



## **CALL TO ORDER**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Good evening.

**ALL:** Good evening.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I'd like to call the Regular City Council Meeting of April 18<sup>th</sup> to order. But, before we begin, I'd also like for us to offer a moment of silence in memory of Former First Lady Laura Bush. Barbara Bush.

Mrs. Bush was a staunch advocate of literacy, having founded the Barbara Bush Foundation for Family Literacy. Mrs. Bush's reach extended here, to Palm Beach County, and her efforts were specifically remembered by residents of the Glades. In addition to championing literacy, the Former First Lady also brought attention to the HIV/AIDS epidemic in 1989. I'm sure we all remember her visit to Grandma's house in D.C. and that very touching photo of her holding the infant effected by the disease. The flags here at the City of Riviera Beach are flying at half -staff in memory of the Former First Lady.

## **INVOCATION**

### **PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** We can now have our invocation and Pledge of Allegiance led by Chair Pro Tem Hubbard.

[Moment of silence]

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** [Inaudible]. Let the words of our mouth and the meditation of our heart be acceptable in God's sight. Amen.

**UNK.:** Amen.

**ALL:** I pledge to the Flag of the United States of America and to the Republic for which it stands, one nation under God, indivisible with liberty and justice for all.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** **MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC SHALL BE GIVEN A TOTAL OF THREE MINUTES TO SPEAK ON ALL ITEMS LISTED ON THE CONSENT AGENDA. ANY PERSON WHO WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON A CONSENT AGENDA ITEM, PLEASE FILL OUT A PUBLIC COMMENT CARD LOCATED ON THE TABLE DIRECTLY OUTSIDE OF THE COUNCIL CHAMBERS, AND GIVE IT TO THE STAFF BEFORE THE APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA. PUBLIC COMMENT CARDS FOR THE CONSENT AGENDA WILL NOT BE ACCEPTED AFTER THE APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA.**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam city Manager, Mayor and Council, are there any additions, deletions or substitutions?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, before we proceed, we need to do the roll call.

**ROLL CALL**

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Mayor Thomas Masters? [Pause]. Chairperson Tonya Davis Johnson?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Here.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Pro Tem Lynne Hubbard?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Here.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson KaShamba Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Present.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Julia Botel?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Here.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Terence Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Here.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** City Manager Karen Hoskins?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Here.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** City Clerk Claudene Anthony is present. City Attorney Andrew Degraffenreidt?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Here.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** You may proceed.

**AGENDA APPROVAL**

**ADDITIONS, DELETIONS, SUBSTITUTIONS**

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair, we have the following additions and deletions for tonight's meeting. Ordinance on first reading, Item No. 27, deletion. An Ordinance of the City of Riviera Beach, Palm Beach County, Florida restating Article 3, entitled Boards and Committees and Commissions, Chapter 7, entitled Civil Service Board, providing for simplified, updated and clarified language providing a new definition for the standard of review, updating the creation, selection and term of board members, clarifying qualifications for board members, amending the definition for the classified and unclassified services, establishing an eligibility roster for reemployment, extending the period for emergency appointment, providing for remedy f or repealing disciplinary actions, providing for conflict, severability and codification, and providing for an effective date.

Under Regular Old Business, I would like add Item No. 27A, setting a workshop date for parliamentary procedures and rules of decorum.

Item No 20'.., under discussion and deliberation, Item No. 28A, that's 28A, consideration of the Mayor's suspension of Interim Public Works Director. Under.., an addition discussion and deliberation, Item No. 28B, authorizing the City Manager to hire a vacant department head positions.

That's all, Madam Chair.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Where is that? The one...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS::** Under...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I don't [inaudible]...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** ...Item No. 28B.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Oh, on this. Okay. And next.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Per the workshop on last.., on Monday, you all asked that this be brought back for a vote, ratification vote to, to allow the City Manager to hire department heads.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilman Davis.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I'm trynna find out. We discussed this on three occasions. Is [stammer], did we ever take a vote that she.., that the City Manager wasn't allowed to hire department heads?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Initially we did, and we discussed it during our workshop and we decided that we would come back at the next City Council meeting to address that issue.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** But, but the previous Council meeting, it was stated that the City Manager had the authority to hire...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** What they need to happen. So, I'm trying to find out, when do we need to take a vote for that to take place?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** We have discussed it. I don't think that there was a formal vote. We decided that we would bring it back for a formal vote at this meeting, on Monday. If I stand corrected, please correct me, but I believe that that was the conversation that we had during our workshop.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I, I just..., and just for practical purposes, I just don't want it in the common practice that we have to take a vote for Staff to do there, you know, for, you know, I don't..., just don't want people at home to think that this normal where we have to give..., take a vote for a City Manager or any Staff member for them to do their jobs. And I just wanna make sure that this not common practice, what we're, what we're doing here.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Point...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So, we're doing it for, you know, for the sake of moving forward in what we're trying to do, and that's what we discussed.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Point taken, Mr. Davis.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Thank you.

[Pause]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Any further..., that was it for you?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Yes, ma'am.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay.

### **ADOPTION OF AGENDA**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Motion to adopt the Agenda?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So moved.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Second.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It's been moved and properly second.

### **DISCLOSURES BY COUNCIL**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** But, before we do that, are there any disclosures by Council?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Davis.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** In regards to the Item that we discussed, for the proposals for the City Manager, for the, how we're gonna move forward with the hiring and the policies and procedure, I did receive a email from someone earlier today, just for disclosures, Mr. Arnold Broussard, in support of assistance for the City Manager. But I did wanna state for the record, I did receive a email.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilperson...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** I rec'...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...Botel.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** I received the same email, and additionally, I received an email from...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** And Marie Davis, as well, I received an email from her.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** From Marie earlier, and as well, later in the day, from the Russell Group.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I didn't see that email.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay. Anyone else?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes. I received a email from the Russell Group...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Oh, I see it.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...as well as Mr. Arnold Broussard.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** If it was sent to all Council, I guess I would have but I haven't checked my emails this afternoon, so I don't know if I got it or not.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Right.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** And I...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Let the record reflect...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...too, the Russell Group. I see it.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Let the record reflect that the Mayor is now on the dais.

#### **ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA (con't.)**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** The adoption of the Agenda has been motioned and properly second. Madam Clerk.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Hubbard?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Botel?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Davis Johnson?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Unanimous vote.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I, I believe that the Mayor wanted to make a disclosure. Mr. Mayor.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yes, thank you.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you, Madam Chair. I had a meeting today at about 2:45 p.m. with Dr. Debra Robinson, and also...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Microphone not on [inaudible]...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I had a meeting today with the Superintendent of Public Schools and Dr. Robinson for 35 minutes to press for our call for metal detectors in the public schools and it went very well. Thank you.

### **CONSENT AGENDA**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ALL MATTERS LISTED UNDER THIS ITEM ARE CONSIDERED TO BE ROUTINE AND ACTION WILL BE TAKEN BY ONE MOTION. THERE WILL BE NO SEPARATE MOTION...

[Inaudible dais comments]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** THERE WILL BE NO SEPARATE DISCUSSION OF THESE ITEMS UNLESS A COUNCILPERSON SO REQUESTS, IN WHICH EVENT, THE ITEMS WILL BE REMOVED FROM THE GENERAL ORDER OF THE BUSINESS AND CONSIDERED IN ITS NORMAL SEQUENCE ON THE AGENDA.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Are there any Items to be pulled?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Miller-Anderson.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I would like to pull 4 and 6 for.., just for the presentation.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Items 4 and 6?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Are there any other?

[Pause]

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, we do have a public comment card on the Consent Agenda. The acceptance of public comment cards for the Consent Agenda is now closed.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I'll entertain a motion to approve the Consent Agenda with Items 4 and 6 pulled.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** So moved.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Second.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It's been moved and properly second. Madam Clerk.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Botel?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Hubbard?



**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Davis Johnson?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, would like to the public comment card on the Consent Agenda now?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes, ma'am.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Norma Duncombe.

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** Norma Duncombe.

I'm looking at this work that's going on right now in that area, and this says that this is the person who's gonna do the oversight, right? [Pause]. What I'm concerned about, is that this work that's going on, that this is the roads and all the work that they're doing, that it will be completed and look as if it is completed. What, what do we have in place to make sure that these roads are not all torn up and, and, and they're not done properly, at the end of the job? Do we have that in place?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I cannot speak for Staff, but as a Councilperson, it would be my expectation that there is compliance and review of the closeout of the project before all releases have been signed. But we can certainly verify that with Staff as to how they handle that matter.

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** Okay. And the reason I'm here talking, is because this is an area that I have to use on a regular basis and I have seen work that has been done there before, and when the work is completed, it's left a mess. I mean, it's [stammer], the...

[Inaudible comment]

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** ...the road is not left in order. And it's not, it's not a good job done. And so, I'm here to make the plea that whoever is, from the City, who's overseeing that, that they make sure that the road is done and done well. I'm just so dis'..., I'm just so dissatisfied. I've been here all of my life and I'm so dissatisfied with how things are done in certain areas of the City. When work is done in one area of the City, it should not look any different from any other part of the City. And, I know I'm speaking in advance but it's just that when you look at it, it's horrible. And I'm, and, and I, and I go to..., because I, I had a card for both Items and, like, you want decorative lights on Congress, look at US1, Broadway, it's horrible. The gutters that..., they did the road and the gutters are not done right, you have old poles that are about to fall down and I'm saying, I just feel we could do better. I'm here for life, I've been here all of my adult life, so we're talking I've been here, it feels like 90 years. So, I just feel that I deserve more. And I've been a taxpayer, property taxes, all of my adult life.

Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you. Ms. Hoskins, would you please follow up on the process for closeout and ensuring that he work is properly completed?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Yes, ma'am.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you. Are there any others?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** No, ma'am. That concludes public comments.

## **MINUTES**

### **1. MINUTES OF THE CANVASSING BOARD MEETING HELD MARCH 21, 2018.**

*DEPARTMENT DIRECTOR: CLAUDENE L. ANTHONY (561) 845-4090*

### **2. MINUTES OF THE REGULAR CITY COUNCIL MEETING HELD MARCH 21, 2018.**

*DEPARTMENT DIRECTOR: CLAUDENE L. ANTHONY (561) 845-4090*

## **RESOLUTIONS**

**3. RESOLUTION NO. 34-18 A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH, PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA, AWARDDING BID NO. 943-18-2 TO BROWN ELECTRICAL SOLUTIONS, LLC. OF RIVIERA BEACH, FLORIDA, FOR THE MUNICIPAL COMPLEX ELECTRICAL UPGRADE IN THE AMOUNT OF \$97,500.00; AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR AND CITY CLERK TO EXECUTE THE CONTRACT; AUTHORIZING THE CITY MANAGER TO APPROVE CHANGE ORDERS UP TO TEN PERCENT (10%); TOTAL CONTRACT VALUE SHALL NOT EXCEED \$107,250.00 WITHOUT AUTHORIZATION BY THE CITY COUNCIL; AUTHORIZING THE DIRECTOR OF FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES TO MAKE PAYMENT FOR SAME FROM ACCOUNT NUMBER 305-0202-519-0-6351; AND PROVIDING AN EFFECTIVE DATE.**

**INTERIM DEPT. DIRECTOR: TERENCE BAILEY (561) 845-4080**

**4.**

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY: RESOLUTION NO. 35-18. A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH, PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA APPROVING A WORK ORDER WITH CHEN MOORE & ASSOCIATES OF WEST PALM BEACH, FLORIDA FOR CIVIL ENGINEERING POST DESIGN AND CONSTRUCTION OVERSIGHT SERVICES FOR AVENUE H NEIGHBORHOOD IMPROVEMENT PROJECT IN THE AMOUNT OF \$192,810, AUTHORIZING THE CITY MANAGER TO APPROVE CHANGE ORDERS UP TO 10%, AUTHORIZING THE DIRECTOR OF FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES TO MAKE PAYMENT FOR SAME FROM ACCOUNT NUMBER 461-1127-541-0-6301 AND 415-1417-536-0-6306 AND PROVIDING AN EFFECTIVE DATE.**

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So moved.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Second.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It's been moved and properly second.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair, this is oversight services provided by Chen Moore for the Avenue H neighborhood improvement project. We have City Engineer Richard Lablanski here to speak on that Item. And also, if you would address resident Duncombe's concerns regarding oversight and making sure that everything is done properly?

**MR. R. LABINSKY:** Okay. Good evening, Council. [Adjusting mic]. It's a little short here. [Chuckle]. But, in reference to this Agenda Item, as part of the construction services, we, we look to hire outside consultants to assist us in the daily activities on the project to ensure that the projects are built to the design plans. For this project here, we're looking to use Chen Moore & Associates who we've worked with before on multiple projects. They've always done a great job for us, they understand what we need, they understand the City criteria and we work well together, so we're choosing to work with them. This is actually a joint agreement [stammer] between..., there's also Utilities involved with this, and they also overlap to do the Utility inspection work also. So, it's a better scenario to have one engineer handling all of the aspects of it. And we typically do not use the design engineer for construction services so that we're getting a second set of professional eyes on the project as we're building it.

The project's ongoing now, and they're actually doing some services for us, *gratis*, to oversee some of what's happening now that they need to be watching. So, we've got that in place. As far as the, the closeouts go, we..., as part of every project, we get performance bonds on projects, which guarantees the dollars needed to finish the project. So, if a contractor has issues, we have the funds to finish the project. From a aesthetic standpoint, we ensure that prior to final payments, we make..., we go through the project, we do walk-thru's. Typically, projects have what's called substantial completion, which is about 30 days prior to completing a project. So, in this case, this project has a 360 day timeline to substantial completion and in the last 30 days, we, we walk through, we punch list it, we make sure all the sod's in place, all the signage is right, everything's clean and everything looks the way we intended it to look. So, that's our closeout period in the, in the way we final the projects. And through payment, we always hold back 10% retainage on all invoices so we make sure at the end of the job, there's 10% left to ensure we get compliance from the contractors.

So, if can be assured that when this job's finished, it's..., you're gonna have a brand new street, everything's gonna be restored, both in the right of way, and any private property impacts, and it'll be something we can be proud of.

And I'll take any other questions you may have.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** [Inaudible] questions.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Hubbard.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** What other streets have Chen Moore provided design or post-design services for, here in the City of Riviera Beach? That you know of.

**MR. R. LABINSKY:** Presently, presently, they've done some design work and post-design on the Federal Gardens project, which is 11<sup>th</sup> to 14<sup>th</sup> Street that's ongoing. They're also providing us Utility..., the Utility Division is using them for services on the Singer Island project. The, the..., on that project, we're using a different engineering company for construction administration, for those two projects that they're involved with at this time.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Were they the original design or are they the..., you said that we..., and I ask this because you said that we have another firm over..., that's working on the construction administration side.

**MR. R. LABINSKY:** On the, on the Federal Gardens, they had done the original design for the Engineering Division, yes.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Okay. And who's, who's providing the oversight on the Federal Gardens project?

**MR. R. LABINSKY:** We're, we're doing that inhouse wit inhouse Staff.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Mm.

**MR. R. LABINSKY:** They're, they're just looking at the Utility portion for the Utility Division.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Okay. And...

**MR. R. LABINSKY:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...and, and the other project that they're working on?

**MR. R. LABINSKY:** That's the Singer Island project, which was designed by a consultant named Erdman Anthony, and they're utili'..., again, the Utility District is utilizing them just for the utility work.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Okay.

**MR. R. LABINSKY:** And, and we're gonna be using..., on that project, we're using Erdman Anthony to do the construction admin work, due to the complexity of the design. We wanted to have the same designer involved so we would not have a..., we would have an understanding of all the pre'..., you know, the thought process that went into the project, needed to be carried through, through construction, because it's fairly complicated. When we...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** [Stammer]...

**MR. R. LABINSKY:** When we have the opportunity, we alternate.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** And that is part of my point. We said that we were putting together a list so that we could rotate the services out, but either we only have three people on that list or we're not rotating it out as frequently as we could. Because that..., my understanding we, we opened up our engineering list so that..., twice, so that we could add more firms to it.

**MR. R. LABINSKY:** Well, at this point, we only have two other consulting firms that will be available to us for inspection work.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Ma'...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Okay. Thank you.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** City Manager.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Mrs...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Thank you.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** ...Hubbard, Councilwoman Hubbard, the..., we do currently have an RFP out for the five additional that..., under the Utility District. I'm not sure if you're thinking about that one. Under the Utility District, we do have an RFP out for that.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Well, I guess we need to, I guess, expand that to the, to the City side as well, so that we can get[pause] a fairer balance of what our projects are, are looking like in our, in our in pro'..., our in products.

Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Any further comments?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** No, thank you.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Mayor.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yes. Your position again with the company?

**MR. R. LABINSKY:** I'm a City engineer.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** City engineer. The, the Chen Moore company...

**MR. R. LABINSKY:** Yes.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** You, you familiar?

**MR. R. LABINSKY:** Yes.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay. Can you... [Clears throat]. Excuse me. Can you tell me how large that company is? How big is it?

**MR. R. LABINSKY:** Not, not specifically. No. They have many offices and many employees throughout South Florida, so I couldn't tell you exact numbers.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** The, the one that is gonna be here is West Palm Beach?

**MR. R. LABINSKY:** Correct.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Branch.

**MR. R. LABINSKY:** Correct.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay. Thank you.

**MR. R. LABINSKY:** We typically deal with a design engineer, an, an assistant typically, and then field inspection people. So, our direct contact is, you know, four or five people with, with each firm.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** There being no further comment, Madam Clerk.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Botel?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Hubbard?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Davis Johnson?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**MR. R. LABINSKY:** Thank you.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Unanimous vote.

**UNK.:** Thank you.

**5. RESOLUTION NO. 36-18 A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH, PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA, ENTERING INTO AN INTERLOCAL AGREEMENT WITH PALM BEACH COUNTY FOR THE OPERATION AND MAINTENANCE OF A DECORATIVE STREET LIGHTING SYSTEM ON CONGRESS AVENUE FROM 45TH STREET TO BLUE HERON BOULEVARD TO BE CONSTRUCTED BY FDOT UNDER PROJECT (FM#436893-1-52-01) AND ACCEPTING OBLIGATION FOR CONTINUED MAINTENANCE AND OPERATION EXPENSES ASSOCIATED WITH THE STREETLIGHTS ONCE INSTALLED BY FDOT; AND PROVIDING FOR AN EFFECTIVE DATE.**

DEPT. DIRECTOR: TERRENCE BAILEY (561) 845-4080

**6.**

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY: RESOLUTION NO. 37-18. A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH, PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA APPROVING THE 2018 JULY 4<sup>TH</sup> INDEPENDENCE DAY CELEBRATION ACTIVITIES AND BUDGET AND PROVIDING AN EFFECTIVE DATE.**

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So moved.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Second.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It's been moved and properly second. Mr. Blankenship.

**PARKS & RECREATION DIRECTOR BLANKENSHIP:** Good morning, Mayor... Or good afternoon, evening, Mayor, Council. Richard Blankenship...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** [Inaudible] wake up...

**PARKS & RECREATION DIRECTOR BLANKENSHIP:** ...Parks & Recreation Director... Long day.

I don't have a specific presentation planned, but I can just go over..., reiterate some of the plans we do already have in the process. Now, the reason why we needed to do this Resolution, is we were planning on closing the southern eastbound lane of Blue Heron Bridge and the northern westbound lane of Blue Heron Bridge, mainly because we wanna buffer the bridge 'cause we, we know there are gonna be a lot of people that are gonna try to view the, the fireworks from the bridge, so we wanna make., it, it's a safety issue. We have submitted our permits. In fact, we had a Planning meeting today and all of the logistics have really come together. The fireworks themselves are all planned and permits submitted. Now, we're kinda turning to a parking plan, a shuttle plan and all the entertainment activities that will go on at Bicentennial Park. It should be a very., the, the

day's gonna start at 2:00 p.m. and go until 9:18 when the fireworks are done and we, we are planning a, a great day for the City of Riviera Beach.

I'll answer any questions that you may have.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Miller-Anderson.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** What areas will people be able to view it from if they're coming close? I know you're talking about on the bridge and will.., the park...

**PARKS & RECREATION DIRECTOR BLANKENSHIP:** Well, the formal area will be Marina Village.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**PARKS & RECREATION DIRECTOR BLANKENSHIP:** Bicentennial Park and along the shoreline there. That'll be the formal viewing area, but people are gonna make their own viewing areas.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. That's it. Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Chair Pro Tem.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** The Resolution.., the part of the Resolution that will allow us to close off the roads and.., that's the part that I'm okay with us signing and voting on tonight, but the budget part of it I find astronomical in that we sh'.., you know, we have time to try to get better prices on that but I know that you need the Resolution to be submitted to close off the roads and things. So, that's the part that, you know, I think that we should do tonight, and I think because [pause] we have, you know, we've had a show in the past and nothing came close to, to, to the.., to this cost.

**PARKS & RECREATION DIRECTOR BLANKENSHIP:** Well, Councilwoman Hubbard, [stammer] how I can address that is, we are too far gone to, to look for another vendor at this point. Because the permits have been submitted and all that. The Council budgeted \$90,000. I mean, if you recall last year, we were gonna do it at Dan Calloway. That complete show would've cost \$25,000. Doing it in the water has so many more moving parts than doing it on land, that's what makes it expensive, is barges, security. The Council.., the consensus was to do it in, in the.., from the water...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** And the...

**PARKS & RECREATION DIRECTOR BLANKENSHIP:** ...so that's...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes.



**PARKS & RECREATION DIRECTOR BLANKENSHIP:** Yeah.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** And, and.., I remember, and I recall.., and I know we talked about the, the \$90,000 but this is a touch more. You think?

**PARKS & RECREATION DIRECTOR BLANKENSHIP:** Oh no. It's...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**PARKS & RECREATION DIRECTOR BLANKENSHIP:** ...we're staying within budget.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** The... [Pause]. I guess [stammer] not a touch more than the \$90,000, but a touch more than what, you know, what I anticipated that, that we, we would be actually spending. You know? So, I thought that tonight we could do.., the way it was written, it read to me as if we were.., that there was an opportunity to go ahead and do the Resolution so that we would be able to apply for the closure of the roads and things. But the.., as you.., but, as you stated a few minutes ago that we're too far down the road and there's already moving prats, it didn't read like all of that was contingent upon your application to have the road closures and the application for the fireworks on, on the water also.

**PARKS & RECREATION DIRECTOR BLANKENSHIP:** And honestly, this, this closure, this permit for DOT is the easy permit. That's why we can 'til mid-April to, to get that Resolution. We've been meeting and working on this since December. So, it's.., as far as the actual fireworks themselves...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Mhmm.

**PARKS & RECREATION DIRECTOR BLANKENSHIP:** ...we're way, way, way down the road on that. And it would be very.., we couldn't turn the page at this point and have a successful show.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Okay. Thank you.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilperson Botel.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Do you have any anticipated revenue that accrues to the City by virtue of bringing so many people in for celebration?

**PARKS & RECREATION DIRECTOR BLANKENSHIP:** We haven't done a economic analysis but there will be some, of course. But understand, we've got, starting

in Jupiter, North Palm, Lake Park, Riviera, West Palm, each of those locations are having a show as, as well.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** But ours will be the best.

**PARKS & RECREATION DIRECTOR BLANKENSHIP:** That's why we don't wanna turn the page at this point. We wanna keep moving forward.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilman Davis.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Thank you. So, later, we will have a complete presentation talking about the parking, how we're gonna structure the entertainment, the acts...

**PARKS & RECREATION DIRECTOR BLANKENSHIP:** Right.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...the full day.

**PARKS & RECREATION DIRECTOR BLANKENSHIP:** We'll come back to you with the shuttle plan, the parking plan, where the parking lots will be. You know what we gotta be careful about, while we want a, a lot of people there, the facility can only hold so many.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Right.

**PARKS & RECREATION DIRECTOR BLANKENSHIP:** So, we don't wanna plan parking for 10,000 when we can only hold three or 4,000. So we're..., Staff is working through that now.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I, I just wanna commend you and your Staff and, and all the previous and current leadership that's been involved with this decision because this is another star on Riviera Beach. You know? For years, we have been going and supplying, funding and energy to other cities, but now residents can sit home in their yards, on their roofs, if they can make it up there, and just really appreciate and see their money working for them and just have a joyous event. You know, we have a lot of our fire offic'..., fire..., public safety officers with fire and police, they can't go to other cities and have to be on shift. So, this'll be a chance where they can actually be here working and see and enjoy fireworks with their families while they're working. And that's the impact that people need to start thinking about, wh'..., how this triggers all the way down. Finally, we have those that work around the clock, they can participate with their families and work and really be excited about, you know, where they work at, where we live at in the City of Riviera Beach.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Mayor.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yes. Do we have any financial partners?

**PARKS & RECREATION DIRECTOR BLANKENSHIP:** Not at this point.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Are...

**PARKS & RECREATION DIRECTOR BLANKENSHIP:** We are, we are gonna seek some.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay.

**PARKS & RECREATION DIRECTOR BLANKENSHIP:** But we don't have any yet.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay.

**PARKS & RECREATION DIRECTOR BLANKENSHIP:** Secured at this point.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** And that will offset our balance, the \$90,000? Okay. And we're seeking businesses in the, in the local area?

