

**CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH  
REGULAR CITY COUNCIL MEETING  
December 6, 2017**

PRESENT AT MEETING<sup>1</sup>:

MAYOR THOMAS MASTERS .....MAYOR MASTERS  
CHAIRPERSON KaSHAMBA MILLER-ANDERSON.....CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON  
CHAIR PRO TEM TONYA DAVIS JOHNSON ..... CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON  
COUNCILPERSON LYNNE L. HUBBARD .....COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD  
COUNCILPERSON DAWN PARDO .....COUNCILPERSON PARDO  
COUNCILPERSON TERENCE DAVIS .....COUNCILPERSON DAVIS  
INTERIM CITY MANAGER KAREN HOSKINS ..... INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS  
CITY CLERK CLAUDENE ANTHONY .....CITY CLERK ANTHONY  
CITY ATTORNEY ANDREW DEGRAFFENREIDT .....CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT

TRANSCRIBED BY:

Legal Transcription, Etc., LLC  
931 Village Boulevard  
#905-148  
West Palm Beach, FL 33409  
(561) 429-3816  
(561) 584-5044 (fax)  
jreitano@legaltranscriptionetc.com

---

<sup>1</sup> List of City Employees, Public Speakers and Others on Page 189-190

## **CALL TO ORDER**

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I want to call to order the Regular City Council Meeting for December 6, 2017, 6:00 p.m.

## **ROLL CALL**

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Madam, roll call.

## **INVOCATION**

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Mayor Thomas Masters?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Present.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chairperson KaShamba Miller-Anderson?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Present.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Pro Tem Tonya Davis Johnson?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Here.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Lynne Hubbard?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Here.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Dawn Pardo?

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Present.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Terence Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Here.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Interim City Manager Karen Hoskins?

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Here.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** City Clerk Claudene Anthony is present. City Attorney Andrew Degraffenreidt?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Here.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** You may proceed.

## **PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. We'll have a moment of silence followed by the Pledge of Allegiance led by Councilman Davis.

[Moment of silence]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Shall we pledge?

**ALL:** I pledge to the Flag of the United States of America and to the Republic for which it stands, one nation under God, indivisible with liberty and justice for all.

## **APPROVAL**

### **ADDITIONS, DELETIONS, SUBSTITUTIONS**

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Do we have any additions, deletions or substitutions?

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Yes, ma'am. We have a substitution, Ordinance on second reading, Item No. 11, revision Ordinance No. 40-97 and Ordinance of the City of Riviera Beach, Palm Beach County, Florida restating Article II entitled "General Employees", Chapter 14 entitled "Pensions and Retirement Programs" providing for a simplified, updated and modernized language, providing a limitation on number of post-retirement beneficiary changes, removing age 70 mandatory retirement age, clarifying optional forms of retirement benefits, providing for the election of elected pension board members from the at large participants in the plan, acknowledging trustees, duty to attend pension schools and other educational functions, providing for conflicts, severability and codification and providing an effective date.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. What was that.., the, the amended one?

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Yes, ma'am. This was the amended...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** ...revised one. Also, I would like to delete Item No. 15 under discussion and deliberation, Riviera Beach Library's new construction grant project.

[Pause]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** That's it.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Any other additions, deletions or substitutions?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yes, Madam Chair. I would like to add, for community benefits, we didn't get the paperwork but they..., they're always..., already in the hopper, approval..., approved and that's \$500 for the Youth Recreation Association. They're putting together a Christmas, Christmas thing.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So, we're going to make that 8A? Ms. Hoskins or Ms. Anthony? 8A? For Youth Recreation, from the Mayor for \$500, for Christmas? Any other additions, deletions or substitutions?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair? I wanna add \$1,000 for the Sickle Cell Foundation. This one is..., we provided all the proper documentation and submitted it to Staff.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Sickle Cell for \$1,000?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes, ma'am.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** From Councilman Davis for? Is it for anything specific? The purpose?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** They, they got the event..., there's a flyer. I left it in my car, for February I believe.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** For an upcoming...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yeah. It's in February but I wanted it... They do it at Palm Beach Lakes High School every year.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Oh, the comedy thing?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yeah.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So, I wanna sponsor that.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Upcoming event. Okay. That'll be 8B, Ms. Anthony? [Pause]. 8B? 8B? Anyone else, additions, deletions, substitutions?

### **DISCLOSURES BY COUNCIL**

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Any disclosures by Council?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes, Madam Chair. I'd like to disclose that I met with Mr. John Hurt of the Riviera Beach Housing Authority regarding Heron Estates Phase 1 and 2 and I'd also like to state for the record that Pamela Toussaint, she is Item, I believe, Item 12?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** She is a certified SBE with the Palm Beach County Office of Small Business Assistance for which I serve as Director.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. Are there...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Go ahead.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** I met with the Riviera Beach Housing Authority's Executive Director, Mr. John Hurt, and attended, and attended their meet and greet for small business participation on last evening.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Anyone else?

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Go ahead.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Okay. Item No. 10, I met with Mr. Hurt and his construction team, maybe six months ago and we had a meeting over on Singer Island for small businesses.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Anyone else? [Pause]. Alright. The only disclosure for me, for Item No. 10, I was supposed to meet with Mr. Hurt and the Board but I was unable to meet with them. I did communicate with them by email regarding setting up a rescheduling of a meeting but we had not had a chance to do it yet.

Any other disclosures by Council?

### **ADOPTION OF AGENDA**

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Do we have a motion to adopt the Agenda?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** So moved.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Second.

[Pause]

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Hubbard?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Davis Johnson?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Pardo?

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Miller-Anderson?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Unanimous vote.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

### **COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC ON CONSENT AGENDA**

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ANY PERSON WHO WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON AN AGENDA ITEM, PLEASE FILL OUT A PINK PUBLIC COMMENT CARD LOCATED IN THE BACK OF THE COUNCIL CHAMBERS AND GIVE IT TO THE STAFF PRIOR TO THE ITEM BEING TAKEN UP BY THE CITY COUNCIL. MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC SHALL BE GIVEN A TOTAL OF THREE MINUTES TO SPEAK ON ALL ITEMS LISTED ON THE CONSENT AGENDA. MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WILL BE GIVEN THREE MINUTES TO SPEAK ON EACH REGULAR AGENDA ITEM. IN NO EVENT WILL ANYONE BE ALLOWED TO SUBMIT A COMMENT CARD AND SPEAK ON AN AGENDA ITEM AFTER THE RESOLUTION IS READ OR ITEM CONSIDERED.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Do we have anyone that would like to pull an Item from our Consent Agenda?

[Pause]

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, we do have a public comment card for Consent Agenda.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** All matters...

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** [Inaudible]...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Let me just read this right quick.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Okay.

### **CONSENT AGENDA**

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ALL MATTERS LISTED UNDER THIS ITEM ARE CONSIDERED TO BE ROUTINE AND ACTION WILL BE TAKEN BY ONE MOTION. THERE WILL BE NO SEPARATE DISCUSSION OF THESE ITEMS UNLESS

**A COUNCILPERSON SO REQUESTS, IN WHICH EVENT, THE ITEM WILL BE REMOVED FROM THE GENERAL ORDER OF BUSINESS AND CONSIDERED IN ITS NORMAL SEQUENCE ON THE AGENDA.**

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Go ahead.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Bonnie Larson. [Pause]. After Ms. Larson, then we'll have Norma Duncombe.

**MS. B. LARSON:** No. 2 is a request to purchase 16 police vehicles. There's a gentleman who comes here, I can't remember who it is, and I don't think I see him here, he usually keeps track of the police vehicles. We just got those SUV's, like, maybe two years ago and now we're asking for 16 more. Just doing my math here, it's \$224,335 times three. We should always put the exact number here. Let me just [inaudible]. [Inaudible whispering to self]. So, it's actually \$673..., \$673,000 we're talking about and I'm wondering why do we need 16 more? We just got all those SUV's. And it's not just that we got the SUV's, then you gotta put all computer., you gotta reinstall all the computers and everything. Why did we just buy all of those and now we're asking for 16 more? Doesn't make sense. So, if that gentleman is here, if he would speak on it, that would be good and if we can have an explanation, what's wrong with the SUV's we just bought, two years ago or so?

Thank you.

[Inaudible dais comments]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Who's the next person?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Norma Duncombe and then Lloyd Brown. [Pause]. And Madam Chair, that closes the acceptance of public comment cards for the Consent Agenda.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. Thank you.

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** Norma Duncombe.

I'm, I'm here, not to really say anything against what you're doing in terms of the donations but I'm here because I think we need to think bigger and broader, in terms of our community. I read an article in the papers and it said how Washington Elementary School had gone from an F or a D up to an A and I'm saying that., and, and, the thing that really bothers me is that that school is over 50 years old and no one has ever thought, 'Well, let's do something about that school.' They build schools all over the county, they're now closing down a school because they don't have enough kids to go in there and I'm saying why don't we come up with a program for our children so that we motivate them in terms of education? What I would like to propose is that we give every child, in this community, who grows up in this community, finishes high school and enroll in the junior college or a state college, that we pay their tuition? Why don't we think in terms of big things? And we can do it. Just think of all the monies that are wasted on things that we

do not benefit from and I'm saying it's time for us to think big, let's do big and let's motivate kids wherein the parents would understand that they have to really jump in there and not just be on the sideline but that they will motivate their kids to do better because, if they can make passing grades and, of course, do community benefits, that we can pay for their tuition to the state college. It's just a suggestion. I like to think big.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:**        Alright.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Lloyd Brown.

**MAYOR MASTERS:**        Ms. Duncombe, I hope that's retroactive. [Chuckle].

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:**        [Inaudible].

**MAYOR MASTERS::**        No, I was just kidding. I hope that could be retroactive from the, the ones that have already [inaudible]...

**MR. L. BROWN:**        How ya doin'? My name is...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Good evening.

**MR. L. BROWN:**        ...Lloyd Brown and I see you were talking about 16 new police cars. Well, you know what, you got SUV's and they burn a lotta gas and I done seen 'em all up through Lake Park. What, you gonna get 'em more vehicles to ride all around and go to they' lawy'..., you know, appointments and whatever 'cause, honestly, that's a lotta money being spent and that's taxpayer money. When you see a officer sittin' up in Lake Park somewhere, parked under a tree or somewhere down and then they got vehicles... I mean, SUV's? In London, they probably got the smallest car, they don't even carry guns, you know, they carry nightsticks. I mean, Palm Beach don't even have vehicles that big. I mean, you gonna get SUV's? I mean, get 'em a Pinto, anything smaller.

And another thing, you know, when they have the Pledge of Allegiance, the reason I don't stand up is because I can't get on one knee, 'cause I'll be protesting the way ya'll are treating this City. Ya'll, ya'll Council Members, the way ya'll treat the City and I'd protest by getting on one knee but I know if I got down there, I couldn't get up so that's the only reason I don't stand up and get on one knee.

But all I'm saying is about the Police Department, honestly, you need to ride around and you need to look in these little holes and these little spots 'cause they're parked all the time. I don't think they need no 16 more vehicles. I mean, they go up here to these places and they eat for free and then once they get a full stomach, they take them other 16 cars and they go park somewhere until something call. You know, like the lady said over Singers Island, she don't even have officers over there, they got one officer. Now, I'm talking for Singer Island, but they only got one officer over there, so, you get 16 cars, you're gonna have 15 of 'em over on this side of the track? And then you're gonna have one over there? And you're gonna 14 of 'em, really, that's on this side up there in North



Lake, tryna catch the Dunkin Donuts and not too full. And that's bad. I told the lady, if you want the cops over Singer Island, you need to put more Dunkin Donuts and more free food over there 'cause, honestly, it's our money and I see these people every day. I, I went up to Southern Kitchen, I seen a officer sittin' in there, he used to be a Council Member. I took a picture of it, I got it on my phone. Just like you watch us, we watch ya'll. I put it on my phone. This man's sittin' in there, he's sittin' in there just as long as I ordered my food and he had a Riviera Beach truck sittin' up there, City Police vehicle sittin' there. I'm talkin' about, he used to be a Council Member. He's sittin' up there stuffin' his face. Now, once he get full, then he gonna be ready to go out there and knock down some brothers on the corner for drinkin' a beer in a store that sells single cigarettes to people, that doesn't have products in that you know where they come from.

See, well, ya'll doing the wrong thing. See, ya'll just.., ya'll.. I'm gonna tell ya, like, back in the days when they say house negros and field negros? See, ya'll house negros done got so comfortable, you done forgot how it is to be a field negro. And see, we' havin' all the problems. So, ya'll need field negros up there, where ya'll at, not ya'll house negros 'cause ya'll done forgot where you came from. And these police cars ain't gonna get it, that ain't gonna make it no better. Crime's still going up, you ain't doin' nothin' to help the field negros. You only forgot about us.

I know ya'll glad my time' up.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you.

**UNK. AUDIENCE:** [Inaudible], Lloyd.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. Do we have anyone that would like to pull an Item?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well, go ahead and.., I'll have Item No. 2 pulled to have a presentation done. Anyone else?

[Inaudible audience comment]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. [Stammer] wanna take a vote to go ahead and [pause]...

[Inaudible background comments]

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Pardo?

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Hubbard?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Davis Johnson?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Miller-Anderson?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Unanimous vote.

## **MINUTES**

**1. MINUTES OF THE REGULAR CITY COUNCIL MEETING HELD NOVEMBER 1, 2017.**

**DEPARTMENT DIRECTOR: CLAUDENE ANTHONY (561) 845-4090**

**2.**

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Item No. 2.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY: RESOLUTION NO. 139-17. A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH, PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA AUTHORIZING THE POLICE DEPARTMENT TO EXECUTE AN ADDENDUM MASTER TAX EXEMPT LEASE PURCHASE AGREEMENT WITH US BANK CORP. TO LEASE PURCHASE 16 POLICE VEHICLES, AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR AND CITY CLERK TO EXECUTE THE AGREEMENT AND THE DIRECTOR OF FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES TO SET UP A BUDGET FOR THE SAME AND AUTHORIZING THREE ANNUAL PAYMENTS IN THE AMOUNT OF \$224,335.22 EACH AND PROVIDING AN EFFECTIVE DATE.**

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** So moved.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Second.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**ASSISTANT POLICE CHIEF MADDEN:** Good evening, Mayor and Council.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Good evening.

**ASSISTANT POLICE CHIEF MADDEN:** Mike Madden, Assistant Police Chief.

Would you like a presentation or...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**ASSISTANT POLICE CHIEF MADDEN:** ...just simply have questions?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yeah. Do the presentation, to answer the questions.

**ASSISTANT POLICE CHIEF MADDEN:** Currently, on the Police Department's vehicle replacement list is 34 vehicles. That list is maintained by Public Works so this list represents half of the vehicles that actually need to be replaced. The, the vehicles that are on that list are over 10 years old. We do maintain a fleet of approximately 130 vehicles. So, in order to replace those vehicles before they become a maintenance issue, we really need to buy 15 to, to 20 police vehicles annually and we..., someone was correct, we haven't bought vehicles since 2015. [Pause]. The, the vehicle we're trynna purchase is a 2018 Chevrolet Tahoe pursuit vehicle.

[Audience chuckles and inaudible comments]

**ASSISTANT POLICE CHIEF MADDEN:** The other vehicle that's prevalently used in the industry and is, a lotta times referred to by some as a cheaper vehicle is the Ford Utility Vehicle, which is one you may see. It is the most prevalent vehicle used. The City did a, a vehicle replacement committee back in 2012 when the Ford Crown Victoria was eliminated, so we evaluated all the vehicles that were on the market. The committee consisted of Public Works, Purchasing, Police Department and all the various units within the Police Department.

So, just to give you some quick comparisons to a vehicle that is more widely used but is more expensive. The cost of the Chevrolet Tahoe is \$40,474, fully equipped. To purchase a Ford Utility, equally equipped cost \$41,415. The..., there was a comment made about gas, the Ford Utility Vehicle gets 15 miles to the gallon, the Chevrolet Tahoe gets 16. So, we're buying the vehicle that gets better gas mileage and is lower cost.

[Inaudible audience comment]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Let's keep it down out there, please.

**ASSISTANT POLICE CHIEF MADDEN:** Is there any other questions?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Do you have anything else? That's it for your...

**ASSISTANT POLICE CHIEF MADDEN:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...presentation?

**ASSISTANT POLICE CHIEF MADDEN:** Yes, yes.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Mr..., is it Acting Chief?

**ASSISTANT POLICE CHIEF MADDEN:**Assistant Chief.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Assistant Chief. Question, in the industry, you..., I, I was..., I think you said that the, the Ford is the one that is generally purchased?

**ASSISTANT POLICE CHIEF MADDEN:**Yes. It is the most widely used vehicle.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Why is that more widely used when the other one is a little higher?

**ASSISTANT POLICE CHIEF MADDEN:**There's probably several reasons. One, you know, the Crown Victoria., the Ford Crown Victoria was the most widely used vehicle so, you know, a lot of people just switched over to the other Ford vehicle. There is somewhat of a belief by those not familiar with the industry, and who haven't done their research, that a Tahoe is a luxury vehicle. You know, maybe in a, in a vehicle that's sold to the general public and equipped for the general public...

[Inaudible dais comments]

**ASSISTANT POLICE CHIEF MADDEN:**...it is a higher end vehicle. But the police vehicles don't have all those creature comforts that come in those vehicles which make them cost so much. So, we look for the vehicle that fit, you know, our purpose, that was we try to have a consistent fleet, we try to have the same car for every officer to drive. We don't want 'em driving a., this style car today and a different one tomorrow so that they're familiar with how the seatbelt comes off when they have to get out quickly. So we...

[Inaudible audience comment]

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** [Inaudible].

**ASSISTANT POLICE CHIEF MADDEN:**...our committee established what we're driving and that's what we've been driving since 2012.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** So there's a \$1,000 difference? Is that...

**ASSISTANT POLICE CHIEF MADDEN:**Yes.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Between the two?

**ASSISTANT POLICE CHIEF MADDEN:**Yes.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay. And...

**ASSISTANT POLICE CHIEF MADDEN:** And that's imply acquisition costs. Our research showed that there's additional savings. The, the resale and auction of a Chevrolet Tahoe will ultimately bring you additional savings 'cause those vehicles will bring in a higher auction price. We've got to dispose of one, though, since we've got 'em.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay. So, you're asking for 16... What, what will happen with the vehicles, I guess, the 16 that you have now, if this Resolution is not passed, will officers be in danger to continue to drive until.., if it's not passed until [inaudible]...

