOVERN YOURSELVES ACCORDINGLY.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Clerk.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, the acceptance of public comment cards for this particular section of the Agenda is now closed. Tiffany Williams, Evelyn Clark, Andre Henderson.

**MS. T. WILLIAMS:** Tiffany Williams, Fire Department, general employee. Mayor, Council, good evening.

Approximately nine years ago, we experienced the Great Recession. And contingent to the Great Recession, we, the employees, were put on furlough days Fiscal Years 2009, 2010, 2010 through 2012, 2013. The same time, we lost our cost of living adjustment' and our annual increases. Based on the City Ordinance adopted in 1965, we continued to receive our longevity. This is something that you guys wanna take aware from the employees. Fiscal Year 2013, 2014, furlough days ended. That same year...

**UNK. AUDIENCE:** [Inaudible].

**MS. T. WILLIAMS:** ...former City Manager Ms. Jones received a 5% raise while the employees were disregarded and overlooked. The same year, she received 3%. In 2014, SEIU bargaining unit negotiated our unit 12% raise for three years. Fiscal Year 2014-2015, we received 6%, in Fiscal Years 2015-2016 and 2016-2017, we received 3%. In 2015, the Council voted on a \$1,000 month stipend to sit in a meeting for thirty minutes. That's \$72,000 a year, excluding benefits. In March 2017, Councilman Davis requested his stipend in retro pay to almost \$18,000. While some of my colleagues work in ninety degree weather, digging holes, putting their lives in jeopardy, and some of us sit at desks for long period of times, which may lead to future health problems. It seems that everyone get' what they are entitled to, except for the employees.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** What a shame.

**MS. T. WILLIAMS:** The current nego'.., this current negotiation process has been manipulative from the beginning. The City stated, per SEIU and the employees agreed to a contract,, SEIU blames the City. April 30<sup>th</sup>, SEIU was aware when we voted, that the corrections were not made in the contract and allowed the employees to vote on manip'.., on a manipulated contract. And, on May 11, 2018, at a town hall meeting, Mr. Carlos from SEIU failed to answer our questions. And Mr. Sherman, based on your memo dated May 3, 2018, the first paragraph, the last sentence, I would like to know which negotiating unit agreed to those terms. And also, as you related to raise disparities, since 2013 it has been the goal of City Managers and Council Members to raise City employee wa'.., wage levels to market rate. City employees have a very long time and paid less than our counter'.., counterparts in surrounding communities. And here we are, five years later, still being disregarded, mistreated, overlooked, and some of these employees are being intimidated by these department heads.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** They can prove it?

**MS. T. WILLIAMS:** I ask you to vote yes to approve and disburse the funds that has been allocated for the job analysis questionnaire classification because that money is owed to us.

Thank you.

[Applause]

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Evelyn Clark, Andre Henderson, Doshia Newbold.

**MS. E. CLARK:** Evelyn Clark, 133 West 11<sup>th</sup> Street, Riviera Beach.

Councilman Hubbard, good job. I really appreciate you taking my concerns to heart and I'd like to also thank the other Council Members who have reached out to me, Councilwoman Botel, Council Mem'.., Council Member Davis, or course Ms. Hubbard and Ms. Davis for reaching out to me and addressing these concerns.

I'm gonna speak in aggregate. Make decorum great again. In the last three years, I have seen the City of Riviera Beach Mayor's office, Council dais, municipal Staff and some outspoken residents fail miserably at exercising the First Amendment right to freedom of speech. These same people conspire to demean, debase, degrade, derogagate, and dehumanize another human being based upon slanderous gossip, insufficient proof, documentation, public conviction and so-called bias political investigation. The intent is to harm, destroy and ruin, often times, for personal agenda and without truth. The right to free speech or debate comes with the right to exercise responsible civil free speech or debate. An individual should consider the consequences and motives ensuring he and/or they continue to enjoy that right, right here in Riviera Beach. You can listen to them tonight continue to divide this City, exacerbate conflict amongst residents in the City, divert us from our City government.., governance responsibilities, lead the City with a depleted culture. Being responsible is hard, hard



work. Each of our discourse should be exemplified by speaking and acting in ways that, for the greater good, enhance human dignity.

Overall, as a resident, I have reached out to the Police Department, past, present Councilpersons, Riviera Beach Staff and the Interim City Manager Karen Hoskins to solve issues which impact me quality of life. To Code Enforcement, Police Department, Customer Service, Public Works and Ms. Karen Hoskins, her stellar service, integrity and character of honesty, I applaud these teams for placing the concerns of Rev'.., of Riviera Beach residents first, the image of Riviera Beach first, devoid of political bias and propaganda. These municipal civil servants are marginalized, ostracized, and criticized by their own elected Mayor, Council representative and department managers. The same people that elude less than best in class officiating in their duties. It is easy, it is cowardly to malign a person's integrity, character, branding and judgment and demand their firing, demotion, expulsion just to get what you want, or your inability to negotiate what you want.

I ask each of you, here in the audience, on the dais, I ask each of you to look in the mirror at yourself and ask, 'Who in their right mind would come work and live in Riviera Beach after witnessing the display of my personal behavior?'

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Ms. Clark?

**MS. E. CLARK:** Riviera Beach politics...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Ms. Clark?

**MS. E. CLARK:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I need you to wrap it up.

**MS. E. CLARK:** I am.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Your three minutes...

**MS. E. CLARK:** Last sentence. Riviera Beach politics rots and smells from the head down, and this politics here has been too smelly for me way too long.

[Applause]

**UNK. AUDIENCE:** [Inaudible] Ms. Clark.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Andre Henderson, Doshia Newbold, Lloyd Brown.

**MR. A. HENDERSON:** Hello Council. My name is Andre Henderson, Sr. I'm a retired military veteran.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Good evening.

**MR. A. HENDERSON:** I've been to Guam, Korea, China, Japan, Panama, most of the forts in the United States.

[Inaudible audience comment]

**UNK. AUDIENCE:** [Inaudible] can't hear.

**MR. A. HENDERSON:** My name is Andre L. Henderson, I'm a retired military veteran. I've been to Guam, Panama, Korea, China, Japan and most of the forts in the United States. I moved here in 1999. I wanted to move into the City and I was content at the time. But, as far as I, I see, all four of my children went to the school here. I'm disappointed on how the City Council has become [pause] fractured, and as a veteran, I don't see..., I see no veteran's plans, no policies, no summer programs, no moral integrity in the City when Councilpersons are conducting City business. And most importantly, the operational unity, so I decided to get involved and that's what I'm here for. I've been..., I mention those places because I've been to 'em, I've been trained by the U.S., U.S. Army and I feel I, I can give some kind of operational unity here in the City, and I think most of the people here can also.

Ms. Botel, I voted for you, but in reference how you spoke to Mrs. Hoskins, I, I just tell you to be careful 'cause you came on the agenda that you were gonna fix on how a person was treating how we was wronged and tonight I, I feel you were wrong on how you spoke to her. And, like President, uh, President Obama says, 'Yes, we can,' you have to, you have to apologize to her publicly. I'm demanding it as a City constituent. I voted for you.

[Audience applause]

**MR. A. HENDERSON:** You were wrong on how you talked to her. And, so, I'm disappointed in the behavior but I'm not gonna complain too much, I'm gonna get involved and I, I tell all my people here in the City, not my people, but my, my family, get involved. If you don't like what they're doing, vote 'em out.

Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

[Applause]

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Doshia Newbold, Lloyd Brown, Margaret Sheppard.

**MS. D. NEWBOLD:** Good afternoon.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Good afternoon, Ms. Newbold.

**MS. D. NEWBOLD:** Doshia Newbold.

Wow. I came up here, first of all, to talk about the train tracks and the train. We can't contact the FEC, the train doesn't stop anywhere except Riviera Beach, and not only does it sit right here at Blue Heron, it sits at 13<sup>th</sup> Street. If there was someone in need of going to the hospital, the ambulance can't cross over. And when I was a

dispatcher, you can contact the FEC and let them know, you gave them 8<sup>th</sup> Street, do their long-term stopping at the intersection of 8<sup>th</sup> Street, or 710, whatever.

Another problem I'm having is vehicles parking in the residential area on a two lane road. I called the Police Department. They're using a road as a driveway, so you have to do a obstacle to get around vehicles that are parked there permanently. So, we need to either get 'em citations, just warn 'em first, or they should get citations.

The next thing, I wanna thank Mr. Blankenship and I sent all of you a email about the Lady Chargers, so I expect to see ya'll at the game. I'll be back for money from Tennessee.

I really like and appreciate what you all are doing over in my area, by [inaudible] 6<sup>th</sup> Street, with the sidewalks, Ms. Davis, but now they need to fix the sod.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** [Chuckle].

**MS. D. NEWBOLD:** And I'm waitin' on that.

Last but not least, I'm appalled by Ms. Botel. I didn't vote for you and I am so happy tonight.

[Audience exclamation]

**MS. D. NEWBOLD:** The way you talked to this young lady was despicable. You can't do that, not sitting there. I don't even know if I would accept your apology. You were wrong. You need to do your research and find out the person that's edging you on, they left in handcuffs from another job. Okay? She was doing their job, and the way this happened, I'm coming back to address it. I know we got one snake in the City, I didn't know it was two. I'm very disappointed in you, and I give everybody a chance. KaShamba can tell you, I ran against her with another party, but she proved to be okay with me. We have enough chaos, we don't need that. That was so unprofessional, that was straight rude. Who are you to make a determination on where she should go? You're wrong.

I'll be back for 20 and 26.

[Audience clapping]

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Lloyd Brown, Margaret Sheppard, Bonnie Larson.

**MR. L. BROWN:** How ya doin'? I don't know if the lady was talking about me, I was one of the first one that came up here, but you know, I'm a veteran too, and you know from the American Revolution all the way up, the Vietnam War and all these things, the First Amendment right was something that these people died for. I mean, if the shoe fits, you know, then you wear it. And I mean, sometimes an individual have to say things, you know, you can't just always sugarcoat it. You're gonna have to tell the person how it is because, for one thing, if you don't, it's gonna bother you inside and eventually you're gonna explode. 'Cause there's a lotta people out there that don't like the City and there's

probably a lotta people who love the City, but what I'm tryna say, the First Amendment rights, I mean, you, you can't tell a person exactly what to say. It's not a sugarcoated thing. I mean, so you'll go up to Trump and you'll say, 'Oh, Mr. Trump, you're gonna send the Mexicans back to Mexico? That's okay.' But, I'm alright with that, you know, but it's not right. No, you tell him how you feel. And I mean, I, I can't understand it being a veteran because I know a lotta friends who have friends that died in Vietnam. And, I mean, even in the American Revolution, these people fought for these rights. That's in the Constitution. Black people never had all these rights and, I mean, we never had 'em. You couldn't go places at times, you couldn't even show your face, they had sundown laws where you had to be out of a place, so don't try to take these First Amendment rights when anybody talkin' about that you're gonna have to come up here and kiss some behind or whatever because, you know, the last time I think I was close to doing that, was in 1954. And that's when I was born, and I never got back to kissing anything like that again. So, I'mma tell you, you got the right, that's because people died in America for the First Amendment right. It ain't nothin' like..., I mean, you don't have to come up here and say, 'Well, you are such a great person,' but I've seen this, when she was talking and, and she was talking good about ya'll, that thing was flashing red up there. Now, as soon as it turned red with me, you're gonna be saying something..., see, so you don't do things right, so don't expect the people here to do things right. And like I said, the First Amendment right, there's a lotta people died for that. And, I mean, you can't go to tryna justify, 'cause they burned flags when I was coming up about the Vietnam War. They burned flags in the Korean War. There was people going around marching. You know, so if you took those rights, they were saying the President wasn't this, the President wasn't that, so if you're gonna take those First Amendment rights, then you might as well just go ahead on and bring back the Jim Crow Law and all that kinda stuff, ya know? Let us go in the back of the building. You wanna take it all the way back?

I mean, when we didn't have to..., we wanted to not to pay taxes in Boston because the British, we threw stuff in the water, we didn't pay taxes because they wasn't representing us. You all are not representing us, so when we come up here our First Amendment right is to say what we wanna say. I don't know what this lady' talking about, but she probably talking about me, but I know we put our clothes on the same way so I really don't care.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Margaret Sheppard, Bonnie Larson, Tommy Walker.

**MS. M. SHEPHERD:** Margaret Sheppard, Riviera Beach.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Good, good evening.

**MS. M. SHEPHERD:** I did find the cards say' do you wanna change? If you don't vote, you can't complain.

But let me say, I am very grateful for you guys coming to the Willie "Bo" Garden Extravaganza, from the bottom of my heart. It was such a great success, and I, I just..., I'm overwhelmed that people that love the Davis Family, just expressed their concerns how this City came together. We are resilient and no matter what people say or try to put

us down, that particular day, we proved on thing, we can make it. And we made it work. And I'm so glad that Gwen and Mr. Willie "Bo" and Ms. Panier and all of them allowed them to say what they had to say. I didn't want nobody to interfere, I wanted to hear everything that they had to say about their father. Because when you're dead and in the ground, it's too late to start talking about these accolades. So, I'm saying all this, thank you for your contributions. I'm coming back with the CRA to talk about the contributions from BB&T, and to everybody that gave. We're still open for contributions, we're a 501(c)(3), you can send your checks to the City Finance, just put in there the meditation garden. On June 2<sup>nd</sup>, we will have the big extrav'.., the big extravaganza where we will be cutting the ribbon. So, we're putting that on the Agenda. I can't remember what time but we will be getting back with you.

There's one thing I wanna say, Ms. Miller-Anderson, your little aide, I can't think of her name, I asked her to come to the event. I wanted to her to be a voice of hospital'.., she's such a fine young lady. I wanted her to speak. If nobody else.., well, we were running fifteen minutes late, but I wanna make sure on June 2<sup>nd</sup>, she come back and address the City. Say something about Willie "Bo", so you all kinda get something together. Help her critique...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** You said June 2<sup>nd</sup>?

**MS. M. SHEPHERD:** June s'.., yes, June 2<sup>nd</sup>.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** She was there that day because I was unable to come 'cause I was at work, so June 2<sup>nd</sup>, I'll be there if that's a day...

**MS. M. SHEPHERD:** I wanna hear from her.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And we'll...

**MS. M. SHEPHERD:** Let me hear from her. I know you, you have taught that young, young lady well and I just want the public... I talk about her so much. I want to hear what that young lady has to say, if it's okay with you.. We'll talk, we'll talk.

[Chuckle]

**MS. M. SHEPHERD:** That's my representative so we will talk. So, I thank all of you for what you have done, your donation. Thank you, Dr. Botel, coming in late, but you did give your contribution, as well as Ms. Dawn Pardo, Mrs... , well, my representative, i know she was gonna give, but thank you and I hope you all come over as the meditation garden is being worked on every single day. And some surprises. And by the time you get there on June 2<sup>nd</sup>, you can say, what a job well done.

Thank you very much. [Pause]. Can I say one more thing? I'm going over to this podium, I'm kinda tired of this. When I go there, please leave me alone, this is a little bit too much.

Thank you.

[Inaudible audience comments]

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Bonnie Larson...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Can I just...

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** ...Tommy Walker, Marvelous Washington.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair, could I just say something really quick.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Ms. Larson.

**MS. B. LARSON:** Bonnie Larson. I agree. Let me just tell you something. You said it was more.., I asked why you have that podium over there only for this meeting and I was told it's more convenient. Who is it more convenient for? When you're, when you're sitting in the audience you can't see all the Board Members because of that podium. When you're standing there, you, you have back to these people. That's not polite to do that. Over here is much better. So please let me speak from over here and everybody else.

[Inaudible comment]

**MS. B. LARSON:** Ms...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** [Chuckle].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Ms. Larson.

**MS. B. LARSON:** Lynne... Yes?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Ms. Larson? We have rules of decorum and...

**MS. B. LARSON:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...and the Board has asked the, the members of the public to speak there and I would prefer...

**MS. B. LARSON:** Was that voted on or was that... I never heard anything about that. I was here for the decorum meeting.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Ms., Ms...

**MS. B. LARSON:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It wasn't voted on during that...

**MS. B. LARSON:** Yeah?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I'm saying to you that there are rules of decorum and we have...

**MS. B. LARSON:** Your running my time.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...asked the public... You can stop the, the, the...

**MS. B. LARSON:** Stop.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** The, the timer.

[Chuckles]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Ms. Larson, if you would please...

**MS. B. LARSON:** Alright. I will...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** We have asked...

**MS. B. LARSON:** It's very rude...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you kindly.

**MS. B. LARSON:** ...to be over there and we can't see the Council from over there. So.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you for your comments.

**MS. B. LARSON:** It's not convenient for us so I'm asking that we be able to speak where everybody else speaks.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, Ms. Larson.

**MS. B. LARSON:** But, it's very obvious we don't always listen to the public, we rarely listen to the public, we rarely listen to the public.

Ms. Hubbard, you brought up some good points about the trash. Near me, there's a street and every time somebody moves out on that street, all their furniture goes right on the lot across, but the problem is, you gotta think about this, who's gonna report that? They're there three minutes, boom [snaps fingers], they're gone, they got a truck, they dump it out and they're gone. So who's gonna do that? We have, like, a lotta City Staff who circle around, maybe they can catch 'em. But, you know, we can't leave that up to the public to do that. You said don't put your trash in the swale because the Waste Management digs holes. Well, where should we be putting the trash? You want us to put it in our yards? Then our yards are gonna get dug up. It all depends on the, on the Waste Management driver because some of 'em pick it up gently and shake it out, some

don't. So, we don't want holes in our yard 'cause then we're gonna hear from you again. So, that.., just some things to think about.

Some other things that came up tonight. Oh yes, I have a lotta questions tonight. We were talking about Silver Beach, doing something with Silver Beach. It was my understand Silver Beach was owned half by Lake Park and half by Riviera Beach. So, how is that gonna work that we're doing away with part of Silver Beach? I mean, if you could explain that. I didn't understand that.

If you could have tonight, Mr. Degraffenreidt explain the difference between tabling an Item and postponing an Item. Very important difference, and I'll bring this up later but if you can him do that. Rules of decorum, Ms. KaShamba Miller-Anderson, you've been trying to bring that for months and months and months. Finally, it happened last week. Two Members.., well, one Member was not here at all, one Member left half an hour into the decorum portion of it. So, that's really poor. This is was on a regularly scheduled, Wednesday night meeting night, so why one person couldn't attend, after months and moths of discussing this, and one person had to leave half hour before. That person has now left again. Alright.

So, when are we going to tear down the Public Works facility building? That was condemned when Mr. Jonathan Evans was here, he declared it should be torn down, it's still standing there. Luckily, he was able to get those employees out of there right of way. First thing he did so our employees don't get sick. When is that building coming down? It's been declared obsolete, it's been declared contaminated, we need to get rid of it.

Let's see here. Alright. I spent quite a bit of time today with Claudene and I'm, I'm very shocked because when I ask for documents, I want them signed, sealed, delivered. Don't give me a draft where nothing is signed and that's what I'm getting lately. So now, I have to come back again and I said, 'Please, when you give me something, have it signed.' I said I think I've even written you a letter saying I want everything that I want has to be signed. I don't want a draft by somebody else, and I was told, no, you have to put it on every single time you come. I spend more time trying to get information. I waste my time, I waste her time. I want the original signed.

Thank you.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Tommy Walker, Marvelous Washington, Erica Davis.

**MR. T. WALKER:** Good evening, Council. Tommy Walker, 1582 West 9<sup>th</sup> Street, candidate for District 3.

I tried to get a card in on Item 5. I'm, I'm, I'm concerned about that. And that's why I came up here to talk. \$228,000. This coulda came a long, long time ago. Thank you for your vote, KaShamba. It seems like we keep kicking this can down the road. This.., that building has been there, we've had several discussions about that building and we have never made a decision about it. I understand we need we need a EOC, but is it really that building? He just said Public Works is still up. I'm, I'm trynna figure out is this some kind of backdoor to use this as an EOC? 'Cause we voted to do other things



with this. We voted a long time ago to sell the building, and it's still up. We, we keep gettin' further and further... It's like my cellphone when I'm going down 60, if I get off 95, the, the more west I go, I lose signal. Someth'.., we gotta get back. The Council is losing touch. A good friend of mine said, 'Planning without implementation is hallucination.' We need to make a decision what we're gonna do with that building. Stop kickin' that can on down the road.

I'm done with that subject. The last thing, all of this stuff on the Agenda, we could've throw'd it away. The general has not a contract. We talked.., I talked several months.., talked with the, with the union rep. Correspondence been coming back and forth to the Council. I haven't had a chance to call you yet, but what we're doing in here now, don't mean nothing until the general will get a [inaudible]. Everybody's got paid off the cass'.., classification study, the Fire Department's gotten paid, the pol'.., the police has gotten paid, everybody else has gotten paid but the general. I think we need to come back. We're going the wrong way, come back, don't put nothin' on the Agenda until you let us know what's going on with the general contract. Please. If I can help, I'll, I'll do that. But we need to get them a contract. They don't even know the timeframe when the contract is coming back. What? It's gonna be October 1<sup>st</sup> soon, and that's when they were supposed to get their rise. Don't, don't let that happen. Please, don't let that happen.

Thank you.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Marvelous Washington, Erica Davis, Billie Brooks.

**MS. M. WASHINGTON:** Good evening. Marvelous Washington, candidate again for District 3.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Good evening.

**MS. M. WASHINGTON:** [Inaudible] as I sit and watch this meeting, what I notice a common denominator tonight was, anytime there was a conversation amongst Councilmen, there was a always a negative response. I've always been taught that when you respond to a situation negatively, whether you say it verbally or you.., by behavior, you're hiding something. You're hiding something. And that's what.., that has been the trend of the Council. I voted for everybody that's up there. I did, and I thought when I voted for some people, we were gonna get some changes. And I'm sure everybody that came up here has said the same thing I said, but my problem of it is, is that everybody's accusing you of doing this, accusing you of doing that. Stop combatting those accusations with negativity, because it looks like you're guilty of doing something. And as a professional, and as a representative of the City of West Palm Beach residents, and the City as a whole, we should know better.

City Manager, unfortunately, you've been caught up in the crossfire. Everybody understand' how longevity pay works. Everybody understand how that work. But we don't understand how that other part of it work'. How do we give raises to upper management, and our groundskeeper, our Public Utilities worker, our part-time workers...

[Audience applause]

**MS. M. WASHINGTON:** ...haven't received a raise in I don't know how long. The cost of living goes up every year.

[Clapping]

**UNK. AUDIENCE:** [Inaudible].

**MS. M. WASHINGTON:** One thing about the City of West Palm Beach, the City of Boynton Beach, Delray, they get a [stammer], across the board raise yearly. Since the economy has improved, we're paying higher taxes on our homes. There's proof in the pudding. It's showing that the City is receiving finances, that those finances should be given back to those employees that is working in the field.

**UNK. AUDIENCE:** That's right.

**MS. M. WASHINGTON:** Not the ones that are sittin' up in the office...

[Inaudible audience comment]

**MS. M. WASHINGTON:** ...giving instructions.

[Inaudible audience comment and clapping]

**MS. M. WASHINGTON:** And definitely not to City employees, City employees with family members that work within the City. Something got to give.

Mayor Masters, you got to use some of your powers.

[Audience exclamation]

] **MS. M. WASHINGTON:** You gotta use some of your powers that the City Charter has given you to do.

**UNK. AUDIENCE:** Amen.

**MS. M. WASHINGTON:** Enough is enough. Anytime you say something about the City of Riviera Beach, when I even said something to some of my, some of my associates that I was running for office, the first thing they said, 'You're gonna get in that mess?' I was raised in the City of Riviera Beach. My dad was born here. He represented the City of [stammer] Riviera Beach 'til the day he died, he refused to leave the City of Riviera Beach. And that's how he put.., that's what he instilled in me. So, that's why I'm here tonight because I need you guys to understand that you are representing the City of Riviera Beach and the citizens. And we gotta walk around with that representation. Stop responding to stuff negatively, be a professional and look for resolutions and solutions.