**PARKS & RECREATION DIRECTOR BLANKENSHIP:** Yes, sir.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Or, wherever? Okay. So, if there's a business there that would like to partner with us, who should they contact?

**PARKS & RECREATION DIRECTOR BLANKENSHIP:** Myself.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** And that number.

**PARKS & RECREATION DIRECTOR BLANKENSHIP:** 561-845-3411.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay. Will there be, um, any benefit to the business partnering? Will there be any kind of display or...

**PARKS & RECREATION DIRECTOR BLANKENSHIP:** Absolutely.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** .....any kind of handouts or anything?

**PARKS & RECREATION DIRECTOR BLANKENSHIP:** There's a VIP area that they would be predominately noticed at, and throughout town, in all of, in, in all of our advertising that we'll do, they will...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay.

**PARKS & RECREATION DIRECTOR BLANKENSHIP:** ...get plenty of, of air time.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** And, is there a rate scale, like, golden sponsor, or platinum or silver or any'..., anything like that, or it's just...

**PARKS & RECREATION DIRECTOR BLANKENSHIP:** Not at...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...whatever you can get?

**PARKS & RECREATION DIRECTOR BLANKENSHIP:** Not at this point. We're, we're gonna... Like I said, as of today, we got all the logistics pretty...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay.

**PARKS & RECREATION DIRECTOR BLANKENSHIP:** ...much tied up.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay.

**PARKS & RECREATION DIRECTOR BLANKENSHIP:** Now we'll start focusing on, on land, parking and sponsors.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay. Thank you, sir. Thank you, Madam Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you. There being no further discussion, Madam Clerk.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Hubbard?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Botel?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Davis Johnson?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Unanimous vote.

**PARKS & RECREATION DIRECTOR BLANKENSHIP:** Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**UNK.:** Thank you.

### **COMMUNITY BENEFITS REQUESTS ON CONSENT**

7. THE PINK QUEEN FOUNDATION - \$500 - MAYOR THOMAS MASTERS - SUPPORTS CANCER SURVIVORS IN RIVIERA BEACH.
8. JESUS AND YOU OUTREACH MINISTRIES - \$500 - MAYOR THOMAS MASTERS - SUPPORTS JAY OUTREACH MINISTRIES.
9. BIRDSONG SPORTS - \$500 - CHAIR PRO TEM LYNNE L. HUBBARD - TO HELP DEFRAY COSTS OF ITEMS NEEDED FOR THE BALL STARS YOUTH BASKETBALL CAMPS.
10. LADIES OF FUTURITY, INC. - \$650 - CHAIR PRO TEM LYNNE L. HUBBARD - TO SPONSOR ONE (1) STUDENT TO ATTEND A SIX (6) DAY COLLEGE TOUR.
11. WM COMMUNITY BENEFITS DONATION TO Bi-Wi INTERNATIONAL, INC. - IN THE AMOUNT OF \$500.00 - CHAIRPERSON TONYA DAVIS JOHNSON - IN SUPPORT OF A GIRLS MENTORING PROGRAM.
12. WM COMMUNITY BENEFITS DONATIONS IN THE AMOUNT OF \$500.00 - CHAIRPERSON TONYA DAVIS JOHNSON - TO PALM BEACH GARDENS HIGH SCHOOL IN SUPPORT OF PROJECT GRADUATION.

#### END OF CONSENT AGENDA

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ANY PERSON WHO WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON AN AGENDA ITEM, PLEASE FILL OUT A PUBLIC COMMENT CARD LOCATED ON THE TABLE DIRECTLY OUTSIDE OF THE COUNCIL CHAMBERS AND GIVE IT TO THE STAFF PRIOR TO THE ITEM BEING PRESENTED TO THE CITY COUNCIL FOR DISCUSSION. MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WILL BE GIVEN THREE MINUTES TO SPEAK ON EACH REGULAR AGENDA ITEM. IN NO EVENT WILL ANYONE BE ALLOWED TO SUBMIT A COMMENT CARD AND SPEAK ON AN AGENDA ITEM AFTER THE RESOLUTION IS READ OR ITEM CONSIDERED.

#### PETITIONS AND COMMUNICATIONS FOR FILING

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Are there any petitions and communications for filing?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Yes, Madam Chair. On today, each elected official received a correspondence from Mr. Gerald Ward regarding Item No. 20, Item No. 19 and Item No. 22 and 23.

**UNK.:** [Whisper: It's right here].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** 19, 20...

[Inaudible whispering]

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** 22 and 23.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** 22 and 23.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Email? Where, where... [Inaudible].

[Inaudible dais comments]

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** I believe it's in an email.

[Inaudible dais comments]

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Mr. Gerald Ward sent a email to each one of you on today.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yeah.

[Inaudible dais comments]

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I'm sorry. I came straight from work. I didn't get a chance to check my email.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** With that being said, do you need to read that into the record or you just make us aware?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** If you would like for me to read each of them into the record, I can do so. Other than that, acknowledgement is sufficient.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** What's the pleasure of the Board? Do you want to hear them?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes.

**UNK.:** I do.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** The Board, thank you. One moment. The Board?

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I've not had an opportunity to read it and so, therefore, I...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I mean, it doesn't matter to me.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Davis, what's your pleasure? Do you want each of the correspondence..., when we get to that item for public comment, we can address it then.

**UNK.:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes, ma'am.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**AWARDS AND PRESENTATIONS**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Awards and presentations.

**13. CITY CLERK ANTHONY: PRESENTATION BY SENATOR BOBBY POWELL – DISTRICT 30 REGARDING THE 2018 POST LEGISLATIVE SESSION UPDATE**

**14. PRESENTATION BY REPRESENTATIVE AL JACQUET – DISTRICT 88 REGARDING THE 2018 POST-LEGISLATIVE SESSION UPDATE.**

**SENATOR B. POWELL:** Good evening, Council. We...

[Inaudible comment]

**SENATOR B. POWELL:** If it's okay to, in the essence of fairness and time, myself and Representative Al Jacquet will present to you all at the same time. How about that? Is that alright? Can we say, 'Alright, alright'?

[Chuckles]

**SENATOR B. POWELL:** Good to see everybody here in tonight's City Council meeting. My name is Bobby Powell, Jr., State Representative, representing District 30, an AICP certified planner from Palm Beach County, who is also a native of Riviera Beach, Florida.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Good.

**REPRESENTATIVE A. JACQUET:** Good evening, Council, Mr. Mayor, Chairperson Davis Johnson, and our immediate past Chair. Congratulations, Councilwoman. Again, I know the Senator said representative, he represented you so well...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** [Chuckle].

**REPRESENTATIVE A. JACQUET:** ...he wanted to keep that title but...

[Chuckles]

**REPRESENTATIVE A. JACQUET:** ...he is the first black male Senator that we've ever had from Palm Beach County that's represents Palm Beach County.

[Applause]

**REPRESENTATIVE A. JACQUET:** And, it's truly been an honor and a, and a pleasure working with Senator Powell. I tell you, we started off together as legislative aides, and watching him matriculate through the legislature, and following in his footsteps has just been a blessing for me. It's made my job much easier. When you have two legislators in both Chambers who represent the town, and who work that well together, it truly makes it a lot easier, I promise you that. So, this evening, we're gonna quickly go

through a quick wrap up, legislative update, what went on in Tallahassee. I know a lot of you are paying attention to the Stoneman Douglas issue that went on, that threw us for a major loop. We started discussing things that they never expected we would discuss and I can tell you, my one comment to them was, 'I will support this if you will tell me.., if you can tell me how this'll save lives in Riviera Beach, West Palm Beach, Delray and Boynton,' they couldn't answer it, when it came to that school marshal program that we're talking about. Sixty-four lives were lost by firearms in the year 2016 alone, in Palm Beach County, and that piece of legislation did nothing to address those 64, and that's the reason that we were opposed to that, but we'll get to that.

**SENATOR B. POWELL:** And thank you. As the Representative said, I.., God, I'm a Senator. I've been a Senator for two years, by the way.

I wanna just give you a quick update. Here in Palm Beach County, we've got nine state representatives, of which Representative Jacquet is one, four state senators. We had one that.., we were down, four.., we had three. Somebody fell victim to the whole 'Me Too' movement, so they weren't part of the senate this year. Right now, I'm the Vice Chair of the Transportation, Tourism, Economic Development Appropriations Committee. Previously, 2016-2017, I was the Chair of the Palm Beach County legislative delegation. Some of the things that we work on are those issues that come directly through, and to, Riviera Beach. So, I've been on the phone with almost everybody on the Council while I was in Tallahassee this year, except for.., and congratulations, Dr. Botel on your recent election, but I've spoken to each and every one of you while I was in Tallahassee this year to fight for Riviera Beach issues so, it's good to be back before you today.

Representative Jacquet started to talk about the major issues that we dealt with during session this year. Gun safety reform. It was the first time in 20 years that the Tallahassee.., that the legislature actually took any type of action with regard to gun safety and gun reform. Senate Bill 7026, we'll talk about in a few minutes when we get on the Marjorie Stoneman Douglas Act, and Education House Bill 7055, which was.., they called it 7069 on steroids. It includes the School of Hope Program and the bully bill that we'll elaborate on a little bit more, healthcare, nursing home generators. We know, in Broward County, we lost several elderly people due to Hurricane Irma, opioids, and home rule, are issues that we dealt with, the tax package of \$168.6M, which saves a lot of money for wealthy people. And, the budget of \$88.7B, which was the overall budget. And it came down to \$88.4 dollars after the Governor got in and cut some of the funding that was allocated for many of our towns, including \$150,000 for the Riviera Beach Youth Employment Program.

Mm.

**REPRESENTATIVE A. JACQUET:** Thank you.

As far as the Marjorie Stoneman Douglas Safety Act goes, as you know, during, during the legislative process this year on Valentine's Day, what happened in Parkland really shook the entire state. And so, although when 49 died at the Pulse Nightclub, we didn't respond that way, when the shooting at Fort Lauderdale Airport, we did not respond



that way, but we did decide to respond this time. If I could make a quick analogy, the face of addiction is also change, so now we respond to opioids the correct way, the way we did not respond to the crack epidemic or, or others in the past. So, I'm glad to see we're really starting to evolve in our way of thinking. But we did... [pause]. I shouldn't say we addressed it, it was forced...

**SENATOR B. POWELL:** To the legislature.

**REPRESENTATIVE A. JACQUET:** To the legislature. What happened was, Representative Kionne McGhee, who is the income minority leader in the House, young man, former prosecutor. He watched his father get gunned down, he lost his brother by gun violence, his mother was a bean picker in Miami, he grew up down there. He's an author, as I said, a former prosecutor, and he's a State Rep., about to be minority leader. When this issue happened, we heard the voice of the folks. Everyone wants a ban on certain assault weapons. We know that. But, the legislature don't know whether they're in the pockets of the NRA or what it is, they refuse to even discuss, not refuse to approve it, they refuse to even have that conversation. So, knowing the rules, Representative Kionne McGhee, there was a Bill that, that, that aimed to ban assault weapons. He made a motion on the floor to take that Bill from Committee and bring it to the House floor, which is a proper motion. Because of that motion, they had to vote on the motion. We didn't vote on whether to ban assault weapons, because they won't allow that, we had to vote on whether we agreed to hear the Bill, and it was 71-36, they all said, 'No, we don't wanna hear it,' and that's why the kids started coming to the capital saying, you know, 'We're gonna take over if you guys don't do this,' and that's why we ended up having to pass something. I call it window dressing.

**SENATOR B. POWELL:** That was what happened in the House. In the Senate, we put several amendments up to be put forth on this Bill. All of them failed because of the, the party in power, which is the Republican side, didn't wanna hear those issues, but this Bill did raise the age limit for buying a gun from 18 to 21, it required the three-day waiting period for all purchases of firearms, it put a ban on bump stocks, which are devices that allow for these weapons that are regular rifles to become assault rifles. It did not ban assault rifles, it included a marshal program that does not arm teachers [audio skipped] instructional personnel [audio sipped]... Councilwoman Miller-Anderson, like, could be a cafeteria worker, a janitor...

**REPRESENTATIVE A. JACQUET:** [Inaudible]. .

**SENATOR B. POWELL:** Anybody who is non-instructional, with a 132 hours of training could carry a gun. Now, remember, we still are the state of State Your Ground.

**UNK.:** Hmm.

**SENATOR B. POWELL:** As a matter of fact, a year ago, or two years ago, we change the side of the burden of proof in terms of Stand Your Ground, and how that would affect people. So, it's a very dangerous piece of legislation that we moved, and myself and Representative Jacquet both voted against it, in both Chambers. We put \$69,000,000

there for a stakeholder regarding mental health services. Remember, when it comes to mental health, the State of Florida, we're 49<sup>th</sup> in the nation, \$98M for school hardening and \$67M for the school guardian program.

A lot of these issues that I can tell you, we bounce back and forth. I've talked to many of the Council Members here, but also, I'll remind you that when we do go to Tallahassee, you have a hometown hero by the name of Sean Pittman, who also is somebody that myself and Representative Jacquet look up to, in terms of getting information and giving information, and he's always fighting for what we'll talk about later in terms of appropriations for the City of Riviera Beach.

**REPRESENTATIVE A. JACQUET:** And, and not to that go unnoticed, you know, Chairperson, we were on the phone almost regularly on issues that were coming up, Councilwoman Hubbard, we communicate. I've seen many of you up in Tallahassee. Councilwoman Miller-Anderson and Councilman Davis, we have been in constant communication. Mayor, we, we text very frequently making sure that you know what's going on. And I can echo what the Senator said, with Sean Pittman and his team, they're very good. They're very good. And so, they represent you very well, but what's most important is the relationship we all have. Sean is from here, he knows you all. So is our Senator. We work very well together, so having this team..., and you can see when you come up from Palm Beach County the, the way that we get along, and that's what makes the work a lot better.

**SENATOR B. POWELL:** Absolutely. We started to talk about opioids and the House did pass House Bill 21, in the Senate, we passed Senate Bill 8. What that does, is it deals with the opioid crisis, not only in, in the State of Florida but, specifically, Palm Beach County as well. Five hundred and fifty deaths were reported in Palm Beach County in the year 2016. We don't have the numbers for 2017, but I'm sure they've either..., they've either increased or they're, they're close. It creates a three-day medically needy necessary program, seven day supply for prescription drugs and it defines what acute pain is more narrowly, so that people..., doctors aren't prescribing opioids people who don't necessarily need them, because what happens is, sometimes people are prescribed opioids and then they become addicted, and when they can't get those opioids, they go to things like heroin, Fentanyl, Carfentanil and that's what has people dying on the streets. There's issues where people have overdosed once, twice and sometimes three times in a day. If they make it through the second overdose and they try for the third time, usually they're very successful.

These are the Bills that we ran this year. The Bill that we got all the way through from Senate, from my side, is the Land Acquisition Trust Fund. In 2014, I believe it Amendment 1 that passed. It allows for the Land Acquisition Trust Fund to be established in the State of Florida. That would've expired in 2019, we pushed that Bill to go into perpetuity. We had internship tax credits. There was a vote by mail ballot bill which would allow for someone who could take their personal ballot, his or her, to the early voting site, it would have to be that person personally delivering, so it wouldn't be Bobby Powell or somebody else, it would have to be that person and then they could go to the early voting site. That made it all the way until it got to the floor and, and it didn't pass on the floor but

they passed it in the House. So, that's something that will come back next year. Care for retired law enforcement dogs, we passed that on the floor, it didn't move through the House, but would allow for law enforcement dogs to have an annual stipend when they come out of service, for whoever decides to take care of that dog, \$1,500 annually to be reimbursed on that. And then, my issues are always mental illness and the Baker Act. I've had mental illness issues in my family, not me personally, even though people might think that...

[Chuckles]

**SENATOR B. POWELL:** ...but, other people around, and the juvenile justice, you know, the State of Florida, Palm Beach County in particular, at one point...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** The largest, that's right.

**SENATOR B. POWELL:** ...was one of the highest...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Highest.

**SENATOR B. POWELL:** ...ranked in terms of a direct file into the adult prison system. As you know, if you read the Palm Beach Post yesterday, there's a 16-year old in Palm Beach Gardens, which is my District still, who is being direct filed for a Strong Arm..., not Strong Arm but carjacking and he's being direct filed into the adult prison system.

We're going to Representative Jacquet.

**REPRESENTATIVE A. JACQUET:** Some of the Bills I ran this year with the restoration of civil rights, and I know that I wanna say next week, is our reentry, reentry week and so, I applaud Riviera Beach for always being in a leader in that. Representative..., Senator Powell and myself have always supported that initiative. We even work on doing some forums, educating folks on what they need to do. And I do believe that's gonna be on the ballot for 2018 through referendum, collected enough signatures to get it on, on the ballot in 2018. That will be Amendment 4, if I'm not mistaken. So, we're gonna have a huge campaign to make sure that everyone gets educated on how important this is. It's amazing, when you talk about this, some think this is a partisan issue, or this is a white/black issue. It's amazing in the rural parts of Florida how much support this initiative has. So, we're looking forward to this passing with over 60% of the vote. Concealed weapons or concealed firearms. This was dealing with mental health, making sure that someone who's looking to get a, a permit, gets a letter from a mental health doctor that states that that person is okay. They didn't wanna hear that. Tourism development tax. That is about the TDC's. Right now, there are five things that they can use their money for, and they cannot use their money for construction of bridges or any sort of infrastructure. What we did is, we added the sixth option. If they so choose, for example, maybe the, the, the overpass from the Convention Center to CityPlace or whatever the TDC decides, but that money doesn't have to come from you, they have tax dollars from the, from the residents they collect as well. Let them use it to do some of the infrastructure work and that will free up some of the money, we believe, for local government to use. Victim assistance. If something gets stolen, it allows the

officers to tell you where it is, if it's located in a, in a, in a pawn shop. Minimum wage. We've ran that almost every year making sure that we fight to have a minimum wage of at least \$15, at least, \$15. We estimate that that is more in line with the cost of living and how much it takes. I think back with my mother and father who came here and the kind of work that they did. My father retired and didn't make \$15 an hour. And it was very hard for our families, and we feel as if, if a parent can bring home enough money, that's more time they can spend with their kids. That's less time that child will spend out in the street, and will be..., and that's more reading they can do with their kids as well, and be more involved in school. So, it can solve a lot of the issues.

So, so'..., those are some of the pieces of legislation that we ran. One of the other one's I ran, I heard you were talking about taxes earlier. I can tell you, it wasn't that popular, but I don't care. I stood against my party on this piece of legislation and asked that any time we, as a state, nice to see you Reverend, we, as a state, decide to raise your taxes, it should not be a simple majority. It is too easy for us to raise your taxes, and not enough accountability as to what we do with it, so I found that, if it's a two-thirds, then we have to think twice. Before we raise taxes, we better make sure we explain exactly what it's for 'cause people don't mind giving up their taxes, as long as they know that it's too g good use. I supported that and, of course, the business rent tax for people who fall below 130% of the po'..., the federal poverty, we have exemption, complete exemption for your business tax and all the fees.

**SENATOR B. POWELL:** Thank you. We're gonna speed this up. This a, it's a, a snapshot of the budget, it's an \$88.7B budget, as I indicated earlier, went down to \$88.43, I believe. The biggest part of the budget is Health and Human Services, we spent \$37.1B. The largest portion of that is your Medicaid and those funding, and the LIP fund, which is Low Income Pool, and a lot of this stuff. This is an aging state, so a lot of that's in there. Education, \$21.8B. Don't let the wool be pulled over your eyes. We did increase the amount of money that's put in there per, per student funding. That's right, by a whole whopping 47 cents.

I will move on to things that are more important to you. As we talked about the budget, here in Riviera Beach, we got the Riviera Beach/Singer Island South..., South Water Improvement Project, that was \$750,000 allocation. That was something that I can tell you, I worked out back and forth with Representative Jacquet and John Pittman, as well as our Staff, who are the one's running in and out of these offices when we're on the floor. The Riviera Beach Early Learning Pilot Program, we actually requested \$1,000,000, we got funded down to \$150,000. We, we still..., we're still working on that. Hopefully, next year we'll push for more. We..., things..., other things... These are just a lot of the things that we fought for. Jerome Golden, we got \$2000,000, I asked for more than that, but keeping in mind, we push for money for the water treatment plant here in Riviera Beach, that didn't make it through the budget. We got \$150,000 for the Youth Employment Program. At one point, we have \$500,000. We were shooting for a \$1,000,000. That \$500,000 disappeared somewhere and through myself and Representative Jacquet, and John Pittman going and, you know, begging and borrowing and not stealing, we don't steal but arguing with people to get that money put back in the budget. We had \$150,000 that did get cut out of the budget. And, a lot of these things,

we had \$300,000 that was also cut for a Rivera Beach.., not Riviera Beach, the historic Rosemary Museum. And then all of these different projects that we fought for in the budget.

Now, these are the issues that are important to you. We talked about home rule, and the issues regarding home rule. Senate Bill 574 dealt with tree trimming and removal, that was by Senator Steube on my side. It would've preempted local governments from regulating the removal of trees on private property. Guess what it did? That's right, it failed.

[Inaudible comment]

**SENATOR B. POWELL:** Senate Bill 1262, election dates for municipal offices. That would've determined that you all, as you run for office, may have to run in November instead of March as you like to run because the state would've preempted you in terms of when you could set your election dates. That failed because they wanted to bring it to the floor. It got close in the Senate. It passed in the House, but we didn't bring it to the Senate floor. The Senate is usually where Bills go to die. Vacation rentals, it would've preempted all regulation on vacation rental, Air B&B to the state and nullify any local regulations. I thought that was important to keep the local regulations and allow you all to continue to do what you do here, because the state should not be preempting you because you're elected to do your job, so that also failed. And, Representative Jacquet.

**REPRESENTATIVE A. JACQUET:** The CRA's, that was ran by, I think that's Senator Lee that ran that, the CRA Bill. What it would've done is, is really do away with all CRA's, and they would be Sunsetting, and in order for them to come back, they would have to apply directly through the state. We found that to be too cumbersome, and Delray Beach, whether some believe we've had issues with our CRA in Delray Beach, it's really been a model, its done quite a bit of work and we know the purpose of CRA's. But, they have their limited purpose and if it's to undo blight, at some time, at some point in time, we expect them to complete their task. And so, that's where we're at now, the legislature just wants to swing that hammer and just say they're all done, and we're saying it's still needed, perhaps we can shift their geographic boundaries, but these things are still needed in our communities. So, that was crucial for us.

[To Senator Powell]: Was I gonna mention [inaudible] or no?

**SENATOR B. POWELL:** Now, we'll close with this. As you know, we have.., both of have really great teams and really great Staff and, and able to get the jobs in order to be able to get the job done in Tallahassee. The GTJD syndrome that we all have, we use a very highly technical and highly skilled Staff and, on my team this year in Tallahassee, making sure that we did get the job done, we had Mr. Delano Allen, we had Mr. Ben Durgen, who is here with us tonight, and also Ms. MaryAnne Dozier. My contact information's up there, the contact information for my Staff is also there, and anyone who needs to reach my office, they can always reach us at 561-650-6880.

**REPRESENTATIVE A. JACQUET:** Thank you. And, on my Staff, we've got a group of dynamic young men representing you. We've got my legislative aide, Kesnel Theus, who's a recent law grad. He's present today. I mean, dynamic when it comes to legislative issues and, and reading through these bills and really dissecting it. The Senator and I, we can't read every single bill when you're running back and forth to committees, as you know, and having a very learned Staff is extremely, extremely important when you're up there. Marvel Joseph, who is a young man from down here, who's up in Tallahassee manning things. I mean, another guy who's quite dynamic, very intelligent. They respond very well. Our contact information is up there. Please do not hesitate to get in touch with us. As I mentioned, all of your Council Members, continuously stay in touch with us. They, they text us, they call us, they come up and actually visit, which I've told them is, is very, very important, that they see a face. When we're asking for the money for the Summer Youth Employment Program, is one thing, when Sean Pittman's asking, it's one thing. That's a lobbyist, that's a legislator, but the principal, the person who it really comes to, your Council Members, they've always been engaged. I can tell you, out of all the cities, I think, percentage wise, more of you come up to Tallahassee than others, and, and, and we hope that's gonna show next year when we get a Governor that's more in line with what we want.

**SENATOR B. POWELL:** I thank you all and we're glad to be in the City of Riviera Beach. We will now entertain any questions, comments, or conversation.

[Applause]

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Mayor, then Ms. Botel.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yes. Thank you.

Governor Scott had announced when he was...

**UNK.:** Never heard of him.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** [Chuckle]. The Governor of Florida, just in case. He announced that he wanted to put money, not only for mental health but for metal detectors, in the schools. Is that still.., is that within that... I didn't see that up there, Al.

**REPRESENTATIVE A. JACQUET:** Yes, Mayor. And, and you're correct. They did want to put in metal detectors as well. That's part of the entire school hardening program. [Stammer]. I'm sorry. This piece of legislation really upset me because, because what they did, is what.., the NRA's [stammer] been fighting for forever, has been to put guns in schools. They've been fighting for this. Every year we have legislation that says well, if a school is attached to a church, can you bring a gun? They've always been trying to expand the places you can bring guns. And here, instead of doing what these Parkland youth were asking for, their parents were asking, they came and they were clear, we

wanna ban assault style weapons. They are military grade, they do not belong in our streets. As a matter of fact, our law enforcement officers are in more danger. When they kick down a door and these guys have AR-15's and, and .47's, and who knows what with the bump stocks...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** That's an issue.