**ASSISTANT POLICE CHIEF MADDEN:** No. None of the vehicles that we currently drive are unsafe.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay.

**ASSISTANT POLICE CHIEF MADDEN:** It's, it's more about how often they get repaired and then it becomes not efficient to continually shuffle cars to the City garage for repair. Sixteen vehicles have been identified to be taken out of service with the purchase of these 16.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** So it, it's really not a deal breaker. What I'm trying to say, that if, if this does not pass, then we'll just continue to negotiate and maybe come up with something even better or maybe a smaller amount of police cars, or vehicles if it, if it doesn't pass, so it doesn't really create a hardship on, on the City per se, if this doesn't pass tonight? The only, the only concern would be maintenance.

**ASSISTANT POLICE CHIEF MADDEN:** I think operationally it causes a hardship because these vehicles have frequent repairs the older the get and a 10 year old police car with 100 plus thousand miles, those, you know, those aren't Sunday drive miles either. You know, they.., they're working cars and...

[Inaudible audience comment]

**ASSISTANT POLICE CHIEF MADDEN:** ...so, I think it's.., it's not very efficient for us to have police officers who come in, go two miles down the street, realize they have an issue and then you have a police officer off the road for two hours tryna find a car that works.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay. And also, when was this, this study completed? How long ago has this been? In the hopper?

**ASSISTANT POLICE CHIEF MADDEN:** 2011 was the study, the purchase of the Tahoe was 2012. And those vehicles are still in service.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you, sir.

**ASSISTANT POLICE CHIEF MADDEN:** Yes, sir.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Anyone else? [Pause]. Alright. Thank you. Alright. Madam Clerk.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Hubbard?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Pardo?

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Davis Johnson?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Miller-Anderson?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Unanimous vote.

**COMMUNITY BENEFITS REQUESTS ON CONSENT**

3. **BI-WI "BECAUSE I'M WORTH IT!" INTERNATIONAL, INC. \$500 - COUNCILMAN TERENCE D. DAVIS - TO DEFRAY COSTS FOR THE MENTORING PROGRAM.**
4. **BI-WI "BECAUSE I'M WORTH IT!" INTERNATIONAL, INC. \$500 - COUNCIL CHAIR KASHAMBA MILLER- ANDERSON - TO DEFRAY COSTS FOR THE MENTORING PROGRAM.**
5. **BI-WI "BECAUSE I'M WORTH IT!" INTERNATIONAL, INC. \$500 - CHAIR PRO TEM TONYA DAVIS JOHNSON - TO DEFRAY COSTS FOR THE MENTORING PROGRAM.**
6. **CHILDREN'S OUTREACH, INC. - \$500 - CHAIR PRO TEM TONYA DAVIS JOHNSON - FOR THE ANNUAL CHRISTMAS CELEBRITY ION ON DECEMBER 16, 2017.**
7. **NELSON'S OUTREACH MINISTRIES, INC. - \$250 - CHAIR PRO TEM TONYA DAVIS JOHNSON - TO DEFRAY COSTS FOR THE ANGEL TREE CHRISTMAS PROGRAM FOR CHILDREN WHOSE PARENTS ARE INCARCERATED ED.**

**OPERATION HOPE, INC. - \$250 - CHAIR PRO TEM TONYA DAVIS JOHNSON - TO DEFRAID COSTS OF THE HOLIDAY PROGRAM, DECEMBER 23, 2017.**

**END OF CONSENT AGENDA**

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** That's the end of our Consent Agenda.

**PETITIONS AND COMMUNICATIONS FOR FILING**

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Do we have any petitions and communications for filing?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Yes, we do, Madam Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** In accordance with §100.361(g)(3) of the Florida Statute, being the City Clerk for the City of Riviera Beach, Madam Chair, I'm here to pre'..., present the certification of the certification of..., that was presented by the Supervisor of Elections for the recall petitions that were distributed for Councilperson Davis, Councilperson Hubbard and Councilperson Pardo. In accordance with §100.361(g)(3), Florida Statute, I, Claudene L. Anthony, City Clerk for the City of Riviera Beach, Palm Beach County, Florida do hereby certify the following according to the certification documents, received and, and are hereby attached from the Palm Beach County Supervisor of Elections. As to the recall petition for Terence D. Davis, District 5, one signature was valid.

[Audience chuckles and inaudible comments]

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** As to the...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Let's keep it down...

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** ...recall petition...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...let's keep it down.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** ...for Lynne Hubbard, District 1, zero signatures were valid.

[Inaudible audience comments]

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** As to the recall petition for Dawn S. Pardo, District 4, one signature was valid.

**UNK.:** [Inaudible]

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** In accordance with §100.361(2)(5), the requisite number of signatures were not met and, in accordance with §100.361(g)(3), Florida Statute, no

further action is required, the matter is at end and the petition shall not be used in any other proceeding.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have here unto set my hand and affixed the seal of the City of Riviera Beach, Palm Beach County, Florida, done this 6<sup>th</sup> day of December 2017. Claudene L. Anthony, CMC, City Clerk.

**UNK. AUDIENCE:** Shame on you.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright.

[Applause]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Awards and... Let's keep it down.

[Inaudible audience comment]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Let's keep it down.

### **AWARDS AND PRESENTATIONS**

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Awards and presentations.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair, we have...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...I., we have questions.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Questions?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** On this.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Who?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yes. I do. Of the City Clerk.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** You have a question?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Of the City Clerk.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Go ahead.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Or the Attorney but on the City Clerk, the purpose of bringing this to the City Council tonight is what?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So disrespectful.



**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** I will read the statute section that I referred to in the certification into the record.

§100.361(g)(3). If the Supervisor determines that the petition does not contain the requisite number of valid, verified and valid signatures, the Clerk shall, upon receipt of such written determination, so certified to the governing body of the municipality or Charter county and file the petition without taking further action, and the matter shall be at an end. No additional names may be added to the petition and the petition shall not be used in any other proceeding.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay. Well, maybe that's not wh'.., what I'm trying to get to. I don't think anyone in this room has filed more petitions and recall'.., not recalls, petitions and referendums and citizen's initiative. What I'm asking is, is this body.., can this body reject this report?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** No.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Or accept? Are you saying that it can.., that, the, the body.., this body does not have a, a voice in accepting this or rejecting it if, if this body chooses not to accept it? [Pause]. And I, and I...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** If I may...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...have a precedence...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...answer that for her?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yes.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** No. You cannot reject it.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay. Mr. Andrew Degraffenreidt, several years ago, and I don't know whether you were the Attorney or not but there was a [stammer] a report, a petitions, a referendum and it, it, um, it was concerning an issue on Singer Island at the time and the Council, at that time, I think, just rejected it and the, the people had to go to court to get it...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** That's not what happened.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...accepted.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** There's a different statute that controls referendum proceedings than the one that controls the recall proceeding.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Well, that may be true but in, in the, the principal, I think is the same and as.., I'm just gonna go on record. There's absolutely no way that this cer'.., should've been certified. If you only have 17 bad ones and 8,500 or more good ones, because the 17 bad ones were because of bad dates, then the 17 bad ones out to be

thrown out and the rest of them should be verified and certified. So, I don't understand how.., I don't understand this and I [stammer]... Let me ask another question, [pause], you know, or maybe you don't know but, there's a.., there, there's going to be a lawsuit as it relates to these petitions and the validity and the.., and others not being valid. My question is this, does this Council have a voice in directing the Attorney for the City to, to stipulate or to have mediation with the recall committee and if it is stipulated between the two parties, in the interest of saving thousands of dollars from a lawsuit, couldn't this Council direct you and say, 'We will stipulate that those 17 bad ones be rejected...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible] rejected.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...and please accept the good ones based upon the date that they were turned in.' Does the Council have the right...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** No.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...to stipulate?

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** No.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** So, we just go to court?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** I'm sorry, sir?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** So, the, the only option that the recall has is to take the City to court?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** I don't think they can take the City to court.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Anybody can take...

[Inaudible audience comments]

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** They may be able to take the Supervisor...

[Inaudible audience comments]

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...of Election to...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Let's...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...court.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Let's keep it down.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** But I don't think they can take the City...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Let's keep it...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...to court.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...down out there, please.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So disrespectful.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** They [inaudible].

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** One of the facts that's [stammer] misunderstood from the public's perspective is that the recall statute, in order to avoid any aspersions or castigations of the City or the City officials, says that it's the Supervisor of Elections office that makes the decision. The recall statute says, upon filing, the Clerk is to immediately turn those petitions over to the Supervisor of Election, which was done.

[Inaudible audience comments]

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** The determination of... Shut up for a minute. The determination...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Excuse me. [Inaudible].

[Inaudible audience comments]

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** I'm talking to my client.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Wait a minute, wait a minute.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Just a minute that's...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Wait a minute.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...not acceptable.

[inaudible dais and audience comments]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Let's... Excuse me. Stop, please.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Who you talking to?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** You're not talking to me.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No. Don't talk to me, you need to...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Don't...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mr. Davis.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mr. Davis.

[Inaudible comments]

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Point of order.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** We are not...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Excuse me.

[Inaudible comment]

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...doing this.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** We're not doing anything.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** We are not...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** There's nothing...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Excuse me.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...going on.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** But...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Hold on one...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** As a...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...minute. One minute, Mr. Degraffenreidt. One second.

**UNK.:** I'm taking my basketball and I'm going home.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright.

[Chuckles]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Let's keep it in perspective here.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Let's keep it professional.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** In order...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** That as well.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...to avoid any appearance of impropriety by the challenged municipality or the officials, the statute gives the say so, the review and the verification authority to the Supervisor of Election. Now please keep in mind that the petitions that was submitted to the Supervisor of Election, in order to evaluate the validity of the signatures, were presented by the recall group and all of them were attested to by some witness. So, there was nobody here or there who took an opportunity to challenge the truthfulness of what was submitted. But based upon what they submitted, a determination was made by the Supervisor of Election, that it did not meet the statutes requirements. She certified that...

**UNK.:** [Inaudible]

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...to be true. Not, not Claudene or anyone else. Once that certification is made by the officials charged under the general law with the responsibility, it is [stammer], mandatory [inaudible] that she come back and tell you what that report was. That's why she's complying with the statute.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay. Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Go ahead.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Let's set that aside. But, I heard Mr. Degraffenreidt tell a citizen to shut up and that's being televised, that's everywhere. So, Mr. Degraffenreidt, I know you're more prof'., professional then...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** You are quite correct, sir, and I do apologize.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** So, what's your apologize? I didn't hear you.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** I said, you are quite correct, sir, and I apologize profusely.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you, sir.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** [Inaudible] should have let him finish [inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. Is there anything else, Mr. Mayor?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mr. Mayor?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yes. The, the public.., does.., if the public wants to have comment on this, can they at this time or would wait 'til public comment?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Do they do the comment cards for the...

[Inaudible audience comment]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...section here, for petitions and communications for filing?

**UNK.:** No.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mr. Degraffenreidt?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Would you repeat the question, please?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I said, is there a comment card that can be put in for petitions and communications for filing, that section?

**CHAIRPERSON DAVIS:** It's too late.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Can a comment be put,.., a comment card...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Public comment card.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** To, to do what?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Are they able to comment on this particular section that we're speaking of?

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** At public comments

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** They can comment if they choose to. But it's a fait accompli, it's something that's required by general law. We don't have a choice. They can speak whatever their mind is on the issue, but it is done.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** At public comments.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** It is done.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** [Inaudible].

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** That's why it said the...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** We do have public comments...

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** ...proceeding is...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...that we're going to start at 7:30. So, if we can kinda wrap it up at that time? That would be fine, I think. To be able to it, that's another 30 minutes or so. Is there anything else for petitions and communications for filing?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Not at this time, Madam Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Did you have something, Mr. Davis? Mr. Davis, did you, did you want something? [Pause]. Okay.

### **AWARDS AND PRESENTATIONS**

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Awards and presentations.

9.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Item No. 9.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY: PRESENTATION BY BISHOP PHILLIP DUKES,  
OPERATION RESTORE PROGRAM**

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright.

**DR. P. DUKES:** Madam Chair, Council, Mayor.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Good evening.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Good evening.

**DR. P. DUKES:** Dr. Phillip Dukes, 1217 Avenue U, CEO of Operation Restore. And this is...

**MS. L. DUKES:** I'm LaShonda Dukes. The better half.

[Chuckles]

**DR. P. DUKES:** And the Vice President and it's all true.

I was told I only had 10 minutes, am I correct?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** There's no time limit but just, you know, go...

**DR. P. DUKES:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...ahead and do...

**DR. P. DUKES:** Well, I'm, I'm...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...your presentation.

**DR. P. DUKES:** ...going to... I'm...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Not 30 minutes, now. Just [chuckles].

**DR. P. DUKES:** I, I, I do 30 minutes...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Oh, she gave you...

**DR. P. DUKES:** ...but I'm not gonna do it tonight.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Hold on one second. Is.., was that a time you gave?

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**DR. P. DUKES:** They said...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**DR. P. DUKES:** ...10 minutes.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**DR. P. DUKES:** That' what they told me but I'm going.., I'm, I'm, gonna do it in 10 minutes but I'm gonna ask you to allow me to come back next month so I can give you a full presentation because this is too big to really do in 10 minutes because all the studies that we have done to deal with gun violence across the country or that I have done in the last 20 years to solve this problem. I.., my wife is gonna read you what Operation Restore is founded in and our philosophy and ten I'm gonna go into a one facet of our program, which is the community mentoring program that we have for our City.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Point of order. Madam Chair, how much time do you need for a complete program? You need 10 minutes now...

**DR. P. DUKES:** I need...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...and then 20 minutes later?

**DR. P. DUKES:** No. Ten minutes right now is good but I...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** And then when you come back...

**DR. P. DUKES:** ...wanna come back and do, do...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...it's 10.



**DR. P. DUKES:** ...at least 30 minutes or 25 minutes so I can do the slide presentation about gun violence and how we got to where we are today.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Chair?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay. Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** I would like to request that we place his presentation on a workshop Agenda...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...so that we can...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I agree.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...give him a full opportunity to present.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I agree with that.

**DR. P. DUKES:** Okay. Go ahead, Mr. Dukes.

**MS. L. DUKES:** Operation Restore, Incorporated is a non-religious 501(c)(3) organization. Our goal is to impact youth, families and communities in low income neighborhoods that are drug and crime infested. We believe that inner city youth are being socialized to a culture of violence and crime through the drug retail market, which is allowed to breed in these neighborhoods which causes the family unit to break down. We have accepted the responsibility to bring equity to these neighborhoods on every level. This goal will be achieved by hosting community drug rallies that call for zero tolerance of drug use and drug dealing. We will offer free tutoring for youth and family counseling for those who have a need.

In addition, music lessons, vocal and performing arts training will be provided free on a weekly basis. We will offer financial and credit seminars for families and youth. Operation Restore, Incorporated will not promote any religion but will network with all agencies, religions, philanthropic groups that believe in the welfare and equity of all people as we advance the American dream as a reality. Our mentoring program is the missing element in changing our community atmosphere from drugs and gangs that are community terrorists. The drug retail market is one of the main problems in our community. We reject the ideology that if you live in a poor community, you will have drugs, high crime and high murder rates. We believe that lawlessness, apathy and... in a society that refuses to invest in communities, that have been overlooked and ignored because of social cultural bias and prejudice is the catalyst for our community decay and youth delinquency.

Our program, once implemented in any community will, in less than 45 days, decrease up to 70 to 85% of the drug retail market. When drugs and gang dealers see the police presence, people of the community and those from your centric conservative community working together, the cycle of drugs, murder and youth being socialized to thug life will begin to break. Again, we will network with all existing City and county programs. If you would like to help us out, then please contact Bishop Dukes and Operation Restore at P.O. Box 10111, Riviera Beach, Florida 33419.

**DR. P. DUKES:** Thank you, baby.

[Chuckles]

**DR. P. DUKES:** No. We're finna celebrate 25 years, she's been with me so ya'll say, 'Lord have mercy.'

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** [Chuckles].

**MS. L. DUKES.:** Yes, Lord.

**DR. P. DUKES:** Now, how do we break.., how do we [pause]. I'm sorry. Take these, baby 'cause I'm finna make a mess. You know how I do.

**MS. L. DUKES:** I know.

**DR. P. DUKES:** Thank you.

How to break the drug retail market. The drug retail market has been set up in the African American community across America. There are six principals that allowed this to happen, historical bigotry, disenfranchisement, implicit' ba'.., implicit bias, fear, apathy and lawlessness. That's what sets up the drug retail market in the bLack community, all across America and in Riviera Beach. It is not drugs come into the country is the problem, there are.., there is much propaganda that's out there, 'Supply and demand,' that's more propaganda because when supply and demand happens in the business world, there's a great demand for knock off purses. Louis Vuitton, or whatever. When they get upset with that market, they enforce the law. They, they go throughout the United States, they find out where it is and they break it. We have not had that same mindset in the black community, in Riviera Beach or across the United States, where we work together. The Police Department, the City Council, elected officials and the residents has to work as one. In this atmosphere that we have now, what we call racial tension, which is a word that I don't like to use, I like to use culture because there's no such thing as race. We're one human race. This is the point that we all need to work together on. There is more unity in saving manatees, dogs, cats and birds than it is for black children in America. So, we have to work together. The Police Department has to work in the community four days a week, once we designate an area. We all know, in the black community, who's selling drugs. You don't meet with gang leaders, you don't meet with gangs. They're criminals. You put them in prison, one whom I used to be. Now, I know that's not popular with black folk' but you couldn't talk to me until I got locked up. I was arrogant. Extremely

arrogant. So, that same mindset is bred in the streets. These little kids watch that. You have to break that mindset. There's no excuses for anybody to sell dope. You sell dope 'cause you don't wanna work. Now, when you go to metropolitan cities, there's a different dynamic but right now, I'm talking about Riviera Beach. And even in those metropolitan cities, there are youth that are not doing that. There are more youth in Riviera Beach that are not using drugs, that's not into this lifestyle than the ones that are but they breed that negative mindset to the other ones. So we don't need to take them, just bring them out of the community, we must change the community atmosphere.