Thank you.

[Audience exclamation and applause]

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Erica Davis, Billie Brooks, Tradrick McCoy.

**MS. E. DAVIS:** Erica Davis, 37<sup>th</sup> Street.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Good evening, Ms. Davis.

**MS. E. DAVIS:** I'm gonna piggyback off of what she said. First of all, you guys need to go back to your manuals and read your policies and procedures, 'cause obviously, some of you don't know how to run this City because you're doing it according to what you want. And that's what needs to change around here. You know it was wrong for giving those raises to yourself, and I like you Karen. You are a good person but you got caught up with this one and the other one.

**UNK. AUDIENCE:** Uh-oh.

**MS. E. DAVIS:** The New Jack City crew.

[Inaudible audience comments]

**MS. E. DAVIS:** And I am sick and tired of everybody coming up here defending what you know is wrong, 'cause it is wrong.

[Audience comments and clapping]

**MS. E. DAVIS:** Just like she said, these employees are the ones out there sweatin' and need their monies to take care of their families. You don't need nothin'.

[Audience clapping]

**MS. E. DAVIS:** You got a job. You're my godsister, you're my family members. I, I'm good friends with [stammer] with his cou'.., with his auntie. I don't give a cuss about none of that, it's about right and wrong. And when you're not doing your job, it's time for all of you to go. And nobody's gonna go over here and, and, and ride Julia Botel because she's [stammer] intelligent one up here, trying to call out people when they're doing wrong. Right is right and wrong is wrong and ya'll better get it in gear 'cause you know come, come March, ya ain't gonna be up there.

[Audience exclamation]

**MS. E. DAVIS:** 'Cause we're gonna vote your asses out.

[Audience exclamations and clapping and inaudible comments]

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Billie Brooks, Tradrick McCoy, Horace Towns.

[Inaudible audience comments]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Point of order, please. Point.., please, point of order. This...

[Inaudible audience comments]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Point of order, please.

**MS. B. BROOKS:** Good evening, Mayor, Councilpersons.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Good evening, Council.

**MS. B. BROOKS:** My name is Billie Brooks, 1325 West 28<sup>th</sup> Street, and also a candidate for District 1, City Council. I wanna thank you all. I, I watched the workshop on parliamentary procedure and it was really fantastic and it certainly was very helpful to those of us who have been appointed to serve on City Boards and we are in leadership positions. I thank you so much for that. There was a question by someone on.., who got into the area of rules of decorum for us, for the, for the Council. When you have persons who have asked questions of you and made comments and inquiries, when do you respond? Well, these rules were all developed at the time that I was on the City Council, and what we did, at the end of the Agenda when you have Board comments, that is when you addressed those comments, not going that volleying back and forth and trying to explain during public comments, so that the meeting can move on in an orderly fashion. So, and, and something else that was very interesting, when we were trying to determine how far can we allow people to go here at, at the mic? Because, you know, there was a gentleman who often time tested the, the Council on certain things when he would come before you and say what he wanted to say, and not always complimentary. What we had learned is that because of First Amendment rights, that we really must permit that person to say what he has to say.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**MS. B. BROOKS:** And sometimes it's out of order. And we also learned that cities, when, whenever a constituent or a person went to court with that, they prevailed. They said no matter what he says, or she says, that you must permit it under the First Amendment rights. So, we don't wanna get into a situation where we're going to court again. In lieu.., 'cause that's taxpayer's money.

So, I just wanted to make that comment and thank you so much for airing that, and please let it air for several, several times if you can because those of us who are Chairs of different positions, learned a lot from what Attorney Russell had to say about conducting a meeting.

Thank you.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Tradrick McCoy, Horace Towns, Dr. Phillip Dukes.

**MR. T. MCCOY:** Good evening, Members, Madam Manager, Mayor.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Good evening, sir.

**MR. T. MCCOY:** Tradrick McCoy, Riviera Beach.

A few items, real quickly. The Consent Agenda was entirely too long. When I came in, I thought I was gonna be able to put a Item in but I didn't realize it was under Consent. That's, that's eighteen Items that was on Consent. Two of 'em are Resolutions. One of those Resolutions regarding the Silver Beach Road abandonment should note on Consent Agenda. Furthermore, I believe your questions were right on point that this is something that should go before the Planning Zoning Board. And it almost seemed like déjà vu because I keep repeating these things and it's because ladies..., or individuals like that lady, Ms. Debra Allen came up here because the City is about to give up a portion of their property to the county to expand Silver Beach Road. Now, I certainly understand where she's coming from, but you wanna have an opportunity for members of the public to have some input. Now, while this is a county road, the City is giving up their own property and I'll read it for you, §27.36. If you mind, please take a note because this is probably four or five times this year that I've gotten up and said the same exact thing about how some of these things get circumvented through the process and you have folks that's coming up here that's being forced by eminent domain to give up their property for less than, less than the value of it, all because there's no public input. So, let's work with people. It's actually Approval of Public Improvements and Public or Private Utilities, and it goes on to say, and I'll be very brief:

The widening, narrowing, relocation, vacation or change in the use of any street or other public way or ground or the sale of any public building or real property, shall be similar to the submission to the Board.

And that Board is the Planning & Zoning Board, even so you can have individuals to come and give their perspective. The other two Items I wanted to point too, Items 17 and 18 were Ordinances. One related to the gas stations, which came through the Planning & Zoning Board, and I have a real concern that we put in countless hours on this Planning & Zoning Board, only for you guys to pass it on Consent and not even concerned about what the real impact. And these things have unintended consequences.

And the other Item, related to Item 17, if you remember, two weeks ago that Item was pulled off of the Agenda and it had to come back tonight. So clearly, there was some questions and concerns that, at least I head, and clearly we won't be able to see because that was the second reading. So, I know it's a lot of stuff, but you have to commit that when you are gonna pass an Ordinance, it shouldn't be on Consent because these are permanent. And the only thing that can undo an Ordinance is another Ordinance.

And also, No. 18 related to planning manuals. I do think Staff should have the authority to implement manuals inside the Planning & Zoning Department, but please, don't give these blanket approvals because I'm guaranteed to tell you, something's gonna come back and we're gonna be like, 'Oh yea, we voted on that in Consent and there's nothing we can do about it at this point.' So, please be mindful of those,, Members.

Thank you.,

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you, sir.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam City Manager.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** As it rela'.., Mr. McCoy, as it relates to the public hearings Ordinances on second, second and final reading, those Items have not been approved by the City Council yet, those are coming up.

**MR. T. MCCOY:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It, it's fine. We'll take care of it.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Horace Towns, Dr. Phillip Dukes, Allen Schultz.

**MR. H. TOWNS:** Good even to the Council.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Good evening, Mr. Towns.

**MR. H. TOWNS:** I wanna give disclosure that I am a candidate for Riviera Beach City Council, District 1. However, today, after reading or watching the news outlets, Channel 5, I want to give some insight. I've been optimistic and tried to work with this Council, when I first started in municipal government, I was a general employee. I made \$9 a hour. I worked my behind off, looking for overtime and most of us worked because the benefits were good, and trying to take care of families.

In the City of Riviera Beach, like most municipalities, the executive employees typically make about three times what general employees make. So, what bothered me is the trend that, while sitting in a meeting over on.., at JAYS Ministries, the union rep discussed how he felt that the City was not being faithful or proactive in contract negotiations on behalf of the general employees. But then, when you look at the news and find out that the benefits that the general employees are being denied, are some of the same benefits that executives are fighting for, longevity. And, in this situation, if the employees don't have a contract.., I'm.., I don't believe they're even in a position where they can grieve. I think I was very successful in municipal government simply by knowing that the people that I.., that work for me, they make me. These are the people that make.., when you go home in the afternoon, these are the people that are out in the rain, in the snow.., we don't have snow but these are the people work for every dime that they get, and I really feel like [stammer] a, a crime of how the employees are being treated. So, I ask that the Council make a better effort at going to bat for the City employees who make this City great.

Closing out, Ms. Hoskins, you have been a great employee for the City. I, I personally think you've done a great job. I personally, my personally feel.., I, I wish that you didn't take it in a permanent tenure and got involved in some of the mess that's goes

on in the City Council. I did understand your position, I would like it if you would have petitioned or put it to the Council, that way the Council, you could've had this on Agenda, or you even have the residents kinda fight and say hey, this is something that is fair, this is something that may have been in there. But for the other people, the other things that I read about, there's no way that we make mistakes like that. There's too many hardworking people in the City that deserve better.

[Timer]

**MR. H. TOWNS:** Take care of the people in the City. That's what makes Riviera Beach great. So please, if you don't hear anything else, it's not a campaign, it's just me being a resident and wanting to see better from you guys.

Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, Mr. Towns.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Dr. Phillip Dukes, Allen Schultz, Amon Yisrael.

**DR. PH. DUKES:** Dr. Phillip Dukes, 1217 Avenue U, Riviera Beach, Florida. Madam Chair, Council, Mayor.

On May 19<sup>th</sup>, this Saturday from 1:00 to 4:00 p.m., we will have our Change our Community Atmosphere rally at 1217 Avenue U, in the City of Riviera Beach. This rally is designed to bring people out into their communities to break fear, apathy and deal with disenfranchisement and lawlessness in our community. We have so many good things going on in this City, but from 1982 until this date, we've never had a zero tolerance from the City Council, the Mayor's office, or the Police Department in dealing with the issues on the west side where the negative image of our City that the drug retail market and thug life breeds. Now, when we talk about our youth in our City, we say that it takes a whole village to raise a, a child, but we refuse to dig up the issues that cause our children in our communities to be the way they are. And that is the drug retail market, it is the hinge. We don't have to have the drug retail market. I've submitted the vision to you to get rid of 75 to 80% of that, and it can be done. The same way you just put on that board there bout picking up trash.., well, that's something ya'll will do, I'm not knocking that, you all can do that, that's simple. But, I give you the same systematic plan to clean up our communities from the drug dealers. You know, Saturday night, this.., in this report, and you can ask the Police Department about the work we do, we had a boy put a, a Glock in the face of another boy, right there on 13<sup>th</sup> Street and fittin' to shoot him in the face. The other boy's arguing with him, calling him all kinds of names and, you know, cussing him out and the boy didn't pull the trigger. Now, if anything, if you know anything about the street, you don't pull your gun out on someone unless you shoot him, so somebody's gonna die in that.., in the next few weeks. We've got shooting after shooting in Federal Gardens. And I'm in your District, Ms. Johnson, your District. We've set precedent in your District, not only in the City of Riviera Beach, but in the State of Florida, in 2002. So, I'm asking you to support us. Collected, this is not about politics, personal politics, this is something that should have been done, that has never been done, that across the country

we don't do, and we have to do this in our City. Our City should be an example. Also, I'm asking you, personally, to support us. Personally. Not with just the funds that we get coming through the City, but you. I'm asking every Cou'.., every elected official to give \$100 and every citizen to give \$10, and we take our City back. We take our City. Now, you know these boys kill, they do murder. Everybody talking about bullies and, and violence but, you know, we're afraid to stand in our communities 'cause we know they'll try to kill you. We know that, and you know it, and that's why some of you are so afraid, 'cause you know you're gonna have backlash with this thing.

But, you know, being a Christian, I'm a serious Christian, the Bible says there's no weapon, I don't even have to finish that 'cause all ya'll know what it says. But I believe that, and I have lived this and I have been the example. So, I'm asking you and the citizens to support us. P.O. Box 10111, Riviera Beach, FL. Operation Restore, we're a 501. And come out Saturday from 1:00 to 4:00 p.m. We're gonna have free food. I wanna thank Mr. Dan Calloway and I wanna thank Coach Miller for their support. Mr. Dan Calloway supplied all the free food.

Thank you so much

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Allen Schultz, Amon Yisreal, J. B. Dixon.

**MR. A. SCHULTZ:** Good evening.

**UNK:** Good evening.

**MR. A. SCHULTZ:** Allen Schultz.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Good evening, sir.

**MR. A. SCHULTZ:** 5480 North Ocean Drive.

Golly. I think we've started to really hear a lot of feedback from the community here about, you know, the Board being just totally disjointed and really not doing the public's [stammer].., following what, what the public is telling you. I just don't feel like, like you're listening. I mean, [pause] Karen, you know, I, I, agree, I think you had a fine career here from what I've seen. But, I mean, from every angle I look at it, you.., this pay raise thing, you mishandled it terribly. I mean, it was just grossly mishandled. You have people who haven't even gotten a raise yet, and you're giving.., and agreeing to... I mean, the buck stops at your office. You know, and just like, you know, the, the Chairman and CEO of a lotta banks have been let go because of problems in the bank, the buck has to stop somewhere. So, we, you know, to throw out an example of, 'Well, you know, things happen and,' [stammer], you know, an example of software comes in. I mean, that, that's really, you know... Mrs. Hubbard, I can tell ya, this comes back to you and Terence. You let the City Manager go. Who...

[Inaudible dais comment]



**MR. A. SCHULTZ:** ...who cause the problem that we had to bring in Plan B.

[Inaudible audience comment]

**MR. A. SCHULTZ:** No. [Pause]. And there's still an open wound, in my opinion, concerning Jonathan Evans, for this misfeasance. And never providing any proof. Why hasn't the City entered into mediation with Mr. Evans? Or taken steps to explore bringing him back? Is this City really willing to spend tens of thousands of dollars to defend this action in court? And potentially pay him hundreds of thousands of dollars in settlement fees?

I mean, please, get back to work folks and, and, you know [pause]. People are laughing at us. We're a joke.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Amon Yisrael, J.B. Dixon, Madeline Irving.

**MR. A. YISRAEL:** Good evening, Council, Mayor, Chair.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Good evening, sir.

**MR. A. YISRAEL:** My name is Amon Yisrael, Riviera Beach, Florida.

I really, really am appalled at the information that's been given in terms of the general employees. I mean, I think that's really disgusting that our general employees who, from my understanding, was, was the only ones that received furloughs when the City wasn't doing as good. Now that we're in better shape, they're just being looked over. The bottom line, that's just not fair. That, that's just the bottom line.

I also would like to make everybody aware that we are in the process of reinitiating the recall. So, it is started, this Friday just past, which was the 11<sup>th</sup>. We're asking that the community get involved in helping to get those petitions and we do not wanna take thirty days to do this, we wanna do this in a much shorter period. So, when you see me around, we will be going through your.., your neighborhoods going door to door getting these signatures. We've had a very good start form the 11<sup>th</sup> 'til now, but we must complete this. If we wanna bring about the change, and it's alright, the citizens need to understand that it's alright to elect Council, and it's alright to remove Council. That's the communities rights. It's not about an argument or being disrespectful. If the community feel that our Council is just not fit to be Council, we have a right to remove them, and we're just emphasizing.., exercising that right.

Again, on the employees, I understand that everybody wanna get paid but those people.., what I'd really like to understand, those people who did get raises, why you didn't make sure that the employees, the general employees, get their raises? If you could answer that question, I think it'd be quite helpful to the community.

Thank you very much.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** J.B. Dixon, Madeline Irving.

**MS. J.B. DIXON:** At the risk of being repetitious, I would like to add that I too do not understand how we can be giving executives exorbitant raises without making sure that our unionized employees get what they have been promised for so long, and have not had, evidently, any kind of an explanation as to why their raises have been delayed so often.

I think that, again, the whole image of Riviera Beach, with these kinds of, what I can only call scandals, of raises being given without a counterbalance. Anyone usually would know that it is a conflict of interest to vote on your own raise. Always, you should say, 'I recuse myself from that.' The young lady who is the head of HR, the vendor who did the compensation study reported to HR. I've been in corporations before when we've had those kinds of studies, you recuse yourself. You don't make any raise in HR without it going somewhere else because the accusations will be there. You should at least know to cover yourself and, frankly, Ms. Hoskins, should have come to Council. If that was a legitimate raise, which she says it is, then why not bring it to the Council so that it will all be transparent? So again, when people are looking at coming to the City as businesses, moving to this City where their children will be educated, who wants to hear that kind of stuff? Where we have a Building Inspector who's been called out by the state 'cause she's not a Building Inspector but she says she's a Building Inspector? And at the end of that report, they say why on earth, essentially, did somebody hire this person, who was not certified, who is not certified and who, evidently, keeps failing the exams to become certified? So, when we have all of that out there in the atmosphere, we're not going to attract business, which means we are not going to be able to offer our citizens good paying jobs. And if they don't have those jobs, they're not going to become homeowners if they can't afford it, and they're not going to be paying taxes, we're not going to expand our tax base. So please, sometimes just use the common sense of saying, 'I should not be a part of this decision because it might look bad.' You know? It's Caesar's wife must be above... con'.., not contempt, what is the [inaudible]?

**UNK:** [Inaudible].

**MS. J.B. DIXON:** Reproach. Caesar's wife must be beyond reproach. And I would hope that all of you would try to be beyond reproach in your dealings.

Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madeline Irving. And Madam Chair, this is the final speaker during this portion of the public comments.

[Pause]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Is Ms. Irving present?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madeline Irving? [Pause]. That...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** That concludes...

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** ...concludes

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...public... Alright.

**16. ITEM NO. 16**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON: PRESENTATION OF THE CITY'S 2016-2017 AUDIT.**

**DEPT. DIRECTOR: RANDY SHERMAN (561) 845-4040**

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair, we have our independent auditors, Harvey, Covington & Thomas Here to present the Fiscal Year ending 2017 audit.

**MR. R. HARVEY:** Good day, Mayor, Chairperson, Pro Tem, Council Members, City Manager, City Attorney, City Clerk. My name is Roderick Harvey, partner with HCT. HCT is the audit firm of record for the City of Riviera Beach. We will be, tonight, reporting on the audit results for the Fiscal Year ending September 30, 2017. And if you would allow, Madam Chair, we will do our best to answer any questions from Council after our presentation. I also have with me Mr. Thomas Williams, III, our audit manager who worked directly on this engagement. And at this time, Mr. Williams will come forward and start us off with the presentation and then we will talk about some other matters. At this time, Mr. Williams.

**MR. T. WILLIAMS:** Good evening again. This is just a brief overview of some of the topics that we will discuss tonight in connection with the audit. First item of the agenda, is that the City received an unqualified opinion, which means that the Financial Statements state fairly in accordance with general accepting.., generally accepted accounting principles. Just to take a brief overview of the broad aspect of the numbers, the fund balance in the net position is basically, what do we have, what do we owe and then ne'.., that final number gets you the fund balance. What I'd like to highlight.., in this portion, I'll kinda get deep, in the next.., coming slide will deepens, get into how we got to these numbers. Overall fund balance for the governmental rose approximately \$3.8M and then as you.., and then, for the proprietary funds, and I'll show that later, the, the fund balance rose approximately \$10,000,000. For the general fund, you'll see here that rev'.., there were revenues of \$7,000,000 against expenditures of \$56,000,000, both of which rose from 2016. And you'll see there is a steady increase. Last year, there was an increase of \$3.1M. Currently, in this year, for 2017, there was a rise of \$3.8M within the general fund. And just to kind'.., and the brief overview of all the general f'.., governmental funds, look at that last number, the change in fund balance at \$2.7. In 2016, it was a negative \$4.2M, so you see that the City is growing, and the City is doing things to improve its conditions. If you take a look at the proprietary funds and go back to last year, you'll see that funds for the, for the revenues are at \$34,000,000, which is an increase of about \$3,000,000 from last year. And expenditures decreased over last year from \$25,000,000 to \$22.8. And, with everything, you'll see the net position rose for the proprietary funds \$10,000,000.

And now, some of the numbers that I did pull from last year, you can brief, broad overview of the condition of the City and it's trending upwards.

And with that, I'll turn it back over to Mr. Harvey.

**MR. R. HARVEY:** Thank you so much, Mr. Williams.

I wanna talk about the management [inaudible] comments. These are the written comments that we give as your CPA firm on things that arise from our audit testing. Please note that we test, not only the numbers, we test a controlled environment and also compliance. Are you meeting the metrics on things that you should do? And the comment that we have for the current year relates to grant reporting. I will read the criteria.

The work performed for the reporting period was not submitted to the Florida Department of Environmental Protection, which is due twenty days after the quarterly term. The quarters end, as you might imagine, March 31<sup>st</sup>, June 30<sup>th</sup>, September 30<sup>th</sup> and December 31<sup>st</sup>. What we found, three of the four quarters, the City did not complete the progress report forms and, in quarter two or the second quarter, the form was filed late. The effect, noncompliance could lead to delay in funding and potentially discontinuance of grant funding. What we recommend, we recommend that the City provides training to Staff to ensure that they are aware of all compliance requirements and possible, or the due dates for all grant programs. As you know, the City is allowed to respond and so the City responded. The City agrees with the recommendation from HCT. Staff has contacted the Department and was directed to bring..., and was directed to bring the reporting up to date. Public Works Staff has been properly trained and all reporting requirements are now in compliance. The Finance Department has been added as a copy to the filing and serves as a check against missing files.

The last thing that I want to bring to our attention, is the State of Florida, Office of the Audit General, has twenty-nine, started at nineteen, but twenty-nine basically ratio checks. And this is important because this is how you determine if any City is in a state of financial emergency. This is what they use at the state level, and so, we've listed the various indicators here, and I will summarize. For the year ended September 30, 2017, there are fifteen favorable, six unfavorable, five inconclusive and three are innate. What I wanna bring your attention to, is there are several factors that the state has said are very important, or critical factors that should be considered. They are factor or financial condition assessment to, and all of the four..., so, you have 4GF, 4G, and 4P. We have, for your viewing pleasure, added a..., or put up the charts for those indicators and I will just go back and highlight now for Council, the elect officials, appointed officials, and the citizens, number two is a favorable rating, number 4GF is inconclusive, 4G is favorable and 4P is favorable. And to get..., to get ahead of a question, why a calculation may be inconclusive, is the changing of a trend. These are five year trends and so, if a trend begins to change in year one or year two, and if you don't see a steady trend over two or three years, we rate it as inclusive because it is too early to tell if that trend will hold, which is the case in item 4GF, which is at your upper top of your screen. You can see that trend

is starting to level down for the first year, between '16 and '17, and so, we rate that as a conclusive.

I want to say thank you to Finance Staff, the Manager, Finance Director, the elected officials and appointed officials for having us. We do appreciate working with the City of Riviera Beach. And at this time, Chairperson, I will turn it back to you and if you would allow, we will do our very, very best to entertain any questions that may be out there.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Are there any questions from Council?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Miller-Anderson, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I just wanted to clarify, your audit that you did, is it different or not different from a forensic audit?

**MR. R. HARVEY:** Very good question. Do you want.., can I just... Do you want me to describe both, or you want me to just answer your question.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** You, answer the question and then describe both for me.

**MR. R. HARVEY:** Thank you so much for that.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you.

**MR. R. HARVEY:** Our audit is different from a forensic audit. We audit entity wide for the City of Riviera Beach, is what we do. So, we have.., what we issue, or what we do as a financial statement audit, which is focused primarily on the financial statements as issued. This 120 page document that is submitted to the State of Florida, okay? A forensic audit, is an audit with a, a purpose to look for fraud, defalcation and irregularities. That audit has a different scope, not only in its intent, but in also the level of numbers that it will.., amounts that it will look to audit. So, therefor numbers. We may look at a item at \$50,000 and up, a forensic audit may look at items at \$1,000, and were those items put forth in a manner that is an irregularity, fraudulent or defalcation.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Any other questions? I had a question, Mr. Harvey, on something that just struck me strange. It was on Page 123 and it's in the last paragraph, and it says that:

Our consideration of internal control was for the limited purpose described in the first paragraph of the section and was not designed to identify all deficiencies in internal control that might be material weaknesses or

significant deficiencies, and therefore, material weaknesses or significant deficiencies may exist that have not been identified. Is that some standard language? What.., could you explain what that means and why?

