

**CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH  
REGULAR CITY COUNCIL MEETING  
January 3, 2018**

PRESENT AT MEETING<sup>1</sup>:

MAYOR THOMAS MASTERS .....MAYOR MASTERS

CHAIRPERSON KaSHAMBA MILLER-ANDERSON ...CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON

CHAIR PRO TEM TONYA DAVIS JOHNSON ..... CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON

COUNCILPERSON LYNNE L. HUBBARD.....COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD

COUNCILPERSON DAWN PARDO .....COUNCILPERSON PARDO

COUNCILPERSON TERENCE DAVIS .....COUNCILPERSON DAVIS

CITY MANAGER KAREN HOSKINS.....CITY MANAGER HOSKINS

CITY CLERK CLAUDENE ANTHONY .....CITY CLERK ANTHONY

CITY ATTORNEY ANDREW DEGRAFFENREIDT .....CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT

TRANSCRIBED BY:

Legal Transcription, Etc., LLC  
931 Village Boulevard  
#905-148  
West Palm Beach, FL 33409  
(561) 429-3816  
(561) 584-5044 (fax)

jreitano@legaltranscriptionetc.com

---

<sup>1</sup> List of City Employees, Public Speakers and Others on Page 198

**CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH  
PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA  
MINUTES OF THE CITY COUNCIL MEETING HELD  
JANUARY 3, 2018 AT 6:00 P.M.  
RIVIERA BEACH EVENT CENTER  
190 E 13<sup>TH</sup> STREET, RIVIERA BEACH, FL**

[Before meeting chatter]

[Gavel]

**CALL TO ORDER**

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I'd like to call to order the regular City Council meeting for January 3, 2018, 6:00 p.m.

**ROLL CALL**

**INVOCATION**

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam, roll call.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Mayor Thomas Masters? [Pause]. Chairperson KaShamba Miller-Anderson?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Present.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Pro Tem Tonya Davis Johnson?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Here.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Lynne Hubbard?

**UNK.:** Here.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Dawn Pardo?

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Present.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Terence Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Here.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** City Manager Karen Hoskins?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Here.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** City Clerk Claudene Anthony is present. City Attorney Andrew Degraffenreidt?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Here.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** You may proceed.

### **PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** We'll have a moment of silence followed by the Pledge of Allegiance led by Councilwoman Pardo.

[Moment of silence]

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** I pledge allegiance...

**ALL:** ...to the Flag of the United States of America and to the Republic for which it stands, one nation under God, indivisible with liberty and justice for all.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC SHALL BE GIVEN A TOTAL OF THREE MINUTES TO SPEAK ON ALL ITEMS LISTED ON THE CONSENT AGENDA. IN NO EVENT WILL ANYONE BE ALLOWED TO SUBMIT A COMMENT CARD AND SPEAK ON A CONSENT AGENDA ITEM AFTER THE ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA.**

### **ADDITIONS, DELETIONS, SUBSTITUTIONS**

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Do we have any additions, or substitutions?

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Alright. Under Community Benefits, I'd like to add \$250 to the Sickle Cell Foundation of Palm Beach County.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. [Pause]. Ms. Anthony, is that going to be 2A?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So, Ms. Pardo, Sickle Cell, \$250 you said?

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Correct.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Do we have any other additions, deletions and substitutions?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Go ahead.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I have two additions.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** The first one will be CAP Government update.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. Where do you want that to go?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Under discussions and deliberations. And the other one will be discussion of a plan of support on how to get the situation resolved of Ms. Wilder's home, for an effective, cooperative plan.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I didn't hear..., what is it?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Ms. Wilder's home, her displacement and...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...what's going on. But, an effective plan through cooperating between two agencies to make sure that we're all on accord with what's going on.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. So, you want to discuss the update for Felicia Wilder?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes, ma'am.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And then, the 6A you said was for CAP Government?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Absolutely.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Go ahead.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Under Item No. 4...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** The draft for the Maritime Academy. I'd like to pull that Item's..., pull that Item so that we consider if we are able to put that out for an RFP.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Pull your mic down. Okay. You want to pull the Item off the Agenda? You want to table the Item and delete it totally or?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** I want to...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Cause' it's un'...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...table the action on this Item and we can fit it under discussion and deliberation and [inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** It's under discussion and deliberation for the Maritime Academy?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Yes. But it's.., but not without action. I just want.., I don't want a.., to vote on it. Well you can be...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Pull that on this side.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Either way you want to do it, Madam Chair, we can leave it under discussion and, and deliberation and we just take it from there and see if there.., if we have the wherewithal to do a, to do a vote on it. I don't think that we do tonight, to put out an RFP.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. So, we'll just leave it on there and then we'll have a discussion about it and then go from there, right?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** That's fine.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I have one deletion Item.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** As it relates to Item No. 5. This is a matter that was brought before the Council, action was taken on this. Unless someone from the majority side part of the Board brought this back, it'll be improper for this Item to be discussed at this time based upon verification of Robert's Rules and Item 5 shall not be here on the Agenda.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. So, this Item that you're speaking Item is to be pu'.., was put on here because I thought that it.., we all needed to be in the same room to have a conversation with it, about it, because it appears that Mr. Degraffenreidt, you know, he's only able to speak to us individually regarding this and think it.., it doesn't matter what our vote was on it because we all get to decide and give input on this particular Item. So, this Item is on here so that we all are in the Sunshine and able to have a conversation and Mr. Degraffenreidt has clear directions from everyone on moving forward.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Ma'...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Because it, it appears sometimes that it's only one or two or three people that are able to communicate with him and then he goes from there. So this is a matter of being transparent and allowing us to have a conversation, out loud. This is not something we can have in a closed executive session, so this would be the only venue that we could have the conversation.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** With all due respect...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...to the things you just stated, it's very clear in Robert's Rule, once there's action taken on an Item...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...it's only the majority of the.., those of that action, whether it's declined or accepted or supported, those are the ones that can bring that back unless someone on the prevailing side is bringing this back, you or myself cannot discuss this Item until that take' place. Unless, for a legal position, if there's something that came before the Board through a closed executive session, then it would reach that point. It's my understanding, unless someone knows something I don't know, it hasn't gotten to that stage, or even a legal matter at all. So, it's.., unless three folks, the majority of the Board that supported this Item, one way or the other, on the prevailing side has brought this Item to us, this a Item that no one can discuss no matter how we feel about it with our opinion but that's the law, that's the Robert's Rule and we must stick by that.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Mr. Degraff'.., Ms.., is Degraffenreidt there or Ms. Lina...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** I am.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. So, with this particular Item, I don't.., this is not an Item that's coming back. This is, from my understanding, the first time the mutual separation agreement has been put on the Agenda. Am I correct or not? This is not the Resolution where he was terminated with cause, this is not the Item where it was brought back as a Resol'.., Resolution to terminate without cause. This is the mutual separation agreement. Has that been brought before?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** That was a part of [inaudible]...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** No. It...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...has not. But, here's the circumstance...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...that we deal with. By Board action, we uniformly and by majority vote, approved a settlement agre'.., I mean, not a settlement agreement, an employment agreement. That employment...

[Inaudible background comment]

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...agreement controls his employment and his separation. There's no need for that. You approved the specific terms of the relationship. At the risk of being redundant, I've always said to you, this matter, after the action of terminate, is a legal matter controlled by the contract. Now, in deference to the Manager, my lawyers tell me that there has been a request that we go to mediation, with respect that, anything that's reached at mediation has to come back to you for approval, as you well know. If you choose to take that route, and I would recommend that you do, I think that would be the appropriate action to take.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Now, I, I would like to ask though, how much are we having to expend in legal fees with having to now take it through mediation? When were the first proposals.., they were brought before, some months ago, right?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Ma'...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mr. Degraffenreidt?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Ma'...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** They were.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. So, through that, we're, we're constantly having to consult with the Torcivia Law Group...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** That's not accurate.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Are they not...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** They, they un'...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...the ones that's handling it?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...they understand, they understand the limitations of this scenario, as well as I. They're operating under the terms of the agreement you approved.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** They have not moved from that. I have not moved from that.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So, in...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** I cannot move...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...regards to the...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...from that...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...legal fees though...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...until you do something different.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...how much are we having to continuously..., are they doing it for free? I mean...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** They are not doing it for free but there's no...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Billing.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...substantive work...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** There's no voluminous work being done for the simple reason that we're enforcing the contract approved by Council.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So, in essence, you're saying there is no need for a mutual separation agreement? Just..., we just operate from the contract that was signed?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** It is my position that the contract controls 'cause that's what you approved.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** In deference to the Manager and Mr. Lawson, who I have the utmost respect for, I don't have a problem going to mediation. It is plausible that there's something palatable that can be brought back to you.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So, what has kept us from doing that all along? I mean, why are we... It only came back up because I figured we need to go ahead and close this out. So, what has held us up from doing that, thus far? Waiting for the request of mediation...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** I [stammer]...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...or...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** I believe the request was made sometime before Christmas.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Glen informed me that the request was made.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Hold on, I'm still speaking with Mr. Degraffenreidt. And so, with this mutual separation agreement, you're saying that because.., and I'm gonna ask this again, you're saying that we do not need to have this... Now, I know there was a, a general.., some sort of general release that we did provide, right?

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Aren't they supposed to be approved [inaudible].

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** That was a mutual separation agreement that was drafted from the City's perspective, consistent with the employment agreement, yes.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Point of order.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** This is an Item that we're discussing that's already been executed on, voted upon and it's been clear that the separation agreement was connected to the initial contract, that this entire Board supported, one way or the other, the majority Board...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...and that Item.., that issue is done. It's closed. The only people that keep opening it up are those that opened it up with their public opinions. This Board had made a decision, whether we like the way the decision is going one way or the other, it's done. The major'... Now, unless, and I don't want to speak... Unless someone from the prevailing side has chosen to bring this up, we cannot even discuss this, what we're discussing now. There is no legal matter. The contract was, was clear. It was a contract that the individual, who's attorney here, Mr. Attorney Lawson, who I have a great deal of respect for, has.., wrote that contract, agreed to the contract and now you're asking this Board to discuss something that's

been decided upon and to change different from what the contract has asked us to do. That's all I'm saying.

So, the point of order's clear...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** We made a decision, it's done. This agreement was tied to the initial decision. We should no longer be discussing, in this new year, of 2018, a matter that was voted upon back in September of 2017.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** This issue's...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...Mr. Davis...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...dead.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mr. Davis, the contract agreement also indicated that if we were terminating, with cause, we needed to have.., and with misfeasance, we needed to be able to document what that was. And so, I think that had a lot to do with the reasonings for having this mutual...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...separation agreement

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Because, we., i.e., you, did not have the documentation to support the, the part of the contract that stated needed to be terminated...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Stammer]...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...with misfeasance...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Point of order.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...right?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Let's, let's be clear here. I've had the documentation. Nothing has changed on that but it was...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...reported that improperly. So let's be clear on that.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So, two, point of order.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** We're back to the initial conversation that we're here to.., we did.., we did all our additions. The deletion was based upon Robert's Rules. There was a decision that was made back in last year, in September. The decision is done.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mr...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No one...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...Degraffenreidt...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...from the majority chose to bring... We cannot...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I understand.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...discuss the contract, nothing related to the contract.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I understand.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** If there is some issues that...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Here.., [stammer]...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...any one of us want to discuss with the Attorney, we have that right. His attorney has been reaching out and... Mr. Lawson came before the last meeting...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Point of order.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...and during that...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** We're, we're gonna move on. I am going to ask Mr. Degraffenreidt again, with this particular Item, has this particular Item been brought before us before? Am I bringing something back that was already put on the Agenda.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** The only thing that's been brought back that is foreclosed, is the terms of separation based upon the employment agreement. That is, in fact, closed. There is one new issue though that you need to address, and that is Mr. Lawson's request for mediation.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Did you.., is this the first time you're bringing that up to us or? I mean...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** This is the first time it's been discussed here.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. So, that is new information that was not provided before, this was added on, was it?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** He didn't just ask it, he said...

**UNK.:** I wasn't here.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...it was asked before Christmas, right? That's what, that's what he just said, before Christmas.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** I believe it was be'..., before Christmas.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** That's what..., yeah. You just..., that's... Well, that's what you...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** It was...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** He didn't just ask for it...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...on the 28<sup>th</sup> of...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...just now.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...December that's the request was made.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible] last week.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Now, relative...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** But, my point is...

**UNK.:** Today's the 3<sup>rd</sup>.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...today is January 3<sup>rd</sup> and that hasn't been shared so that would've been nice to know...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ... before that was put on. Excuse me, Mr. Davis.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So, again, if you would like to vote this off, that's fine. I am wanting to keep it on. So, if you all want to take a...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...vote and take it off, then, we could do that.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Twenty.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** So, may I a'.., inquire as to the purpose for us discussing this?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** To mo'.., to close it. To.., for us to say what it is that we would like to do. I don't know what direction Mr. Degraffenreidt has been given. I...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** The direction is what's in the contract you approved...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I know that's...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...initially when you...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...what you're saying now.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...Employed the Manager.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well, that's what you're saying now but...

[Inaudible dais comments]

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** I've been saying that all the time.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** When?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** All the time.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Today?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Well, there has...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Every time...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...been no...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Today, right?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...this issue has come up, I said...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Today.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...it was a legal matter controlled by the employment agre'..., agreement between the parties.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. So, again, you, you all are more than happy to go ahead and do what..., if you want to take it off but it's an Item that I put on here. If you would like to vote it off, vote it off...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Stammer]...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...but I don't see where I'm bringing something back that was already closed.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** I...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Ma'... No.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Chair, I'm just [inaudible]...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And we do have a short Agenda so we could...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible]...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yeah. But I'm just...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** [Inaudible]...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...trying to understand your...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** We need the Robert's Rules lesson when this over wit'.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Chair?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** What do you want to [inaudible]?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Hold on, hold on. I would like for us to be able to speak about this, move on.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible]...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** If there is something in there that we don't like or..., give him direction. How are we gonna give Mr. Degraffenreidt direction?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Alright. Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Degraffenreidt, I would li'... [stammer].

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Yes, ma'am.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Well, I would like to make a motion that this Board gives Mr. Degraffenreidt the authority to take this to mediation so that we can close the matter out.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Thank you very much.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Second.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Point of order.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Clerk.

**UNK.:** Point of order...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** What are we point of or'...

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Hubbard?

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Hold on.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Here', here's my concern. We have a contract that was already signed and executed. It speaks for itself. What is he.., so, you're asking him to go back to change the contract?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** That's what mediation would do.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Well...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Stammer]...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...here's the thing. Well, let's just be clear...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I can [inaudible].

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...Florida statutes are clear as it relates to what we have the ability to pay.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Correct.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** So, you deal with that in mediation. You deal with the 20 weeks' severance...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...you deal with the final closeout of the...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...of the, of the process. I don't believe that we're asking them to manipulate the contract in any shape, form...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Okay.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...or fashion.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Okay.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** I think that we need to just go ahead and mediate the matter so that we can resolve it and close it. Is that the intent of what you wanted to do, Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Let's ,let [inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** My, my concern...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Motion stands.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Wait...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** My concern...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. Madam Clerk.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Wait. I'd like to...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** ...hear from Ms. Hubbard.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** I., my concern is this, to go to... What else do you think will take place at a mediation other than the manipulation of the contract that's in place? What else could possibly...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible] take place?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...happen at a mediation other than that?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** I think that Mr. Graffen'.., Mr. Degraffenreidt is clear on the contractual language and what the position of this.., the contract allows him to do. And so, if that, if that will assist in the closing out of this particular issue, then let's move with it but he understands that there is no...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** I know why...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...desire...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...we're... I know why we're going to mediation.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Mm.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** We're going there because we want to move forward and we want to close this out but again, I., but, but again...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...if we're saying that... Okay. Take.., just from...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...your point, Mr. Degraffenreidt is clear on the content of the contract. With that said, there is nothing else that will happen at that mediation...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Mhmm.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...if we are not willing to allow the mediator to manipulate the content of the, of the document. So now, we can go into.., let's go to mediation clear if we're going to mediation.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** To discuss...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** We're saying that we're willing to back up off our position...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...which is the contract and allow an objective person to sit in the middle, hear both sides and come up with some'...We can't go in there...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** That's right.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...with.., and tell this mediator, 'Hey, you cannot venture outside the lines of this contract.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** And why...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** If we do...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...can we not?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...we did not come...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

[Inaudible dais comment]

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...we did not come with an open mind and an open willingness to be.., to, to negotiate.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Well...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** And that's what I'm saying.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay. And you're, you're point is taken, Commissioner, um, Councilwoman Hubbard. Here is where I am with it. We've been dealing with this since September 20<sup>th</sup>. We continue to get the negative press, we are constantly being thrown under the bus for mismanagement, for misfeasance, for not being able to run the City properly. We need closure. I am now in a position.., we are here, in 2018, still dealing with the same issue, going back and forward. It is a negative blemish on us. I think that Mr. Degraffenreidt fully understands the rules of mediation and, as our representative, I'm sure that he will be in that, in that r room in some shape, form or fashion so we need to be able to put this thing to bed because it is stifling us. And, to continually bring it up at each meeting, at each meeting it simply opens the wound and I'm just saying, let's...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** I...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ... move.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** I understand...

[Inaudible dais background discussion]

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...ya and I don't, I understand everything you're under'., that you're saying and why you want to go to...

[Inaudible background discussion]

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...mediation and why we should, why we should move forward but I, I'm just...

[Inaudible background discussion]

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** And I'll go to mediation but I'm saying, I'm saying let's go there with a clear understanding. When you go to mediation, you're saying I'm willing to have this third party look at both sides of, of this., your point of view and his point of view.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** You cannot walk in there and say, 'Mr. Mediator, you cannot go outside the bounds of this contract.' So, I'm saying okay, we're going to mediation, know going in, know going in that's what will happen, the contract...

[Inaudible dais comments]

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...will be massaged. That's his job.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** How...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** It's his...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** That's true.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Right. But we don't have to...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** If I may?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...agree to the... Thank you, Mr. Legal.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** I've served as a certified mediator for the last 20 years. I do understand the process.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** [Inaudible].

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** The first thing we have to tell the parties is I have no way to compel anyone to do anything. The purpose...

**UNK.:** That's right.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...of this is to see if there's something available that both parties can live with to avoid the potential of litigation. This is pre-suit mediation. And whatever happens, whatever happens, comes back to you.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** If nothing happens, it has to come back to you, I gotta tell you what happened.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Did you...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...have something? Go ahead. Go ahead.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Well, I am willing to vote in favor of it going to mediation but, to be clear with everyone, there is no way that I'm willing to approve anything in addition to what he.., to what Mr. Evans and his attorney agreed to in February when they crafted the agreement.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Yes, ma'am. Understood.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** So, you want to go to mediation and I don't know what you're gonna do and why Mr. Evans' attorney wants to go but if you want to go, fine but I'm telling you right now...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Understood.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** ...I am not giving him a nickel more than what he agreed to in February.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Understood.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** My position has not changed. If this is something that's, that comforts support of the majority of the Board, I will support this Board if this is a strategy that may be helpful but this issue was done back in September. We should not waste City Attorney's time, we should not, um, well, Attorney Lawson, you're getting paid so, I think, no problem with that. But, we have numerous issues in this City that are positive. Our staff...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** [Stammer]...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...need to be working on those issues so we can focus on moving forward.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. We're...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** We're not...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...[inaudible]...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Hold, hold. No, no. I., no.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** But let's...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...just keep it...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...to this...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No, no.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...point here.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No one, no one individual on this Board has the authority to tell me how to talk, as long as I stay within the confines of the contract of what we're discussing here.

Now, like we're stating, our Staff, we cannot allow them to sit on one issue for an entire year. This is done. We have other issues that are relevant.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** We're trying to...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Like...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...close it out now, Mr. Davis.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Well, no.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** [Inaudible]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...Hold on, hold on. Let's be clear. When you say close it out to the public...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Let's be clear, to the public... Where's the camera? It is closed, back in September when the Board made a decision. Whether you agree with it or not, we made a decision, everything was cle'... Unfortunately, there are some words that have been used to keep the public confused on what's going on...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Point of order, Mr. Davis.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...in this wonderful City. No, you brought up...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** We have a motion...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...on the floor.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No. You cannot stop me from talking.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** But you're off topic.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No. I'm not...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** You're talking...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...off topic.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...ab out other...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** You brought up...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...things.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** You suggested, the Chair suggested that we need to close this out. I was speaking towards the words that you suggested.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. And your...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So, I will...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...point is?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...stop, I will stop for the...

[Inaudible comment]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...for the sake of the meeting...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...but I just want to be clear that this is closed already but folks want to keep talking about it and having Staff waste time on one Item. We got all these economic development issues, we got City employees. So let's talk about those issues.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So.., but honest. I think it's unfair to everyone in the City that our City Attorney has to go sit down in another meeting when they can be doing other issues, your permitting, the inspections and all the things that we got going on with this CAP Government issue that we're gonna deal with later on in this, in this Agenda.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** We need to stay focused on this entire City and not one individual.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you, Mr. Davis. And I would like to say that the whole point in trying to close this matter out is so that we can move on and so that the former City Manager can move on.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** He can move.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And also, we need to keep in mind as to why we're.., we've had to dedicate so many hours to all of this because of the confusion that was created from the very beginning on September 20<sup>th</sup>. So, this is an idea to try to get this behind us. Madam...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Confu'...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...Clerk.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Hey, um, Madam...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I'm not gonna...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** ...Chair?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...keep doing this.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Okay. So, I don't think that statement is correct.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** That's your opinion.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Only because... Right. It is my opinion...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** ...but I think it's fact.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** You know, if you recall, there were three people on this Board that voted to get rid of the CRA Director, Tony Brown...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** ...and he wasn't constantly coming back, he didn't have the community in an uproar. The man packed his bags and he left.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Was he...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** ...And he...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...fired with cause or...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** ...moved on.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...without cause?

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** He moved on.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Doesn't matter.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Was it with or without cause.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** The same with Ruth Jones.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Who we fighting' for, him or the City?

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** The woman asked for three months...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** ...health insurance.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Who you [inaudible] for...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** The Council...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** It was not...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** ...said no...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...the same.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** ...and she moved on.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Who we fighting for It's the same thing.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** There was cause and there was no reason for us to be in a confused state. That way was totally different.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Let me...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** We're gonna go ahead and close this out.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Yeah. It's divided...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Clerk, go ahead and call it.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** ...and not's confused.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** It's not confused.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Hubbard?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** No.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Pardo?

[Pause]

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** No.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Davis Johnson?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Miller-Anderson?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** That motion is approved with Councilpersons Hubbard, Counc'... The motion failed with Councilpersons Hubbard, Davis and Pardo dissenting.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. So, that's the end of additions, deletions and substitutions unless we have some others?

[Inaudible dais comment]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So, the Item is deleted, correct?

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Yep.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** 'Cause it's Robert's Rules.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** We were voting on my motion to go to mediation.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Right. That's that, yeah.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** So...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** That died.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Well, that's just a deletion of itself. We should not..., even had this on the Agenda but let's focus on what we have in front of us.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. So, how about we just keep it on the Agenda since we're not..., no one wants to vote it off...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Hold, hold...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...when we get there, you all can decide how you want to move from there.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Well, no.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** We just, we just got through...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** We just keep discussing the same thing.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** We, [stammer], nobody..., did you, did you all vote to have it removed? I put it on.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Listen...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** I move that we remove this Item from the Agenda.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Second.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. Madam Clerk.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Pardo?

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Hubbard?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Davis Johnson?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Miller-Anderson?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** No.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** That motion is approved with Councilperson Miller-Anderson dissenting.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. Do we have any other deletions and substitutions? [Pause].

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Addition.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Chair. I would like to add, for discussion and deliberation, the City Manager requirements, experience requirement.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** And, Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Alright. So I had asked for Item 6 to be put on but after all this discussion, I don't want to be here 'til 11:00 o'clock, so I would ask that we delete Item 6 until the next Agenda.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I don't., the Agenda's not that long. I mean., well, they've added the CAP.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Yeah.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I don't know how much they...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** I think CAP is more...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...prepared for it.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** ...important than the discussion on the Board so I'd like to remove that. Item 6.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Madam Chair? The Council'., Councilwoman Pardo?