**REPRESENTATIVE A. JACQUET:** That, that's an issue. These belong in the military, not on the streets. So, what they did is, they found a way to put more guns out in the streets by allowing certain staff in schools to have, to have guns. Metal detectors, yes, it could prevent someone walking through the school, but now our kids are going through schools that look more like prisons. And I don't feel as if the learning environment is really appropriate for them to learn that, that the maximum amount that we expect them to learn when they're sitting there getting checked and metal detectors, maybe dogs walking around...

[Inaudible audience comment]

**REPRESENTATIVE A. JACQUET:** ...teachers have guns, we're now in a war zone when we're in school.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** And I...

**REPRESENTATIVE A. JACQUET:** I think we can do much better if we ban the AR-15, if we ban the AK-47 and we ban these dangerous military style weapons. We won't have the same worry 'cause all of those mass shootings, one thing they have in common, is these assault style weapons, because the handgun, when they've been used, as soon as they reload, somebody took them out.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** And I, I certainly agree with you, we certainly don't want our schools to mimic or look like prisons, but neither do we want them to look like cemeteries either.

I wanna ask you about the internship tax credit. Did that pass?

**SENATOR B. POWELL:** No.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** That failed?

**SENATOR B. POWELL:** Abs'.., yes.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay. And the tourism development tax, that passed or failed?

**REPRESENTATIVE A. JACQUET:** I believe that passed.

**SENATOR B. POWELL:** That passed.

**REPRESENTATIVE A. JACQUET:** Yes.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay. On that on.

**REPRESENTATIVE A. JACQUET:** Yes.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** So, the tourism board gets the money? How, how does that work?

**REPRESENTATIVE A. JACQUET:** Right now, they, they are.., they're, they are currently getting money. By relationship with the county, they have their assessment that they get, their tax dollars, their millage that they get. And so, that money that the TDC gets, they have options per statute on what they can use it for. And there are five options. For example, marketing, you can hire a team from Chicago to come and promote Palm Beach County and pay them \$3,000,000, you can hire, you know, whatever it is, it's marketing and advertising, those sorts of things, but not enough of the dollars go to actual infrastructure. That's left to you, that's left to the county, that's left to local government. So now, your tax dollars already limited, it's hard to raise the millage, especially when your residents are doing.., are struggling, and now you have to divvy up your dollars among infrastructure work that is gonna be helpful to tourism. And yet, that's why we have a Tourist Development Council, is to do exactly that. So, we didn't mandate that they must use it for such, we gave them one more option. They don't have to use it for that. But, they have six choices on where.., they can use all the dollars on one option, if they...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** And the reason...

**REPRESENTATIVE A. JACQUET:** ...So choose.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** The reason why I asked you that, because as you, as you know, Riviera Beach is probably the number one tourist location now because of.., thanks to the Port, with the ships every day going to the Bahamas, which we don't see, we don't get any money, any tax, anything from the Port. So, my point is, maybe through this tax thing that's going to the.., I would like you to look into that to the tax.., to the tourism board and maybe they can contribute something to the City for marketing or, or something, as it relates to offsetting or, or either letting people know about what we have in the City as well.

**SENATOR B. POWELL:** Thank you, Mayor. That goes through, generally, Visit Florida who got \$76,000,000 in the budget this year and I can put you in contact with...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you. Yeah. We need to...

**SENATOR B. POWELL:** [Inaudible]....

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...see some of that money.

**SENATOR B. POWELL:** ...secretary of that. Yeah.



**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you. Thank you, Madam Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Botel.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Thank you, Madam Chair.

Senator Powell and Representative Jacquet, I appreciate your coming here this evening to speak with us, however, I think that our time might be a little bit limited this evening and I would appreciate having a lengthier conversation with you, as well as Mr. Pittman, so that we could really get into some of these legislative issues.

I have a little bit of a bone to pick with you regrading Senate Bill 804 and House Bill 631. I believe, Senator Powell, this is something that you might have voted for?

**SENATOR B. POWELL:** Senate Bill 804, can you tell me what that is?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes. It's the beach access bill.

**SENATOR B. POWELL:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** It has.., I could use the word enraged, annoyed, upset, aggravated a good number of my constituents on Singer Island, and I believe that many of my constituents in Riviera Beach on the westside as well because it limits our access to the beach. And, as we know, walking along the beach is the quintessential Florida experience. If we begin to limit the access that people have to the beach, we begin to limit our tourism and our tourism dollars. And what we don't want to see happen, is that people come down here to Florida and are prohibited from walking on the beach. I attempted to put this on a Council Agenda, but I am not permitted to put things on a Council Agenda unless they go through the Chair of the Council and it has, therefore, not been put on an Agenda. I will leave that enough said, and hope that it can be put on a future Council Agenda and hope that you will come back at some point and discuss this very important topic. This is critically important to us.

**SENATOR B. POWELL:** And, and let me.., I hate to do this, uh, we have to go to another event, another meeting where we're gonna do another update.

So, what I will tell you is that, when you talk about a piece of legislation like that, we can't get into the details. I can always you this, I'm a.., I am, my, my.., what I do is, I'm a certified planner and I look at every Bill in detail and what I can tell you is that, if I voted for it, I had a reason for it.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Okay.

**SENATOR B. POWELL:** You may be upset, and there may be a group that's on the other side of that piece of legislation, but what we can do, we can sit down and we may walk away, but at, at the end of the day, we may agree to disagree and I will tell you that, as a legislator, 100% of the time I will never make 100% of the people happy. And we will discuss it further when we get [inaudible]...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Good. And you know what, it may be something that's not gonna hurt us at all but, frankly, I just wanna know more. It may be...

**SENATOR B. POWELL:** We will.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** ...we have fairly good beach access, public access. I live in the Tiara. Right next to the Tiara, there's was a wonderful beach, way to the beach but there are, there are lots of issues around this, so all I want is an opportunity to discuss it with you. It's not even mentioned. I have the Pittman Group end of session report, it's not even in here. That bothered me because I couldn't even read this about it. So, that's the one, that's one issue.

The second issue that I asked to have put on the Agenda is the issue of gun control. Many, many cities, as I'm sure you're well aware, and I'm looking at, 'Cities, counties take aim at state gun law,' I'm looking at, 'In Florida, cities challenge state on gun regulations,' 'Florida cities to sue state officials.' There are lots of cities like us who are challenging the state. I would like Riviera Beach to be one of those cities. Why can't we ban assault weapons ourselves? I don't wanna take a lotta time on this, this evening's Agenda, but I would like us, as a City, to take a look at this, with your help. Can we, as a City, ban assault weapons? I, I see in this particular article, that we might face getting thrown off Council.

**SENATOR B. POWELL:** I, I think...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Well, if it takes that to protect, protect our kids, I'm willing to say let's go and do it.

**SENATOR B. POWELL:** That's a great point, Council Member, and, and you're right on. That, that is the legal question right now facing the courts, whether the cities have that right. I, as an attorney, believe you do. Constitutionally, home rule, when it comes to the health, safety and welfare of your residents, you should have that right, but there are suits going on and it's being challenged saying that you're not allowed to and it's preemptive. But I would agree, I would agree with you. I think if more municipalities take that position, we at least, at minimum, even if they don't you that right, we at minimum, will force the state and others to do what we want.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Exactly.

**SENATOR B. POWELL:** Councilwoman...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** And, and I would like to see us join those cities who are brave enough to take that step.

**SENATOR B. POWELL:** And, and I would like to, we can pass a Resolution here in the City, but I also remind you that, as you indicated, this is something that moved several years ago with the legislator and, when you talk about let's join them, I'd be very cautious in terms of bringing the City of Riviera Beach into another lawsuit and spending taxpayer

dollars. In, in a legal battle that we know has been fought time and time again that we, we can't... So, let's just...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Well, again...

**SENATOR B. POWELL:** ...pull it back...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** ...what I, what I wanna do...

**SENATOR B. POWELL:** ...just a little bit and we'll...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** ...is have the...

**SENATOR B. POWELL:** ...we'll have a...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** ...conversation.

**SENATOR B. POWELL:** ...arduous comp'...

[Inaudible comment]

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Have the conversation.

**SENATOR B. POWELL:** ...more comprehensive discussion at a later date.

**REPRESENTATIVE A. JACQUET:** And, and...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Thank you.

**REPRESENTATIVE A. JACQUET:** ...Council Member, just to, just to let the folks know, the House Bill 631 that you mentioned by Representative Edwards, the, the mail focus of that Bill, and you're right, it did have that beach access concern. The mail focus of that Bill was for ejection. If somebody was in your property, if you didn't have any agreement with them, they're in your property [inaudible], the ability to get them off, but there was the piece that Council Member correctly pointed out, some concerns about beach access. That question was asked and I promise you, we'll sit down and explain it to you. I think there's some misunderstanding exactly what that... The same concerns came up, and so, we can sit down, I tell you, the Senator voted for it, believe me, there is a good reason.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** So...

**REPRESENTATIVE A. JACQUET:** 'Cause he's not afraid to go up against...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** I only...

**REPRESENTATIVE A. JACQUET:** ...anybody. So...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** ...wanna be able to explain...

**REPRESENTATIVE A. JACQUET:** ...we will sit down...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** ...to the people how, how they can walk along the beach without being obstructed...

**REPRESENTATIVE A. JACQUET:** Perfect.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** ...from being able to do that.

**REPRESENTATIVE A. JACQUET:** And I invite all of your Council Members, sit down we can have coffee together. This is a perfect opportunity as a one on one to really flush out a lot of the issues. As you mentioned, this is very limited. We can have a frank dialog on how we can go forward and what is important to you. What you did not see on there, is perhaps we could not list everything that happened [stammer] and it's a lot. And so, because that is particular to you and the community where you're from, I need to know that. So, next time, we'll address that and we'll take care of that.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** And let's talk about a workshop.

**REPRESENTATIVE A. JACQUET:** Perfect.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**REPRESENTATIVE A. JACQUET:** Thank you so much, Council.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Let me just state for the record, that the information that the Councilwoman is alluding to, I thought it best for us to do a workshop with the electives, and with both you and the Senator. And so, therefore, I would put that on an Agenda. We will check with your office to find out your avail'.., availability and we will get that schedule so that we can know what you know and you can hear our concerns, and those can be addressed with your colleagues.

**REPRESENTATIVE A. JACQUET:** We look forward to it.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Thank you.

**REPRESENTATIVE A. JACQUET:** I can tell you, the Senator and I, this is the highlight of our legislative updates. We love being here in Riviera Beach, so when you have that workshop, we would love to be here to really flush out these.., it's more of a workshop conversation, and I think we're gonna get to the bottom of it.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** So, let me just say on behalf of the Mayor and Council, we thank you so much for bringing this update and we look forward to working for.., with you in the next session.

**REPRESENTATIVE A. JACQUET:** Thank you, Chair...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Good night.

**REPRESENTATIVE A. JACQUET:** ...Mayor...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**REPRESENTATIVE A. JACQUET:** ...Council Members, and thank you, Commissioner, Commissioner Neering, and I see him in the building, so...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Mr. Powell, I...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, sir.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...know you're glad to have MaryAnne Dozier.

**MR. B. POWELL:** Thank you all.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** You're proud to have MaryAnne Dozier, that's Riviera Beach too.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Clerk.

**MR. B. POWELL:** Yeah. Oh, yeah.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yeah.

**MR. B. POWELL:** [Inaudible].

[Chuckles]

15.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY: PRESENTATION BY CITY OF WEST PALM BEACH  
COMMISSIONER CORY NEERING – “TIES THAT BIND”**

[Applause]

**CITY COMMISSIONER C. NEERING:** Good evening.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Good evening.

**CITY COMMISSIONER C. NEERING:** Mayor...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Good evening.

**CITY COMMISSIONER C. NEERING:** ...Chairperson, City Staff and Council Members. I., first of all, let me say thank you very much. This, this is indeed an honor. My name is Cory Neering. I have the honor of representing the residents of West Palm Beach as City Commissioner, and what you may not know is that I, I spent my formative years growing up here in Riviera Beach, 2820 Avenue S, Apartment 4. I attended Washington

Elementary and Allamanda Elementary, so the City has a special place in my heart and I'm glad to be here tonight.

Thank you for this opportunity to introduce "Ties that Bind." It's a local non-profit, and I wanna give a special thanks to Chairperson Davis Johnson for your support of this initiative and with your support, we were able to take a group of young people to Washington, D.C., in particular, we were able to take four young men who reside here in the City of Riviera Beach to Washington, D.C. during spring break. And, they're here tonight. I'm gonna introduce two of them and they're gonna tell you a little bit about their experience. What I will say is, again, this presentation will be brief, I know you have a packed Agenda but I, I think it's important, I wanted to just do a quick overview of Ties that Bind. It is the umbrella for three initiatives and we're gonna talk about one very briefly tonight, which is the annual D.C. trip during spring break. But we also have our Youth Development and Etiquette Workshop. Those happen throughout the year and it is my goal to bring that particular workshop to the City of Riviera Beach on Saturday, May 26<sup>th</sup>. I would love to follow up with the Council to see if we can find a location. And what... in essence, what the workshop does is it works with a group of young men, anywhere from 50 to 100 young men, teens. The highlight of that is, we have mentors that literally spend the day in workshops, talking about social etiquette, life skills and we teach them how to tie a tie. I mean, literally, that is the, the piece that binds all of us. So that, that's one of the initiatives.

The other initiative, and it's one that's been happening here in the City for many years so I don't take credit for it in the City of Riviera Beach, but in West Palm Beach, but in West Palm Beach, we have our annual High Five Back to School event. And so, that's where we invite men and women in the community to come out and volunteer on the first day of school to greet our young people, both in elementary, middle and high school. If you recall, all of us, our first day in school and there's both excitement and anxiety that comes along with that. So, we have six schools in the City of Riviera, I'm sorry, the City of West Palm Beach, we have branched out. We're in Glades, Boynton Beach, and Delray Beach. And again, I know that that is happening to some extent, here in Riviera Beach. I'd love to see that county wide.

And then finally, we have our annual Washington, D.C. spring break trip where we take anywhere from eight to ten young people who reside in Palm Beach County, and I'm proud to say that four of them reside in the City of Riviera Beach, this particular year, to Washington, D.C. Now, you can't do this work alone, and so, there have been a tremendous amount of people who have supported Ties that Bind. There are several who are here tonight, I just wanna quick'.., quickly introduce them, Ricky Aiken, who is the Founder and Executive Director of Inner City Innovators. He is doing a tremendous job in the inner city in West Palm Beach, and if you've not heard of Inner City Innovators, I invite you to look at his website and see some of the great work that he's doing. We have Reverend Kevin Jones, who is the assistant Pastor at Tabernacle Missionary Baptist Church. Again, a real advocate for our community and our county. And then finally, we have Latoya Neering, my wife and sometimes boss, who also is very, very...

[Chuckles]

**CITY COMMISSIONER C. NEERING:** ...very supportive and.., of this initiative. And so tonight, we have two young men, we have Sean Williams and Reece Adams who are going to just take a minute and talk a little bit about their experience in Washington. And I, I don't wanna steal their thunder but I do wanna say this, we spent three days in Washington, D.C. We had a chance to tour the United States Supreme Court, the young men had a chance to see the first thirty minutes of an argument, an actual argument with the Justices on the dais. They got a chance to see the preamble and all the pomp and circumstance that come along with that. We got a chance to tour the U.S. Capital, the MLK Memorial, Howard University and finally, we spent the day, which was really the highlight, one of the highlights of the trip, at the National Museum of African American History and Culture. So, we, we did a lot in three days and I'm gonna ask these two young men if they will just talk very briefly about their experience.

Sean Williams.

**MR. S. WILLIAMS:** Good evening.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Good evening.

**MR. S. WILLIAMS:** It was, it was just different to get out of Riviera Beach and go to another state and it was, it was very just... [Pause].

**CITY COMMISSIONER C. NEERING:** Talk about some of the things that you did.

**MR. S. WILLIAMS:** Okay. We.., we went to the African America Museum, as he said, and spent a long time there. It was, it was just a lot of information, you can be there for, like, a week if you wanted to...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** [Chuckle].

**MR. S. WILLIAMS:** ...'cause it was, it was just a lot to soak in. I learned a lot. We also went to, let me see... Went to the Supreme Court and we watch an argument for about thirty minutes and [pause]...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Guess you had a lot of fun, right?

**MR. S. WILLIAMS:** Yeah. It was a lot of fun. Yes, sir.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** [Chuckle].

**MR. R. ADAMS:** Good evening. I'm Reece Adams and, as he said, I live in Riviera Beach and at the Washington trip, I got to learn a lot about, like, African American history at the MLK Monument and the Smithsonian, I believe the name of it is, Art Museum. And, it was just a lot to soak in, it was a good opportunity and I would just like thank you guys for supporting that trip.

**UNK.:** Right.

[Applause]

**CITY COMMISSIONER C. NEERING:** So again, again, I wanna thank you. And, you know, I have a motto, I don't know if I coined it per se but, you know, you only know because someone taught you. So, every experience, just to be able to sit up on this dais, you know, whether it was an experience of someone that fed into your life at some point in time, you only know because someone taught you. So, we know how important exposure is for our young people, and, you know, I really believe that all of us have a gift and so, whether you take ten kids to D.C. or 5,000, use your gift and make it happen.

So, thank you for providing this opportunity for these young people, and I look forward to partnering with you in the future.

[Applause]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, Mr. Neering and your entire team for the work that you do with these young men.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Clerk.

16.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY: PROCLAMATION FROM THE OFFICE OF THE MAYOR PROCLAIMING APRIL 22-28<sup>TH</sup> AS REENTRY WEEK IN THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH**

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair, Proclamation from the Office of the Mayor.

WHEREAS, more than 600,000 men and women leave American prisons every year. More than 11,000,000 people annually cycle through our nation jails. The national recidivism rates top 50% and thousands of adults and juveniles return from incarceration to Palm Beach County each year; and

WHEREAS, it costs \$18,000 per year to house an adult inmate at the state level, \$48,910 per year at the local level, and \$50,000 per year to house a juvenile; and

WHEREAS...

**CHIEF OF STAFF ISAACS:** WHEREAS, the work that has been done by the county's reentry task force and the Riviera Beach Reentry Center, plays an integral role in the county's collaborative efforts that has made Palm Beach County a national leader in the reentry services; and

WHEREAS, the citizens returning to Riviera Beach and Palm Beach County have benefitted from the important work of the community partners who have cut recidivism rates in half and provided returning citizens unprecedented access to job training, healthcare, housing, case management and have put thousands of individuals on a path to productive, successful lives; and



WHEREAS, the demand for reentry services remains high and the investments we make today, will pay dividends for returning citizens and for public safety in Riviera Beach.

NOW THEREFORE, I, Bishop Thomas Masters, Mayor of the City of Riviera Beach, I do hereby declare and proclaim April 22<sup>nd</sup> through the 28, 2018 as the reentry week, into our City and implore all citizens to be aware that encouraging the restoration, reintegration of persons who have paid their debt to society, ultimately makes communities safer and saves taxpayer dollars by lowering the direct collateral costs of incarceration.

And let me just add, that we're pleased that the reentry program in our City is going to participate Friday, April the 20 at 9:00 a.m., to be there to help people who have been incarcerated and looking for a job and they have a great program to try to reconnect them to our local City and, and to also give them job opportunities and they work hand-in-hand with the Mayor's Office and we're very proud that they'll be there. So, any returning citizens, this is a good opportunity for you to be there as well, Friday, April the 20<sup>th</sup> at 9:00 a.m.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I HEREUNTO set my hand and I've caused the official seal of the City of Riviera Beach, Florida to be affixed this 18<sup>th</sup> day of April, 2018. Thomas A. Masters, Mayor. Attest, Claudene L. Anthony, MMC and all those other 'C's'.

Thank you so much. I would like to give this to Mr. Orie, who is the Director of the [inaudible] Riviera Beach, this is countywide. [Inaudible].

**MR. ORRIE:** Good evening, Council. We just wanna thank you all on behalf of the Reentry Center and my staff, we have some staff here.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** They can stand.

**MR. ORRIE:** If they can stand, please. We have our regional coordinator and our case manager, Ron Dixon and Minnika Veasy We just wanna thank you all for begin staunch advocates for reentry and Riviera Beach leads our community in reentry initiatives. Next weeks is Reentry Week in the county, as well as Riviera Beach and we have a lot of activities planned. We're gonna be pretty busy next week. Here, locally, we're hosting a Reentry Awareness Night, just wanted to invite everyone out. It's gonna be at the Marina Event Center at 6:00 o'clock on Monday, April 23<sup>rd</sup>. We'll actually have food and we'll be able to kinda go through some of these experiences of our, some of our clients. So, we're inviting everyone out to that activity, but we also have some other activities planned throughout the week.

So, thank you again. We appreciate all you all support.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

[Applause]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Clerk.

**17. CITY CLERK ANTHONY: PRESENTATION TO COUNCILPERSON KASHAMBA MILLER-ANDERSON FOR SERVING AS CHAIRPERSON OF THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH CITY COUNCIL**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you. So, as there is no formal ceremony to recognize the service offered by a previous Chair, I wanted to take this opportunity, along with my colleagues, to recognize our immediate passed Chairwoman for her service to this Council and its residents. So, on behalf of the Mayor and Council, I would like to official thank you, Councilwoman KaShamba Miller-Anderson for your commitment and dedication to the business of the City. Please accept this token of appreciation as your service as Chairwoman of the City of Riviera Beach City Council from May 3, 2017 to March 7, 2018.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you very much.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** The shortest term Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** If I may? The plaque reads:

Thank you for your leadership and service to the City of Riviera Beach.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** And, we also have your gavel.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Oh. Thank you.

[Applause]

**MAYOR MASTERS:** And your name is on it, your..., on the gavel.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you very much. I was glad to pass the gavel over to you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you so much. Madam Clerk.

**18. CITY CLERK ANTHONY: A PROCLAMATION PROCLAIMING APRIL 29 – MAY 5<sup>TH</sup> AS NATIONAL SMALL BUSINESS WEEK.**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** This is a Proclamation of the City Council of the City of Riviera Beach declaring April 30<sup>th</sup> through May 3, 2018, as the City of Riviera Beach Small Business Week.

WHEREAS, every year since 1963, the President of the United States has issued a proclamation announcing National Small Business Week, which recognizes the critical contributions of America’s entrepreneurs and small business owners; and

WHEREAS, more than half of Americans either own or work for a small business and they create about two out of every three new jobs in the U.S. each year; and

WHEREAS, April 29<sup>th</sup> through May 5, 2018 has been designated as National Small Business Week and the City of Riviera Beach is pleased to join in the celebration; and

WHEREAS, as part of the National Small Business Week, the U.S. Small Business Administration takes the opportunity to highlight the impact of outstanding entrepreneurs, small business owners and others from all 50 states in U.S. territories; and

WHEREAS, as part of National Small Business Week, the City of Riviera Beach takes this opportunity to celebrate and recognize the contributions and importance of small businesses on the local economy; and

NOW THEREFORE, be it proclaimed by the City of Riviera Beach City Council, Riviera Beach, Florida assembled in regular session this 18<sup>th</sup> day of April, that the week of April 30<sup>th</sup> – May 3, 2018 in the City of Riviera Beach is hereby proclaimed City of Riviera Beach Small Business Week.

BE IT FURTHER PROCLAIMED by the City of Riviera, Palm Beach County, Florida that this Proclamation is duly sealed and executed by the Members of this Council. The foregoing Proclamation was sponsored by Chairwoman Tonya Davis Johnson and upon unanimous consent of the Council, the Mayor declared the Proclamation duly enacted.

Thank you. I share this with my, with my colleagues and we want you to know that here, in Riviera Beach, we are concerned about our local small businesses and the work and services that they can provide. So, what we will do is we will share, while we don't have a series of activities planned for the City, Palm Beach County does have a week of activities that have been planned, offering various sessions for local small businesses. We will get that information up and distributed out so that our local small businesses here can take part in that celebration. So, thank you Mayor and Council for supporting this Proclamation.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** You're welcome. Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** PUBLIC COMMENTS SHALL BEGIN AT 7:30 P.M. UNLESS THERE IS NO FURTHER BUSINESS OF THE CITY COUNCIL WHICH, IN THAT EVENT, IT SHALL BEGIN SOONER. IN ADDITION, IF AN ITEM IS BEING CONSIDERED AT 7:30 P.M., THEN COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC SHALL BEGIN IMMEDIATELY AFTER THE ITEM HAS BEEN CONCLUDED. ANY PERSON WHO WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK DURING PUBLIC COMMENTS, PLEASE FILL OUT A PUBLIC COMMENT CARD LOCATED ON THE TABLE DIRECTLY OUTSIDE OF THE COUNCIL CHAMBERS AND GIVE IT TO THE STAFF BEFORE THE PUBLIC COMMENT SECTION IS ANNOUNCED.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Clerk.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, the acceptance of public comment cards is now closed. Norma Duncombe, Kim Denmark, Dr. Phillip Dukes.