**MR. R. HARVEY:** Thank you for that. Would love to explain. So, I'm gonna answer both ways and I'll start from the universe and get more specific. So, the AICPA, and their rulings, offer us suggested language. Right? And so, what the AICPA said, American Institute of Certified Public Accountants, says that if you are not going to use our language, then you must state why. So, to answer your question directly, yes, this is standard language. But, to explain, our audits, and most audits, are based on a statistical approach. So, in other words, you say the population may be a million transactions, we're only gonna look at a sample of those. And so, based on our sample testing, a hundred transactions, a thousand transactions. We make conclusions. And so, the language that you have just read, is really for the financial statement reader, the general public, which basically says that there errors or issues known and unknown that may exist that we may not find. And so, there is no way, that's how teach it at the University of Texas, that you can perform a 100% audit. There's no such way. So, what we do is give a qualification, if you will, backed up by the AICPA that says that there are some things that we may have.

Now, one other thing because I think it speaks to the spirit of your question, the internal control environment is, what did you say you're gonna do? Did you do it and are you doing it consistently? And so, the internal control environment, in this report, is very key to support of the do'.., support of the numbers in the financial statements. And so, we just want folks to know there are things out there that may not fall in our sample testing.

Was that a good answer?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** That was an answer. Thank you, sir.

**MR. R. HARVEY:** Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Clerk, do we need to entertain a motion to receive and file? Or do we just accept?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes. To which part?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** To make it clean and clear, just in case anybody come back later on, it will be best if you make a motion to accept what has been presented.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** To receive and file?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** To accept what has been presented to you by our auditor.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** So moved.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, ma'am. May I have a motion...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** So moved.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Second.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It's been motioned and properly second. Madam Clerk.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis? Councilperson Botel?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Davis Joh'..., Pro Tem Hubbard?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Da'..., Chair Da'..., Chair Davis Johnson?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** That motion is approved with Councilperson Davis out.

**MR. R. HARVEY:** Thank you so much.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, Mr. Harvey.

### **DISCUSSION AND DELIBERATION**

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, previously, you all reordered the Agenda to take Item No. 20, then Item No. 26 and then Item No. 27, after the awards and presentations.

20. ITEM NO. 20

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** So, at this time, we will go to Item No. 20 which is:

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** DISCUSSION AND DELIBERATION TO AUTHORIZE THE CITY MANAGER TO HIRE DEPARTMENT HEADS TO FILL VACANT POSITIONS.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Botel.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** 16A.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** What is...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** My apologies.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Oh, an add-on. I...

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** 16A.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...apologize. 16A. Thank you, Madam Clerk. Thank you, Councilwoman Botel.

**16A. ITEM NO. 16A**

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY: PROCLAMATION FROM THE OFFICE OF THE MAYOR DECLARING FIRST FRIDAY IN JUNE 2018 AS NATIONAL GUN VIOLENCE AWARENESS DAY**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Mayor.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I'm going to ask Dr. Botel to come and join me in this Proclamation. Dr. Botel was the actual driving force to make sure that this is something that we would do as a City. And, I respect her leadership here, and thank you for making sure that this happens, Dr. Botel, because we are in a state of emergency, somewhat, with, with all this shooting going on and assault weapons. So, I think some young ladies are here tonight. You may come and join us. And I see one that had a Parkland, a Parkland shirt on, and we certainly wanna continue to remember the victims at Parkland school. And it was a wonderful thing for the Mayor to participate and go to the march in Washington, and I hope and pray that we will see the day that we will have sensible gun laws in this country.

So, Dr. Botel, I., it was your thing, so you read it all and I'll do this part right here.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** WHEREAS, every day 96 Americans are killed by gun violence and, on average, there are nearly 13,000 gun homicides every year, making Americans twenty-five times more likely to be killed with guns than people in other developed countries around the world; and

WHEREAS, protecting public safety in the communities in which they serve is the Mayor's highest responsibility and greatest challenge and support for the Second Amendment right of law abiding citizens goes hand in hand with keeping guns away from dangerous people; and

WHEREAS, Mayors and law enforcement officers should know their communities best, be the most familiar with local criminal activities and know how to address it and by working together, are best positioned to understand how to keep their citizens safe; and



WHEREAS, in January 2013, at the Hadiya Pendleton, a teenager who marched in President Barack Obama's second inaugural parade, and should now be celebrating her 21<sup>st</sup> birthday, instead, she was tragically shot and killed just weeks following that historic celebration. To help honor Hadiya, and the 96 Americans whose lives are cut short, and the countless survivors who are injured by shootings every single day, the National Coalition of Organizations has designated June 1, 2018, the first Friday in June, as National Gun Violence Awareness Day, the fourth such observance in the country; and

WHEREAS, the idea was inspired by a group of Hadiya's friends who asked their classmates to commemorate her life by wearing the color orange. They chose this color because hunters wear orange to announce themselves to other hunters when out in the woods, traffic workers wear orange to enhance their presence on the streets, and orange is the color that symbolizes the value of human life; and

WHEREAS, anyone can join this campaign by pledging to wear orange on June 1<sup>st</sup>, the first Friday in June 2018. This will help raise awareness about gun violence, to honor lives of its victims and survivors by renewing our person commitment to reduce gun violence and pledging to do all we can to help to keep firearms out of the wrong hands while encouraging responsible gun ownership and to help to keep our children safe.

AND NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** That I, Bishop Thomas A. Masters, Mayor of the City of Riviera Beach, Florida, by the power vested in me by the residents of this great City, I do hereby proclaim June the 1<sup>st</sup>, the Friday in June, 2018, to be National Gun Violence Awareness Day, the Fourth Annual National Day of Gun Violence Awareness. I encourage all citizens of Riviera Beach, Florida to support their local communities efforts to prevent the tragic effects of gun violence in and around this City and to honor and value human lives in remembrance of all victims and survivors of gun violence, and to declare that we, as a country, must do more to reduce gun violence and protect the future in and around our communities.

I have set forth the official seal and the signature of the Office of the Mayor.

I want to say that, preface this Proclamation to you, that we are gonna continue pressing our efforts to keep guns out of schools. And, the only way that's gonna happen is there has to be metal detectors in the schools as soon as possible. That's the only thing that's gonna keep guns from walking to the school, like walking onto a air'..., into the airports and on the planes.

We'll like to recognize the Moms Demand Action for... I think you had a press conference here the other day [inaudible] wonderful. We're gonna ask one of you to speak on behalf of the Moms that are Demanding Action for Gun Sense in America. You may come at this time. [Inaudible]. Thank you.

**MOMS DEMAND ACTION FOR GUN SENSE IN AMERICA CLERK ANTHONY:** Thank you so much.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** You're welcome. Debbie [inaudible].

[Inaudible comments]

**MOMS DEMAND ACTION FOR GUN SENSE IN AMERICA CLERK ANTHONY:** Thank you so much everyone for listening and, and supporting this cause. As the Mayor said, we are members of the organization Moms Demand Action for Gun Sense in America, and the number one goal of this organization is to reduce gun violence. We recently formed a North Palm Beach County group of this organization and that includes the City of Riviera Beach. So, one of the initiatives of the Moms Demand Action organization, is to bring attention to National Gun Violence Awareness Day on June 1<sup>st</sup>. We are very grateful to Mayor Masters, Councilperson Botel and the entire Council for helping with the issuance of this Proclamation declaring June 1<sup>st</sup> National Gun Violence Awareness Day. We would invite anyone who's interested in learning more about the organization to, if I'm still here or anyone wants to speak with me at the end of the meeting, or momsdemandaction.org and you can find more information on groups to join and get involved, which would be great.

So, thank you so much.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** At this time, I will ask the Chief of Staff of the Mayor's Office, along with Dr. Botel, to present this Proclamation, and I, I hope tonight that your presence will also cause dads to demand action for gun sense in America, and I'll join that group.

**MOMS DEMAND ACTION FOR GUN SENSE IN AMERICA CLERK ANTHONY:** We're mothers and others.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Oh, you're mothers and others?

**MOMS DEMAND ACTION FOR GUN SENSE IN AMERICA CLERK ANTHONY:**  
[Inaudible], moms, dads [inaudible]...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Oh, well I'm part of the other group then. Thank you.

[Chuckles]

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair, this ends our presentation of the Proclamation. Thank you very much.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, sir.

## 20. ITEM NO. 20

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, now we're onto No. 20.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY: DISCUSSION AND DELIBERATION TO AUTHORIZE THE CITY MANAGER TO HIRE DEPARTMENT HEADS TO FILL VACANT POSITIONS**

**COUNCILMAN TERENCE D. DAVIS (561) 845-4095**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Did you have anything you want to preface this by, Madam City Manager?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair, as you know, there are several department head vacancies throughout the City. Those that are pressing are the Human Resources Department, the Public Works Department. These are critical departments that I feel positions need to be funded in order to start making a change and bringing in policies and procedures, and just a overall departmental run. Like I said, these are critical positions that I feel that should be filled and, you know, I'm, at times, it's difficult, so if you would allow me to hire those positions, that would be great. But, you know, it's also listed in the City Code that the City Manager is able to hire position'.., department head positions. Being, you know, held back and not being able to do that, you, you come across problems that, you know, that, that are not being addressed.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Botel. Are, are you done, Madam...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Yes, ma'am.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...City Manager? Councilwoman Botel, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** It has quite recently come to my attention that the group known as the Florida, I wanna get this right, the Florida City Council Management Association, which is the association that many, quite reputable City Managers belong to, City and County Managers belong to, has a group called the Range riders. I think that's an interesting, interesting name. I think of Teddy Roosevelt when I think of Rough Riders, but this is the Range Riders, and they are a group of City Managers who are retired, many of them recently retired, who are out on loan to cities such as ourselves, to help in, in times of need. And, we, I think, are a City that is in times of need. I, I appreciate the work that Ms. Hoskins has done for the City. She has been a good and loyal employee for thirty years. She has been put in a pos'.., in an untenable position, put in a position that she never had.., well, that, that she probably didn't expect to be put in when she agreed to do this and, and I applaud the work that she has done. But, I believe that, in light of recent things that have gone on, that it is time to look outside ourselves for some help, and I would like to make a motion that we look outside ourselves to experts who have been City Managers in other places, who have the expertise that we need and I would like to make a motion that we look to the Florida City, County Management Association for assistance with.., in this time.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Ma'.., Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Miller-Anderson, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mr. Degraffenreidt or Ms. Anthony, I know that we have.., we're working on this particular Item here in regards to the City Manager filling these department head positions and, and I will go back to my comments regarding that, but I wanted to know, is it proper to now do the motion that Ms. Botel wants to do now in the middle of this particular motion that is on the floor? Not saying that I would not be in support of her motion because I've had these same concerns for a few meetings, but I just wanna make sure that, especially when we just did Robert's Rules of Order. I know you were not here, Mr. Degraffenreidt, but I wanna just make sure that if that.., if we need to come back to her motion, that we.., that it's proper to do it that way.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** I can think of nothing that would prohibit from being done that way.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Is it okay for her to go ahead and do...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...it this way?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** If I may, I believe that we should have an opportunity to discuss and have some exchange before an action is taken. Because along.., if we are to go with that motion, we could very well say let's engage Anita Favors Thompson, who initially reached out to us to assist us in our time of need. So, you know, to just go directly to that, we have had an offer that has been on the table for many months, from a seasoned City Manager, who is retired. So, I think that th'.., that discussion needs to ensue before that takes place, or if the motion goes forward, we take the vote and see where it lies, but I... That's my thought.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** The process of...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** [Inaudible]...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...Robert's Rules as I understand it...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** No.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...is there's a motion and a second, and then that discussion you're...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...speaking of can take place, and the either the motion will be denied, modified or changed to address the final result coming out of the discussion.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** But you never get the discussion, as I understand it, unless there's a motion and a second.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** [Inaudible].

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Put it out there.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well, Madam...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Well, it's here for...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It's here for a discussion and deliberation.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Yes, yes. It has to...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** [Inaudible] not.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...be about how...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** He's...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...Robert's Rules would handle it.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** No. I'm... No. That was... I, I'm...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Based upon our way of doing it, we usually have the discussion first...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** He's right.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...and the motion at the end.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. So, Madam Chair?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** [Inaudible]...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** One moment. I believe Councilwoman Miller-Anderson.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes. So, with the motion being there and this Item No. 20 is a discussion and deliberation, not a Resolution, correct?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It's a...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Item 20?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...discussion and deliberation.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** [Inaudible] Resolution.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So, technically, it didn't really have a motion already on the floor. So, being that she had her motion there, I will second it for discussion.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** My reason for... May I, Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** You are recognized, Councilwoman Botel.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Thank you. My reason for raising this issue of the City..., I'm making sure I get it right because I'm not used to saying City Count'..., City County..., Florida City County Management Association, is that they are an extremely well respected organization. Now, it's probably the case that Anita Favors Thompson is a member of this organization and it may very well be that she's the one appointed as our, I keep wanting to say Rough Rider, Range Rider. And so, it may be the case that she's appointed to help Riviera Beach. I don't know, because I am not familiar with all of the Range Riders that they have available. What I do know is that they are a highly respected organization, made up of City Managers who have good experience working in cities, and are known to be well versed, particularly in cities who are in need of someone to, to serve a, a short-term need as we may be. It might give us the opportunity to, to do a search for a City Manager as, as..., with the guidance of someone who has been in that position, with someone who has held that role and, as I have said, I respect the work that our current City Manager has done for us over thirty years. I want to make that clear, I want to show no disrespect to her. I, I still maintain my previous comments that I don't believe what has happened of late, was done appropriately. Let me just leave that at that.

However, I want to say that I think that we need to have help here and I think that this organization, this particular organization being a well-known organization in the, in the State of Florida, can bring that help to us.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, before you all proceed in your discussion, I just wanted to advise that we do have public comment cards on this Item, and the acceptance of public comment cards on this Item is closed.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you. Chair Pro Tem Hubbard.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Madam Chair, the Item that we're discussing is whether or not we're going to give the City Manager the authorization to hire department heads. We need to dispose of that Item before moving on to another Item. I think that we.., last week we started down that road and a topic was brought up under No. 11, then we got off course and time ran out. So, right now, based on the heading that was read, the Item was not whether or not we want to bring in someone else to assist the City with operational measures. Right now, we are talking about, and voting on, one thing and one thing only, whether or not we're going to allow the City Manager to hire department heads. We need to dispose of that. Then, if we want to take up another issue about bringing someone on, then we can do that, but everybody who attended the Robert Rules of Order with Mr. Russell, seemed to have missed that part, that we have to dispose of one issue at a time. That's what.., and so, we have to dispose of this Item and if Councilwoman Botel wants to make a motion, or add another Item to be considered on the Agenda, then we can do that. But not.., definitely not in the middle of, of what we're doing now.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** You can't possibly...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** There is a motion...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...tell me that that's proper.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Excuse me.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Excuse me. Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Botel, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** There is a motion seconded on the floor. We need to discuss and move on that motion. That's Robert's Rules. Excuse me, I [inaudible]...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** No, ma'am. Point of order, Madam Chair.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** There was an Item read. We started with No. 26, and in the middle of that.., excuse me, in, in the middle of Item 20, all of a sudden we're gonna make a motion about something else that was not on the floor. That is not Robert's Rule of Order, and saying it over and over, is not gonna make it so.

**UNK:** Call the question.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair?

[Audience clapping]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Miller-Anderson.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So, for me seconding the.., this particular Item that Ms. Botel brought before you, is because of it, for me, it does impact the decision that we will making for this particular Item. It says to allow the City Manager to hire vacant department heads. And as a whole, we did agree to not doing that until we were able to get the permanent person in here, and as it stands, we still ha'.., we have Ms. Hoskins in the position as the permanent City Manager for the simple fact that many were concerned that we would've run out of the days needed to hire someone. And so, she was offered the permanent City Manager position, with the understanding that she was not going to stay in that position very long. Because we were still actively looking for someone to come in. And being that that's the case and we know that she still says that she, you know, it's not her desire to remain in that position, and so, if we are looking to fill the position, we, we let her go ahead and hire these important department head positions, and then she's gone in the next thirty days and you bring someone else in, and we've now hired these people in these positions, get someone else new that comes in and may not be very satisfied with the people who were just hired, and now you look at having to let these people go.

And so, I just think that, um, also with that, just in numerous dealings.., just.., dealing with Ms. Hoskins on various issues, I know that she has had some hesitation on being able to address issues and, as well as, just making sure that the department heads provide information to her by her deadline. I, I understand that this is a very tough position. However, I do understand that it comes with a very hefty salary. And then also, it was a job that she willingly accepted. And I know that she was trying to do her very best and help the City out, but at the same time, she accepted the position and we know that it has not been a position that is just very simple and easy to do. So, even though that is the case, it is still expected for you to be able to do what you need to do as the City Manager, and making those hard decisions, as I've mentioned before, it, it, it's required. And so, I question, you know.., let me say this. Let me go back and say this. When, when Ms. Hoskins did get this position, I did not, as we know it was a scoring system. There were two people that it came down to. I did not score either one of the candidates. And I did make it very clear that I, I, I really like Ms. Hoskins in terms of her professionalism and, and the work that she had done in the Finance Department. I was not in support of her coming into the City Manager's position. Although I said that and that was what I did, I did work with Ms. Hoskins as she got into the role. But there has been numerous issues that have occurred, in terms of just being able to get information, holding the, the people accountable, the employees accountable, following up on issues and, and there's a lot that is required of this position.



And I say all that to say that the point that Ms. Botel is bringing up is important, in my eyes, because we do need to look at making sure that we have someone that is going to be able to hire department heads that are one, qualified for those positions, two, that are able to do the job and then, Ms. Hoskins has to have the..., she has to be able to make the decisions that need to be made, and if that's going to happen, I don't know that I'm comfortable with her hiring these department heads. Particularly, when this is not going to be the last person that we have, because we, we already said that we will be looking for our permanent City Manager and she's pretty much like a te'..., a placeholder at this time for us. So, I'm not in favor of the..., her..., allowing her to go ahead and do those department head positions, and which is why I seconded the, the motion that Ms. Botel made.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you. Councilman Davis, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Thank you. I have one question before I move..., before I pause for a minute. I would like to hear from the City Clerk as regards to the Charter. Please read the Charter where it states about the City Manager's authorities and what's required by law, of the Charter. Please.

[Pause].

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** In accordance with §22 of Article 2 of the City's Charter, that's entitled City Manager Duties Powers. It reads:

The City Manager shall be the Chief Administrative Officer and the head of the administrative branch of the City government. He or she shall be responsible to the City Council for the proper administration of all affairs of the City, and to that end, subject to the personnel provisions of this Charter, shall have power and shall be required to appoint and, when necessary for the good of the City, remove all officers and employees of the City except as otherwise provided by this Charter, and accept as he or she may authorize, the head of a department or office to appoint and remove subordinates in such department or office, prepare the budget annually and timely submit it to the City Council and be responsible for its administration after adoption, prepare and submit to the City Council, as of the end of the Fiscal Year, a complete report on the finances and administrative activities of the City for the proceeding year, keep the City Council advised of the financial condition and future needs of the City and make such recommendations as may seem to him or her, desirable, perform such other duties as may be prescribed by this Charter or required of him or her by the City Council, not inconsistent with this Charter. The City Manager shall attend all meetings of the City Council but shall have no vote therein. The

City Manager may take part in discussion of all matters coming before the City Council. At the City Manager's or Council's request, the department directors or other officers may take part in discussions of the City Council, of the City Council relating to their respective offices, departments or agencies.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Thank you. Now, what I notice, the Charter is the law. Correct? Yes or no?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** The Charter is the Constitution of the City of Riviera Beach.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So, in the Constitution, from which you read, they mention "shall" approximately about seven times, and it went got to the hiring, they said shall and is required. Not "may", as if there's an option. "Shall" and "is required". And, our job as elected officials is to only follow the law that the voters have supported through, through their vote. And, the law, which was read into public record now, said that the City Manager, he or she, shall, is required. So, at no point, the Board is allowed to enter into an agreement that's the total opposite of the C'.., of the Charter, and that we try to manage and control any City Manager, we will be in.., noncompliant with the City's Charter. We're not allowed, based up'.., we're not allowed, based upon the Charter. That's why I wanted it read into the record 'cause I wanna make sure that we stay consistent not with what we want, but what the law requires. And that's...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes, ma'am.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yeah. Madam Chair?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I'm sorry. Mr. Mayor.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** You're recognized.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Well, you know, it's interesting [chuckle] we follow the Charter when we want to, and when we don't wanna follow the Charter, we make, we make up laws as we go along.

[Audience exclamation]

**UNK:** Shh.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Point of order.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** What is.., I, I think there has to be some common sense here for, for us. The common sense is that since it makes no other sense, it's nonsense. We know what the law says, we know what the Charter says, but in essence, we have a City Manager that's in limbo status, laying duck status, if you will. When a new president is getting ready to take office, he doesn't make appointments of, of boards or his cabinets because he knows that within two or three months, or a couple months, the new guy's gonna come aboard. I don't think, having said that, what we have.., we don't really have a permanent Manager per se. We're gonna be changing that. There's going to be a Manager for this City. We're in the process of trying to get a Manager that's gonna be working with department heads for a year, and two years, or three years, whatever the contract may state.

So, I'm gonna break a few rules of grammar. For me and my house, this is what I think, I don't think it would be fair, or right or just, for whoever the new Manager is going to be to tie his hands, that he has to work with a Police Chief that he didn't appoint, he has to work with department heads that he didn't appoint. I believe that whenever someone comes in, and maybe this has been a problem, maybe that's why we have what we have, because we have done things not like the way we should've done things. There should not be a rush to judgment here. We tried to do that in the past, we tried to make things happen before the time was right, in the past. It was a rush. There's no rush. Ms. Hoskin's been doing a fine job in the capacity she's been, the departments have been running fine. I don't see a national state of emergency with the City. So, if we know that we're gettin' ready to have a new City Manager, why are trying to allow Ms. Hoskins to make those kind of decisions right now when we're gonna have a new City Manager in one month? That doesn't make sense to me. It really, really doesn't. I want the new City Manager, since we are in that process, if not throw the process away. But, if we in that process of getting ready to get a new City Manager, then we should be patient and allow that City Manager to come in here and choose who he wants, or she wants, to work with. Period.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Unless, un'.., unless, unless we put people in position temporarily with the understanding that when the new City Manager comes in, and that's.., we've been trying to do this, what, three or four months, still can't get it right.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Six months.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Six months.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Six months. Madam Chair?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Just...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** I'm sorry.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** So therefore, if we're gonna put somebody in to put somebody in to help her with these departments with the understanding they'll be for a short period of time, until we get a City Manager, I'm okay with that, but it's not fair, it's not fair to a new guy or new girl that's gonna come on, on the block. And we.., he has to work with people that he didn't appoint. A new City Manager should be able to appoint their new cabinet officers, especially when we're looking at possibly a few weeks. What's the rush?

Thank you very much.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Um...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam City Manager.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** The only reason that this Item is on is because, okay, I submitted a timeline to the City Council along with twenty-six applicants.., City Manager applicants and only three of the Board Members participated in submitting their na'.., their short list names. So, and you haven't, as a Council, decided on an extended timeline or which way we're gonna go. Now, if you say it's gonna happen next month, then I'm fine with that, we don't need to hire anybody. But, if it's not gonna happen next month, then what, what date are we using? What, what timeline are we using to hire a new City Manager? Because I'm under the impression that it's gonna be longer rather than shorter.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Allow me, I would like to weigh in. I wanted to state, to address that very same point. We asked for applications to come in, we had criter'.., criteria that was set. As I looked through the listing of individuals, and I made it very clear when we talked about criteria, what it was that I was looking for specifically, and that was City Manager, County Administrator, Assistant and Assistant City Manager and County Administrator. So, as I go through the list and I presented my list, we had candidates with twelve years' experience as a City Manager, we had eight years of collective City Manager experience, ten years as an Administrator. And to say that we don't have viable candidates from which to get a.., get to a list, a short list, where we could interview, I believe is improper. So, there are candidates that were forwarded to us that can certainly be considered based on the amount of time that we wanted them to have the experience and the place in which we wanted that experience to come from.