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Yeah.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** I wanted., in that discussion there was a, an Item, the Charter Committee, the Review Committee that I wanted to discuss. I can add it separately, the., I can add it on separately or we can leave it there to...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Let's leave it then.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible] non-qualifications.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. So, for the additions, Ms. Anthony, would you review what additions and deletions you have over there?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** We have a community benefits add-on by Councilperson Pardo for the Sickie Cell Foundation, Palm Beach County. We have a discussion regarding CAP.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** What number do you have? 6A?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** It can be 6A.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Then we have a discussion regarding the housing for Ms. Felicia Wilder.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** 6B.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** And then we have an add-on for the discussion of the requirements for the City Manager's position.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So, we're gonna make that 6C? [Pause]. Yes or no? Ms. Anthony?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** That, that'll be fine.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. [Pause]. Alright. Are there any others? [Pause].

### **DISCLOSURES BY COUNCIL**

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Do we have any disclosures by Council? [Pause]. Any disclosures?

### **ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA**

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Can we have a motion to adopt the Agenda?

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** So moved.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Second.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Clerk.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Pardo?

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Hubbard?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Davis Johnson?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Miller-Anderson?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Unanimous vote.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: ALL MATTERS LISTED UNDER THIS ITEM ARE CONSIDERED TO BE ROUTINE AND ACTION WILL BE TAKEN BY ONE**

**MOTION. THERE WILL BE NO SEPARATE DISCUSSION OF THESE ITEMS UNLESS A COUNCILPERSON SO REQUESTS, IN WHICH EVENT, THE ITEM WILL BE REMOVED FROM THE GENERAL ORDER OF BUSINESS AND CONSIDERED IN ITS NORMAL SEQUENCE ON THE AGENDA.**

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Do we have any Council people that would like to pull an Item? [Pause]. Can we have a motion to adopt?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Motion to approve.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Second.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Ms. Anthony.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Pardo?

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Hubbard?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Davis Johnson?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Miller-Anderson?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Unanimous vote.

## **MINUTES**

1. MINUTES OF THE REGULAR CITY COUNCIL MEETING HELD DECEMBER 6, 2017.

*DEPARTMENT DIRECTOR: CLAUDENE L. ANTHONY (561) 845-4090*

## **RESOLUTIONS**

2. **RESOLUTION NO. 1-18** A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH, PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA, APPROVING AND

RATIFYING THE COLLECTIVE BARGAINING AGREEMENT COMMENCING UPON RATIFICATION BY BOTH PARTIES AND ENDING ON SEPTEMBER 30, 2020 BETWEEN THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH AND THE PROFESSIONAL FIREFIGHTER/ PARAMEDICS OF PALM BEACH COUNTY, LOCAL 2928, IAFF, INC., AN ORGANIZATION REPRESENTING THE FIREFIGHTER/PARAMEDICS OF THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH TO INCLUDE AN INCREASE IN SALARY FOR THE EMPLOYEES AND AUTHORIZING FUNDING FOR A VOLUNTARY EMPLOYEES BENEFICIARY ASSOCIATION; AUTHORIZING THE CITY MANAGER AND THE CITY CLERK TO EXECUTE THE AGREEMENT; AND PROVIDING AN EFFECTIVE DATE.

*INTERIM DEPARTMENT DIRECTOR: EUREKA IRVIN (561) 840-4880*

### **END OF CONSENT AGENDA**

### **PETITIONS AND COMMUNICATIONS FOR FILING**

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Any petitions and communications for filing?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** None.

### **AWARDS AND PRESENTATIONS**

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Awards and presentations?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** None.

### **PUBLIC HEARINGS**

### **ORDINANCES ON SECOND AND FINAL READING**

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** ORDINANCE NO. 4105. AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY COUNTY OF THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH, PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA EXTENDING THE PREVIOUSLY ENACTED ONE (1) YEAR MORATORIUM FOR UP TO SIX ADDITIONAL MONTHS AS TO THE FILING, RECEIVING AND PROCESSING OF AN APPLICATION OR PERMIT FOR THE ESTABLISHMENT, DEVELOPMENT OR OPERATION OF A MEDICAL MARIJUANA DISPENSARY OR MEDICAL MARIJUANA TREA MAYOR MASTERS:ENT CENTER AS DEFINED HEREIN, PROVIDING FOR THE BOUNDARIES SUBJECT TO THE MORATORIUM, PROVIDING FOR SEVERABILITY AND CONFLICTS AND PROVIDING AN EFFECTIVE DATE.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** So moved.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Second.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. Mr. Gagnon.

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** Good evening, Council and Staff. Thank you, Madam Chair. Jeff Gagnon, Action Director of Community Development.

You have before you the second reading of this Ordinance as stated by the City Clerk. It was approved unanimously on December 20<sup>th</sup> of last year, 2017. [Pause]. This is the same slide as presented December 20<sup>th</sup>, however, back in 2016, on December 21<sup>st</sup>, Ordinance 4090 was approved by City Council. Since that time, Staff is actively researching this Item and there's been various laws that have changed over that time as well. So, we're requesting that the City Council extend the existing moratorium for an additional six months. This Item was presented to the Planning & Zoning Board on December 14<sup>th</sup> of 2017, they unanimously recommended approval to the City Council. And again, this is the second reading of this Item. Staff is requesting that you approve this Ordinance on second reading tonight. And I'm here to answer any questions you may have.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. Do we have any public comment cards for this Item?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** There is one public comment card.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. We'll go ahead and go to public comment card.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Lloyd Brown. [Pause]. Madam Chair, we're no longer accepting any public cards on this Item.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Thanks.

**MR. L. BROWN:** Hello. My name's..

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Good evening.

**MR. L. BROWN:** ...Lloyd Brown and, uh, I'm not somebody, you know, for big words or whatever but I was looking at this and I want to ask Ms. Pardo a question. I mean, it's not about anything but do you have any machines over there in those stores, across Singer Island, where you come in and gamble? You know, like, slot machines and... Do you have any of those over there? How about convenient stores that have turned to restaurants? You don't have any of that over there either. I mean, they cook food. You know, I., 'cause I know a convenient store, when I was coming up, you take your sandwich, you put it in the microwave...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Wait. Excuse me. Cook what? Marijuana?

**MR. L. BROWN:** No, no. I, I'm talking about.., I'm getting' to the marijuana but what...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** That's what...

**MR. L. BROWN:** ...I'm saying is...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...we gotta stick to that one...

**MR. L. BROWN:** I'm going to it.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...Mr. Brown.

**MR. L. BROWN:** Okay?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**MR. L. BROWN:** It's 'cause you got permits. You gotta let me go.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Go ahead.

**MR. L. BROWN:** Okay. So what I'm saying', who gave these people in these stores over here, the permits to do what they're gonna do but you're gonna go about a moratorium about marijuana. Mainly, where it's gonna be probably, it's gonna be over somewhere on the Island, it's not go be over there in the neighborhood. But I'm saying, permits. That's what I'm looking at, the moratorium. Who, who thought about when these stores came in with all this hair they selling in our neighborhoods and all these restaurants, who gave them permits? The same guy, Gagnon? I bet he don't live over there. See, these are the things that start crimes. And see, nobody want to investigate, nobody don't want to bring it up in the Council or nothing. The Mayor Masters was the only one that said something about it because most of these places don't have bathrooms. I mean, honestly, to me, it may sound stupid what I'm saying but I don't think ya'll black enough for the black neighborhood, honestly. I'm gonna be straight out with you 'cause what you're doing' over here, it's not effecting the blacks over there. It's, like, you're doing things that's gonna improve... How much improvement this done over here, since you got all this going' on over here, the mall, the beach and all this. How much improvement you done on our side? I mean, we're not mad over there because of what you're doing over here, we're just mad because you're not doing' nothing over there. That's what we're mad about. And then you get over here and you want to argue all day long. I'm not a brain and I'm not smart but, like, I done' seen them guys on the corner shooting craps, they didn't argue as much as you argue over here.

And one thing about it, this is not bring it back to permits or whatever but, you know, when.., you could get in a group and you could separate them and get 'em arguing' toward each other, nothing can be accomplished, 'cause you can see that in any game, basketball, football, whatever. And what I'm saying back to the permits, this Gagnon dude, he don't need to be in there. I just seen the guy. He don't need to be doing anything about.., 'cause over there in our neighborhood, who gave these people permits? I mean, what is the thing? So, I want to open up my own little marijuana place, right in my backyard.

[Chuckle]

**MR. L. BROWN:** Could I get a permit? I mean, and then I want to open up a strip joint. We got more corner stores than we got anything. And, I mean, where do they get these permits from? Ya'll don't even look at that. Where do you think the crime at?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you, Mr. Brown. Alright.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Do we ha'... Go ahead.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I'd like to know., Mr. Gagnon...

[Inaudible audience comment]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Did he go away?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I'm sorry?

[Inaudible audience comment]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I'd like to know, what is the penalty if someone was try to, [pause], like, for instance, I saw a store somewhere in the City that had Gummi Bears for \$20 and I was wondering why were the Gummi Bears so expensive.

[Inaudible audience comment]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yeah. The Gummi Bears were \$20 bucks and what kind of fines would be associated with those special Gummi Bears?

[Pause]

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** First of all...

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** Well, it...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** ...it's illegal.

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** If you're inferring that the special...

[Audience chuckles]

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** ...Gummi Bears have some...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Stammer].

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** ...component of marijuana in it, there's probably some severe...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** ...legal ramifications for...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** It's off, off Military Trail and Blue Heron

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** ...anyone selling special Gummi Bears.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Right.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I'll give ya' the information. But I saw it... I.., it just.., it was \$20 bucks.

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** Right. And, I, I guess, just for the record, I wanted to state that this moratorium has a global...

[Inaudible background discussion]

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** ...impact, so it's for the entire jurisdictional boundary of the City and if there are specific instances of unlicensed operations throughout the City, please let me know...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Okay.

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** ...and then we can look into them.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I'll give it to you.

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:**  
Unfortunately, you know, Staff members aren't overabundant so the more eyes we have reporting information, the more, you know, the more productive and productivity we can demonstrate as Staff.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Thank you, sir.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Mr. Gagnon, the.., unbeknownst to Mr. Lloyd Brown, I had spoken with some of your Staff to find out, while you, while you were on vacation,

about what can we do that would not make us look like we're singling out the corner stores. We have so many of them in, in, in my District. What I want us to put in certain standards and qualifications. For example, one I know is that 25% of the window can't be covered. So, I think...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible]. That makes sense.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...they need to, one, be look., to look more aesthetically pleasing and when your Staff comes up to par, I'm sure they'll have more time... And when I say come up to par, I mean, when you get your other bodies in place through Building and Code Enforcement, with inspections, they will see things that are going on and then we will be able to rectify them. One, one is the bathrooms. Two, that they, they need to look more aesthetically pleasing. I want to see how can we put together a set of standards that we can apply across the board that doesn't make us look like we're singling out one retail body. And my understanding is, that is the problem, singling out, singling out a retail entity.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Let the record reflect Mayor Masters is on the Board.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you.

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** One, one of the concepts that Staff is currently looking at is coming up with specific overlay districts and providing additional architectural standards to ensure that certain things, for example, amount of signage on windows or just general appearance of buildings. It could be building colors, certain upkeep standards that they're at a higher level for certain roadways within the overlay. So, it's definitely something we've been looking at. Not to go down a different pathway but, specifically, in accordance with the existing moratorium that we have in place. So, it's definitely something we're looking at and I think there are some really good ideas and methods to help really ensure that redevelopment in the City is, is done in a manner that the community is looking for.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Okay. Thank you. So, I'd like to get with you later on the week so that we could...

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** Sure.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** You know where to find me.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Delve into further.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Chuckle].

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. Ms. Davis'... Go ahead.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** So, I too would [video skips] permanent zoning, et. cetera and we have a code in place that says it shall be unlawful for any place..., person to play or engage in any games or cards, et. cetera, et. cetera and then it references the Florida Department of Business and Professional Regulations so I think that having that language, we should be able to go in [pause] now to review those kinds of things, those kinds of stores. I mean, I understand that stores are cooking because we are a food desert. That's the main issue that we need...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...to deal with, we don't have..., other than the Publix, we don't have a grocery store in the City, we have to go outside of the City. So, that is driving a lot of these stores to cook food for the communities that don't have access to a grocery store. So, that's the first thing that we need to deal with.

And then secondly, we need to go ahead and start looking at the stores that are operating outside of our code and outside of our rules and regulations and bring them into compliance. And then I think thirdly, you all were talking about reviewing the code and reviewing language to be able to present it to Council so that we can shore up what Staff sees, what the law says and what the rules of our code say.

So, that's..., those are the three actions that I believe that we need to take. You know, as a body, we need to start looking at other companies that can come in and talk to us about utilizing that old Winn Dixie space to put in a grocery store so that our residents can access fresh fruits, vegetables, you know, and meat. So, you know, I, I understand the need but I understand that we have a greater need. We have to focus..., as a Board, we have to focus on the greater need which is the food desert here in Riviera Beach. So again, I would say Staff needs to attack what we can attack by way of codes and get some of those things under compliance, as we move to address other issues. That would be my suggestion for us to handle as a, as a Board and to direct Staff.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. So, are..., do we have anything else for the medical marijuana though?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yes, Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Mr. Gagnon, can you answer, are there any other cities, in Palm Beach County, that have granted the medical marijuana license to proceed?

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Lake Worth.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** There, there have been...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Other than... I know..., I've heard about Lake Worth but...

**UNK.:** Boynton.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...are you... Mr. Gagnon?

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** So, Mr. Mayor, the City of Lake Worth originally did not create new regulations. They had, I believe, two companies come in within that field of business selling medical marijuana. Since that time, Lake Worth has decided to create a moratorium and look at regulations. I believe that...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay.

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** ...was specifically for separation requirements, distance from other facilities, things of that nature. I believe Boynton Beach is also the other municipality in Palm Beach County that is allowing medical marijuana dispensaries, with certain regulations. But other than those two, I don't believe there are any others currently.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay. I want to digress for a minute and go back to what Council'.., Councilwoman Lynne Hubbard mentioned. It is.., and also, Mr. Brown, it is very shameful that we have public facilities, such as a gas station, that are denying residents the right to use the restroom. I don't use.., I don't spend my money anywhere that I can't use the restroom and more residents, I would encourage to do the same. However, that's not the point. The point is, and I hope that you and the Police Department will look at this together in some kind of way, it's sh'.., it's against the law to deny access to a public restroom. They have to have public restroom so that is something that, as he said, I am very concerned about and those businesses who continue to lie and deny, I'm gonna personally start some demonstrations, the NAACP because it's wrong and we need to look at it, if they don't want protesting to start. I will definitely do it because I'm really sick and tired of them out'.., outright lying. The pa'.., the restroom is not broken, it's not, you know, it's working but they tell you, 'Oh, it's broken.' Or they just say it's only for customers. It's a public restroom. And so, as we do this, I would hope you look at that too.

Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Do we have any other comments regarding the medical marijuana?

[Chuckles]

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Madam Chair...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I, I, I am... [Chuckle]. I appreciate [chuckle] the conversation but let's keep this to medical marijuana and then we can do this in our public comments, probably, all the other stuff. Okay?

Yes. Medical marijuana?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** [Chuckle].

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** I cannot tell a lie, not medical marijuana.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. Can we...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Go ahead.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Thank you.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** [Chuckle]. Everybody else talked about it.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. Alright. Madam Clerk.

[Chuckles]

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Chuckle]. Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Hubbard?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Pardo?

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Davis Johnson?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Miller-Anderson?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Unanimous vote.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright.

**COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC - 7:30 PM Non-Agenda Item Speakers (Three Minute Limitation)** Public Comments shall begin at 7:30 PM unless there is no further business of the City Council, which in that event, it shall begin sooner. In addition; if an

item is being considered at 7:30 PM, then comments from the public shall begin immediately after the item has been concluded.

Public Comment should be restricted to issues, matters, or topics pertinent to the City of Riviera Beach. Please be reminded that the City Council has adopted "Rules of Decorum Governing Public Conduct during Official Meetings", which has been posted at the entrance of the Council Chambers. In an effort to preserve order, if any of the rules are not adhered to, the Council Chair may have any disruptive speaker or attendee removed from the podium, from the meeting and/or the building, if necessary. Please govern yourselves accordingly.

ANY PERSON WHO WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON AN AGENDA ITEM; PLEASE FILL OUT A PINK PUBLIC COMMENT CARD LOCATED IN THE BACK OF THE COUNCIL CHAMBERS AND GIVE IT TO THE STAFF PRIOR TO THE ITEM BEING PRESENTED TO CITY COUNCIL FOR DISCUSSION. MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WILL BE GIVEN THREE (3) MINUTES TO SPEAK ON EACH REGULAR AGENDA ITEM. IN NO EVENT WILL ANYONE BE ALLOWED TO SUBMIT A COMMENT CARD AND SPEAK ON AN AGENDA ITEM AFTER THE RESOLUTION IS READ OR ITEM CONSIDERED.

#### ITEMS TABLED

CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Do we have any Items tabled?

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: None.

CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Alright.

#### REGULAR - OLD BUSINESS

CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Regular- old business.

#### REGULAR

#### DISCUSSION AND DELIBERATION

CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Regular – discussion and deliberation.

4.

CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: Item No. 4.

CITY CLERK ANTHONY: DISCUSSION AND DELIBERATION ON THE DRAFT REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS FOR USE OF THE FORMER MARITIME ACADEMY SITE LOCATED AT 251 WEST 11TH STREET.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, we have one public comment card.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** The acceptance of public comment cards regarding this Item is now closed.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. Mr. Bailey.

**PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** Terrence Bailey, Director of Public Works.

At the previous meeting, Staff was directed to put out an RFP for the use of the site at 251 West 11<sup>th</sup> Street. There was a healthy discussion and Staff felt it in the best interest, moving forward, to bring back the draft RFP so that the Council could see the trajectory of this project and provide any input. In addition, the.., there are some critical dates to bring to your attention. As you'll see, on Page 1, this is intended to be advertised this weekend and next in the Palm Beach Post, as is standard and it is Staff's intention to bring it back to Council, preferably at the March 7<sup>th</sup> City Council meeting, as it runs through the normal course of the procurement process.

Other than that, if there were any questions, comments...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Madam Chair?

**PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** ...additional input on the process, any thoughts that we may have overlooked in putting this solicitation on the street and how we will bring you back the request for a vendor, we will take that commentary now.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Okay. Mr. Bailey, on, on la'.., on last.., at the last meeting it was placed, I guess, if you will, at my feet that it might be that it was my responsibility to let the Council know that Mr. Easley was interested in it. What we did not get to say was how we arrived at that.., where we were. My point.., the point that I'm making to you here is that I don't know if we should be putting out an RFP period and this is based on the information that, that I, that I have, how we got here.

The, the property, the tr'.., the buildings that are on the property over at the old Maritime Academy site, Mr. Carter was the overseer of those and was charged with removing those items from that property. However, he thought that something else could be done with those buildings as opposed to him salvaging them [video silent for 2 seconds] and in talking.., he, he shared that with Judge Rogers. Judge Rogers then, in return, said he would talk to the Alpha's and I just want this to be on record that he would talk with the Alpha's about providing a civic service. Having done that, they went

to the school district to find out if that was an acceptable usage because we had restricted types of use that.., when they gave it to us as a trustee, if you will, to use it. So now, after they find out that this was a service.., that this was a, a prohib'.., this, this service was not a prohibited usage of the land. Mr. Carter says, 'Okay. I won't remove those buildings. You.., and if the, if the.., if you get the City to agree, then I'll leave them there. I don't have to destroy 'em, I don't have to move them.'

So, my concern is with this, the property... If.., the property, we have control over the ground itself and the only reason that they needed us was because where would they put the trailers and that's why Mr. Carter was telling them to come and make a presentation to us. So, I don't know if we have carte blanche to put out an RFP. What are we gonna put out an RFP for? On the dirt itself? Because we don't have the right to put the buildings out within the RFP.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** Your question appears to be much more legal in nature, as to what our rights are with the land that we own, as opposed to the contents of this RFP. The way the RFP is structured currently, it simply says use of the property at 251 West 11<sup>th</sup> Street. It is not defined as to whether there will be buildings on it or whether there will be a blank piece of dirt for the very reason of what you discussed as to the potential residual rights of the previous owner to still remove their structures from that site.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** This is, this is what.., and, and this is my point, no one sought out Viking or George Carter to say, 'Hey, I want to do this.' He just thought it was a shame that we would demolish or tear up or move the buildings and say somebody should come here and do something with it. And told that to Judge Rogers, who then went and said, 'Hey, what do ya'll think about this? Let's go over there and let's do something.' It wasn't, 'Hey, we're dying to do something, we want to do something,' and... It didn't, it didn't happen like that.

So, my thing is, now that they have.., Judge.., you know, George Carter and the Judge have come to some kind of agreement, I'll leave this here, if you get the City to go along with yall stand. And we've done, we done that, just that. So I'm, I'm concerned about us putting.., how do we go, how do we move forward with putting out the RFP?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Go ahead.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Like it was stated before, I do recall Mr. Carter coming to the meetings, stating that he has given all the equipment over to Judge Rogers and his organization. That's his equipment. Now, as far as the City owned land, the state requires us to put it out. We must do that, we have to do that now. When you talk about just put out your, your uses, structured based upon nonprofits, you can do it that way for, for nex'. We talked about last week about, you know, what the use was gonna

be. Anyone can respond but [stammer] at this point, it's my understanding that Alpha Phi Alpha is control of the trailers now. So, whoever will be responding, they need to.., I hope the understand that those trailers are no longer owned by the City, they have turned everything over to Alpha Phi Alpha. So, that, you know, I mean, we don't need to necessarily put then in the RFP because we just need to put the land and the use, the nonprofit use as community services because the, the school district had said public use. They didn't define it and specify, they didn't restrict. They said public use. So, we have to put it out. You know, and, and see...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** I mean, we can, we can put it, we can put it out but I guess we need to find out the interest and the intent of the, of the other interested, the other interested party and I think he's here, here to speak to that. My only concern is, we kind of.., it puts us back at wh'.., back at the very beginning. Like Mr. Bailey pointed out, the, the RFP will go out but it'll, it'll go out just about the land itself. [Stammer].., the City was never in a position or looking for someone to just use the land. We're getting ready for this piece of dirt, we're getting ready to do something and we're looking for someone to come in. You understand what I'm trying to say?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yeah. I, I was under the understanding in 2015 the law had changed. Years ago, they used to allow cities to do that but now, no matter what...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** To do...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...you're looking for...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...now, we're required, Madam Chair.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** When you said that, what do you mean? To do what?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Anytime you.., the City, the public land, which is owned by any municipality is there, no matter what the services is, no matter if we sought somebody or.., like, they gave us an unsolicited.., like, the gentleman in the back, Mr. Easley, gave us an unsolicit'.., gave the previous City Manager an unsolicited proposal. It never made it here. Judge Rogers [inaudible] and gave this Counc'.., the new City Manager a proposal that did make it to this Board. Now, no matter.., it was all unsolicited. We still have to put it out, for tho'.., for those specific nonprofit services, let everybody respond and then we have to, we are mandated by the State of Florida to do that now. Years ago, you didn't necessarily have to do that but now you have...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** I under'...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...to do that now.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** I, I understand what you're saying and in, in my, in my opinion, what I was saying about the property itself was the concern for the property and

the interest in the property was because of the structure and the building. That's what spark'..., that's what sparking the interest of the building itself.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Correct.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** We need to find if we wish to do something with it. Of course, we have to put it out for open bid. It is outs, basically, in trust, only because of the fact that there was an educational facility there and that's what the school district was allowing us to do. So, we were more a, a trustee of the land. Anything we have, if we decide to build houses on that property, we would have to go back to the school district and get their blessing to do it.

So, I'm just saying to you that the organization went to fi'..., to the school district to find is this a...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Public use.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Is this a public use? One that you can get behind. They got that blessing and then came to us. So, since we're talking and we're clear that we're talking about the dirt itself, let's go ahead and hear all of our other comments.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. So, we have a public comment card.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Yes, ma'am.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. For three minutes and then we'll come back to the Board.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** James Easley.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Good evening.

**MR. J. EASLEY:** Good evening and Happy New Year.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you.

**MR. J. EASLEY:** Chair, Vice Chair, Council, Mayor.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**MR. J. EASLEY:** My name is James Easley. I represent the Life Center of Palm Beach County. I stand to thank you for your leadership and direction that you provided during your last meeting regarding this matter. Every comment, suggestion, was taken wholeheartedly.