Now, the Police Department has to work in the, in the neighborhood four days a week, once the designated area is established where we're gonna be working. It can't be random, it has to be, like, from 1<sup>st</sup> Street until we get to Silver Beach Road. And the re'.., the Police Department and you, City Council, or whoever's sitting on the City Council, we have to set this precedent of working with the residents. The residents cannot come out on their own and take their community because they kill. That is something that we don't like to talk about. That dynamic is not in Palm Beach Gardens, that dynamic is not in North Palm Beach. There's nothing in those communities that, when they get ready to stand up for their youth or do anything that can cost them their lives but, in the black community, in Riviera Beach, if you come on the corner and say, 'We're gonna change this,' we have a whole counterculture that says we'll kill you. I've experienced it. And we have.., and I, and I, and I have the credentials to prove it by the Palm Beach Post in 2002 by the work we do. Even 'til this day, I still get threats but we cannot allow that to keep us from moving forward. We must have higher standards in our community and it can be done. It is not done because we don't have a will to work with the Police Department, the City Council and the residents. This must be done for six to eight weeks and it's a seven year program. It becomes a lifestyle if you're gonna break it. You cannot break this through just going out, telling people, you know, 'We love you, we wanna see you change.' It doesn't work like that. It doesn't work like that in any other thing. It.., you go down to CityPlace, you start doing crime, they'll, they'll, they'll start doing arrests but they tell us, in the black community, 'Well, we just can't, uh, do this through the law, we can't police our way out of this.' That's a lie. That's a part of the mindset that has low standards in the black community and it starts with us having a higher standards. Because anytime you have crime in any other element, they don't bring those concepts to you, , they enforce the law.

But there's another dynamic, while we're doing this, we've got to deal with. Disenfranchisement. We've got to deal with that. We do have to offer people something else. I'm not talking about just putting people in jail, no, no, no. But we have to offer them something else but, at the same time, we have to hold them accountable. To one group, we must become a blanket of love and concern and covering and to another group, we have to become a rod of iron because when children die and we do these funerals, tears don't bring them back.

**UNK. AUDIENCE:** That's right.

**DR. P. DUKES:** Tears don't help that mother's heart heal and shouldn't have to be like that but it is. Let me give you some statistics here on homicide. I'm almost, I'm almost

done. [Pause]. It's on the board? No. Okay, there it is. Thank you so much. Riviera Beach, this, this is from the Palm Beach Post...

**MS. L. DUKES:** Homicide traffic.

**DR. P. DUKES:** Homicide traffic. Riviera Beach, 34,000 residents.

**MS. L.. DUKES:** [Inaudible].

**DR. P. DUKES:** 101 homicides. West Palm Beach, 108,000 residents, 151 homicides.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** [Inaudible].

**DR. P. DUKES:** When you look at these numbers... Oh, you gotta bring it back.

[Inaudible background comment]

**DR. P. DUKES:** Oh, there it is. Look at Wellington, 64,000 residents, 13 homicides. Lake Park, 8,600 residents.., uh, I ain't got my.., let me put my glasses on...

**MS. L. DUKES:** Nine.

**DR. P. DUKES:** Nine homicides. Palm Beach Shores.

**MS. L. DUKES:** One.

**DR. P. DUKES:** One. 1,200 residents. Royal Palm Beach, 38,000 residents, 4 homicides. Now, they will tell you that this has something to do with poverty. When you look at those studies on crime and poverty, those studies are biased. This is lawlessness because, historically, the black community has become the storm drain for whatever goes down. You can do anything in a black neighborhood. Anything can go on. It's always been lax, we've never had high standards. These go back to the Jim Crowe days. This is 2017. Now, let's just go back 50 yea'.., let's go back to 1967. We had a heroin problem in the black community. A serious heroin problem, nobody said anything but heroin now, it's a social, what? Problem. But they never did that with the black community.

Now, I'm not trying to make this... Some people say, 'Well, you're, you're being racial.' That's what America is but if we join together and follow this vision and systematically and finance it and work together, this is not about Phillip Dukes whoever have the.., how I wanna say, the pre-emulance, it's about our City. Our City should be the example to the state and the nation in solving this problem but it's not because we don't have finances through disenfranchisement. And we got, and we gotta have the will to do it because when black children die, people aren't really not concerned. I can dogs and start beating dogs on E Avenue...

**UNK. AUDIENCE:** Right.

**DR. P. DUKES:** Just beat two dogs every other work, you're gonna see the Peggy Adams Foundation...

[Inaudible audience comments]

**DR. P. DUKES:** You're gonna see all these folks down there, everybody gonna be concerned. I can same boiled eggs outta my refrigerator and some bologna sandwiches, I like fried bologna, go on the beach with my wife, start eating boiled eggs, have a, have a bag where they can see the eggs and walking off the beach, somebody gonna call the police and say, 'He got some turtle eggs,' and in less than 10 minutes, somebody gonna have me in handcuffs. They're gonna make sure them boiled eggs are not turtle eggs. Now, ya'll know that's a fact. But we don't treat the black community like that.

This is why we have to deal with this implicit bias. And that is on all sides. In other words, we're conditioned to act a certain way. We are not conditioned to have higher standards in our community and it can't just be the police by themselves, as I said before, it has to be all of us together with the police because we have killers in our community. Don't you..., you, you, you get some of these gangs and you watch some of they' Facebook. These boys are 14 and 15. They're being socialized to a culture of violence. Now, I'm not excusing their behavior and I'm not excusing mine. I became a criminal by choice, I wasn't raised like that but it was allowed in my neighborhood. Drug dealing was allowed in my neighborhood. The only time that this thing was dealt with, was during election time. You know what we call that, indictment time.

[Audience chuckles]

**DR. P. DUKES:** So, we have to deal with this issue and work together with the residents, with the Police Department. See, when these police departments are in the community, they have to be in there and they can't be on call, they have to be set up during those hours, from 12:00 noon to, to 3:00 p.m. at night, four days a week. Systematically, taking that community back, 'cause it cannot be done any other way.

What's gonna happen to us, which it already is across the nation, when our communities go down because of drugs and violence, other people come in, put up stuff we cannot afford and wherever we go, we got the same social problems. Because no one has a willing heart to do what I just told you. They say, 'Okay. Let's invest in the community.' It can be done but the mindset says, 'Well, you've had this so long, nothing has changed yet.' Because we've never done it right. So'..., it's something about black folk. Let me be black for a minute. That we don't wanna work with the police. Now, we don't mind the police coming out to some of the functions we have but we won't work with the police to enforce the law in our community because we keep making excuses. Little Johnny can't get the kind of money he want' working at McDonalds. Little Johnny can't get the kind of money he want' working at Winn Dixie. Well, I worked at Blizzard and Burger, I did it. Tell me I don't know nothin' about Blizzard and Burger.

[Inaudible audience comments]

**DR. P. DUKES:** In Lake Park. I worked there but I had a mindset when I decided I wasn't gonna work, that, that, that negative...

**UNK.:** Mhmm.

**DR. P. DUKES:** ...social culture, that counterculture got to me because it was allowed in my community. So, we gotta get rid of these negative mindsets that we have...

**UNK.:** That's right.

**DR. P. DUKES:** whether you have to offer them so they stop selling drugs. Prison! But we don't like saying that.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mr. Dukes, I'm gonna have you wrap it.

**DR. P. DUKES:** Thank you...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And then we'll try to get...

**DR. P. DUKES:** Yeah.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...you on the workshop...

**DR. P. DUKES:** Okay. Let me wrap it up.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...Agenda.

**DR. P. DUKES:** Now, when we start talking about changing our community atmosphere, this must be a lifestyle of higher standards in 2000, going into 2018. We don't need empty rhetoric because there are gonna be more killings between tonight and September of 2018. Watch how the shooting starts. It will be germane to our communities. But we can change our community atmosphere and I hope you put me on the Agenda so I can show you some slides of how this thing was set up from 19'.., in the, in the.., what I call this [inaudible] drug [inaudible] from 1982 until today.

Thank you so much.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you so much.

[Applause]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Item No. 10.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair, I have a question.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Of the presenter. Pastor, Dr. Dukes, just one quick question.

**DR. P. DUKES:** Yes.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I, I know we're gonna see more of your presentation in the workshop, as suggested by the Co-Chair but do you have any knowledge of any documentation that there's any other..., is any other African American city, or majority, that's..., has adopted your model so far?

**DR. P. DUKES:** No. Because I've studied the Rice Project, I've studied all these different projects. What happens is, is that there's a culture bias. Let me, let me be real frank, well black folk and white folk don't work together on this. Now, they don't mind doing certain small things but what I'm talking about, they don't do that because there's a fear and there's apathy.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** So, if the City adopts this, whenever we see it in, in entirety, it would be the first?

**DR. P. DUKES:** Yes, it...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** In...

**DR. P. DUKES:** ...would be the first.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** In the nation?

**DR. P. DUKES:** It'll be the first in the nation because, when you look, when you look at, when you look at America, ya'll think about this, when you look at America, look at New York, look at any drug infested neighborhood, black folk and white folk...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**DR. P. DUKES:** ...don't work together.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Alright. I just wanted you to answer that. Thank you.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you so much.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you, Madam Co-Chair.

10.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Item No. 10.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY: UPDATE BY JOHN W. HURT, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OF THE RIVIERA BEACH HOUSING AUTHORITY ON THE DEVELOPMENT ACTIVITIES OF THE HERON ESTATES PROJECT**

**MR. J. HURT:** Good evening...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Good evening...

**MR. J. HURT:** ...Madam Chairman.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...Mr. Hurt.

**MR. J. HURT:** Council Members and Mr. Mayor.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Good evening, sir.

**MR. J. HURT:** I'm John W. Hurt, Executive Director of the Riviera Beach Housing Authority. I'm here with our development team and I'd just like to introduce them. We have the Chairman of our Board, Delvin Thomas, we have the Vice Chair of our Board, Jeffrey Jackson, we have the President and CEO of Housing Trust Group, Mr. Matt Rieger and we have Mr. Bryan Finney who's a strategic development partner with the Housing Trust Group. We're here this evening to try to give you a brief update on the development of the Heron Estates residential community. Next slide. As you all know, the former Ivy Green Village is located on Congress just south of Blue Heron and north of Martin Luther King and currently it's a 15.3 acre site that's vacant, with all of the former public housing developments demolished. Next. We're looking forward to developing a new residential community there in two phases. Phase 1 is going to be a senior building, senior living facility and Phase 2 is gonna be a family community. Next. Currently, we're, we're in the process of finishing a development of Phase 1, , which is the Heron Estates senior building. As we presented it, it will be a 'L' shaped building, three story, providing affordable living for senior citizens. It will be 101 units. We have 81 units of one bedrooms, 22 bedrooms will consist of community room, exercise room, swimming pool and other activities in the building.

We anticipate the units will be leased at an affordable rate for our seniors. The age restriction will be 62 years of age or over. We anticipate our one bedrooms will rent in the neighborhood of \$709 and the two bedrooms will rent for \$859. We, we are building in a lotta amenities into the senior facility. There will be a lake feature, club room, exercise room and, as you can see, a long list of amenities. There will be laundry rooms on each floor and there will be even hook ups in each unit for laundry facilities. We, of course, are looking ahead to make sure it's a safe environment for our seniors and quite nicely, we're gonna make this a green efficient building, with all the technology that's available at the time of completion. Next. Right now, our senior building is funded. [Pause]. Our funding sources are from the Palm Beach County Housing Finance Authority, with 4% bonds and we anticipate raising about \$12,000,000 for those bonds. We are also getting funding from the Florida Housing Finance Corporation, SAL funds, which is a State Apartment, um...

**UNK.:** Loans.

**MR. J. HURT:** Loans, in the amount of \$5.6M. We're getting construction financing from Chase Bank, that will roll over into permanent financing in the amount of \$4.8M. And



the Riviera Beach Housing Authority is contributing \$1,000,000 to our senior development. So, the approximate total project cost, for our senior building it's gonna be \$23.49M.

[Inaudible whispering]

**MR. J. HURT:** Thank you. At this point in time, for the senior building in Phase 1, we have identified our general contracting team and we've gone through a long selection process to do that with our co-developer and we have those team members present tonight. The selection is a combination Gulf Building, LLC, in partnership with Newbold Construction and Ran'.., and Randolph Construction. I'd like to introduce Ms. Jordana Jarjura and Dwayne Randolph, from Randolph Construction, who are, who are a part of the general contracting team. We made a commitment to this City and to this Council that we would make every effort to have local participation. We have a strong commitment from our general contracting partners about local participation. We had a meeting last evening, with local contractors in the community, we've been developing section three contractors to be involved in the construction of this senior facility.

We're here tonight to talk to you a little bit about Phase 2. And Phase 2 is going to be a family community of 79 units. They'll be townhouse style units, one, two and three bedrooms, along with a community building, basketball court and other family amenities. We are currently seeking funding for Phase 2. We anticipate funding from the Florida Housing Finance Corporation, we're applying for 9% tax credits that would generate about \$15,000,000. We already engaged a relationship with Chase Bank and they will provide the construction financing and convert it to permanent financing in the amount of \$2.9M. Our code development partner, HTG will defer some of their fees in order to make this project work. And we're here tonight to talk to the City of Riviera Beach and the City Council about their participation in a local government opportunity grant. So, the projection for Phase 2, for 79 units will be about \$18.7M.

So once again, we were here last year addressing this Council about making a application to the Florida Housing Finance Corporation for 9% tax credits and this Council did co'.., give us consideration for that under a Resolution 185-16, in the amount of \$551,0000. This year's application has been modified and then this years' application, they're asking a request for local government contribution, in the amount of \$567,500. In your Resolution last year, when you provided that, we do understand that money was never used or accepted because we weren't successful in last year's application. So, we're back once again, asking for your partnership and cooperation and consideration of partnering with that Housing Authority and providing us with a local...

[Inaudible whispering]

**MR. J. HURT:** ...government area of opportunity funding in the amount of \$567,500. All of the conditions of the last Resolution will still apply.

We're here tonight to certainly ask for your consideration and our team here is willing to answer any questions that you may have.

Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you. Do we have any public comment cards for this Item?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** No, we do not, Madam Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Council, do we have any comments? Questions?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Mr. Hurt.

**MR. J. HURT:** Yes, ma'am.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** This is the same as the first application. We rarely change funds., funds rarely will change hands, it will be [stammer] reimbursed back to the City in the, in the form of services or what have you. Can you explain that for the public's benefit?

**MR. J. HURT:** Certainly. This grant, if given to our Phase 2, will go into that project. Any., we have cooperation agreements with both the CRA and the CDC to partner with them to build more affordable housing in the City of Riviera Beach. Our Board has a Resolution that's in your packet, and we're committed to obligate our future development funds, that we would generate out of this project and other available HUD funds that we have to work with the CRA and CDC and would contribute that amount or more to develop affordable housing in the City of Riviera Beach.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Anyone else?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yes. Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Go ahead.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Mr. Hurt.

**MR. J. HURT:** Yes, Mr. Mayor.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you. Was any particular reason., and this is minute but just for the record, that it was named after Blue Heron, when it's really a little distance from Blue Heron, more on Congress. Was there any reason why you chose Blue Heron?

**MR. J. HURT:** Well, I...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**MR. J. HURT:** ...my best response, Mr. Mayor, is that our Chairman of the Board, when the Board deliberated and had input about the renaming of the former Ivy Green Village site, we went through a process of, of trying to identify a new community, a new residential community and our Chair, Delvin Thomas, suggested Blue.., not Blue Heron but Heron Estates. Heron Estates.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Mhmm.

**MR. J. HURT:** Heron Estates.

[Chuckles]

**MR. J. HURT:** You have to forgive me, I'm from up north so. Heron Estates, as a viable identifier for a new community, south of Blue Heron Boulevard on Congress.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay. I would like for you to just look at the possibility maybe naming something inside, maybe the rec room or one of the rooms, after Ivy Green, to kinda bring that identity back to those that, you know, that would remember Ivy Green since that's the location. I mean, something...

**MR. J. HURT:** Mhmm.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...in there, even if it's just a room.

**MR. J. HURT:** Right. I...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Would you look at that?

**MR. J. HURT:** Mr. Mayor, our, our Board has discussed that extensively. We do plan to do that, everything from having pictures in the building...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay.

**MR. J. HURT:** ...[stammer], recovering any memorabilia, bricks or anything else that we can do. We're also gonna do some art in the building. And there's been discussion about [pause] art at the entry that's reflective of, not only the community, but perhaps, the former Ivy Green Village.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** And last but not least, I'm very, very proud of, of this Board since that's about the only board that I appoint.

**MR. J. HURT:** Yes.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** And you guys have done a good job.

**MR. J. HURT:** Thank you, Mr. Mayor.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Anyone else?

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Yes, Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Go ahead.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Okay. So, Mr. Hurt, can you be clear, you do need the City's funds to move forward with this project?

**MR. J. HURT:** Absolutely. We anticipate submitting this application on December 20<sup>th</sup> and, as a part of the application for us to get the additional 10 points for the government support area opportunity, we do need a Resolution to submit with the packet.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Okay. And how confident are you that you will receive funds from the state? You know, so we have the article in the newspaper, was it yesterday, today, you know, talking about how the state legislator.., legislature will be probably rating the Housing Trust Fund, once again, this year?

**MR. J. HURT:** I'll let...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** And I know a lotta cities are...

**MR. J. HURT:** May I...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** ...you know, going...

**MR. J. HURT:** ...let Mr. Rieger respond...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** ...after that money so

**MR. J. HURT:** ...to that?

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Yeah. Can you guys just...

**MR. M. RIEGER:** Sure. Matthew Rieger, President and CEO of Housing Trust Group. Thank you all for, for your consideration of this proposal today. It's very important to the community.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**MR. M. RIEGER:** With respect to the Sadowski Trust Fund, you're right, the Governor's proposed budget does raid those once again. But obviously that's not a final budget so the good news is, is the funds we're pursuing for Phase 2 are not subject to anyone's raiding the Sadowski Trust Fund. These are federal funds, 9% tax credits. And, and to answer your first question with respect to our chances, if we don't get this loan, we have a zero percent chance. If we get this loan, our chances are somewhere between 33% and 66% based on the amount of applications submitted last year that did receive this level of support from the local government.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Okay. So, how many cities in the State of Florida did receive federal funding for projects like this?