So, we have a list of individuals, and I heard my colleagues say that they had concerns with various issues with the candidates, but that's the process of evaluating, you go through, you have a conversation, you review. But, to throw the baby out with the bath water and say that there are no viable candidates, is incorrect and improper. So, the timeline was provided and we have gotten in our own way by pushing this off and pushing this off for whatever reason. And there are candidates that we can consider and that we can short list and evaluate. And if, at that time, it is determined that this Board is not interested in those candidates, we then make a determination as a collective body to determine what will be our next steps. But to throw the entire process out, I, I don't believe

that that is a proper action for us to take. So, we have, we have, as a Board, perpetuated this, this situation with not having support for Ms. Hoskins. I have been in county government for thirty years, and I have never seen a City Manager or Administrator handicapped in the manner in which Ms. Hoskins is being handicapped. Now, whatever the ultimate end game is, I am unsure of that, but we keep saying that we want to see progress, movement and quality emplo'.., employees, but at every turn, we are putting up obstacles in her pla'.., in her, in her way. Ms. Hoskins has been responsive, she has been responsible, she is, in fact, loyal but I don't think that there is anyone that can speak negatively against Ms. Hoskins' integrity, or her moral compass. To do so, is shameful.

So, I am, I am not clear on what it is, as it relates to the desire of this Board, in order to provide her with assistance. She needs assistance to run this City. Yes, it comes with a hefty salary, but she needs support Staff. And we are at a deficit, we are running at a deficit and we have to, as this elected body, identify ways to provide that assistance to Ms. Hoskins. So, I'm going to say, I would like to see us revisit the applications that have been provided to us, short list, make it.., we'.., and I believe it was public meetings and public interviews that we were wanting to hold. Let's go along that, that line and move forward with that process, and then make a determination if it's not what we want.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Chair Pro Tem and then Councilwoman Botel.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I, I asked...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Madam...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...as well, Ms. Davis Johnson.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Pardon me?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I had called a while ago as well.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I, I, I have you on the list.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** You're welcome.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** The.., I agree wit what the Chairwoman has said in reference to Mrs. Hoskins' character, her professionalism and her responsiveness. She has been deliberately handicapped by not being allowed to have assistance. Every department head that is not there, adds another burden for her to not be as effective and efficient as she possibly can. There is no way that we can expect, nor have we ever expected, any other City Manager to operate in the manner in which we are asking Ms. Hoskins to operate. Ms. Hoskins is a thirty year professional, respected by most of the employees here at the City.., and most of the Councils that have been here. I.., if we were serious, and if we were honestly interested in getting another or a new City Manager on board, we would have lived up to the timetable that was put before us. Three of us followed the timetable that we all voted on. We voted on that timetable. HR didn't put it

together, the Manager didn't put it together, they sat with us, we all pulled out our calendars and we backed into that timetable. Staff typed it up and presented it to us for us to follow. So, when we got the documents, the resumes, that was our time to vote on where we wanted to go. Just to abstain and not to vote at all when, in fact, it is true that there were candidates that met the criteria. If we wanted to move on, that was what we should've done to move on. We are trying, some of us are trying to hold this City hostage and, at the same time, continually demonize others, as well as the..., as, as well as the Manager. We have to move forward, we have to get back to governing, we can't continue to believe the hype that is being portrayed about the City..., about, about the City of Riviera Beach, this Council. We have to move forward.

If we're going to participate as Council Members, then so be it. If we're not gonna participate, then we're not gonna participate, but we had a timeline that was set forth, and we didn't. So therefore, we have no City Manager that's being spoke of and banter back and forth about here, that we'll go out and hire these other department heads. What we did was we hired a City Manager. Regardless of how long she is going to be here, she is still being ex'..., expected to perform and to perform efficiently. Regardless of how long she's expected to be here, she still needs the tools to do her job. She still needs the Staff to do her job. We..., if there's another City Manager that come aboard, that don't like the people that are here, they are going to dismiss them anyway. So, it's..., so, so that's not, so that's not fair, what we are saying and what we're doing. We have put this Item on the Agenda twice and I think that if we are generally concerned about moving this City forward, let's get some people in place. The reason that we don't have those other positions in place under the management, it's because the department heads are empty. Let her fill those positions and then we can fill the subsequent Staff and we can get to work, and we can ignore the rumbling, the rumors and move on with the business of this City. Just because somebody continually says that the salary is wrong, 'Oh, it's too much.' It's too much for who to make? Ya know? It's..., when you've been somewhere for thirty years and you have longevity, that's what you, that's what you've been there for, and that's why you stayed as long as, as you did. We talked about the..., a lady came up here a few minutes ago, she talked about us trying..., not trying to take longevity and moving to another realm away from giving the residents what they did. We had a workshop up here, and I spoke against that and I still spoke..., speak against that, taking those type of benefits away from the residents. The residents want them, they expect them, they de'..., they deserve that.

I expect..., and Ms. Hoskins is a re'..., is a..., excuse me, I said resident and I mean..., meant employee. [Stammer], Ms. Hoskins is an employee and she deserves all the things that she is entitled to, just as we talked about with the SEI'..., with the SEIU group. They voted that down, giving us a chance to go back and do what is fair because, as the employee said, conflicting information goes back and forth, one from the union, one from, from our side. So, to ask her to an effective job, an efficient job and talk about she's not responsive in a timely manner, and that she's not making decisions based on the employees that the department heads that work un'..., work under her. When she's, when she's bombarded with thirteen emails from one Councilperson a day, how can she manage the City if she doesn't have department heads that she can give directives to, so that they can go on and get things done. And, and, and I think that whatever we do, if we

want to go and continue searching for a City Manager, that's fine, but we definitely need to deal with Item 20 today, Madam Chair.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair, I call the question.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Well, we appreciate that but I believe there were other co'..., comments that needed to be had.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** There is a mot'...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** And Robert's..., Robert's Rules says...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** But I can call...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...that with...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** ...the question.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Calling the question requires a vote to move on and end discussion. So, is that...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** [Inaudible]...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...the Board..., is that the...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** That's what I'm searching to do.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** One moment. But we have to take a motion on calling your question according to Robert's Rules of Order.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** So, is it...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Point of clar'..., point of clarification.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** I'm, I'm...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** What clarification...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** ...asking to call the question.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...would you request, Mr. Mayor?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** You mentioned a timeline. Are..., do we have a timeline... And that's my only concern, do we have a timeline that we're gonna have to, to have a City Manager, a permanent one?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Well...

**UNK:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Hold on. I can share with you the, the various timelines that...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I'm [inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...we've had.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I mean, do we have one now? Like, the next [inaudible]?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** And, I will share with you...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** The Manager said...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...the timeline.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...thirty days, so, are we gonna have a Manager in thirty days, or sixty days?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Mayor, I would think that you would know that that is not going to be the case because we've had a number of timelines revised, that have been submitted, and because we have continuously put the Item off, the timelines have expired. For instance, this very last one has us at contract approval tonight. But, because we have put this off and we have had other issues that have come up as it relates to interviewing and, and getting to a listing, our timeline has expired. So...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** So, does that mean that we're not going to, to institute or reinstitute a new timeline, like, sixty days from now?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** No. Absolutely it doesn't mean that. We have to..., this..., the, the voting body has to make a decision as to which direction it wants to go, and that was a part of my conversation and my point that was made.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I know, and that's why I'm making this point now because if, in fact, we're just gonna say, you know, do it, in sixty days, no matter what, then I don't..., then I think that person should be able to appoint the heads of the departments. If we have a fixed timeline and we do it. And I agree with you, Madam Chair. We had a process. But because of whatever, the process was not followed. It's time to follow the process, let's do what we have to do.

Thank you.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, Mr. Mayor.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?



**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Hold on. [Stammer], are we calling the question or are we gonna continue 'cause I was next [inaudible]...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I just wanna [inaudible]...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** So, Robert'.., as I stated, although she asked to.., although Councilwoman Botel asked to call the question, Robert's Rules of Order says that a vote must be taken on calling the question. If there is continued discussion, then we must complete that discussion if that motion does not carry to call the question. So, that's where we stand.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So I asked that because I noticed that others were asking to be heard. So, if that is the case, as you just stated, I'm waiting to go ahead and call the question and then we'll see where we go from there. I just wanted to make sure, if we were continuing discussion, that I was next.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Again, because she has asked to call the question, I will entertain a motion to call the question.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** No public comment?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Stammer].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** We still have public comment cards to address. So, if.., she wa'.., Councilperson Botel wants to end discussion, so there was still conversation in the pipe to be heard, and this would conclude the second round of conversation as it relates to this particular Item. So, again I say, if this body wishes to call the question, then there must be a motion to support the call for question. If it.., if there is no motion, we will continue discussion.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair, just for the record, I just wanna know what the motion was originally.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** I made a motion, and it was seconded, that we engage the services of a... Now I'll have to look at what they call themselves again.., of a...

[Inaudible dais comments]

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Range [chuckle]...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Range Riders.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Rebel Rouser. From the Florida City County Management Association to assist us.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Okay. Madam Chair?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** And it was seconded.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Just a point of clarity. My discussion has everything to do with the initial Item that was on the board, so...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Ma'... I made the motion...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Can I please finish?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** ...[inaudible] motion.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Can I fin'.., please finish? Thank you. So, my motion is to discuss that, so I won't enter into any more discussion until we disseminate.., do something with this particular motion. And that's Robert's Rules. So I will wait until this motion is called.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Miller-Anderson...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So, with this...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...particular Item being that it was a motion that was put out there, those comment cards that we have out there are not for the one that we're about to vote on, so are we going to allow the public to weigh in on the...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Those comment...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...Item...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...cards are for Item 20. Correct?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** That is correct...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** They, they are...

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** ...Madam Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...for 20.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** But our vote though, that we're getting ready to made is about hiring the, the person to.., from the Range Riders.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Right.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So, that's why I was asking if we're doing that particular Item and about to vote on it...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Well...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Are we going to allow the public to speak on that issue?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Well, it's interesting that you would ask that question in that way because we just talked about whether or not we were circumventing the discussion of Item 20 to get to a motion that requested that we take up the notion of entering into an agreement, or making a motion that we engage that organization in order to help us in our time of need. So, we need to stay... That motion is there. There's a motion and a second. And, the comment cards were specifically for 20, which is what the discussion should've been on. But that motion was thrown out there...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Presently.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...prior to...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Right.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Pardon?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yeah. I said presently because the motion... I'm agreeing with you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** [Chuckle].

**MAYOR MASTERS:** That's been [inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, sir, for that. So again, the rule says if we're going to stop discussion to deal with that motion, I, I just think that it's out of order. It, it just.., it is out of order and it does not fall in line with what we were here to discuss.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well, I know we said that it was a dis'..., before we got into the conversation, I thought we settled that by saying that it was a discussion and deliberation Item. There was no motion on the floor, so her motion was able to be put out there and that's why it went forward.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** You seconded it for discussion.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** But we let the motion go out to even be seconded, is what I'm saying.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Had you not of second it, it would have died for the lack of a second.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well, I did not...

[Inaudible comment]

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...choo'... Ms., Ms. Davis Johnson...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I, I'm just saying, [inaudible]...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...I'm really sensing a lotta hostility up...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** [Chuckle].

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...here from you...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Of course you would say that. You would say that.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...and I don't know why.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** You're..., okay. You would say that.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And it, it has continued a number of times, so I, I just really wish that we can just kinda just take it down a couple notches.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I would disagree with you, Councilwoman.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** No.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** You are..., [stammer], this..., let's just be about the business of the City...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** That's what I'm trying to do.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...and not the politics of the City, and I disagree and I take offense to the fact that you're saying that I'm hostile, because I've not been hostile with you.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I know. I...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I have not. So...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I'm telling you my perception and my feeling about it.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Of which your enti'..., you're entitled.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And so...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I ,please excuse me.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you. So...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Hold on. So, I asked Mr. Degraffenreidt from the beginning if that was okay, and because we went on with it, because he said.., we said that it was a discussion and deliberation, there was no motion the floor, that it was allowed. So, all I'm asking right now is we could get pub'.., if anyone wants to speak on the particular Item that we're about to vote on, if it would be okay.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Well, I think that the comment cards that are in, we should go ahead and allow those comments to move forward. Individuals did place a comment card in, in response to Item No. 20. We have deviated from the original conversation that was associated with Item 20. So, I believe that we should allow those who have put a comment card in to speak to the issue of 20, to come forward and speak at this time.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. And [stammer], can they also talk.., weigh in on what we're talking about too, would that be okay? With those people that have put in a card. And if there are others that do want to now weigh in because it's something additional, is that alright?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Attorney, what is the proper method by which to, to dispense of this Item? I think that we need not prolong the time because it's 9:45 and there are comment cards out there, so we certainly should allow them to speak. But on the additional motion that was put out, should we now open up a comment.., a public comment period to discuss that motion or do we keep it relevant and germane to Item 20?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Clerk, public comment cards, please.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Margaret Sheppard, Bonnie Larson, Dosha Newbold.

[Inaudible comments and chuckles]

**MS. M. SHEPHERD:** Huh?

[Inaudible audience comment]

**MS. M. SHEPHERD:** Excuse me, don't start the clock but the American Disability Act says if something happens, or whatever, I don't have to tell you what my problem is, but standing there is not gonna get it. So, I don't see what the problem that you all are making, we're staying here all night for foolishness. Let's, let's get to the, to, to what you're talking about, which I agree with Mr. Miller-Anderson. I agree to a point of what, what you're saying, as well as Mrs. Hoskins. Mrs. Hoskins do need help on a couple of things.

Let me get to the point. Public Works, the grounds of the City that's coming from I-95, and some of the grass and the flowers, I don't know where they get those flowers,

the grass is just horrible. This City is going down but yet, we're gonna do the petty stuff. I wou'.., you fired Jonathan Evans in six months.

[Audience clapping]

**MS. M. SHEPHERD:** So, what the H-E-double L will make any difference if she hires somebody when the man get here, you fired Jona'.., fire him. If they're not doing the job, fire 'em. And then bring in, what Dr. Botel is talking about, bring in somebody, let's give the job... Back and forth, back and forth [stammer] let's get the job done.

HR, I think that should be on hold until the City Manager get here. I, I don't know where these salaries are coming back but I'll come back to.., but, you have Purchasing, he has to do the RFP, QRXYZ. Some of what she's talking about, she needs help. She has nobody. You have Dorothy Mitchell there, she's in the DROP program, why can't you put Dorothy there? She's, she, she's, she's an honorable black woman, this is an honorable black girl. Why do we keep adding and adding... 1995, I remember when Ms. Hoskins came here with that little bitty boy, he's grown old man. It's been a long time, let's not bash her. Let's don't, don't bash her. Allow her to do the job. And I think she's doing a fine job. And I hope you all get to the salary thing, I hope you come back 'cause you don't have time now. This is stupid. This is really kinda dumb. Allow.., she's the City Manager, allow her to do the job, but in the meantime, bring in whomever you got and let them start... I'm like the Mayor, you already ran outta time. What'ch you gonna do? Run out of time again, gonna run outta time again. And I hope you feel what I felt, Ms. Miller-Anderson, when this Chairwoman disrespected me. I hope you feel what I felt. I hope she feel what I felt because you all got to move it on, you're just draggin' it and draggin' it and draggin' it and draggin' it. Let's stop. Let's stop and get this City on track.

Thank you.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Bonnie Larson, Doshia Newbold.

**MS. B. LARSON:** I agree with Mayor Masters, we change the rules to change the situation. Mr. Evans was here, did he get to pick the people he wanted to work with? No. He had to work with people that disliked him, who wanted that job. That's who had to work with. He didn't get to hire anybody. He encouraged two people, they were allowed to resign. That were molesting women, accused of molesting women. Okay? He let them go. That was a big deal, that's what go him fired because he wanted to do the right thing. Now we're talking about.., Ms. Botel brought up a comment about hiring these Range Rovers. I'm not gonna try and...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Range Ro'.., Range Riders.

**MS. B. LARSON:** Range Riders, whatever. Okay. So, you said that was out of line. But then, Ms. Tonya Davis, you brought up this lady again, Anita Favors Thompson, who we.., supposedly nobody knows but that was okay. So there you go. You say she can't suggest somebody as part of the conversation, but you can. That doesn't make sense to me. And it is part of the conversation because if you're voting on should Ms. Hoskins be able to hire department heads, that is part of the situ'.., what are all our alternatives? So,

that is part of this conversation. You can't make somebody vote for somebody if they say these people are not qualified. Two people on the Council do not feel any of those applicants were qualified. You can't make 'em vote. They're not., they're gonna be voting for a warm body. We need a lot more than a warm body here.

Ms. Hoskins took the job, temporarily. She's doing the best she can. Her expertise is in finance, not in hiring people. Not in hiring people. Mr. Evans didn't even wanna do it himself. He suggested hiring a legal person in the HR Department to vet applicants, to check them out because that person would have experience doing it.

The first meeting we had on the Consent Agenda was to do, do without that person. As soon as Mr. Evans was let go, you said, 'No, no, no. Let's not get that person in HR,' who knows how to interview, who knows how to hire people and vet them out. Where are you gonna get these people for the department heads? You can't just pull them off the street, where you getting this list of people for the department heads? Where's that coming from?

When you get a salary study, and Mr. Evans, Mr. Jonathan Evans was the one who asked for that study so that our employees would be paid properly. He's the one who started that. The thing is, when you have a study like that, there's more to it than to say HR person in Miami or Tallahassee makes 'x' number of, of dollars. That doesn't mean the person in Riviera Beach gets that number of dollars. There's a different number of people., there's, like, a hundred different parameters you have to look at when you get that study, you don't just say someone in Tallahassee is making a hundred and., \$320,000 so we in Riviera Beach should get that. No. You have to look at the study, you have to be able to discuss that, you have to be able to interpret it, you don't just do that. That was a very poor decision to go ahead and give people raises like that, without doing that.

But this is not her expertise.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**MS. B. LARSON:** It's not.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, Ms. Larson.

**MS. B. LARSON:** My time is up, I know that but I'm just saying, that is part of the discussion what those two ladies brought up, is part of the discussion.

Thank you.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Doshia Newbold, Doretta Paulk, Billie Brooks.

**MS. D. NEWBOLD:** Good night again.

I'm listening to you all. I heard Ms. Botel said maybe. And I think it's not a maybe or I think situation. And then you started to say, I'm not gonna put words into your mouth,

but it looked like you were starting to say she doesn't have any experience. I didn't really like that. Okay? So who's going to do the hiring? They read the law, that's what my tax dollars is paying her for, to do her job. This is a at-will state. Like the Mayor said, do it temporary. You all are not doing your job because you let the time lapse, when you should've hired a City Manager. So you wanna throw the rock at her, but look at..., don't throw stones when you live in a glass house. You all had a timeframe, you all had an agreement. You didn't do your job. Indirectly, KaShamba, you basically told her, you're not qualified to be the City Manager, but you gotta do your job to help the other Council Members hire somebody that you think is qualified. You can't get twenty-seven people that fit your criteria and ya'll can't pick out one? Three people said they went through the list. You s'..., you basically told her she's not qualified, she doesn't do this, she doesn't do that but did you do your short list? So, with the timeframe that you all came up with, I heard limbo..., decorating words. Not limbo, you had a timeframe. Do your job. People are unemployed and qualified to be a City Manager. So hire somebody. That's not fair to her. And this going back and forth with the bantering, if we're on No. 20, let's do No. 20. If you hired me to be your cashier, but you're saying oh, you're not counting the money right and I'm sitting there..., basically, she's sitting there gettin' my tax dollars, that's not fair to the taxpayers. Let her do her job. If you have to, get a committee. We got so many ex-retired employees that were head of departments, you can get a couple citizens, let's do a boa'..., I don't know where she' comin' from with this Range Rover, or whoever Rover, or troop or whatever, and let's do a board, get a set of questions, have other people that have worked for the City and citizens, come up with a list of what she's looking for and make a determination. Do it temporarily. She's been here temporarily, but don't tell her what she's not doing if you're not doing your part.

Good night, on this point.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Doretta Paulk, Billie Brooks, Horace Townes.

**MS. D. PAULK:** Good evening. My name's Doretta Paulk. Good evening to the Board, the Mayor.

[Inaudible comments]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Can you pull your mic to you? Thank you. Just a little close to you.

**MS. D. PAULK:** This doesn't move. Well, I'm very concerned with..., and Ms. Hoskins, I think you have done a marvelous job, a marvelous job. But, what I'm very concerned with is the raises that you have given these, these employees. I'm very concerned with that because when we have a \$40,000,000 bond that is gonna come out of the citizens of Riviera Beach, and their water bill is gonna be raised up higher and higher, this money should've been staying in Finance or given to the general public that works the..., that works the, the streets and keeps the parks, and the Recreation Department's nice and clean. Give those people the raises they should be having. But to give this type of raise[pause], [stammer]. Well, before I retired, I was a professional, I never..., and sometime a corporation didn't have the money, we didn't get raise. But, to give this type



of raise is unconscionable, and I think it should be rescinded, just like you all rescinded the stipend, and it's just not fair to the little people, just as me in Riviera Beach to have to have our water bill sky high because of the \$40,000,000 bond that we have to pay and we have the infrastructure of this City, that's so poorly... The sidewalks, the roads with all the cracks and all the holes, this is what this money should be going towards. Not giving someone these sky high raises. It's not right, and it's not fair. And how, you know, I'm just saying, Ms. Hoskins, and nothing against you but this has to be rescinded, because it's not fair to any citizen of Riviera Beach. Now, I'm not talking about your longevity 'cause I don't know anything about that, but I'm talking about these two raises that you gave. You know? I don't think it's right. Period.

And [stammer], about..., if you have people qualified, and now the census is that the time limit has gone and, you know, and I guess these people not around anymore who could interview, that's on you all. That's on the Council. I'm sorry, that's on the Council. I think she does need help. I really think she does need help because this is a very taxing City Manager job. And maybe, maybe ya'll need to even think about seeing if he would even step foot back in the City of Riviera Beach, uh, bring Mr. Jonathan Evans back.

**UNK. AUDIENCE:** No...

[Inaudible comments]

**MS. D. PAULK:** Yes, yes, yes. I think he did an outstanding job, outstanding job.

**UNK:** Ding, ding, ding.

**MS. D. PAULK:** Ding, ding, ding.

[Inaudible comment]

**MS. D. PAULK:** Thank you so much.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**MS. D. PAULK:** Thank you.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, the time is now 9:59. What is the pleasure of the Board?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** What is the pleasure of the Board?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I make a motion that we extend the meeting at least to get through 20..., what do we have, 20, 26 and 27.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** And what time is associated with that extension, please?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I, am.., [stammer]. A maximum of an hour and a half? I mean, I don't want to put a time limit on it because I know they're very important.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yeah. We typically put a time.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** You know?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yeah.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Hmm?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I said we typically put a time.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Say 11:30.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Is there a second? Is there a second?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I second her motion.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Botel?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes. [Chuckle].

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Hubbard?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** No.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Davis Johnson?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** That motion is approved with Councilperson Hubbard dissenting. Billie Brooks, Horace Towns, Bessie Brown.

**MS. B. BROOKS:** I almost feel guilty about speaking because of the time. Anyway, Billie Brooks.

And I wanna speak to this matter about, you know, giving our City Manager the right to hire some people. You know, I was looking at it and let's just be real about it, you know, we are where we are today because of the firing of Jonathan Evans. We know that. And nothing right now that's going on is usual, in the order of business for the City. I want you to think about, administratively, if you move forward to place people in positions, you are denying the..., a City Manager the right to select his or her own team, and that's what I'm looking at. And predictably, the person who are coming in are gonna be on a probationary status, and is it fair to them to come in thinking they're gonna have a position that they might not have because, when you get a City Manager, they might be terminated. And then the process starts all over again with that person, City Manager, trying to hire someone. Now, I know that Councilwoman Botel and Council'..., Councilwoman Miller-Anderson are speaking to this issue from the level of working in administrative positions on a high level and, and, and in doing so, most of the time, even in governmental agencies, when someone has been put in an administrative position, I wouldn't say an executive position, the heads of departments submit resignations and why? Because the person coming in has a right to choose the team that they can work with. So, I'm just looking at the fairness of this, really, to the person who would be hired.