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** I guess I continue to say this, in terms of this being my home all of my life, and I take issue anytime I hear people making derogatory statements about this City. I realize we have to work hard and we have to move forward, but when someone makes a derogatory remark about the City, I take issue with it. I'm going back to the card that I received during the election. And which it was stated, from out new'.., newly elected person, that this City's the most dangerous City in the county. I have never heard a public official address their city that way. I never heard anybody from Orlando say anything about their city after about 50 persons were killed, I never heard Vegas, any official say that their city was dangerous, after over 500 people were shot. Now, what I'm saying is, if you say the City's the most dangerous City in the county, then I need to know that you have a plan to turn it around. For whatever reason, and, and I, you know, it, it.., the reason it bothers me, is because what you are doing is stigmatizing all of us who live here. You're not saying, 'that person,' you said the City is the most dangerous in the county.

And, my thing is, if you, and, and the people who voted for you, they voted for you, I'm, I'm not dealing with that, I'm dealing with, when you make those kinds of statements, what do you have in your plans to turn it around? Especially, after I read in the newspapers, that your place was the place that they took drugs and drug money...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Ms. Duncombe.

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** ...out of.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** It's out of order.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Ms. Duncombe.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Out of order.

**UNK.:** Tonya.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** That's out of order.

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** And so...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** One moment. I...

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** And so, and you can answer. I, I...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** No, no, no.

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** ...want you to an'...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Ms., Ms. Duncombe, we're not...

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** Wait, wait...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...going to...

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** ...wait, wait, wait.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...disparage. I appreciate...

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** Wait, wait. You're not gonna tell me what I can say.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Ms. Duncombe, if...

[Inaudible audience comment]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...if you fall out...

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** You cannot tell me...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...of the rules of decorum

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** ...what I can say.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Point of order, Ms. Duncombe.

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** Okay. I., wait a minute. But I want my minutes. When people attacked the City Attorney, and they call him everything under the sun, and he is not a pretty child, but his mother loves him, nobody ever said point of order. Nobody ever...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** That may have been...

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** ...said point of order

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...Mrs. Duncombe.

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** So, I...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** However...

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** ...am addressing an issue that came in my mailbox.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Right. However...

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** And I have the right to address that issues. And I have the right to ask., and, and she can give an answer if she wants to, but she does not have to give an answer, but I have the right to address that. It was in the newspapers that drugs were pulled from her place...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Ms. Duncombe.

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** Money...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Ms. Duncombe...

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** ...and drugs.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I am calling...

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** And I'm saying...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...point of order.

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** Okay. But, I'm saying you cannot tell me what I can talk about.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** But what we can...

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** I am...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...say, Ms. Duncombe, please, hear me out.

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** [Stammer]...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** We have asked for decorum, we have asked for...

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** That's right.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...order, we spoke just at the very last meeting, that we would not spend time attacking the citizens and, therefore, we don't want that same type of attack here. I am kindly asking you, Mrs. Duncombe.

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** Okay. But...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I am not trying to tell you what to say, I am trying to help you, help us continue in decorum and order, and that is disparaging.

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** And that's the position...

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** When...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...that I'm taking...

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** When...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...as Chair.

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** When I sat here...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I can't speak...

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** ...and listened to people say.., and he's no special friend of mine...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Officer.

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** He's not related to me.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mrs. Duncombe.

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** But, when I heard people talk about the Attorney, and, and made all kinds of statements about him...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay.

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** ...I didn't like it.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Well, let me say this...

[Inaudible comment]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...to you, Mrs. Duncombe...

[Officer approaches Mrs. Duncombe]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Please.

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** No, you cannot.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes, he can.

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** I have the right to speak.

[Inaudible audience comments]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** He can ask you to...

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** No. You cannot.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...sit, Mrs. Duncombe.

[Inaudible officer comments]

**UNK. AUDIENCE:** Yes, he can.

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** I have the right to speak.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I need to call a recess, please.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you, [inaudible]...

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** I., no.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I'm not doing this.

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** No.

[Video stops]

[Video restarts]

[Before gavel discussion between Chairperson Davis Johnson and Mr. Lloyd Brown]

### **CALL TO ORDER**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** We are calling the, we are calling the meeting back to order.

Let me, let me state this. I cannot speak for what has happened in the past and how decorum has been handled, but as Chair and being responsible for the order of the meeting, I have read that...

the City Council has adopted rules of decorum governing public conduct during official meetings, which has been posted at the entrance of the Chambers. In an effort to preserve order, if any of the rules are not adhered to, the Chairperson may have any disruptive speaker or attendee removed from the podium, from the meeting and/or the building, if necessary.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** And the statement concludes with, 'Please govern yourselves accordingly.' It is not my desire to prevent anyone from making comments, but we have had such volatile meetings, we have attacked each other in both directions, and it is just our desire.., we had a conversation as a collective body that it was our desire to have meetings to run smoothly, to have meetings that were not defaming of character or to be disparaging. I want to be fair to every citizen that comes before this dais during their public comments, but we agree, and we had this conversation at the very last meeting, that we would not disparage, defame, or otherwise insult the dais or nor would the dais do that to the residents, and to the audience. And so, therefore, that was the reason for me calling point of order and trying to restore order because it may be your feelings, and everyone is entitled to their feelings. However, when we attack each other, it is counterproductive, and it does nothing for the City, for this body and for this community. So, I want to hold fast to that, and I believe that my colleagues join me in this as we discussed it from this dais, so we will move forward with our rules of decorum and expect that this body will be respectful to that body and reverse. So, if we could all agree that we will move in that vein, that will allow us to have a productive meeting and to not have inflammatory accusations or comments. Thank you.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair, I have a question.[Pause]. Please, to you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Mayor.



**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yes. Thank you. The young man who said he had an emergency, from Belle Glades, and didn't make it in time, my question is, if there is someone out in the audience who that wanna give him a minute of their time, is that allowed, allowed?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Mayor, we have, to my knowledge, we have not transferred time over. And [pause], I've sat as Chair since March, I've not done anything before other than try to govern this meeting. So, what, what I will say, Mr. Mayor, is we don't want to start a precedent. We have always said that public comments be concl'.., we will close public comments at the beginning. We are now doing our best to start our... Point of order, please. We are doing our best to make sure that our public comments begin at 7:30 because we do value your time, and we know that our meetings are held late. So, therefore, we are trying to make sure that we provide the opportunity for public comment in a timely manner.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I understand.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** And we will do our absolute best.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I understand that, Madam Chair, but, I mean, we do allow for emergencies. I mean, it's not something that just happened, it just.., he had an emergency and I'm wondering if the Council can give him.., since it was an emergency, and we don't wanna start changing rules, but we should make some accommodation for someone who tells us that he had a emergency and they came from out of town, just didn't get here in time, can the Council respond, and grant him the three minutes?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Mayor, you will be setting a precedent because, if you say'.., if you say now that one emergency is allowable to open up the closed comment section, anyone moving forward can have an emergency or some other situation and we will continue to have to allow the acceptance of comment cards after the public comment period has been closed. I do believe that the former Chairs can agree that once public comments were closed, it was closed and there were no opportunities to reopen. Is that correct?

[Inaudible comment]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I am not doing anything that has not been our policy here.

[Inaudible audience comment]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Ms., Mrs. Brown, I point of order on you. I.., this conversation, we don't wanna do the back and forth, please.

[Inaudible audience comment]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, Mrs. Brown.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay, Madam Chair. I guess if you, you, you have, you know, if that's how you feel, and the Council feels the same way obviously, I just think that we should, should've made an exception. That's just my personal opinion.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, Mr. Mayor.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you. Since he's out of town, came from out of town.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, Mr. Mayor.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** You're welcome. Continue, Madam Clerk, please.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Kim Denmark, Dr. Phillip Dukes, Cora Masters Barry.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** How are you, Ms. Denmark?

**MS. K. DENMARK:** My name is Kim Denmark. I'm from Dayton, Ohio and I'm the lady walking across United States. When I came to your City some time ago, I was coming south, now I'm going north. And what I have in mind to say, I changed my mind. And I would like to say what's on my heart.

[Singing]: When you walk through a storm, hold your head up high and don't be afraid of the dark. At the end of a storm there's a golden crown and the sweet silver line of the night, walk on through the wind, walk on through the rain, through your dreams be tossed and blown. I'll call.

I said that because no matter what storms are in your life, you gotta keep going.

[Inaudible comment]

**MS. K. DENMARK:** If I can walk sixteen states, with nothing, leaving my home, my business, all in the name of homelessness and poverty, and our veterans that are homeless, living on the streets, and certainly all of you in this room can walk on. Tomorrow's not promised.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yes.

**MS. K. DENMARK:** I come with love and peace, and the God that I serve has ordered my steps and I happened to be going through Riviera Beach right now. The men that are with me, were formerly homeless. I've taken over 300 homeless people off the streets of America, sixteen states, thirty-three pair of shoes. I love you guys, my time is up. My ultimate goal is to build a self-sufficiency campus one day, but I ask each and every one of you to pray for Riviera Beach, 'cause I'm gonna pray. I'm gonna lay some oil in this City before I leave...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** [Inaudible].

[Inaudible audience comment]

**MS. K. DENMARK:** Because I see there's love. And there's people here, and there is unity. And I hope I haven't extended my time. These are very important men, one is a veteran, living outside in the park. The other one's living in another park.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Mm, mm, mm.

**MS. K. DENMARK:** And you meet people where they are drugs, heroin, mental health. Somebody me to walk, and it seemed crazy but when I took that first step, he said I will provide. And that first step was in the name of the Father, my second was his son, and the third has taken me across sixteen states.

I love you guys. I bring love and peace [inaudible] right now. God bless you all.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you so much.

**MS. K. DENMARK:** Masters, thank you. I love you, you know I do.

[Audience clapping]

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you.

**MS. K. DENMARK:** And congratulations, Ms. Botel.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**MS. K. DENMARK:** Keep up the good work.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Bless you.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** God bless you. Keep walking.

**MS. K. DENMARK:** [Inaudible] be alright.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Give her a hand. Anybody walking across America deserves a hand.

[Applause]

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Dr. Phillip Dukes, Cora Masters Barry, David Brady.

**DR. P. DUKES:** Dr. Phillip Dukes, 1217 Avenue U, Riviera Beach, Florida. Madam Chair, Council, Mayor's Office.

On May 19<sup>th</sup> from 1:00 to 4:00 p.m., we will have our Change our Community Atmosphere Rally, at 1217 Avenue U in the City of Riviera Beach, and everyone is invited to come out. I'm asking the City Council to waive some fees for me, for information I'm trying to get from the Police Department. We've already spent about \$60 getting some information, and [inaudible] information that's the \$91, I'm asking you to waive that fee so we can educate our citizens on what's actually going on in our communities. Let me give

you some numbers. Last time I gave you some numbers, we only did ten states. Between..., for every one person that dies in a police shooting, forty-five to fifty die in the African American community from gun violence. For every one that die in school..., and, when anybody' child die, that's a serious thing..., we have 60 that die in the African American community. In the City of Riviera Beach, from 2011 to 2018, there has been 76 murders. There's about twelve to fourteen every year, averaging between twelve..., I mean, not twelve, sixteen and twenty-seven. So, I wanna get these statistics out, so we can educate our people how we can stop gun violence.

Now, the drug retail market is what breeds all these things. We have a lot of beautiful things going on in our City. One time, Jesus was talking to a group of people and he said this. He said, 'you've done this, that and the other, but the weighted matter you left undone,' and we're in the backyard of the President of the United States. We should set precedent in our City for what everybody nationally is talking about, but nobody's coming to a conclusion. We have all this disparity, all this macavelian politics and attitudes toward people. We can be an example..., instead of running somewhere else, we need to be an example of what to do. Now, I have submitted the plan to you before, I'mma submit it to you again tomorrow, on what we can do to change our City's perception. Now, some people say, 'Well, it's not that bad.' Yes, it is. Yes, it is that bad. Where I live, if I had \$50,000,000, I wouldn't move off of Federal Gardens. I wouldn't. Because I believe in my community, but it is bad. We have drug dealers that come back and start doing the same thing right now. Right now, I'm working with undercover officers. You're the City Council, you check out what I'm saying. Go to them and ask them about the work Operation Restore is doing. I'm asking you to support us. This is not about anybody trying to shine. We always say, 'It takes a village to raise...' what? [Pause]. [Inaudible] use that. We're always talking about the village, the community, the village. Well, why don't we be that in our communities? Why don't we be the example to that, but we gotta put some skin in the game. We can't just keep talking about. We have these kids that we take out of the communities, that's good but we need to change the community atmosphere. We have a lot of beautiful things going on in our City, but we need to change our community atmosphere and became an example to the county and the state and the nation, right here in the City of Riviera Beach.

Thank you. May 19<sup>th</sup> from four..., from 1:00 to 4:00 p.m., we're gonna have free food. Alright? And not just hot dogs.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, Mr. Dukes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Cora Master Barry, David Brady, Fane Lozman.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair, my sister, I don't see her, she's not here, but was, was coming to support her brother tonight in the suspension thing. So...

**MR. D. BRADY:** Okay.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...she's not here.

**MR. D. BRADY:** Alright. Then, I'll take it. Hi. My name is David Brady. I live at 1100 Fairview Lane.

And I really came here just to speak a couple things that concern me, and one of 'em was I watch the meetings, I've been coming to the meetings quite a bit. I don't get up to speak, I've been listening, and I do listen very well. I am a small business owner. I have a local business here, just outside of Riviera Beach in Lake Park, on Old Dixie Highway. My concern is that our water and listening to the meeting, the Utility District with only 19 of 27 pumps that are running currently. We were buying water from Seacoast up until a week ago I was told. And, we are required to have two more wells, according to the county. We have three very large condos that are gonna come online. I feel we have nowhere near enough water. And this spending of the City, and not properly maintaining it, is what caused the problems that we're at today. So, with that said, I understand there's \$116,000,000 needed to get our water up to where it needs to be, the quality, as well as the quantity.

The misspending of the City is kinda what bothers me. Another meeting I come and I listen to, we are gonna approve \$450,000 to have plans for a new fire station on Blue Heron. That's just the plans, we're gonna spend \$250,000 to put a temporary building in there but yet, our City faces a \$480,000 a year loss on Barracuda Bay. I think you should consider closing Barracuda Bay, building the fire station on that property and then do something with the property next door. That saves us, right away, \$1.2M. Every year after that, it saves \$450 to \$500,000. Again, keep in mind, you are only a eight and a half square mile City, with 17 parks. The misspending, I think, needs to stop, the money should be appropriated to the correct places. Ms. Botel and Ms. KaShamba Miller, thank you for getting the money..., at least you're giving another \$110,000 back to Mr. Sherman that he can put into the Water Department.

Thank you.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Good.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Fane Lozman, Billie Brooks Saulter, Marty, Martin Mark Murphy.

**MR. F. LOZMAN:** Fane Lozman.

I tell ya, Ms. KaShamba Miller-Anderson, Mr. Terence Davis, we miss you as former Chairpersons. You need to read the Sunshine manual, Ms. Tonya Davis Johnson. Rules of decorum, according to the Sunshine manual are limited to the following four items, guidelines to the amount of time somebody can talk, if you have a large group of people, what's the procedure for one person to represent the large group, what kind of form to fill out to talk publicly and you designate a part of the meeting, when they can talk. That's the rules of decorum. The rules of decorum are not to censure Ms. Duncombe because you don't like the content of what she has to say. The First Amendment dictates what people can say up here. I can say I think you're a corrupt politician. That's my

opinion. That's what the First Amendment allows. The First Amendment is not there to protect comments that you're the greatest politician of all time, the First Amendment is to protect critical comments, comments that people don't like to hear. That's what the First Amendment's about. You're looking at the rules of decorum and saying, 'Oh, well, our rules of decorum, you have to be nice to everybody. You have to say nice things.' That's not what the rules of decorum are according to the State of Florida. Now, when you raised your hand, when you took office and you swore to uphold the Constitution and the rules of the State of Florida, you do not know what they are. You need to go read them, or you need to step down or somebody should make a motion to replace you because you're embarrassing yourself, you're embarrassing the City. And what you did to Ms. Norma Duncombe is shameful. She should be allowed to come up here, have her three minutes and make her comments without you trying to censure what she's saying. She had a First Amendment right to do that. You're interpretation of the rules of decorum, is not legal.

Number two, you violated the Sunshine Law after her comments and your City Attorney would tell you about it. Any comments made by elected officials on the dais must be audible to the public and your comments were not audible to the public, that's a Sunshine violation. Okay? I spent the last fifteen years studying the Sunshine Law. I was just recognized by the First Amendment Foundation of the Pete Whitesell Man of the Year. I'm a member of the Sunshine Brigade. I know that manual, I get a new copy every year. You certainly do not. But we are not gonna sit here, the residents of this City, and have you interfere in our First Amendment rights. I spent ten years taking the case to the U.S. Supreme Court in February for a past Councilperson, Liz Wade, that tried to play that game. And you're certainly not gonna play that game with me or anyone else in the audience.

Now, for the other elected officials up there, if you think she's made a mistake, you can make a motion to vote to override her decision. That gentleman back there should be allowed to have his three minutes. Other people, if they've come late and they've had an emergency, they've been allowed to make their comments. The Mayor, certainly, he asked for that, that courtesy for this man and you denied him that courtesy. That is also shameful. Somebody needs to make a motion to replace you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Billie Brooks Saulter.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Former Councilwoman Billie Brooks there, right?

**MS. B. BROOKS SAULTER:** Good evening, Mayor...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Good evening.

**MS. B. BROOKS SAULTER:** ...Councilpersons. Billie Brooks Saulter, 1325 West 28<sup>th</sup> Street.

I just wanna offer you guys, just praises for the action that you took the other night by rescinding the stipend. I think it was a great move. You know, the citizens were feeling maybe they were being raped and that you guys were there for the money more than for the mission, and now we see that we do have this, you know, you changed all that. I appreciate it so much. And now that you have these dollars, about \$72,000 I guess it would be, why not consider contracting with someone who can write a, a grant, look for a grand writer and that \$72,000 would be invested and a return could be several million dollars. So, I hope that you will take that into consideration.

Councilwoman Miller-Anderson, we had talked about location rehabilitation. I did speak with them and they're quite excited about coming again to the City of Riviera Beach. When I was the Chair, I brought them in and partnered with them, and I was able to get two legislative aides so my budget, I did not need any of the City's money 'cause I had two legislative aides. One did research, and that person had a juris doctorate degree, was a paraplegic. And the other had a Masters of Science degree and she was my liaison person. I used her to talk with our citizens and work for them and advocate for their needs. So, that's just something that you might consider to do. And I will send you that information, that I got on that.

When I walked in, there was a proposal handed me for providing City management services, and I did view the workshop and I, I think this is going in the right direction. You know, now is the time to really go in and clean up. We wanna change our image. We want people to think that we really want..., we, we believe in efficiency in our government.

So, thank you so much.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, that concludes public comments.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Next Item.

### **PUBLIC HEARINGS**

**19. CITY CLERK ANTHONY: RESOLUTION NO. 38-18. A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH, PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA APPROVING THE SITE PLAN APPLICATION FOR THE PORT OF PALM BEACH DISTRICT FOR THE REAL PROPERTY LOCATED AT 105 BROADWAY, PROVIDING SPECIFIC CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL AND PROVIDING AN EFFECTIVE DATE.**

**ACTING DEPARTMENT DIRECTOR: JEFF GAGNON (561)845-4060**

**20. RESOLUTION NO. 39-18 A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH, PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA, APPROVING THE PLAT APPLICATION FROM THE PORT OF PALM BEACH DISTRICT FOR THE REAL PROPERTY LOCATED AT 105 BROADWAY; AUTHORIZING EXECUTION OF SAID PLAT; AND PROVIDING FOR AN EFFECTIVE DATE.**

**ACTING DEPARTMENT DIRECTOR: JEFF GAGNON (561)845-4060**

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, we do have one public comment card for this Item. Acceptance of public comment cards for this Item is now closed. And do not forget I do have the communication from Mr. Gerald Ward.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you. I'll entertain a motion.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So moved.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Second.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It's been motioned and properly second. Mr. Gagnon.

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** Good evening. Thank you, Madam Chair, City Council, Mayor, Staff. Jeff Gagnon, Acting Director of Community Development.

So, I wanted first clarify Item 19 and, if it's okay with Council, clarify that it's connected with Item 20, 22 and 23 as well. Those four Items are associated with 105 Broadway, which is a property owned by the Port of Palm Beach. If it pleases the Council, I can speak to them collectively. Perhaps under Item 22, but I did wanna make mention the fact that the Resolution's associated with Item 19 and 20, their effective date is tied directly to the approval of the Ordinance on first reading tonight, and then future approval. So, Item 22 and 23. So, Resolution 19 and Resolution 20, they're effective date is directly tied to the second reading approval of Item 22 and 23. So, to be as clear and transparent as possible, I wanted to make sure that all four Items were presented simultaneously.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Push your mic over a little bit.

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** Microphone?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mhmm.

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** Is that better?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And lift it up.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** A little bit.

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** Okay. I wanted to make sure that all four Items were presented simultaneously, so that way the Council had all the backup information associated with these Items. [Stammer], if it pleases the Council, both of those Resolutions can be brought back during the second reading of those Ordinances that are associated, just to be as clear and concise as possible, excuse me, clear and concise as possible.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** What's the pleasure of the Board with regards to these Items? Do you want to combine? In the essence of time?



**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yes.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes. I., Madam Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I see yes, yes, Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** That's fine with me.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** For the...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Mr. Davis?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...presentation.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** For presentation purposes.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Oh. Okay. I'm gonna have to amend my motion then.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** And...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** And, to include...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Do we need...

**UNK.:** [Inaudible]...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...to... One moment, please. Madam Clerk, do we need to amend the motion or can we take the motion as it was stated?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** You can take.., if I understand you correctly, are you talking about to make the presentation for all of them at one time?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mhmm.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** You do not need to amend your motion for that.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay. Thank you. Proceed, Mr., Mr. Gagnon.

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** Thank you very much.

So, as, as previously stated, there are four connected Items on this Agenda, Item 19, Item 20, Item 22 and 23. Again, Staff is proposing that Item No. 19 and No. 20 are brought back to City Council for review and approval concurrently with Items 22 and 23. However, the information and presentation will be pertinent to all four of those Items tonight. So, the Staff numbers are provided to the Council currently on the PowerPoint.

The backup information for all four Items are provided within the online Agenda, as well as made available in hard copy format upon request.

So, 105 Broadway is, is currently shown on the bottom of the screen. It's actually adjacent to the municipal boundary of the City of West Palm Beach, which is directly south. This parcel is just west of the FPL Next Era Energy Center. So, this is a slightly closer view of this parcel. The intended use of the parcel and the four Items will allow the Port of Palm Beach to modify the existing future land use designation, modify the zoning designation, approve a site plan and also approve the plat. The intended use is for storage of rolling stock. And I also wanna make note of the fact that there are specific deed restrictions that ran with parcel. The Florida Department of Transportation previously owned this land. Their..., a very long time ago was a conversation about having a connecting roadway between US1 and what is now President Barack Obama Highway. What happened, again, this is about ten years ago, is the rail line runs north and south, and there was major difficulty in getting a cross access agreement through that rail corridor. So, unfortunately, FDOT had to scrap that plan. They did put the parcel up for sale and the Port of Palm Beach purchased the property, I believe it was in November of 2011.

So, shortly thereafter, and this is a historic aerial view, for approximately 2013, the same plot of land, which is shown here in red, was utilized by the contractor that was developing the energy center just to the east. So, there were some site improvements done in associated with this use. There was a site law that was established on the southern property boundary, in addition to some hard surface improvements to the site. So, in order to use this parcel for this contractor storage yard and laydown area, there was triparty agreement between the City of West Palm Beach, the Port of Palm Beach and the City of Riviera Beach to ensure that the use of this would be consistent and compatible with the residential uses just to the south.

So, before you, you have a screenshot of the current future land use map. The parcel in question is shown, hatched out on the bottom. So, currently there is a Utilities future land use designation. And, what the proposal will do is create industrial future land use designation for this parcel. In association with the future land use amendment, we have to ensure that our zoning map is compatible as well, so currently, it shown as Utilities, and the proposal is for a limited industrial zoning designation for the parcel.

For backup information, this is just a cover sheet that was provided by the Port as applicant. It has a location map as well as specific parcel information. The size of the parcel is approximately 5.2 acres. This is the Site Plan associated with the parcel. And, I want to make note of the fact that there are specific site use provisions that are incorporated within the Site Plan itself. These were..., they were based off of the previous deed restrictions that were placed on the property. They were also based off of meetings that the Port of Palm Beach Staff and the City of West Palm Beach, and also City Staff had to really discuss how the property would be used in the future and to ensure that compatibility was maintained over time, specifically for those residential uses that are directly south of the land. So, there's specific discussion on limitation of height of any stacking, making sure that there's no light trespass to the south, and other specific items

that will have to be followed in perpetuity for this specific site. That's also referenced within the conditions of approval that are attached with the Resolution for the Site Plan.

I also wanna make mention of the fact that there is a landscape plan associated with this parcel. It really is the first parcel in the City of Riviera Beach if you're driving north, so we wanted to make sure that there is a better landscape treatment on the east side of the parcel, as well as including palm trees along the southern property line itself, and also improving the landscape area to the west, even though there still is the railroad that is located even further west, we thought it was important to have as much of a landscape screen as possible for those residents within Riviera Beach that live towards the west.