**MR. M. RIEGER:** Last year, this was the first year they did this, there were nine local governments who gave this amount of money and six of them received funding.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** In Florida or...

**MR. M. RIEGER:** Correct.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** ...throughout the country?

**MR. M. RIEGER:** All throughout the State of Florida. This is a Florida initiative.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Okay. Alright.

**MR. M. RIEGER:** Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Anyone else?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Go ahead.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** So, with that being said, zero chance if we don't get the Sadowski dollars, what then, not...

**UNK.:** No, no.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...Sadowski but the, the other dollars. With that being said, what is the Plan B to ensure funding of Phase 2?

**MR. M. RIEGER:** So, we always wanna look at the, the targets right in front of us.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mhmm.

**MR. M. RIEGER:** And these applications are due within, I think, two weeks.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mhmm.

**MR. M. RIEGER:** So, this is, without a doubt, our number one priority. After that, we're gonna look at ongoing programs and sources of dollars that the Florida Housing Finance Corporation, through..., puts out throughout the year and, at the same time, we're gonna look at private sources and other potential opportunities to joint venture to, hopefully, facilitate development. But, but our, our number one priority has to be the dollars that are staring at us right in the face, with our application is due in two weeks.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Is there an opportunity for us to go back to Palm Beach County for additional funding for Phase 2?

**MR. M. RIEGER:** Sure. There's always an opportunity to ask for more money but if you look at the, the capital stack that, that Director Hurt showed you, the, the amount of money we were going to, hopefully, get from the 9% tax credits, I think it was, like, \$15,000,000.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mhmm.

**MR. M. RIEGER:** That's a lot. And so, really, if you think about leveraging your resources, a five hundred something thousand dollar loan to generate \$15,000,000 of federal sources is, in my mind, and again, this is just one guy speaking, a pretty good use of money.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** It certainly is a pretty good use of money but we have to be realistic and look at what our other potential options may be if we are not successful...

**MR. M. RIEGER:** You are...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...and I just want us to think that.

**MR. M. RIEGER:** You are 1,000% correct.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, sir.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Anyone else?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Go ahead.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Mr. Rieger, you mentioned there was six of nine that was awarded the appropriations. Do..., can you identify the six, who they were?

**MR. M. RIEGER:** The, the six projects that were awarded throughout the state, if you're referring to them, were one in each of the respective large counties across the State of Florida so, one development received this funding in Broward, one in Palm Beach, one in Hillsborough, one in Orange County, one in Duvall County and one in, I'm thinking of one other large county that, Pinellas.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Okay. Thank you.

**MR. M. RIEGER:** Sure.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. Anyone else?

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** I believe they were looking for a vote from you all tonight regarding reappropriating this funding or...

[Pause]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam...

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** ...some ki'...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Go ahead.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I'd like to make a motion that we support the Housing Authority as a partnership to make sure we get allocation add the five hundred and...

**MR. J. HURT:** Sixty-seven...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...sixty seven thousand...

**MR. J. HURT:** Five.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...dollars. Sixty...

**MR. J. HURT:** Five., sixty-seven five.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Five sixty-seven five for... For the Housing Authority.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Phase 2.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Phase 2.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Second.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** I second.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Madam...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** [Stammer]...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Yeah.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Madam...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** [Inaudible] second?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yeah. She did. Mhmm.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Okay. Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Go ahead.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Okay. So, Ms. Hoskins, so, since those funds weren't used last year, we didn't reallocate them anywhere, did we? Or, the..., we...

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** No. We didn't.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** ...still have those funds...

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** And I would...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** ...in an account?

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** ...like to verify with Director Sherma...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** ..., those funds are...

[Pause]

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** Good evening. Randy Sherman.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Good evening.

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** The request came in December last year, I believe.

[Inaudible comment]

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN:** Was when you approved it and we did not put anything into this fiscal year because, again, the award was not made so we will have to consider putting something in next year's fiscal year budget. So again, it wa'..., the request came in but you, you know, it's not like you need the cash, you know, right there on the point you're, you're, you're agreeing to provide that funding in the future. So, nothing was put into this year. So again, we'll watch it and as something comes up, we'll put it in next year's budget.

[Inaudible comment]

**MR. J. HURT:** If I may.

**UNK.:** Yep.



**MR. J. HURT:** The con'..., this contribution is...

[Inaudible background comments]

**MR. J. HURT:** ...will not..., due to be developed until after the construction of the project and, and after substantial completion. And so, we're talking a timeline that's at least two years away before the funds will need to be available. But what we...

[Inaudible background discussion]

**MR. J. HURT:** ...need now is the commitment.

[Inaudible background discussions]

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** And..., yeah. And Madam Chair. Right. So, we went through this already. We used to apply for the new market tax credits and it was the same thing, we had to commit the dollars but...

**UNK.:** Right.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Right. If we didn't...

**UNK.:** That's right.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** ...get it, they just came back. Okay. I'm good.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. Anyone else? [Stammer]...

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** And Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** I would have to bring back a Resolution again. It'll be passed the..., your deadline but..., or, on the day, the 20<sup>th</sup>, I will bring back a Resolution.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Right. So you have the commitment.

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** For next meeting.

**MR. J. HURT:** Yes. We would need it signed on the 20<sup>th</sup>, if possible, so that we can submit the application that day. You know, days are critical on submission of applications, if you're late, you're out. So, they...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**MR. J. HURT:** ...try to...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Sure.

**MR. J. HURT:** ...submit early.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Why didn't you come earlier?

[Inaudible dais comment]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** We are [inaudible] now. We can sign the documents.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Why didn't they come earlier?

**MR. J. JACKSON:** Excuse me. Is it...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** [Inaudible].

**MR. J. JACKSON:** ...poss'...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** [Inaudible].

**MR. J. JACKSON:** Jeffrey Jackson.

Is it possible to read the old Resolution, just inserting the new numbers that would help us be expedient?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Uh-uh.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** To the developing partner, would a Letter of Commitment, stating what took place on this day and there's a Resolution scheduled for, for that day? Would that help?

**MR. M. RIEGER:** Yeah. Unfortunately, Florida Housing has very specific requirements.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Okay.

**MR. M. RIEGER:** So we need exactly what we got last year.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Okay.

**MR. M. RIEGER:** I'm sorry if it's, you know, difficult but, you know, they make it hard to get this but...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So...

**MR. M. RIEGER:** ...it's so important and...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So, we would need...

**MR. M. RIEGER:** ...anything you guys could...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...to call a special meeting...

**MR. M. RIEGER:** ...do to help facilitate...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...to do that?

**MR. M. RIEGER:** ...this, that would be appreciated.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well, we have a CRA meeting on the 13<sup>th</sup>, right?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yeah.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Did you all want to...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...do a special meeting right before that and...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...be able to get the document...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** That's fine.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...done?

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** That's fine.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So the...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** I'm fine [inaudible]...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...vote that we're...

**MR. M. RIEGER:** Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...taking tonight is just to.., do we still need to take the vote tonight or are we just gonna bring it back on the 13<sup>th</sup>? Take a vote...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** [Inaudible] the vote...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...saying that we're gonna do...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...tonight.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...the Resolution...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...for.., on the 13<sup>th</sup>?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** My motion [inaudible]...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Take a vote tonight so...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes or no?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...Ms. Hoskins can prepare it.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** ...that's devoid. If you all wanna proceed with your vote, you may do so and we just bring back a Resolution to memorialize your actions on tonight.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** On the 13<sup>th</sup>.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. Alright. Go ahead, and call the vote. Call the question.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Pardo?

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Davis Johnson?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Hubbard?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Miller-Anderson?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Unanimous vote.

**UNK.:** Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. Thank you, s'...

**MR. J. HURT:** Thank you very much...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you.

**MR. J. HURT:** ...Councilperson, for your support.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So we'll come..., we'll do a special meeting right before the CRA meeting.

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. Okay.

### **PUBLIC COMMENTS**

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** We're gonna go ahead..., it's 7:43, we'll go ahead into our public comment card so, if you would like to put in a public comment card, please do so at this time.

[Pause]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** PUBLIC COMMENT SHOULD BE RESTRICTED TO ISSUES MATTERS OR TOPICS PERTINENT TO THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH. PLEASE BE REMINDED THAT THE CITY COUNCIL HAS ADOPTED RULES OF DECORUM GOVERNING PUBLIC CONDUCT DURING OFFICIAL MEETINGS WHICH HAS BEEN POSTED AT THE ENTRANCE OF THE COUNCIL CHAMBERS. IN AN EFFORT TO PRESERVE ORDER, IF ANY OF THE RULES ARE NOT ADHERED TO, THE COUNCIL CHAIR MAY HAVE AN DISRUPTIVE SPEAKER OR ATTENDEE REMOVED FROM THE PODIUM, FROM THE MEETING

**AND/OR BUILDING, IF NECESSARY. PLEASE GOVERN YOURSELVES ACCORDINGLY.**

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And I want to remind everyone to please pay attention to the three-minute time up on the projector screen, please. Alright?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, the acceptance of public comment cards during this time, is now closed.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Norm Adams, Alfred Jones and Craig Glover.

**MR. N. ADAMS:** Thank you. Norm Adams.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Good evening.

**MR. N. ADAMS:** Omissions, lies and conflicts of interest. That's what you guys are gonna go down as.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**MR. N. ADAMS:** No, don't shake your head, TD, because the omission was..., back in September when the Mayor said, 'Is anybody gonna make a motion regarding personnel of the City?' And the five of you were silent. And all of a sudden, you made a motion, you couldn't answer his question, that's an omission. Lies, there are too many to count. Conflicts of interest, the primary culprit is sitting three people to my right. I've got letters from the super'..., Supervisor of Elections basically saying all she does is verify the names that they're on the voter and counts..., counts the petitions. She laid it back on your Attorney who lied when he said, 'Oh, it's the Supervisor of Election.' That's not true. I've..., have an email from the Deputy Assistant, or whatever she is, saying it, call the Attorney's office. He's the man with the conflict of interest. Does he still represent one or more of you? And he picked..., he, he said he abided by the rules. Well, he didn't. He said there were these things dated in January, which was before Jonathan was hired and before the..., it was printed and he also said there were a couple in September, the petitions. Well, there was also one dated 1937, somebody wrote down his birthday. There was several others dated 2016. All I can surmise is, the City Attorney used his judgment, not the law, and he said, 'Hey these were scribner err'..., errors so I'm not gonna even consider these from 2016. But then he looked at the one that said 2017, January, and he considered that.

The man is in the pocket of the three of them. He represented one of them, he should not be the City Attorney, he's got a conflict of interest. Somebody told me 10 years ago, he sued the City. He was the plaintiff, so they hired him last year because he represented Ms. Hubbard in, in trying to get..., gain a seat from someone. The man has a absolute conflict of interest. He should be, not only thrown outta here, he should be disbarred. Disbarred. Conflict of interest. I don't even know why he represented the

three of you on the petitions 'cause we..., nobody was singing against the City, they were signing against three individuals.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**MR. J. HURT:** Each of you should pay for his time. It should not be the City paying, it's just more and more legal costs. And now that you're being sued on the petitions, it's gonna be even more.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Who's next?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Alfred Jones, Craig Glover, Peyton McArthur.

**MR. A. JONES:** My name is Alfred Jones.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Good evening.

**MR. A. JONES:** 3020 West 28<sup>th</sup> Street.

Last week, my lawyer came to you guys. I've been dealing with this issue for at least four months and I have not gotten a response from anybody. Your City Attorney knows about it 'cause I talked to him personally, two, three..., about three or four months ago about the issue and I'm trynna figure out why is' anybody doing anything about this situation?

[Inaudible dais comment]

**MR. A. JONES:** I need to know.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** [Inaudible].

**MR. A. JONES:** Kenny Payne is all..., Kenny Payne is just running the, the Rec Department down over there and no one's doing anything about it. So, I'm asking you people that's sitting up there, what are you guys gonna do about it? You'd rather get a lawsuit? Because I was removed for no reason...

[Inaudible audience comment]

**MR. A. JONES:** ...by the police. So again, I'm asking, what are you guys gonna do about it? I'm hoping somebody will, will respond. [Pause].

**UNK.:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** We'll..., at the end, Mr. Jones, we will..., we did get an answer on that and I thought you should've been contacted so...

**MR. A. JONES:** No.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...at the end...

**MR. A. JONES:** I have not received anything.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** At the end, we'll, we'll speak with you regarding that because that issue was brought up. I did inquire about it last week and I did get a response from Ms. Hoskins and Mr. Degraffenreidt, so I thought that it, it followed through and made it to you. So we'll.., I'll make sure that you get an answer in a few minutes.

**MR. A. JONES:** Alright. Because you have a Director over there that's going through hell and nobody's doing anything about it.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Say that again.

**MR. A. JONES:** You're having a Director that's going o'.., going through that Rec Department, going through hell.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Which department?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** We're, we're not...

**MR. A. JONES:** The Parks & Rec.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...let's not go back and forth. We'll just let him make his comments and then we'll have him finish up at the end.

Thank you.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Craig Glover, Peyton McArthur, Gladys Darville.

**MR. C. GLOVER:** Good evening everyone. My name is Craig Glover.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Good evening.

**MR. C. GLOVER:** My wife and I own a home healthcare agency. We are contracted with the Veteran's Administration to provide service to veterans and their spouses. I'm here this evening to share information about benefits that most people in the community don't know about. My goal is to educate you all, that you might get this to the community that veterans and their spouses who've given so much to our country will get the benefits that they've earned. There are two programs available. One is a direct home healthcare benefit for veterans. It's a very simple process. The veteran can have a physician in the community, they.., if they have a need for home health services, bathing, dressing, toileting, cooking, light housekeeping our medical care and the veteran needs that help today and they've been honorably discharged, they can make an appointment with a VA physician, the VA physician agrees they write an order for a social worker. The social workers agrees. In a manner of weeks, that veteran can get up to 21 hours a week of



care paid for by the government. Most veterans don't know this exists, these programs go underutilized.

Second program, is called Aide in Attendance. It's more complex, it's a longer process. That program's for veterans and their spouses. That program provides the same type of care, the qualifications are a little bit more rigorous and it's a more of a process. The.., it is for ho'.., veterans who are honorable discharged, who have served during the time of combat who have a need for care today and there's an income asset requirement. I work with the VA, we can qualify people, the goal is to get this information out for those who might need care.

In the VA, suicide prevention is their number one clinical priority.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** That's right.

**MR. C. GLOVER:** Every day, on average, 20 veterans commit suicide in this county. The benefit of a home health aide is to do the things the veteran may not be able to do so they don't get frustrated, to have someone in the home that provides companionship and socialization, someone with extra eyes.., set of ears and eyes so that they can listen for the clues that suggests somebody might put themselves at harm, and then to be connected to the V'.., VA for resources that would help them, so that the home healthcare could help the veteran, there's spouse and those who are risk to keep them well.

Residents are welcome to call me. My number is area code 954.., our office number, excuse me, is area code 561-202-1266. The name's Craig Glover of Better Way Home Care, 561-202-1266. That's our office number, we serve all of Palm Beach County and we are happy to make information available one on one to civic organizations, groups, churches, wherever we might find seniors and veterans who need that type of care.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yes.

**MR. C. GLOVER:** We love those introductions.

Thank you so much for your time.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Thank you.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Sir, make sure you get in contact with Debbie, my Chief of Staff. We have a Veteran's Affairs Office in the Mayor's Office.

**MR. C. GLOVER:** [Inaudible].

**MAYOR MASTERS:** We'd like to work with you.

**MS. T. SMITH:** Next, Mr. Peyton McArthur, Ms. Gladys Darville and Ms. Cindy March.

**MR. P. MCARTHUR:** Good evening, Mr. Mayor...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Good evening.

**MR. P. MCARTHUR:** ...Councilpeople.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Good evening.

**MR. P. MCARTHUR:** It's a pleasure to be here as usual. Peyton McArthur with the Port of Palm Beach, 1 East 11, Riviera Beach.

I have two things I'd like to ask for help with tonight. One, we're trying to get a permit to relocate a cell tower from one building that's going to be abolished to another building. It's..., the application, I believe, was submitted by Vertex, V-E-R-T-E-X, I believe. The other thing [clears throat], excuse me, we're still for the Land Use Change on what we call the Annex. That's the property under the FP&L lines that come to the City Council, so we might be able to use that property. We'd appreciate any assistance you can do.

Other than that, I'd like to wish you, your families, your Staff and you constituents the best of the holidays and a healthy and happy New Year. Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Thank you.

**MS. T. SMITH:** Ms. Gladys Darville, Ms. Cindy March and Ms. Charlotte Darville.

**MS. G. DARVILLE:** Good evening. I'm Gladys Darville...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Good evening.

**MS. G. DARVILLE:** ...a resident at 2534 Canterbury Drive.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Good evening.

**MS. G. DARVILLE:** I am a resident of this City, have been for 63 years, I'm 82 years old.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Wow.

**MS. G. DARVILLE:** My problem tonight is, as a disabled citizen coming over to one of the affairs, like to tonight, you have the event over at the Marina and, to my surprise, handicap parking is limited and when you can't get..., when you're parked around that back entrance north, you can't come in through the doors to come into the hall. And, if you park over in the parking lot, over there, I'm on the second row, I had to walk over curbs and medians with my walker tonight to get to this event. That is terrible. I coulda fell. Many things coulda happened. Two ladies came and helped me bring my walker over here. It is terrible that we have these events over here and no, no concern for your disabled citizens, who are senior citizens. And that's my point. If I come over again, I

won't come 'til I get somebody to help me because it's no need coming. I'm was sorry I even headed over here tonight.

My next concern is my water bill.

[Inaudible audience comment]

**MS. G. DARVILLE:** I have a water bill for between \$200 and \$300 a month, every month since I've stayed at 2534, and when I stay on 23<sup>rd</sup>, it's the same way. I want the Council to try to do something about it. They have.., the water company has attempted but nothing has been accurate to help out in finding out what's the cause my bill being from \$200 to \$300 a month. I am staying alone in my home.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Mm.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you.

**MS. T. SMITH:** Ms. City March, Ms. Charlotte Darville and Ms. Bonnie Larson.

**MS. C. MARCH:** I'm Cindy March. I wasn't gonna speak at the moment. I'm just here for moral support for my niece.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**MS. T. SMITH:** Okay. Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you.