As an update, we look forward to finalizing the parameters of a partnership. We've had ongoing, constant, open discussion and dialogue with the brothers from the Alpha's. That's one of things that we stood up and asked for last time, an opportunity to work with the brothers from the Alpha's, to work out the parameters of a partnership that we

all can bring something back, that can be impactful to the residents, the business partners and the community at large. And thanks to you, we've been afforded that opportunity. And again, discussions have been open, they have been constructive, they have been ongoing. We look forward to bringing something that's able to garner your support and, ultimately, your approval.

Thank you and God bless you.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. Go ahead.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Well, that's great news to hear.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, Mr. Easley.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** That's great news to hear, however, I think that we still need to move forward with putting an RFP out because that is the proper thing to do. It does not set a precedent, it does not allow for any additional unsolicited proposals to come through, it would have to go through a standard process and I believe that that will keep us legal, that will keep us operating in a position where we will not be considered as giving one organization any undue advantage over another.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Anyone else?

**MAYOR MASTERS::** Yes, Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Go ahead.

**MAYOR MASTERS::** Madam Attorney? Hi. Happy New Year. Are we legally bound...

**UNK.:** Can't see.

**MAYOR MASTERS::** Is the Attorney here?

[Inaudible dais comment]

**MAYOR MASTERS::** I couldn't see.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I know. Yeah.

**MAYOR MASTERS::** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** It's hard to see everybody down there on the end.

**MAYOR MASTERS::** Either one. Are we legally bound to...

[Inaudible dais comments]

**MAYOR MASTERS::** ...put this out in an RFP?

**ASSISTANT CITY ATTORNEY BUSBY:** Happy New Year, Mayor. Yes, you're legally bound to do that.

**MAYOR MASTERS::** Thank you.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Robert Rules.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** That's it, Mayor?

**MAYOR MASTERS::** That's it.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. Anyone else have any questions, comments? [Pause]. Alright. So, Ms. Hoskins, Mr. Bailey, we'll just move forward with what we have here?

**PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** We'll, we'll clean it up and move forward, put it out and you'll see something preferably the first of March, once the process has run its course.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Thank you. Alright.

**6. ITEM NO. 6**

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Item No. 6.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY: DISCUSSION OF CITY COUNCIL APPOINTED BOARDS**

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Go ahead.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Okay. So I asked this Item.., I asked for this Item to be put on.

I think we need to do a better job training the people that we appoint to the boards and I think it is imperative that the appointees know exactly what they're supposed to be doing. I've attended, probably too many, of Planning & Zoning meetings and other meetings throughout the City, where the Council appoints people and some people have a tendency to, um, they think they're policymakers...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Mhmm.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** ...instead of just doing what they're supposed to be doing.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Right. They're advisory members. If you look at Planning & Zoning, go through the Charter and the Charter clearly states what people are supposed to be doing, what the appointees are supposed to be doing. So, um, and no, I'm not just picking on Planning & Zoning, it's all of the boards. So, I think it's imperative that the City Manager try to come up with some kind of plan to educate the..., all of the appointees that we have on all of the boards. And go through and just let them know what their duties are and what the Charter lays out for them to do. Now, there's a school down in Fort Lauderdale. I remember years ago, I was on the Zoning Board of Adjustments and they sent us all to a class down in Broward County and I, I think it's the John Daly Government.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Right, right. That was...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Mhmm.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** ...a couple...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Yes. I was on...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** ...decades ago.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...Zoning Board of Adjustments also.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Right.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Chuckle].

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Right. We were on it together.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Mhmm.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** [Chuckle]. Twenty years ago. But..., and, that's what they used to do, the City used to send the, the appointed members down to Fort Lauderdale to that school and I really think that we need to start that again.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** And I think maybe we could have them come up or one of their...

[Inaudible dais background discussion]

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...persons come up to meet with our board members.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** All the boards.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** It could be, you know, a mandatory requirement that once it's put in, when we get that person up here, that you come and that you attend.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Absolutely.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Yeah.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** I think it's very important that we do that.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** So, that's my suggestion.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Ms. Hoskins.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I will get with the City Clerk and we'll bring you back a plan for training, dates and the number of people that we'll have to train, next Council meeting. Will that be fine? Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. Ms. Hubbard.

**UNK.:** [Inaudible] do it by Ordinance.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** The Item that I wanted to have us discuss is the Charter Review Committee. I think that, in light of us moving to separate with the current City Manager that we had, I think thi'.., this Charter Review is tied directly to the five things that he wanted to see changed in the City of Rivera Beach Charter. It's also tied heavily to the persons that he wanted to sit on the Review Charter. So, his agenda, his politics, his.., what he wanted to see for Riviera Beach is clearly tied to this Charter Review that we are having right now. I would like for this Board to vote to disband the Charter Review Committee and, at some point, when we are.., at some point, when we leveled out, then we can put together and start looking at our Charter Review at another time because I don't think that this something that we want to stick with. The Charter Review is fueling the same stuff and the same things that we didn't want to see happen on the front end so we're getting it on the back end, in the body of what he put together to get.., to have this Charter Review Committee actually look at.

So, Madam Chair, with that said, and there may be some comments to, to this end and I'll yield to.., before making a motion, I think we have some comments.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Did [stammer], did you want, you...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes [inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...want to go? Go ahead.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** What, what I would suggest, maybe it's a small suggestion just piggybacking off what Councilperson Pardo just suggested, making sure that each board member understand their actual legal responsibility and why they're here.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Making sure that all those that were appointed go through the training...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** That's okay.

[Chuckles]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** All those appointed go through the training that's being suggested so they can really understand, from a neutral party, that.., what their responsibilities are. I think that should be the first step before.., definitely.., 'cause we gotta look at, first of all, who all has an appointment. I don't have an appointment. I would like to make sure I have an appointment on the board...

**MAYOR MASTERS::** Yeah. I don't either.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...as well. So, maybe we need to look at the ordering of the board appointments and make sure that each person have someone that represents their district and I think that will take care of itself.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Ma'...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Because.., I know I don't have an appointment at this time. So.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Yeah. And Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** And also, the people need to be impartial. And we found, with Charter Review, they're not impartial because [chuckle] several of them came up here and scolded three of us for terminating the former City Manager and, you know, there's been Sunshine issues...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Hmm.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** ...that I heard about. You know, all kinds of stuff going on with the Committee. So, you know, all of that needs to be on the record.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Go ahead.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** So, the concern that I have is the time and effort that has been put in by the residents who we appointed. We need to give some thought to this because we are, you know, asking to disband an entire committee. And I understand the rationale and the points that have been brought up but what we also have to understand is the Charter Review makes the recommendation and the Board ultimately decides what goes before the voters. So, we need to give some thought to this. Maybe we, you know, if you want to suspend it and, and maybe take a look at who's on there and maybe do some reconsideration but to just scrap all of the work and the time and effort that the residents have volunteered their time to do, I think is improper and I.., that's the concern that I would have.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I want.., would like to say something and then I'll come back to you, Mr. Davis.

When we selected the.., when we appoint the people on the board, did we not all have an opportunity.., we didn't all have an opportunity to put people on there or were they already on there before everybody got there or? What, what happened with that?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Well, it's...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Did you have an appoint'...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...it's my understanding there was a slate, pretty much, brought before the Board.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** And folks wanted to enc'.., not, not encourage folks that want to participate and did not want to discourage.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** And I thought it was only fair that we support the entire slate that was suggested.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** You know? And that was, that was only fair. I mean, you give everybody a fair shot and, and you know, and see what they're willing to do. There has been some time put in place, like Vice Chair stated and I think what she's suggesting, with the postponement, is very fair.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Yeah.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I definitely support what the Vice Chair is, is stating before this Board today. At some point, if that, if that hits the floor as a motion, she definitely has my support.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Hold...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** One.., okay. Ms. Anthony, how many people did we have that applied for the, the appointed positions?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** If the Board remembers, when the...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I don't. [Inaudible].

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** ...advertisement first went out...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** [Inaudible].

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** ...applications for the Charter Review Committee, and I may get some stuff mixed up because I didn't bring every'.., anything regarding this Board with me, we only received on application by the deadline that was set forth by the Board. A recommendation was sent to the former City Manager stating that the City Council could s'.., could do this themselves as outlined in, I believe, Section 5-5 of our Code of Ordinances. The decision was made that that would not take place, that we would need to push forward for.., to encourage additional applicants. As a result, we continued with advertisement on the water bills, TV18, the web, you know, where'.., in the newspaper and everything and, as a result, we got six additional applications in which brought up to seven. The Board consists of seven members and then it consists of two alternate members. We did not have applications at first for two [stammer], alternate members but then the Board encouraged individuals to apply for the alternate positions. You only had two people that applied for the alternate positions. So, those two were appointed. So, that's how your Board pretty much got set up.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So, the Board had some input with adding on to those two that applied?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** No. According to the Resolution which we were going by, which is Resolution No. 115-07, I believe.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** When the Charter Review Board was set up at that time, it was set up with seven regular members and two alternate members. This Board did not deviate from that Resolution. You stayed with that setup. So, it's...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** But, what I'm saying is...

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** ...seven board...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** You said two applied, correct?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Two applied for the alternate because we only had two alternate...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** How did we come up with the people who are currently participating on the Board now?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Okay. As I previously stated, we only received one at first.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible background comment].

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So, we...

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** And then...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...did that?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** We only received one at first.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** I had advised our former City Manager that the City Council can make the decisions as.., can sit as the Board in accordance with, I believe, it's Section 5-5 of our Code of Ordinances.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** He stated, 'No, we want to move forward with a board.' I said, 'Okay.' We advertised again and the Board, during your meetings, you encouraged the residents to apply.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Right.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** We only got six additional applications.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** So, that was your seven. So, we just went with those seven that was presented...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** But we voted on...

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** ...to you all.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...those that did apply.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** That the seven that...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** ...that we had the applications for, were presented and the City Council appointed them.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Right. Okay. So, we did have some input as to whether or not we wanted those particular people to be on the Board, correct?

**UNK.:** Yea.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. So, Ms. Davis Johnson, did you want to add something to that or?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** No. She...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Question.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Wait...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Here's the thing...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...hold on one minute. Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** After all the controversy.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** After all of the discussion, there was not a number, as the Clerk has indicated, there was not a sufficient number...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Right.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...of individuals. So, what, what we did, and there's an email from me to the City Manager, recommending individuals who I reached

out to and asked if they were interested. So, we ended up getting some additional names and it did come back before us and we discussed it.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** All of the people that were to come forward.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** They did.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Right.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** So, everybody was aware...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Right.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...of those individuals that were to be appointed to the, to the Charter Review Board.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Right. Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Ms. Hubbard and then Mr. Davis.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** With that said, even with that said, [stammer], where your..., where my concern lies are in the items. The items are what will mold the future of the City. The items is what will mold the direction of the City. The..., those are the things, those are things that we have to be concerned about, the fi'..., the, the five key things and, and I, you know, and just one thing for example, just for affect, and just for example, to move that the City doesn't have a Civil Service Board, so that the di'..., that the City Manager would have total control over the employees and if the employees had a grievance, they had nowhere to go that..., the buck would stop right with the City Manager. And I said that's for affect and that's an example. And the reason that I pull that out to you is, that's not the people that we are here, that's not how we operate, that's not how we have been doing things in the City of Riviera Beach. Whether you were union, whether you were civil service, you had an opportunity to go somewhere and grieve the process. And for me, that's what a democratic process is all about. So, if that's just one of the things that we're trying..., are going to be burdened with, as individuals, as a community...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yeah.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...then we, we have to stop and think, 'That's not how we want to live and that's not how we live with each other.' What I, you know, that this is the final say so right here and you have no way to grieve the process. All of us have

worked for somebody at some time and have had a supervisor who we wanted to go a little higher to grieve the process with.

So, that's why I'm saying.., and I don't understand when we say postpone the Charter Review Committee. And, you know, I, I, I thank everybody for stepping up and willing to serve on, on any committee. Those people.., you know, those people, we could still hold them and hold their names and start the process, you know, over if we want to. And the two reasons I say that is, we had a whole list of stuff that came to us prior to Mr. Evans leaving that was laid out in several presentations that was going wrong with the committee and the process. Then we had some.., we had some other persons that came.., that, that came up and talked about the process and the things that were going.., that were in the Charter Review Committee. I'm not talking about who' on the committee, I'm not talking about Mr. Evans, I'm talking about the five items. The items is what's gonna control our life, for us that live out here and for us that work out here and who have to work under those five.., tho'.., those controlling items. And, you know, the people, you know, only he who [inaudible] and the people that don't have to live by it or die by it, they'.., they're, they're gonna be alright with, without.., with having those things wrapped around, wrapped around their, their body. One of the items was the.., the Mayor would no longer have the ability to suspend. Stuff like that. Some.., I mean, this is eating at the heart and soul of what our Charter does and says. So, we have to know what we want to be and how we want to be it. You know, I appreciate... I [stammer], I don't care who's on the Charter Review Committee, it's not about personal and personality. You know, it's a sad case that the same person on the Charter Review Committee, would be the same person on the Recall Committee. You know?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** [Chuckle].

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** That's a, that, that's, that's kinda sad...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible]...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...state of affairs...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...but, but I say to you that that's the important, and the meat, of what we need to be l'.., be looking, looking at. We've got to stop looking over here at the flash and the dash and while people are trying to distract us from what is really substantive in our community and making us think that all this is going on while they're upsetting and destroying the very base of our life. That's what's going on when you start talking about tearing the Charter apart and you want to have something that, at the end of the day, that everybody can live with.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** [Inaudible]...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I'm coming to Mr. Davis but a question regarding your.., about the ci'.., Civil Service Board. I thought we agreed to bring that back. I know you used it as an example but we did...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** We agreed to...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...agree to...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...bring it back...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...bring it back.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...but that doesn't stop you, or them, from making it one of the five items in the Charter.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** But what.., they're only an advisory group so if it came back to us, and that's not...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** All of them are, you know, and that's...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And it's the community so, you know, at the end of the day, we want the community to be involved in their...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Right. We...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...their Charter.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...want them [inaudible]...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** It's not our Charter.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** And, and very...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** It is our Charter.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...few people know that...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** It is a community...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...that's one of the five things that are being stated...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...in that Charter Review Committee, that the employees of this City, that the buck stops with, with the Manager and there's no grievance process.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Ma'...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** I bet if we...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...took a poll tomorrow, very few of our employees would've known that that's one of the things that is being suggested.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Mr. Davis.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Thank you. That, that goes back to the training that was suggested earlier. I think the training is very important to understanding what it means to be impartial, what is your responsibility? As a person, just to make recommendations to the Board and what is your purpose, and which was suggested by Councilperson Pardo. What Vice Chair Davis Johnson stated earlier about a postponement, I truly can support. One of the issues that's been going on over the last few months, you know, since April, it.., I think we all can agree to is that we was all trynna get folks to focus on the Civil Service Board, the surtax money, the Planning & zoning and this Board that's being discussed today. And the issue that we had is which one we was gonna prioritize. I mean, everybody had all these issues they want to talk about but you only had a handful of folks that was really... Well, like me, I was trying to focus on the surtax dollars. That money was coming down the...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...coming down the pipeline, the county already had a plan in place and we're sitting around here doing absolutely nothing but focusing on one individual and nothing's getting' done in the City and let's get back to that. The City is why we're here. You know, with some of that training, I think.., if that Board goes to that training, I would like to sit in on that training as well because I think it's very understanding that when we have those discussions and training, that they have someone from this Board, all of us, to understand how we must work together to get something accomplished for this new year. And that's why we didn't get anyone on all the boards. We got the Civil Service Board, you know, supported, we got the Charter Review but not.., everyone had an appointment but we did it because the be'.., we thought it would be fair for the City to have someone that actually care, not knowing it was gonna become a partial board.

But the surtax is something we still gotta address. We got money that's being allocated with no direction which way it's going.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well, we had it...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...on the Agenda.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Right. You know, but we had it on the Agenda, like, nu'.., for, like, months, over and over and over again. So, I can support what Vice Chair

is... I understand what Councilperson Hubbard's position is, I support that but I understand what Councilperson Pardo was saying that all the boards need training, knowing they' purpose and how to get things done as a team. I think if they get that, there won't be no [stammer], the issues that are going on that we have today. I think let's give 'em a fair shot at that but, until that happens, I can support a postponement that was discussed and recommend by Vice Chair Davis Johnson. And that's my position, if she makes that motion, I support it.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Degraffenreidt?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Yes, ma'am.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** In the Charter Review process, please explain how that actually works. Charter Review Committee submits its recommendations of Charter revisions.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Yes, ma'am.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** This body has the right to push it forward to go to the voters or not.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Yes, ma'am.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** So, does that no address the issue that they cannot just put forth the.., their will...

[Inaudible audience comments]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No. That [inaudible]...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...of...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** I, I need to complete that.

[Inaudible comments]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** [Stammer]...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** My recollection is that the Charter Review Board can make the suggestions to the Council.

**MAYOR MASTERS::** Recommendations.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** To the extent that the Council does not agree, or decide to proceed with it...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...I think the Charter provides a referendum petition procedure whereby they can have it put on anyway.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Right. But we..., it comes back to us...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Oh yes.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...for discussion?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Oh yes, oh yes.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** And, and if there is something that we know is, is directly harmful to us, then certainly we have the ability to deny it moving forward. We put ourselves...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Pardon?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** I can go with a postponement.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** I, I just want us to.., we need to think about this because apparently, you know, there has been correspondence that has been blasted to every organization and individual as it relates to the issues that are being addressed in Charter Review, which I don't understand the, the motivation behind the correspondence that was sent out with all of the Staff's recommendations, inclusive of the former City Manager. So, I'm still.., I understand that it was.., I was told that, at least, that it was for informational purposes only. You know, but the one thing that I know that we are constantly doing as a body is inserting ourselves into these committees which seems to set up a, a.., it kinda set, sets up an adversarial type environment. We agree that they need.., that all of our boards and advisory committees need to be trained but we need to allow them the opportunity to do what is set forth and there needs to be clear and definitive instructions as to what the intent of each advisory committee is. If information is requested, then that information needs to be provided. Our, our Staff needs to make sure that any information any advisory board is asking for in historical context, that it should be provided. If it's not available, then we need to understand why records and information is not available. But we have to, we have to stop putting our hands in the midst of every action that takes place because our role, our role here...

**MAYOR MASTERS::** Is policy.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...is fiduciary...

[Inaudible audience comment]

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...and it is...

[Audience clapping]

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...also... Please. Point of order. We.., it is fiduciary and it is policy. And so, we will be able to set those policies. I just believe that we need to take an opportunity and a step back. I fully understand after reading, you know, the five points and then some of the other things that were in there, where the concern is coming from but we have got to.., if it is this Board's pleasure to suspend operations of the Charter Review Committee, I.., you know, it's, it's just...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Ma'...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** It's just.., it's disheartening for me because we struggled, number one...

[Inaudible comment]

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ... to get individuals to serve on the Committee. Once the service got going, you know, naturally, you have individuals with their personal opinions, feelings and thoughts and, and that's natural, you know, for any individual. However, there is a charge at hand and that is to review the Charter. We were supposed to, if you all will remember, we were supposed to have input as to what items we wanted to have looked at in the Charter. I don't recall us submitting that. I didn't see that in those records.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** This...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well, hold on. Are you fini'...?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** This is to that question.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Now, I, I do recall that and, and, and back to the focus of we were trying, as a Board, to make sure that we give a board direction but...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** We did not.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Well, we have a lotta things in the City we haven't done. I don't believe.., I know.., I can speak for myself, at no point did I ever get

involved with any of the board to tell anyone.., to get my hands involved with that. What I would like to do is, based upon your recommendation of the post'.., or the suspension, I would su'.., like me, I would like to, when the time is proper, to put a motion on the floor to postpone it until all the boards, not just the Charter Review, all board members in the entire City go through a day of training, through the, what is it? The John Daly School?

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Yeah. [Inaudible]...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** To, to, to discuss the [inaudible] of your purpose on the board, what you have the authority to do and how do you work together as a team. There's certain things that all our board members.., I don't want to isolate nobody. And I think.., and, and [stammer] sometimes I think some of us on this Board need to go through that same training as well.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** I don't disagree.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** And, and, and matter of fact, I will submit myself to that training just so I can be part of what all those board members are going through as well. I think that that board, this board specifically because it's so important when you talk about the Charter, should be suspended until that takes place of all boards.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Madam Chair?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** And I will...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Hold on.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...definitely, when that time comes, I... But I will wait 'cause I know there's still discussion. The Mayor has to chime in, the Chair has to make a decision on what she want to say and I will hold my motion 'til that.., until it comes.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** The... Mr. Davis and to others, it's not about the.., I, I agree that we have some boards and that all of our board members should be afforded the opportunity for trainings and conferences of such. Even, like, out General Pension Board, they get a lot of training, they do, they do a lotta.., go to a lotta conferences and things of that nature, so they're afforded a lot of opportunities that our other boards should be afforded. I don't want for anyone to think that, for me, that's it's just about personality. It's about substance, it's about things that are gonna matter at the end of the day. It's not that I want my hand mixed into the day to day operation of what's going on. It's not that we.., that if I sit here and I don't say anything about this particular thing and it becomes a noose, or an albatross, around all of our necks, then everybody's gonna look back and say, you know, that was in 2018 when they were on the board and they let that happen. Right now, it's all, you know, rah, rah, rah but when,

when, when it hit' the fan and the rubber hit the road, then we're going, then..., we will, we will be charged with not..., we will be charged with not seeing what was going to happen, not having enough foresight to see what those things would do to the very lives of the people that asked us to take these seats. If we don't look at those things, that's what would be the travesty in all of us, not seeing a [stammer], a far ahead enough to know that those things would be devastating to this community. That's what, that's what I'm, that's I'm tal'., that's what matters. We can leave the same people in place, the same people could run it, they could have training or not trained but we need to see those items are what is going to be a problem for the residents of Riviera Beach.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay. Madam...

**MAYOR MASTERS::** Madam...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...Chair?

**MAYOR MASTERS::** ...Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Ms. Davis Johnson, then the Mayor.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Your point is fully taken and understood, Councilwoman Hubbard. What I think is proper is for this body to look at everything that was proposed because, apparently, those things were done in, in..., we were not aware.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** We [inaudible].

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** We, we were not aware of what went forward to the Committee. We only became aware when the email was sent to us with a full..., with a full dossier, if you will, of the department's recommendations, as well as City Administration. So, I believe that, as the policy setting body, we should, number one, take a look at those things. We know, we know what things drive this, this City and what will have us to operate in a professional manner, so maybe we need to take a look at those things, make our comments and take the opportunity to make the comments that we initially said that we would make as it related to concerns that we have for the Charter. Throughout..., because, remember, it was said to us that City Administration and Staff would take a look at things that they wanted to have addressed but we were to also taking advan'., take advantage of an opportunity to identify the things that we wanted addressed. And I, in no, in no piece of that documentation, is there anything that refers to this Council's...

[Inaudible dais comments]

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...suggestions or comments. So, I'm saying suspend...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...it to give this body an opportunity to provide the information that we would like to have included in the review of the Charter and then maybe reconvene them at a later time.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. Mr. Mayor.

**MAYOR MASTERS::** Thank you, Madam Chair. I [pause] have mixed emotions, feelings about this entire matter.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**MAYOR MASTERS::** Thank you, Councilwoman Hubbard, as it relates to the suspension, that one, the powers of the Mayor, I'm not really concerned about that at all because that was on.., went to the people before and it was voted down by a landslide so I'm not really concerned about any of those five because, at, at the end of the day, it's.., the Vice Cahir said, it'll come back to us. One way or the other.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**MAYOR MASTERS::** But I just don't know whether it's fair to have people who have volunteered and then tell them that, midway or, or almost the end, to.., they need training. I'm not for sure that's the fair way to deal with it. And as it relates to postponement.., postponement or sus'..., or suspension, whatever you want to call it, are we going to tie that in to when we get a new City Manager? That we're just hold everything in abeyance until we have a new City Manager? Maybe there will be leadership, new leadership at that point but right now, everything is at, at a standstill.

The other thing I think we need to make clear, to those who are serving, that we.., that they still have our confidence, either we.., either they, they do or, or they don't. Ya know? And we don't.., if we don't believe that they're working or recommending in the best of the City, then we're wasting time. So.., but if we do believe, if we do have confidence in them, then they go forward after we get a new Manager or after we look at whatever they have produced, those three or four items. And, if we feel that none of those items are something that we are not in accord with, then we vote 'em down at that point and then give them some directive, with the new City Manager.