So, the final Item, out of the, the four in the presentation, which is No. 20 on the Agenda. This is the Plat associated with the parcel itself. So, this is the, the legal document that we utilized to designate the property boundaries. With this document, it's, it's vitality important because the land was never platted, so it's just been used as is over time, so this was an essential component of the site plan approval process and future land use amendment, as well as the rezoning. And I've included in the presentation, just for the record, the title block for the land use amendment request for the zoning amendment request for the site plan approval, as well as the plat approval.

So, that concludes my presentation, and, in summary, Staff would like to bring back Items 19 and 20 at a future meeting when Items No. 21..., excuse me, Item's No. 22 and Items No. 23 are up for discussion on second reading. So, they'd be approved concurrently at the same meeting.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Any questions from the dais?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** So, the question before us tonight would be just No. 22, Mr. Gagnon?

[Inaudible comment]

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...through the Chair?

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** I'm sorry, ma'am?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Okay. We're going to postpone 19 and 20?

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** Yes, ma'am. So, if it pleases the Council to table 19 and 20, or postpone 19 and 20 until the Ordinances on first reading are scheduled for their second reading on the Agenda.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Public comment.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Marty Murphy.

**MR. M. MURPHY:** Good evening. It's...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Good evening.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Good evening.

**MR. M. MURPHY:** Mayor, Chair..., Chairperson and Councilpersons. My name's Martin Murphy. I live at 1071 Grand Bahama in the, the great City of Riviera Beach Florida.

My point was, that I was gonna try to get across, it was covered a li'..., a lot by Jeff, and what I would like to do is, is [inaudible] ten years ago, it was twenty-seven years ago, it was 1995 when this plan started. And then, the orig'..., the original reason for it starting, was to, to expand the Port to the west side of US1. An interlocal agreement was made and allowed the Port and City to close what was then known as Port Road, now MLK Boulevard, from what was then known as Old Dixie to US1, now known as Barack Obama Boulevard to US1. This would allow the Port to build a structure. It was..., it's named L.E. Vidueira Blue Memorial Bridge, better known as the Skypass.. This would allow the Port to expand to the west of US1 without a traffic interruption to the Port and to it's tenants. To accomplish this, the Port agreed to build a new connector road on property to be acquired on the south end of the Port property, between Barack Obama Boulevard and US1.

Later, the Florida Department of Transportation condemned and purchased this property. This is the right of..., this is the right of way that you see in red. Following..., fast forward now to twenty years, and we're here tonight and, uh, two of the Items that I was gonna ask you to table were tabled until 22 and 23 get approved on second reading. The approval, I want you all to understand, the approval for the Port to use this property for staging, is on the City of Riviera Beach property because the City closed the old Port Road and were promised that a new connector road would be built to US1. And I'd ask that you table these four Agenda Items, all of them, until an arrangement can be made to reopen Port Road from Barack Obama Boulevard to US1, or for the Port to construct a connector road, as was planned in 1995.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, sir.

**MR. M. MURPHY:** Thank you very much.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, that concludes public comments for that Item. I have the communication from Mr. Gerald Ward.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Would you please read it into the record.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** I'm sorry. My apologies, Ms. Duncombe. Norma Duncombe. [Pause]. Wait a minute. Ms. Duncombe, that..., your Item says 21. And we're on 19.

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** But I thought you put all three of them together.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Just for presentation purposes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Communication from Mr. Gerald Ward, P.E., Consulting Engineer, Coastal Environmental,, P.O. Box 10441, Riviera Beach, Florida 33419.

To City Council and Mayor of City of Riviera Beach, from Jerry Ward regarding CRV Council meeting of 1818, April 2018, Agenda Item 19, Site Plan application, State Road 710, right way conversion to Port roll in vehicles and bulk cargo. Applicant, Port of Palm Beach District.

The cart is before the horse for this Item. Until second reading of both Ordinances establishing land use and zoning, this Item is premature and not authorized. Certainly, Council wants to preserve it's right to modify and condition either of the Ordinance request. The simplest action is to defer and list after having the Port requested Ordinances on second reading.

Gerald M. Ward, P.E.

Copy was sent to City Manager Karen Hoskins, myself, City Clerk Claudene Anthony, and City Attorney Andrew Degraffenreidt.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilman Davis.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Thank you. I do believe there's a lot of historical and future value in the decision that we're gonna be making in the future. Wehnev'..., before this Item comes back, I do believe it's..., I'm the last Commissioner that's up here that ha'..., that was a part of the Port joint meeting with the City. Before this Item come' back, we definitely need about three hours with the Port of Palm Beach to talk about when this interlocal agreement and everything was discussed in '95 in the past, and '96, what was the conversations at that time and what impact it's gonna have. There's a lotta things that have to go through Planning & Zoning when we start talking about the different land use, that this Commission really need to be engaged in conversation with what those discussions were. Back I think,[inaudible] it was 2015, '14, that we...

[Inaudible comment]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** '15, we had a meeting for about three hours, but before this Item come' back, it would be detrimental if we do not, as a Board, sit with their Board and their Staff and our Staff, and to engage into a real serious workshop on how we..., what's gonna be used at the Port, the future use, what they're asking from us, how we're gonna create the jobs. There's some things that the Port wanna ask of us, 'cause they got some fees that they wanna try to get us to eliminate, what the City get' back in return. So, there's been a lotta discussion over the last three years that we've been trying to bring to the table and really get us moving on because there's a lotta things that go on in Tallahassee through the legislation that, you know, they can't really move forward on without our input. So, it's very important that we choose a date as a Council and sit down with the Port Commission and really spend about three hours to really get this information,

knowledge, so we can support the Port and support this community, in whichever direction we choose to go based upon the information that's presented to us by Staff.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you. Any further comments? So, I believe that there was a request by Staff to postpone Items 19 and 20, so the initial motion that's on the floor...

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** As made by Mr. Davis, and so, he can either rescind his motion or amend the motion to [inaudible]...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I amend the motion that we postpone the Items in question until we have a meeting between us and the Port and the second reading of Items [pause]...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** 22.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** 22 and 23. Is that correct, Mr. Gagnon?

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** Yes, sir.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Does the, does the second stand?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Second.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Clerk.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Botel?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Hubbard?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Davis Johnson?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Unanimous vote.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Item 21.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, that was just a motion to postpone No. 19.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** We said 19 and 20.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** I didn't hear him say 20.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It was...

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** But...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** The request by Staff was to...

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Oh, we're honoring...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...postpone 19...

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** ...the request by...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...and 20.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** ...Staff. Great. Got it.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

#### **ORDINANCES ON SECOND READING**

**21. CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Item No. 21. Ordinances on second and final reading.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY: ORDINANCE NO. 4106. AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH, PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA ABANDONING A PORTION OF EAST 20<sup>TH</sup> STREET, A PORTION OF AVENUE B AND A PORTION OF AVENUE C EXHIBITED ON THE "REVISED PLAT OF COCONUT LODGE" AND GOVERNMENT LOT 4, SECTION 28, TOWNSHIP 42, SOUTH RANGE 43 EAST AS RECORDED IN PLAT BOOK 7, PAGE 52 OF THE PUBLIC RECORDS OF PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA AND LOCATED WITHIN THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH, FLORIDA CONTAINING 26,815.6 SQUARE FEET, .62 ACRES MORE OR LESS, PROVIDING CONDITIONS, PROVIDING FOR SEVERABILITY AND CONFLICTS AND PROVIDING FOR AN EFFECTIVE DATE.**

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, the acceptance of public comment cards, for this particular Item, is now closed.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So moved.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Is there...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Second.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...a second? It's been motioned and properly second. Mr. Gagnon.

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** Thank you. This is the second reading of this Ordinance. I have an identical presentation if it pleases the Council, or we can open up the questions. Whatever you so choose.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** What's the pleasure of this Council? Do you need another presentation?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Condensed version, please.

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** Absolutely.

[Chuckle]

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** I did wanna make note of the fact also that we had questions from the public during our previous discussion of this Ordinance on first reading, and I did wanna say that Staff did hear the comments and we did respond by providing postcard mailout notifications to all of the property owners to the north of this roadway, all the way to Blue Heron Boulevard. So, the, the typical radius is approximately three hundred feet, but we expanded that well beyond, including the entire neighborhood so we sent out about two hundred notifications for the second reading of this Ordinance. So, I just wanted to state that for the record as well.

So, this is a location map of Avenue B, C and also a portion of East 20<sup>th</sup> Street. I think it's much easier to see on the aerial view. For reference, this previous portion that's shown in orange or peach or pink, whatever descriptive language someone would like to use for this, this was previously abandoned a few years back. So, what's being proposed to be abandoned currently, is the roadway areas that are shown in blue. So, as you can see, it kind of creates a phase two of that abandonment process, and what it will do is creates a master campus for Rybovich in order to facilitate future development. So, for the record, there are legal descriptions and sketches provided in the backup material. And, I did wanna make note of the fact that there are specific conditions of approval with this abandonment. So, the.., probably the most important condition is condition number one, which requires the applicant to submit a site plan application for this land area within twelve months. And, the plan currently is that a master campus will be generated. With that, there will economic development and jobs created by this abandonment request, which is currently the proposal. Additionally, they would have to provide a landscape plan, as well as a plat, which are denoted in condition two and three.

There's currently a traffic signal at East 20<sup>th</sup> Street, and because this abandonment will eliminate the ability of individuals to utilize that traffic signal, one of the conditions of approval, sated under number four, is that a new traffic signal is installed and operable at the intersection of East 22<sup>nd</sup> Street and Broadway. What that'll do is maintain any sort of



southbound travel from individuals that are in that neighborhood, and also provide a guarded signal to turn south. So, you won't have to cut through lanes of traffic, it'll be a signal that will provide a guarded turn. Additionally, number five is to provide a access easement in order maintain any right of way, until said development comes before us. And, number six is, if there is any future cost associated with relocating existing water, sewer, or any other City infrastructure, utilities, those costs will be borne by the applicant or any future property owner.

So, I'm here to answer any questions you may have.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Council, any, any questions?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilman Davis.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Mr. Gagnon, what's gonna happen in the future with that [stammer], with the light, once that road closes there, on 21<sup>st</sup> Street, is it?

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** So, 20<sup>th</sup> Street...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** As you can see, this blue area, if you wanted to travel south, currently you could utilize Avenue C and also 20<sup>th</sup>, and there's a signal that's directly across from the CRA building...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Mhmm.

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** ...BB&T building. So, because this right of way will be abandoned, there's no ability to utilize the signal. So unfortunately, this aerial cuts it off, but as you can see sequentially, it goes East 20<sup>th</sup>, 21<sup>st</sup> and then 22<sup>nd</sup> is north. So, a signal will be installed and operable at the intersection above, which will allow vehicular traffic to still flow south and have a guarded traffic turn signal, so you don't have to just...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** On 22<sup>nd</sup> Street?

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** On 22<sup>nd</sup> Street. Yes, sir.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Okay. I just wanted to make sure the question was asked.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Any further comment? Madam Clerk, public comment?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** M. Xavier, Norma Duncombe, Fane Lozman.

**MR. M. XAVIER:** Good evening, Council.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Good evening.

**MR. M. XAVIER:** Chairperson, and Mayor if you're listening.

First of all, I wanna start off by saying thank you to Mr. Gagnon. He did provide notice to everyone. I received this last Monday about tonight's meeting. So unlike the first meeting, there was adequate notice. And if he.., the rules say three hundred feet from the subject property, if they're going from 20<sup>th</sup> Street and they went out three hundred feet, they're pretty much giving notice to themselves 'cause they own that property. So, I don't know what kind of notice that is, but so be it, we got noticed this time.

[Inaudible] by saying I have nothing against Rybovich, nothing against Mr. Vidueira, he's doing the best he can for his employer, shareholders and stakeholders. We have to do what's best as residents for our ourselves, and the City as well. Okay? What they're attempting to do is cut off the traffic flow that we currently have, depleted by one road, and that's gonna cause congestion over there. I have no problem with them giving away the parcel of Avenue B, the one up towards the east, a little sliver of land there, the rest of Avenue B was abandoned [inaudible] the property years ago. That site has had plenty of abandonments. It's had abandonments from Avenue B, that went all the way to approximately where Jim Berry Park is, that was gonna be the entrance to Jim Berry Park. Avenue C as well. You can see that sliver of land there? That was abandoned. Okay? Now, they're asking the City to go ahead and give them more land for free. Now, I understand that, hey, you probably can't sell it, you'd have to abandon it. But guess what, you don't have to abandon it, you can keep it. You don't have to give it away. Not too long ago, you didn't wanna give.., you didn't wanna give a basic address to a person that's here in the audience, an address and here you are abandoning a street. It doesn't make any sense to me. So, that's just the history of the roads.

The flow of the traffic, it's simple. If you take identical size buckets, fill them up with water, put five holes in one, four holes in the next one, the one with five holes, that water's gonna come out a lot quicker. It's that simple.

The teeth that are in the contract for their agreement, it's ridiculous. They probably already have a plan. Okay? I only have three minutes, there's a lot to say about this, but corporate messiahs that come to this community and promise you the world, jobs, this and that, a lot of that doesn't come to fruition and you know it. So, think twice about this. I think this has to be postponed. You might need to have some kind of meeting with the public to, to work on this 'cause I don't think this is gonna be good for the residents that live in that area.

That's it. Thank you.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Norma Duncombe, Fane Lozman, Lloyd Brown.

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** Okay. He probably has said basically what attention I wanted to bring to this. This goes way back, in terms of their actually owning..., if they could move those people out who are left there, owning the whole shebang. And I'm saying, every time you give something away, you are taking away from people who have been here for years. And, regardless of where we live, we deserve more than what you are considering.

The next thing is this, and they always throw this in, we're gonna give you jobs. It's not in writing, so you don't have anything to make them give jobs. Do we need jobs? Yes, we do, but [stammer], this, this, this game has been played over and over and over again. And, I, I just say we have to take more consideration of the people who live here, and not just, just treat them any kind of way. And, and this, this, this is [stammer]..., it has been a continuous thing. So, I, I don't know what, what, what you could do to make this work, but I think you need to not just throw up your hands and say we just give it away and just forget about the people who are living in that area. I, I., you're just gonna have to do better, we have to do better.

Thank you.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Fane Lozman, Lloyd Brown.

**MR. F. LOZMAN:** Fane Lozman.

I wanna thank that gentleman, I did get my address after a long, uh, litigation.

I remember back to October 2010. Emma Bates, myself, Andrew Byrd, I think Norma Duncombe, [inaudible], Lynne Hubbard, we all fought to keep Rybovich out of the City Marina. And I recall talking to Carlos Vidueira, we called King Carlos who, at that time, was the most powerful man [chuckle] in Riviera Beach, still probably is, and we said, 'Listen, we don't want you in the City Marina. There's plenty of waterfront land, go, go up to Jupiter, go up the road to 20<sup>th</sup> Street, just, we don't want you in the City Marina.' And he said, 'Okay. We're gonna go accumulate property and we're gonna buy it in Riviera Beach.' And if you look at that map, they bought a ton of lots, they own forty acres over there. Okay? So, all that land is landlocked. He made good on his promise to Emma Bates, he went and bought his forty acres and he's building a premier facility. Those roads are inside all the lots that he owns. And people say, 'Well, what is he gonna do for Riviera Beach?' A, he's done a lot. He saved the big battle over that Marina that could've gone on for years, because they have deep pockets at Rybovich. It'd still be going on, they try to take the public Marina.' So, he made good and he went and bought his own property. The benefit to this community is, those improvements are gonna make that a tax base [inaudible] that property's gonna be worth eighty, \$100,000,000 one day. So, the money's gonna flow back from these vacant lots into this premier mega yacht facility. So, where's this community gonna benefit? They're gonna benefit in the increase property tax'..., taxes are gonna be coming in. They're also gonna be benefit that you do have the Maritime School, and supposedly they're training those students, George Carter and his crew over there, to work in the maritime industry. And if you're gonna have a major, one of the number one Mega yacht boatyards in the world a few blocks from, from this, from the City Marina, I mean, you know, there's nothing really to talk about. The

non-residential lots in the middle of his boatyard, whatever was there, those guys bought. Rybovich bought 'em. I think for somebody who's spent a lot of time and a lot of money with Emma Bates and Andrew Byrd and the rest of the citizens task force, this is what we wanted, we wanted them to go someplace else, they have the property. They need a couple little pieces of the road that they've landlocked around, I say give them the road, give them a key to the City and thank them for contributing to make Riviera Beach the best City to work, live and play in.

Thank you.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Lloyd Brown.

**MR. L. BROWN:** Thank you. My name is Lloyd Brown.

I have a, a short, you know, like, ;I can't con'..., you know, like, how you say that? I can't really keep my thoughts on one thing, so if I go all off the wall, don't get mad at me and put me out. But, I do appreciate what Lozman was saying about First Amendment rights and all I got say is, is I saw it done here before. And, [stammer] only thing I can say then, you know, you people making all these decisions, that's almost like you got a axe over your head right now, so you're gonna make all the bad decisions you can, or good decisions, or whatever, if they benefit the City. But none of these, these decisions you make, none of these decisions you make benefit these brothers I know over here. None of these decisions. You can let Rybovich come in and they could take the whole Marina and everything, it still doesn't help the problems we have on my side of the track', or in Riviera Beach.

And like, they're talking about drugs, whatever, I know you don't want me to get off some'..., my plane of thought is not too good. By anyway, Ms. Botel, all I gotta say is you, I appreciate that 'cause these brothers up here, they ain't try to do anything. The man's supposed to be coming out, so if you all don't like me talking that way, if I'm stepping on your feet, then you deserve it because, for one thing, if the shoe fit', you where it. You can't get mad at anybody for coming up here talking about you because the truth hurts. If it didn't hurt, you wouldn't get mad. If it wasn't the truth, you really wouldn't get mad. Like, you know, and then when I hear somebody talking and they start preaching, well, my mother taught me about Christ and everything and she'd been teaching me ever since she was around. She taught me how to tie my shoe. I don't need nobody to teach me how to do that. And, if we need to pray for Riviera Beach, what happened? You stop prayin'? I mean, did you stop praying before, so that's why we got in this mess? So now you're telling me..., so, we're gonna praying again? I mean, maybe your prayers weren't being answered because you aren't really praying. You just up there..., you just fake. You know, you get up there and you wanna pray but you're not.

And then another thing, I don't care if..., I've seen this happen in here before, to where some guys said I want my other person to take my card. So, you can't tell me that. I'm not like Lozman, I don't have no money to get a lawyer, but you violated my rights, and I wish there was somebody in Riviera Beach, some lawyer in Palm Beach County, to see this because you didn't have no right to tell me I couldn't because I seen it done. I

don't care if you were there the last time or somebody else was the Chairman. It's like this, in the military, they got a code of military justice where every base has to do the same thing. Just because you get another general on the base, the rules don't change. See, that suck'. That's not right, and I don't care if I don't ever be able to talk up here, 'cause what you do [stammer], excuse me. See? I lost my train of thought.

Anyway, what you're doing here, it's not helping the black people in Riviera Beach, not at all. You took away all of 8<sup>th</sup> Street. Give these people that and make sure they're gonna hire people from around our neighborhood. Don't just let them put it out there and say, 'Oh, we're gonna give plenty of jobs.' Now, you're gonna...

[Timer]

**MR. L. BROWN:** ...boot me because I'm not talking for you.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam chair, that concludes public comments for Item No. 21.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay. There be no further communication? Madam Clerk.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Botel?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Hubbard?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Davis Johnson?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Unanimous vote.

**22. CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Item 22.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY: ORDINANCE NO. 4107. AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH, PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA AMENDING THE CITY'S FUTURE LAND USE MAP DESIGNATION FOR THE REAL PROPERTY LOCATED AT 105 BROADWAY, CONSISTING OF APPROXIMATELY 5.2**

**ACRES OF LAND FROM A UTILITIES LAND USE DESIGNATION TO AN INDUSTRIAL LAND USE DESIGNATION IN ORDER TO FACILITATE USE OF THE SITE FOR STORAGE OF ROLLING AND BULK CARGO AND PROVIDING AN EFFECTIVE DATE.**

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, we do have one public comment card. Public comment cards for this Item is now closed and we do have communication from Mr. Gerald Ward on Items No. 22 and 23.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Right. So, we are in the right order. We postponed 19 and 20. We just took 21. We are now taking Item No. 22.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I thought she said 24.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** 22. She just read 22, Ordinance No. 4107.

[Inaudible dais comments]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** There was a...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Compilation was only for him to present'...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Only for...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...to present.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...the presentation we had to take the two Items. We still have to take them because they're Ordinances.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I just thought I heard her say 24.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** No. 22.

[Inaudible comment]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** 21. She said 21. Did you not say 21?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** The Item No. is [stammer] 22.

[Inaudible dais comments]

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** And the Ordinance No...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** [Inaudible]...

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** ...is 4107.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...22.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yeah.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I did but it didn't come from her. I...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...heard 24. I did.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Alright.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** [Chuckle].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay. Now that we have that cleared up. Mr. Gagnon.

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** Thank you, Chair.

As previously discussed, this is a Ordinance on first reading for future land use amendment for 105 Broadway. The current future land use designation is industrial, and the proposed amendment would change that to indust'.., excuse me. The current [stammer] designation is Utilities and the proposed amendment would change it to industrial for 105 Broadway.

I'm here to answer any questions you may have.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Do you have any public comment cards?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Yes, ma'am. I do. And we...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** And the...

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** ...have the communication...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** And the communication.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** ...from Mr. Ward.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** And comments from the Board? Any questions?

[Inaudible comments]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Clerk.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Martin Murphy.

**MR. M. MURPHY:** I have the same point..., excuse me. Martin Murphy, 1071 Grand Bahama. Mayor, Chairperson, Councilpersons.

I have the same comments on 20'..., and 22 and 23, as I stated on 19 and 20. My main, my main concern is that you all know, and the citizens know that originally there were four east/west corridors that we could go in and out of our City. The north/south corridors..., that got us to the north/south corridors. What I'm saying is, we lost one of those corridors when we made the deal in 1995. And I wanna remind you again, like I said a few minutes ago, this property is the property that was in the interlocal agreement that was supposed to be a connector road.

And I, you know, my thoughts are that we table it just like you, you tabled the other issues until you all have the meetings and decide when you wanna proceed.

Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, Mr. Murphy. Madam Clerk.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, we've received communication from Mr. Gerald Ward on today, regarding Items No. 22 and 23.

Gerald M. Ward, P.E. Consultant Engineer, Coastal Environmental, P.O. Box 10441, Riviera Beach, Florida 33419.

To City Council, City of Riviera Beach

From Jerry Ward

Re: CRV Council Meeting, 1818, April 2018

Agenda Items 22 and 23, Land Use Amendment and Zoning Designation, State Road 710 right of way, conversion to Port rolling vehicles and bulk cargo.

These two applications are 2016 applications to Sea Deck, which have been in the pipeline way too long waiting on the City Council and Port of Palm Beach Board to meet and resolve each entity's direction to move the Port ahead. The joint City Port meeting in June, years ago, was and is the way to get the City and Port moving. Both Ports now have at least a portion of them with knowledge and zeal to make progress for the profit of both the Port and the City. As the reference above indicates, the City agreed to [inaudible] the State Road 710 connection temporarily to Broadway, US Highway 1. The Port always looks for some other entity to pay and then the mid first decade of the century, the economy changed and they look..., they took the position, along with FDOT that traffic did not justify the connection of State Road 710 to US1 then. Unfortunately, the Riviera Beach CRA did not proceed with any traffic intense development, but we do need to preserve the connection in the future. Do the Ordinances do that? Or, are



Theresa alternatives? The future needs to be discussed with the Port Board, as has been planned and stonewalled by some Port Commissioners, why not defer both Items 22 and 23 issues tonight and get the Port and City Managers to set a joint Port City meeting quickly.

Gerald M. Ward, P.E.

Copy: Karen Hoskins, City Manager, Claudene Anthony, City Clerk, Andrew Degraffenreidt, City Attorney.

Thank you, Madam Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you. Commissioner Hubbard, Chair Pro Tem, you had a question?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes. Mr. Murphy made a comment twice, and I wanted to see if this is the right understanding. On.., when we set aside the road on MLK and we cut that access off and we were expecting to get an access road built where the entrance.., where West Palm and Riviera Beach connect, my understanding was that it did not happen because of the railroad. The railroad would not give permission for us to run the road through there. So, now FDOT has given the Port a conditional quick claim deed, if you will, for the property but the only reason that we didn't get that access road was because no one could get permission from the FEC railroad granted. Otherwise, we would have that access. So, I just wanted to bring that up to make sure I was remembering correctly. And, Madam Chair, if you would allow it, I'd like to hear from somebody at the Port that might also remember, or can, or can bring a little more clarification to this particular instance that I'm referring to. Or trying to recall.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Come forward, please.

**MR. L. SMITH:** Good evening. I'm Larry Smith, lawyer with Gary, Dytrych & Ryan and we represent the Port, and have for many years, twenty years actually this year. Manny Almira's here, he's the Port Director .