**MS. C. MARCH:** Mhmm.

**MS. T. SMITH:** Next, Ms. Charlotte Darville and Ms. Bonnie Larson.

**MS. C. DARVILLE:** Mayor, Council.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Good evening.

**MS. C. DARVILLE:** Charlotte Darville.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Good evening.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Good evening.

**MS. C. DARVILLE:** [Pause]. Okay. I would like to know from the Police Department, how many crack houses have been shut down in this City? How many d'.., drug dealers have been prosecuted? These streets are riddled with drug dealers. Also, pimps, prostitutes. That's been going on for, [pphhfft sound], maybe 20 years. [Pause]. It's, it's just, it's just horrible out there. My husband would get up, years ago, 4:00 o'clock in the

morning to go fishing, driving down Broadway and there's the prostitutes trying to wave him down.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** [Inaudible].

**MS. C. DARVILLE:** He told 'em, 'Nah, I don't have time for you, I'm going fishing.' [Sigh]. You need to take down that sign out here in front of the, the City Hall that says Blue Heron, the best waterfront..., or, this City is the best waterfront City to live, play and work in. That's a big lie. When you've got so much crime, nothing's being done about this City to improve it. I've been here since 1973 and gradually it's gone down, down, down. You people are just wasting the taxpayer's money, not using it to build the City up and now, this beautiful Marina here, you wanna turn into a circus and bring in vendors? And then how about the former ice cream shop over here on Broadway, you wanna put vendors there? It's like you wanna turn this City into a circus town. You start bringing in people like that and you're never gonna get rid of the crime here, you're just gonna bring more in here.

How about the cold storage building? There's another lawsuit coming. And the water treatment plant, that's never been resolved. [Pause]. Has the Public Work Department been demolished yet? I'm sure it's still sitting there. The list goes on and on. Mr. Evans was addressing so many of these ill-managed things when he was here. You three people and the Attorney and the Chief, are the most incompetent people I have ever seen running a City.

[Audience clapping]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you...

**MS. C. DARVILLE:** What's being done is...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...Ms. Darville.

**MS. C. DARVILLE:** ...you're running it right into the ground.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you.

[Audience clapping]

**MS. T. SMITH:** Ms. Bonnie Larson, Ms. Norma Duncombe and Mr. Ezekiel Edwards.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Edmonds. [Pause]. Edmonds.

**MS. T. SMITH:** Edmonds, I'm sorry.

**MS. B. LARSON:** Bonnie Larson.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Good evening.

**MS. B. LARSON:** My fourth request for an update on the Ocean Mall. I guess, Ms. Pardo, you'd be the best one to know that. How has it improved since Hensley came in? I know we got the Post Office over there but that was in, in motion before he got here so how is that doing, the Ocean Mall? I understand there's a greenmarket over there, on Wednesdays is it? I never heard about that before, I saw it in the paper or something. So we need to advertise that. How are we doing with the parking meters over there? Now it's wintertime, we have the most people that we have all year there, right now, we could making a lotta money. You talk about how much we could make on parking, so where are we on that situation?

We have several buildings which need, need to be demolished because they, they've been condemned. That horrible looking condo at the base of the bridge, they finally got their permit for demolition in November. They were supposed to tear that down in 30 days. They made the residents move out in one night. They, they were supposed to tear it down in 30 days, so, what's happening with that? Ms. Darville, she already mentioned this, the Public Works Department, when is that coming down? It's been condemned. The sooner we get it torn down, the sooner we can, as you like to call it, move forward. We gotta get rid of some of these eyesights in the City so kids don't go in there, somebody get hurt. Let's get rid of all the things that make the City look bad. Ms. Davis Johnson, you asked at one meeting about lighting, the need for more lighting, could we lower the lights, have we found out a price on that? If you look tonight, when you go home, if you pass Blue Heron and Broadway, look at the lighting on Broadway. That was put in by DOT but it seems like we shoulda had some kind of a say. The bulbs they use give off kind of an orangish hue. When you're driving down Broadway, you can barely see there's someone walking on the sidewalk and the, the lights, again, are only on one side. You can barely tell there's a person there. Trying to ID that person, out of the question. Again, a crime situation. Lots of neighborhoods have no lights whatsoever. So let's spend some of our money doing that. Let's have a Resolution that all businesses have outdoor lighting. Go down Broadway and look at all the businesses which are closed for the evening and it's pitch dark. Let me tell you, there are a lot of people wandering out there at night, 2:00, 3:00, 4:00 in the morning. I hear them, I see them, they're out there. So, if all those businesses would do their part and have outdoor lighting. Popeye's, when they first went in, they're on the corner of Blue Heron and Avenue E, when they first went in, gosh, that lighted up the whole block, their lights. I looked over there the other night, when they were closed, and you ca'.., it's pitch dark. You can't see anything for, like, two blocks. It would be nice if neighbors turned on their lights but for a two block period there, it's pitch dark. Perfect, perfect for the il'.., illegal trade that goes on in our City. So, why don't we have a Resolution, they have to leave their lights on. Even if they close the business, they have to keep the electric on. Don't put all of us at higher.., at risk.

And how are we doing hiring a Human Resource person? I understand we have 15 vacancies, so we need to get going here.

Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you.

**MS. T. SMITH:** Ms. Norma Duncombe, Mr. Ezekiel Edmonds and Mr. Lloyd Brown.

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** Norma Duncombe.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Good evening.

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** I'm here for a couple of things. And people have, have spoken on this earlier in terms of the appearance of the City. I wanna commend you for getting the monies that you got for your roads and lights to improve it, I think it was something like \$9,000,000 and I'm saying I commend you on that. But I feel a little sad because whose district is Silver Beach Road between Avenue S and just over the railroad track, it is horrible. [Stammer] and, and whose district is US-1? Our area on US-1 is the worst looking area on US-1 from Main to Miami. It looks horrible. And the job that they did there was terrible. Now, she said that you can't see. You can't see because they don't have it done like they have the other areas. They have lights only on one side and many times, the lights are out. Now...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** ...you know, I'm not attacking you because I don't come from that.., what other folks are doing but you have to demand respect. When they do the state and county roads in the other areas, they do not just haphazardly do them. Give you an example, down there when they did the Port, all of that road and the, the lights and everything is done beautifully and lights are on both sides. We have to demand and we have to stand up for.., well, I guess maybe you're so occupied with people talking about a City Manager who was here two minutes, maybe they have not lived in, in.., they have not been living very long because city managers come and go. If you check other cities, they don't stay that, necessarily, that long. But I'm concerned about what's going on with the City and in terms of the appearance of the City. I just think we can do a better job. Mr. Dukes, I agree with him in terms of us working together with the Police Department. This is why when they said they wanted to get rid of the Chief and the Police Department, that's why I stood up because our Police Department is what makes the City and we have to have them.

That Goodwill place over there, they took their fence down and it's a horrible site and I, I need to know, who would I talk to in order to get them to put that fence back up there? It's, it's a disgrace, you know, that you have to look at that junk that they have in the back there. Is it someone I can talk to directly or is it.., who would take care of that?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well, she'll address it when.., at the end of our public comment.

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** Okay. Because that's something... One last thing, that storage building that's going on for the freezing and what have you, is that a hazardous place? How safe is that for that to be in our community?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you.

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** Is it safe?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** She'll come back at the end. If she can address it tonight, she will. If not, we'll have someone contact you.

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Who's next?

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** Mr. Ezekiel Edmonds, Mr. Lloyd Brown and Mr. L.B. Sylvester.

**MR. E. EDMONDS:** Good evening.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Good evening.

**MR. E. EDMONDS:** How are you all? Just a few things.

First of all, you all have to remember that you are in a situation where your City is standing up against corruption. You cannot lose sight of that. And all of the inconsistencies with the operations are due to this level of corruption because we had to make sure that, yeah, although city managers come and go, this City Manager that was here gave us the opportunity to see the levels of corruption that has been existing and has been abiding issue in this City. So now, the people are here to stand up so, you know, although he was here for a short period of time, he's not gone, he's still over there. We're waitin' for him to come back so that's the goal. That's the goal.

Now, I never really talked to Mr. Degraffenreidt 'cause, you know, I, I just think he's too condescending to even be a City M'..., Attorney but it just really kills me to see your dogmatic flap doodles campaign when you're dealing with the public. So, he knows, just as everyone else who have any acumen when it comes to recall, that the City doesn't have a recall [stammer] it's not a part of the Charter. So, what he's doing is just pontificating about things that he knows doesn't exist. Right? And it's just to make sure that you all are confused, and maybe even in these holidays, that you lose your momentum and forget about this stuff because we're all trying to play Christmas, Santa Clause right now, right? So...

[Inaudible audience comment]

**MR. E. EDMONDS:** ...[Inaudible] nor, you know, confuse by these puppets. Right? Because they know that they're time is up. Right? The Supervisor of Elections... And, and I would, I would like to..., I don't if [pause], the Interim City Manager, I'm sorry, I, I, I forgot your name, ma'am, I'm sorry. [Chuckle]. I know it's Karen...

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Yes.

**MR. E. EDMONDS:** Right? I don't know the last name. To look into the relationships of some of these people who are evaluating the petitions and Mr. Degraffenreidt and see if there's any formal, uh, or former relationships that would give Mr. Degraffenreidt the

confidence to think that he can speak for the Supervisor of Election. And also, if you're anything of a competent Attorney, when someone te'..., asks you, you know, that's a part of your administration, do you have the right..., do the citizen have the right... You shouldn't be thinking whether they have the right to, [stammer], appeal or go to court, you should know. You know? You should know. And that's a problem.

So, all of these people who are creating resistance, are a part of the challenges that we have to...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**MR. E. EDMONDS:** ...get rid of and that's what it comes down to. So, stay strong. I know Christmas is coming. We're gonna celebrate Christmas but 2018, we're gonna make sure we stay right..., get right back on the train. And Ms. Hubbard, I'm interested in talking to you still because I don't like the way you've been misl'..., misled by this panel of fools up here. And I'm sorry, and I'm not talking to anybody specific, I'm just saying the foolishness that exists, I wouldn't...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you...

**MR. E. EDMONDS:** ...insult you and think you're fool'...So...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you, Mr. Edmonds.

**MR. E. EDMONDS:** ...let's talk.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you.

[Audience clapping]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible background comment]

**MS. T. SMITH:** Mr. Lloyd Brown, Mr. L.B. Sylvester and Mr. Amon Yisrael.

**MR. L. BROWN:** My name is Lloyd Brown. I guess, you already know this and, you know, I think, like, the City right now, we're working with a skeleton crew. Like, you know, we're lucky we're not back in World War II in a tank where we don't have a driver or, you know, somebody to steer us in the right manner, tell you what to load up on the ammunition. I mean, we got a skeleton crew. How can ya'll vote here on things that's gonna effect the people for the rest of our lives, I mean, that we livin' here? Like, you're gonna vote on thi..., this place for these people over here on Congress? Okay? And then you look around the neighborhood, you got a million stores. I, I understand what this lady, who's sittin' over here, was talking about crime. You know what? The crime start..., it don't start in the neighborhoods, like, around the clubs 'cause we don't have no clubs. Ain't that strange that we don't have clubs and we got crimes? 'Cause you know what, we got more store that they got gambling machines in 'em. Who you think gonna go around there? And then, when you got a man that's broke down, don't have no money, they' gonna shoot through these little places. Seem like they sell cigarettes, anything that



a black man don't have, he gonna try to get. Like, okay, with the lotto? Who you see in those stores buying these lotto ticks? Us. 'Cause we don't have but then, like you say, we gotta stick together. How you gonna stick together? We done bought more fence in Riviera Beach since ya'll been in there to keep our properties secure, since ya'll people been in there. We done bought enough fence to go over here to Mars and back, and that's a shame that we have to have security cameras and all that. And it wa'n't like that before ya'll got in. So, you can't blame this on these young kids you see out here because them young guys you see out there, you say criminals or whatever should be locked up, let me tell you something, when they were born it was like this. They were just were born into this. So, you can put them down all you want to, if you don't try to work with them. We're not [inaudible] saying terrorists, we don't with terrorists, that's what I heard some President say. And then, Obama, he talked to a couple of 'em and now he's not in there because he was making the right decision, you gotta go out there and talk to these guys that are selling drugs. You can't put them on a job for \$7 a hour when..., like, my father made that, \$7 a hour but, you know what, bread wasn't but 75 cents a loaf so you're telling a man to go work in McDonalds when bread is \$4 and you only gonna get \$7. So that mean, when he go to the grocery store, he ain't gonna be able buy but two loaves of bread and probably pay his bills, if he can do that with the money. You gonna have to get jobs. When there's poverty, there's crimes. So, it's a lotta guys out there, they don't..., they wanna work and aint work. I go around the City all the time, I bet it ain't but 2% of the people in Riviera Beach working out their gardens. On Garden Road, you got all these warehouses, I bet none of these young boys that wanna work, not even working there. You know why? Because they' felons, because when they got there, they saw what was going on and they knew they weren't gettin' no job so they sold drugs and now they've been sellin' drugs, you wanna try to change their attitude and put 'em on a job somewhere, making \$7 a hour when bread is, like, \$7, or whatever. I'm sayin', you needs to do more for the local district.

Okay. One more thing...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you...

**MR. L. BROWN:** ...if we had a cake...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...Mr. Brown.

**MR. L. BROWN:** ...right?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, Mr. Brown.

**MR. L. BROWN:** If we had a cake... Let me just say this. And we put in for this one cake, you know what ya'll districts would get off of that cake, since ya'll been in here, we might get the candles. We ain't even gettin' the crumbs in our district and ya'll the ones, it's ya'll fault.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, Mr. Brown.

**MS. T. SMITH:** L.B. Sylvester, Mr. Amon Yisrael and Mr. Bruce Guyton.

**MR. L.B. SYLVESTER:** Well, once again, Ms. Pardo has left when, when I come up to the podium, I find that interesting.

I have to offer my congra'..., I'm L.B. Sylvester, III. I have to offer my congratulations to Ms. Hubbard, Ms. Pardo and Mr. Davis. You have apparently successfully dodged a bullet regarding recall'..., recall drive, with collusive assistance...

[Inaudible audience comment]

**MR. L.B. SYLVESTER:** ....with the...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Point of order, please.

**MR. L.B. SYLVESTER:** ...collusive assistance of the City Attorney and, most likely, the City Clerk. Nearly 8,700 recall petitions were declared invalid by the County Supervisor of Elections. Mr. Degraffenreidt, you knowingly made false statements to the County Supervisor of Elections regarding the recall petition drive 30 day windows. You know that the dismissal of Jonathan Evans on September 20, 2017, is what precipitated the recall drive. You know that the recall petitions were not even drafted until mid-October, 2017, you know that Jonathan Evans did not take..., even take up his duties as City Manager of Riviera Beach until March 20, 2017. Yet...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**MR. L.B. SYLVESTER:** ...in the letter dated November 22, 2017 to Susan Booker, Supervisor of Elections for Palm Beach County, Mr. Degraffenreidt maintained that the 30 day recall periods for Ms. Hubbard and Mr. Davis closed well before Mr. Evans' start date as City Manager. The Supervisor of Elections has stated that she based her decisions on..., to invalidate the petitions, based on Mr. Degraffenreidt's letter. Common sense and the decent citizens of Riviera Beach, understand the City Attorney's complicity in this matter. This was a shameful abuse of Mr. Degraffenreidt's position as City Attorney.

[Inaudible comment]

**MR. L.B. SYLVESTER:** It also raises suspicions that the Office of the City Clerk may have joined in the collusion with the City Attorney in fabricating the false recall windows...

[Audience clapping]

**MR. L.B. SYLVESTER:** ...communicated to the Supervisor of Elections regarding the recall petitions.

[Audience applause]

**UNK. AUDIENCE:** Lock 'em up.

**MR. L.B. SYLVESTER:** Mr. Degraffenreidt, you should resign your position immediately for your part in this travesty. If you choose not to resign, you should be dismissed immediately by this City Council. You have not provided appropriate representation to our City, in this matter. The mismanagement of this City by this City Council is appalling and shameful. Your actions continue to invite lawsuits against Riviera Beach for which we, the taxpayers, will be assessed. It must stop.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you.

[Audience applause and cheers]

**MS. T. SMITH:** Mr. Amon Yisrael, Mr. Bruce Guyton and Mr. Javarious Jackson.

**MR. A. YISRAEL:** Good evening, Mayor...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Good evening.

**MR. A. YISRAEL:** ...Council.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Good evening.

**MR. A. YISRAEL:** Amon Yisreal...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Good, good evening.

**MR. A. YISRAEL:** ...Riviera Beach, Florida. [Clears throat]. Excuse me.

What I wanna say to Riviera Beach, just really be calm. This recall process is nowhere near through. I...

[Audience clapping]

**MR. A. YISRAEL:** ...want you to really understand that. Do not be dismayed at what you're hearing. I would also like to add that I visited Susan Booker November the 21<sup>st</sup> and she personally told me that one of Riviera Beach City Councilpeople had enough petitions, that were valid'.., validated to recall them. She would not tell me who it was. There was some correspondence between her and Riviera Beach City Attorney, Mr. Degraffenreidt. Because of that correspondence, the rules changed somewhere. The same rules that she used to approve the petitions, and this are them, these are the same petitions she approved saying that the number had been reached and that she was still in the process of recalling them. Again, I'd like to say, after having correspondence with Riviera Beach City Attorney, the rules changed and two people had one validation and one had zero. Preposterous.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**MR. A. YISRAEL:** I would also like to say that the City will be sued and the Supervisor, Susan Booker, will be sued. We really need to understand that this has ventured outside of Riviera Beach.

[Inaudible audience comment]

**MR. A. YISRAEL:** Susan Booker is the Supervisor of Elections for Palm Beach County. When they did this to Riviera Beach, they did it to Palm Beach County. She had basically said that your voices will not be heard and you will not vote to recall. The law that they speak of was never intended to hush or quiet the voters. Susan Booker is supposed to be a protector of the registered voters, not a suppressor. That is exactly what she's doing. This is nowhere near the end.

Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you.