So, I [pause]. The other thing I want to say is that the Chair.., the, the Chair of the Charter Committee is here tonight and I would definitely want to hear what he would have to say and how many meetings you've had, anything else because I know at one point, you said that the Committee was gonna reach out to the Council individually and get their concerns. So, if that's still on the table, I would like to hear from the, the Chair of the.., that Committee as well, Madam Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. I, you know, as I stated earlier, we each had an opportunity to vote the people in and, you know, I know there were.., Councilwoman Pardo and Ms. Hubbard stated about some of the people who are on the Committee, either participated, headed the recall or talked out against the Council. I, you know, I hope we're, we're not, you know, now trying to address this because of that

type of co'..., those comments that were made because at this point, it just sounds like it's..., want's..., we want to disband it because of the people that are on the Board. If there were some concerns about what was taking place during the meetings... I know we did have Mr. Jackson and Ms. Walker, I believe, came up during one of the meetings and provided somewhat of an update. Sometime ago, there was some concerns Mr. McCoy had as to what was taking place and with the attorney that was leading the actual Charter Review Committee and, you know, outside of that I had heard of any other issues that were taking place to a point where we now want to disband the entire Board. As the Mayor stated, and, and Councilwoman Davis'..., you know, I understand, and I agree ;with you, everybody..., I mean, that's why we just approved for a consultant to come and provide some training. So, we know that many departments and boards need the training. I, I wholeheartedly agree with that but I, I'm not..., I just..., it ju'..., I don't think it's right to now say let's disband the Board because of, you know... And, and I know we talked about moving on earlier but I agreed to move on and we've said Mr. Evans' name maybe 20 times in the past 15 minutes. So, I don't know who's not moving on because we keep bring him up.

But the, the boards..., I just, I don't, I don't think it's right that we now want to disband this group, for whatever reasons it is that we're now talking about disbanding it. They've put in time, with the board. We've had an opportunity to put the people on the Board. If we had concerns at that time, I think we should've brought it up but now it just sounds like we're kinda being, like, tit for tat, at this point where we want to try to, you know, get..., retaliating and get 'em off the Board because...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...they may have participated in a negative way for some of us. I'll come to you in a second. And then, if we, we postpone, I think Mr. Davis mentioned postponing or putting a whole on every board until we get some training for them. I mean, we're talking about Planning & Zoning, we're gonna now just stop all of the other things that we had going on to provide training. We don't know when we'll be able to get the people to do the training, so I don't think that's the answer either. I personally am not in support of, you know, stopping the board or disbanding the board. Now, if we need to..., if we feel that we have not provided any input, I, I'm sure they would be open enough to hear what we have to say and I think we still have time to do that but we have to keep in mind, this, this Charter Review, any board, is not our board. And when I say our, I'm talking Hubbard, Pardo, Miller-Anderson, Davis, Davis Johnson, it is the communities board and so the community has a right to put in what they want. Again, they did elect us and put us in office but we still have to listen to what the community as a whole wants. And it's not about what we want.

So, you know, I don't know which way you all want to go with this. I know some of you do want to make, continue to make comments. Do we have any public comment cards for this?

[Inaudible comment]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. So, Ms. Pardo, were you next?

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Yes, I'm next and, to be clear, because obviously you didn't understand what I said.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Oh, I'm sorry.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** It was..., originally, I said and I still feel this way, that all of the boards needs training. And it's...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I agree.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** ...not a slight to anyone on the Board. It's something that was required years ago and, for whatever reason, it's not required anymore and, after spending a lot of time watching these committees, it's obvious that they need training. And if you also recall, we have had members of some of those boards come forward at Council meetings asking for training. So, I think, at this point, it's time to move forward with training.

With regards to the Charter Review Committee, the one application that you received, was an application from a gentleman on Singer Island who requested to be put on the Board. And I was all for him and everyone else. And I am not looking to disbanding the Board. This is all about educating everyone. And the members need to realize that they have one job to do. They're not here to set policy, they're not here to bring their personal opinions into it, it is to look at the Charter and then come back with recommendations. And we had the attorney for the Charter Review Committee come to the meeting and I had asked her about Sunshine, are these people going to be bound by Sunshine? And she said yes. Okay? And there's been rumors and other things about Sunshine but that's not up to me to say. You know? Other stuff will be coming forward on that. And then, we also asked whether or not the Council should be attending the meetings and talking to the representatives and it was her opinion, at the time, that we should not. And back in August, I think it was August 2<sup>nd</sup>, when this originally came to us, we had a discussion with the former City Manager about the Charter Review Committee and, you know, at the time, and I pulled the Minutes and, you know, he had a concern about Sunshine Law and ethics and, and other things and, for whatever reason, the Clerk wasn't here but he was gonna get with her to schedule a sequence of meetings, with the Charter Review, with the City Council and everyone else and it just, it never happened. And that was back on August 2<sup>nd</sup>, it wasn't September 18<sup>th</sup> or 19<sup>th</sup>. So anyway, just for the record. I just wanted to put that on there. This isn't...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Madam Chair?

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** ...about getting rid of the Charter Review Committee. Alright? This is about training them and every other committee in the City so they can do a better job. If they're dedicating their time to, you know, trying to do a good job, let's train them so they know exactly what to do. And I believe we even put money in the budget...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** We did.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** ...because this came up...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** We did.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** ...during the, during the budget and we put money in the budget to train the people. So, we need to move forward with it.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilwoman Hubbard.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** I'm all for, for us having training and.., for the, for the board members. That's fine, that should be an ongoing process, that should be something that happens regardless of whatever board that one decides to sit on.

I'm.., the.., I don't want the members of the board to go away thinking.., because I clearly, I, it's clear, based on what the Chairwoman Anderson Miller said, that there's a mis'.., there is a misunderstanding as to what, and the reason that I want us to postpone it, as you suggested or disband it, either one. My concern and I.., is just the items that are being reviewed and the items that are being suggested on that, on that docu'.., on the, on the document, while the last time, 2008-2009 when we had the Charter Review, we had another gentleman that was the attorney for it. At that time, we were encouraged to come, we were encouraged to, to sit in on the meetings. That gentleman, he actually did charter reviews before and he was well aware of it. So, and then it surprised me at this time, when we were discouraged from coming. And, in that discouragement, I know that administration continually sat there and was there. Now, all of a sudden, we're discouraged from going this particular time, we weren't discouraged from going before. So, all I'm concerned with...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...is what's gonna affect the future of this City and how do we want to live. How do we live with the other things that people will burden us with? If want to pos'.., postpone it, put in some'.., suggestions, let the Chair make his meetings with each one of us as he.., if it's my understanding, is that his intention to do.., to, to meet with each of us or, or whatever or we need to clear up whether we can come or not. If we can come, then let's go. Let's be there. Because the attorney that we had the last time, he said we could go. So we need a point of clarification on that. So, I would just say we postpone it until, until we get a chance to look at the documents that was given to us, until we can get an answer from that particular attorney, sir.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Madam Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes. Go ahead.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** At this time, I'd like to make a motion that we postpone our Charter Review Committee until the new City Manager that is hired, that was suggested by the Mayor, to review the documents and bring something to this Board to schedule training and the vision of the City with the Charter Review Committee.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Is there a second?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Second.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam Clerk.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** I'm sorry.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Hold on.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Question?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** With regards to this postponement until..., I know I spoke about temporary suspending and I'm thinking, you know, as the discussion has been had, we need to..., there are other items that they can work on but, specifically, those things that came before us that we believe to be detrimental to the operation of the City, this Board needs to take a look and submit some suggestions and have Legal weigh in on what the Charter provides so that the Charter Review Committee will fully understand what some of these actions mean and how it affects the overall operation of the City.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** So, if we are, in fact, going to do that, we need to take advantage of that time, as a Board, to review what was provided to us by a member of the Charter Review Committee. And, while we're reviewing it, I believe that Legal should review it as well to discuss any potential negatives that may come as a result of that.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Absolutely.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** I'm good with that.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Do you want to amend your motion to that?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Well...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Oh, you understand...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...that, that could be done within the motion.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yeah. That's what I'm saying.

[Inaudible dais comments]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. Madam Clerk.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Davis Johnson?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Hubbard?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Pardo?

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Miller-Anderson?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** No.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** That motion is approved with Councilperson Miller-Anderson dissenting.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright.

**6. ITEM 6A**

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** 6A.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** CAP GOVERNMENT

**UNK. AUDIENCE:** Public comments.

**UNK. AUDIENCE:** Public comments.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I'm sorry. Yes, it is 7:00.., after 7:30.

**COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC**

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Let's go to public comment.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, the acceptance of public comment cards is closed at this time.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Phillip Dukes, John Miller, Julie Botel.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And let me go ahead and just read this.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** PUBLIC COMMENT SHALL BE RESTRICTED TO ISSUES, MATTERS OR TOPICS PERTINENT TO THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH. PLEASE BE REMINDED THAT THE CITY COUNCIL HAS ADOPTED RULES OF DECORUM GOVERNING PUBLIC CONDUCT DURING OFFICIAL MEETINGS WHICH HAS BEEN POSTED AT THE ENTRANCE OF THE COUNCIL CHAMBERS. IN AN EFFORT TO PRESERVE ORDER, IF ANY RULES ARE NOT ADHERED TO, THE COUNCIL CHAIR MAY HAVE AN DISRUPTIVE SPEAKER OR ATTENDEE REMOVED FROM THE PODIUM, FROM MEETING AND/OR THE BUILDING, IF NECESSARY. PLEASE GOVERN YOURSELVES ACCORDINGLY.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And, please be sure to watch the time. You have three minutes. Thank you.

**DR. P. DUKES:** Council. Dr. Phillip Dukes, 1217 Avenue U.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Good evening.

**DR. P. DUKES:** Riviera Beach, Florida. I want to thank you for putting me on the Agenda last month. I'm also looking forward to doing that workshop that you said we wanted to do on crime and violence and how we can stop the drug retail market in our City. I hope we can do it before April of 2018. Our next event will be March the 10<sup>th</sup> at 1:00 p.m. at 1217 Avenue U.

We need a strong, street movement to change our community atmosphere on the Westside. I think, overall, with the business aspect of the City that you guys are doing real good but on the..., and I have to say it like this, on the black side of town, we have historical problems that we haven't dealt with...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Hold on.

**DR. P. DUKES:** ...over the years.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Hold on one second. We're gonna stop you. Pause the, the timer.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**DR. P. DUKES:** Yeah. Pause... Put it back [inaudible]...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mr. Miller, are you leaning on...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Is that coming...

**UNK.:** He's standing...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...form over there?

**UNK.:** ...on the thing.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Huh?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** John Miller.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Can we get it back down...

**DR. P. DUKES:** Sure.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...please?

**DR. P. DUKES:** Oh, the door?

[Inaudible dais comments]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Say that again.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** He was leaning on [inaudible]...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** We need the timer.

**DR. P. DUKES:** Oh, oh, oh the thing.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Don't go back on the wall.

[Inaudible comments]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** [Chuckle].

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Cost him fifty cent'.

**DR. P. DUKES:** See, now I gotta start all over, lost my train of thought.

[Audience chuckles]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** [Stammer].

**DR. P. DUKES:** And while, while we're waiting...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** No, no, no. We're gonna hold on 'til this timer come back on.

**DR. P. DUKES:** Okay. Alright.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** 'Cause we don't want anybody say I gave you extra time.

**DR. P. DUKES:** Why not?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Can we get somebody to come and, and get it?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** They're going to get a Staff member...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Alright. Well, while we're waiting, can we hold up for a few minutes, just a couple minutes. As soon as...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Is that him? Oh, no. Yes, Mr. Davis.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Could, could we get someone from over there to just start over for three minutes from their phone or something? And then...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** No. We'll...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...Try and give a hand the...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...they'll...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...next 30 minutes instead of hold up a meeting.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** We're not holding up, I was...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Because...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...going to suggest something.

[Inaudible comment]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Excuse me, I'm just trying to talk to the entire Board. It's a Board decision, do we want to move forward or do we want to wait for someone to come here to help us out?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible]...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Just use the timer...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well, she's gonna [inaudible].

[Inaudible comments]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Bring it back down.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Just use the cellphone.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Telephone timer.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** The screen.

**UNK.:** The time is still on the computer.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I know.

**UNK.:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Right. We can still use the timer.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Can we see it up here?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** No. But you can see.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**UNK.:** I can see it.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Right.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Run the time.

**DR. P. DUKES:** Okay. Just tell me.

**UNK.:** Two minutes [inaudible]...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** [Stammer], we'll have it ready in a second.

**DR. P. DUKES:** Alright.

[Pause]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Go ahead and start our timer back. Thank you, Mr. Davis.

**DR. P. DUKES:** On March the 10<sup>th</sup> at 1:00 p.m., we're gonna be having our next event. I, I'm asking the residents to support Operation Restore. I want to thank the

Civic Committee on Singer Island for sending us a donation and two families on Singer Island that wanted to be anonymous for sending donations, and the people on the Westside. You can send donations to P.O. Box 10111, Riviera Beach, Florida 33419. Our..., Operation Restore's concepts and work is unparalleled in the State of Florida and throughout the nation. When you look at dealing with gun violence and drugs in our community because we, we believe in Riviera Beach, we need to have a higher standard and a zero tolerance for the drug retail market that breeds thug life. So, I'm asking the City Council, and the Mayor's office... I know you guys have your monies that you get from ..., that's already earmarked for your community benefits but I'm asking you to buy in personal, like I'm asking everybody else. I would like to see you lead with \$100 to Operation Restore, I'm asking every resident in our City to give \$10 to help us. Would could have changed our community atmosphere 35 years ago but, because of fear and intimidation in the black community by these drug dealers and these thugs, nobody wants to step out and say what I say. I just happen not to be afraid. On the Westside, people live in fear and intimidation by those , what I call, community terrorists. So, I'm asking everyone to play a part in this. This is passed personal politics. It's doing the right thing. We have all this redevelopment across the City, that's great, but we have to redevelop these historical problems we have in Riviera Beach that are germane to wherever black people live, which is the drug retail market and gang violence. And you don't meet with 'em, you deal with them. 'Cause I used to be one of 'em. And I don't have a problem telling folk that what changed my life, was church and prison.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**DR. P. DUKES:** So, I'm asking you to support us.

Thank you very much.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** John Miller, Julie Botel.

**MR. J. MILLER:** First of all, Happy New Year.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Good evening. Thank you.

**MR. J. MILLER:** Second of all...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** State your...

**MR. J. MILLER:** You know, I just...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...name for the record.

**MR. J. MILLER:** ...listened to about 45 minutes...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** State your name...

**MR. J. MILLER:** about this...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...for the record, please. State your name for the record.

**MR. J. MILLER:** John Miller.

I spent about 45 minutes, along with the rest of ya's listening to about advisory boards. I'm on an advisory board. Alright? Am I right? What I'm getting at is this, you just, you know, you beat up a dead horse about this. It's ridiculous. An advisory. It's like..., did anybody know Allen Iverson, the basketball player? I'm from Philly, originally. He talked about practice. He didn't want to hear about having to go to practice. It's practice. We're talking advisory. Advisory board. Not people making the decisions, not the people voting, alright? Now..., and, first of all, I ha'..., listened to Ms. Pardo. First she talked about the Planning & Zoning and then she went right to the Charter Review Board. And she named three people..., she didn't name them, she said three of those members are ta'..., talked about her on a recall or something. That's like..., where we at? Are we in Washington? Is Trump here? You know, he goes after the FBI, he's looking to the FBI 'cause they might've voted against Trump. Come on now. That's enough. Wha'..., what you have to do is this, right now, we got three people that are gonna vote whatever they want to do. That's it. They're gonna do what they want and that's gonna happen but on March 13<sup>th</sup>, that could change. We got an excellent candidate here. Now the first time in eight years, Julie Botel, who's gonna...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No.

**MR. J. MILLER:** ...work for both sides of the City.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Point of order.

**MR. J. MILLER:** Point of order, for what? I'm...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible]....

**MR. J. MILLER:** ...in the middle of doing my comment.

[Inaudible dais discussion]

**MR. J. MILLER:** Am I allowed to comment?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** We cannot use...

**MR. J. MILLER:** You're, you're st'...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** We cannot use public funds...

**MR. J. MILLER:** I won't use that.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...public service.

**MR. J. MILLER:** What I'm saying to you...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...to, to campaign.

**MR. J. MILLER:** ...is that you can do anything you want, the three of ya...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** 5 of us.

**MR. J. MILLER:** ...for the next seven weeks, eight weeks. After that, it's gonna be up to you because you're gonna have the chance.., you don't worry about the recall, you're gonna find out you got a chance to say, 'Say who's gonna be sitting' up there?' Yes, they have the right to say what they want, they have the right to do what they want. Just like Trump, he can do anything he wants. But, remember this, you put the people up there and what they don't remember is this, they don't remember that you, the citizens tell them what to do. It's not backwards. So, when you figure that out, you're gonna get your people out and you're gonna vote for either the incumbent, or this lady here.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** This is [inaudible].

**MR. J. MILLER:** And it'll be the same thing with KaShamba and her opponent. Do the right thing, let 'em do what they want. They're gonna do what they want for another seven, eight weeks. After that, just like Trump, the change and everything with Obama, that can be changed.

Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I, I think it's.., we must understand what our responsibilities, and respect to all public comments and Council comments and responsibility as public funds used to pay for this airtime. And, anyone from the public can talk about the issues and that's fine, but as we embark upon the new year, we need to make sure that we're focused on the entire City of Riviera Beach. And there's five Board Members that ha'.., three of us, maybe four of us, maybe all five of us have a level of experience to find a way to work together but not to keep separating. Trump does not trump. He's the president of the United States, whether we like him or not, and we must respect that position upon that.., on our country. And we must do and treat him the same way we ask folks to respect President Obama 'cause he wasn't Obama so I will stay formal, I will ask everyone to come to this meeting to talk about the issues, be positive. If you know it's a heated political issue, there will be debates to talk about your platform while you're running but this is not the place to talk about the platform but we have issues on the Agenda that are pertinent, that you can speak on.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So, let's make sure we set the tone and do not give the press a show to keep embarrassing the City.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Mr. Miller, I have great respect for you and I know you can do better and I support you as you do better.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Ms. Anthony.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Julie Botel, Amon Yisrael and Charlotte Darville.

**MS. J. BOTEL:** Thank you. I am...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Good evening.

**MS. J. BOTEL:** ...Julie Botel. I live at 3000 North Ocean Drive, Riviera Beach. Thank you, John and thank you, TD. I would like to bring some civility to this discussion, however, I am hopping' mad. And so, I have to digress from what my original remarks were about and talk about the Charter Review Board.

Marie Davis and Mr. Jackson are sitting here. They are two members of the Charter Review Board and I assure you that they have been working very, very hard in the interest of this City. They are not swayed by politics, they are, to my knowledge, not on any recall committee, they have been having meetings that are long and hard and difficult and, in some cases, divisive but they are working toward resolving those issues that they have as a committee for the benefit of this City and I applaud them for that work. They are not partisan in any way, they are not taking sides, they are working very, very hard. If you, as a Board, as a Council, do not want to hear the voice of the people in this community, then go ahead and disband this group, disband every group that you've assigned to give you advice. And that's all it is, it's advice. They are not making any decisions. You are the decision'.., decision making body in this community. They are there to give you advice, to propose things, not to adopt things, not to change things without your vote. In fact, without, without the vote of the people because, ultimately, if there's something put on a referendum, it will be the vote of the people of Riviera Beach, not even the vote of City Council, ultimately.

So, I applaud their work and I urge you to continue to support them. As I understand it, they have invited City Council Members to attend. I have attended a good number of their meetings and on number'.., a number of occasions, they have said that they had wished they had input from City Council. I think the issues that they're grappling with are issues that we, as a community, need to grapple with in public and I

would urge more people to go to those meetings, to hear what it is they have to say because this is the Constitution of our community. This City Charter is the Constitution that we will have to live with, if it is passed by our community.

And so, I fully intended to talk about the article that was in here about what lies in store for Riv'., Riviera Beach. I have a lot of comments about that. I'll have to save them for, for another day because I think that the work of this Charter Review Committee is so important that you need to focus on keeping them alive and well.

Thank you very much.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Next.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Amon Yisrael, Charlotte Darville, Reverend Burrs.

**MR. A. YSIRAEEL:** Good evening.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Good evening.

**MR. A. YSIRAEEL:** Amon Yisrael. Chair, Mayor, Council.

Just an update on the recall. 'Been getting a lotta calls and questions in reference to the recall. The recall is very much active. There is movement. [Clears throat]. There are two things legally, that I can say, that the City has asked for the recall to be dismissed and the Supervisor of Elections, Susan Booker, has said she has nothing to do with this. We should hear something the, the end of this week, maybe early next week. We are asking for a hearing. I have personally talked to about four, four, four judges and their opinion is that this is a win, that no time that the citizens should be denied the rights, in America, based on a few people, that the majority is always to win. [Clears throat].

I also just want to, you know, several people have asked me in terms of who do I support for the upcoming election and that is KaShamba Miller-Anderson and...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Point of order.

**MR. A. YSIRAEEL:** ...Ms. Julia Botel.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Point of order.

**MR. A. YSIRAEEL:** Uh...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Point of order.

**MR. A. YSIRAEEL:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Go ahead.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Point of order. Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Go ahead.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** At some point, you..., I should not have to do it, I'm not the Chair or the Vice Chair, to keep the rules and decorum governing this City. We are starting off a new year, a new tone. Mr. Jenkins has the right to say his public opinion. It's not my job to silence him but this public funds, he has on a campaign shirt, that's paid by a political organization and he's talking about politics on public funds and public time. I think that is definitely improper. We must set the tone, we must let folks, this is not a show, this is a new year, the proper way and we're gonna stay focused and continue to support his opinion on how he want to, but let's make sure that we follow what is order.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you.

**MR. A. YSIRAEEL:** Councilman Terence Davis, I hearing you saying that. I always understood that public comments were public comments. And we do have an attorney here. Is it possible for him to weigh in on public comments?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** We can talk about this at a later date.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I'll, I'll have them say something after you're done.

[Inaudible comment]

**MR. A. YSIRAEEL:** Okay. So, do I get my few minutes back, 'cause I don't want to be...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** It stopped...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** [Inaudible].

**MR. A. YSIRAEEL:** ...I don't want to be out of order.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** She stopped it while...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** She stopped the clock.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...he was on.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** She stopped it.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So...

**MR. A. YISRAEL:** But I want to continue saying something but I don't want to be out of order. Because if it's not ...

[Inaudible dais comments]

**MR. A. YISRAEL:** ...proper...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Let's stop. Mr. Degraffenreidt?

**MAYOR MASTERS::** [Inaudible] stick to the rules.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Please, please give your statement on that.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** I believe the statement that you read every meeting says that the comments are limited to public business that's on this Agenda.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. So, you're saying that they cannot come up there with a shirt on.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** That's what I stated.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** I just referenced the instructions you gave.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** There's nothing about attire.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright.

**MR. A. YISRAEL:** Okay. Thank you, Ms...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Does it say anything about that?

**MAYOR MASTERS::** No I thought public comment.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Issues, matters or topics pertinent to the City of Riviera Beach.

**MAYOR MASTERS::** So, that's relevant.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** An election is relevant to the City of Riviera Beach.

[Inaudible background comments]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So you support public forum.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I'm not saying I support it but if you can tell me, and Mr. Degraffenreidt can say no, they can't do it, I'll do what Degraffenreidt says, if it follows the rules.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** I don't believe the comments can be...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Can.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...made that support candidates or issues from a political perspective. I think you're addressing the City's business.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Alright. Continue, Mr. Amon.

**MAYOR MASTERS::** Would it... Excuse me, Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**MAYOR MASTERS::** I didn't hear what he said, the Attorney.

[Inaudible comment]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mr. Degraffenreidt, can you repeat it, please?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** The comments shall be limited to the City's business. It should not be used as an infrastructure for campaign speeches or support for individuals or political ideas.

**MAYOR MASTERS::** So, City business can be..., City business is who you feel...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** [Inaudible]...

**MAYOR MASTERS::** ...can better...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No.

**MAYOR MASTERS::** ...carry on this...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No.

**MAYOR MASTERS::** No, no. Wait a minute. I'm having my opinion. That's a matter of interpretation. City business can be who you feel can better carry out the City business in the election. That's City business, to me.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** It's politics.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Chair?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** That's not, that's not...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So again, it says public comment... First of all, I don't need anybody to come and, and campaign for me, so I'm not doing that for that purpose. It says:

'Public comment should be restricted to issues, matters or topics pertinent to the City of Riviera Beach.'