Let me just give you a little history. You head what Mr. Murphy had to say. He's a historian, he's been around longer than I have, but I've been around a long time too. And we represented the Port for, for twenty years, as I said. So, we were involved in this whole thing when they were condemning this property. We actually didn't get in involved in the condemnation of the property, but we know about the FEC, like Ms. Hubbard said. The FEC objected to a crossing of the 710, which was planned at that time, to go across what you see in red there. It's true. What Mr. Murphy said was, was accurate, to a point. The rest of the story, as they say, is that when the FEC.., DOT tried to cross.., get a crossing, FEC said no. There was actually a law suit. The DOT sued the FEC, and administrative lawsuit, the Port joined in on the DOT side and this was going back about 2002 or '03, or '04, somewhere along in there, and the DOT, I believe in 2004, abandoned the lawsuit because they couldn't get it. And they knew they couldn't get it. So, this language, for quite some time before the Port finally acquired the property, as Ms. Hubbard said. And I think that happened about 2011? Or so?

**MR. M. ALMIRA:** [Inaudible].

**MR. L. SMITH:** About 2011 and, as you say, there was a, there was a deed and there's certain conditions on the deed and, and what the proposal before you tonight, and, and will be coming before you for the site plan, it, it's consistent with that.., those, those uses that the Port can use through the deed. So, it's all about rolling stock and cargo and that kind of thing and, and... So anyway, that's the history to the current, to the current point. And again, as I said, Mr. Murphy and I have been talking about this for fifteen years, and that's the rest of the story.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** So, where is the.., or is there another proposed access being talked about or available to us...

**MR. L. SMITH:** I don't know where...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...[Inaudible]?

**MR. L. SMITH:** I don't know where you'd put it. I mean, again, I've been having this discussion with Mr. Murphy for a long time, I don't know where you'd put it. I mean, as he said, there were four and now there are three. And I, I guess they're Blue Heron and Silver Beach maybe, and I can't think of another.., 13<sup>th</sup> Street, obviously. Yeah. And 13<sup>th</sup> Street got improved after.., I believe after they couldn't get the, the crossing at.., for this one. I, I think. I mean, that was kinda part of the whole thing, you know, the City would like to have a nice entrance to the Marina, and the Port actually did the condemnation on 13<sup>th</sup> Street, and paid for it...

**MR. M. ALMIRA:** Mhmm.

**MR. L. SMITH:** ...as I recall.

**MR. M. ALMIRA:** We did.

**MR. L. SMITH:** Yeah. So, you know, the Port has done... This isn't a.., this is the Port's doing, but it's good for the City in that, you know, it's gonna enhance the ability of the, the Port to, to, you know, do business and, you know...

**MR. M. ALMIRA:** Expand.

**MR. L. SMITH:** ...expand.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Okay. I just wanted to get more clarification, I wanted the people to hear what I recalled and to get a little bit more detail on what actually, actually happened or what I remembered that was happening. But I do look forward to us having a joint meeting so that we could talk about ways that we could benefit each other a little, a little more.

**MR. M. ALMIRA:** Thank you. And good evening to all. Manny Almira, Executive Director of the Port of Palm Beach.

First, I was not at the Port when the aforementioned events occurred, but I can tell you that, like, just like Mr. Smith, I know Mr. Marty Murphy very, very well. Happen to like him very much and we have had several conversations and I've offered to him..., he could always use the entrance to the Port with any of his merchandise. It'll just be a matter of having his merchandise, his cargo, go across the Port, we would monitor that, as we would put on own safety and security folks to escort him in from, let's just say, from Martin Luther King, through the Port, out south gate and make that loop to come back up on Broadway. That may be feasible at times, it may not at other times.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Are there other bu'...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Go ahead.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Are there other businesses... Mr. Murphy didn't mention that that was the issue, but if it is the issue, are there other businesses around there that are, that are being...

**MR. M. ALMIRA:** Effected?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...hampered because of this, like Mr...

**MR. M. ALMIRA:** Not that I...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...or Mr. Murphy's street, in Mr. Murphy's...

**MR. M. ALMIRA:** No.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** ...area of business, are there other businesses that are being hampered by this?

**MR. M. ALMIRA:** Ms. Hubbard, not that I'm aware of.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Okay.

**MR. M. ALMIRA:** But, once again, my phone is, is free, anyone can call and we would make the necessary arrangements.

But can I just go back to the railroad crossings?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** May I?

**MR. M. ALMIRA:** Sure.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I think in the es'..., in the essence of time, Councilperson Botel is fairly new, I was not a part of the original discussion so I think, if my colleagues, colleagues will indulge me, it would probably be better for us to sit in workshop and discuss this as opposed to trying to lay it all out tonight. So, my request of Staff is to..., we're going to direct Staff to contact your offices and we will put together a joint meeting in the very near future. We don't want to prolong this any longer than

necessary, so what we'll do is do it in that joint forum and we'll be able to provide that historical perspective and give us a working knowledge so that we can then ask the questions that are important to our, our respective citizens.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** I was just wanting to.., the people to hear, the community to hear that, while we were just on first reading of the land use, that it wasn't something that we were just willy nilly giving it, that there was a real reason why we couldn't make the acc'.., the access road, and I just, you know, wanted it to get out there in the public as correct information. So, that's why I thought it would be prudent to bring them up and let them speak to the issue.

Thank you.

**MR. L. SMITH:** And, Madam Chair, if I may? This is first reading, obviously there's a second reading, and as, as was suggested earlier, and the Port Director agreed, that it's a good idea for the joint, for the Boards to get together and have this joint meeting that we've been discussing but I'd like to request that you move these two Items forward on first reading, understanding that we need to get that joint meeting before we have a second reading on this.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Well, we certainly will take that up as a Board and, and render...

**MR. L. SMITH:** Thanks.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...a decision.

**MR. L. SMITH:** Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, sir. Are there any other comments and/or questions with regards to this Item? What is the pleasure of the Board?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Miller-Anderson.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** In light of the information that you just shared, I think that it would make a lot of sense for us to postpone this until.., try to aim for getting a workshop, or a joint meeting, and then bring it back at another.., at a later date, as opposed to doing the first reading, voting on it tonight, doing the meeting and then coming the second.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** And would it be the Boards pleasure to set a meeting date for this Item to come back? We have the 2<sup>nd</sup>...

[Inaudible comment]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...of May or the 16<sup>th</sup>?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Well, it's my... Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Chair Pro Tem.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** My opinion would be that we, since we have the time, we can do the first reading for land use, giving Staff an opportunity to do the things that they need to do and still gives us a time to have our joint meeting with them. So, if, after that joint meeting we feel that we don't wanna go any further, we still can do that.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Any further comment? [Pause]. Was there a motion on... There was no motion on the floor for this Item.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I'm asking... Madam Clerk, was there a motion...

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, there was no motion. We went into discussion...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** [Inaudible].

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** ...on whether this was No. 22 or 24 that was stated. [Chuckle].

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilwoman Botel.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** So, I wanted to ask Staff, does it help them if we make the motion on the..., if we make the motion tonight to let them get started on something, have our joint meeting and, at least the process is moving forward. We can always put a halt to it if, after some meeting we decide that there's something we, we wanna put a halt to, does that help Staff? I'm just trying to be...

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:**  
Councilwoman Botel, from [pause].

[Inaudible comments]

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** Thank you, Councilwoman Botel. From, from a Staff perspective, there is a time benefit if the Ordinance on first reading was approved. Again, that's at the discretion of Council, but even to...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** ...advertise again, it does take resources, it does take time. Something that, right now, Staff has limitations on both, but again, it's completely at the discretion of the Council. I don't see a negative impact if the first reading is approved being that there has to be a second reading...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** [Stammer]...

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** And fi there would be, really, a third meeting, being that we're adding a joint meeting with the Port of Palm Beach as well, so we're definitely having another option for discussion and, and further input either way.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** So, Madam Chair, we could approve first reading, rake our time to have a meeting, a joint meeting, and then approve or not approve on second reading and we'd be okay.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I'll entertain a motion.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** I make a motion.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** I move that we.., was that your motion...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yeah. [Chuckle]. I...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Okay. Second.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** ...Make a motion [inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It's been motioned and properly second. Madam Clerk.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Botel?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Miler-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Hubbard?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Davis Johnson?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Unanimous vote.

**23. CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Item 23.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY: ORDINANCE NO. 41408. AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH, PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA AMENDING THE CITY'S ZONING MAP DESIGNATION FOR THE REAL PROPERTY LOCATED AT 105 BROADWAY CONSISTING OF APPROXIMATELY 5.2 ACRES OF LAND FROM A UTILITY ZONING DESIGNATION TO A LIMITED INDUSTRIAL ZONING DESIGNATION IN ORDER TO FACILITATE USE OF THE SITE FOR STORAGE OF ROLLING AND BULK CARGO AND PROVIDING FOR AN EFFECTIVE DATE.**

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** So moved.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Second.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It's been moved and properly second. Mr. Gagnon. Are there any public comment cards?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, we have one public comment card and the acceptance of public comment cards for this Item is now closed.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you. Mr. Gagnon, proceed.

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** Thank you, Madam Chair. This is the sister Item to the Ordinance we just heard on first reading. What this will do is amend the City's zoning map to match future land use that's being currently proposed. So, the zoning designation will be amended from Utilities, as currently shown, to a limited industrial zoning designation. And this for 105 Broadway.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Any comments from the Board? Madam Clerk, public comment.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Martin Murphy.

**MR. M. MURPHY:** Well, I'm back. I feel like I'm going in circles. My name is Martin Murphy. Mr. Mayor, Chairperson and Cityperson..., Councilpersons.

On 23, to me, it's like 19 and 20, but Mr. Smith talked about a few things that I don't remember and maybe, maybe he can show me some documents. The, the research I did at the railroad for the..., after the application was made by the Port, the Port made the application..., one of Mr. Smith's partners made the application. But, I went to St. Augustine to review the file, and the file had no connections anywhere with an administrative hearing with the DOT. One of the things that the file did have though, was that the Port needs to get with the City of Riviera Beach, the City of West Palm Beach,

Palm Beach County and the State of Florida and come up and see 'em and [pause], you know, that didn't mean they were gonna give them the railroad crossing, but that meant there's be more horsepower behind it with the Port. That's the way I remember it because I went and reviewed the files. If Mr. Smith's got something that will contradict that, I'll be the first one to call all of you and say no. But that, that isn't what I understand.

Again, you know, it's like I said a minute ago, and I'd like to see this Item, which I want you all to understand that this Item is, I feel, our property, our..., the taxpayers and the citizens of the City of Riviera Beach. In a few years, when this Marina project gets developed and there's condominiums and everything down [stammer] east/west arteries are gonna be needed more than they are now, uh, hopefully. I'm hoping that I'm here to see that. As far as what Mr. Manny said about us going through the Port, the State of Florida will not give us the permit to go through another District. I've been over that with Mr. Almira many times, I've been over...

[Timer]

**MR. M. MURPHY:** ...with everybody. I'm not talking about my needs. I've already adjusted my needs. We're trucking to North Lake and coming around, that's what we do now, that's what Martin Marietta does, that's what Rybovich does, that's what Newport Cove does, that's what all of us do to get into the City now. We can't come in Blue Heron because of the railroad crossing, it's, it's got too much of a elevation. The trucks end up scraping the, the railroad and we don't wanna do that.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, Mr. Murphy.

**MR. M. MURPHY:** In closing, I, I, I hope that helps a little bit. It has nothing to do with my business. It has to do with me being a, a resident and a taxpayer in our City.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**MR. M. MURPHY:** Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Any further comments from the Board?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair, just because I am a novice, when we have that meeting, will all of those issues be discussed with us clearly, so that we understand this need for the east/west crossing and all of that? [Pause]. Okay. Good. Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Clerk.

**MR. M. MURPHY:** Madam Chair?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** You'll be there in the [inaudible] by that time.

**MR. M. MURPHY:** Will, will the public be able to come to this meeting [inaudible]?



**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Absolutely.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** He did last time.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilpers'... Pro Tem Hubbard?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Botel?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Davis Johnson?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Unanimous vote.

**24. CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Item No. 24.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY: ORDINANCE NO. 4109. AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH, PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA AMENDING CHAPTER 31 OF THE CITY'S CODE OF ORDINANCES ENTITLED "ZONING," ARTICLE 1, "IN GENERAL," SECTION 31-1, "DEFINITIONS," AND AMENDING ARTICLE VI, "SUPPLEMENTAL DISTRICT REGULATIONS" IN ORDER TO ADD DEFINITIONS FOR AND ASSOCIATED WITH MEDICAL MARIJUANA TREATMENT CENTERS AND MEDICAL MARIJUANA TREATMENT CENTER DISPENSING FACILITIES AND TO PROHIBIT MEDICAL MARIJUANA TREATMENT CENTERS AND MEDICAL MARIJUANA TREATMENT CENTER DISPENSING FACILITIES WITHIN ALL ZONING DISTRICTS AND WITHIN THE CITY'S JURISDICTIONAL BOUNDARIES, PROVIDING FOR CONFLICT, SEVERABILITY AND CODIFICATION, AND PROVIDING FOR AN EFFECTIVE DATE.**

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, we have no public comment cards on this Item and public comment.., acceptance of public comment cards is now closed.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you. I'll entertain a motion.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** So moved.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Second.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Gagnon.

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** Thank you, Madam Chair.

Before you, you have an Ordinance on first reading, which will prohibit any medical marijuana dispensary facility within the City's jurisdictional boundaries, as well as any medical marijuana treatment center. This Item, for some of the newer Council Members or just for the general public, previously, the City Council enacted an Ordinance in December of 2016 and that was for a one year [stammer] moratorium for medical marijuana. The City Council, in December 2017, extended that moratorium for an additional six months. So, that moratorium's currently in place and is set to expire in June of this year.

The Florida statutes was amended in mid-2017 and the state has really preempted the local government's authority to regulate the treatment centers or dispensing facilities for medical marijuana. They've really made it cut and dry and they basically said that local jurisdictions can either strictly prohibit this use altogether or you have the option of allowing the use, however, you can't apply any additional criteria that wouldn't be applied to a pharmacy. So, the option is to strictly prohibit or treat identical to pharmacies. So, we thought, at this point in time, from a Staff perspective, and the Planning & Zoning Board has agreed, that it's most prudent and probably in the best interest of the City, at this time, to strictly prohibit this use and, at a future time or date, if City Council chooses to revisit the Item, we could. It's much easier to go back and revisit it once it's prohibited, to potentially allow it, then it is to allow it right now and then decide that you don't want to allow it because you already have businesses established and they'll be existing in the City and be, in essence, grandfathered in, be considered a legal non-conforming use. So, the approach right now is probably best to strictly prohibit and then at a future date, if the Council chooses, to revisit the topic.

I am here to answer any questions.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Any questions or comments from the Board? [Pause]. Madam Clerk.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Botel?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Hubbard?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Davis Johnson?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Unanimous vote.

**25. CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Item 25.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** ORDINANCE NO. 4110. AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY COUNTY OF THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH, PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA AMENDING CHAPTER 31 OF THE CITY'S CODE OF ORDINANCES ENTITLED, "ZONING," ARTICLE VI, 551, "PRINCIPAL ARTERIAL COMMERCIAL DESIGN STANDARDS OVERLAY," TO AMEND EXISTING OBJECTIVES, APPLICABILITY AND OVERLAY DISTRICT DELINEATION AND TO ENACT NEW REGULATIONS FOR THE APPEARANCE OF BUILDINGS, STRUCTURES, LANDSCAPE DESIGN, BUFFER STANDARDS AND SIGNAGE, PROVIDING FOR CONFLICTS, SEVERABILITY AND CODIFICATION AND PROVIDING FOR AN EFFECTIVE DATE.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Motion?

**UNK.:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** So... Second.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, there are no public comment cards for this Item. The acceptance of public comment cards for this Item is now closed.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Gagnon.

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** Thank you, Madan Manager., Chair, excuse me.

This Item is also based off a previous City Council moratorium. In January of 2017, the City Council enacted a moratorium for any sort of site plan application submittal to the City and that was for the Broadway corridor and the Blue Heron Boulevard corridor. Since that time, Staff has considered a zoning in progress to be implemented in order for us to workshop the land development regulations for t these corridors and also to consider what other treatments might be appropriate through other primary roadways throughout the City. Once, or if, this Ordinance is approved, this Ordinance on second reading, would release the zoning in progress that is currently in place and allow for site plan applications to be submitted to City Staff and to be accepted by the City.

The main goals of this Ordinance is to really revisit the overlay District that we've had in place for sometime now. There really have been only minor amendments to this

overlay. And, what an overlay is, is just specific regulations that apply to certain roadways, at least in the case for this overlay designation. So, historically, this overlay has really been associated with all of our primary roadways. If you can name it as a primary roadway, it's, it's being incorporated into this overlay and what we're trying to do is strengthen some of the architectural standards, strengthen landscape design requirements, also take into account the fact there are a lot of bus stops that are designated along these routes and to ensure that development in the future not only takes that into consideration, but provides easements for either bus shelters or for bus benches, and to also ensure that future applicants understand the need to have that pedestrian activity, to have that other mode of transportation and to also incorporate into site plan approvals and conditions of those approvals.

So, I'm here to answer any questions you may have.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Any questions or comments from the Board? [Pause]. Madam Clerk.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Botel?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Hubbard?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Davis Johnson?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Unanimous vote.

**26. CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Item No. 26.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY: ORDINANCE NO. 4111. AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH, PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA AMENDING CHAPTER 31 OF THE CITY'S CODE OF ORDINANCES ENTITLED, "ZONING," ARTICLE I, "IN GENERAL," SECTION 31-1, "DEFINITIONS," AND ARTICLE VI, "SUPPLEMENTAL DISTRICT REGULATIONS," BY CREATING A NEW SECTION ENTITLED REGULATIONS FOR FILLING STATIONS A/K/A GAS STATIONS, IN ORDER TO PROVIDE AND AMEND DEFINITIONS AND TO PROVIDE**

**SEPARATION REQUIREMENTS BETWEEN FILLING STATIONS TO PROMOTE DIVERSIFIED DEVELOPMENT PATTERNS WITHIN THE CITY, PROVIDING FOR CONFLICTS, SEVERABILITY AND CODIFICATION AND PROVIDING FOR AN EFFECTIVE DATE.**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Entertain a motion.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** So moved.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Second.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, we do not have any public comment cards on this Item. The acceptance of public comment cards on this Item is now closed.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Gagnon.

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** Thank you, Madam Chair.

Again, before you, you have an Ordinance on first reading. This specifically will create separation requirements between, as our Code calls them, filling stations but today we call them gas stations, so I guess, the Code was written back in the 50's so that's when they were called filling stations, so we still have that definition in place, but we did a study of, again, a lot of our major corridors and we did realize that, I don't wanna say there's an oversaturation at this point, but in comparison to other municipalities, we're pretty much at the top as far as total number of gas stations per square mile. So, we totally..., excuse me, in totality, we have 17 gas stations located within the City. So, if you divide that by total land area, which is about 8.5 square miles, we have approximately two gas stations per square mile. So, that equivalent to what North Palm Beach currently has. Palm Beach Gardens, which does have much more land area, specifically out west, they only have a fraction of that ratio for gas stations. So, we thought it would be prudent to incorporate the separation requirement for any new filling station that's proposed in the City. We currently have a special exception requirement for any approval for a gas station, so this is an additional regulation that would be placed into our Code of Ordinances to ensure that there's adequate separation between these gas stations. I also wanted to make note of the fact that, at the interchange of I-95 and Blue Heron Boulevard, Staff did recognize the fact that this is a hurricane evacuation route, so we wanna make sure that, that gas stations are able to locate with in a 2,000 foot radius of that intersection, so that way, if there is a need, the market demand can influence that. However, along other land area, specifically, along Blue Heron Boulevard and other main..., major corridors, that 1,000 foot separation requirement would be in place.

Thank you.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Any discussion from the Board?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** No.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** None? Madam Clerk.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Hubbard?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Botel?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Davis Johnson?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Unanimous vote.

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** Thank you.

**27. CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Item 27 was deleted.

**27A. CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** We are now moving to Item 27A.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY: SETTING A WORKSHOP DATE FOR PARLIAMENTARY PROCEDURES AND RULES OF DECORUM**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** If I may...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible] retreat.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...take a moment of privilege, I want to apologize that we did not address this issue at the workshop on Monday. It, it was an oversight. Certainly not an intentional oversight but I wanna make [stammer] make my colleagues aware that it was an oversight and so we wanted to make sure that it returned promptly to the Agenda. Madam Manager.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair, what.., the documentation behind the additions and deletions, we spoke with Mr. Matthew Russell, as Councilwoman Miller-Anderson had suggested, and he is willing to provide the parliamentary procedures at no charge. Also, we did reach out to Patricia Macdougall, she's a professional registered parliamentarian. And, she is willing to provide these services, however, her's is broken up into two days regarding Robert's Rules of Order and then Rules of Decorum. And

her..., her dates of availability are next week, April 23<sup>rd</sup> and 24<sup>th</sup>, and then a Saturday date, if you all are available. So, just depends on what you..., what type of training you're looking for, and what dates you're available.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Council Member Davis.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Have we determined when we're gonna have our Council retreat?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** No. I have a list of workshops and..., including Council retreat that...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Because...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** ...we need to have.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Thank you. 'Cause, I, I do believe, and just me, with Matthew Russell, it'd be great to have him as a component of our retreat, because we've got a lot of business we gotta take care of. And you know, retreats take some time, two full, whole entire days. We, we [chuckle]..., I, I'm very comfortable having Matthew Russell be a part of our retreat and, and add that to the Agenda so he can..., so we can go over a lot of the issues that..., if anybody got any questions or concerns, and let him, you know, just kinda give some, give some of our new Members [pause]... Get everybody going in the right direction. That's just where I'm standing with it, versus creating a whole other day. If we're gonna be here for two days talking about Council business, wherever we decide to be, Marina or whatever, I think it's only fair that we add to the Agenda, a..., the workshop [stammer] on the Agenda for a..., with Robert's Rules and decorum and, and then have Mr. Russell see how much time he got..., he can give us in, in those time slots. Because, because, you know, we still got Utility District, longer meetings in the Utility District, we got CRA meetings, we got Council meetings, we got the CRA workshop that's gonna come up, which is gonna be independent... A CRA retreat, which is gonna be independent of what we're doing. So, just for time, for time sake and as we approach the summertime, I think it's, I think it'd be..., I'd like to hear how..., what everybody else feel about it but, you know, just to find a way to be flexible with what we have and make it work versus trying to bring us back together for a separate day.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Was it Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes. The retreat that you're looking at doing, how far down the line are we looking to do that? I know CRA's retreat, I think he mentioned maybe June or something?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** June, it's a June date.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Well, the retreat that I'm speaking of is to..., so you can set your budget priorities for Fiscal Year '19, so I would say no later than end of May, so we can start putting our budget document together and, you know, working on your..., making sure your priorities are included in the budget, that we present to you in July/August.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well, as we know, this Item I had put on the Agenda several months back, and for various reasons, we, we did not address it. I'm not in favor of pushing it any further down the line. We do have other meetings, maybe on a Utility District night that we don't have as many things on the Agenda, or maybe we have other workshops that may not take as long. I don't think prolonging it any longer than we've already done is going to help the situation. I think that this is something that does need to be addressed. I think it's very important that... And, and the reason I did it was because of the issues that we were having, and I think starting off brand new, you know, we..., this is probably the time in which for us to do it because we have at least one new person on the Council now, and so I thought that bringing this before us at the very beginning would kinda set the tone so that we could move forward. So, to continue to push it down, further down the line, I am certainly not in favor of that. On one of the Utility District meeting nights, which is...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** So, the next meeting is May 15<sup>th</sup>.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Which is a third Mon'..., I'm sorry.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** No. The four'...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** I'm looking at Tuesday. May..., it's usually the third Monday of the month.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Right. That's the 21<sup>st</sup>?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** 21<sup>st</sup>.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm. Which is almost around the time you were talking anyway. Maybe looking at that time, or if there was a time, I'm not sure about when the CRA... I know at one point, they were looking at just doing..., well, at least for this month, they only com'..., they combined the two meetings. Right? In April, Ms. Davis Johnson?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** We did not have...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** We did not.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...the first...



**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** We have a meeting scheduled on the [inaudible]...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** The second Wednesday.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** We did not.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Right.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So, I'm not sure of what the plan is for May, but maybe May 9<sup>th</sup>? Which would be the first CRA meeting. And if there.., I'm not sure if we're going to have it or not, but if.., even if we do, if the Agenda's not that long, we could possibly take a look at that date. So, if we could put May 9<sup>th</sup> as one of the dates and then, push come to shove, the May 21<sup>st</sup>? Or the May 23<sup>rd</sup>, which is the other CRA meeting, and then we can kinda see.., I guess you can send it out and then we can email back which would be most appropriate based on the CRA's Agenda. If it's anything like it was just this past month, I mean, we had a workshop.., a closed executive session, I think, on the second, second Wednesday for.., in April because we did not have a CRA meeting. So, maybe the 9<sup>th</sup> will play out the same way. Not sure. But if we can look at those dates, the 9<sup>th</sup>, the 21<sup>st</sup>...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** 21<sup>st</sup>.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...and the 23<sup>rd</sup>.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Is the rest of the Council avail'.., well...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** I'm fine with combining it with another meeting. I think that's a good idea.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Actually, I would rather not combine it with another meeting. I would like for it to be a standalone so that we can get through it and not have to be hurried because of the lateness of the hour and folks wanting to go home. So, if we can check the availability of our Members for.., well, check with the CRA to see if they are having...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...those single...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...meetings. If there is no single meeting.., I mean, if there is a single meeting, then we can place it on the Agenda for a standalone meeting and that would be the 9<sup>th</sup>.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Because, what has been happening, is we have been placing those meetings on the., they have gone on the fourth Wednesday. So...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Right.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...we will check., we, uh, we'll direct Staff to check with Mr. Evans with regards to his plans for the next CRA meeting, if we are scheduled for the 9<sup>th</sup> or if we are going sometime thereafter, and then we can schedule that alone.