[Audience clapping]

**MS. T. SMITH:** Mr. Bruce Guyton, Mr. Javarious Jackson.

**MR. B. GUYTON:** Thank you, Madam Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Good evening.

**MR. B. GUYTON:** City Council. My name is Bruce Guyton and I've been in this City all my life. I've been involved in politics, I've been in..., been working for government over 30 years and I do it because it is something that I love. I love my City and one thing that people know about me..., that I don't back down when I believe in what I believe in, I normally have data, documents and evidence to support it. I don't let emotions intimidate me and when emotions get involved, I've learned, that sometimes the best decisions are not made.

[Inaudible audience comment]

**MR. B. GUYTON:** Now, let me just start off by saying that..., somebody once said that we are entitled to our emotions but we're not entitled to our facts. The facts are what they are. I did not..., and let me say this, quite a few people been calling, stopping me, asking me my position on the recall. I don't support it. That is one of the most divisive procedures in the law.

[Audience clapping]

**MR. B. GUYTON:** Does nothing but divide our community. But there've been some accusations and attacks at the City Manager, the City Co'..., I mean, the City Attorney, the City Council. I've been knowing Andy a long time. On the Council we had to go up against him quite a few times. Andy is one of the best attorneys in Palm Beach County, in my opinion.

[Inaudible audience comments and exclamations]

**MR. B. GUYTON:** Now, just because you don't like his decisions, that doesn't, that doesn't, does not make him not a good attorney. When I say we're not entitled to the facts, this recall petition, you have laws that you have to abide by. Andy can't change 'em, the S'..., the Supervisor of Election' can't change them. So all this about what they're doing, is just hype.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yeah.

**MR. B. GUYTON:** Florida Statute 100.361, in part, reads:

All signatures should be obtained and provided as provided in Paragraph E within a period of 30 days and all signed and dated petition forms should be filled at the same time, no later than 30 days after the date of which the first signature is obtained on the petition.

After the first signature is signed, there's a 30 day window.

**UNK.:** Right.

**MR. B. GUYTON:** If you start taking signatures and you stop, then you start again after that 30 days, you know what they're gonna count?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** The first one.

**MR. B. GUYTON:** That, that top..., that first signature and 30 days. Whatever you have in that period, that is what's gonna be counted. And if it's outside of that period, it's gonna be considered invalidated.

**UNK. AUDIENCE:** [Inaudible].

**MR. B. GUYTON:** Don't blame Andy or the City Manager if the recall petition committee didn't do what they were supposed to do.

[Inaudible audience comment]

**MR. B. GUYTON:** And that is exactly what happened. And I support the City Council in their decision.

Thank you...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you.

**MR. B. GUYTON:** ...very much.

[Audience clapping]

**MS. T. SMITH:** Mr. Javarious Jackson.

**MR. J. JACKSON:** Good evening.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Good evening.

**MR. J. JACKSON:** Javarious Jackson, Riviera Beach. I'm gonna...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Good evening.

**MR. J. JACKSON:** ...stick to my script.

Members of Council and residents of Riviera Beach, I come before you this evening as the Chairman and Member of the City Charter Review Advisory Board and to provide everyone with an update and to put to rest the notion that we're operating in silos. I have received numerous phone calls and inquiries regarding the City Charter, mostly positive, and a few that...

[Inaudible audience comment]

**MR. J. JACKSON:** ...and a few comments that gave me concern. So today, the Board has convened a total of 10 times. Our journey up to this point has been longed filled with contentious debates. The Board is comprised with a, with a diverse group of individuals who represent our community. I want you all to know that we take this responsibility bestowed upon us, serious and with sedulous care. We take our time vo'..., vetting through proposed amendment changes and currently we are going through the Charter and '..., and identifying areas of concern. One of the toughest challenges we have is deciding on which form of government we wish to see. We had invited down Lynn Tipton from the Florida League of Cities to provide us with an [stammer] in depth presentation on the different forms of government structures and we have to ask ourselves if the current structure is conducive to our community.

Since the Board inception, here are the following proposed amendment, although not finalized because, at the end, our plan is to build a matrix with all the proposals and then decided what options to proffer to you all, that will ultimately go to the residents. Paragraph 3, Section 15, Article XI, the Mayor Suspension Power. We propose to eliminate that. We also, we also incorporated term limits. The term limits would be no more than three consecutive, three-year terms. Although some Members have been there for 12 years, they also have the opportunity to do an additional term, if it's passed. We also passed a non-interference clause between the Executive and Administrative branch of government. And, at our next meeting, we're gonna discuss the Police Chief selection, whether or not we want the police to be under the auspice of the Council or stay under City Manag'..., the City Manager and the reporting options. The creation of municipal departments, recall procedures and requiring super majority vote to terminate City Manager's employment. And we're also gonna continue the conversation on the role of Mayor and City Council.

When Ms. Tipton came, she told us that one of our best practices is to be inclusive of the community so we're asking the community to voice your concerns on some of the things that you wish to have implemented in the Charter. Madam Manager, we're gonna

need your help, along with the Finance Director 'cause there seems to be a appetite for a strong Mayor so we will need to know what a cost., the cost would be associated with that and again, we just wanna thank this Board for allowing me and my colleagues the opportunity to serve our community.

Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Is that the end of public comment?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Yes, Madam Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. Thank you. Alright. Item...

## **PUBLIC HEARINGS**

### **ORDINANCE ON SECOND AND FINAL READING**

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Public hearings. Ordinance on second and final reading.

11.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Item No. 11.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH, PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA RESTATING ARTICLE II ENTITLED "GENERAL EMPLOYEES", CHAPTER 14, ENTITLED "PENSIONS AND RETIREMENT PROGRAMS", PROVIDING FOR SIMPLIFIED, UPDATED AND MODERNIZED LANGUAGE, PROVIDING A LIMITATION ON NUMBER OF POST RETIREMENT BENEFICIARY CHANGES, REMOVING AGE 70 MANDATORY RETIREMENT AGE, CLARIFYING OPTIONAL FORMS OF RETIREMENT BENEFITS, PROVIDING FOR THE ELECTION OF ELECTED PENSION BOARD MEMBERS FROM THE AT LARGE PARTICIPANTS IN THE PLAN, ACKNOWLEDGING TRUSTEE'S DUTY TO ATTEND PENSION SCHOOLS AND OTHER EDUCATION FUNCTIONS, PROVIDING FOR CONFLICTS, SEVERABILITY AND CODIFICATION AND PROVIDING AN EFFECTIVE DATE.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So moved.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Do we have a second?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Second.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I, I just wanna say something. I did forget to have Ms. Hoskins go over the.., any information that she may have had for our public comments, so I will let her do that right after we finish this Item here.

Alright. Who's doing the presentation? Who's presenting...

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Ms. Irvin.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...Item 11?

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Ms. Irvin.

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** This is, this is.., Eureka Irvin, Human Resources...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Can...

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** ...Department.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...can you speak up a little bit?

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Eureka Irvin, Human Resources Department.

This is a Item that is up for a second and final reading. It was brought back to you earlier in the year after.., the request was for the Pension Board to review the Ordinance once again and, at this time, I will int'.., allow Ken Harrison, the Pension Board's attorney to, to present to you.

**MR. K. HARRISON:** For the record, my name is Ken Harrison. I'm with the firm of Sugarman & Susskind. We are the attorney s for the Pension Board.

Just a brief history on this, this has been pending now for a couple years. It came to you on first reading and you had asked that this go back to the Board and make sure that they had a full agreement because there was some question asked. Those.., I think you've been provided a copy of the document with all the corrections. I believe I was told that. The first area.., and this is a restatement. What we did, we took all the amendments and rolled them into one document and made very little changes. The changes that we did make were required by statute or federal law. If, if.., Page 24 of 54, you'll see that we, we refer to the 415 limits of the Internal Revenue Code, that was not in the document before but it needs to be added because [stammer] we are subject to those limitations of the Internal Revenue Code. So that was put in, the Board looked at that and, and, on their review, when you sent it back to them they agreed to it.

The other matter was on Page 14 of 54. This is required under the Heroes Act. This is for a employee that's called to active duty that is killed while in the line of duty. We have to treat them as if they came back to work the day before they were killed so that their beneficiary can be entitled to any benefits that they may have been entitled to.



We were required to put that in. It was not in the original document so that is a new item. The other area of interest that you expressed was the selection and appointment of the Members of the Pension Board. Due to some reorganization of the City, we had to take a look at that because the old language said that the elected officials came from certain departments and some of those departments don't exist anymore so we changed that to say the elected people come from a citywide vote of general employees. The Board discussed that and agreed to that. The other thing was, the appointed members used to be all appointed by the Mayor with approval by the Council. That's been changed that the Mayor will appoint two and the Council appoints the other two. And again, the Board looked at that and agreed to that change.

Those were the changes that we had, that was discussed here when it came to you before so it's back to you for second reading with those clarified.

The other issue was attending conferences. That was a question. The language is changed to require the Board to consider training conferences in the State of Florida before they consider anything outside the state, but still could consider them if it was approved in advance by a majority of the Board.

Those are the items that were discussed before you. The Board has reconsidered those. They met in workshop, went over the whole Plan, line by line and now this is what they've.., they are recommending to you for approval. And again, it doesn't change.., other than the items that I pointed out to you, it just puts all the amendments to the Plan into one document so you don't have to go from document to document to see what it is. We now have one document to look at. It's called a Plan Restatement.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Is that the end of your...

**MR. K. HARRISON:** Yes, ma'am.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...presentation? Alright. Any questions, comments? Do we have a public comment card for this?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** No public comment cards, Madam Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. Council? Mayor?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** No.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Nothing.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** None.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** You have a question?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** None.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Alright, Ma'... Thank you. Madam Clerk.

**MR. K. HARRISON:** Thank you.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Hubbard?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Pardo?

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Davis Johnson?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Miller-Anderson?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Unanimous vote.

[Inaudible dais background discussion]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Before we go on to Item No. 12, I'm going to have Ms. Hoskins address any of the concerns or questions that were brought up during our public comment and if she doesn't have the answer for them, she'll let you know when she'll be able to get back to you.

[Inaudible dais comments]

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair, as it relates to the Public Works building, they finished moving out all the contaminated products, paper, office furniture last week. This week, they..., we are ordering [pause] that the network connection be terminated in the existing building, which allows the fuel pumps to talk to the server and the fuel cards. So, we're moving along with that. We're gonna have to build.., or, install a 5x5 building to house AT&T fiber connection to run the fuel pumps and after all of that is complete, then we'll be able to demolish the building, at Public Works.

As it relates to Alfred Jones request, I'll defer to the City Attorney, as you all were emailed earlier this week regarding the no trespass issue and he sent you all an email regarding that, however, after he sent the email, I failed to contact Mr. Jones regarding that so I will reach out to him this week.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Mr. Degraffenreidt.

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** Essentially, what I was informed of by the Police Department, is there are no active trespass notices on file relating to Mr. Alfred Jones and that, in the future, the law enforcement officers who are to address the trespassing issuances, are to abide by the strict letter of law in enforcing it.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Go ahead.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** With that being said, what, what is the continued issue of claiming that this gentleman is harassing..., is trespassing on the property?

[Inaudible audience comment]

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** There is no continuing issue of him trespassing on the property.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Hasn't it happened more than one time?

**CITY ATTORNEY DEGRAFFENREIDT:** My understanding from the records I reviewed, is that there was one issued and it was unfounded because it was issued improperly. There are no other active ones, or inactive ones, that have been issued. It was that one that was being addressed.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Go ahead.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair, I have a ques'...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...City Manager?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I have a question.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. As soon as Ms. Davis Johnson is finished.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Interim City Manager, perhaps you can have a discussion with Mr. Blankenship to understand what the issue is and make sure that the issues discontinue because if there is no open..., any open trespassing permits out there, then he should be able to enjoy the park. Now, unless there is something else that this Council is not privy to as it relates to this particular matter, if we need to be brought up to speed, then certainly that should happen but we need to find out from Mr. Blankenship what the issue is, what the disconnect is so that this behavior and pattern of...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...harassment, I wou'... I, I don't know., I don't what it is exactly.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** It's harassment.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** But we need to discontinue it.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright.

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Yes, ma'am.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Is there any...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yeah.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Go ahead. I'm sorry, Mayor.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yeah. No problem. Basic'...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** You had something related to...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yes, basically...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...this, right? Okay.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...that's what I wanted to say, that he has the right like any other citizen [stammer] to enjoy the park and, to me, that means that he can go tomorrow and enjoy it because there, there isn't an issue that has been brought forth, as far as trespassing, unless anyone trespassed then that's the issue but going to the park and enjoying the park, is not trespassing. So, as far as I'm concerned, he can go tomorrow.

Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. Ms. Hoskins, did you have anything else?

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** The rest of the issues I will have to get back with the residents and provide an update or additional information.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Okay. I'd like to give an update. I believe it was Ms. Larson asked about the old Singer Island yacht club at the bottom of the bridge and when demolition would start. So, today we are into day three of the demolition. So, the demolition began on Monday. So I just wanna put that out there. The other thing, the green market at the Ocean Mall, there is no green market at the Ocean Mall and no permit has been issued for a green market at the Ocean Mall.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright.

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** As it... Go ahead. I'm sorry.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** I have an update about Silver Beach Road.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Pull your mic up some.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** We had a, a town hall meeting with Commissioner Mack Renard and the engineering department from the county. They came here, as a matter of fact, to the Event Center and showed about the [pause] upcoming projects that would be taking place in that area, from the railroad track, just east of that railroad track, as a matter of fact, to Congress Avenue, on the expansion and the rehabilitation of that road and the amenities that they're gonna be providing for the homes that face that road. One, for example, where people are exiting their homes onto Silver Beach Road, they're gonna take 37<sup>th</sup> Court and give them the type of driveway that they would like, be it a in-line driveway, a circular driveway so that they would use that to go in and out of their homes and, the same time, they will put a sidewalk there so that they might come to the front of the road and have a service road still. But, asking them to.., for vehicular traffic to come in out of those homes on 37<sup>th</sup> Court. So, we've been working diligently with the county to expand, rehab Silver Beach Road and I'm pretty proud of the relationship that we have with the engineering department at the county and Commissioner Mack Renard for leading the charge so that we can finally get the okay and the co-operation to take care of that area.

[Inaudible audience comment]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. Is that it, Ms. Hoskins?

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Yes, ma'am.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. Item No...

### **ITEMS TABLED**

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Do we have any Items to be table'.., that were tabled?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** No, we do not.

**REGULAR – OLD BUSINESS**

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Regular – old business.

12.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Item No. 12.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** RESOLUTION NO. 114-17. A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH, PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA AWARDING RFP 861-17-1 TO PROVIDE CONSULTING SERVICES TO ASSIST HUMAN RESOURCES IN DEVELOPING AND DELIVERING EMPLOYEE TRAINING FROM ULTIMATE IMAGE COACH, AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR AND CITY CLERK TO EXECUTE SAID CONTRACT AND AUTHORIZING THE DIRECTOR OF FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES TO MAKE PAYMENTS NOT TO EXCEED \$60,000 FROM ACCOUNT NUMBER 001-0511-519-0-3101 AND PROVIDING AN EFFECTIVE DATE.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So moved.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Second.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair, we have two public comment cards.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** That closes the acceptance of public comment cards...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** ...regarding this Item.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you.

[Inaudible dais comments]

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Eureka Irvin, Homan Resources Department.

Some time ago, we..., the Human Resources Department received a directive from the Council that it was a priority that we develop a training curriculum for the City's employees. We went out to bid in earlier part of 2017. We received three responses and Mrs. Pamela Toussaint of Ultimate Image Coach was the selected provider to provide the training for the City's employees, through the Human Resources Department. And so, at this time, I will allow Mrs. Toussaint to come to the, to the podium.

**MS. P. TOUSSAINT:** Thank you. Thank you. Good evening.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Good evening.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Good evening.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Good evening.

**MS. P. TOUSSAINT:** Madam Chair, Council Members, Mr. Mayor...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yes.

**MS. P. TOUSSAINT:** ...City Manager and everyone else in the audience.

Earlier this year, the City issued an RFP for training services. My name is Pamela Toussaint, by the way. My business is Ultimate Image Coach and we specialize in management, customer service, professional image, all the types of training that can enhance an employee's ability to perform better on the job.

So, we actually submitted a bid and the scope of the services that were laid out in the RFP, I'll just briefly go over them. There were six areas, presentation skills, helping participants develop confidence in their ability to deliver a message that is clear and persuasive, leadership skills, customer service skills, career development skills, management skills and strategic planning and envisioning. In that proposal, those were the six areas..., those were under..., under those, I think we had 19 modules that I was asked to submit a proposal on and I am honored that our proposal was accepted. The proposal is pretty large and [stammer], it's actually included in the paperwork that you have and I think it is Exhibit C. I'll just briefly say that we developed detailed curriculum outline for all 19 areas and the, the budgeted dollars were somewhat less than the comprehensive proposal that we delivered. So, the next steps are for..., include, we need to sit with HR to determine the priorities and then develop a training program to start the process as soon as possible.

So that's a quick overview. I can get into the details of it but I'm not quite sure how much you'd like to know or, or if you have any direct questions.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. If that's all of your presentation for now, I'll go to the public comment cards and then we'll come back to the...

**MS. P. TOUSSAINT:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...Council.

**MS. P. TOUSSAINT:** Sounds, sounds great.

**MS. T. SMITH:** There are two public comment cards. First is Ms. Bonnie Larson and second is Mr. Traddrick McCoy.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Are you passing? Ms. Larson?

**MS. B. LARSON:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Mr. McCoy.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Ms. Larson, you don't never pass. You must don't have any questions.

**MR. T. MCCOY:** I'll take [inaudible]...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** [Chuckle].

**MR. T. MCCOY:** [Inaudible] her minutes to me.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Nice try.

**MR. T. MCCOY:** Tradrick McCoy. Members, Madam Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Good evening.

**MR. T. MCCOY:** Mr. Mayor and...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yes.

**MR. T. MCCOY:** ...Madam City Manager. Tradrick McCoy.

I think the training should be extended to advisory boards because when you think about it, you have...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** To what?