And, and Ms. Hoskins has done..., always been an outstanding employee. She came to the..., to meet the need when the Finance person left and she was..., she's always willing to offer her service, and I don't see that there is, what do I wanna say, a negative about Ms. Hoskins and what she is doing. I mean, when we look at the qualifications of a City Manager, what are they? You know, what are they? And now, we're asking her to select, and maybe she wants to do it, select department heads. But, a City Manager, a City Manager, with certain qualifications, comes in and knows what needs to be in place in the different departments because you know the goals and objections and the missions of that department, and the persons that he would be..., or she would be interviewing will fit just what is appropriate to fill those positions.

So, I'm, I'm just hoping that you'll really consider... And then, Commissioner Botel, Councilwoman Botel, I think she's offering a s'..., for you to think about a solution as the interim. She mentioned a particular agency, or firm, or whatever it is, but if you just look at the concept here, how can this help us while we're trying to at least give Ms. Hoskins a timeline that, okay, you can say goodbye to the City because we are coming in with some kind of solution for that. So, it doesn't have to be the Lone Rangers or the...

[Chuckle]

**MS. B. BROOKS:** ...whoever, but it can be a firm or a consultant or someone so I think you should be thinking about the concept, regardless of who you wanna put in. And you mentioned someone from Tallahassee. You know? So.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, Ms. Brooks.

**MS. B. BROOKS:** That's my position.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**MS. B. BROOKS:** Bye.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Bye-bye.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Horace Towns, Bessie Brown, Delores Williams.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** [Inaudible].

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Horace Towns?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** [Inaudible].

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Bessie Brown, Delores Williams.

**MS. B. BROWN:** Good evening.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Good evening.

**MS. B. BROWN:** I see you all have your hands full tonight. The City Clerk read the Charter where the City Manager has the authority to hire those people that the Council tried to keep her from hiring. She is the City Manager and she is in that job, and the thing about it is that, if you all had done the applications and followed your timeline, we wouldn't probably be into this, basically. And, um, she ne'.., she needs help. There's three positions in that office when, when other City Managers sat there. She's only one person. And then the other, you know, the one that came one was gone. You fired Jonathan Evans. Um, what's his name? Randy? No. Danny Jones, was gone, Troy Perry did not wanna stay. Now, she's.., and she stepped in to help to just keep things a little, you know, kosher here so that we would have a City Manager 'cause we wouldn't have had anything. Now, you need to let her hire.., and I don't know the pre'... Let her hire somebody to help her, if it's one or two or three. You understand? And HR needs to do that process and get it done. If you start the process, then maybe we can get somebody in here to help her and this'll be.., all this, this conversation is getting her nowhere and getting mothering, and it's time for ya'll to allow HR and the City Manager to do the job that they're sitting in.

And, and, and the Charter stated that the City Manager has a right to hire these people. That's what she needs to do. You don't need to talk it to death. And, and, and I, I mentioned and I said.., I even offered... One time, back.., you kept going to get people.., going to look at the League of Cities. Now, now Ms. Botel is offering something. But you're ding nothing. It's time to let this thing happen so that you can be.., you can do your job and she can do her job and whoever's not... If, if they're good, or they're not good enough, whoever we hire, we'll know that. But you need to give her the opportunity to hire somebody to help her instead of sittin' there and, and then complaining. And then you're not happy with it. Then it's.., and it's not fair.

So that what I have to say. And, and, and you all.., and, and stop talking these things to death. We're here in this City and we're sittin' out here and we need to go home.

**UNK. AUDIENCE:** Alright, Bessie.

[Audience clapping]

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, before we proceed with the next speaker, a member of the public submitted a card for the motion that was placed on the floor. He was advised that the acceptance of public cards for Item No. 20 was closed. What's the pleasure?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** We are going to continue to follow the process. Once the comments has been...

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Thank you, Madam Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...closed.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS::** Madam Chair?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Ms. Delores Williams.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS::** Did, did we allow the public to submit cards at that time, once there was a new motion on the floor?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** We did not.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS::** Well we..., because there's a new motion that wasn't on the Item, we're required to allow folks to submit a card.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Attorney.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS::** Because it wasn't on the Agenda.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS::** That's all...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Att'... I asked the question of the Attorney, and the Attorney instructed us to allow the public comment cards on the Item as it was labeled, and I followed the rendering from the Attorney on that matter. Thank you, sir.

**MS. D. WILLIAMS:** Mayor and Council, Chairman, each one of you. I, I live at 1219 West 9<sup>th</sup> Street, Riviera Beach.

[Inaudible comment]

**MS. D. WILLIAMS:** You can't hear me? [Pause].

I'm here to speak on..., I think... You all get up say Ms. Hoskins is doing a great job. If somebody's doing a great job, why can't you make it better and give her the tools she needs? Why you keep complaining you need a City Manager? If she' doing the job of the City Manager, she's taking it on herself. You say she volunteered, she accepted

it. I'm not trying to say nothing about her..., about the Rangers or nothing like that. Well, I think we have people that's been retired from here. The lady just got through spoke, she said she worked here for twenty some years. She can give her advice to help you in different departments. I think she said she worked in three departments. Well, give her the help she need. You say you don't wanna pay her? Okay. Don't pay her. She's doing a good job. If your conscious don't condemn, neither can I. Some of you have some bitterness and evilness against these people up here. Your heart and soul [inaudible] ya'll have these derogatory words to say about somebody.

You know what, what the scriptures say? When you make somebody' else life miserable, you can sleep, but when they're happy, you cannot sleep, 'cause some of you holdin' on the firing of this man and the firing of that. When are you gonna let it die? Let the lady stay right where she is. I don't know how long she wanna stay. Ya'll discussed that she set a time, right? There's a time and a place for all things. All things have a time.

And I, I want to say something else too she [inaudible] I want to say you say something about the railroad crossing here. You know, West Palm Beach, they have 12<sup>th</sup> Street of Palm Beach Lake, they built a overhead pass. Ya'll re'..., uh, remodel that railroad crossing. Why ya'll couldn't make an overhead pass? You got the fire station right here, Police Department. [Inaudible] emergency, why ya'll couldn't spend that money to build that thing so when the fire people..., if just for them, that when they come for emergency, they can get over to go see about us and we need the ambulance or we need the police? Huh?

And all this, this man keep getting u talkin' we're gonna do a recall [stammer]. 'Oh, we're gonna get rid of 'em. We're gonna do this here.' You don't know if you're gonna live to do all that.

[Audience exclamation]

**MS. D. WILLIAMS:** What you need to do, is get out and start getting votes and ballots for 2018 and 2020. What you wanna keep recalling? Don't know you're gonna reap what you sow? Recall. Go home and rest tonight and pray, ask God to help you. Give her the tool she need'. God is not even like that. He give us tools, he give us fruit of the spirit. It's fruit, not fruits, love, joy, gentleness, peace, longsuffering, kindness. And 1 Corinthians, 13<sup>th</sup> Chapter say, 'Love [inaudible].' It does not work against this brother. [Inaudible]...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

[Audience clapping]

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, that complete s the public comments.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay. Where're we..., where are we in discussion?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilman Davis, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** If I recall, my memory stores me right, on behalf of peace and everything, there's been a decision made with this Board previously, where the City Manager had the authority to go out and talk to Ms. Favors and anyone else who submitted a proposal on providing her with the support she needs to bring this City..., and to keep this City moving in the direction that so many others before us have committed so much time to do. This motion, unless there's something specific, specific that we not already made a decision on prior, which was about a few weeks ago, I would, I will support it, but if it's something identical to what we already discussed and voted on... Ms. Hoskins has already, from my understanding, been doing what we've already given her the authority to do with looking at proposals so they can it back to us so we can make a decision.

So this motion, from my understanding, is to do the same thing that we discussed, or to add to. We got three proposals that are submitted, so this source that you bring to the table, I think that's just something that, you know, if you wanna add that to Ms. Hoskins take a look at to support what she's already doing, I have no problem with it. You know? This is an organization that does a lot. I don't think there's even, even any costs associated with it. That's something Ms. Hoskins can just go out and do on her own. I do believe as someone who's been in the City twenty-nine years, she will do everything in her power to use every resource we have. And I think that's something that we can support and allow her to go ahead and do. These are all the instruments that we've told her previously, hey, you know, use all the instruments that you need to run this City forward. I'm not opposed to that, but, you know, when we make a decision, we have to allow her to do it, don't interfere and let it manifest and support her and push her and encourage her. That's the only way we're gonna get where we need to be. We have to encourage her, we have to encourage one another. We have to make sure that we don't lose focus as leaders. We can't lose focus. Our people, this community deserve the fact that we stay focused on making sure that our leader has what she needs until we make a decision on whoever that City Manager is, I don't know who that person's gonna be. I'm not gonna speak as if she may or may not [stammer] put her name in the hat. So, I'll just speak in support of what you wanna do, what you stated before, we supported that. So, we had the organization, the gentleman from Singer Island, that you brought before the Board, that..., some letter that you read that Marie Davis sent to us all

**COUNCILPERSON JULIE BOTEL:** He's not...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Oh, he changed his mind?

**UNK:** Mhmm.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I just wanna say... Oh, okay. Well, the gentleman before, Anita Favors, we also had one or two other proposals, so I'm trying to find out if this is another source that you wanna add to that list? I think that I'm comfortable with

that. You know? Because we need to give her whatever she want'..., whoever she needs to, to move forward. And I think, I mean, as a motion, you know, as a consensus, I think it's something we can just do and we can move forward with the next question.

**COUNCILPERSON JULIE BOTEL:** Madam...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS::** ...but to reach out to 'em and... Is there any cost associated, Councilperson Botel?

**COUNCILPERSON JULIE BOTEL:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Botel.

**COUNCILPERSON JULIE BOTEL:** I would be happy to amend my motion if the second would agree to an amendment, to say that I would make it a recommendation that the City Manager seek out the assistance of the, the group from the, the Florida City and County Managers Association to help her in her work. And I believe the cost is minimal. I think if we could support that as a Council, it would be wonderful. I think that would give her some, you know, an extra pair of hands and, and I think that she would well appreciate it. I think that she'd, she'd be willing to.., and if she'd be willing to do that, I think it would give her that extra, you know, extra person in the office that, that, you know anybody would appreciate having. So, I would.., I'd be happy to amend my motion to reflect that, and I appreciate your support.

Thank you.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well...

**COUNCILPERSON JULIE BOTEL:** If you would, if you would accept that, that as a second?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Give the second [inaudible]...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...Councilwoman Miller-Anderson.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. What may or may not be known is that I do believe Ms. Hoskins has already brought on someone to be the Assistant Manager, or at least the Acting Assistant Manager, so she does have some assistance now, and that is Mr. Willie Horton who is the Utilities Director. Am I correct Ms. Hoskins? [Pause]. Ms. Hoskins?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair? Mr. Horton has been brought on in a part-time basis to assist me with some of the day to day operations.



**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Oaky. In the memo that was sent out, it didn't say that he was gonna be part-time. I thought that he.., it said that.., well, it actually said, originally, that he was the.., being designated as the Acting City Manager in your absence while you went out of town. And then, when I questioned about that part of it, that's when you said that he would be the Assistant City Manager in that time that you're out. And then, in our conversations the other day, it was that he would now be the Acting Assistant City Manager and then he, in turn said, 'cause he was at the meeting, that he had also, or between the two of you, had allowed Mr. Leighton Walker, who just became the Assistant Utility District Director to be the Acting Utility District Director over at the Utility Department.

So, there's been some changes that everyone may or may not know about in terms of having some additional assistance already in the City Manager's Department that was not there before we started talking about bringing on the additional help. Now, with the additional help, Ms., City Councilwoman Botel is speaking of, we are.., if there's a fee associated with that, we're now going to say we're going to pay some people to come in to, to help Ms. Hoskins in her role, when we're already paying [stammer], and I'm thinking in terms of funding here, we're paying her as the City Manager for the \$150 or the \$168, depending on where we are with it right now, and then we're going to now bring on additional help outside to come in and whatever that fee is, that would be another associated cost, and then on top of that, we already have Mr. Willie Horton that is there assisting. So I, I would not be willing to keep my second there, unless we had all of that.., all of the figures and everything worked out and we knew exactly what we were talking about doing. If they're coming on to volunteer, fine. If Mr. Horton was not there, fine, but some things have changed since we had the initial conversation. And that just happened as of last Wednesday or Thursday, I believe it was.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS::** Madam Chair?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** ...Chair? There is an amended motion on the floor that has not been seconded. Either it's seconded or it does...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** It is not.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** ...for a lack of a second.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** It is not.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It is not...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS::** Madam...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...seconded?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** One moment, please. You..., are you saying you are not seconding?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I'm not.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay. So that motion dies.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Madam Chair?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Thank you.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** One moment. Let me identify..., let me acknowledge you. Chair Pro Tem, you're recognized.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Madam Chair, we took a..., we took the comments for Item 20. We finally got ourselves back to Item 20. Is that the Item that we're on, Madam Clerk? Through the matter..., through the Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Okay. No, that motion died because it was a lack of a second. Excuse me...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** So, I, Madam Clerk...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** There is still the original motion [inaudible]...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** [Inaudible].

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** The original motion...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** That did not die.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** It was amended, she amended it and it died. So, you can't go back...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** The amendment...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...to her...

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** The amendment...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** The amendment...

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** ...died.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...died.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** We can go back to the original.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** No. She cannot go back to the original because...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yes, she can.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...she amended her motion, her motion died.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** The amended motion died.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** [Inaudible] cannot go back to her original. Ya'll just came from a class with Mr. what's his, Russell...

[Chuckles]

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** She can't..., you can't... Just because...

[Inaudible comment]

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...when you amend your... When you amend your motion...

[Inaudible comments]

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** When you amend your motion and your motion dies...

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...your motion dies for lack of...

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** I have asked...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...a second.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** ...my Staff to go and get my Robert's Rules of Order book.

[Inaudible comments]

**UNK:** I believe the original motion does stand.

**COUNCILPERSON JULIE BOTEL:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Okay. But...

**COUNCILPERSON JULIE BOTEL:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Excuse me.

**COUNCILPERSON JULIE BOTEL:** I withdraw...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...Let me finish [inaudible]...

**COUNCILPERSON JULIE BOTEL:** I withdraw my... Madam Chair? I withdraw my motion.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you. The motion has...

[Inaudible dais comments]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...been withdrawn.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair?

[Inaudible dais comments]

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Are...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** [Inaudible].

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** If it's the pleasure of the Board, if you all are through discussing Item No. 20...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** No.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** We...

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Which was to authorize the Ci'..., the City Manager to hire department heads...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** I make...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I believe that...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...a motion that...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I have a question...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...we authorize...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...the City Manager to hire department heads.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Davis, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I, I would like to potentially second that motion but I don't think there's no motion needed because the statute and the Charter's very clear, on what authorities the City Manager has, she is..., and it says in the Charter, she is..., he or she is required to hire. So, we're not allowed to enter in any agreement, or any motion, that is the total opposite of what she has stated through our..., through our Charter. It's very clear. And that's why I asked that question, remain' any comments, refrain from any comments outside of the law that was stated to us. And we are not allowed to enter into..., and it was stated that... I follow all laws. And I just hope that all, this entire Board, wants to continue to do that. Let's not get confused on throwing things out there, saying we follow some laws. No, we should be following all laws. It is not acceptable not to follow a law. It's not acceptable to throw it out there like that, but what is acceptable, is we stay focused and just do what the Charter says do.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair?

**COUNCILPERSON JULIE BOTEL:** Madam Ch'... Sorry.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I believe that the City Manager has to be recognized.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Just to clarify some of the comments that Councilwoman Miller-Anderson made, on Thursday, on...

[Inaudible comment]

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** ...Thursday... On Thursday, a memo was sent out from Legal speaking of the dual roles of the Executive Director for Utility District. The dual role was to address when I go on vacation in June, and trying to prepare for that vacation date, that memo was sent out. So, Ms., Councilwoman Miller-Anderson asked, you know, why was it being sent out so early, and I had, you know spoke with Mr. Horton about him possibly assisting me as the Interim City Manager. We had some discussions and when we met with Councilwoman Miller-Anderson on Monday, I spoke with her and told her that, you know, he would be assisting me. Now, he will be doing that on a part-time basis, also, along with working over in the Utility District. Just wanted to make that clarification for everyone.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Um...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Just to [stammer]...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Davis...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Please, pretty please.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** You're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Is he receiving any salary increase?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** He has accepted the position without a salary increase.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Okay.

[Inaudible comments]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Mayor, you, you called out.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Did you have a...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Does that mean...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** [Inaudible].

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...he's, he's not gonna be getting two checks, then, right? That's what that means?

[Inaudible comment]

**MAYOR MASTERS:** He's gonna be gettin' one check from Utility...

[Inaudible comment]

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...Director. Okay.

UNK [Inaudible].

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I had a... I really like what Councilwoman, former Councilwoman Billie Brooks said, we're looking at something that's, that's pretty deep here. So, I have a question for the Attorney because there were people who said that if the new City Manager had just come in, and if a new City Manager did not like someone

or did not wanna work with that person, that they could just fire that person. I think they have to have cause, don't they? They can't just do that

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** [Inaudible].

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I'm asking.., hold on. I'm, I'm asking the City Attorney to, to answer that.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** The Charter specifically provides that department heads must be removed based upon justifiable cause.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Exactly. So, therefore, that option would not be made available to whoever the new City Manager would be, if we go down this, this, this road. So, we would be handcuffing the.., a new City Manager. He would be forced to accept the cabinet that he didn't appoint. And I, I just don't think that's fair.

Now, the next thing, the next thing is...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...[pause]. I, I got distracted so that's okay. I'll come back. When people are talking, I get a little distracted. So, I'll come back. I'll come back. Madam Chair, I'll come back.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Miller-Anderson, did I hear you? Did you ask to be recognized or was...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...Councilwoman Botel?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Nothing?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I know I'm right.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** We're with the amended.., we, we got rid of the amended. Where are we with that?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** The, the amen'.., the amended...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Died.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...failed, and the...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Right. So...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...and the original motion was withdrawn.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** You withdrew your...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...original?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Oh, I remember now, Madam Chair. May I just finish this point?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes, Mayor, you're recognized.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you. A couple weeks ago, the City Manager had stated that one of the Councilpersons and the Mayor had come in and out asking questions and she felt somewhat pressured to, to go ahead and make a decision. And if that be the case then, then I'm concerned that in, in the future, that the Manager must not be put in a position to be pressured and make decisions based upon what one or two people want. It has to be independent, it has to be what she wants to do. So therefore, I like the idea of giving her help make.., to make some decisions with a committee, or with someone and that way it's, it's not all just one person. I do think that, I think someone mentioned that there's a couple positions, maybe, that ought to be filled now, and if that's the case, then that's, you know, that's Public Works or something like that, but the Police Department and some of your major.., not to demean any other departments, but some of those major departments that the City Manager has to work with day to day, particularly the Police Department and a few others, I think those need to wait until we have a City Manager. I think we need to set a timetable. I think it's fair to Ms. Hoskins, it's fair to the residents, it's fair to the Council, that there should be a timeline set that when thirty or forty-five days, we're gonna hire a City Manager. Period. And, and do it, and not allow any distractions or anything to detour or distract us. But, in the meantime, if there's a couple.., she's hired her assistant, so that's, you know, that's, that's been a gap that's been filled which was probably needed. But some of the key positions I think ought to wait for the new City Manager to make those decisions. Particularly if it's gonna be thirty days from now, or sixty days at the most. We have existed this [stammer] time period and we have gotten along fine. Mr. Finance Director.., I mean, the Mr. Purchasing Director, has been doing a great job, the interim position. So, we can move on, but let's not rush, let's not rush this judgment to judgment, or rush to make a decision. We don't wanna tie the hands of the new person that'd be coming in, particularly when he can't fire them.

Thank you.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam, Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Miller-Anderson, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. So, we're talking about discussion and deliberation about vacant departments. I already kinda spoke earlier and said that I was not in support of it and I explained the reasons why. So, if we are at that point, I



already explained why I don't support it and, and nothing has changed in the last hour. So, that's, that's where I am with that.

What I wanted earlier was regarding some other issues that we were talking about under the amended motion and the motion that we had originally. So, I., that's why I'm holding my comment for that part. But, as it stands with this Item, I, I don't support it. And I know that we're talking about the Charter allows her to do the hiring, but as a Council, we did all agree to hold off until we did get the permanent City Manager, so we weren't thinking about the Charter at point in time when we all agreed that we were going to go ahead and let her., not allow her to fill those positions, but now we're following the Charter in that respect. I don't feel that., I understand that we pull the Charter in when we wanna make it convenient for what we., the, the idea we wanna push and I, I, I get that, but I don't support this Item here.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you. Mr. Davis, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** In the spirit of peace and cooperation again, that motion was taken against our Charter. The Charter wasn't available at the time, but after, you know, every meeting, I try to go back and...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** What wasn't available?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...watch and pull the information. It was anticipated that during the selection process, if you go through interviews and the applications that we all were supposed to select, that was supposed to be done. Nowhere in mind., right mind, I woulda thought that five folks agreed to make a decision and then two just choose... I mean, whatever., you have your reason, I'm not here to judge you for it, but all those things are taken into consideration because we were supposed to have been in a different position of selecting a City Manger but because folks didn't do it at that time, that's pushed us further back. If I woulda known that woulda taken place, I wouldn't have entered into that agreement, 'cause I also [inaudible] understanding that this entire Board was gonna sup'., review, research, make phone calls and discuss, based upon the information they provided. But, that didn't take place. So, now that that didn't take place, you put., you crippled the entire... Well, we're ain't gonna say we're crippled, and I stand corrected because we still can make a decision. And, when Ms. Jones was here, when she came on board, and I remember, at the time, we had the City, the Finance Director, we had a Fire Chief, we had a Police Chief, we had a Utility Director. She ran through her assessment, she made her decision, she kept people, she moved people, but there were no vacancies then. When Bill Wilkins came on board, the same thing. When Tony Smith came on board, the same thing. There were people in place that did a professional job of giving them a true opportunity to assess what skills did they have. Ms. Hoskins has been judged without a evaluation. She deserves the right to go through a professional evaluation, based upon a tool that's been sent down from the state or the county, that we can use to measure how a wonderful job shoe's doing and what improvements need to be made.

But since, you know, if there's a motion that's needs to be required to do this all..., to undo what we did, but the Charter's very clear. Now, if we have to..., go into that motion to undo it, then I will support that motion if you put it back on the floor.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair, did... Just, thirty seconds.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Miller-Anderson.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I do want to..., since it's come up a number of times in regards to myself not providing any names with the City Manager candidates that did apply. As I stated then, I did not feel that any of those candidates met the requirements that I thought we needed here in Riviera Beach, as all of you did for the candidates that you put forth. Now, I did submit an answer. It's not like I didn't do anything, I did submit an answer and I said why I did not select anyone. So, when we came here that night, the three na'..., people identified who they wanted. At that time, you could've moved forward, but Ms. Davis Johnson said she didn't, you know, think it would be appropriate to..., for a person to come in on a 3-2, it would be more appropriate so that we all kinda got on the same page and were able to agree on the same person, or be able to pull someone in. And that's how we left it at that. So, I mean, you all, because you're in the majority, if you wanna move forward with what you have, then we would..., I would have to fall in line with that. That doesn't change my position, but if you want to be the majority, as you were when you submitted your names, then if that's what you want to do, you can. Because that's what happened on that night. It was there. You had three Council Members that did submit something. I did not because I did not feel they were qualified for the position. So, to say I'm handicapping or crippling the, the, the structure here is inappropriate and it is irrelevant because you all have already identified your names. So, if you want to decide to do something and move forward, you, you have the three to do that. Or, we can go ahead and decide again what we want to do. Obviously, not tonight, but we can decide at another meeting to be able to talk about the City Manager timeline once again.