Now, the other thing that we need to decide is, who will conduct this and how will we., how will we want to structure this retreat., workshop rather, around rules of decorum and parliamentary procedures?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well, Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** We already have those., the rules of decorum in place, we have a policy.. I do think we need to take a look at it because, as we were putting it on the, on Novus some time ago, we recognized that there are some things in the policy that we have not actually followed. So, we wanna probably take a look at that and see if those are some things that we want to change or, or modify of some sort. And then, in terms of the parliamentary procedures, I think we should, at least, just first start off with the basics and, if we find that once we have our initial meeting, if we need to have an additional meeting, then we can do so. I think it's just a matter of trying to get the basics down for everyone, and then once we have that, if there's a need for an additional meeting, then we can do that.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Right. But is this going to be moderator based, are we selecting a moderator tonight? Because we have two names that have been put, put before us and there has not been a full conversation of the Board as it relates to what direction we want to go. Certainly, we've heard from you and we've heard from Mr. Davis, no comment as of yet from Commis'., Councilperson Botel or Chair Pro Tem, so an opportunity for them to speak about that is certainly warranted and then we can move forward with that., with whatever date is selected.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Chair Pro Tem.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** I would be in favor of us using a., using the professional registered parliamentarian for the Robert Rules of Order session, and there definitely needs to be a look at the rules of decorum so that both of us., so, so that it can be outfitted for., with more teeth. The date that we use, I would prefer it to be a standalone date as opposed to tying it to another meeting.

Those are my comments, Madam Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Council Member Botel.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** It appears to me that this person who wrote the letter is.., who is a professional registered parliamentarian has good credentials and it, it would seem that this an appropriate person. I don't.., I know anything about the other person, and all I have is a one or two sentence email, so it's, it's difficult for me to even rec'.., recommend that person.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Alrighty. So, I, I've already stated. We will look.., we will check with Mr.., Mr. Evans for the 9<sup>th</sup>. We can either take a vote as to whom we want to lead this or we can do it by consensus.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Ma'...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilman Davis.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Typically, when we get into these retreats, the Chair usually take lead on that on those initiatives.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Well, I am trying to give us an opportunity...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...to reach consensus on...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I mean, I can...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...certainly say, but I, I don't want, want to be dictorial.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Well, I'll sate it for the record, I'm fine with either one.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** The only reason I mentioned Matthew Russell is for two reasons, one, because he was from here. He's also done some work with...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...the, with the local association, neighborhood association, and he does some work with the Housing Authority as well. We also have a certified person. So, you know, if someone that Councilperson Miller-Anderson brought

up, I have great respect for both, both individuals. Whichever way you go, I think we're in safe hands. Whichever way it goes. So.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I can certainly take privilege if that is the direction of this, this Council, but I wanted us to have a discussion and to make a decision collectively. So, we will either..., we can take it in two parts, we can vote for Mr. Russell or we can vote for Ms...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Macdougall.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I have...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Ch'...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...a question though, before I...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes, sir.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I apologize.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Can I make one comment? We do ha'..., also have a third professional registered parliamentarian, Barbara Proctor, which I did not give you all that..., provide that information to you. So there's a second parliamentarian..., professional registered parliamentarian also. Her name is Barbara Proctor.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Miller-Anderson.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. So, Mr. Russell was offering to do it at no charge, Ms. Macdougall is \$850, and how much is it for Ms. Proctor?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** [Pause].

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Ms. Proctor is..., her fee would \$300 for a four hour workshop.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Talking about \$600.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Which will include the preparation and all handout material.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Council Member Davis.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So, now I have to give it even much deeper thought. Whoever we choose, it must be someone who has been staying up on trends and all the changes for all the new additions that have been taking place over the last decade. So, I think that will only be fair to..., for us to make..., take whatever decision we do make, take that into consideration 'cause the rules have been amended, they have been modified, there have recommendations and changes to the Robert Rules of itself.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mhmm.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So, having someone, you know, I'm not..., I don't know if they all three are or not, or whoever that person is, I'm comfortable whatever way that you all choose to go, but please keep that in mind that, that is something that we need to take in consideration.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Mayor.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yes. This is..., who's Item is this? I just wanna make sure I'm on... KaShamba Miller-Anderson's?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay. And you brought the, the person that, that you are recommending?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** The person that I initially recommended was Mr. Matthew Russell because he did, some time ago, reached out to me and said that he would not have a problem with coming and assisting us should we need the service. He also has helped with the Riviera Beach Housing Board. And so, at that time, that was the only person in which I spoke to. I did not go out looking for any other professional parliamentarian to do it. I figured..., and, and like I said, he offered his service free of charge, and so that's where that came from. And, as I said before, that was something where we felt like we needed to go out and, and do a little more research or, or have more training than we could possibly look at someone who..., if..., who's, you know, were certified at that point. But, I think he's been around, as an attorney, he's been around for a while. He's pretty well known for his expertise in Robert Rules of Order. I don't believe that he's certified, and I could be wrong, but I felt that [pause] having, having him come in, assist us on this, free of charge, would at least be a start. And if we felt that we need to have an advanced class in it, and we needed to then dole out a little bit of money to get that level of expertise, then we could move in that direction, but my initial thought was not to make this a high-priced Item or, you know, it was just a matter of just trying to get the basics down.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you. I, I think that if we have someone that is willing to do this free of charge, that tells me there that they're committed to the City, and they're willing to save the City some money. And, if we have an opportunity to get attorney, Matthew Russell, just the mere fact that he's, he's been the attorney, even Assistant Attorney for the City of Riviera Beach, but he is well qualified, and I believe that, since Ms. Miller-Anderson, it was her Item and this is something that she has been doing with bringing, you know, back and forth for several weeks, I think in, in all respect to her judgment, that I definitely support attorney Matthew Russell. I have been in meetings with him when an issue came up about Robert Rules. He is very strict, he's very strong,

he doesn't care who it is, he's gonna tell it just like it is. And I've seen him in action as a parliamentarian, at the Housing Authority, and maybe one or two other places. So, I concur with you.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair?

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, Mr. Mayor.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** On the strength of the Mayor's recommendation, and that of Councilwoman KaShamba Miller-Anderson, I would, I would do away with my reluctance to recommend somebody based on two lines and say that I'm okay with that too.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Well, here... Thank you. If I may? I, I do not disagree that Mr. Russell has been around, but I think that we are seeking to do is bring the parliamentary procedures around full circle, and we're talking about doing this in the form of, of a workshop. We can invest the \$300. I understand that he's free, but we have to think in terms of what our end goal is and we were trying to do, and it appeared to me that we wanted to go, maybe with someone who is certified, at this particular time, so that we don't have to come back and do a subsequent session in the event that the needs are not met. That is my position and I would state that for the record. However, you know, the consensus of this Board will dictate and drive where we go, but I wanted to put that on the record.

Any further discussion? [Pause]. So, what is the final pleasure of this Board?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** There's.., is there a motion?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes. I make a motion that we bring on Attorney Matthew Russell to provide the workshop for us and we'll determine the date based on his availability and what we spoke of about the CRA.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** I second.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Before we move forward, we talked about not determining... He would need to ma'.., be available for the 9<sup>th</sup>, if the 9<sup>th</sup> is what's available.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yeah. I think that it said... Yeah. If, if we know that it's available, yes.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Did we check with Mr. Evans? Can you reach out to Mr. Evans? Okay. It's been motioned and properly second. Madam Clerk.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Botel?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Miler-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Hubbard?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** No.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Davis Johnson?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** No.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** That motion is approved with Councilpersons Hubbard and Davis Johnson dissenting.

[Inaudible dais comments]

## **ITEMS TABLED**

### **REGULAR – OLD BUSINESS**

#### **REGULAR**

#### **DISCUSSION AND DELIBERATION**

**28. CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** 28.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Item No. 28.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes. Thank you.

#### **CITY CLERK ANTHONY: CHARTER REVIEW COMMITTEE**

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, we do not have any public comment cards on this Item. The acceptance of public comment cards on this Item is now closed.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Great. So, I requested that this Item come back before us because it is necessary for us to review our Charter and to have certain sections of the Charter amended. What I wanted to discuss was the reconvening of the Charter Review Committee. However, I want to also discuss identifying an attorney that has that specific experience. Based on information and feedback that we've received from members of the Charter Review. There has been some challenges or, I would say challenges with the attorney that was initially assigned to serve as the attorney for the

Charter Review Committee. It is most important, and every critical to our community, to the operations of this City, for us to address the Charter and address the Items that have to be changed or that posed us some, some challenge during the previous election. Not this last election, but the election prior to. And so, I would like to have.., ask my colleagues to reconvene and.., reconvene the Charter Review Committee, we need to, while reconvening, identify potentially another attorney that is well versed in Charter Review that can guide and steer this Committee as it is working to address the many Charter amendments that need to be put before our voters. So, if my colleagues are in agreement with that, I would like for us to be able to de'.., to direct our City Attorney to identify a, an attorney who is specialized in Charter Review. And I believe the attorney that we had in previous Charter amendments, is out there and available and is very well versed in Charter amendment. So, I would like to request that we identify an attorney who is well versed in Charter Review and to also reconvene the Charter Review Committee.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Is that a motion?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I can't make a motion.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** I'll make that motion.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Second.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It's been motioned and properly second. Mr., are there any other comments? [Pause]. Madam Clerk.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, before we take the roll call vote, I will have to do a letter to the previous Board Members to see if they are all still interesting in serving.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mhmm.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** And if they are not, I will have to put an Item out to.., for you all to make a decision whether or not you want appoint additional individuals or whether or not you all would want to continue the process as the Board, as the Code of Ordinances does allow you all to do that.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Well certainly, there is an expectation that we would submit correspondence to those Members. We would have to have notice of continued participation or not. We'll expect to see the list of individuals who have agreed to continue on and those that will not. We will then seek to have replacements, and then we will also need to have the City Attorney notify the existing attorney that we are going in a different direction and seek to identify an attorney that is well versed in Charter Review.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Understood.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Hubbard?



**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Botel?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Davis Johnson?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Unanimous vote.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**28A. CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Item 28A.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY: CONSIDERATION OF THE MAYOR'S SUSPENSION OF INTERIM PUBLIC WORK DIRECTOR**

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair, providing I am required by the Charter to provide to the Council Members at the next regular City Council after., after the suspension, I am, I am directed by the Charter to, to provide this in writing. So, there you go. [Hands out copies]. [Pause]. I'm coming here since I'm going to be addressing the, the Council, Madam Chair, if that's okay with you. And then, we have pictures that we need to show as well.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Continue, Mr. Mayor.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you. What I have given the Council Members is what I am prepared to read into the record at this particular time. And let me just say, let me preface to say that there's only., this is the second time in ten years that I have attempted to suspend, or have suspended, one person in the past. Unfortunately, it wasn't upheld by the Council, but both times it involved elected officials. The first time, I think, one of the elected officials asked that I would suspend someone. In this particular instance, I was not asked by any elected official to take any action. Secondly, let me point out that this provision is in the Charter, it was attempted by referendum vote to delete it from the Charter, but by 65% of the vote, or 68%, it was decided by the voters to continue to allow the Office of the Mayor, the Mayor to have this authority when necessary. I am now reading a letter to the Council Members, dated April the 18, 2018.

To my fellow Council Members,

As you know, I suspended Mr. Terrence Bailey for four days without pay, ending today at 5:00 o'clock, p.m. According to our City Charter, I am required to report my finding to you, in writing, at the next regular City Council meeting following the suspension. So, that's why, why I'm here. My reasons for the suspension of Mr. Terrence Bailey are as follows:

1. Mr. Terrence Bailey was given a very clear and concise directive by our City Manager to remove all campaign signs in the right of way of public properties. However, our investigation, the Office of the Mayor, revealed that, in direct contradiction to the City Manager's directive, several campaign signs were removed from private properties as well. 'Do not have a problem with public property because the City Manager's certainly within.., was within her right. Anything that's in, in the public domain but my problem is with the private property. This act'.., this action was not authorized by, nor was it disclosed to the City Manager.

That's number one.

Because the directive came to.., from the City Manager to Mr. Bailey, if there were gonna be any changes to the directive, Mr. Bailey had a fiduciary duty to say to the Manager, 'Well, let's do this and let's do that and let's just go around the City and just remove all of the campaign signs no matter where they are.' He was not.., that conversation never took place, so he wasn't authorized to make any changes to a directive given by the City Manager.

Number two, it was later learned that many of the signs that were confiscated by the City Staff, had also been destroyed without the knowledge or approval of the City Manager. Destroyed or done away with. I know that we may not have a statute specifically on point on this at all as it relates to the removal of signs. And, from this perspective, the state statute even talks about ten days, it even talks about giving notice to the elected.., to the, to the person, the elected official, whoever was campaigning, as a courtesy, at least.

But, you know, that's neither here nor there. Okay.

It was later learned that many of the signs that were confiscated by the City Staff, had also been destroyed without the knowledge or approval of the City Manager.

Last but not least...

And this is a very important point and I'm somewhat disappointed that the.., Mr. Bailey is not here tonight to defend this action.

At the time our City Manager inquired about the signs, Mr. Bailey informed her that Staff had already destroyed the signs.

Is that right, Ms., Ms. Hoskins? [Pause]. I'm asking you a direct question.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** What date are you referring to?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** When you spoke to Mr. Bailey about the signs, what happened to the signs? Did he said we no longer..., the signs are gone?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** He said they were destroyed.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you. Let me go back to number three so we won't lose the continuity of the statement.

At the time our City Manager inquired about the signs, Mr. Bailey informed her that Staff had already destroyed the signs, but this was not exactly the case. A member..., a number, excuse me, a number of the [stammer] confiscated signs had been hidden behind the old Public Works building and were subsequently discovered by me, by the Mayor, as you can see in these photos. This investigation was conducted over a two weeks period. The Manager was under the impression that the signs were gone. I was told by a person that he thought the signs, some of the signs, I may find some of them but they were..., some of them were not destroyed, that some of them would be found back, back behind the old Public Works, by the Public Works building.

There's a couple..., this is just a violation on all fronts, as I, as I see it, going on private property, not following the directive that was clearly given by the City Manager. Now, I have in possession to..., for evidence, Mr. Guy'..., Bruce Guyton always says, 'Document, data and evidence.' I have , signed by Mr. Floyd Davis, Jr., a document, matter of fact it says, 'On Old Dixie's Highway's property....'

So, Old Dixie Highway, which is President Barack Obama.

...and Silver Beach Road, on the southwest corner, I did not give the City permission, permission to remove any campaign signs off of my property.

We also have in, in our file, another correspondence from the gas station on the corner of Blue Heron and doc'..., and President Barack Obama Highway. I had an opportunity to visit the station and talk to the general manager and walked with him, on the property to make sure that, as we walked the property, that he would be able to point out his [stammer] the borderline of his property. He did that with me and it was clear that the sign of dispute was not even close to the public right of way. This was also true a couple other places, I don't wanna debate it. One was on Australian and Blue Heron Boulevard, where we all put our campaign signs. That is clear to me, that is private property, at least where Councilperson KaShamba Miller-Anderson had her sign, which was back. It wasn't up close to the, to the curb, to the sidewalk at all. Clearly. And then, directly across the street, there was another sign and that was moved. That was clear. That was clear to me, that it was not in the public right of way.

Now, the pictures that you are seeing are the signs that I discovered, some of them, behind the old Public Works building. There's the wood, and you will see, Dr. Botel sign and you will see..., I think, one of Dr. Botel, maybe two. And then, the, the elected official sign, KaShamba Miller-Anderson. I was told that KaShamba Miller-Anderson had spent \$200, I think, to put thank you signs, thank you notices rather, on these signs. That could not happen because of, you know, they were no longer there. The wood is expensive, the wood is gone, the signs are gone, all of the above. Tommy Walker was going to use the wood, personally, 'cause it was a pressurized wood, very expensive, that was..., could not be done because Dr. Botel, your signs were gone too, that were on private property, on the mainland. There was one gas station, I wanna put it on the record, on Singer Island that the owner of the, of the station removed the sign himself 'cause he wanted to use the wood. [Chuckle]. And that was also your sign, Ms. Miller-Anderson.

Other than that, the, the record speaks for itself.

Thank you, Madam Chair. This concludes a two week investigation by the Office of the Mayor. I'm not debating the public right of way, I'm only debating private property.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, sir. I am not familiar of what the next step would actually be for this Board, if there is a discussion that needs to ensue. Mr. Attorney.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** The Board is charged with substantiating or denying the request of the Mayor in terms of the suspension.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** And, he's put into evidence, these facts that he's relied upon and taking the action, and basically has presented to you for ratification.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** So, we need to entertain a motion?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** To ratify or not.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Is there a motion?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So, being that one of..., some of that was my signs, what..., do I need to refrain from the vote, disclose, Mr. Attorney?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** That's already been disclosed, your involvement in it. The issue's whether or not the facts presented by the Mayor substantiate the action taken.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Any comment? Any further comment or questions?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** I wonder if any defense was provided? Was due process given?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** The opportunity was given, as I understand it, for Mr. Bailey to be here and offer his defense and he declined to do so.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Is there a motion?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Oh, Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** To ratify?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilman Davis.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Thank you. I tried to reach Mr. Bailey myself to get a understanding of what's going on. Unfortunately, I couldn't really reach him. At the time.., he had.., I was told he had a car accident on Friday, the day he was to been at work, he was suspended on Thursday. But I wanna ask the Mayor, while we try to see.., 'cause I hear what you're stating in your report, [stammer], referring to certain folks but you never gave me any names. So, what I'm...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I can give you a name if you need one.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Well, I'm, I'm just trying to support, you know, if, if somebody did something wrong, maliciously wrong, you know, I've always supported you in efforts. We had a issue before that came back with the Utility District, as you can recall when something took place in this meeting. So, it's very evident what happened in that meeting. So, my question is, when, when did you start this investigation?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Approximately [pause], Ms. Hos'.., Hoskins probably can tell me, may be more accurate. Probably about two weeks, would you say? About two weeks ago?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** No. [Pause].

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Or do you...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Emails...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...do you know?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** ...from..., I would say March 15<sup>th</sup> or something, when it actually occurred.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** No. He's asking when I started.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** When did you start?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Do you know?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Does that include you come and asking me questions? I think that was around March 15<sup>th</sup>.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yeah. But, I think he's asking is when I became involved and did the own..., my independent investigation. That...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...that took about two weeks.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I mean, if...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I did have...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...you're asking questions...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...conversations with...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So, that would be part of the investigation, correct?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Somewhat, you could say that. But I thought you meant the actual, physical investigation. Going to the places...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I'm...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...talking to people. I talked to Ms. Hoskins about...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Inquiring is a part of the...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yeah. Inquiring.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...investigation. I mean, it started somewhere. Okay.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** But I have a question for the Attorney. Mr. Attorney? In the law..., in a court of law, which we're not, when the defendant has an opportunity to state their case and he doesn't show up, what happens generally?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** You're right. We're not in a court of law. We're in an administrative proceeding. The issue is the same, however. They are required to make their decision based upon what is presented to them. You presented a case with facts, there's no contrary facts presented. That's all they have to deal with.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you, Mr. Attorney.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair? [Stammer], I'm not through... Mayor. I wanna ask you a few more questions.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I've been preparing some information. During your investigation, did you make any contact with the Human Resource Department and the City Attorney, along with, you already [inaudible] on March 15<sup>th</sup> with the City Manager? Did you...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** The Charter does not...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...contact...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** The Charter does not have me to make contact with HR. I did have a conversation with the City Attorney.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So, what [pause], what was your issue with the signs? Because I know when I got elected in 2013, my signs were removed, um, not by me, but it was removed by Staff and, and I just looked at it as saving me some labor time and money.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Private property.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Okay. So, private property?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Number one. Private property...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No, no.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** But the directive that was given...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Okay.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...by the Manager, directly to Mr. Bailey, contradicts that.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So, where's that documentation on that?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Ms. Hoskins wrote a email to Mr. Bailey...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No. I hear what you're saying.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...stating...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I don't have a copy of that.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...only the signs..., stating that the signs on public property should be taken. That was the email, and I saw that.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** One moment, gentlemen. We are now approaching 10:00 p.m. We have remaining on the Agenda, the authorization of the vacant tires, the reappointment of Ms. Kendrick to the General Employee's Pension Board, and discussion.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Okay. So, I'm gonna wrap this question, I think, 'cause I'll be here all night.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I need a motion to extend.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Motion...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** To extend.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I'll wait and see how long we're gonna go.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** You need to tell me how long you want to extend.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Twenty minutes?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Speak into the record, please.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Twenty minutes.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Motion to extend for twenty minutes. Is there a second?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Second.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It's been motioned and properly second. Madam Clerk.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Botel?



**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Hubbard?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Davis Johnson?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Unanimous vote.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Continue.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I'mma just, just stop here. I just got..., I would like, as some point, once everyone's done talking, their input, I would like for someone to do an independent investigation of all the documentation that we all should've had and make a recommendation to this Board, with the information that the Mayor has discussed, as far as Mr. Bailey. All documentation, and all emails, everything, and give an independent on what happened with Human Resources, with happened with Legal, what happened with the City Manager, through this process before I can make any substantial information. 'Cause right now, we're going by what Mr., what Mayor Masters is saying, but he's not giving information to back up all the information that he's, that he's stating. You know...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I think [inaudible]...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I mean, private property is something that private property owners would have to make and file a complaint on their private property.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** You have documentation, signed. You heard what the Attorney said, there's nothing to dispute what the Mayor said. He had a chance to dispute it, he's not here to even dispute it.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Mayor, I'm just stating what I would like to see.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Well, I...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...from you.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...think you should just vote no.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Mayor, I can respect your position. I'm just asking for [stammer]. I'm not saying I'm against what you're stating, I never said no. All I said was

give me information, so I can either support it or go a different direction. I'm just asking to get all this information accumulated. But right now, we don't have any..., no..., there's no, no backup. You just gave us, you just gave us something at, at this time to support it but there's more information I would like to receive about all these complaints that you started your investigation back on March 15<sup>th</sup>.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** That's all.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Isn't that fair? I'm not saying I'm against what you're...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** No it's not.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...what your trying to do, but right now, we have taken someone off, off the st'..., off our community, and we got \$50,000,000 on the street right now, working. And we have no Public Works Director.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair, I'm asking for, tonight... I've done what I was supposed to do.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I'm asking this Council to..., here are the..., here's the..., Chief of Staff just brought all the emails that went back and forth, if you need them. But, I think I have..., what Mr..., what the Attorney has said, I have...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...presented undisputable evidence at this point.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**MAYOR MASTERS:** And I'm asking this, this Council to either vote it up or vote it down, rather than to debate it further.

Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, Mr. Mayor.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I'm calling for a motion at this time.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair? I'll just pause. I said [stammer]. I just had...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...some questions and documentation. That's it.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilperson Botel.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** I have one last question for our Attorney. Are we at risk because there has been no.., because you feel the due process has been given, and the person.., that the subject of this investigation has not shown up to give us any opposite side of this investigation, are we at risk of any.., facing any lawsuit as a result of any decision we may make here tonight?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** You're always at risk of a lawsuit...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** What's your opinion about that?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...[inaudible] regardless. I don't think you would be found in violation of the law.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Okay.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** The question was, is there a risk of there...

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Well...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...being a lawsuit?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Your opinion is that we wouldn't be found in violation?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** [Inaudible].

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Would not be.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Okay.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Would not be. Would not be.

[Inaudible comment]

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Would not.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** We would not. But that's what I just said, that we would...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Correct.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** ...not be found in violation. Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilperson Miller-Anderson, any comment?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well, I'll make a motion that we support the suspension, as the Mayor has stated.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** I second.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It's been motioned and properly second. Well, before that, we have not heard from every Councilperson on this matter.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** So, before the...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** But, I mean.., well, go ahead. Yeah.

[Inaudible comments]

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I thought...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** [Inaudible]...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...you already kinda...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** No.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...said what you wanted...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** No.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...to say.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** No.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Well, I still have that motion but go ahead.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman.., Chair Pro Tem, did you have any...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** No, ma'am.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay. It's been motioned and properly second. Madam Clerk.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Oop, ooh.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilp'...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Question.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Well, I thought you were done.