**MR. T. MCCOY:** ...essentially, public officers under the statute, advisory board members are, that's asked to do a job with a probably a 15 minute orientation. They have no real in depth understanding of what the Sunshine Law means. Certainly, there's been a huge issue with one of the advisory boards and that's the Charter Review Advisory Board and particularly, with what's protocol. So, definitely, training is needed. I will add that, set up under the Resolution for the Charter Review Board that was done back in 2007, it calls for the organization of a Chair and a Vice Chair. The City Clerk's office decided it was important to usurp the authority of that Resolution and create another position called a secretary. Now, I'm gonna tell you why that's particularly important. The secretary, which is a member of the public, is now.., have the charge responsibility of recording the meeting minutes and keeping track of the vote count. We do have a court reporter but, even more so, the Code of Ordinances requires that the City Clerk maintains and executes all advisory board minutes and she's the keeper. Now, you're gonna have a public, a member of the public be responsible for taking meetings and then also expect that person to turn around and have some informed discussion and be able to vote on that same item. Now, the problem comes when the same City Clerk proposes a recommendation, but her authority is to also record those minutes, so certainly that should be done.



Another area I think that we need training is in public records laws. This is definitely something that I 've seen that departments, in itself, tries to recreate and manufacture records to fulfill a public record requirement. I sent a request last month for police officer, Cedrick Thomas' cellphone records. And then someone, in their bright ideas, decided to extract that information off of the phone bill and put it onto a Excel worksheet, which is absolutely illegal. I did send a email back to the Clerk's office and I did put them on notice that they need to come into compliance with state law or I will escalate it. Furthermore, there should be some real training with this guy on the end. Clearly, once you become an attorney, I don't even know if he does any continuing education courses but, clearly, he's misguided you guys and he appointed his friend to serve as the counsel to the board. And what's interesting about that appointment to the Charter Review Board, she too has a role in doctoring and manufacturing the minutes and she charges you guys for it. So, this is a real issue that this whole Charter Review thing needs to be really looked at because there is a organized conspiracy with the City Attorney, the City Clerk and also Ms. Elaine James Johnson of the special counsel to the Board.

Thank you, Members.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you. Alright. Alright. Do we have any questions or comments for Ms. Toussaint?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yes. I do.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Go ahead, Mayor.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yes. Good evening, Ms. Toussaint.

**MS. P. TOUSSAINT:** Good evening.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** You.., I missed something you said about the price, \$60,000.., you.., did you say that could be more or you needed more or something?

**MS. P. TOUSSAINT:** No. I.., just to clarify.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yes.

**MS. P. TOUSSAINT:** What I...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Clarify that.

**MS. P. TOUSSAINT:** What I proposed back in.., earlier this year, back in march or February, was a larger scope, a comprehensive scope of services based on what was requested of me in the RFP so it had a different price.., dollar limits to it...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay.

**MS. P. TOUSSAINT:** ...as, as outlined in, I think that's Exhibit, Exhibit C'.., Exhibit B, as a price...

[Inaudible comment]

**MS. P. TOUSSAINT:** ...which is three hundred , whatever, thousand dollars. Now, I was given the budget of \$60,000 that is incorporated in the contract for then.., for me to work closely with Human Resources to determine what \$60,000 can actually afford the City.., or buy for the services that I, that I laid out. So...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** So, are, are you saying that you had to kinda hold back or cut back on, on the training, or whatever is needed, because of the budget and that it w'.., it's not as complete as it.., or comprehensive as it would have been if you had more resources?

**MS. P. TOUSSAINT:** Right. Well, what I'm saying is that's in.., what's shown in the contract, it's included in the material you have in front of us, is that I will be required to sit with Human Resources, with Ms. Irvin to determine what the priorities are for training that will take us to that budgeted dollar of \$60,000 per ca'.., per fiscal year.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I, I do understand.

**MS. P. TOUSSAINT:** Yes. Mhmm.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** My final question...

**MS. P. TOUSSAINT:** Mhmm.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...is, have there been any other cities that you have worked with as far as the employee training?

**MS. P. TOUSSAINT:** Any other cities with whom I've worked?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yes.

**MS. P. TOUSSAINT:** Yes. I've training for, some training for West Palm Beach.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Okay.

**MS. P. TOUSSAINT:** By the way, I'm a certified SBE with Palm Beach County, as well as with West Palm Beach and my certification is in process with Riviera Beach. So, I've done some work for the, for the City of West Palm Beach in terms of training and I've done a lot of training for other public entities, including Palm Beach State College where I am an adjunct professor of business, I do similar training there for Staff and faculty, in addition to students.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I knew you were well qualified. I just wanted you to say that for the record, for the public...

**MS. P. TOUSSAINT:** Thank you very much.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...could hear that.

**MS. P. TOUSSAINT:** Appreciate it.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you.

**MS. P. TOUSSAINT:** Any other questions?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** That's it.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes. Go ahead.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Ms. Irvin, this question is for you. Is searched for Exhibit B, price and hourly rates and I did not see an extracted Exhibit, however, did see in the consultant's, the consultant's response, her fee.

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Mhmm.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** But I didn't see the \$60,000 which is mentioned in the contract and what that fee scale looks like. So, it is missing because you need to go back and have a conversation with her with regards to these services?

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Yes, ma'am. So, what we would... Yeah. So, what we would do is just list the [inaudible]...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Can you speak up a little bit?

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** What we will do, we'll actually list the types of training that the \$60,000 can afford us.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay. So, [stammer], perhaps it's more appropriate to bring that back to us to vote on it so that we are clear on the services that will be contained within the contract, at the fee that has been determined to be \$60,000.

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Well, some training, some training has been identified such as secession planning, leadership development [pause], what was it, presentation seals and customer service.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Is there a fee schedule associated with those services that have been identified that we can see?

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** I'll have to...

**MS. P. TOUSSAINT:** [Inaudible].

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** That needs to be developed?

**MS. P. TOUSSAINT:** Yes. That's what the contract indicates...

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Mhmm.

**MS. P. TOUSSAINT:** ...It will be developed.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Then I would suggest...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** I understand that you're trying to get to what the work will be for the total dollar value.

**MS. P. TOUSSAINT:** Mhmm.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** But as it stands right now, we don't know what is encompassed in that \$60,000 value. So perhaps, we can bring this back. I'm trying to understand...

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Okay.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...exactly what we will be voting on.

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Right. So, you want us to identify the items that the \$60,000 will pay for?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Absolutely.

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Okay.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I would like...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair?

[Inaudible dais comment]

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I would like for you...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I'm looking at[inaudible].

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** [Inaudible].

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I would like for you to identify the items that it doesn't cover, as well. If there's things that we're not getting...

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Okay.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...that's out of that so we'll know what we're missing, as well as the, the Co-Chair wanted to know what it covers, I wanna know what it doesn't cover.

Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. So...

**MS. P., TOUSSAINT:** If I could just add one more thing?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**MS. P., TOUSSAINT:** I think it's Exhibit B has my pricing spreadsheet so I've.., I've actually priced out every single module of the training so it would be easy for us to go back and work on prioritizing which of those we can purchase for \$60,000 and then you'll see which one will fall out'.., outside of that.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Just, just make...

**MS. P., TOUSSAINT:** Yes.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...it clear to me

**MS. P., TOUSSAINT:** Yes.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** That's all.

**MS. P., TOUSSAINT:** [Inaudible].

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. So we have a.., are we going to.., someone has a motion to bring this back? Or amend the motion?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Who.., who made the motion?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Who was that? Was that...

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis motioned and Ms. Hubbard second.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Would you be willing to amend your motion [inaudible]....

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I amend my motion that this comes back when Staff has the information prepared as requested by the Board.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So basically, we're looking for a scope of services?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** [Inaudible]...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I mean...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Whenever they have...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Specific...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...whenever they get...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yeah. Specific.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...it prepared.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** My second stand.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. So...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So that's, so that's the...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Second stands...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...next meeting ...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...she says.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...or the one after that?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Oh.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Pardo?

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Hubbard?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Davis Johnson?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Miller-Anderson?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Unanimous vote.

### **REGULAR**

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Regular Item.

### **DISCUSSION AND DELIBERATION**

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Discussion and deliberation.

**13.**

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Item No. 13.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** **CITY MANAGER RECRUITMENT TIMELINE, JOB DESCRIPTION QUALIFICATIONS**

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Ms. Hoskins or Ms. Irvin.

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Alright. Ms [inaudible]. Based on last City Council meeting discussion, you talked about the timeline that I had provided after being appointed Interim City Manager and did not think you would be able to make that aggressive timeline so you wanted to bring back that discussion about the City Manager's..., what you're requiring as far as job quali'..., qualifications of the city Manager and, and revising the timeline, looking to push it out. So, based on those discussions, Staff has developed your recommendations, what you sent that you thought would work. [Pause]. And we just need to get you all to agree upon the years of service and some of the [pause] of the recommendations. You need to make that..., can you make it bigger? Can you enlarge it? She's gonna pass it out also. Sorry, public.

[Pause and inaudible comments]

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** We do have two public comment cards regarding this Item. The acceptance of public comments cards for this Item is now closed.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. So, I don't know if they wa'..., who is it? If they want to come and present now or they wanna listen to the discussion first before they come and speak? Who, who do you have.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Norma Duncombe and Ezekiel Edmonds.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Would you like to wait until we have our discussion or...

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Huh?

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** I don't want any comments?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** That's not what I said. I said I don't know..., I'm asking you, do you want us to discuss first or do you want to go and make your comments before we have a discussion?

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well, that's gonna be a part of your three minutes, that's what you want...

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** Yeah.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Yeah. You get three minutes.

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yeah. I just didn't know if you wanted to go before us or after us.

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** I, I'm just so concerned about the City Manager's position...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Hold on one second. Did you start the timer already?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** No.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Hold on one minute.

[Inaudible background comment]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Just minimize it. It's still up, right?



**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Yeah. And it didn't work.

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright.

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** And I'm not gonna be here but a minute. I'm really concerned about the City Manager's position and all of the energy that's gone into a recall and I... I'm, I'm really disturbed about the fact that the Charter states that, if a vote is taken on something, even if everybody up there does not agree, that..., I don't think that it's fair for the other Members of the Board to go out and fight the situation because you don't agree with it. The Charter spells out...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Ms. Duncombe, you know what this one is about? This is about...

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** Yeah.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...the recruitment and the timeline...

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** But that's...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...jo'..., posting the job out.

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** ...[stammer] and that's what I'm gonna talk about.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Oh, okay. Okay.

**MS. N. DUNCOMBE:** Is that, when you..., and this, to me, could've been avoided because you could've just held..., kept the person who was here. And I'm saying,, okay, let's get this thing taken care of because it is preventing you from doing all of the things that we need to have done in the City. So, let's your timeline be concise, be up..., really direct and to the point in terms of what you're looking for, how you're gonna go about so that we can get this over with.

That's all I wanted to say.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. Thank you.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Ezekiel Edmonds.

**MR. E. EDMONDS:** I'll go after.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Alright. Go ahead, Ms. Irvin.

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Eureka..., Eureka Irvin, Human Resources Department.

In our last meeting, we had a brief discussion on bringing back the criteria of the selection for the City Manager and [stammer] each Councilperson was to email to the Interim City Manager and myself, the HR Department, some recommended changes that they would like to see added to the job description.

So, what we have here is just little..., a matrix of some of the comments that were sent. Some were set for five years, seven years and 10 years. And so, what we want to do is to get a consensus of the number of years of services that an applicant must, as well as having a bachelor's or a master's degree. Also, at the bottom, we have some recommended..., some of the current recommendations that we, that we received in regards to other criteria that you would like to be added. So tonight, we just want to get your clear direction on the job description so that we can go ahead and, and start discussing the timeline so we can select a City Manager. [Pause]. If you can go back down a little bit. [Pause]. No, no, back up, the other way.

Okay. The type of degree, do you want the Managers to have a bachelors or a masters degree? The years of experience, do you want them to have five years, seven years or 10 years? You can see some of the comments that says that [stammer] you would like a Manager to have at least five years of managerial experience at a department head level or compatible or five years of experience and 10 years of experience at the senior management exper'..., level. So, if you will just please provide your comment, so we can create the job description.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. Anyone want to go?

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Okay. So, Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Go ahead.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** So, I would like to see a masters degree and a minimum of seven years' experience.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Seven.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Experience as, what, City Manager assistant?

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** As a City Manager.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Alright. Do you wanna just go down the line?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** I think they just want us to mark it [inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well, she didn't say that. You want us to mark it, do you want us to say it? What do you want us to do?

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Just say it.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yeah. Okay. You wanna go?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I'll wait.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Ms. Davis Johnson?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** My, my suggestion was that it be a bachelor's degree from an accredited college or university, master's degree in public administration, business administration...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Pull your mic up.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...or other public related field, is preferred. I thought that., I did some research and was looking at best practices and it, it is typically 10 years that is requested. I also., was there anything e'... Did you want me to stop there?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Uh-uh. You can keep going.

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** No, go ahead.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Go ahead.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Requires 10 years of high level municipal managerial supervi'.., supervisory and administrative experience or closely related experience.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Total. Total [inaudible].

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** That's what I put.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Oh.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mhmm.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Ms., that's it?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mhmm.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Ms. Hubbard.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Okay. The master's degree and seven years of experience at a level of City Manager, Assistant City Manager, County Administrator or Assistant County Administrator. The.., there's not one that have public or government service included in that.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Repeat the question...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Okay.

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** ...again please.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** [Chuckle].

[Inaudible dais comments]

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** I was trying, you know, they might not have been a..., they might not have served at the City Manager or an Assistant City Manager but have numerous years of public administration and governmental service in some...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...other area. So, I'm asking, should we craft that statement or add it to here?

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Thank you.

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** If you want someone to have..., if you're saying other administrative governmental experience but..., it should be designated at a certain level.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Yes. I, I got that part but...

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...I was just saying, the only two areas of [pause] that you mentioned or pointed out or, maybe, and like you said, we gave you these, the City Manager or County Administrator or assistants. But, there was no opening left for, if you, you know, had served for numerous years in another government..., governmental administrative position.

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** [Stammer]...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** So, I want...

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Would this be...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** ...like, a, a division level head or higher.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** It's a...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yeah. High level, municipal manager?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** It could be...

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** For other governmental...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...a division head.

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** ...experience.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Yeah. It could very well be..., have been a division head or, or, or a deputy. Something, you know, in high administration. And so, I just wanted to know if my comment was not found in one of your boxes, should I just add it at the bottom of...

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...[inaudible] sheet? Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. And for me, I would like to see a master's degree in public administration, business administration or other public related field and a minimum of seven years., between seven and 10 years as a., experienced as a City Manager, Assistant City Manager, County Administrator or Assistant County Administrator. Mr. Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I support, I support the master's degree just like the, the entire Board. I'm trynna be., so, you're saying seven years of, years of City Manager experience?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** That's what I said. Between seven and 10 for me. Should...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Between seven and 10, City Manager?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yeah.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** City Manager or Assistant City Manager.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Oh, oh all of them?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yeah. Well...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So, we're gonna put a requirement on how many years of experience of a City Manager, are we gonna address that issue?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yeah, it's...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Some folks [inaudible]...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** [Inaudible]...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Uhuh.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Like Councilwoman Pardo stated, seven years as a City Manager experience?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So, when we talk about how many years of experience, as a City Manager, do we wanna address that issue first?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** I think we're addressing [inaudible]...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Or do you wanna put it all together? Oh, the degree, I support the master's degree. Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** A master's degree just in general or in a specific field?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Well, a specific field that's related to what we do on a day to day routine.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So, what it says up there? In the second box?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** That's the first.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Oh...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** First two? Really?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** The second bo'.., master's degree in public administration.

**UNK.:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yeah. Public administration, business administration.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Or other public related field?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yeah.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Something that speaks to that.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** That's very clear. You know, we ain't gotta go hire someone to specify... I like the least five to seven years experience as a City Manager, along with [pause] 10 years of senior level management experience. Separate though. I don't... And, someone that actually has experience helping cities get through some critical situations. I wanna hear some success stories.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. Mayor?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I'm sorta going back and forth. I definitely think that the City Manager, at a minimum, should have a master's degree. I like the idea of seven years experience at a level of City Manager Assistant. I like number one, period. The first block. The master's degree and seven years experience at a level of City Manager, Assistant City Manager, County Administrator or Assistant County Administrator. Now, if someone has, um, I'm, I'm still kinda torn about administrative experience, or close related that may not be in one of those fields. So that's...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible]...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...optional for me. Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Alright.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** What is the consensus for...

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...the master's degree re requirement?

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** The consensus is a master's degree requirement and business or public administration or you normally add other public related field.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Correct.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm.

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Is required.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** That's fair.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Alright.

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Seven to 10 years of senior management, municipal level, managerial, supervisory and administrative experience at a division le., level or higher. [Inaudible]...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** No. That's not what I said.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** That's not what I said.

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Well, I'm just listening to the...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible]...

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** ...the comments that were brought out from everyone, so I combined...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Oh, you're gonna read all of them

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** I combined it together 'cause were most saying..., most of you were saying seven to 10 years of experience at a City Manager or Assistant City Manager or at a senior , senior managerial level... Senior level,, managerial position.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I don't agree with that part on the end. I'm..., I, I want it to be spec'..., that's just me. City Manager, Assistant City Manager, County Administrator or Assistant County Administrator.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** I, I...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...Not with the other part attached to it, about the senior level.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Are you ta'..., you're speaking about the experience?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yeah.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** I think the second block encompasses what I was trying to say a little bit more than just the first block.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** The second block about the education?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** No, no.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** The...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...at the bottom, under current recommendations.

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Well the cu'..., the current consensus is not necessarily at the City Manager level.



[Inaudible dais discussion]

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** No.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** [Inaudible] they specific [inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** You're talking bout the years. Go ahead.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So, and that was the question I had 'cause of the way it was written...

[Inaudible background discussion]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Are we gonna discuss a minimum experience, a City Manager position...

[Inaudible dais discussion] 2:44:18

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...and then address, in addition to, you know..., 'cause, like, when we talked about this in the previous meeting, we was talking about someone said 10 years experience at City Manager, one person said seven years at City Manager. I projected five years into the discussion, as it relates to the younger professionals, along with 10 years of senior level management experience. So, can we address a minimum of how many years experience we want as a City Manager or we don't wanna do that?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well, that's what I...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ....just said.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yeah.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And I think a few of us said...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yeah .

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...at that specific level of City Manager or Assistant City Manager, County and Assistant County. I think Ms. Pardo did, I did, I believe Ms. Davis Johnson...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** No. I just [inaudible].