That is all it mentions. Other than, rules of decorum, can be removed, disruptive speaker. Any..., it does not reference anything outside of that, public comment shall be restricted to issues, matters or topics pertinent to the City of Riviera Beach, which is very generic and general.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Unless Mr. Degraffenreidt says something within that statement is illegal for them to do that, what they're doing, then I don't understand what, what are we..., what are we doing? Mr. Degraffenreidt, one last time.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** I don't think the comments are illegal. The meetings are under the control by the people on the dais. You set the rules.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. So...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** [Inaudible]...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...unless we're taking a vote to say that you all don't want it, he has...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...fifty..., fifty-se'...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Hold, hold...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...fifty-four seconds...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Hold on. You asked a question. Unless we're taking a vote. Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** If you want to do that...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I would...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...we can do that if you want.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Listen. Let's be clear...

[Inaudible comment]

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Chair?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No. No.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**MAYOR MASTERS::** Will you guys [inaudible]...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** We don't need to do a vote...

**MAYOR MASTERS::** ...shirt.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No, no. No, I had the floor. I had the floor and I, and I'll be very brief, Vice Chair. I know you got some things you want to state. These meetings, in this wonderful City, no matter what folks say, some folks laugh about it but I believe this City. Okay? Remember, what happens here, impacted us all, no matter what side you stand on. Our Attorney, that's paid for by public dollars, no matter how you feel about him, has taken a position and has gave us an opportunity to set a tone. There are debates, there are political attire, there's other.., there's an arena for everything in life. This is a business meeting. And, at some point, can we conduct business? We will get out in the street, we'll beat it down, we're gonna get down but this is not the place for it. This is not the place for it.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. So...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** And, at some point, we need to respect our professionals that we pay money for to give us a legal opinion to understand that.., where we need to go and set a tone. This is not Gotham City, we will not create chaos.

[Inaudible background comments]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Okay?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** This is not Gotham City, this is a wonderful City and I will no longer move into this year, this new year, support anybody or nay Member on this Board or in this room, that says we need to create chaos. I support the democratic process, good luck to everyone but let's conduct a meeting.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. Mr. Amon, 54 seconds.

**MR. A. YSIRAEEL:** I can make this easy. Anybody on the Charter Review Committee, that's on the recall committee, has a right, they're still citizens and they have a right to be on the recall committee and they have a right to voice their opinion. And I've heard several people state that this is an advisory board and, because they have different opinions of yours, that's part of the, as you say, Councilman Terence Davis, that that's part of the po'..., the process.

So, I want to say thank you. Riviera Beach, just kinda hold tight, the recall is definitely going to happen. And while I'm here, we need about 20 more people to participate in that recall.

Thank you very much.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you.

**MAYOR MASTERS::** Madam Chair? Point of order. I just need to ask a question and it's relevant. What is the difference in talking about a recall then talking about an election? If, if someone gets up and say they support the recall and if someone else comes up and say they don't support the recall, they support an election of certain can'... What's the difference?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair? We have public comment. We have another speaker.

**MAYOR MASTERS::** There isn't a difference.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** We have, we have another speaker waiting.

**MAYOR MASTERS::** There isn't a difference.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Chair?

**MAYOR MASTERS::** Common...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**MAYOR MASTERS::** ...sense.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** And please forgive me, those of you that are waiting.

This body has [pauses]. It is divided, it is fractured. We are setting precedence and doing things that we have not done all in the name of our own personal interests and what we are trying to move forward. I am totally.., and, and, and yes, I can probably do this at, at comment but we have just spent time trying to debate what should be allowed. In my tenure, in the City of Riviera Beach as a taxpaying citizen, I have never watched campaigning from the podium, so why now, do we switch that and change that to serve our interests? We have got to stop it. We have an attorney that

has given us a rendering. We don't necessarily like the rendering that the Attorney has given us because it doesn't suit our purpose. We have got to get back to the business of this City, we've got to have order in these meetings, we should not allow things that are unprecedented and things are not conducive to our business, to go on. And, at some point, I can't [stammer], we have a Chairperson. Chairperson is, is running..., she runs the meeting, she's in control of that. You know, we are constantly hollering, 'Point of order,' because we understand and we are recognizing things that are not proper. We need to do the right thing and stop circumventing processes and policies to suit our purpose.

I wanted to be on the record for that because this is really becoming counterproductive to every meeting that we have, we continue to look buffoonish, we continue to look inept, we continue to look as if we don't understand what it means to govern and, quite frankly, I am sick of it. And, just...

[Audience clapping]

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...as we... Please. Point of order. I, I, I don't say that for that. I'm telling you that, when we come to run the business of this City, we are going to have to unify at some point but we need to..., we certainly need to stand together as a body and call those things out that, that are not proper and those things that are proper, then we allow. But we've gotta cut it out and, and this is very frustrating for me and, I'm certain, it is frustrating for the residents. It is time to cut this out.

**MAYOR MASTERS::** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you. Who do we have next? Yes.

**MAYOR MASTERS::** I, I just need to ask Legal a question.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**MAYOR MASTERS::** It's pertaining to this. If you're not allowed to say anything to campaign, are you allowed, Constitutionally allowed, in the United States of America, to wear a t-shirt.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Yes.

**MAYOR MASTERS::** Supporting...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**MAYOR MASTERS::** ...a candidate?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** I believe you can wear a t-shirt.

**MAYOR MASTERS::** I, I...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** [Inaudible].

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Was that a yes?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** I believe you can wear a t-shirt.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay. You just can't...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** I mean, I can't think...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...say anything but you can wear a t-shirt.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...of anything that prohibits...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** There's no difference.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...you from wearing...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** That's crazy.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...your t-shirt.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Madam Chair?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible]...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I just wanted to know if you could wear a t-shirt. He said yes.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Um, Councilwoman Davis Johnson...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mhmm.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...in all that you said, I was trying to follow you and to hold on to see were you..., your first point that I got from what you were saying was that, when the, when the Attorney made the decision that we should not discuss campaigning material here and the majority of us [pause] went with that, or nodded to it or agreed to it or let, or let that stood, then you went on to say that we were being..., that it was for... I didn't make a comment in this setting, so what I'm, what I'm referring to is what I'm hearing, is that we are..., that there were comments up here made for person's own, own s'..., own interests.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** I...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** And...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible background comment]

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...and I want to.., I don't want to make any kind of response or any kinda comments out of the way without understanding exactly what your point was in that diatribe about...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** [Chuckle]. My diatribe?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** The, the, the long speech, because we started out I was witcha' for a piece of it and the last of it I felt like that there was some kind of [pause] something that we had done wrong as a body.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** No. I, I am not.., I'm saying that, as a body.., I'm not scolding us as a body, I'm saying that if the Attorney gives us a rendering, we move with it. I'm saying that.., and, and we can agree or not, I'm not pointing to a specific Member of Council for its own.., when I said when we have our issues, there is a lot going on in this City and it comes back to this dais and so, it is all encompassing when I talk about personal, personal interests and for our own individual agendas. So, not nec'.., not just for this Board but for the Committee and for the, for the community and those that come to us with various issues because this has been a, a very divisive time in our City. And so, I'm just talking about all of the personal interests. What I'm.., what I'm suggesting, and what I am asking us to, is to get to the business of the City. When is a rendering is given, we move with that that rendering ad then let's just kee'.., just, just stop. It just seems like we are being petty and, and, and politicking and doing all of these things that are not necessarily conducive. I'm not saying that you have a vested interest or that you have an underhanded motive, I'm not suggesting that, I'm just talking in a whole, a universal whole. So, I'm not, I'm not pointing my finger at any of you. We're all responsible for something that has happened. We're all.., we have had a part to play and I'm just simply saying, let's stop playing the parts and get to the business of running the City and doing the things that we need to do. That's all I'm saying.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** And, and, and the reason that.., I guess it begs to question, is because that was what your.., the colleagues to the left of you were saying and then you, you, you were.., either you were agreeing to say the right thing that we.., the same thing, rather, that we needed to move on with the business of the City...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** I'm saying [inaudible]...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...and that.., and, and that still.., and, and you know, and that's all of our positions but I, you know, I, I've got... Most people know me and if I'm, you know, if I see something that I feel that is wrong and that's a detriment to the City of Riviera Beach, then I think it's incumbent upon me to say something about it as a Councilperson. Now, four other people up here might think that it's hunky-dory and living like that in, in these times would be okay. We have.., we've had two public comments so far and both of them thought that it was.., it, it behooved them to tell us what was best for us, who's living' in, in, you know, who's living'.., who's lived here or living in Riviera Beach equally as long and to say that the rest of us, that, that, that are not looking out for their best interests.

So, I say to you, that that's, you know, that's must my position. I think that it's incumba'.., incumbent upon all of us sometimes to see stuff and to, and to say something about it, even if you have to stand alone on those positions sometimes.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Absolutely. And, and that's, that's what we have to do. Sometimes you have to stand alone and what I'm, what I'm simply saying is, it is quite frustrating to come here, meeting after meeting and, you know, naturally, the public has an ability to say and state their case...

**UNK.:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** We, ultimately, as the decisionmakers, policy setters and fiduciary agents have the responsibility to make sure. And, and, and my comment certainly was not going back to the fact that you brought up the issue because it had to be brought up after we got the information, that wasn't where I was going with that. It is quite frustrating, quite frustrating to do what we do here, week after week, going back and forth with the citizens, knowing what policy is, knowing what Legal tells us to do and then, you know, we, we get from public pressure, we start doing things that we ordinar'.., ordinarily don't do. And that's what I'm talking about.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** That's.., and, and that's my point, even with the public pressure...

**MAYOR MASTERS::** [Chuckle].

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...we gotta stick to what we're supposed to do.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** And that's what I'm saying.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...and our, and our thing is to bring it up, discuss it and then move on. [Stammer]...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** And that was what my diatribe was about.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Okay.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** That was solely what it was about.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Very well. Who's next, Ms. Anthony?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Charlotte Darville...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, Ms. Darville for allowing us to [inaudible]...

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Reverend Burrs...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...discussion.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** ...and then Evelyn Clark.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Good evening.

**MS. C. DARVILLE:** Good evening. I hope everyone had a nice holiday and now...

**MAYOR MASTERS::** Good evening.

**MS. C. DARVILLE:** ...it's time to get back to business.

Okay, we the citizens., this question is for the City Manager. We, the citizens and taxpayers of this City, would like to know what a bond was taken out for, I don't know if it was last year, the year before, that has doubled our water bills. It was never told to the citizens about this. Now, [pause], and Broadway, from Blue Heron north, is disgusting. It has been for years. It looks like you're driving down through Belle Glade. I don't why something hasn't been done about some of those nasty businesses along there, the rundown trailer park on the west side, the drug city. Okay? And you want businesses to move in here? We have to get this City cleaned up. It needs a lot of work. It used to be a very nice place to live but over'.., I've been here since '73 so I've seen a lot of changes here. Some good, some bad. Okay?

And I'm all for that training for the department heads but it not only needs to be for department heads, but also employees. There are so many employees, that work for the City, not all...

[Inaudible audience comments]

**MS. C. DARVILLE:** ...but there are employees that have no idea what they're doing. They probably haven't been trained in what their job title is and they're getting paid these enormous salaries. So, I'm all for all that training but it needs to be across the board, ya know? And the department heads, of each department should be responsible for their employees, and training them but, apparently, that's not being done a lot. Okay. And, as far as hiring new employees or new City employees, we don't need to be hiring people that falsify their applications or do not have the correct training. If they fal'.., falsify an application, what are they gonna do if they get into office, or in a high power position? We can't, they...

**UNK.:** [Inaudible]...

**MS. C. DARVILLE:** ...can't be trusted.

**UNK.:** ...applications.

**MS. C. DARVILLE:** So, we need to, to be.., hire people very carefully.

Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Reverend Burrs, Evelyn Clark, Dennis Clark.

**REVEREND W. BURRS:** Madam Chair...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Good evening.

**REVEREND W. BURRS:** ...Council. Three minutes, I could.., if you all woulda give me the time you all have, I'd'a know..., everybody know the facts, not what I think, what ya'll think, facts about the Charter Committee and all this is centering around the firing of the City Manager. I attend the first Charter Committee I attend. I can't tell ya'll the facts in, in no three minutes. Ya'll need to know, and these people need to know the facts. Their Charter Committee is political. The first meeting I attend to, it was at Lindsey Davis' place, they supposed to be for two hours. They discuss political issues for an hour and 45 minutes. The Clerk was there and I told them, I says, 'I will never attend one of ya'll meetings again,' but I did because they never discuss the Charter. They discuss political issues and I told the whole Committee that. Facts [inaudible] Minutes. I gave ya'll one copy of the Minutes, which was, uh, and if you read on that copy I gave you all, you will find out that you, most of ya'll are right, it is about the Charter is the heart of your City. Whatever you put in that Charter, that's bounding and it's being based on the, on the political issues that happen. They wants.., it's in the Minutes, the Mayor went to 'em and said, 'Let's..., ' somebody mentioned about getting rid of the Civil Service Board, read the Minutes. Strong Mayor. The Mayor met with 'em, it's in your Minutes, want to be a strong Mayor. Wrong.

Madam Chair, Madam Council, you all are right, you don't.., shouldn't have to.., the people oughta be familiar enough with the Charter to know what they need to do. They don't know about the Charter. They don't know about history of the City. And this Committee need to be stopped because ya'll don't know what they're doing in their meetings. I attend the meetings. I don't have no bones in this one way or the other. I had no qualms against firing Mr. Evans one way or the other. This thing, I said it before and I'll say it again, that hurt Mr. Evans more than ya'll firing him. I've been in this City for.., I work for the City 30 years, been in the City 50 some years, I seen City Managers go and come. Fired illegally. They went and got 'em another job with other municipalities and other government agencies. Why? Because they cause no uproar when they left. Facts. Because of this uproar, ain't nobody gonna touch Mr. Evans, because of this recall stuff. He ain't coming' back. He's gone. Let the man go and live his life.

I gave ya'll a copy of this. It's in it. The Mayor met with the Committee. There' the young man, over there and ask him about putting strong Mayor.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** No. That's not true. No, no that's not true.

**REVEREND W. BURRS:** Read the Minutes.

[Inaudible comment]

**MAYOR MASTERS:** No. I never asked 'em that, 'cause I never supported...Read the...

**REVEREND W. BURRS:** [Inaudible]...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you, Reverend Burrs.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** No, that's not true.

**REVEREND W. BURRS:** Read the second page.

[Inaudible audience comment]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Excuse me. Thank you, Reverend Burrs.

**REVEREND W. BURRS:** Read the second page. That's all... I'm not telling what I think.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Reverend Burrs, your time is up.

**REVEREND W. BURRS:** It's in the Minutes.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Who's next?

[Inaudible comment]

**MAYOR MASTERS:** [Inaudible]...

**REVEREND W. BURRS:** Ya'll don't want to know the facts.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Evelyn Clark, Dennis Clark, Felicia Wilder.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** That definitely was not true.

**MS. E. CLARK:** Good evening.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Good evening.

**MS. E. CLARK:** Good evening, dais. Evelyn Clark...

**UNK.:** Good evening.

**MS. E. CLARK:** 133 West 11<sup>th</sup> Street, Riviera Beach.

The City Council and Mayor have deliberated over the City owned property, specifically, Maritime Academy. As an 11<sup>th</sup> Street property owner, I strongly believe owners voices should be heard, acknowledged and addressed regarding the value of home ownership diminishing, remaining stagnant or increasing, based upon City Council and Mayor awarding a lease rental agreement to a social service group or

religious organization on this street. Entities have not given any consideration to change in the neighborhood, as their mission impacts our home ownership values and our quality of neighborhood. Nor have there been attempts to solicit any feedback from homeowners or renters regarding the organization's negative or positive impact to our daily lives. Fact, Healthy Living, Healthy Food pantry provides free social services. Daily, this nonprofit is packed and the street is busy. Does this one street need another one? No. The City has other empty facilities to offer these organizations. Homeowners and renters, our safety and our peaceful quality is compromised as these social services foster increased trash and garbage heaps, in addition to the patrons disposing their trash and garbage in the street, or on private property. These organizations or associations govern from behind fenced walls and never add any value to the neighborhood outside of the fence. For example, they do not clean up, nor do they cite beautification improvements, they do not properly pack or dispose of trash and garbage, they do not look out and they fail to report criminal activity. They do not engage with the neighborhood permanent residents, period, regarding any positive or negative feedback. They do not participate any community or association meetings to improve quality of community for all to enjoy. Personally, our property ownership has not increased in value. My time to deal with the messes left behind has increased and my tolerance has decrease. This property should be a revenue generator, not a lost cost center expense. For once, make decision' as CEO's and as a company.

In closing, I ask the City Council...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I don't care what he ask it's still wrong..

**MS. E. CLARK:** ...and the Mayor... Dennis, where's.., where are the pictures?

**MR. D. CLARK:** They got 'em.

**MS. E. CLARK:** I didn't want them to have them. I wanted everybody to see this stuff.

In closing, I ask the City Council and Mayor to remember this scripture, Matthew 7:12:

In everything, then do as others do unto you as you would have them do unto you.

This is the essence of the law and the prophets. I thank...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you.

**MS. E. CLARK:** ...you for your consideration.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you so much.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Dennis Clark, Felicia Wilder, Tommy Walker.

**MR. D. CLARK:** Dennis Clark, 133...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Good evening.

**MR. D. CLARK:** ...West 11<sup>th</sup> Street, Riviera Beach.

Just to ducktail into what my wife just indicated and what she just spoke about. The quality of life in our neighborhood is being, is being subsidized, I should say, or nonsubsidized, by the lack of the community quality. Your..., the, the debate over what's gonna happen to the Maritime Academy, and what they have left behind, it's a travesty in our neighborhood. You have three shipping containers that are wide open and now people are going in there and they're...

[Inaudible background comment]

**MR. D. CLARK:** ...just distributing whatever trash and garbage, all over the, over'..., all over the Westside of that Academy. So just tell me, tell me who is it that I gotta pay to make sure that our quality of life and our property values stay high? Who is it I have to pay? What is it that I have to do to ensure that? That's all I want. I didn't come here to ask for any money, I didn't come here to ask for your time, I just came here to make sure that the quality of our community is being considered. And you're now gonna be putting something else in there, that we don't have any control over, we're being ignored. I don't like it. I don't think it's fair to us and I sure as hell don't think it's fair to anybody else. Every neighborhood in this City has their own dichotomy about what's going on in their neighborhood. Everyone one of us do. Every homeowner that's in this room has to deal with what's going on in their community as individuals, but if we have the opportunity to come together and have one central task, one central theme, that's what it' called a community. One big community that's gonna do something. And not be all fractured up about nothing. This is a tra'..., travesty. It's ugly. It's disparaging. We even haven somebody selling cars over here on Broadway and 11<sup>th</sup> Street. They got their cars all lined up with for sale signs on 'em, right over here on Broadway and 11<sup>th</sup> Street. Is anybody doing anything about that? No. Not one thing.

So, let's say that your trash, you're, you're driving through your neighborhood on Saturday afternoon after they pick up the trash, right? Now, somebody's thrown out all this garbage and trash all over the place and now you gotta drive by it until Wednesday morning. Is that fair?

[Inaudible comment]

**MR. D. CLARK:** Is that fair?

[Inaudible audience comment]

**MR. D. CLARK:** No. It's not fair. So, I make my point. I, I appreciate your time.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you.

**MR. D. CLARK:** Thank you so much.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Felicia Wilder, Tommy Walker, Javarious Jackson.

**MS. FELICIA WILDER:** Good afternoon.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Good evening.

**MS. FELICIA WILDER:** And Happy New Year, 2018. To everyone in their respectful places, my name is Felicia Wilder and I have a home address at 541 Silver Beach Road and I'm still here discussing it after three years.

I will be homeless soon because I pay \$800 a week because the county has destroyed my home. I've been trying to get help for the last three years, in reference to my property. Doing all kind of illegal stuff and I've addressed it but God is still with me. They're tryna put me in the grave but they mess around and I'll be looking' down on them 'cause I don't plan on dying. I'm a fighter and I'm just asking the Council.., some of you have already came out and seen my home. It's unbearable. And, even Mr. Evans came out. Everybody comes out, they can't see how that man got away with \$64,000. I only have 39 left and it won't fix my house. I have a tub, rats die in there, air conditioner, I can't even live in it. It's unlivable. It's not right and I'm a fighter and I'm gonna still fight. I just wish the Council would get together and work together with me on this situation. It may seem minute to you 'til God put you in a situation where you're outta your home, living in a hotel paying \$800 a week. Not a month, a week, rent and I don't think it's right for them. I am a widower of a veteran, that's why I applied for the program. I am disabled, I am a senior citizen and I be treated like this in the City of Riviera Beach? I'd like for you guys to come together, not guys, I'm sorry for saying that, you all to come together as one and work together with me to try to see what someone can do to help me because, until you s'.., you, you can't my shoes, you wear your own shoes, to help me. I'm out of a home that was already paid for. They have \$100,000 down at, at the courthouse on my house. I can't live in it, it's unlivable. The windows are not even storm windows. You can shoot a, a bb gun in the windows. I just.., I'm just.., and I'm not a contractor but God has led me to that house every time they was doing something wrong. When I went to address Verdenia Baker, oh no, uh-uh. But let me tell you something, honey, just like you, you're afraid... When I come.., when I got paperwork, I got proof. Now, you go down there and t'.., I wa'.., I don't want to step on toes because you want your job. But if you're dealing with God, you're gonna step on some toes. You just do what's right. Just like I told Mr. Evans, you do what's right. What you did to me, it came back on so how do you feel? We have to do what's right, not what we feel but what's right. I have paperwork to show everything that I say but all I ask the Committee to do, everybody just meet up and come out to my home. The news, I don't care who come out, they need to see. I can talk 'til I'm blue in the face, you come out and see what's it like. One person came in and said, 'Where' your kitchen?' I said, 'You just passed it.' You can't even tell where they kitchen is. You can walk through one room and go to the bathroom, the door's way over here. Get your sledgehammers.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you...

**MS. FELICIA WILDER:** That's all...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...Ms. Wilder.

**MS. FELICIA WILDER:** ...I ask.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank...

**MS. FELICIA WILDER:** Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you. And that is one of the Item Mr. Davis added on so we'll, we'll get some input from, um, our Community Development and Ms. Hoskins to address.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Tommy Walker, Javarious Jackson.

**MR. T. WALKER:** Tommy Walker, 1582 West 9<sup>th</sup> Street.

Haven't been...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Good evening.

**MR. T. WALKER:** ...before you in a while. Happy New Year, Madam Chair, Council.

As hard as it is to get people to sit on our boards, to volunteer any, any, any, any board, not, not just talking about the Charter Review, you shut it down. What kind of message are we sending our residents? This seems like the same type of attitude or mindset that we had about the, the former City Manager. If it don't fit in our realm, get rid of it. I'm just so sick and tired of being sick and tired.

My daughter served on that board ya'll just shut down. Ya'll know how hard it took me to get her to serve on that board?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** It's not shut down.

**MR. T. WALKER:** She was an alternate. And now, you just sent a message that it don't matter. If it don't fit me, shut it down. This is Gotham and I'm gonna be Batman from now on. Every time... I ain't sitting' still no more. I'm gonna play my role as Batman. I don't care what Mr. Degraffenreidt say, I pay my taxes, I'mma say what I want to say for my three minutes, and ain't nobody gonna shut me down, cut the mic off, call the police. Don't make me no difference.

But I ain't here to talk about Ms. Botel or talk about Ms. Pardo or, or KaShamba, but you ain't gonna tell me what I'mma.., I am and cannot say when I get my three minutes. I'm gonna get my attorney and see how that thing go'. Look, my daughter served on that Board, she had to go.., she's a single mother. I used to babysit while she come to the Board. She has a, a master's degree in speech pathology and she

wanted to do things for the City. What kind of message are you sending the rest of the people that want to serve and help this community? Now, I understand, if anybody missed it, all of this centered around Jonathan Evans. It seems like you, you all heard that song called, "I Shot the Sheriff,"? It's like every time Jonathan plant a seed, you kill it before it go. Let's le'.., the man gone. He ain't coming' back, I get it. So, why ya'll still trynna kill it? That's my comment. I wish and I hope and I pray, as Batman, that we, this Council, get on some kinda even ground that we can move this City forward. But, you can best believe I'm gonna be Batman for.., until next March.

Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** As the public comes, I want folks to be very clear that the Board was not shut down, it was postponed until the new City Manager's hired to make some recommendations to the Board, as we discuss training and the purpose of the Board. So, that is not correct, the Board is not shut down.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Javarious Jackson.