So those are, those are the choices. But, I don't..., that, you know, for me, I've already answered where I was with the discussion and deliberation Item about the department heads, but I felt the need to try to address that because it keeps coming up.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And I'm done with that.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** One moment please. Let, let me just make one quick point of clarification. Yes, I did say that we didn't want to come..., have a City Manager come in on a 3-2, but that conversation certainly was not to stop the process by which we would make a selection for short listing. I just need that to be clarified. What I would like to suggest, at this particular point, is that we direct Staff to develop a timeline.

I'm looking at the timeline that was put out and it was roughly about four months that was given, but it does not require that we go back four months because we have a pool of candidates that we can short list and we can come up with a timeframe that is going to be suitable to this Board because we are not making any progress, we are simply bantering and going back and forth, with no resolve. And I believe that it is important for us to move and to identify candidates that can be considered. And, as I stated earlier, if we so choose that once we get through that interviewing process, or that short listing process, if there is a determination that we don't want to move forward with any of those people, we will then make a decision as a collective body as to how we will move forward.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Botel, you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Thank you. I have to say that I too did not find any candidates in that pool to be satisfactory. And I also have to say that going forward, I do not feel the confidence in our own HR Department, given what has happened most recently. And so, I would like to have a conversation, not tonight, but I would like to have a conversation at some future meeting, about how we will proceed with the search. Again, I think that we might need to look at help from League of Cities, or help from some outside organization, maybe a search consultant, someone who can give us assistance in finding appropriate candidates and in vetting those candidates because of my reluctance to put that in the hands of the current HR Manager.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Mayor, you're recognized.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you. Just thirty seconds. In the spirit of...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** [Inaudible].

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...com'..., in the spirit of compromise, [pause], I think Ms. Newbold mentioned earlier, if the Manager is going to appoint some department heads, can we make that appointments temporary appointments or some other word, if you wanna use it, until we get..., until we finish the process of selecting a, a permanent City Manager? And that way we would be in compliance with the Charter, and we would be helping the Manager with these departments that need a Chair. So, I, I'm, I'm offering a compromise of a temporary..., these temporary positions, that way the new Manager would not..., hands would not be ti'..., tied. He will be able to choose his department heads because they're temporary. They only will serve until we select a new City Manager.

Thank you, Madam Chair.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Davis, you're...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Thank you so much. I support what you stated. This is something I do believe that, nothing against HR, but this is something the Board can make a decision on, that if we wanna make a decision by the end of June, we need to make.., we can put some things together and make a decision, end of June, July, whatever the... Listen, I'm [inaudible] what you wanna do. We can't keep kicking this, this down the road. We've been discussing this for almost a year and we need to make a decision. It's very clear that we have to move forward. You know? This City deserves moving forward. We all have our special criteria and what we'd like to see in a City Manager. One of the things that, at least I can only speak of from my position is, you know, when I saw some of the candidates and I didn't know.., 99% of them had no clue who they were but I did make some phone calls to find out where'd they get their degrees from, who are some of the folks they worked for and.., folks said some great things about a lot of folks I had no clue about, but I think it's only.., it would do a disservice for someone to put that much time into a resume, at least allow t hem to come and interview and see what they really have to say, then you can make a decision based upon what you hear, what you did your background on, Staff will do a background check, or we hire a company to do the background information. [Stammer], but we need to go ahead and make a decision. If we can't make a decision, we need to go on ahead and make decision and let Ms. Karen Hoskins run this ship and just move forward and let her have the same resources we give outsiders that come do.., run our City. She's from this community, she's been here for twenty-nine years. If we don't wanna move forward with the selection process, we need to go on ahead and make her the permanent City Manager, let her have all the same tools that we gave everybody else. She's getting underpaid, she went through the furlough process with our employees, created a furlough to keep people from losing their jobs, she's understaffed and we're asking Ms. Hoskins, and I always give her a great deal of respect, to do all these great things when folks are trynna micromanager her and tell her what to do, keep her confused, public records requests, all these emails. No. Let's allow her to be treated just like anyone else that came before her. She should be allowed to have the same equipment, the same Staff, to have a real assessment on what she can and can't do. And that's only fair to her and the City. But, we can't keep kicking this can down the road. We, we can't. You know? Me personally...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Huh?

[Inaudible dais comment]

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I have offered a compromise.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Well absolutely it's a second.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Attorney.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** I can't tell you in detail what they are, but I do know that there are regulations in terms of employment practices that impact and limit the time period that people can be placed in temporary positions.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mhmm.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** And, we need to have..., maybe HR can give us some impact on that but..., so we'll know the timeframe, for your purposes, that people will be in temporary...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...temporary positions.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** HR is here.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Ch'... Madam Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes, Madam City Manager.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** That limit is one year. For temporary positions. People can only serve in temporary positions for one year.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** For a period of one year. Okay. I., it was a direction, it's wasn't a motion. I didn't pass the gavel. I just...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** I made a motion and Mr. Davis seconded it.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Oh. What was the motion, please?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** The motion was that we allow Ms. Hoskins...

**UNK:** Can't hear you.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** I'm sorry thank you. My motion was that we allow Ms. Hoskins, in role as the City Manager, to hire department heads to fill vacant decisions. If...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Vacant positions.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Vacant positions. Yes, sir.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** My second still stands.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Clerk.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Botel?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** No.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** No.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Hubbard?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Davis Johnson?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** That motion is approved with Councilpersons Botel and Miller-Anderson dissenting.

**UNK. AUDIENCE:** Remember they said now, remember what they did, remember what they did.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Point of order, sir.

**UNK. AUDIENCE:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Point of order, sir.

**UNK. AUDIENCE:** [inaudible] ya'll wrong.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Point of order.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, we are now at Item No. 26.

**UNK. AUDIENCE:** Ya'll wrong [inaudible]. TD's wrong. All ya'll up here are wrong.

**26. ITEM NO. 26**

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY: DISCUSSION                      REGARDING                      COMPENSATION  
STUDY/PAYROLL TRANSPARENCY**

**CITY MANAGER: KAREN L. HOSKINS (561) 845-4010**

[Inaudible comments]

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, we do have public comment cards for this Item. The acceptance of public comment cards for this Item is now closed.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Are you making a presentation, Madam?

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Are you making a presentation? How are...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...we going with the.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Call Mr. Sherman up.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** As it relates to the, to the memo that Mr. Sherman shared with you all, I would like to call him up so he can talk about the allegations.

[Inaudible comment]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Twenty..., that is Item 26.

[Pause]

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** Good evening. Randy Sherman, Director of Finance and Administrative Services.

The first thing that I would like to say is, I'd like to correct what Ms. Hoskins actually just said, I am not making allegations. What I have come across are some areas, and I tried to be very careful in the memo, of transactions that I think occurred that the Council was not aware of. I was not aware of them, until I began to audit the payroll after the first payroll process under the new pay plan. I think I made it very clear in the memo that I did not, or had not been provided all of the information that I normally would've been provided before a payroll such as that, and once I had the opportunity to go through, again, there were some transactions that I thought needed to be brought to your attention. And, my recommendation in the memo was that I thought that, you know, you should investigate and either bless them or, you know, maybe rescind them, take whatever action you felt you needed to do. It's not my role to take those, those actions, it's my role to bring them to your attention and for you to take the actions.

The first one I think that, I think people wanna focus on, and I don't disagree that we need to address this contract with, with the City Manager. The issue that I would like to bring, again, to your attention, is you all know that the City is under very intense scrutiny, and you all know I have probably challenged every one [chuckle] of you on certain expenses and things that you've all done. You, you buy a ticket for an event, we wanna know who's going to the event. If you, you wanna give community benefits, we wanna make sure it's benefitting somebody in the community. We're trying to make sure that all of those loopholes are closed tighter than tight, so when the IG does come in here, that those things are all clear. The issue with the contract with Ms. Hoskins is, I do not believe, and Ms. Hoskins has a, a different belief and that's fine, and I want you to know that, you know, I respect Ms. Hoskins and I think, again, she has been doing a decent job as a City Manager. It's a tough, it's a tough position. And it has no'.., this has nothing to do with any of that, it's a matter of transparency and closing a loop that I believe needs to be closed. So, the question on this one is, is Ms. Hoskins, under the terms of her contract, you have two contracted employees in the City, the City Manager and the City Attorney. Those are your only two contracted employees. And as, you know, even Mr. Degraffenreidt has said before, we have to live within the four corners of the contract. What does the contract say? That's what we have to abide by. So, unfortunately, [chuckle], in the City, we have a lot of examples of where we've had Interim City Managers. And, even Ms. Hoskins, you know, pointed towards Gloria Shuttlesworth, the former Finance Director, she stepped up, similar to what Ms. Hoskins did. And this is the terms that she actually, like Ms. Hoskins, entered into a contract when she stepped in as Interim.

Now, the first thing I wanna point out, this is section one of her contract and it's entitled, 'Employment and Salary.' And, if you look at what Ms. Shuttlesworth did, she came down and she said, 'Ms. Shuttlesworth shall receive a twenty percent increase to her current base pay of \$121,348, plus any other salary increase as granted to administrative personnel.' Now Ms. Shuttlesworth took her current salary and they raised it twenty percent. Everything that went along with her current salary got raised twenty percent. That was the contract that was agreed to with Ms. Shuttlesworth.

The next person in line was Ruth Jones. Again, section two, salary and evaluation. What Ms. Jones did, she took an annual salary and then she put in her escalators for the next three years.., two years, I guess it is. Two years. Ruth Jones did not get longevity despite the number of years that she was here, her contract didn't provide for it, she didn't get it, we lived by the terms of, of this agreement. Wanna point out.

Now, here's Pamala Ryan's contract. Again, you have contracted employees, Pamala Ryan serving as the City Attorney. If you look at Pamala Ryan's contract, again, section two, 'Salary and Term of Agreement.' You can see in the third line, it says:

Employee shall receive and be entitled to all longevity and cost of living wage adjustment increases which the City grants to other management employees.



So, in Ms. Ryan's contract, she not only stipulated that she got..., received longevity, Ms. Ryan also received any COLA increases that came along. So, she set her salary at \$145,000, and then as management got a two percent raise, a three percent, whatever it was, her \$145,000 changed. But she was very clear, under the salary section, that she also received longevity. Attorney Degraffenreidt's contract is the very same. I think he probably used the same language that Ms. Ryan had. And again, it says, 'Entitled to all longevity and cost of living wage adjustment increases.'

This is Danny Jones. Danny Jones is ver'..., did not enter into a contract. What he did, is he accepted ten percent. Again, he get ten percent on his base, he got ten percent on his longevity. So again, it wasn't a contract that you entered into with him. He actually just took the ten percent that's provided for in the Ordinance. Troy Perry did the same thing. Troy Perry did not enter into a contract, he just took the ten percent. And again, it just what was allowed under the Ordinance.

So then, get back to Ms. Hoskins' contract. It was presented to the Board on December 20<sup>th</sup>, and this is the copy of the Agenda Item. And what I would ask you to focus on is the background summary and I'll read it 'cause it's down at the bottom and maybe everybody can't read it. It says:

On November 22, 2017, in a special City Council meeting, Ms. Hoskins was interviewed and hired as the Interim City Manger for a period not to exceed ninety days. To avoid missing the ninety day deadline, at the December 6, 2017 Council, uh, Council..., excuse me, Council approved, by a 4 to 1 vote to employ Ms. Hoskins as the City Manager until a new City Manager is hired at the rate of a hundred...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mr. Degraffenreidt?

...fifty thousand dollars plus benefits.

So now, you go to the term of her contract. Number one, salary, \$150,000 is not even listed in here. There's absolutely no discussion about longevity, there's no discussion about receiving the raises that management may receive. It just says?

The City shall employ Ms. Hoskins as City Manager at the City of Riviera Beach, Florida pursuant to the Charter of the City of Riviera Beach for a period commencing on December 6, 2017 and ending either when a permanent City Manager is hired and begins work or when either party elects to terminate this agreement.

Now, what Ms. Ho'..., and so my issue is, is it does not provide in here for longevity. What Ms. Hoskins has said is that, well, longevity's not a salary, it's a benefit. We went through Shuttlesworth contract, we went through two Attorneys contracts, they both address longevity under salary. Salary is reported to the IRS as a, as..., longevity, I'm sorry, is reported to the IRS as part of your salary. I do not see any indication here how we can come to the conclusion of longevity is a benefit not salary. To further make this point, here's the language out of Attorney Degraffenreidt's contract. It's the exact same wording

as the language under Ms. Hoskins' contract, you get all the other benefits accruing to the City. If longevity was a benefit, why would it be in Mr. Degraffenreidt's contract in two separate places? He addressed longevity under the salary section, as did every other previous Manager.

Now, the other issue that I would point out, and City Clerk, thank you for doing all the research on this, here's the Ordinance:

The Ordinance of the City of Riviera Beach, Palm Beach County, Florida amending Section 2-117 entitled, 'Longevity increases of Division 3 entitled, 'Salary Plan.'

Longevity is part of your salary plan, it is not a benefit. So, that's where the interpretation comes, saying, when you voted on that contract on December 20<sup>th</sup>, the background Agenda said, '\$120,000. Nowhere in the contract did it say longevity was going to be added, that's where we have the disagreement. Do I think anything [chuckle], you know, intentionally was done? No, I don't. I've known Karen for five and a half years, actually, a little bit longer than that. She's honorable, reputable, you know, great long-term employee. Do I think she was trying to do something deceptive here? I do not. Okay? My point to Ms. Hoskins on May 2<sup>nd</sup> I guess it was, was it's not clear. Your contract doesn't say it, you should not be getting it until the Council is aware of it and votes on it. Now, there's one other additional step I did, I did talk to the Councilwoman who was Chair when the contract was approved, I asked her if she was aware of it, 'cause I do understand that conversations happen off, off screen sometimes, and the answer was, 'No, I was not aware that were approving longevity.' As, I believe Mr. Towns said earlier, if we had just brought back an Agenda Item to get clarification, but that wasn't the direction that Ms. Hoskins wanted to go. So, that's where we end up in this place right now. I think it's clearly under the salary plan, I think it's clearly part of salary. If you want to provide longevity, bring back a, a Resolution [chuckle], we'll put longevity in, but the contract, again, with-in the boundaries of that contract do not provide for longevity.

And I'll answer any questions anybody may have.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** [Inaudible] to far down the road. I need him to point out something to me. Can you go back a couple of screens where you noted to us that there was nothing in there about the amount of salary, period?

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** Right here.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Okay. Employment and salary. So, because it says nothing about salary, was she then expected not to get paid, period?

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** No. There...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Because...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** ...was'...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...it wasn't there?

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** No. There was an earlier motion when she became Interim that the salary would be \$150,000. She then brought the contract forward. In the background information, she put \$150,000.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** But her salary already included longevity when she came into the Interim position. Is that correct?

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** Her old salary as...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** She did not...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** ...as Assistant...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** She did not...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** ...Finance Director...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Right.

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** ...yes.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** We didn't go back and take that away or, or...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** Oh...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...you're saying we did, as you pointed out, is to give her the percentage increase on top of her salary? Her salary already has the longevity in it. So, as you pointed out... Oh, let's go back to Gloria Shuttlesworth's page for a second. And I'm, you know, I just.., I'm not the finance guru, so I wanna just make sure that I am understanding what you're saying. So, as you, as you pointed out to us, longevity is part of a salary, and like you said, it, it's some are interpreting it as, as a benefit. But, let's, for the sake of this conversation, and, and for you to.., for my edification:

Ms. Shuttlesworth shall receive twenty percent increase to her current base pay, plus any other salary increase granted to other administrative personnel.

So, Mrs. Shuttlesworth is already getting longevity. Her salary, based on what you're saying, her salary included that. Now, she has been asked to be the City Manager, so she's gonna get a twenty percent increase. But still, nothing says that we will go back and gut her base salary of the longevity piece. So, if my.., if, if, as you say, it's.., the longevity is a part of the salary. When we met her, her salary included longevity. We're keeping it as salary, just for the sake of this conversation...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** I'm not sure who we're talking about now though.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Is it...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** [Chuckle].

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** We're, we're talking about Mrs. Hoskins'...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** Okay.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...salary

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** Okay.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** And we're using your example, uh, one of your examples about the definition of salary and the role..., and, and the contracts of Managers, and I'm only making..., I'm only asking you for two points of clarification.

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** Ok.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** One, you said salary includes..., longevity is included in salary. So that's a given, right there for Mrs. Shuttlesworth. Because we're asking her..., Mrs. Shuttlesworth, at this point, to be the City Manager, she gets her twenty percent. When..., the base salary that Mrs. Hoskins came to the table with already included the longevity, so we weren't even discussing that. What we were giving her was a percentage increase based..., well, an increase based on her, promotion if you will, or her temporary role.

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** But that's exactly what you didn't do. You didn't say her current salary plus twenty percent. Then, everything that went along with her current salary..., as, as you see the language here on Mrs. Shuttlesworth, okay, you said \$150,000. And then, when the contract came back, the background says \$150,000. It doesn't say \$150,000 plus any other salary increase. It doesn't say \$150,000...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** But amounts had been done...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** ...plus longevity.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** But amounts had been done...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** It says...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...in the final salary was just put there.

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** Was put there.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** But it already included the longevity. Go back for me to the other page where there was no salary mentioned. If you would. [Pause]. Right there. So, there you say she'.., the City Manager.., she's been hired and began to work and can be ter'.., terminated when either party elects to. There, we state nothing at all about how much she will be making. So, would, would, would one conclude that she's not to get paid at all? Because...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** No.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...it wasn't in there that in the...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** No.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...in the [inaudible]...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** Again, you had, you had a motion, back when you made her the Interim, that her salary would be \$150,000. That was reconfirmed with the background information here, that the salary be \$150,000. If you go back and watch the meeting, Ms. Hoskins says her salary will be \$150,000, right? No discussion about longevity.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** But she already had longevity in...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** No. But you ch'...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...her base salary.

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** But, when you made her a contract employee, you changed her salary to \$150,000.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** [Inaudible].

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** As you saw with Jones, she didn't get longevity. 'Wasn't in her contract. So, it's not like longevity is automatic. You go to a contract, it is what it is in the contract.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Ms. Jones didn't... I think you're, I think... And, and I'm..., and I'm gonna let Mrs. Hoskins talk for herself, but I'm just saying, Ms. Jones didn't come to us from another tenured position already with longevity in the box.

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** No. But she was here long enough to get it.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** But she did not come to us with that. We're talking about someone like Gloria Shuttlesworth, and someone like Ms. Hoskins, who came from another position and advanced up. So, while we broke Mrs. Shuttlesworth out and said

\$121,000 plus twenty percent. We could back into the one'.., we could break the \$150,000 out and tell you what percentage of an increase that was.

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** You could.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** But we... How can we go back to her base salary and take out the longevity that she's worked for for thirty years? She already had longevity when she sat down to the table to negotiate, so we weren't even.., so, we couldn't even discuss that, she came to the table with that. So the increase we're asking, you say, hey, you're making a hundred and thirty some thousand dollars, we are now.., and we'll give you \$150,000 if you'll be the City Manager, but she came to the table with that hundred and thirty something, and longevity was included. So, that's where you're confusing me, especially when you give me an example of Gloria Shuttlesworth. You, you, you kinda.., you're showing me one thing with your, with your example...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** No. My point...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...states a whole other.

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** The issue is, Ms. Hubbard, every time you've had an Interim, you've, you've done something a little bit different. Okay? But again, it's the terms of the contract. And the issue is, is the contract does not address longevity. If you want to address longevity, amend the contract [chuckle].

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** The contract...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** That, that's fine.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** The contract doesn't even address the salary.

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** It, it do'...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Based on what you showed us.

[Inaudible comment]

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** ...it doesn't. You're absolutely correct, it doesn't.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** I mean, I mean, based on what you showed us, so we had to...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** Yeah.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...we had to use common sense, the fact that...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** We used...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...this is an amendment.

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** We use common sense, you're...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** To the...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** ...absolutely right.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...too the.., an amendment to what was already in place. When she came over, she had a base salary that included longevity. So now you're saying, because we gave her an, an increase, she is to.., we shoulda backed out the longevity? But over here, the example you showed me, longevity stayed in place for Mrs. Shuttlesworth.

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** Because that's how she calculated her new salary. This, this Board voted a specific dollar amount. You didn't use a percentage. You voted a specific dollar amount of \$150,000.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** So...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** And when you talk', [stammer], to [chuckle]...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** But if you're gonna use that as an example, then the content of that example has to apply.

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** My, my point of using all these examples, Ms. Hubbard, is the fact that every one of these has longe'.., those that have longevity, it's under the salary section. Your Ordinance says it's under the salary section.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Okay.

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** Ms. Hoskins' point is saying she's eligible for it under the benefits section, and I'm telling you longevity is not a benefit, it is a salary. It's a methodology to calculate what your salary is. And the, the contract...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** She's entitled to it under the...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** The contract...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...[inaudible] benefits.

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** The... But, at the \$150,000 that you approved.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** She's entitled to it...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** If you wanna amend that, amend it. I.., that's fine.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** I, I didn't ask that...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** That, that's...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair?

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** ...up to the Board to do that.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Uh...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** And that's, and that's the issue of just being transparent over what we are doing.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** One moment. The Attorney wanted to weigh in. Mr. Degraffenreidt, you're recognized.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** I, I'm looking at the provisions in the Code that addresses longevity increases, and I'd like to read it to you. It says:

In order to reward faithful, satisfactory, continued services, the City of Riviera Beach will grant the following longevity increases to it's employees beginning October 1, 1965.

And it gives a list of the increases. And, the last sentence says longevity increases will apply to appointed personnel as part of the [inaudible]. It will apply to appointed personnel.

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** And, and...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** She was an appointed person to that position. And it seems consistent with what the language of the increase says, and I think that during your conversations, there was nothing indicated that there was to be a diminishment of her property rights from her prior employment. As a matter of fact, you all made provisions that if anything happened, she would go back and not lose anything. So, I don't understand.., I'm not understanding why...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** 'Cause...



**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...there's a problem...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** 'Cause, Mr. Degraffenreidt...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...if the contract said that she would be entitled to all the benefits of other management...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** That's what it says.

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** Benefits.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** And it says that appointed personnel are entitled to longevity increases.

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** And longevity is not a benefit, Mr. Degraffenreidt.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** It doesn't say anything...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** And you know that., and you know...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...about benefits.

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** And again, I'm gonna quote you...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** The contract.

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** ...from when you were...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** The contract... And, I'm sticking...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** ...attacking Mr. Evans.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...with the contract. I'm sticking...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** Stay within...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...with the contract.

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** ...the four corners of that contract.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** And the contract says she's entitled to the benefits of other...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** [Inaudible].

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...management personnel. That section...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** [Inaudible].

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...says, these longevity increase apply to our employees generally, and specifically says, it applies to appointed personnel.

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** Then, Ms. Jones is due her longevity.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** She didn't ask for it. She didn't put it in her contract.

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** Neither did...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** And sh'...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** ...Ms. Hoskins.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** But the language...

**UNK:** [Inaudible].

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...is there that she's specifically entitled to the same benefits of other management per'... You got it.

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** You keep going back to...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** You got it.

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** ...the word benefits.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** [Stammer]...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** It's a salary. It's under Section 3...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** That section...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** ...salary plan.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...does not define it as a salary [inaudible]...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** [Chuckle].

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** Therein lies...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** [Inaudible].

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** Therein...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Point of order, please.

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** ...lies the debate.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Point of order. Please? Point of order.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** We cannot all talk over each other.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilman Davis and then...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** That was me...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...Councilwoman Miller-Anderson. Oh.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And then him.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Did I overhe'...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Ma'...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Pardon?