**]COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No. No, no, no. I was waiting for you to finish..., everyone to have their comments.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** There's a motion on the floor.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** There is a motion... But he did say pause...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I said pause.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...Mr. Mayor.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I was saying..., I...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** That he, he wanted to give...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...wanted to allow my other...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...everybody a [inaudible]...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...colleagues to say what they had to say.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay, Mr. Davis.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So when the [stammer]...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...please make your comment.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So, I'm trying to find out, based upon the documentation that's submitted to me here now. We have someone that would've been here but, unfortunately, he was in a major car accident, and no one's stating that for the record.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** I did not know [inaudible]...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Never told us that.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yeah. Yeah, he was... That's why I was trying to reach'..., trying to find out what was going on. The very next morning, he was in a major car accident.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** He has not given any kind of communication to the Manager stating that he would not be here because of it. You have that information...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Mayor.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...we don't.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Mayor, what I'm stating is, I was trying...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** That would not be the procedure.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I was called today, we had an add-on that was added on today. Right? We had a document that was given today. You're stating.., all I'm saying.., I'm not ready to vote yes or no on it, all I ask for you to do, and this Board to do, is support the City, City Attorney, or Human Resources, to do an indep'.., hire someone to do an independent investigation, validating all the documentation that the Mayor's stating and, if that's the case, I can support that. But, we're going in the wind with, with his word without all the documentation.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** And...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** All of it. And, I saw some signs up there, and I'm trynna find out, when was those signs removed? There's no documentation that say when those signs were removed, and that he actually did it. There's no documentation that says that he removed the signs and when he did it. He just said, 'Here.' And this document here, Mr. Floyd Davis, who's.., just happened for the record, is my mechanic, he stated...

I did not give anyone permission.., the City permission, to remove the signs.

He didn't say that he saw the City do it. He just said I didn't give nobody permission to remove 'em. Nor did he state I gave any permission to do it. But he's always been graceful with every candidate on that corner.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** And that corner, as you know, as we put all those signs up, is always blocking traffic. And so, I'm trying to find out when did... , are you saying when those signs removed? Did they removed in one day, did they get removed in two days, did it go two weeks? Because these are questions that we should all been properly prepared to vet.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you. Madam Chair, you have...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Hold on.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...you have a...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So, you're not gonna answer the question?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** No. I'm not. I'm not answering... I've laid my case out, there's nothing [inaudible]...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Because...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...to say. There's a motion on the floor.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No, no. No. I'm gonna ask my colleagues.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Since you won't answer the question. With all due respect. Colleagues, all I'm asking this Board is to allow to get all the information. Now, we have been given some documentation that say' the signs were removed but it doesn't specify who did. Now, I support my colleagues if there's something wrong and maliciously were done, but there's nothing to state when this happened and who did it. And you're asking us to take a vote?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Call for the previous question. The motion is on the floor.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Mayor.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** There's a...

Td: I'm just a'...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...motion on the floor.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Mayor, you, you, you said you did the investigation...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I don't wanna get into...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...independently.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...an argument with you. I know that's your friend.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** That's why I asked for...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I know he's your friend.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Let's, let's not...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Hold, hold, hold on.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Let's just continue.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** That's unfair.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Let's not, let's not interject.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No. I'm not...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I'm not gonna go back and forth with him.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** There is a motion and a second on the floor. However, I would like to...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** My friend.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...ask Mr... Mr. Davis, don't please.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** You were involved in the communication.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Yes. Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** And so, you have the information and you have looked at, at this information?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Right.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** And do you have a, a, a comment or was there any action taken by your office or did.., or was the investigation of the Mayor, did that supersede any action that you were taking? Mr...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** When you finish having that question answered, I have a concern.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay. So, should I not be asking that...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Yes. You can ask... She.., you can get the answer that you asked the Manager.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** There's some information that I just heard that I did not know.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** And I need to express that to you.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** After hearing from Council'.., Councilwoman, Chairperson at the time, Councilwoman Miller-Anderson on March 15<sup>th</sup> that ten of her campaign signs had been removed, I contacted Mr. Bailey and asked where were the campaign signs that... I gave a directive to remove the signs from City property and City



right of ways. So, she then emailed me the next day saying that all of her signs had been removed. I contacted Mr. Bailey and asked if the..., all of the signs were removed and, not only those from the right of ways, but from all over the City. So, he said he had directed Staff to remove the signs. Once..., and I asked had they been destroyed, so we can get the candidates to pick up the signs. So, he called me back and said the signs had been destroyed. So, I then heard back from Miller-Anderson to, you know, what am I gonna do, ho'..., you know, as far as holding Staff accountable? She mentioned the Florida state statutes regarding removal of signs, that she had thirty days and that Florida state Statute §106.1435 mentioned, you know, you would be arrested for touching campaign signs. So, I did ask Staff where did they remove the signs from. I got a list of specific areas where they removed the campaign signs from and I then spoke with Legal because, at that point, I was going to do a written warning. After checking with Human Resources, they advised me that Mr. Bailey's jacket was clean so I couldn't suspend him or anything, but I could reprimand him by providing a written warning. I had that letter. However, I spoke with the City Attorney and he recommended that since the Interim, and again, I say Interim Public Works Director did not physical mo'..., remove the signs himself, then he didn't think that the reprimand was warranted. So, I pulled back the reprimand, in between the time talking back and forth with the Mayor and other Council Members regarding the signs.

So, that's it.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Attorney, your comment.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** In my conversations with the City Manager, I advised her that Mr. Bailey was entitled, under due process, to appear and to respond to the charges against him and be entitled to bring an attorney with him. I just found out that the possible reason that he may not be here was related to a traffic accident or something. I didn't..., I assumed that he was not here by choice. I think that there needs to be a termi'..., a determination whether or not his failure to appear was a result of being unable to appear.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** And having said that...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** One moment.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** 'Stated that he declined to come.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** One moment, please, Mr. Mayor.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** That, that was my understanding, 'cause with my conversations with the Manager, I was clear that he was entitled to those rights, but I never heard anything and he's not here tonight. But I just learned from...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** [Inaudible].

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...Councilperson Davis that he was involved in what has been described to be a major traffic accident. I don't know anything about that, but it...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** [Inaudible]...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...does raise the issue in terms of equity and fair play of whether or not his failure to offer a defense or be here, is a result of not being able to do so.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** And so, therefore, your recommendation to us would be what?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** To determine whether or not that.., that non-appearance was voluntary or inability.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** So, we won't be able to do that in the course of tonight.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Of course you couldn't.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** So then we would need...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...to bring...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Karen would have to make that assessment after speaking with Mr. Bailey.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** There's a motion on the floor.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** City Manager Hoskins.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** I did speak with Mr. Bailey and asked him if he, you know, was going to appear. And I did not hear from him this evening. I did hear that he was in a pretty serious accident. And, you know, had to go get medical treatment, immediately after that, that Sunday or whatever day that occurred.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Well, there is a motion on the floor. With that being said, are you interested in withdrawing your motion so that there is an opportunity to ascertain the validity of his failed attendance tonight? The, the suspension has happened, it is a matter now of ratifying or not ratifying. So, there's no continued harm at this point. Is, is there a consideration of you, maker of the motion to withdraw it and we can bring it back?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well, I have a question.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mhmm.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Are we saying that he is seriously injured to a point he could not have communicated that he could not come?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** I, as I stated, I did speak with him and he said he would let me know, but I did not hear back from him. So, I don't know what's going on.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** That was before or after his car accident?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** That was after..., well, I'm assuming the car...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** After.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** I'm not sure when the car accident was.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** According to Mr. Davis he said Friday.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Okay. I...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So, you spoke to him when?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** On Monday.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** You spoke to him on Monday?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Right.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Right.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** No. I'm, I'm not going to pull it back. I would like to say this. With this situation, I know the last conversation that I had with Ms. Hoskins was that she asked him to give her the reasons why those signs were destroyed. And, as far as I knew, they were destroyed, I was never aware that they had been hidden...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Me either.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...either, because I, I did inquire about trying to get 'em back. The thing was, I was never notified whatsoever about these signs being missing. I just happened to be driving around and didn't see my signs anymore, and I asked my husband had he taken them down and he said he had not. And so, I called Ms. Anthony to find out if she knew anything about the signs being removed all over the City, and she said she no clue. I then asked Ms. Hoskins was she aware of anything happening with the signs. And here is the most important part of it, the signs

have been up for over a month without any notices being posted, without anyone saying that it..., there was an issue with the signs being in the spots that they were in. As some of you may recall, back in 2015 when I won my election back then, I did purchase thank you decals and I put them on the signs to thank the residents for electing me that time. From my understanding, there weren't very many people had done anything like that, and so, with me winning my reelection just this past month, I'm certain that some people may have thought that I would do the very same thing. The day I went and picked up my thank you decals, which cost me close to \$300, I didn't have any signs to put 'em on. And, and the thing was, I was not notified, and Ms. Hoskins read off the statute where it explains that we have thirty days to remove the signs. The signs were gone within a day or two. And, no notification was done. I, I personally believe that it was done deliberately and maliciously. It could've been a matter of just notifying me, saying pick up your signs, they're in the right of way. I did ask for..., I gave the specific locations that the sign were in and I asked for an explanation as to how it violated the right of way, and I said that if it did violate the right of way, why did you let them stay there a whole month?

And so, I left off with Ms. Hoskins emailing me saying that she had asked Mr. Bailey to find out why he destroyed the signs. And that's pretty much where it left off for me. I, I just figured I would deal with it on..., in the way in which I could deal with it, which would have been to file a report, because it is a misdemeanor to remove someone's signs without their permission. And so, I just kinda left it alone, but my thing is tonight is that if Mr. Bailey had some sort of medical issue that prevented him from coming or calling, I could certainly understand that and would be very sensitive to that, but I am not hearing that he was in [stammer] in such a bad state that he could not have communicated that he could not come because of a medical issue. So, I am not willing to pull back my motion because I feel that he had an opportunity to share what it was that he wanted to do, or didn't wanna do.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair, one last question.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Actually...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No. It's something...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...it's, it's...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...I saw.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...10:20.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** We have a motion.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It is now ten'...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No. Three's a picture that I wanna bring reference to.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Davis, allow me one moment.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes, ma'am.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It's 10:20.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes, ma'am.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** So, there either needs to be an extension of the meeting, or we will call the vote and adjourn.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Motion to extend for fifteen minutes.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Second.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It's been motioned and properly second.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Botel?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Hubbard?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Davis Johnson?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Unanimous vote.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay. The...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Quickly. Could someone bring the, the, the sign picture up at the, at the barnyard?

**UNK.:** [Sigh].

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Nah. There's something I just wanna show.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I mean, I just wanna..., the evidence was presented to us, [inaudible] bring the picture back up.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** [Inaudible] know how do it.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Debbie's sitting there.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Chief of Staff...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Would you please ask her to do it?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** And while she come, I'm just gonna [stammer] respect the..., Councilperson Miller-Anderson, I got... This is nothing against you. I support if anybody mal'..., like I said, maliciously [stammer] violated your rights. That... Go back. There's another picture.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** That, that was the first one.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** That was the first one.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Move forward.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Go forward, please. Again. Stop. [Pause]. [Inaudible].

**UNK.:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Dr. Botel has a thank you sign on her sign. And out of respect to the process, and I respect you, Councilperson Miller-Anderson, my concern is that someone may or may have not pulled the signs up and stuck them behind the barnyard and we couldn't prove it. But, if you notice in this picture, when Councilperson Miller-Anderson was trying to put her what, thank you signs up, but Botel's signs were there with thank you sign. So...

[Inaudible comment]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...how did her thank you sign get there, if the [inaudible]...

[Inaudible comment]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...this is for, for the Council...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** We just gotta vote.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I can...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I can answer that.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Stammer].

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I can answer that.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No. [Stammer]...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I don't...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And she can probably tell you too.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** So...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No. But my que'.., my question is, I was only referencing what you were saying, Miller-Anderson.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** But, what was your point?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** My point is, you made reference you wanted time to put your thank you signs up, right?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I recall when Botel put her signs up, her thank you signs. They went up a few days later.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Right.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** But my question is, we have no proof that anybody on how those signs got there and who put 'em there. And, if your thank you signs went up later, went up later, and your sign.., how did they get in the same spot?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I don't.., I'm not [inaudible]...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Listen...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay. No. Listen. I, I apologize...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Chuckle].

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I just believe that we need to call the question. I do need to go on record as saying I don't know that the action was malicious. That I cannot support. I will support the fact that Staff removed the signs and the signs were subsequently found. Now, it was a directive that was given to the.., to Mr. Bailey from the City Manager, however, there was Staff involved and I don't know that Mr. Bailey gave direction to Staff to hide them. So, there.., there are issues certainly that surround this.

So, with that being said, I would just like to call the question, please.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Can...

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** ...Botel.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Let me just say this. This is my first time even knowing they still existed, so I had not'.., I had no knowledge they were being hidden.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Right.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I was told they were destroyed, and that came from Ms. Hoskins.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Right. You bo'...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So, that's what I've been...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** You, you bo'...

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...operating on.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** You both said that, yes.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Right.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I... Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...Right.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay.

**UNK.:** It's time for the vote.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** The question is called.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Botel?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?



[Pause]

**MAYOR MASTERS:** What does that mean?

[Inaudible comments]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** If I'm on the prevailing end, can I bring this back the next meeting, if necessary?

**UNK.:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Hubbard?

**UNK:** Do you know what the question was?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** No.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Davis Johnson?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** The question was to ratify the suspension.

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** The question is to ratify the suspension.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes, he knows.

[Inaudible comments]

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** No. No, is my... No.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Davis Johnson?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** That motion is approved with [stammer] Councilperson Hubbard dissenting.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Alright. Thank you.

**28B. CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Item 28B. We need a., we discussed in workshop., we discussed in workshop, the authorization of the City Manager to hire vacant department head positions. Is there any further discussion regarding that direction, or can we move to vote to allow that...

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** So moved.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...authority?

**UNK.:** Madam Chair?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Question.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It's, it's been motioned, is there a second?

[Pause]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** We discussed this, you're, you're not ready to vote on it?

[Pause]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It has failed for lack of a second.

### **BOARD APPOINTMENTS**

#### **29. CITY CLERK ANTHONY: RE-APPOINTMENT OF BETTY KENDRICK TO GENERAL EMPLOYEE PENSION BOARD**

**INTERIM DEPT. DIRECTOR: EUREKA IRVIN (561) 840-4880**

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** So moved.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Second.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** It's been motioned and properly second. Madam Clerk.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Botel?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis? [Pause]. Councilperson Miller-Anderson?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Hubbard?

**CHAIR PRO TEM HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Davis Johnson?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** That motion is approved with Councilperson Davis out.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

## **DISCUSSION BY CITY MANAGER**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Discussion by City Manager.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair, I., earlier, I passed out a handout titled, 'Pending Workshops.' I did speak with our techs, Interim CRA Director Scott Evans, and he stated that his May 9<sup>th</sup> meeting would be a short meeting. So, if you would like to have the parliamentary procedures and rules of decorum on the, on May 9<sup>th</sup>?

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** The 9<sup>th</sup>?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** May 9<sup>th</sup>'s fine with me.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** Yes.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Okay. Also...

[Inaudible comments]

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** We gotta find out if he's available to...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Right.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yeah.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Also, there are several other workshops that you need to have or hold. In particular, the sales surtax projects and committee appointment, Citywide facilities and library construction, Charter Review Committee, if you're going to workshop the training, City Council retreat regarding budget priorities for Fiscal Year '19, Ocean Mall parking. The consultant has said that he's available May 19<sup>th</sup> and/or May 21<sup>st</sup>, a joint meeting with the Port of Palm Beach and a joint meeting with Mangonia Park. And also, workshop on Senate Bill 804, with Senator Bobby Powell and State Representative Al Jacquet.

I added a couple to the list, so.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I would like for you to poll Council on..., we, we need to prioritize, but due to the lateness of the hour, here's what I would like to suggest. For the next Agenda, I would like to place the discussion by City Manager at the beginning of the meeting, as well as the comments by Council at the beginning of the meeting so that we don't run into this based on lengthy discussions and we would be able to get the business of the City out at the onset of the meeting. So, let's..., if, if my colleagues will indulge me, let's reorder the Agenda to reflect that and we can see how that works for us. But, what we find ourselves doing right now is trying to rush because we are now at a time limit, and there is no room for discussion. So, if you will indul'..., indulge me, I will reorder the Agenda to allow the City Manager's comments to come at the very beginning. Is there any opposition to that?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** None.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay. So, we need to give you [chuckle], some direction with regards to retreat date and information. So, if you could prepare a correspondence for us. You've given us this document, but you've added some items, so if you could bring that, we can prioritize the workshops, and the retreats and get that scheduled.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** I have one more announcement also. The Palm Beach County Department of Housing and Economic Sustainability has a mortgage and housing.., mortgage and housing investments, State Housing Initiative Partnership (SHIP). They are, they will open the wait list for Monday, January 8, 2018 through Friday June 8, 2018 to accept names for the following SHIP purchase assistance programs: purchase assistance, funding to assist income eligible, first-time home buyers with the purchase of a new or existing home. Funds are awarded to assist, assist with gap funding, lot acquisition, down payment, rehabilitation of the unit being purchased, and closing costs. Also, Veteran's Home Ownership and Preservation Program, funding will assist income eligible active duty military personnel and veterans. To be placed on the wait list, please call 561-233-3693, or 561-233-3606, Monday through Friday, 8:30 to 4:00 p.m.

Yes, ma'am.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Alright. We have less than five minutes before this meeting will conclude.

#### **DISCUSSION BY CITY ATTORNEY**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Discussion by City Attorney?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** I have nothing [inaudible] consideration.

#### **CITY COUNCIL COMMITTEE REPORTS**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** City Council Committee reports?

**UNK.:** None.

#### **STATEMENTS BY MAYOR AND COUNCIL**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Statements by Mayor and City Council, starting with Mr. Davis.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Real briefly. I will be definitely bringing this Item back at the very next Council meeting, so hopefully Staff is there so I can ask some more diligent questions, so I don't feel like... Tonight, I feel like we were railroaded a lot of things that were missing information. In the next Council meeting, I would like to be prepared to get more information at that time because, as stated in the meeting, the question and concern was when and where those signs were removed and who put them there. No one has yet to, to disclose to the...

[Inaudible comment]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No one has yet disclosed who moved the signs, there's no confirmation that Mr. Bailey stated that and gave an order, there's no confirmation that him or any Staff Member did it. And, my only reference to the thank you sign was when did Dr. Botel purchase her thank you sign, when did they go up and how much time between did someone, if who, remove those signs to put them two signs there? Because that coulda been a plant from somebody, far as we care. I just wanna check the integrity of the decision that this Board made. And if someone did something wrong, I will support what my colleagues wanted in moving forward.

Another thing, one of the initiatives I'm gonna bringing forth is trying to get some input and buy in on some creativity.., on how we can update and improve [pause] the City's image. [Stammer] probably bring it back like an idea of a committee or something that we can discuss as a Board and we can structure some.., do something good on the upgrading of the branding of the City. And have some Board input, I'm gonna put some structure together and see what you all say. I'm gonna put it on the Agenda.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, sir. Commiss'.., Councilperson Botel.

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** I made a statement earlier that I wanna correct, and, and maybe it's an apology as well. I stated earlier that I was not permitted to put Items on the Agenda, and my, my.., I, I wanna correct that. I, I asked to have Items put on the Agenda after the time in which I would've been able to put Items on the Agenda and I know that now. And, I will, in the future, ask that they be put, put on the Agenda in a timely manner. Those Items, I hope, will be on a future workshop or an Agenda, and they are the beach access, the gun control. I do wanna have a conversation about residents having the ability to call in to public meetings and have their comments heard at public session time and I hope we can pursue that, that concept. I know that we're gonna be talking about Citywide facilities and the library construction grant, I hope we can have someone to guide us through this public/private partnership concept at that time. I hope that we have an expert on Board because I don't know enough about that as a, a person who has not been involved in this before.

And I think that it. Oh, one, one other thing. JAY Ministries is having an open house on April 24<sup>th</sup> at 10:30 and I would encourage you to join me there. It's.., I'd like, if you would respond to my office phone at 561-845-3683 or my email

[jbotel@rivierabch.com](mailto:jbotel@rivierabch.com), they do wonderful work over there and they would like to have you come and visit and see what kind of work they're doing.

Thank you.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** What was the date?

**COUNCILPERSON BOTEL:** April 4<sup>th</sup> at 10:30. Excuse me, April 24<sup>th</sup> at 10:30. Thank you.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** That's next...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Miller-Anderson.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Right, right.

**COUNCILPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I don't have any comments.

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** Commissioner., Chair Pro Tem.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** I have two very brief. The town hall meeting for the MLK project is scheduled for April 24<sup>th</sup> from 6:00 p.m. until 7:30 p.m. at the Marina Event Center. This is regarding the stretch of road that is from Avenue J to President Barack Obama Highway. There was a request to have a wall and then the request came not to have the wall, so we., I had conversation with FDOT and they will be on hand to talk about the revisions to the project, and what we can expect. And that is, again, on April 24<sup>th</sup> from 6:00 pm. Until 7:30 p.m. at the Marina Event Center.

And, the small business workshop entitled, 'Are You Back Office Ready,' it will be held on April 26<sup>th</sup> at 5:30 p.m. at the Marina Event Center. Registration will be up on tomorrow. Please register. April 26<sup>th</sup> at 5:30 p.m. at the Marina Event Center.

I do have to take this opportunity, you all had boxes in your chair when you arrived. Those...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yes. [Inaudible]...

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...were the boxes that were distributed. We distributed... Can someone hold their box up, please? We distributed a total of 10,000 over at Barracuda Bay, so please allow me to express my sincere appreciation to the Mayor and City Council for the food distribution on the 13<sup>th</sup>. Heartfelt thanks are extend to Maura Plante, Founder of Living Hungry, Farm Share, the Palm Beach County Office of Community Revitalization, Riviera Beach Public Works and Parks & Recreation employees, and Officer Brown who was on hand to keep the order. Thank you, Interim Chief Madden for making sure that that happened. Special thanks to Mr. Bailey and the

Interim Chief for the design of the distribution. It was seamlessly and it was flawless. And, we will get back with you on the rescheduling of Talk Back Tuesday.

And I believe that the City Manager has one final comment.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** I'm sorry. At the closed executive session, you decided that we would have a workshop on Monday, April 23<sup>rd</sup>, at 6:00 o'clock and we will be discussing the impact of the SEIU contract to brief the City Council and the public. And the SEIU election will take place on April 30<sup>th</sup>. So, being that that's passed the date of the Agenda submittal, it will be presented to you as an add-on Item, since their vote is April 30<sup>th</sup>. So that's Monday, April 23<sup>rd</sup> at 6:00.

### **ADJOURNMENT**

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS JOHNSON:** There being no further business, we stand adjourned.

[End of video]

**City Employees, Public Comment Speakers and Others**

NORMA DUNCOMBE .....MS. N. DUNCOMBE  
CITY ENGINEER RICHARD LABINSKY.....MR. R. LABINSKY  
PARKS & RECREATION DIRECTOR RICHARD BLANKENSHIP  
PARKS & RECREATION DIRECTOR BLANKENSHIP  
SENATOR BOBBY POWELL.....SENATOR B. POWELL  
REPRESENTATIVE AL JACQUET .....REPRESENTATIVE A. JACQUET  
CITY COMMISSIONER CORY NEERING ..... CITY COMMISSIONER C. NEERING  
SEAN WILLIAMS .....MR. S. WILLIAMS  
REECE ADAMS .....MR. R. ADAMS  
CHIEF OF STAFF DEBBIE ISAACS .....CHIEF OF STAFF ISAACS  
REENTRY PROGRAM DIRECTOR ORRIE.....MR. ORRIE  
KIM DENMARK.....MS. K. DENMARK  
DR. PHILLIP DUKES .....DR. P. DUKES  
DAVID BRADY .....MR. D. BRADY  
FANE LOZMAN.....MR. F. LOZMAN  
BILLIE BROOKS SALTER .....MS. B. BROOKS SALTER  
ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT JEFF GAGNON  
ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON  
MARTY MURPHY .....MR. M. MURPHY  
M. XAVIER.....MR. M. XAVIER  
LLOYD BROWN.....MR. L. BROWN  
LARRY SMITH, ESQ.....MR. L. SMITH  
PORT OF PALM BEACH DIRECTOR ALMIRA .....MR. M. ALMIRA



**APPROVED:**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**THOMAS A. MASTERS**  
**MAYOR**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**TONYA DAVIS JOHNSON**  
**CHAIRPERSON**

**ATTEST:**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**CLAUDENE L. ANTHONY**  
**CERTIFIED MUNICIPAL CLERK**  
**CITY CLERK**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**LYNNE L. HUBBARD**  
**CHAIR PRO TEM**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**KASHAMBA MILLER-ANDERSON**  
**COUNCILPERSON**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**JULIA A. BOTEL, Ed.D**  
**COUNCILPERSON**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**TERENCE D. DAVIS**  
**COUNCILPERSON**

**MOTIONED BY:** \_\_\_\_\_

**SECONDED BY:** \_\_\_\_\_

**L. HUBBARD** \_\_\_\_\_

**K. MILLER-ANDERSON** \_\_\_\_\_

**T. DAVIS JOHNSON** \_\_\_\_\_

**J. BOTEL** \_\_\_\_\_

**T. DAVIS** \_\_\_\_\_

**DATE APPROVED:**   MAY 16, 2018