**MR. J. JACKSON:** Good evening. Javarious...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Good evening.

**MR. J. JACKSON:** ...Jackson. Happy...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Good evening.

**MR. J. JACKSON:** ...New Year, to the Council.

I just wanted, um, I serve as the Chairman for the Charter Review Board so I just want to bring some clarification. First, I just want to start off by saying, as society change, so should government. Our Charter has not been looked at since about 2008 and so it's time for us to make some modifications to our Charter. It was a little disheartening that you guys postponed it until, you know, we had further training. It's just unfortunate because so many people have put in a lot of man hours to go over the Charter, to understand the Charter.

[Inaudible background]

**MR. J. JACKSON:** We, we've invited guest speakers to come out and educate us on the Charter. We have another guest we've.., we had proposed to have a guest speaker come on January 22<sup>nd</sup> and February 5<sup>th</sup>. We have a list of events going on that we planned and now you guys, just as momentum is going, you guys just halted that

momentum. Lynn Tipton, of the Florida League of Cities, was coming back to not only educate the Board, educate the community and as well, educate you guys on the importance of the Charter and some of the things that should be in the Charter. It does look like this is retaliation. Now, all of a sudden, we just want to shut it down. I'm sorry, that's, that's just what it looks like. You've had..., you guys had plenty of, plenty of opportunities to come and speak with that Board and give your recommendations. We've asked more than one time so, because you guys didn't give us those recommendations, we took it upon ourselves to go ahead and move forward. We can't wait until City Council decides that now we want to give you guys the recommendations, so we move forward. In my research on charter review boards, usually in the beginning, the board and the elected officials get together and hash out some of the areas that they want to look at in the charter. You guys did not do that, so what did you expect us to do?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** It wasn't our fault.

**MR. J. JACKSON:** As it relates to the strong Mayor, no one..., the Mayor, first of all, did not come advocating for a strong Mayor...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** That's exactly...

**MR. J. JACKSON:** ...so I [inaudible]...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...right.

**MR. J. JACKSON:** ...Reverend Burrs came...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** That's exactly right.

**MR. J. JACKSON:** When Lynn Tipton came and she gave..., provided us an overview of the different governmental structures in the State of Florida, she laid out all of them. On our Board, there's a divide on what structure of government we want. So, it wasn't to say we're going to go to a strong Mayor, so what we did was, we have four different municipalities, with four different charters, coming to explain their charters, explain what it is they're doing. We've already invited, and they've confirmed, [inaudible] Jeri Muoio, City Manager, Jeff Green, Mark Lauzier in Delray Beach, Town of Palm Beach Shores, Town of Palm Beach, they've confirmed that they're gonna come talk to us about, you know, they're charter, their structure of government and now we've shut down. Again, the momentum is now starting to move and it just feel' like, I, I don't know what a new City Manager is going to do. If it's training that you guys want to provide us, give us that training but, again, like I said, we're being educated by people from FCCMA and the Florida League of Cities. I don't know what o'..., what other training you would like us to have. So...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you.

**MR. J. JACKSON:** ...thank you.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Who's next?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** As, whoever's next...

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, that concludes...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I have a comment.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes. And then we're moving to Item 6A, CAP Government.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I, I want to thank the Chair of the Charter Committee for telling the truth. And so, Reverend Burrs, you know, if you're listening, I don't appreciate you keep coming up here taking pot shots at me, especially when it's not true, and that's another thing that you've said that was not true and he clarified it. I never asked for a strong Mayor. Thank you, Mr. Chair for telling the truth. I don't care what the Minutes said, please correct that because...

[Inaudible audience comment]

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...I am not in support... Excuse me. I am not..., I did not advocate, and I'm not advocating, this day or any other day for a strong Mayor. But maybe I need to, but I haven't as of yet.

So...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...that was not said and I'm glad you clarified it for the record. Minutes., if the Minutes says that, thank you for clarifying. And Reverend, please stop coming up here taking pot shots at me...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you, Mayor.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...'cause I'm not taking pot sh'..., pot shots at you.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Madam Chair?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Let's talk about the truth. Thank you, Madam Chair.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Madam...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** ...Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** 6A. CAP Government. Go ahead. Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Okay. Just for the record, the Chairperson of the Charter Review Committee said that this was retaliation. For the record, this was not retaliation and I don't know how many times we've discussed it.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** This is all about educating, um, that Board and the rest of the boards.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Thank you, ma'am.

**6A. ITEM NO. 6A – CAP GOVERNMENT**

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you. Ms. Hoskins or Mr. Davis, CAP Government. Who's speaking?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes, I just want to talk about, back in, so I can stand correct, back in June or July, we was discussing some issues, started back in April and March and it got to June, we started talking about the amount of money that the City was paying the CAP Government. And we, at that time, had directed the City Manager at that time to come up with a strategy, something that allows us.., gets us from up under the umbrella of CAP and spending so much of the public, public dollars, your dollars, taxpayer dollars. I would like to hear from everyone in that department, all the leadership, at that time, I think, in July, I think.., who was the Building.., Building Official was still Ms. March, Mr. Bailey, then it switched over to Mr. Gagnon. I would like to hear from all three parties on what are some of the recommendations you all made, when were they made and what action needs to happen to get us up under the CAP umbrella because, it's my understanding, at this point, we maybe have paid, maybe have paid CAP up to a million dollars. The Amrit we just had was here recently talking about three million.., potentially \$3,000,000 of permitting fees and I refuse to see the City lose that type of revenue of 60% of that to CAP. I definitely want to hear from Staff, Mr. Bailey, Ms. March, someone to tell us a strategy.., Mr. Gagnon, on where we are and how.., when are we gonna get this done, if anything at all? 'Cause I know we talked about a strategy with the previous Mana'.., Manager and you all went back but I'm waiting to hear something from somebody.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** When they come up, if you all could kinda.., since we're going into this subject, I know this particular Item I brought back a few times. If you could give the history, with this going back to, when was it they came on, maybe October, was it 2016 or something maybe a little bit before that. If we could have all of the history, 'cause I know Mr. Jones was here at that time as well, and that was at the point in which I brought it back, well I brought it up on the Agenda because of the amount of money that we were expending. I think at that time, right before or after that, our Building Official did resign and then I brought it back up probably in January or

February again to get some sort of update as to why we had gone beyond the amount of money to CAP that we had originally thought we approved. So, when you all come up to speak, please be sure to go back to...

[Inaudible audience comment]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...give all of that information and not just from the past couple of months.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair, before he move, I want to make sure he add something to it. Be clear in my recommendation for this Item, was the purpose of that we all supported this back in the fall, of this coming back. It was a consensus of the entire Board but it got to a point where nothing was happening but we didn't know what was going on and we all brought it back in April for a discussion. We gave Staff some recommen'..., an order on what to do and how to save money and how we don't want to continue privatization in this City and if..., and that's why I focused on April because that's when this Board gave a, gave a directive, by all five Members. So, I don't..., yes, tell the history but I want to know, once we gave an order in April, what happened from there. That's when..., let's be very clear in that, there's, there's no..., there's a gap of this stuff happened last year...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...when Mr. Ringle just up and left and took another job and it put us in a position, unfortunately, where it cost the City a lot of money because we didn't know that Mr. Ringle was gonna move on to another venue, all due respect to him, wish him well wherever he is, but we need to know, for those who don't know, like Ms., the Chair stated, what started this, how'..., when we got to April, this Board had a discussion. We gave some directives to Staff and what recommendations..., after April, what actions did Staff take? And, I want to hear from that point on 'cause I want to be very clear on where we are, what we've asked for and when did anything happen? Anything at all, because we're gonna have another three to \$4,000,000 coming through this City really soon and I don't want to see us give CAP anymore unnecessary dollars of the taxpayers. So, we're not gonna hide and play this game about when and history, no. There..., yes, there was a..., we had a City Manager that some was fighting' for, that believed in privatization and that's sad. And there was a plan put in place, by Staff, and we've been waiting on that plan and we'd just like to make sure that, if there's a plan, I want to hear it and the people need to hear it because we can't keep putting out millions of dollars.

Mr. Gagnon, sir, take your time.

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** Thank you. Jeff Gagnon, Acting Director of Community Development. Just for the record, I wasn't asked, prior to this meeting, to prepare anything on this topic but, hopefully, I can answer all of the questions of Council and I think that we do actually have a very good plan in place to address the concerns and help the City move forward expeditiously.

To respond to the Chair's request to provide some of the history and backstory, there was employee turnover, there was no succession plan in place. Specifically within the Building Division, we had a Building Official, however, there was no Assistant Building Official when the previous Building Official left so we didn't have a designated Staff member to fill that position. Since that time, the Assistant Building Official position had been created and is part of the budget now. We actually, just recently, completed interviews for that position. And it's.., it was an in-house interview so we're moving forward with that HR process currently, so one of the major elements that kind of created this domino effect in the beginning, has been solved for the, the moment. [Pause]. There were a few.., it wasn't only the Building Official position either. There were other planned retirements and unplanned departures of Staff members that created other gaps. So, that created the need, back in October of 2016, to go into agreement with CAP Government for services. Specifically, for the Building Division, for the Building Official position and also for plan review and inspection services. That Building Official capacity ceased for CAPs.., CAP Government shortly thereafter because we did hire a Building Official permanently, who is our current Building Official, Ms. Ladi March.

So, as we move through the process, you know, Council did indicate the need to fill vacant positions and it was made very clear that any sort of privatization was not a recommendation of the Council. Again, it was made loud and clear so, at that point, Staff moved, as quickly as possible, to advertise vacant positions and try to fill those vacancies. We did find that the market right now is extremely competitive and it's really skewed not in local government's favor and not in government's favor in general, being that the private market is able and willing to pay much higher salaries. So, we did see some instances where longtime City employees and also, very recently, we had an applicant that, I believe, took a, a private job versus continuing with the application process with the City. I'm guessing that was due to salary as, as a main focus. So, it's difficult to actively recruit and maintain and attract new employees based on the current market conditions because private market is absolutely booming and they can just pay more. So, if you're looking for a new job and you see the salary that seems to be very attractive, then, some people prioritize that over other benefits, health benefits, et. cetera.

So, since that time, let's see, in early July, I was named Acting Director of the Department of Community Development. During that, the budget process, the fiscal budget process, the Department was renamed to Development Services Division. There were some conversions about positions, as far as renaming existing positions, creation of new positions. And when I, when I took that acting role in July, I really had to sit down and see what puzzle pieces we had to work with. It seems as if there was a very strong attempt at filling all of the full-time positions to greatest extent possible. However, again, we, we found deficiencies in either the job requirements, as far as what the expectations were from the City, or other HR focused issues that we needed to work through internally, in order to fill the vacant positions. So, once we crossed that hurdle, we moved forward with advertising the vacant positions, then we began the interview process once we received qualified applicants.

So, we have made a few, a few hires since that time. We've hired a new..., excuse me, we've hired a new Building Inspector, which has been a key hire because that's taken pressure and stress off of our existing staffing, as well as also removing some of the time that has been contributed towards CAP. We still, currently, maintain CAP Government to provide third party, third party solutions and third party work fill-ins, I'll say, until we can permanently fill the other positions. We..., going through the application process and the interview process, we did find other qualified applicants. Some may be a better fit than others so we're still debating the best way to move forward but we are actively working on that. A major element is through that review of the current job titles, positions, expectations. We realize there was a few gaps that we needed to fill. So, actively, the, the timing... Excuse me. Actually, the timing of this Item is extremely timely because we have an Agenda Item that's slated to go before the Council on our upcoming Council meeting, which is I believe is the 17<sup>th</sup>, is our next meeting?

**UNK.:** Mhmm.

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** So, within that Item, Staff's been working and Staff being myself, Ms. Hoskins, Ms. Irvin, have been discussing the dynamics..., excuse me, also the Building Official, Ms. March, have been discussing the dynamics within the Building Division, discussing the potential need of creating new positions and that's something that we want to propose to the Council in the very near future.

So, I guess, in a nutshell, that was my synopsis of how we got to this point. Hopefully, I can answer any other questions that you may have.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. Did we have any public comment cards on this Item?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** No [inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. Mr. Davis.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Thank you, Mr. Gagnon. I have a question. How many interviews have we conducted? Well, how many vacancies, total, do we have back when you was... Was it Ju'..., July you took place?

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** So, for, for just focusing on the Building Division...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yeah.

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** Well, I'll, I'll start at the Assistant Building Official position. So, I believe it was in January or February of 2017, the position was created. However, in July, we realized that the funding allotment wasn't placed in the budget, just in error, so that was corrected which allowed us to move forward with interviews for the Assistant Building Official position.

Again, in July, I realized that the person that was functioning as our Assistant Building Official, actually had a different title, it was his previous title, functioning as a Building Inspector. So what that did, it allowed us to move that one Staff Member into the proper position that they're currently acting in, or at least, that's what's anticipated. It hasn't currently happened yet and it also fills up his existing position to potentially hire a new employee for that inspector's role. So, what we've been able to do is, we interviewed for one of the other Building Inspector roles that's been vacant. I'd say, for that position, we interviewed approximately six applicants.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Okay.

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** It could've been more than six applicants. We had a, a rather large applicant pool. However, the total number of qualified applicants wasn't, um, only a fraction of the applicant pool itself. I'd be happy to provide those numbers as well. Out of that interview process, we did find an eligible candidate that accepted a position so he's currently on Staff. He's been with us for a few weeks now and he's working out extremely well, which is great for everybody.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Great.

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** We also moved forward with interviews for our Plans Examiner position. We really have one candidate that seems to meet what our needs are. There's some...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Let me ask you a question, the needs are based upon the criteria that we advertised?

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** Right.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Okay.

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** Right. So, it's..., really, to, to just cut to the chase, we have one eligible candidate.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Okay.

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** Just period. And that eligible candidate would be great in the position, if it were to be offered but we're working through a few other issues that...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Okay.

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** ...hopefully, we can discuss at the upcoming City Council meeting.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So, what's the, what's the total amount of vacancies, in that Department, that we [stammer]... I know you don't have it all...

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** Yeah.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...so just kinda just...

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** So, we have our, our Plans Examiner position is vacant...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Mhmm.

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** ...and I believe we have two Building Inspector positions that are vacant.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Mhmm.

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** I didn't touch upon in my previous comments, our building permit technician position, where we had one vacant position, one filled. However, when you come into the Department, it appears as if we have three, however, we really only have one and we have two other employees that are kind of in f'.., I'll just say, in floating capacity, that are currently trying to resolve through HR what needs to happen in order to resolve their full-time status. So, we have multiple vacancies still.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Understood. So...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Can I ask a question about those vacancies? How long have those vacancies been unoccupied?

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** At least since July.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** And that's why I thought of that date.

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** But, prior to July.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Huh?

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** Prior to July.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** When?

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** The exact date?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Like, I mean, has it been two months, five months, ten years.

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** Some have been many months.



**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** Well, the, the interesting thing is, although I work there, knowing the technical capacity of how people are hired, is not something I was privy to at all times, so...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So, let me...

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** ...yes. I, I absolutely...

[Inaudible comment]

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** ...worked there

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Let me check someone.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** So, your question was...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** How long have the vacancies that he just explained, how long have they been vacant?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** For the Building Tech or the Building Inspectors?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** All of them.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** All of them?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm. Mr. Bailey, you...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** And, I'll let...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...were there...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** ...um, Human Resources, the Interim Human Resources Director answer that.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. 'Cause I, like Mr. Gagnon stated, he's only been over it since July and he is having a little difficulty being able to provide the information going beyond that, so, if someone can help us out with that.

**HUMAN RESOURCES IRVIN:** Eureka Irvin, Human Resources Department.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Good evening.

**HUMAN RESOURCES IRVIN:** The position of Building Inspector have been vacant since, I would say, mid-July, 2016.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm.

**HUMAN RESOURCES IRVIN:** And the position of Building Permit Technician, I'm not exactly sure but it would've been, I would say, mid 2016, as well, due to the retirement of the employee.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. So, are those the only positions that Mr. Gagnon referenced?

**HUMAN RESOURCES IRVIN:** And there's also Plan, Plan Examiner. That is also..., was maybe July 2016.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So, has it been that we haven't been getting qualified applicants or...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** It's because of the salaries.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Hmm?

**HUMAN RESOURCES IRVIN:** Well, we've made multiple attempts at recruiting. Those positions are very technical and they are hard to fill.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Alright.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** We also have to remember that one of the issues that we discussed was cha'..., was the ch'..., part of the challenge was the dollar value that we were offering...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Right.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...and that we were not comparable tow what private sector was giving and certainly we can't go far outside that realm but we talked about the fact that the dollar value that we were, we were offering in salaries for those various positions were low and we were not getting the candidates that were willing... At least, this is a part of the discussion that I remember having, that we were not getting applicants in that were willing to take the salary that we were offering and they w'..., they were looking for higher salaries. That was a part of the discussion as well, was it not? Staff?

**HUMAN RESOURCES IRVIN:** That is correct. You know, we are not the only municipality that is having issues with filling their building...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**HUMAN RESOURCES IRVIN:** ...inspector positions. Yes, we are competing with the private sector, who's able to offer much higher salaries.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** And to back discuss, at that time, that did come up, but the issue that we was also talking that day, there was also discussions that CAP, at the time, may have been recruiting some of the applicants that were applying for the jobs.

**HUMAN RESOURCES IRVIN:** Right.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Which mean they was gobbling.., trynna gobble up folks to keep the contract with us, potentially. And at that time, that's fact. You know, that, that, that was out there and, and that's why I was being aggressive because I didn't want to continue privatization, I wanted Staff to bring a plan on how we can compete with that and also, stop spending so much money. And that's why I asked to hear from.., 'cause, at one time, Mr. Bailey was over there in Community Development then, you know, he was moved to another department to help the City out and the citizens from that division but I also want to hear from him as well, all due respect to Ms. Irvin.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And, and...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** And Ms. March...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...to piggyback...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...as well.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...piggyback, on what you said...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Because Code.., Code Enforcement [inaudible] back over there now as well.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Right. And, and again, like you said, you know, CAP was getting quite a bit of funds from us and that was why I brought it up in October 2016 and, I believe, January of 2017 again.., or February 2017, or it mighta been a little bit after that, I'm not sure. But I did bring it twice. I brought it four times. Is that.., four times? Was it [inaudible]...

**PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** Yes, ma'am.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...that many times?

**PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** I stood before you four times...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** ...to answer the question...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So...

**PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** ...what was going on with CAP.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So, we've been talking about this for a while now, going..., dating bac, at least...

**PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** March, is when...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...October...

**PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** ...it was initiated

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...2016, when Mr. Jones was here.

**PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm.

**PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** CAP came online in March of '16 at the exodus of the previous Building Official. We began this very comprehensive discussion in March of '17. We discussed it approximately four times in front of the Council. You'll recall that, in order to reconcile our accounts, we owed CAP, at the time, approximately \$400,000...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Right.

**PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** ...in March, when we had to clear that up. At that time, there was a discussion towards privatization as it went in the budget process. As Mr. Gagnon said, this Council said absolutely not and gave the Staff direction to create a system in the program, change job descriptions, do what needs to be done to have this come in-house. Knowing the projects that had been approved in the site plan process on Singer Island, the Gateway and other large scale projects, there was also discussion of integration of Code Enforcement and how the two played together, building and code. There was also a third directive to find a point of entry for local Riviera Beach residents to get into that department because all of the current jobs require certifications simply to apply.

So, Mr. Davis, to your previous question, all of those directives were taken into account when I'd initially proposed a budget in, I believe, it was late May or June during the budget process.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** There were realignments of the department funding sources, job descriptions and everything as outlined from this Board, and it went through the budget process. Again, that, that was the time when the privatization because the...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Stammer]...

**PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** ...main driver...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Mr. Bailey.

**PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** ...of the conversation. Hmm?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Let's, let's pause for a minute. You say it went through the budget process, but it never made it to this Board. So what happened?

**PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** As I was about to say, there was a push for privatization...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** By who?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Again.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** By who?

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** The Manager.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Tell the truth.

**PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** Um, [pause]. The process that we follow as directors is...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** But, hold on.

**PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** ...we submit our...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Hold on, hold on. Hold on one minute, Mr. Bailey. I find it very strange that we're trying to now come up with the reasons to justify...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...the misfeasance.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Who you protecting.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And, and it's very odd that this same issue that we're talking about now and so concerned about, having given CAP all of this money, was the exact same reason I brought this up back in October 2016, when Mr. Danny

Jones was over this. Now, all of a sudden, today, January 3, 2018, we're concerned about all the money CAP has been receiving. CAP has been receiving money for a while now and they were receiving quite a bit and it went beyond the amount that we knew.., at least the Board, knew about because it should've been somewhere around \$140,000. By the time Mr. Evans came on in March, it had gotten to about four, three hundred, \$400,000. And, at that time, I asked for a presentation...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** July.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...I asked Mr. Bailey.., he had, actually, kinda just came on but I did and Mr. Evans was trying to speak on it but he had just taken the position. So, I asked for Mr. Danny Jones to provide us a little more background. So, when we have this conversation tonight and trying to go all deep and find out what was the plan, please do not leave out this did not just start a couple of months ago. It did not. CAP has been receiving money for a while. They were even here and came and gave a presentation and part of it was because we did not have the Building Official, they did have to continue on for a little while longer than was planned. So, we need to explain all of that and let's not pick and choose the amount that we want to say. Because it, it's, it's very obvious of what you're trying to do but if we're gonna tell the story, tell it all. Let's go back, let's talk about how the, the, the storage, Cold Storage was built. I mean, let's talk about...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Let's talk...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...all of that stuff.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yeah. Let's talk about [inaudible]...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Because that occurred...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Let's talk about [inaudible]...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Excuse me. That occurred well before March.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Madam Chair?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. March 2017. This information is not brand new at all. Now, in regards to the pay, we said that we're having trouble recruiting people and getting them because of the pay, we were doing a pay rate study, so I'm thinking we were supposed to get that information somewhere around this time now, January, February and if we needed to modify something, that was part of what the pay rate study was going to be, I thought. So... I'll let you continue but just please tell the whole story. Let's not pick and choose what we want to talk about.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Ma'...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Hold on. Madam Chair, I had the floor and then the line of questioning. I'd like to take it back.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** You have the floor again now.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Okay. Let's be very clear here, I do support telling the story and I said please tell it to the point of July because I know we had two folks run that department and that's where we got to that. Now, I only can speak for me, Councilman Davis, the District 5 [inaudible] representative, who promised the people he would be focused on creating jobs and opportunity to protect this City. I only can speak for me. I'm not here to protect the former City Manager, Mr. Evans. Okay? We all govern differently so don't accuse nobody of..., don't be mad for somebody telling the truth.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** No.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** The truth is...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...You're telling...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Hold on.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...half of the truth.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** The truth is...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Half.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...up until July, June 24<sup>th</sup>, before June 24<sup>th</sup>, Mr. Evans was directed by this Board, including yourself, to come up with a plan to do what? Get us from up under CAP. His answer to that plan, on June 24<sup>th</sup>, was privatization. This Board, to the respect to Lynne Hubbard, flipped, and I support her flipping, I flipped right with her and I flipped with Pardo and you guys supported it but we flipped because he talked about privatizing this City on var'... [stammer], code and with, um, Code Enforcement and this Department and had no study to justify him doing this, eliminating all these jobs in various departments. I will stand by these wonderful people in this City, I will not be silenced on the truth and we said no. On June 28<sup>th</sup>, after this Board said no and three of us flipped out, I'll say it again, three of us flipped out, he came back four days later and pushed it again to this Board, after we told him no. I never once stated why I fired him and I don't want..., in this discussion, I'm trying not get into that position but to deal with the issue, we gotta deal with the truth. CAP came here for undue circumstances. We, as a Board, all five of us say, 'Hey, how do we get up under the umbrella?' The answer to, to [stammer], his solution, on June 24<sup>th</sup>, you saw it, in this building across the way, he said privatization. On June 28<sup>th</sup>, he said privatization.

[Inaudible audience comments]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** He kept pushing his agenda and, when he didn't get that, he also supported other but [inaudible]. I want you just to continue telling the truth. This ain't about Mr. Evans, this about all these jobs in the City, a \$72,000,000 operational budget and the fact that we got all this development coming to the City and we want to create jobs and get all the money we can, for the taxpayers. So sir, I will not bully you. I just want to hear the truth. We done dealt with this on numerous occasions and because we're playing politics, that's why we're still spending up all this money.