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I, I think he was first, and then...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I, I...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...you, and then...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I can wait. I, I'll go last.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Do you have the full contract? Can, can you pull up the full contract because...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** I, I don't have it on the s'...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** ...slide.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** But this is the thing with the.., what Mr. Degraffenreidt is speaking to about the benefits, the, the section that you're talking about, which is Section 3 and benefits. And it says.., and, and.., it says the City shall provide Ms. Hoskins with all of the benefits accruing to City employees in, in administrative positions and the following increase benefits which have been afforded to prior City Managers. And then it goes on to list what those benefits are. A) provide a car allowance at \$500 a month, B) pay any reasonable, customary travel and expenses, C) the City Manager's entitled to a twenty-five vacation day, D) pay for life insurance, E) pay on a bi-weekly basis defer compensation. Those are the benefits that are listed. So, we're, we're combining two.., and so, Mr. Degraffenreidt, you're combining the two sections. Ms...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** [Inaudible]and other position.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** It does not speak to it either.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** It does not speak to it either. It, it clearly lists.., it says, in administrative positions and the following increased benefits which have been afforded to Ci'.., prior City Managers. In those other contracts, it says the s'.., basically, the same thing actually. This particular contract has a little more listed for benefits than Ms. Shuttlesworth's does. I think she only had, like, a couple things that were listed. But, I can understand her position in getting the additional pay because of the section with salary in that sentence or two, talking about the twenty percent and anything due.., what was read a few minutes ago. But, that benefit section, which you all are trying to attribute the word longevity to is in t he section where it says Ms. Hoskins will...

The City shall provide Ms. Hoskins with all the bene'.., benefits accruing to City employees.

The word benefit is where the word longevity is being tied into that and that, that is incorrect because you have all of those benefits listed in that contract. It clearly shows what the benefits are. And it spe'.., and the, the five that I just listed.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And wh'..., and then we spoke on the twenty'... One thing I do wanna correct is that that agreement, that Mr. Sherman showed talked about the City Manager being there, basically, indefinitely until we find a City Manager, is actually incorrect. There is a, a, a..., we had another mee'..., in that meeting on the 20<sup>th</sup>, we agreed to put a end date in there, which was, I believe, March 9<sup>th</sup>.

[Inaudible comment]

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. March 9<sup>th</sup>. But that was not corrected, and, and that was, you know, I don't know what happened as to why it wasn't brought back, but what we notice is that my signature, as well as Ms. Davis Johnson's signature were not on the Resolution or the..., accepting that agreement on the 20<sup>th</sup> because, in the meeting, we clearly all voted to approve the agreement with the understanding it had an end date of March 9, 2018. So the contract, actually right now, is expired.

But, my point is, that is part of it. Yeah, that there's a corrected agreement now that is..., should be on the web, that has March 9<sup>th</sup> as her end date. For whatever reason, it was not corrected by the Clerk's office when we signed..., everybody signed it. Whoever..., I don't know, I'm just saying, typically, the, the Items are sent down the line for us to sign, already preprinted. And so, it was already preprinted and..., but, in the course of our discussion of the Item, it..., we changed our minds about when the end was going to be. So, another one was to come back and have everybody sign that, but it never did so this one remained on, on the books. And, a couple weeks ago in which I discovered that was incorrect, that's when the change was made and Ms. Davis Johnson and myself just signed the new one about week or two..., about a week...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yeah.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...ago I believe. And so, that part has been corrected.

But I said all that to say, that section for benefit'..., that Section 3 for benefits clearly lists..., and it says and the following increase benefits, which have been afforded to the prior City Manager. It goes on with all the benefits. It's talking about benefits as in, you know, car allowance. It's not talking about money, in terms of a salary. Your salary is speaking to the top, which, in that meeting, we voted..., we all said \$150,000. Now, if we want to add more to it, then, you know, the, the Council can do that, but this was just not the right way to go about doing it. Bring it to us and letting us decide it, would've been the most appropriate way. You know...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I mean..., and, and to assume that in that section of benefits is speaking to longevity increasing a salary, that is not what it says and I don't understand how our Attorney can try to sit here and misconstrue that word and turn it into longevity, when that clearly is not the case.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** I'm not...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And it...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...[inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...and I, I really, I really, really feel [chuckle], that it is important that, Mr. Degraffenreidt, that you can stay neutral and really just call it what it is and not put spins on stuff.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Madam Chair? Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Attorney.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** I'm not putting a spin on anything. Based upon what she just read, Ms. Hoskins is entitled to those benefits that other management, employees enjoy and there's an and.., and, and it lists certain items. And usually means in addition to these items.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** It's not.., that's...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** The other management personnel who get longevity, they don't get the car allowance, they don't get those other things down there, but they're still management and they get longevity. And means in addition to.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** In all fairness.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** At no point in the negotiations did anybody make the Manager aware that she was losing that benefit.

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** That is not...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** When you...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** That...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair?

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** ...is not true.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair?

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** That is not true.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** One moment please.

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** Because I spoke...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Then, then point it out in the record.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair, I have a question.

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** I pointed.., I.., Ms. Hoskins and I had that conversation...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** In November...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** ...and Ms. Hoskins...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** You ain't her employer.

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** And Ms...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** ...and Ms. Hoskins...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** ...[Inaudible].

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** ...has acknowledge that conversation.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** In November, I had the conversation with Mr. Sherman, and he said.., and I was not under contract. I said okay, when I.., when I am under contract, I will add that benefit. And Randy, will you give me the definition of benefit? Provide the definition of a benefit?

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** Yeah. It, it's, it's other compensation than salary. Health...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Right. So, I'm...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** ...insurance, dental...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** ...I'm looking...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** ...insurance, life insurance...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** ...at definition of benefits as...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** ...auto pay...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** ...a payment.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Exactly right.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Benefit is a payment.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** It's not defined...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** So, so...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...as [inaudible]...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** ...health insurance is...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** A payment.

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** ...a payment?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Yes. You're providing the City...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** I'm paying...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** ...provides your...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** I'm making a payment to you?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** ...your health insurance payment...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Would you allow her to speak please?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** ...where you don't pay...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** Ms. Hoskins?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** You don't pay.

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** ...right there, it says salary plan.

[Inaudible dais comment]



**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** It says salary plan.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Benefits.

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** That's your... That is...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** It is a benefit.

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** ...your City Ordinance and...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair?

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** ...following the City Ordinance...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** A point of order, Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** One moment.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** It is a...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** What's your point...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** ...benefit that I have been...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** It's not a benefit.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** ...accruing for the last 24 years.

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** You can continue...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Up to twelve percent

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** ...to say that, Ms. Hoskins, but it's not.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay. One moment, please.

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** And, and, and if everybody...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** One moment, please.

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** ...thought that that was fine...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** ...you should've brought it back...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr...

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** ...[inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Sherman, one moment, please.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Botel, you had a question.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Please. It is so clear to me that this conversation, at 11:25 at night, is not going to resolve anything, and it is only gonna incur more rancor between two people who have worked well together in the past. I would, please, please beg that we put this to an independent investigative body that come to some conclusion...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** ...as to the validity...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** On a benefit though?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** No, no, no. This is not a benefit. Mr. Sherman has...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** On a, on a payment?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Mr. Sherman has one opinion about this and Ms. Hoskins has cl'..., has clearly a very different opinion, and I think we need to put this to somebody has an outside opinion about it because we have, we have clearly a divided Board here, Council here rather, and I, I just think that, because we already have a promise from the OIG to come in here in an expedited way, we should let that take its course. Ms. Hoskins has told me that, that the OIG is gonna be coming in here in a matter of days, so why not let that run its course?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Well, that, that's the outside..., that's the only outside review that needs to take place. We don't need to engage...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** So, so, so exactly. Oh no, that's all I'm saying.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...in any additional thing. So...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** No, no. That's what I'm saying. What I'm saying is, do we need to prolong this an'..., this angst.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** I need to make...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Let me just say this, the, the City Manager does need to go on record.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** We heard from Mr. Sherman, we need to allow Ms. Hoskins to go on record, and after that is complete, we will probably be at the 11:30 hour which will allow us to...

**UNK:** Extend...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Right. We would have to discuss whether or not we want to extend any further.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Ms. Hoskins, you have the floor.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair? Point of order.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Davis, Ms. Hoskins has the floor.

[Inaudible comment]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No. Don't tell me about the time, I wanna make sure she, she's not required to rush. It's only fair to her.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So, if we.., she should be allowed to extend the meeting enough time for her to not rush her presentation. He was allowed to take his time, Ms. Hoskins will be allowed to take her time. So, if we gotta extend the meeting for fifteen minutes...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...then we should...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** That is the...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...be allowed to do that.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** That is the collective will of this Board.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I make a...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** If that...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...motion that we extend the meeting to 11:45 to allow Ms. Hoskins to take her time on her presentation just like Mr. Sherman.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Second.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Fair.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It's fair.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** That's the motion.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It's been motioned...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...and second.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Botel?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Hubbard?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Davis Johnson?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Unanimous vote.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Ms. Hoskins, you have the floor.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Okay. Madam Chair, in Nov'.., November, when I was appointed, the City Manager and Mr. Sherman saw the longevity on the, on the pay stub. He came to me and said that, you know, that it was not a benefit and that I should remove it, that the Council would be upset if they saw it, or if someone did a public records request and saw that dollar amount. So, I said, okay, we'll take it off. When I get my.., when I prepare the contract, I'll make sure that that benefit is included. The benefit.., when the contract was prepared, I made sure that I looked at the other contracts from people that were promoted from within, they were promoted from within, they were already receiving longevity, so that I would be able to get the same benefit, I included the language in the contract. In consultation, Legal reviewed it and signed off on it and it was sent to the City Council. On May 2<sup>nd</sup>, at around 8:20, Mr. Sherman called me in his office and he provided this memo stating that, basically, that I was colluding with HR and, and it seemed as if that I gave myself a raise, that I gave HR a raise and then I gave HR a raise again. And I immediately asked, okay, 'Why did you write this memo like this? If you had a issue with the longevity, that benefit, why didn't you come to me? This happened in January, you're coming to me in May and stating you have these issues with this? Why, why are you doing this?' 'Well, I've already talked to the Council, they're ready to terminate you.' And I said, 'Well, I guess I'll be back in Finance.' 'No, they wanna terminate you from the City.' I spoke...

**UNK:** Wow.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** 'I spoke with the entire City Council.'

**UNK:** Wow.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** And I was floored. I mean, [stammer], I didn't know what to say or do and he said, 'Well, you need to provide a response because the newspaper is calling and the Cou'.., this is addressed.., the memo was addressed to the Mayor and City Council and I'm gonna send it out.' So, when I went upstairs, upset, of course, I responded to his memo. And, in responding to his memo that evening, on May 2<sup>nd</sup>, there was a Council meeting. I gave him the memo, he was sitting right there at the table, he read it and threw it and said, 'I'm, I'm... [stammer]. No. This is not, this is not what I expected.' So, he took it to, I believe hi'.., he and the Chair exchanged words and then the memo went out to the press the next day, went to the City Council the next day. I'm assuming he sent it to the press also.

I have worked for this City for thirty years. That longevity has always, in my view, been a benefit. A benefit is a payment or some kind of, of.., health insurance or some kind of benefit to the employee. I had a accumulated that twelve percent. Twelve percent is the maximum. I did.., I was not stealing, I was not pay'.., paying mys'.., giving myself a raise, none of that. As a matter of fact, I don't want it and I'll pay the \$6,000 back.

[Inaudible audience comment]

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** If that's the issue...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** No.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** It, it's just..., it doesn't make sense.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** It does not make sense. Why..., why..., I just cannot understand why that memo was written like that and not work..., he did not say, and he said that I did not wanna go that direction. That is not true, I did not say that. I woulda brought it back to the Council and said, 'Hey, Mr. Sherman has a issue with what I'm getting.' I would've done a Resolution right away, but no, he gave me eight hours to respond to him.

[Audience exclamation]

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair?

[Inaudible comment]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Mayor.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** I'm done.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** You're recognized.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I, I think that we've heard from both sides. Mrs. Hoskins has made it clear that it wasn't any mis'..., misintent or anything on her part, she's made it clear that she felt that she was entitled to it. Mr. Sherman has made it clear that he felt that she wasn't entitled to it. How'..., however it may be, the, the matter is on..., is here now. It's [inaudible]. He also stated that all it would simply take is a Resolution...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** No.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...and the... Let me finish.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** [Inaudible].

**MAYOR MASTERS:** So, the, the matter is here now. So, what I'm suggesting, is that his Council just makes a decision...

[Audience clapping]

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...whether or not the longevity will stay as is, or whether it not it shouldn't. All it takes is three votes to stay, or three votes not to stay.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**MAYOR MASTERS:** But let the Council..., my advice is, because of the controversy here, I would like to see the Council just make a decision and we go home. Simple...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...as that. Thank you.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair?

[Inaudible comment]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. City Manager.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam City Manager.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** I would rather for that \$18,000, or twelve percent, to go the general employees for their raises, so we can get these union negotiations done and look at some kind of way where we cannot take away additional benefits from them with this PTO, and the longevity. That's why that contract did not pass earlier because they don't want those benefits taken away from them. I'd rather for that money to go toward the general employee's union.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I believe Councilwoman Miller-Anderson [inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes. I [pause]. The Mayor stated about whether or not we should go ahead and make a vote, either to keep it or get rid of it, and so, if..., I heard what Ms., Ms. Hoskins is stating about the..., giving it to the employees. I think that should be a vote as well, instead of just saying..., because, at this point, you're saying that the eighteen belongs to you anyway, so you can make that suggestion. I think it's still, uh, comes to the Board. Now, like I said earlier, if the Board..., when we had this meeting and, and discussed her contract, we clearly stated \$150,000. Now, if we're saying that we want to now make it \$168,000, I think it would be appropriate for a motion to just be made and say that you wanna amend the contract and you want to include the wording in there, and make it be whatever you want it to be.

And then also, I have a question though, in terms of how..., I still say that because of the wording of it, I was never aware that the \$18,000 had been added in. So, how..., what is the process in..., when that ei'..., how that \$18,000 was added on? What happens in payroll? How does that happen? How does..., how is it approved, I guess is more the question I'm trying to ask?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** The co'..., once the contract is approved and sent to HR for them to do a PAR, Personnel Action Request form. And I have also included information where previous City Managers, when they don't have the assistance, they have approved their own PARs, because they don't have those vacant..., those positions filled.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So the Assistant City Manager approves the City Manager's pay increase? In the past?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Via a PAR, Personnel Action Request. They would attach the contract.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** She's saying for herself.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So the City Manager had the subordinate approve their pay increase?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** No.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** What?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** The Interim HR Director, and you'll..., if you look at No. 5 of the handout, in the additions, deletions, you'll see that the HR Director normally inputs the PAR.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. So, the HR Director, in the past, has approved a pay increase for the City Manager?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Only if it's approved by the City Council.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. So, with that being said, the additional \$18,000 was not approved by the Council. The Council was under the impression it was \$150,000. So, when the additional \$18,000 was put in for approval, the HR Director is the one that gave the approval for that?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Not to Council?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** It's not \$18,000. It's \$150,000 plus twelve percent.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. So...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** So, it's twelve percent...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** [Inaudible]. So how much..., the \$168,000? Where's \$168,000 come in at?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** That's a annual basis.



**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** On an annual basis.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. So, your twelve percent, that has been paid so far, between what.., when did it start?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** January 9<sup>th</sup>.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Until?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** It ended.., and Mr. Sherman took it off on April 28<sup>th</sup>, after he sent out the memo saying that I was making \$168,000.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So, he took it off once he was able to receive the files, I guess, 'cause in the memo it said that he had some issues being provided the files to...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** No. That's, that's...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...to that?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** ...related to the compensation study.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** That's not related to...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. So...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** ...the PARs.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. So, he found out, for whatever reason, April 20, he stopped it. But, it had already been done, and so, from that point, whatever amount you received, it was paid to you because who approved it?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** I approved it.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. So, what I'm saying is, that.., I, I don't know of any other job where a person can approve their own pay raise. And so...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Did you...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And, and.., so, this is what I'm saying, it would be very appropriate for someone on the dais to just.., to make it look clean, to make, make it be what you want it to be because, back on December 20<sup>th</sup>, we wanted it \$150,000. That's what we all voted for, but if it has changed and you're wanted to give the additional dollars, then I think it would be more appropriate, it would make the public

be aware that we're okay with it, and this is what we want. So, I think it would be appropriate to go ahead and make a.., someone make a motion...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** [Stammer]...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...to add that amount on there, because there is no job where a person is going to.., especially in this case here, the City Council is the one that sets the salary. We did not s'.., agree to increase it. We did not agree to increase it in January. And so, this allows you the opportunity to now do what it is that you are agreeing with, and it just makes it very obvious that we're okay with, if it passes. So.., but I don't think it should stay out there that she has in turn given herself this raise, on her own...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...without the approval of the Council, and we were not aware of it being made. So, it's just a matter of mak'.., being transparent.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Ma'...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Excuse me...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...Madam Chair?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Wouldn't the Council have [inaudible].

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I'm sorry. Mr. Attorney.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** I believe that interpretation is totally unfair to Ms. Hoskins, that she did not give herself a raise.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** The worst case scenario, was she was executing her understanding of an agreement she made with you all. But she did not give herself a raise. That contract does say she's entitled to that benefit. The Code says she's entitled to that benefit. She believes she was entitled to that benefit. If we have a flashback to that November conversation, she didn't put that extra compensation in there, but when her check in the first time, when they looked at it and the entitlement she was entitled to, Finance put it in there, she didn't put in there. There's a misunderstanding going on but she did not deliberately do anything wrong or did anything dishonorable. She was merely executing what she believed your agreement was, and I think she's right.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman..., Chair Pro Tem Hubbard.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** I [pause]. The, the point..., this is..., and I agree with that because to vote to give her an increase to say that's, you know, it's the principal of the matter now. It's not about the money, it's how we're leaving it out there hanging, that she gave herself an increase. When Mrs. Hoskins came to offer herself up as the Interim City Manager, she already had longevity built into her salary. So, it wasn't discussed, it wasn't assumed she would give it up, none of that. The twelve percent increase, when you add it to her salary, gives her the \$150,000, never thinking that we had to discuss taking her longevity away. If it was an issue that we were going to take her longevity away, somebody shoulda discussed it then, at the table. I never thought that we were gonna ask her to give up any of her base pay. And when I say base pay, I'm including salary and benefits. So, when we put the twelve percent on the top and it came out to \$150,000 as we said. It's..., it came out to that. So now, the four years elapsed..., and here, I can cash in my longevity. So it is what it is. People work to collect those types of perks, if you will, and that's what our definition of the longevity stated. Is that we..., to enhance and to reward persons for long..., for working for us a long period of time, we give them this thing called longevity.

If that was an issue when they were negotiating, when Mr..., even Mr. Sherman, when we ere doing her contract, and she and he were discussing the contract, why didn't he then say, uh, put it on the next Agenda to say, 'Does this mean you want her to keep her longevity? Or, do you want her to take this longevity out? I am,' you know..., or when he gets ready to do payroll, and he sees her longevity is in it, I nee'..., because he, he stated he talked to everybody on the Council. He didn't talk to me. He didn't talk to me about that because had he talked to me about that, I would've, you know, I would've said, okay, let's put it on the next Agenda or let's..., 'Ms....,' I would, 'Ms. Hoskins, what do you think? What's going on, explain that to us,' because I know Ms. Hoskins is not going to try to manipulate the process. So for us to sit up her and say we're gonna make a motion to increase her salary, that's not what's happening here. The fact is, do you believe that Mrs. Hoskins' longevity was taken out of her base pay when we hired her to be the Interim City Manager. No one brought that up at all, that coming into the office of the City Manager, she would lose her longevity?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair? I was next.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I, I'm sorry. We have public comment cards and we have had quite a lengthy discussion from here. We need to allow public comment to move forward and then we'll come back to Council.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Can I make a motion to extend the meting?

[Inaudible dais comment]

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I mean, you're gonna do public comment in five minutes?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** [Stammer]. The meeting will, will terminate after the public comment.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Well...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** You know?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...she, she's not...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Go ahead and make the motion.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. I make a motion that we extend 'til 12:00. How, how many public comment cards do we have?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** There are nine public comment cards.

[Inaudible audience comment]

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So let's., okay... 12:30.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** No.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** You have thirty., you got thirty minutes worth of public comment cards.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** No, we don't.

[Inaudible comments]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Public comment cards, please. There's a motion to extend until 12:30. Is there a second? [Pause]. And I don't believe that we can go., can., we cannot continue after...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** We can.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...midnight, can we not?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yeah. We can.

[Inaudible comment]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay. So, is there a second? [Pause]. That motion dies for lack of a second.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair? But we can complete public comment, but the meeting will be adjourned after that.

**UNK:** Madam Clerk?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** We done it before.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well, she still is'.., isn't getting the money, right? It just stopped already though. [Inaudible].

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Lloyd Brown...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** It stopped [inaudible]...

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Doshia Newbold, Margaret Sheppard.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Or it's taken out so, maybe we should do something about it, change it.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair? Do, do we have a motion to extend the meeting?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** There wa'.., there was no second on the extension of the meeting.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** So, so at what point is this meeting going to end?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** As soon as the public comment is done.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** It's already 12:45.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Because we have to provide an opportunity for those comment'.., comments to be heard.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Thank you.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** But, 12:45 was the cutoff time, so are we...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** 11:45.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...saying [inaudible]...Eleven'.., I'm sorry, 11:45 is the time we set so, where does it come in that we have to continue until the.., and just terminate after all the comment cards? I thought the time was the time. So, can we entertain...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Well...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...a motion for thirty minutes more?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Is there a second?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I will entertain a motion this meeting is extended until public comment is complete.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Is there a second? [Pause]. That motion dies for lack of a second. I have no one to pass the gavel to.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Doshia Newbold.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** While she's coming, the Family and Friends has been moved to the Event Center tomorrow night, rather than here. Because of the rain.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, Mr. Mayor.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you. I just wanted to get it in real quick.

[Chuckle]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Ms. Newbold.

**MS. D. NEWBOLD:** Good evening. I'm gonna ask some questions so I want ya'll to, like, kinda note it so I can get some answers. So, if you don't mind, I have a lotta questions. And I have a couple statements, you know that, of course.

Okay. I've been reviewing the package that was outside, and in reference to this compensation study that was done, have you all found out whether or not it was accurate? Because there's a portion of a management consulting service that I was reading in this section and on the second page, the paragraph from the bottom, I want you all to take note of that. And, a couple questions were answered already. Was Mr. Sherman working on this project, with the study group for six months? And if he was, and like she stated even without the six months, if he noticed there was an error in longevity, by him being a Finance Director? Why did it take him so long to confront Ms. Hoskins? That shows his inability in his job. Why would he go to the City Council? She's his boss. That's insubordination, that's being a snake. He was digging a grave for her that he needs to fall in. He needs to be written up..., he really need' to be terminated. He shoulda left here with Aurigemma and Ms. Jones 'cause he was a part of that regime with that water situation. Ya'll didn't realize you had a snake then? If he didn't prove it tonight...

[Inaudible audience comment]

**MS. D. NEWBOLD:** ...and he said he's being scrutinized. He runs to the media, he know' we're under scrutiny with the media. Why would he do that? He wants to follow the same pattern, he go from Finance Director, like she was the Interim Finance Director. What his next goal is, to get rid of her to be the City Manager? That's not gonna happen. That's not gonna happen. Mr. Sherman sat here and played with words, he toyed with them, and he played with them. This man have a law degree. You're gonna go against the law and play.., and ponder with words. We're not that ignorant. He shoulda left here with Aurigemma and Jones, with that money from that water. He seems to overlook everything, and he's the Director when it comes to money.

So, we need to do some careful, very careful... I heard him say about he scrutinizes everything, he's trying to tell us his role and her role. She's your boss. You all are her boss. I'd agree with you KaShamba, she coulda stepped to you all, but what gives him the right to step to you all? After he let this go on for four or five months? That's inadequate. He's not doing his job, and he needs to go. He needs to really go 'cause this has been blown out of proportion. And it didn't have to be that way. If she gave him a memo, who is he to say how she should write a [stammer] memo? Why would he tell her right before a meeting? All of that is being slippery, slimy, grimy and snakerish. New word. And in his contract, what this man said, Mr. Sherman insists on them having multiple ways of trying to get him a raise.