So, I just want to hear, what was your plan, with, with your budget, that you submitted to Mr. Evans, what happened to your budget?

**PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** Alright. So, you asked...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Your budget.

**PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** You asked two questions there so I'll talk process first. When.., March or April, Directors are given a directive to put together a new...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** ...proposed budget. Those budgets are proposed to the Finance Department and they're aggregated together and it works with the executive team. Each of the department typically meet with that executive team to talk about who, what, when, where, get clarity on why you made the request you, you've made. Then it's consolidated and then it comes before you with this first, sort of, reading. So, process wise, we turned in a budget to the executive team, Finance and the Manager's group. So, to why you saw privatization versus the plan that you had asked for, when we submit it, it goes through that process and you see what is decided on...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So, let me ask you a question. In your plan, did it have privatization a part of it?

**PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** No, sir. Before that, because you'll recall in March when we were up here talking about CAP, you gave direction to create a plan where we have the appropriate staffing to work with the development that we know is coming. The plan that I proposed added multiple plan reviewers, inspectors, brought Code Enforcement underneath the Building Department so they could work hand in hand with all the issues because, you will recall, we had just come out of the first part of the year, with a very healthy Code discussion about how our Code Enforcement is going to contribute to the success of the City. So, bringing these two departments, these two divisions together into one unified front, handling all of the very similar issues, was the plan that we proposed.

In addition, in order for that third leg that you had requested a point of entry for the department where, to be a code officer, you need to have the code officer credentials, to be a building inspector or plans reviewer, you need to have those credentials. There is

no point of entry for a young person, in this community, to get into that group. We created, uh, we proposed, I should say, a.., I think I titled it, a Code Technician. Somebody about 19 to 25, some, some aptitude, attitude, drive, who we could bring in, who was about a half a notch below an official Code Inspector, or, we change the name of the Code Inspectors, that could come in, put in time and get the credentials on the job, while there's a lotta functions that we needed as you, as you've seen how things work, just to go out and do. Be our eyes and ears in the field but not all the up to the level of the responsibility of a Code Inspector. That hierarchy, the ladders that we created so an individual could come into this organization at 19 to 25, become a Code Technician, get their Code Inspector license, get their Plans Reviewer license, get their [stammer] the Building Inspector license, because one of the other elements we created was a hybrid Code Inspector, Building Inspector to where now both your Building Inspector and code people have one more leg to go up to by having both. When development is heavy, they're working on the Building side, when development is light and you need more code issues, they slide on the Code side so that you don't ever have to really lay anyone off and you can flex them between how your, your work load is.

All that was built into the model proposed.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So, how many positions would, would you propose [[inaudible]]?

**PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** We were going to add, I believe, four or five positions.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Let's start with the minimum. So, you.., we woulda had four positions, potentially, to discuss approving that would allow us to address issues like Ms. Darville come up, Mr. Clark keep coming up, so we can more folks on the ground to keep this City clean and inspected properly so we can get economic development flowing through this City and we can start telling some good stories.

So, that's the piece that never made it to this Board. Is that what you're telling me?

**PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** The process is, the Department submits it to the executive office, and the...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** And that's where...

**PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** ...executive office...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...it stopped at?

**PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** The Department submit' it to the executive office and the executive office brings their proposal to the Board.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So, with those technician positions, what other positions do you also put in place that kinda [stammer], that we missed out on during that presen'.., that we should've had in our presentation?

**PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** The exact same positions Mr. Gagnon mentioned. You need a P'.., another.., an additional Plans Reviewer, you need more inspectors. There was the Building Technician, your front of office staff to receive all of these individuals coming in to the front office for building permits and asking other questions, as well as the positions that I described in sort of the hybrid Code Enforcement technician and the Code Enforcement slash Building Inspector position. So, those will be your.., sort of your five new ones and you would rework some of the existing vacancies in the Staff. 'Cause that.., please keep in mind, Code also had four vacancies at the time, Building had four or five vacancies so it would be the appropriate time, when people are not occupying those positions, to reword job descriptions and reorganize that entire group to build, basically, what you directed us to do.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So, for us to potentially do something like this, we would have to review what's in the budget that you were asking for, before you can move further on that potential plan? Is that the case?

**PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY:** I believe the plan that Mr. Gagnon has just described is, I can't tell you it's identical but, from what I understand and I'll leave it to him to talk about, what he had intended on bringing to you, here...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Understood. So, Mr. Gagnon, a question. Is there enough money to do.., to support your plan? [Pause]. In the budget?

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** The way that our budget was laid out, I thought it was interesting because it almost anticipated one of two things happening. Um, either, again, filling vacant positions or continuing to pay CAP. The, the problem is, the money allocated didn't really truly substantiate either one of those things, in my opinion. So...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** And that's, that's what...

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** The, the...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...that's what I'm asking. So...

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** Right. So.., I'm sorry. So, we're, we're at a point, I feel we're at a point where it's unusual, I think, in some circumstances, following a budget process and budget cycle...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Mhmm.

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** ...to have a certain department or division come back to Council and say, 'These are things we still

need because they were adequately addressed through the previous budget process,' but that's where we might be next meeting.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Mr. Gagnon, I have a great deal of respect for you, you understand that but [inaudible].., we're spending money where we are, please do not hesitate to come to this entire Board so we can support you supporting this City. Okay? I know that this year's been a very difficult year for a lot of our Staff and we want all of our Staff in this City to understand that this support'.., this Board here, supports the employees. Our job is to make sure you all have what you need and if you guys have submitting something that never made it to this Board, you know, I know that temperature now is not, not what it used to be. We, we must get this done. What I would like for you and your team to get together and if.., and if there's a budget that's not in place, if the, if the money's there, do what you need to do getting' those people in because it's costing us money. But, if it's not there, get with, with, uh, our City.., well, our City Manager team, ya'll leadership, just like we talked about the building, the public safety and all that, get with leadership, bring an Item t the next Agenda...

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** Yes, sir.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...and find a... Ask us.., let us know what you need to create jobs and a safe City, a clean City to make us all look great. Alright?

**ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON:** Understood.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I have a question.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Ms. Hoskins?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Yes, ma'am.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Do you have anything to add in regards to the positions and not being allocated? Were you privy to any of the conversation that was taking place when they were meeting with the different department heads? 'Cause I know they were allowing the employees to give a lot of input for the budget, as well as the department heads. So, do you recall or was that something that you all brought up when you had those... Hold on. When the budget sessions were going on, were those items brought up? Do you recall?

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** When we were meeting with the City Manager, at that time, the, um, I remember Mr. Bailey bringing forward his plan.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** And, I'm not sure what happened in between him presenting the plan and the budget being presented to the City Council.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** And I believe when it was discussed during the budget adoption, I remember you.., remember the City Council going through each individual department saying what positions that would add and would not add. Now, at that time, the City Manager did not put those positions before you all. And I believe there was some additional discussions, um, [pause], I, I don't remember what happened after.., whe'.., once we got to Community Development. I think there was gonna be some type of reorganization or something, I'm not sure. I remember the name changing, bringing.., taking Code Enforcement from under police.., under the Police Department back to Community Development and [pause], with the inspections, I'm not sure what exactly happened with those positions.

[Inaudible audience comment]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. And s'...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** To piggyback off of Ms.., our City Manager, great City Manager is suggesting, at that time, she's definitely correct, when the conversations, um, the City Manager, at that time, was ha'.., I went through two, two meetings where he sat down with departments, and it was a great meeting as he sat with Staff and had discussion but the only problem was, when he had those meetings with departments, none of the department heads were present. So, he received information from the employees, never took it to department heads, never brought it to this Board and implemented a plan... When we talked about moving and I suggested and I s'.., and that was one of my initiatives that I really focused on which was moving it from Code Enforcement back over to under Community Development and, to keep that separated, he created this term called what, Code Compliance so he could keep it as an independent department and privatize, like he suggested to us. On June 24<sup>th</sup>, we said no, on June 28<sup>th</sup>, we said no and when he didn't get the answers, he would run to friends and they would come to the Council meetings and they would say that we're, we're trying to micromanage the City Manager. And, and numerous occasions, and I can state this, that I was really.., I would get approached by individuals in his camp because we were doing things for the people and when he wouldn't get his way, they would show up at the office and hang around City Hall and say.., and make [stammer]... I filed a complaint one time to the Police Department, actually twice. Because, when we're fighting for the people, we're fighting for the jobs. His answers were privatization, over and over again.

Now, like I said, we all govern differently. I'm not mad if anyone govern.., don't want to see people get jobs. I'm not mad if that's what you want, if you want to support recalls and all that stuff and give jobs away, I'm not mad. That's your opinion. But don't get upset with me when I, when I see these young ladies in this community have an

opportunity to be building inspectors, code enforcement. These are jobs that we can give these young ladies, through our department, with valor [inaudible], as they graduate from high school and give them proper training before they learn bad habits in other entities, in their backyard. And I took that personal. That's not why I fired him. Because, if I wanted to fire him, I'd'a fired him on June 24<sup>th</sup>, on my birthday. It wouldn't have made it to June 28<sup>th</sup>. Right, Mayor? You know...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Ch'...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...you know we had a discussion. That's another thing. But, it's very clear, the team has a plan in place that never made it to this Board and we..., all the public, everyone that's listening, and I guarantee you it won't make the news. That privatization was rammed down the public throat, there are certain folks that fought harder than others, while we all did support it, I'm very fair. We all did support it. [Inaudible]...

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Support what?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** 5-0.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No. We all supported each other in making sure that didn't happen.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Oh.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Okay? No. You, you know where I stand with that. I, I will resign before I support something like. But anyone that comes to this City within the first 45 days, had not study in place, met with Staff, refused to bring the recommendation to the Board, to save us money. Okay? And create jobs for these young people that we're trynna say, 'Hey, we don't want you picking up guns, we don't want you selling drugs, we don't want you selling alcohol, we want you to do something positive. Here's a job, here's a retirement, here's healthcare.'

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Um...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Mr. Chair...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Wait, hold on, hold on.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** [Inaudible]...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No, hold on, hold on. No, no, no. I got my..., my family watched me get whooped from September to the new year. And my grandmother, as she do well, and it's been difficult for me, and my family, as they get

ol'.., as they get older. And you have no idea what people go through in their personal lives when their grandparents get older, they have to witness this on their', potentially, last days. And I'm gonna fight, not just for them, but if something happened to one of them tomorrow, they're gonna know I fought for their future, which is their neighbors, their grandchildren and you all heard the truth. And Channel 5, if you are.., the good reporters you are, you need to take this story and say, 'you know what, I screwed up in the worst way, we need to tell the truth on Riviera Beach is a great place,' and I gua'.., and I guarantee you, you'll be a real news station then. Okay?

[Inaudible audience]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** You, you... Listen, negativity is one thing but what you do to people, will hit you somewhere one day. And I know your bosses probably, you know.., I understand, you know [inaudible]...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mr. Davis.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...what you gotta do. No, no, don't Mr. Da'... No.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Let's, let's...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...just get back...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No, no, no, no.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...on topic. You can keep...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No, no. I...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...talking but just get on topic.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No, no, no.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** 'Cause you're sounding like Trump now, okay?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Trump?

[Audience chuckle]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Ms. Hoskins [inaudible]...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Wait. Hold on, hold on, hold on.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...do you want to add [inaudible]...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Hold on, hold on, hold on.

[Inaudible dais comments]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Wait. Hold on, hold on, hold on.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Did you want to add something to [inaudible]...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I don't... No. Let's be clear here...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No. I have the floor. Until someone stops me, I have the floor.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Go ahead.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Now, his name is President Donald Trump, whether you like him or not.

[Inaudible audience comments]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Okay?

[Inaudible audience comments]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Just like, that's my Mayor, Thomas Masters, whether I like him or not.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** [Chuckle].

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** His name ain't Bishop, his name is Mayor Thomas Masters.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Now, back to this here. I'm not gonna play politics with you.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** It's 9:00 o'clock.

[Inaudible comment]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** The team has gave.., the team has given us...

[Inaudible comments]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...a vision on what's been taking place, whether you want to listen to it or not. All I'm asking for is the support of [stammer], my colleagues because I do believe that there's some good Board Members up here, to allow Staff to bring something back at the very next meeting, where we can get from up under the

umbrella of CAP, stop the privatization, shit it down, put people to work and change the image of this City.

**UNK. AUDIENCE:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Now, that.., I don't think that's something requires a motion, that requires help...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Mr. Davis.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...common sense... Ms. Hubbard, now I allow you.., when you do your thing, I don't stop you. I want to sometimes but...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** No. I just wanted you to know that I did want to say something.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Go ahead.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** I wasn't trying to stop you.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Go, go ahead. I pause...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well, Ms. Hoskins...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I pause, I pause.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Ms. Hoskins...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...was next. Hold on. Are you finished, Mr. Davis? [Pause]. Mr. Davis, are you done?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I pause.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. So, Ms. Hoskins wanted to give a little input.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** I just wanted Council to know that I hear them loud and clear, that the.., an Item will be brought back on the next Agenda and we're gonna offer you two options, as it relates to position'.., positions in the Building Inspections Division. So, an Item will be brought back to the City Council for you to amend the budget.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Ms. Hubbard.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Madam Chair, Mr. Davis, thank you.

One thing I want Staff to include and consi'.., consider or point out in their, in, in the plan that's being developed or that's already developed, is the, the inspections of our stores, if you will. Because, as, as Mr. Lloyd Brown constantly points out, the condition of our stores. I understand that through Code Enforcement, they were saying, 'Well, hey, what we do is basically outside. What we look at is outside. However, if.., when Code Enforcement comes under building and building.., and they are inspecting, they're supposed to go inside so they're the eyes and ears for the pol'... the, the police, for the Building Officials, for the.., for any.., for the Health Department, or whatever, so that we can see what's going on and I think that's where the tra'.., that's where they would be trained properly as what to, what to look for and what to do and I do think.., I think that, that the Code Enforcement Department needs to work, needs to understand that they have to work as a unified department, or a section or, or a sector of our community development. So, you got the, the Code Inspectors, you got the Building Inspectors, you.., we're, we have to work together because that's how we're going to know what's going on in our City and I think that once Code Compliance, or Code Enforcement officers are, are trained and our Building Inspectors is.., by them going under that department, they would definitely know what to look for because right now, they haven't lived up to their potential. They've only been going outside, looking. If they look at those retail stores and the things that.., and I use the word retail because my understanding now is we have to look at all of our stores as retail and then that leaves them with certain alliances.., allowances. So, the overlay is going to help us put in, I guess, different, or special requirements.

Mr. Gagnon, and my.., I want to make sure that we, that we add that piece in there, that we have an adequate number of inspectors, building and code, working together to make this City look more attractive, more aesthetically pleasing. There's a lot of things that we can do that's not gonna take a while lot of money to, to bring this City to a level that it's, it has a more respectable eye appeal, if you, if you will. I hope.., I agree with Mr. Davis 100%. I believe that all those jobs, as many of them as possible, need to be filled locally. We need to fill those jobs locally and we need to have that come back to us next week. What I don't want it to get bogged down in HR either. I want it to hit the street as soon as possible. As soon as we can get those jobs out there and start interviewing and fill those positions, we need to do.., we need to see that, that, that happens.

**UNK.:** Yes, ma'am.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Thank you, Mr...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...Davis and Madam Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So, is that the end for this Item? We.., they have their direction?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes. Yes, ma'am.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Yes, ma'am.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright.

**CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** We have it. Thank you.

**6B. ITEM NO. 6B**

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** 6B. **PLAN FOR MS. WILDER**

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** We're all aware of the historical [stammer] issue with Ms. Wilder. This is an Item I just wanted to discuss. It's been a very rough situation to witness someone, her capacity who served in the school system and helped so many people, try to get something that work', you know, for her. There have been some difficulties but I wanted to discuss how do we get our Staffs to work with the county staff, not to throw anyone under the bus, to focus on a, a executed plan that, that make sure that, that inspections and everything 's done properly and that there gotta be some way, all the money that Ms. Wilder has spent on hotels for the last two years, that someone.., some agency, that we can create a strategy, can help her with some of the funding that she's even lost. If that's something that can be done. I think we need to be aggressive with having Staff working with the county staff to make sure that this story... You can't fix what happened but you can do better from what happened.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mr. Davis...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** And...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...could we have someone from the.., that department kinda give a little background because everybody may not be aware of what the situation is and...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** That's fine.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...how did we get to this point and who, you know, what program it is. You're gonna come up?

[Inaudible comment]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** What the program is, how much the City is involved, how much the Palm Beach County is involved because, from my understanding, this was a Palm Beach County project but, again, that's, you know, I want to where, where does Riviera Beach fit in with this? And, for the public, to let them know what we're talking about.

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** Absolutely. My name's Ladi March, Building Official for the City of Riviera Beach. The matter came to our attention with regards to the situation Ms. Wilder found herself in, I would have to say shortly, uh, March, April. I think she had brought it directly to the Building Department. What had ha'...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** But wh'..., but when did, when did she start having the work done? It goes back to when?

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** It, it predates me. So, what I will tell you is, I believe under the old Building Official, she had already begun the process of rehabilitation or remediation to the unit that she lived in.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm.

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** That program was administered through a program proffered by Palm Beach County. There's several different programs under that remediation program so I'm not sure which one it was but, ultimately, long story short, what happened was, she was approved for the program, construction began on the home, the second mortgage was applied to the home and that was indicative of the fact that the payouts had been made because that's typically how it goes. In order for the payouts to be made, what happens is, someone from the City will do an inspection, someone from the City did do an inspection on her property on a couple of occasions. They did not pass. There was a memo in the system that indicated that one of our inspectors even, the GPS did not indicate that it had even stopped by. Now, that may be some motive hearsay or whatever the case may be but it was documented.

How the payouts were signed and how they came to be, I'm not sure. Those payouts went to the contractor on the property.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** But the payout happened through the county?

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** The payout happened through the county. Where we became involved is, the county.., once she began really bringing to the forefront that I have this, you know, enormous second mortgage on my house and I'm still down to studs, someone needs to come and look at it. The county's position was, 'Well, we would not have paid unless the City had conducted inspections.' And so, what that did was put us in the position of defending against having approved, or signing off on inspections that just simply did not pass or meet code.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Right. Okay. And so, with that.., when that happened, and correct me if I'm wrong, I know you're out there Ms. Wilder, that was a little.., about three.., two, three years ago and I believe there was, when Ms. Ruth Jones was here, the investigation was done regarding that inspe'.., that person, whoever hat person was, who was no longer in that department anymore, passed the inspection and it should not have passed. There sh'.., I, I can't recall if there should have been or they did provide some sort of reprimand but I do believe that person wound up leaving the City...

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** What...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...who did the passing of that inspection, who should not have.

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** What we need to be clear on is the fact that the scope of work associated with the rehabilitation on Ms. Wilder's property, would not have been limited to a single inspection.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** There was not one payout, there were several in such a manner that you had a \$68,000 payout in totality. So, that meant that somewhere along the process, there would have had to have been several inspections. Now, again, most of this predates me but when she brought it to my attention, I believe it was myself, the City Manager and the Mayor, we came out to the property and then, after that, she contacted Councilwoman Hubbard and she came out to the property., What we did to ensure that we were on the same pages, we scheduled a third visit so that both myself, as the presentative as the Building Official for the City, and the representative as the Building Official for the county, Mr. Doug Wise, came out to the property to, basically, follow up on how these payouts came to be and whether or not the inspections were passed. And, at that point, somewhere in the process of trying to find a solution, attorneys got involved and the Staff was given a directive not to [pause], to allow Legal to work with Ms. Wilder to remedy her situation.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And that was because... At that point, were we taking a stance that we were..., because it's a county project, but the City was, basically, trying to correct a wrong because of the inspections? Um, the inspector passing them and it shouldn't have been passed? How..., I'm still trying to figure out how do we...

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** Again, our records only reflect that, based on what we have, at that time, the inspector conducted that one inspection. He was reprimanded because there were multiple inspections on multiple properties that he was just doing drive-by's on and not necessarily getting out and putting an eye on the projects. Her's happened to be one of...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** One of them.

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** ...them on one occasion but we had documentation..., no documentation where rough electrical had been passed, our Department had actually failed it. We had documentation where the structural components, the windows and what not, they were not inspected but they were paid out on. We even went so far as to look at the payout applications and go line item by line item. We got an opinion from the Building Official from the county, I wrote an opinion. It's all documented in our emails and, based on that, it was then forwarded by the county to their legal department and once it escalated to that level, we were asked to remove ourselves from the equation.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Now... Okay. So, I..., 'cause I really, I really..., and I, I've met with Ms. Wilder and Ms. Hubbard has I know, probably almost all of us up here have met with Ms. Wilder over the past two or three years and she's come up to the podium numerous times about the issue and I just was trying to figure out where the City came in. I know one of the things that she was requesting was for the City to assist her in paying her, her rent or the hotel while she was having to..., having, having had to stay in the hotel and so some of the relief, I think, was for the City to pay those rent...

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** Well...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...payments for or at least those, those lease payments from th...

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** If I'm not...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...the hotel.

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** ...mistaken, when we looked at the payout and then when we looked at what the second mortgages equated to on this unit, it appeared as if the cost associated with her living in a hotel was also being tagged on to the remediation. So I'm not sure of when they were making the payouts that they were making payouts for the work done and payouts for the hotel or trynna put it together but, essentially, our role was, and what she came to us for was, 'You guys need to come out and look at my property. There was an inspector here, it did not pass.' What the county has passed, they say the passed and paid out because they're saying the City would have conducted an inspection, or multiple inspections and we would not have signed off on paying out unless we had. That is where our Building Department got involved because we had, in fact, with the exception of that inspection record that we had, where that gentleman was reprimanded for not conducting an inspection by getting out of his vehicle. The other inspections we conducted, had failed. Someone had actually gone out and failed in that process. So, our argument or defense when attempting to defend against the fact that somehow we cosigned on Mrs. Wilder being in the position that she was, was no we didn't because we've done what we're supposed to do by checking this box, this box, this box. This is something that you need to remedy.

What happened was, once we had management out, once the members of the legislative body became in'..., involved and came out, it was redirected towards, you know, more or less a cry for help. What do we do because, when you put eyes on the property, there is the realization that the unit is down to the studs. There is a bathtub in there and there is studs and then there's nothing else.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Question. Madam Chair? Let me interrupt you, Ms. March. Question. When you say failed, not that we failed in our duty, we failed what we...

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** We fai'...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...saw as an inspection?

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** We failed...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** It's a failed...

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** ...the inspection.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...inspection. We, we marked...

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** We, we marked...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...we marked this as a...

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...bad project. Because I don't...

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...want the public to think that we failed or was derelict in, you know, our duty. I., what you're meaning in terms of construction and inspection, is that this failed the process, this did not meet standards to pass the test?

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** The unit failed. When we went back and looked at all the specs and drawings associated with what was proposed, it didn't meeting the criteria. I'm not quite sure how we got where we got but the bottom line is...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I, I just want... Is Mr. Degraffenreidt over there? Mr. Degraffenreidt?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I., like I said, I know Ms. Wilder., one of the requests was to., for the City to pay the rent payments for the hotel while she was still living in it. Is that something that we, as a City, would be able to do? [Pause]. I can't see you, so.

[Inaudible dais comments]

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** There, there would have to be some culpability, or legal responsibility, on the City's part in order to pay that.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Are you...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** [Inaudible] county...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...familiar with this situation at all?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** No. I'm listening to it very carefully.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** And what, what, what's missing and from what I'm hearing, is that somehow the contractor was paid by the county and there were no passing inspections by the City.

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** That, that's correct.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** How did that happen?

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** Again...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** That, that's why...

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** ...I have it...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...that's why I got...

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** ...a comprehen'...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** That's why I'm lost.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Oh that... Yeah. That...

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** We forwarded...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...it was, like, about two...

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** ...a comp'...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...or three ago.

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** We forwarded a comprehensive report to the executive office. That report including our findings, along with...

**UNK.:** Okay.

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** ...the position of the Building Official from the county.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** We were both in alignment when we submitted the reports. After the reports were submitted and reviewed, somewhere midstream, Ms. Wilder secured an attorney, there were conversations with executive management and members of the count. We were then advised to allow Legal, which I'm surprised you guys didn't get it, to remedy the situation and...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** ...more or less, let it...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** But what...

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** ...take [inaudible]...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...you expressed to me, my understanding is to allow Legal to address it, sounds like it would be the county's...

[Inaudible dais discussion]

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...legal that's involved

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** Well, there was an email...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yeah.