[Inaudible comment]

**MS. D. NEWBOLD:** In the management consultant service, the second paragraph from the bottom, this man admits that Mr. Sherman had to find a way for him to get \$10,000.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Next comment, please.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Bonnie Larson, Doretta Paulk...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair? Madam Clerk, we said 11:45. When we say a time, that's the time that we go with.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** We need another motion.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I make a motion that we extend the meeting to 12:15. Thirty minutes.

**UNK:** Fifteen.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I second the motion.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Botel?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** [Inaudible].

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Hubbard?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Davis Johnson?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Unanimous vote.

**MS. B. LARSON:** It's almost midnight, we've been here since 6:00 p.m. My Lord. I don't believe your able to go over into the next day, after midnight. Your Attorney needs to tell you that.

As far as the compensation study, I can hardly remember what I was gonna talk about it, it's so late. But, who did.., when they got this compensation study and, if it's in our package tonight, that'll be the first time I've seen it. Haven't seen it before, so there is no transparency here. We're talking about it tonight, haven't seen it yet, unless it's in that package. If you get a compensation study, there are many, many things to consider when you give departments a raise. Who did that study? Who di'.., who did the determination that because a dollar figure was associated with a position, that's what we should have in Riviera Beach. Who did that? I have no faith in Human Resources, I've asked for public records requests. That Department, Human Resources, is a disaster. I have never seen such documents, as I get from them. So, no. I don't trust Human Resources to be doing this. Who did this? Who determined that the whatever figures are on that document are what we should be getting in Riviera Beach? Who did that, because I have no faith in Human Resources and I, I would like to know, who did that st'.., who determined that the figures on that study is what we should be getting here? I wanna know. They certainly cannot do it in Human Resources.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Margaret Sheppard, Doretta Paulk, Erica Davis.

**MS. M. SHEPHERD:** Margaret Sheppard, Riviera Beach.

I do agree with you, Ms. Miller-Anderson, it should have been clean to bring to the public. But, let me go at Randy Sherman who was fired from West Palm Beach. I can't remember why Lois Frankel fired him, I kinda, like, remember, but, you know, who is he to come to this City and scrutinize this lady, publicly, who's been a public servant? Ruth Jones came here, she was up the ladder, I'll never forget that day, she was right there as she was about to be the Finance Director, Ruth Jones put him over her. And I know, Mayor, you remember that day. She cried like a baby.



[Inaudible dais comment]

**MS. M. SHEPHERD:** Yes, you did. That, that, that young lady cried like a baby. Took her job and now I understand that, that Mr. Randy Sherman is like a Hitler type atmosphere. When he go' in to discipline our employees, he put 'em on the spot and that's why the Civil Service Board should come back. He never shoulda been an Administrator whatever he is. It's not right, you all, that she come here, she brought stabilization to the City and until we straighten out this mess, allow her to make some dec'..., I'm kinda like with some of you all, don't give her a reign of, of [stammer]... I'm with, with HR right now, you can't do that. You can make certain rules to benefit you. She's the City Manager. Who is he to come in here and put her on the spot and say, 'If you don't do it, you're gonna be fired.' He was up under her rule. She..., that's the time, Mr. Mayor, you come with your, uh, whatever it is you do.

**UNK. AUDIENCE:** Right.

**MS. M. SHEPHERD:** That's the time.

[Audience clapping]

**MS. M. SHEPHERD:** And you don't put him on no four day..., four day suspension. He shoulda been fired for the way he talked to his boss.

**UNK. AUDIENCE:** That's right. [Inaudible].

**MS. M. SHEPHERD:** That's his boss. And he can't stand it because Ruth Jones brou'... And I wanna know who signed the \$10,000 check? Now, he's so smart, who signed a \$10,000 check with that Water Utility? How dare you do it. Now, Mr. Horton is here, he's stabilizing everything. If he wants to do it for free, whatever he's doing, he's a man of honor. [Inaudible] Mr. Horton come back, ya'll need to go get somebody that's gonna kinda mimic him. He's a great man, and he's working with a great woman. How dare this happen.

But, I'm with you, Ms., Ms. Miller-Anderson, it shoulda be clean. It shoulda been clean. This kinda look'.., it does look tacky. Somebody did something. It looks tacky, sweetheart, but we could clean it u p and give her..., she is the City Manager, give her some respect. She's been disrespected by this man. He is something else. That Mr. Sherman, I., the public library, I'm coming back with, with, with Ms. Cobb. I want you to hear how they got together and terrorized one of those [stammer] employees over there. Fire him, Ms. Hoskins.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Doretta...

**MS. M. SHEPHERD:** [Inaudible].

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Doretta Paulk, Erica Davis, Amon Yisrael.

**MS. D. PAULK:** My name's Doretta Paulk. And...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Pull the microphone down, Ms. Paulk. You're a little short. [Chuckle]. Thank you.

**MS. D. PAULK:** My name is Doretta Paulk.

And, the revelations that has been brought forth, it's been enlightening. You know? But I still think that, overall, because it was.., felt so much tension that, if it was transparency with Ms. Hoskins, but I can see her point too, because as, as listening to everything, you know, she believed that she did have the longevity entitled to her, after listening to everything, because after everything comes out, it's.., I'm at a different aspect of the situation. But I do believe what, uh, Ms. KaShamba Miller-Anderson is saying, that if we were aware of this, I think it'd been a better situation. But, I do believe, after all of this, you were truly believed that you were entitled to the longevity. I think you have done a remarkable job and I think you should be entitled to it. It's now that I see everything that has come out.

But, saying that, these two employees that you gave the raise to, I think you should rescind that and it should go to the general public, and these people on the ground doing that type of work. I really do. Because they're hardworking people, out there in the sun and the rain, and I think that particular two raises should go to those people in the City. And, other than that, I think you are entitled to it, I do.

And I thank you all for listening.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Erica Davis, Amon Yisrael, Bessie Brown.

**UNK:** I think they're all gone.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Erica Davis? [Pause]. Amon Yisrael? [Pause]. Bessie Brown?

**MS. B. BROWN:** I just wanna say good evening again. At this time...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Good evening.

**MS. B. BROWN:** At this time, I would like to...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Make a motion? [Chuckle].

[Chuckle]

**MS. B. BROWN:** I would like to just read for you, and everybody, I'd like to say to the public, there's a packet out there that, that has this letter written in it. It says May 7<sup>th</sup>. I really would appreciate it if you would get this.., and this is asking for a management consulting services team, I think that did the compensation study and on the second page

is this letter. No, the third page is this letter. I want to read that..., Mr. Russell Campbell said:

I have, at this time, gone back and used the same implementation model for managerial staff that was used for the general employee population. Again, it was Mr. Sherman that insisted on the more aggressive approach for the managerial staff. In fact, I voiced my concerns about this on more than one occasion but no one spoke out against Mr. Sherman's request.

Now, you know what, I want you all to read this entire letter because, you know, it seems as though Mr. Sherman has done the bargaining for the, for the general employees. I don't think he should've been there, and, and, and he, since he says that longevity is not a benefit, when he..., they were at the table, negotiating longevity, I..., and, I don't know if it was benefit or how it was written, but that was a benefit to the employees, that they knew they had. And, he was also negotiating at the table to have them change their vacation and sick time to PTO time. Mr..., Mr. Sherman has his hands in a lot of pots, and Mr. Sherman needs to be..., learn how to be fair because I don't think that was anything a part of the negot'..., that shoulda been a part of the negotiation, if it wasn't..., it, it stated that this..., these articles, they would've handled lately. And also, they have a question about good cause. Are they losing good cause too? I'm, I'm just gonna ask it all 'cause I know my time is left. And, and, and I, and I think the Council, you all implement it, you all accept it and, and, and accept it and approve this study. And right now, tonight, we have something in here says that..., this is not the final, this is the draft. And I don't think none of this should be discussed on any draft at all in here with you all, because if it's approved and, and accepted, and you all need to have the final. So, if you're gonna discuss something, have, have what you need. And, and, and then let Mr. Sherman make, make his statements.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Miller-Anderson.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Was..., is that the last public comment?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I don't know. Let's check with the Clerk.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, that concludes the public comments.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you. Are there any additional comment from...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...the dais? Councilwoman Miller-Anderson.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I do wanna be very clear that I do not support the additional \$18,000, or the twelve percent. The \$150,000 is what we discussed when we gave Ms. Hoskins the contract and so that's where I am with that. I'm not, by

any means, in support of the \$168,000. Now, what I did say was that, if the Council as a whole wanted to put a motion to go ahead and, and make it that, that would be, I think, the most appropriate way.

What I do want to say though, you know, with Mr. Sherman bringing this before us, as he stated, it is for us to determine whether or not we wanna take it or not. I do believe he had a duty to report it. Now, from this day forward, if the OIG finds out there's something that was done improper, they will deal with it, but I do believe also, on our side, that we should not be okay with the fact that an approval was made without our knowledge. That is an issue for me. I don't know about anyone else, but that's an issue for me because that.., when we left the table at \$150,000, we did not leave knowing, oh well, there would be an interpretation of the word benefit to indicate an additional twelve percent would happen. There was no word of.., there was nothing in there that stated the word longevity, so you can't take the word benefit and make it the word longevity, or whatever other word you wanna make it.

So, I, I wanna be very clear. And then I know also, you know, whatever Mr. Sherman may have had in his past or whatever the situations may have been, that doesn't change the facts of what happened, that an additional twelve percent was given without the knowledge of the Board. So, I mean, one thing, I don't think, has anything to do with the other. And, the other thing is, I would be very reluctant to see something happen to him in terms of his job at this point, because now it's gonna look like retaliation, or something dealing with the whistleblower. And so, I mean, we need to make sure because I know in the.., in the memo, there was an indication in here about there was some sort of investigation that had occurred sometime ago, and come to find out... This was a year ago the issue happened, but he was then given a verbal warning, just, at the end of April. So., to give a, a, a verbal warning, I think... No, I'm sorry, maybe it was the end of March, for something that happ'... The end of March, a verbal warning was given, March 2018. The incident occurred in April 2017. And so, I just hope that we're being very cautious in terms of trying to apply some sort of reprimand due to this being brought to light. It, it is not anything done illegally, then that's one thing,, but you cannot fault him for doing his job and bringing it before whatever agency needed to be notified and bringing it before the appropriate people on the Council. He came to me because this compensation study and all.., and the contract was done when I was the Chair. He came to Ms. Tonya Davis Johnson because her name and her spouse was involved in this as well. He went to, I, I believe he then went to Ms....

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Correction.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** .....Ms. Hoskins...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Correction.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Correction. He never mentioned Ms. Scott to me.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I don't know.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** No. And I want you to be clear of that.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. So, what did he...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** There was certain...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...come to you for?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...information... He never mentioned that until the memorandum was released. And we approved, on February 21<sup>st</sup>, we approved the implementation of the study without having the specifics as to who would receive what. And, at that time, had we have had that, the abstention would have come from me. So, let's put that out on the record and...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...be clear about that. Mr. Sherman, in his conversation with me, never mentioned Ms. Scott. And for there to be a connection to my partner, to suggest that there was something in'., inappropriate about that, really concerns me and alarmed me.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Because he sat on that phone with me and he talked to me about everything else, except that piece. So, that, that brings pause to me.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I don't know the conversation...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Right.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...you all had.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** But, but you stated that he came to me...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Right.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...without knowing...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Because I knew...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...the full...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I knew he came...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Without knowing.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...to you...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes. Without knowing...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** He, he...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...the full piece.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...came to you 'cause I heard Ms. Hubbard said that sh'.., he didn't come to her.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Right.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So, he came to you because of your affiliation...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** No, no, no.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And then...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** No. No...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...Ms. Hoskins...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** He came to me, let's be clear...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Because you are the Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** He came to me because I was the Chair. He never said to me, let me make you aware of this situation that I have concerns about. That wasn't how he came to me.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Well, I...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Let...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I'm not finished.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I just...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I'm not finished.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...wanna.., I just want...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I want clarity.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** That's fine.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** She is no'..., Councilwoman Miller-Anderson is not done, but'...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** I'm sorry.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I understand.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** But would you complete...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I haven't gone yet.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...so...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...the other Members can have an opportunity, please?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Right. And then he said that he went to Ms. Hoskins because of her involvement and, and dealing with her with the longevity. So, that's how the three of us were brought into it. But, the thing is, I do not feel that we should be shooting the messenger. Now, I, I'm hearing there's some different interpretations of how the message was given out or why the message came up, but he did his job. He was responsible for submitting it to the OIG, the OIG will do their investigation. Again, I did not have any knowledge of this and I do not feel that was done properly, it should've come to the Council, and that is what I have an issue with. And I do not believe she should continue, even though it's already been stopped, I hope we're not now saying it's going to start back because the \$150,000 is what we agreed to and I'm expecting..., I'm thinking that's where we're going to stay unless the Board is making a motion to change that.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** We're taking the longevity...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** One moment, please. One moment, please. You're out of order, Chair Pro Tem. Councilwoman Botel...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...you're recognized.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** My greatest concern is that we not have an opportunity, in the very near future, to continue this discussion and to move, move on being sure that the OIG completes their investigation. I was horrified when I reviewed the video of the February meeting at which this study was presented to the, to the Council. KaSh'.., Councilperson KaShamba Miller-Anderson was home sick with the flu, she called it in that night, but no Councilperson was made aware, at that evening, of the magnitude of...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Of what was contained in...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Exactly.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...the study.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** No Councilperson, I repeat that, no Councilperson was made aware of the magnitude of the raises being given to certain individuals. There are ten individuals who received hu'.., very, very large raises in this.., by virtue of this study and I would like to, as quickly as can be humanly possible, get to another meeting, at which time, I would like to put on the table the freezing of those raises. Anyone making above ten percent. I would not wanna hurt anybody making below that, that average of about eleven.., about ten or eleven percent. But those people who are getting what [stammer] amounts now to be about 100% raise, I would think that the Council would be in agreement that we, we would want to freeze those raises until such time as the OIG can come back with a report.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Well, the OIG's report, before you move forward, the OIG's report was not into the study, it is into the increase. That's the only.., that's what we are looking at from them at this particular moment. So...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Are we not able to ask them to look at this whole thing?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** That's not what they do.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** That.., I don't, I don't know that we need them to look at the whole thing. What we do need to do.., you, you are, you're asking the OIG to vet the work of a consultant and if the consultant has put together a process and whatever the formula was, we need to have that consultant to come back.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Someone's gotta look at it.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** We need to, we need to have that addressed but conversely, I just want to say t hat if, if longevity is a part of a salary or an individual's right in this City, how.., we never discussed longevity yes, or longevity no during the contract negotiation. There was never any conversation that suggested we would take away the longevity that she was currently receiving. There was no conversation to the contrary and so, you know, to, to make a decision that she is not entitled, I don't believe that that, that, that is appropriate.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?



**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Madam...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** So, we're at 12:05.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** City Manager, did you have anything further?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Did you all wanna workshop this?

**UNK:** Uh-uh.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Well...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** We can, but I wanna...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...if, fi we workshop it...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...say something.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...we need to bring the consultant in to defe'..., because it's his study to defend.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Right.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It is not ours.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Right.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** And so, we need to have the consultant to come forward and to help us understand. And then, we also need to read the memorandum that will support., that was provided by the consultant, and be able to ask some questions. I think that now that we have this information, we can formulate questions in order to be able to address the consultant and to be able to have a dialogue to understand how this came about.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** How [inaudible] we can do that.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Davis, you've been calling out.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Thank you. I appreciate it.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** 12:05.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I'll be very brief.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I wanna state a few things for the record. Ms. Hoskins stated that Mr. Sherman had told her, in a private meeting, that he had votes to get rid of by the Council. I wanna be very clear, I have never met with Mr. Sherman to discuss this issue. At no point was this brought to my attention as an issue. It's very clear in the contract, the agreement..., when we approve things, when we talk about doing a job and reading that agreement, those are things that we gotta do. It takes time. And when we approved that with the \$150,000, that was with the understanding that Ms. Hoskins, once the decision was made, was going back to her old position, which made her eligible for what we're discussing now. And we knew that then. And we all stated that, that once we make a decision, Ms. Hoskins get' to go back to her old position. 'Cause she wanna make sure she..., as she helped this City, that she still has her position to where she was. So, all of that was stated even then.

You know, I wanna be very clear here, they talked about longevity as a benefit. Is it not, is it? Well, tell the, the general employees that. 'Cause the general employees keeps coming to the meeting, catching me in the street, saying that someone is taking their longevity benefit. And that's what they say, the general employees. So, the general employees are stating it, and the City Manager is stating it, and the City Attorney is stating that. Who's right and who's wrong? The employees are saying it, the City Attorney is saying it, and your City Manager is sta'..., saying it, and they all are reading the same documents. We must read all of our documents and be very clear..., and be prepared to make decisions and be moving forward on what we need to do.

Now, Mr. Sherman, as a Finance Director, has a boss. I woulda thought, if he was gonna have a meeting with any Councilperson, he should've had his boss sitting in that meeting and make sure he bring' it to our attention, so [stammer], so anyone on this board can bring it forward. But he withheld it, approved it and waited for months, and kept it quiet until the right time and threw it out there saying, 'Hey, somebody was done wrong.' That's criminal.

[Inaudible audience comment]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Because he knew, and he approved it and signed off on it. So, don't act as if he, you know, there was, you know... Only thing shaky is, if folks don't read. And I ain't accusing none of my colleagues, saying they're not reading it. What I'm being very clear is, we have agreements that [stammer]..., they are very clear, they are very clear about what, what we can do, what Staff can do. Our City employees, you know, we've been fighting to make sure they get their longevity, so Ms. Hoskins' longevity's has been under attack, who's attacking the general employee's longevity? Ask yourself that question, and now you can kinda see who's been doing it. And I ain't gonna call no names 'cause I don't wanna be accused of anything, but there's a train..., there's a trend going on of, of longevity being attacked, from the general employees to the City Manager because, under the understand of the general employees, as I close

out, Ms. Hoskins, if she was to go back, as we all agreed to, that was the understa'..., it was very clear to the public. Now, those other people, I support what the Board is stating. Bring the consultant in, they got paid, let them explain themselves but don't accuse the Council, and don't accuse the City Manager of doing their job, when you got a Staff member who withheld information and would not bring it to an Agenda Item. We could've handled this in a very diplomatic way and as a professional way, as long as people work honestly and give us all the same information.

[Inaudible comment]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No matter what happens, I will continue to love this City, no matter what the public TV channel say, I will [stammer], I will continue to love all my colleagues.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Point of order.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I'm talking about love and there's a point of order on the floor.

[Inaudible comment]

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** It has nothing to do with the Item...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Can...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes, it does.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Stammer]...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** It does. I haven't spoken...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I appreciate [inaudible]...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...the entire night on this Item and I'm..., I said I'm closing out.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay. Please, Mr. Davis.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Don't cut..., you don't, you don't rush everybody else off.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Davis, you say that to me every single time and I want you to stop that. I am simply trying...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...to move the business along. No, sir. No, sir. No, sir.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I., I am trying to be...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I'm done with it.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...fair and...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I'm done with it.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...equitable.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I'm done with it.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, sir.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I'm done with it.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** So, we have, we have several Items that need to be pushed over to the next Agenda, and based on our time and our need to complete the business of the City at 12:15, we will take the remaining pieces of the Agenda, we will move that over to the next meeting of the City Council.

Councilwoman Botel, I believe you... No, no. You, you, you recommended.., you, you suggested a workshop to solely do that. That would give us an opportunity to invite the consultant to come and to speak. Are there any further comments from the Board that the City Manager's office coordinate with our offices to obtain a time for workshop.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Just one thing...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Chair Pro Tem.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Just one thing I wanted to say...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** And I have one thing.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...Madam Mana'.., Madam Chair. I don't think that Mr. Sherman can hold hisself out as a whistleblower or that he, that he brought information into .., to us and that he would be'.., being reprimanded for it. He put out misinformation, he did not tell us the total truth. He said that she had eight hours to respond and that we were all ready to get.., to, to fire her. None of that, that.., all of that was not true.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** That's...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** So, he had already concocted something that wasn't true. He wasn't being a, a whistleblower, he was being dishonest in some, in some parts.

And, based on, quickly, okay. Quickly, based on the, the document'.., the document that the management company wrote, and what Mrs. Bessie Brown read to us, those salaries wouldn't have been as exorbitant as they were, if that company was allowed to apply, as he said on.., in the second page on the [stammer], the last page on the second paragraph, the application that he wanted to apply to it, but Mr. Sherman wanted to move in a more aggressive way. So, that's how those salaries became so exorbitant. So, everybody has had an opportunity to grab one of these, so please grab one.

Also, real quick, I wanna say, tomorrow the county is coming to do a presentation on affordable housing and homeownership, so if you are interested, know someone interested in, in purchasing a home, 6:00 o'clock to 8:00 o'clock, here in the Council Chambers.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** And tomorrow is Family and Friends night at the Marina at 6:00 p.m.

**ADJOURNMENT**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Motion to [inaudible]...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** So mo'...

[Gavel]

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Motion to adjourn.

**UNK:** Thank you.

[End Of video]

**City Employees, Public Comment Speakers and Others**

HCT RODERICK HARVEY

MR. R. HARVEY

DEBRA ALLEN

MS. DEBRA ALLEN

LLOYD BROWN

MR. L. BROWN

INTERIM PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR TERRENCE BAILEY

INTERIM PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY

INTERIM PROCUREMENT DIRECTOR RICKY LITTLE

INTERIM PROCUREMENT DIRECTOR LITTLE

ASSISTANT CHIEF MICHAEL MADDEN

ASSISTANT CHIEF MADDEN

FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICE DIRECTOR RANDY SHERMAN  
FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN

TIFFANY WILLIAMS	MS. T. WILLIAMS
EVELYN CLARK	MS. E. CLARK
ANDRE HENDERSON	MR. A. HENDERSON
DOSHA NEWBOLDMS.	D. NEWBOLD
MARGARET SHEPPARD	MS. M. SHEPPARD
BONNIE LARSON	MS. B. LARSON
TOMMY WALKER	MR. T. WALKER
MARVELOUS WASHINGTON	MS. M. WASHINGTON
ERICA DAVIS	MS. E. DAVIS
BILLIE BROOKS	MS. B. BROOKS
TRADRICK MCCOY	MR. T. MCCOY
HORACE TOWNS	MR. H. TOWNS
DR. PHILLIP DUKES	DR. P. DUKES
ALLEN SCHULTZ	MR. A. SCHULTZ
AMON YISRAEL	MR. A. YISRAEL
J.B. DIXON	MS. J.B. DIXON
HCT THOMAS WILLIAMS, III	MR. T. WILLIAMS
MOMS DEMAND ACTION FOR GUN SENSE IN AMERICA	
MOMS DEMAND ACTION	FOR GUN SENSE IN AMERICA
DORETTA PAULK	MS. D. PAULK
BESSIE BROWN	MS. B. BROWN
DELORES WILLIAMS	MS. D. WILLIAMS

**APPROVED:**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**THOMAS A. MASTERS**  
**MAYOR**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**TONYA DAVIS JOHNSON**  
**CHAIRPERSON**

**ATTEST:**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**CLAUDENE L. ANTHONY**  
**CERTIFIED MUNICIPAL CLERK**  
**CITY CLERK**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**LYNNE L. HUBBARD**  
**CHAIR PRO TEM**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**KASHAMBA MILLER-ANDERSON**  
**COUNCILPERSON**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**JULIA A. BOTEL, Ed.D**  
**COUNCILPERSON**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**TERENCE D. DAVIS**  
**COUNCILPERSON**

**MOTIONED BY:** \_\_\_\_\_

**SECONDED BY:** \_\_\_\_\_

**L. HUBBARD** \_\_\_\_\_

**K. MILLER-ANDERSON** \_\_\_\_\_

**T. DAVIS JOHNSON** \_\_\_\_\_

**J. BOTEL** \_\_\_\_\_

**T. DAVIS** \_\_\_\_\_

**DATE APPROVED:**   **JUNE 20, 2018**