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** ...and I believe you might've been copied on it. It was from Mr. Evans, copied to...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** ...I believe, your office. The legal department at the county was not included, however, the comprehensive reports were and it basically redirected Ms. Wilder.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Okay. Who's Ms. Wilder's lawyer? And what happened to him?

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** Ms., what happens is, and, and I know, [stammer], I was seated in..., my seat is Building Official, when our residents typically begin to have conversations associated with lawyers, because I don't know law, I know code, if they start talking legal, I redirect them to the Legal Department. In this particular instance, it caused me pause that she was redirected to the Legal Department because this is...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Wow.

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** ...a particular incident where several members of the legislative body and Mr. Evans and myself and the county building official were, seemingly, on the same page. I was not privy to some of the other meetings that took place, offsite, or with members at the county to speak to what happened. I just know Ms. Wilder made mention that she had gotten an attorney because the hotel was no longer going to be covered by the county program. The county sent four options to our Department for her. When she came to ask me about the options from a building

standpoint, [pause], I told her that she would have to rectify tho'.., you know, get some clarity on what would be best for her. So...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Now...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...the county.., didn't the, the county provided an alternate contractor to continue the work, if I'm not mistaken from my conversation with Ms. Wilder. So [stammer]...

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** The...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Was that one of the options, to have...

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** There were...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Because I know there would...

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** Let me...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...up being some, some, some...

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** [Stammer]...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...you know, conflict between the contractor, who was doing it, and then there was, like, two or three different ones.

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** So, let me tell you what her three options were, as a homeowner. Her first option was to go with the contractor who had already been paid the \$68,000 and allow him to finish but there was some issues with regards to her dissatisfaction with the end product, thus far. For what she'd already had. The second option was, you can choose a second contractor and we will allot you another \$39,000 but you have to agree to the second mortgage being up to \$100,000 and you have to get the work done in.., within the.., those parameters. And, the third option was, she could find a contractor of her own, et her home put back to a livable state and if it exceeded the \$39,000, then she would need to cover the expense out-of-pocket.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Wow.

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** She needed to choose one of those three and that was the ultimatum provided...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And that...

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** ...and that's what prompted the...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And that was from the...

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** ...[Inaudible]..

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...county? That was...

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** From the county.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Okay. Before we go too far with this.., and the reason why I wanted to have this discussion because the county had their issues that, that they were negligent on and we had an employee that we definitely caught but I wanted to find out how do we get out to... 'Cause I remember Ms. Wilder came and there was a discussion and I recall seeing and receiving an email. Ms. Wilder had been speaking... Ms. Wilder, you mind coming to the microphone, please? I'm gonna be real brief. [Pause]. Because, as Ms. Wilder approaches, one of the things that I do recall is that when she went and hired an attorney, she was her focus has been finding somebody to, to fight for her rights with the county. And what.., it wasn't against Riviera Beach. Am I right? It was... Right?

**MS. F. WILDER:** Right.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** And when you hired an attorney to, to ha'.., to work with our Attorney to help get you some support in Riviera Beach, what happened?

**MS. F. WILDER:** When my attorney?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yeah.

**MS. F. WILDER:** When I want my attorney to work with...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Remember you was you talking with our City Manager and you were trying to get us to help you get some things done...

**MS. F. WILDER:** Mhmm.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...with the county? What happened?

**MS. F. WILDER:** Well, I had all type of promises that, that Mr. Evans would do this and have someone to come out and inspect.., have an inspector come out if I had, you know?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Mhmm.

**MS. F. WILDER:** But, in my contract, states that I could choose my own contractor. When I chose a contractor, they threw me off the program.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Okay.

**MS. F. WILDER:** Totally.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Okay.

**MS. F. WILDER:** And stopped paying my rent. Then they find out they were doing something wrong, then what they did was, they put me back on the program and said, 'We're not gonna pay your rent anymore.' Now, my home was torn up. The rats die in there. That's why I tell people you need to come out and see. I can talk 'til I'm blue in the face. It's just a bad situation.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** And, and...

**MS. F. WILDER:** And they don't want me to discuss with anybody because they say my situation is unique.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** And what upsets me is...

**MS. F. WILDER:** Mhmm.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...as we support you, um, and if I st'.., correct me if I'm wrong, Mr. Evans has sent this Board, entire Board, an email saying since she hired legal, without having a discussion with our Legal Department, to no longer have a conversation with Ms. Wilder. Did that happen?

**MS. F. WILDER:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** And my concern is, when we have someone that provides a level of service to this community, anybody.., okay? Anybody. This Item will serve its purpose, how do we work with our legal team, our City Manager, to sit down with the county and, and represent someone... It's anybody, this could be anyone, any of us.

**UNK.:** Mhmm.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** How do we go [inaudible]Council, okay, 'You know what? No matter what happened, how do we make this better?' And this need' to get done, like, yesterday. This is something that needs to be a top priority by this whole Board, to have our City Manager, our City Attorney work with Ms. Wilder to make sure that there's proper representation, moving forward, how do we work with the county to come up with a plan to help her with the money she's spending every week in this hotel? It's cold outside. Okay? People talk about the top 10% but what about the other 90%? Okay? This is a situation...

[Inaudible comment]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...that, you want to go fight for something, I'll fight with you on this...

**UNK.:** Mhmm.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** And I'll fight with you side by side. This is something.., this is a satiation we need to be fighting on this City, together. And the, the.., and, and the purpose of this Item is to..

[Inaudible audience comment]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...not point fingers but to, how do we come together to work with the county administrator and her staff to make this a positive situation? And there gotta be some things legally, that we can do legally, legally they can do , that we can come together and come with a plan. And I would like to just have the support of this Board, that we give the support of our Staff to come up with a plan and maybe.., and do something aggressive within the next two weeks to set up a meeting 'cause we know next week, everyone's gonna be in Tallahassee or Palm Beach County Day. Right? But the following week, could we have someone to have an early meeting with Staff and to talk about these issues? Maybe have Ms. March, Mr. Degraffenreidt and Ms. Hoskins to go in that meeting and come up with a strategy and say, 'How do we expedite this? We know.., we understand that you got it out for bid and [inaudible] work through,' but this young lady is paying for a hotel every week for the last two plus years. And she was told not to talk with her executive board.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** It would be really helpful to me to be able to identify who your legal representative is and his contact information.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Okay.

**MS. F. WILDER:** I had.., first I had Mr. James Brown. He was representing me and he was falling into the county' hands. He was doing stuff... I'm not.., I may not be the sharpest knife in the drawer but I'm not the dullest one either. And, he was doing things that was more conducive to the county. Then, I.., then I had to get a legal aid lawyer and come to find out, the county's funding him and he, 'Don't be calling' my office,' and just kept.., that just...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Who's the legal aid lawyer.., lawyer, please?

**MS. F. WILDER:** It's, uh, [pause], Dorekian [sp] D-O-R-I-A-N.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Dorian?

**MS. F. WILDER:** Yes.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Is that the first name or last name?

**MS. F. WILDER:** Last name.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** First name?

**MS. F. WILDER:** I can't recall his first name. [Pause]. I can give it to you later...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Please do.

**MS. F. WILDER:** Okay.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** 'Cause they have...

**MS. F. WILDER:** But I just...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** They, they have accountability, not only to you, to the Florida Bar in order to do this.

**MS. F. WILDER:** I called...

**MS. F. WILDER:** And I'm trying to figure out...

**MS. F. WILDER:** ...the Florida Bar.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...how..., what you say happened, happed. On their watch. It, it's just incomprehensible to me.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And Ms. Wilder...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** And that's why I want to...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...when did this start?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...talk to them directly.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** When did this start? How long has this been going on?

**MS. F. WILDER:** 2015.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. So, about three years now?

**MS. F. WILDER:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** In peaking... Madam Chair?

**MS. F. WILDER:** And it started with Mr., with the...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** I need [inaudible].

**MS. F. WILDER:** ...building. I had my roof fixed. I paid \$4,800 for Lloyd Roofing to come in and do my roof. The City passed inspection and the roof fell in. And I'm telling him, 'What's, uh, it's alright,' and it fell in. That's why the government had to come and redo the roof over again. Lloyd got away with my \$4,800 because an attorney from

here went out to the courts and had some papers that the house passed inspection, whi'..., which it didn't.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Who's that lawyer?

**MS. F. WILDER:** Uh [pause].

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Can we just [inaudible].

**MS. F. WILDER:** Oh God. It was..., I., let me see do I see him in here?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** While she's trying...

**MS. F. WILDER:** 'Cause he usually come...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...to figure that out...

**MS. F. WILDER:** ...to the meeting 'cause I, I...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Ms. March?

**MS. F. WILDER:** ...pass him...

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** Yes.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** I'm guessing 'cause I'm not familiar...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Is she saying a City attorney?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No. She didn't say that.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** The program...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** She said ...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** The program.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...City attorney.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Yeah.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** That was to do...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** [Inaudible] City.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:**...the rehabilitation. Was that a federally funded program?

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** In part, yes. It's with, um...

[Inaudible audience comment]

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** ...either S.H.I.P. funds or [inaudible] Refunds. It's the same program that was housed here at some point...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Oh...

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** ...under the toolage of [inaudible]...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** The master...

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** ...[Inaudible].

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...contract, for the federal funds was...

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** I, I...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...with who? Was it with the county or with the City?

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** The contract is always with the county.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Okay. Have the people responsible for monitoring the federal money, in the allocation, have they been notified of Ms. Wilder's [inaudible]?

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** I absolutely notified them on her behalf, once I realized the makeup of the program. That was how we were able to have Mr. Evans agree to have the building official from the county come out...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Mhmm.

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** ...so that we could use that as a rubric to measure whether or not they had indeed lived up to the standard of ensuring that the payouts were appropriate and, with that, there is a letter from the legal department from the county, that I will resend to you, that summarizes their position...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** So, it's who's position?

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** ...as it relates to all the...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** County's position...

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** The county's position.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...or the feds position?

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** The county's position.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Okay. That information, has it been sent to the federal authorities, who oversee' the contra'.., who oversees the funding?

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** We had the conversation about sending it to the federal authorities and, again, we were told the legal department would handle it from there.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** That was never sent... What legal department was supposed to handle it from there?

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** The two legal departments, legal from City and legal from the county would work...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** I never heard...

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** ...together to come up...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...anything about that.

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** ...with something. Well, I, I mean, again, I can pull the, pull the emails. I don't know what...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Stammer]...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Wait, wait. Hold on one...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I think this dialog is what...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mr. Davis, hold on one second. We have three minutes left, so if you all...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Uh-uh.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...wanted to make a motion...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...to extend? We...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** How long?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Say that again.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** How long...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** 15 minutes.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...[inaudible]. 15 minutes?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Fifteen, mhmm.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Motion to extend for 15 minutes.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Second.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Second.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Hubbard?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Pardo?

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Davis Johnson?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Miller-Anderson?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Unanimous vote.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Ma'...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

[Inaudible comments]

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair?

[Inaudible comments]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No. I, I can wait [inaudible].

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Mayor.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yes. I., it's just kind of unfortunate that we've spent as much time as we've spent, hour and a half and basically accusing the former Manager, Mr. Evans, for everything except killing Jesus...

**UNK.:** [Sigh]

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...but let me just say this for the record, he's not here to defend any of his actions or any inactions. So, you know, we're just saying what he didn't do and what did do, this, that and the other, so hopefully, that., he can give us light on some of these accusations or ch'., allegations that are being made.

But let me just say this for the record, Ms., Ms. Verdenia Baker called and made it very clear to me, she was very adamant, I've never seen her with that kind of, uh, tone, that the county had gone above and beyond the call of duty with Mrs. Wilder and that they were not going to do anything else, as related to this situation. Ms. Wilder probably knows that 'cause she's referenced...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair, ask the Mayor a question. Madam...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** No. Before we do that...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** And I just wanted...

**UNK.:** [Sigh].

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...to make, you know, I just wanted to be., 'cause Ms. Baker's not here, so she's not able to tell her story either. But, she did call me and you can verify it, but she was kinda, um, a little perplexed and., about the situation as far as the county being accused of not doing their job. She said, 'Mr. Mayor, we have done our job. We have gone far above and beyond the call of duty for Mrs. Wilder.' I just wanted to put that on the record, as it relates to Verdenia Baker.

Thank you.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, Mr. Mayor. Councilwoman Hubbard.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Madam Chair, Mr. Davis, the [pause]. What I can say about this is that I, I went out to Mrs. Wilder's house twice and it is in the condition that she said that it's in. I've spoken with Ms. Outlaw Johnson, spoken with Ms. Baker, they have a new gentleman, Mr. Brown running the DES program out there. So, as long as I have been working with Ms. Wider on this, I have been negotiating some kind of resolution between the two of., between the two parties. What's unable to be reconciled, is the fact that her home is un'., it's not habitable but yet, she has only \$39,000 left to bring it up to par. So, where the mediation, the negotiation, is gonna have to fall is there's gonna have to be some kind of commitment to say., and, primarily

on the county's part, we are willing to do what it takes to get this house up to a, a, a living standard. And I know that they are taking applications or requests for bids at this time. One of the gentleman that bid, Ms. Wilder is willing and, and wants to work with him more favorably. But what the county said they pointed out to Ms. Wilder was..., and... Excuse me. What Ms. Wilder said the county pointed out to her was that it's not automatic that this gentleman will win the bid and they wanted her to sign something to agree that whether he wins or not, they will allow..., she will allow, or go along with whomever they..., whoever wins to finish working in her home and that caused, that caused her concern as, as well.

So, it has been a..., an ongoing conversation back and forth, I've been in touch with Community Action Counsel, trying to find temporary lodging for Ms. Wilder that..., so that she can come out of the hotel and live somewhere, you know, affordable until this, this is resolved. So, I know it's..., I know..., I don't know where, where we can help with the temporary lodging but if the place that's she's looking at now falls through, then I can, you know, go back to Mr. Green and try to find another place for..., somewhere..., for, for temporary lodging until the house is completed because I think that it's gonna be, you know, at least a..., I don't want to say a year but it look like' this problem will be six months to a year before it is concluded. Would you say, Ms. March? If they haven't started yet, I mean. Construction wise.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible background comment]

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** [Inaudible].

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** The scope of work associated with what's left to be done on the home, could be done by a diligent, qualified crew...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** ...within two to four weeks. It's just a matter of going to do it. Mr. Mayor, with all due respect, I wanted to say something to you. You came out to the property with me, kind sir.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yes.

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** You photographed and video graphed the condition of the home with the...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I did. Yes.

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** ...with, with the City Manager.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I did.

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** You guys instructed her to contact the news while we were out there. We asked for the opportunity to be able to work through the process without doing that first so that we would not shed any undue or unjust light on the City.

Just so we could get the opportunity to investigate whether or not there had been some...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So, you was with them.

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** ...undue, or some inept, miss on our part.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Mhmm.

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** I can tell you this, for as much as I have strong opinion about a lot of things, when I serve in the capacity as the Building Official for this City, what I do for one, we do for everybody. And, with that being said, there is no room for me to do anything with my discretion but to apply it equally. It has nothing to do with my position on the former City Manager, I'm simply stating fact. The public request support my position there and I don't want to spend an hour and a half, I don't want to be here 'til 10:00 o'clock at night to bash anyone. I would much rather be home, but I do want to...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible background comment]

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** ...acknowledge the fact that I'm a professional and what I've tried to do with this situation and every situation that I administer some degree of professional discretion towards, is operate in a spar'.., space of fairness. So...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Ms. March.

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** ...I say that to say that I absolutely went to the home and the conditions that are present are present and that has nothing to do with anything else but the fact that it's not in a condition where she can live.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Chair?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Ladi March.., I just, I want to respond to that, Madam Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Go ahead and then Ms. Davis Johnson.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I wasn't referring to you as, as it relates to all the time.., I was really referring to up here, that we have said that Mr. Evans did this, didn't do that. It had noth'... had, had...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...didn't have... Excuse me. Had nothing to do with you. Nothing. Trust me. But I what I.., ;what I did say was, as it relate' to Verdenia Baker, which had nothing to do with you. I was just re'.., rehashing a conversation that Mrs. Baker had with me. Nothing to do with you, Ms. March but I was speaking in general, is about the timeframe that.., from up here. It seems like we were just going on and on

and on, on and on, around circles. Nothing to do with, nothing to do what you've said, or have done. You, you, you stated your, your case.

Thank you.

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** Thank you, sir.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Ms. Davis Johnson.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** So, we, we mentioned that the original issue goes back to a Lloyd Roofing. Right?

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** What happened, yes. My understanding is, again, that even predates me, there was a roof repair done. Now, it is unclear if it's that inspection that the inspector rode by and didn't inspect, or if it is the one of a series of inspections years later that was passed. When I went back and looked at the chrono'..., you know, the chronology of inspections done, as they associate themselves with the build out for her home, where we inspected, we did not pass. There was one window inspection, I believe, if I'm not mistaken, that we did pass, one window inspection and it was a buck inspection. But again, we went out and did a complete walkthrough of the property with myself and the county building official and our findings were outlined in a report that was forwarded over to executive office for review. My understanding was that it was going to be looked at by representatives from the Legal Department. The county's legal department, after review, proffered it's position, in writing. At that point, somewhere along the line, there was a reference by Ms. Wilder that she had obtained an attorney, or was going to work with an attorney to review the options that were presented to her and that was after we presented to the county that we did, in fact, not pass the ;inspections, that we were then told that the legal departments will work through this matter. And that is the beginning and the end of this story, short of the fact that the home is now encumbered with a \$68,000 payout and it is down to the studs. The beginning and the end.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** If I'm understanding, the mortgage, the second mortgage, the liens, is to recoup the funds and the program for doing the work.

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** That was what.., that is very obvious.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Okay. But the work was never done.

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** But the work was not done. The work was done in partiality here, it was not passed. Again, that program typically, I participated in that program before, as a contractor, typically, you have to get a signed inspection form the City and then you have to come out and the county will do an inspection and sign it and then the owner has to sign it and then they pay out.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** And those...

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** So how...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...documents are missing?

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** And how \$68,000 of that happened in this process, the documents that were presented to us, do not tell the story.

[Inaudible dais comments]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** La'.., last question, I'm sorry.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I'm sorry. Go ahead.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Is there is a fund of \$39,000 outstanding, that's available to complete Ms. Wilder's home?

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** The issue became, if I, I..., and, and you can verify with her, she didn't want to [stammer], I don't know if it's \$68,000 or \$69,000 and \$39,000 would've taken her over the \$100,000 mark, but her position was, she did not want to sign for an additional \$39,000 when she couldn't see where the \$68,000 came. So, because she, she had to...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** That's [inaudible].

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** ...the county said sign first, then we will remedy the problem.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible] do that.

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** And that was where the reservation came into play and where we were kinda inserted as the middle person.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** You know [stammer], Mr. Davis, you were getting ready to say something but, I think, you know, we really.., I have never heard from the county. I know, in my dealings with Ms. Wilder's, been, basically, getting it from her, I don't know if this is something that we want to bring back and then have someone from the county come in and share their side of what's going on so we can have a clear picture, because I.., right now, the only thing I see is that, you know, two, three years ago, we, as a City, failed in terms of these inspections.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** I'm not...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** No?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Stammer]...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** No. The county...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No. That's not...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** No.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So, that's not correct.

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** We failed...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** The project [inaudible]...

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** ...the actual...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...contract of work.

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** ...inspections that were required to justify that the work being done...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well, that's what...

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** ...allowed for the...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...I was trying to say.

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** ...payout.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Maybe I just didn't say it right but that's basically what I was saying, there was some inspections that were done, they passed but they should've passed and because of that, the county paid out based...

**UNK.:** No.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...on the fact that...

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** No.

**UNK.:** No.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I'm wrong again?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** What did I miss?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** She said they did not...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** [Inaudible]...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...even pass inspections.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...didn't pass.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** We did not...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** We didn't pass them...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...pass the inspections. Correct?

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** ...the county passed them.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Right.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well, well, what did the guy..., didn't we...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...have a guy that did an inspection, or supposedly did an inspect?

[Inaudible background comments]

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** We had a guy, or we had several inspectors perform the required inspections as they were called in by the contract.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Right.

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** Those inspections...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** [Inaudible].

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** ...were failed. They did not pass.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And the county's paid out even though the inspections failed?

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** Yes, ma'am.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. So, how are we liable for that? Isn't that the county's...

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** The county's defense.., apparently, because his dated back to [pause], you know, it started in 2015.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** [Inaudible].

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** Because of that, their position was, because that is typically their process.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** [Inaudible background discussion]

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** Typically, stage by stage, you have so many eyes on a particular payout, before, I mean, on an particular...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** [Inaudible background discussion]

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** ...draw, there's so many signatures that you have to obtain from different levels of people involved in the process, that you cannot typically get, or find yourself in a situation like Ms. Wilder's in.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** [Inaudible background discussion]

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** That's spec'.., that's why it's designed that way.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Right. So, what...

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** This is an anomaly.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...what did Riviera Beach do or didn't do to get...

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** Riviera Beach had...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...us where we're liable?

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** Short of the Lloyd inspection, that did not have anything to do with the county program...

[Inaudible background discussion]

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** ...except for the fact that maybe that was the conduit or the reasoning behind why she went to get county funds anyway.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** [Inaudible]. Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Excuse me, Madam Chair.

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** We have not done anything...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** We have two minutes.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** We ha'...

**BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH:** ...out of order.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Hold on. We only have two minutes. So, I don't..., Mr. Davis, if you want to have the county come back and...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No. [Stammer]...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I mean, 'cause ha'..., we're only hearing one side...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** [Inaudible]...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...of the story.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** [Inaudible]...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** I would suggest that we let Mr. Degraffenreidt handle it.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** And have him come back to us, you know, either at the next meeting or the meeting after.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm. Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** And, uh, give us an update and, you know, he'll be able to talk to the county then. Okay?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** That's what I suggest.

**UNK.:** Yeah.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Instead of having the county come in...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** That is perfect but we just sat here a whole hour and a half and we could've just said that from the beginning.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. What would we like to do next? We only have about a minute left.

**ADJOURNMENT**

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** I make a motion that we adjourn.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** So moved.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright.

**UNK.:** Second.

[Gavel]

[End Of video]

**City Employees, Public Comment Speakers and Others**

ACTING COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR JEFF GAGNON

ACTING DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT GAGNON

LLOYD BROWN..... MR. L. BROWN

PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR TERRENCE BAILEY  
PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR BAILEY

LIFE CENTER JAMES EASLEY ..... MR. J. EASLEY

ASSISTANT CITY ATTORNEY LINA BUSBY..... ASSISTANT CITY ATTORNEY  
BUSBY

DR. PHILLIP DUKES ..... DR. P. DUKES

JOHN MILLER ..... MR. J. MILLER

JULIE BOTEL..... MS. J. BOTEL

AMON YISRAEL ..... MR. A. YISRAEL

CHARLOTTE DARVILLE ..... MS. C. DARVILLE

REVEREND WILLIAM BURRS ..... REVEREND. W. BURRS

EVELYN CLARK ..... MS. E. CLARK

DENNIS CLARK..... MR. D. CLARK

FELICIA WILDER..... MS. F. WILDER

TOMMY WALKER..... MR. T. WALKER

JAVARIOUS JACKSON ..... MR. J. JACKSON

HUMAN RESOURCES EUREKA IRVIN ..... HUMAN RESOURCES IRVIN

PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR TERRENCE BAILEY ....PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR  
..... BAILEY

BUILDING OFFICIAL LADI MARCH ..... BUILDING OFFICIAL MARCH

**APPROVED:**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**THOMAS A. MASTERS**  
**MAYOR**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**KaSHAMBA L. MILLER-ANDERSON**  
**CHAIRPERSON**

**ATTEST:**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**CLAUDENE L. ANTHONY**  
**CERTIFIED MUNICIPAL CLERK**  
**CITY CLERK**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**TONYA DAVIS JOHNSON**  
**CHAIR PRO TEM**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**LYNNE L. HUBBARD**  
**COUNCILPERSON**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**DAWN S. PARDO**  
**COUNCILPERSON**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**TERENCE D. DAVIS**  
**COUNCILPERSON**

**MOTIONED BY:** \_\_\_\_\_

**SECONDED BY:** \_\_\_\_\_

**L. HUBBARD** \_\_\_\_\_

**K. MILLER-ANDERSON** \_\_\_\_\_

**T. DAVIS JOHNSON** \_\_\_\_\_

**D. PARDO** \_\_\_\_\_

**T. DAVIS** \_\_\_\_\_

**DATE APPROVED:**     **FEBRUARY 7, 2018**