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Seven.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** What did you say?

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** I said City Manager.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** I said...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yeah.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** I said 10 years of high level municipal managerial...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Which could include what? What would that include?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** It, it would include...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Assistant County...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...those..., an...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** ...Administrator.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...Assistant City Manager.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** But it could also be other...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...what, Directors? Or?

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Division...

[Inaudible dais comments]

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Director level, division or director level...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** But that's what I'm saying...

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** ...or higher.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...we wanna be...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** No.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...clear on what...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** I was...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...we're asking for.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** I was clear. Mine, mine says 10 years of high level municipal managerial so that would speak to an Assistant City Manager, an Assistant County Administrator, a County Administrator.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm. That's what you're.., so, you're basically, essentially, saying the same thing that we're saying.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay. So...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** But would that encompass other positions...

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Okay. It will say...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...director positions and...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So, would you be okay with it saying specifically...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** That's what I wanted to know...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...City Manager, Assistant City Manager, County Administrator...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** That's fine.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** What is.., for example, if you had someone that, again.., for example, for.., when we had Mr. Brown, he.., his experience brought him.., could have brought him on both sides of the spectrum but he was in CRA and he also had skillsets for, for City Manager. And I just use that as an example and that's why I'm saying that we should.., that I want.., I'm not saying anything about what we should do, I think we should make sure that we had.., we have other public related fields because there are other public related fields that would give a person the acumen to be a City Manager.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Oh, I, I fully... Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Go ahead.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** I fully agree and I think that is encompassed in the latter part of the education piece where we have the other public related fields, so that would encompass that.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** The last statement that was made was to be specific and say Assistant City Manager, Assistant County Administrator...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** That'...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...and City Manager. That was, that was..., the question was said, let's be specific and that's why I brought that to the table so that...

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** We can add [stammer] or, or...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** ...add in the at the executive level of municipal managerial experience.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Or other...

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** That would...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...[stammer] or other public related fields.

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Mhmm.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And what would that include?

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** That would include, like, an Assistant City Manager, a...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Right. I got...

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** ...Deputy City Manager

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...we got that but what...

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Right.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...else is it going to include?

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Okay. That would be, like, the 10 years of experience at the executive level, managerial experience, of which seven years must be at..., as a City Manager or something [stammer]

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** [Inaudible].

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** ...or language like that.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** That's not what she said.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** It's seven years must be at..., as a City Manager?

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Yes. And I would include all of the comments.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I have a question.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** And again, just as a City Manager. So, for example...

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** No. No. Ten years of executive level, of which seven at, at a City Manager level. Okay. Or just seven years of City Manager ex'.., experience.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Chair, I have a question.

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** So, when you say executive level, you can..., they could be a former City Attorney or a...

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** A Deputy City...

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** ...[Inaudible]?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And that's what I'm not...

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Something [inaudible]...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...agreeing to. That's not what I'm saying, I'm not saying that.

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Alright. So, you just wanna spell out...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** I want municipal...

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** ...Assistant City Manager...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...management.

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** ...Deputy City Manager, Assistant County Administrator, County Administrator. You want to spell that out?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Right.

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** I'm not.., and I'm, and you know, and that's.., I'm not agreeing that those are the only four categories that someone could have held in order to serve as...

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Or closely...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...as the City...

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** ...related field.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...as the City..., or the, or to serve as the City Manager. Because it's, it's truly not the case.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** You finished, Ms. Hubbard?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** [Stammer], how are you gonna word that?

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Ma'am?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** How are you going to word that?

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Okay. So right now...

[Inaudible dais discussions]

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** ...we have a master's de' required..., master's degree requirement, seven...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Seven to 10 years.

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** ...years. Seven to 10 years of experience at the City Manager, Assistant City Manager, County Administrator, Assistant County Administrator level or closely related field.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Public field.

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Public field.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Public related field.

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Is that a consensus?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** What does...

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...that encompass?

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Pubic field.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Public related field.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** You said...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** CEO...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...publicly...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Microsoft [inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Publicly related field.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** CEO of Microsoft, you know...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Ms...

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Well...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** What would you be... What would you accept...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Astronaut.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...as, as an example?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Chuckle].

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Someone may not, because of the City size or whatever, may not call it County Administrator, they may refer to it as Town Manager or Town [inaudible]...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well, that would be...

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well, that would...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** That's applicable.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yeah.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** That's applicable.

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Because we've said no division level, no director level, none of, of, of., none, none of that type of experience.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So that would be the only...

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** So, it...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...variation?

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** ...will be.., it will have.., it must be someone...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Town, village...

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Right.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** It wouldn't...

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Right. It has to be someone who has operated as.., what our equivalent of a, a Manager, City Manager or Assistant City Manager. It has.., that would be the equivalent.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Question.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well, that...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...works fine for me. If that's what.., if that's all it includes.

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Hold on. I think...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** No.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Are you finished, Ms. Hubbard? If not.., I mean, if you are, then we'll, we'll go to the Mayor but I'll let you finish up.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Ms...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I, I just...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** So...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Hold on, Mayor.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** No, no. She's not finished yet.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Again, we ended up right back to the point where there is only.., the only category that someone could have served in would be a City Manager



or an Assistant City Manager, based on what you just read and that's, that's not what I was saying. I was saying that the government administration is too broad and too vast to overlook, you know, some possibly good persons from, from, from attorneys, from [pause] other departments, you know, and I just don't wanna close us off and box us in when you've had people making strides and making differences all over this country and we're not get'.., we, we don't get the benefit of that.

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Well, an...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Because...

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** ...Assistant City Attorney would not be excluded. The consensus from, from, from what I've heard...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** [Inaudible]...

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** ...from, from the Council is, no department director or division level. That's not what.., that is not the.., that is not what the, the desire is. The desire is, City Manager lever or Assistant City Manager level.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** I don't want an attorney.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Now, when you use the word level...

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Or the equivalent. It's definitely City Manager....

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** [Inaudible] in budgets.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Oh, shoot.

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** ...County Administrator, Assistant County Administrator. That is the consensus of, of the Board.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** So again...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Stammer].

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...you're.., no. That's not a consen'.., that's not... Well, that's not what I, what I'm saying. You're, you're, you're saying that.., you're saying.., one minute you said that an attorney for a City would not be...

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** An Assistant...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Excluded.

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** ...City Attorney and Attorney...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** I'm not...

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** ...they would be included because that's at that, that's at that level and...

[Inaudible dais background discussion]

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** ...and [inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** That's not what you're saying though.

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** You said [pause]. A City Attorney is the equivalent.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Okay. Okay. If you're.., I get what you're saying, what you're saying.

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Mhmm.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** It's not the...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** What's she saying?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** They're on the level?

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Mhmm.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** So, you're saying that they're on the level because... Okay. So, if you, if you understand that and that's what you're trying to say, then I can go along with you because your definition of equivalency is...

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** That's...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Okay. I got you.

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Closely...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** We'll go...

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** ...related.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...with that.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Know what I'm saying?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** We'll go with that.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Now, you know that's not what we just said a few minutes ago though, right?

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** But let..., we'll, we'll come back. Let's go to the...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I, I...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...Mayor.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...just..., I wanna get right to the, to the bottom line, the point. This would..., if we go with the master's degree and the level of City Manager, Assistant City Manager, County Administrator, Assistant County Administrator, now, this would eliminate Fire Chief, Police Chief, Public Works Director...

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Mhmm.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...Parks Director. Would that eliminate all those people...

**UNK.:** Yes.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...that hold those positions for..., from qualifying?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Now, I just need a straight answer from that, about that.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Chair?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Sound like.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Ms. Irvin? That was for...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible background comment].

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...her, right?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Ms. Irvin, yes.

[Inaudible dais comment]

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Yes, that would.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** That would exclude...

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Yes, because...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...those people who have served...

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** ...those are division...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...in those positions?

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Those are division heads, or dir'..., or, or department directors.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** And that works for me then. Thank you.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Anyone else? Did you have something, Ms. Davis?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** I have a question. Just, let's just hypothetically say master's degrees don't come in, are we going to then evoke a bachelor's degree equivalency with additional experience required?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible] government. [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** I think we need to stay firm on the master's degree.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yeah.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay. If that is the pleasure of the Board, I will go with that.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible background comments].

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. So...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** One more question.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Pull your mic up.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** For a., [stammer] for division heads, we're..., are we..., we're doing that to exclude in-house participation or we're just..., or we like to, or we would do that for outside...

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** That would be in and out.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** But, I mean, is that the purpose of putting that? Because I was thinking, for, for example, somewhere like a, a Utility District or a Public Works or something like that, they manage a enormous budget as well as a whole lot of people and to exclude that level of experience, also, I think we're blocking ourselves in because some of them have, you know, [pause], great budgets, the capital budgets that have to be managed and things of that nature.

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Okay. So, as it stands right now, unless that parti'..., unless that person performs such a task in their previous life as a City Manager somewhere, sometime ago, they would be excluded from, um, this criteria here. If they were a City Manager...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** [Inaudible]...

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** ...somewhere previously...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** [Inaudible].

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** ...and now up is a Public Works Director, then they could..., and they have to be at seven years of...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Absolutely.

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** ...of experience.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Right.

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** They would be included. If not, they would be excluded.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. And then, they could just apply for a Assistant City Manager position and get the experience.

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Okay. So, we have a master's degree in public or business administration, seven years of experience at the City Ma'..., Assistant City Manager, City Manager, County or Assistant County Administrator.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Or public related field.

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Or public related field.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Thank you.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So, we're combining the Assistant City Manager, City Manager...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** No, that's... No, no. That's not what I said. I was saying that when she was...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Oh, I was going back to what Ms. Irvin was[inaudible]...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** About the Assistant City Manager?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Is that what you just stated? You said seven years with all the combined?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Not combined.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Seven to 10.

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** No. It's not..., it's, it's seven years of experience, as...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** [Inaudible].

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** ...as an Assistant City Manager...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Mhmm.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Or...

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Or, a City Manager...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Okay.

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Or a County Administrator...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Oh.

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Or...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So, they can be four years and three years?

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** If..., yes. It can be four years and three. That's seven years.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** That's why I said combined.

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Okay. Thank you. So everyone's cl'...

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** That would give a person...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...is everyone clear on that?

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** ...a total of seven years of experience.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** See what I'm saying? Or should it be 10?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Alright.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I don't usually agree with you...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** [Inaudible]....

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...much but you might be right this time.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...10.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I suggested...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I mean, if you're gonna break down...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I suggest 10.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...like that, then I would say...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Ten years.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I, I was looking for, actually, [pause]...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Well, Madam Clerk?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** You won't combine that.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Seven to 10, that's...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** When I said seven years, I meant seven years as a City Manager. If we're gonna throw in...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Uh-uh, uh-uh.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** ...an Assistant City Manager, then I'm firm on 10 years.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yeah. I could go with that.

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I'm, I'm fine with that.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So, seven for City Manager and County Administrator? And 10 for Assistant City Manager and Assistant County Administrator?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**UNK.:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** See...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Ten years.

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** So, let me just say...

[Chuckles]

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** ...you're making the search so very difficult.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well, we don't wanna just accept anything either though.

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** I understand that. I understand that.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible background comments].

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** To see [inaudible].

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** To say that you're looking for someone that just have 10 years of City Manager experience and not include to say maybe I did five years as an assistant and did three as a City Manager here...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible]...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Or...

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** ...that gives me seven years of, of, of experience of the..., of, of development or even five years or two years.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I say, keep it that way and see what we get. If we don't get what we're looking for, then we can modify it later. I don't think we should water it down.

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yeah.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Ya know?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So, 10 years total?

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Mhmm.



**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** For [stammer], yeah. Well, she just said for the...

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** So, 10 years total?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** No, no, no. Not what Mr. Davis said, what Ms. Pardo just said.

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Ten years at the City Manager level.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** No. She said...

[Inaudible dais comments]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I think she said seven at City Manager or County Administrator.

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Ten...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Public related...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...as Assistant City Manager or Assistant County Administrator.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Ten..., you think somebody is gonna sit in there as ten years as a County..., as a County Administrator or an Assistant City Manager and not have advanced to...

**UNK.:** It's possible.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...[stammer] and not have, have advanced to...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** That's why they're...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...City Manager?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...gonna be applying for this position...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** No...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...'cause they wanna advance.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Not..., not with 10 years' experience, sweetie.

**UNK.:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** They..., no, they, they woulda gone...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** They can.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...to women'..., somewhere else.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Not [inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** But like she said, you're..., I, I would say a combination...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** That's what we said.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...of..., a combination of, of seven to 10 years. Because there's very..., with the life expectancy of, of a City Manager, no one's...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Its bout three years [inaudible]...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...gonna sit in an Assistant City Manager position for 10 years.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** They would have gone with...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** [Stammer]...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...they would have gone some'..., some'..., somewhere...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Maybe they like...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...else and you wouldn't want...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...being Assistant City Manager.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...them if they sat there for 10 years.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Maybe they're okay with being a City..., Assistant. Now they're ready to grow and become a City Manager.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Yeah...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I... [Pause]. So, just to stay consistent, we're not saying that you had to have 10 years of Assistant City management. What we're saying is, City Manager, Deputy...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Uh-uh.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...County Administrator, Assistant County Administrator, out of all those criteria, a total of 10 years experience.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** That's not what we said, no.

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** No.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** We sa'...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** That's not what was said?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** No.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** That, that's...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Well, at least that's what I said.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** That's what I'm saying, a...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Ms. Pardo, did, did you...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...a combination.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...say something different?

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** What?

[Inaudible audience comment]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I said... Okay. Let's start on the left with Ms. Pardo. Try and ask the council...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Oh my God.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So, we said 10 years of experience, total, of City Manager, Assistant City Manager, County Administrator or Assistant County Administrator. Is that correct?

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** That's fine. I'm...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I, I don't...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** ...good with that.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...know. I'm trynna...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** No, no, no.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** A combination...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** I was saying, at first, you know, a minimum of seven years.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** They you went to 10?

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Right. Seven years of City Manager experience under their belt.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** right? We're a., we're almost a \$75,000,000 corporation here.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Exactly.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yeah.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** So, we should be looking for someone that has the experience to run this \$75,000,000 corporation with 400 employees. So that's why I thought, if we try to get someone that has a minimum of seven years as a City Manager, and if they wanna combine it with, you know, experience as a an Assistant City Manager, which would then give them 10 years, then I have no problem...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Oh, I see...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** ...with it.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...what you're saying.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** But I just don't want to...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** ...you know, try to get someone that has four or five years, or four years as an Assistant City Manager, you know, six months as an Assistant...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** No.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** ...County Administrator. You know, I want someone that really has experience...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Seven [inaudible]...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** ...to run a \$75,00,000 corporation.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** And Dawn...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Madam Pardo, I almost said Madam Chair [chuckle]. Ms. Pardo, the...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Yes, Madam Hubbard.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Okay. And that's why I was saying that with a combination of experience from seven to 10 years, between...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...a person serving as..., in a public related field, be it a City Manager or a, you know, with a minimum..., and I can... With a minimum of seven to 10 years in public..., in City Manager or...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** County...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** County Administrator...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Assistant.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...public related fields. The Assistants also, of course. A combination of that experience because I just would be so shocked to find a person that sat as a, as a City Manager for 10 years and, and our being able to, to get, to get them here.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Right.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** The..., so that's why is aid we should have a combination of the years of seven to 10 years public related experience.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Right. And also, or... Madam Chair? So, we all know most City Managers last three years, in a City.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Three to four years.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Right? Three or four years in a City.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well, Ruth was here nine years.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Before they are...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Five years is supposed to be the life expectancy.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Right. Before they move on.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Yeah.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** So, yeah. So, you know...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** ...if we just combine that, it's fine. But if you get someone has been an Assistant who has jumped from Assistant to Assistant to Assistant, then, I think, you know, that should tell you something, how come they're not. You know, how come they haven't moved up to a City Manager? And that's why I'm saying, we need to have a criteria here that, you know, that makes sure that we do have someone, or, you know, if someone applies that does have that City Manager experience. Because there is a big difference between an Assistant and, you know, the City Manager.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** And...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** So, that's all.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Yeah. And...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** [Inaudible]...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...basically.., and that's why I said seven to 10 combined and to lose, not to lose sight of those other public related fields that could...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Yeah. That's...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...Offer. And like you said, with, with...

[Inaudible dais comments]

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...\$70,000,000 budget, that comes in all shape, forms and fashion.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. So, let.., we need to get to a consensus with this. I'm, I'm.., I haven't changed my thoughts on it. I think we need to have someone... I'm not looking for combined.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Nope.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** We can.., whoever can make a motion but I.., from my standpoint, I'm looking for seven years as City Manager, at a minimum.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Okay.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And 10 as Assistant...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Total.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...City Manager, at a minimum.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible] get that [inaudible].

[Inaudible dais comment]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yeah. [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Yeah. No. That's, that's...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** With seven years City...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ... ourselves.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...City Manager.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yeah. And three years as a Deputy [inaudible]?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** No. You're talking about a total of 10 years?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Seven years minimum...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...management experience, along with the three years of something [inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So, if they have four years as an Assistant and six as City Manager, we're not gonna, gonna include them because we're breaking it down that way?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** It's a...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No, you said...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...combination.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No. No, you said years at a minimum. I support that. But if, if they got seven years and three years as a Deputy somewhere, that's a total of 10, with a minimum of a City Manager.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** It doesn't matter about the rest as long as they have the seven years of City Manager.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** And [inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So, they have to have a Ci'..., experience as a City Manager. We're not looking for any people that have only had Assistant City Manager experience, based on what you're saying?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** No. That's not what I'm saying.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** That, I mean, I think that's what..., that's what Mr. Davis is saying, right?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Mr. Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I'm just listening.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Are you saying that, that a person with a minimum of seven years experience and.., in municipal government, County Administrator, City Manager or public related field, does that fit into the category of what you're defining?

[Inaudible dais comment]

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Mr. Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No. What I was stating originally was, in my very first [inaudible]of discussion, when we were talking about the 10 years, I was saying 10 years but I want to discuss what was the minimum years experience as City Manager within those 10 years? And that's what I was trying to initially get to. So, I guess that's where we are now.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** [Stammer]...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I'm saying, 10 years with a minimum of what?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Okay. And I would... Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Is it five, is it seven of actual City Manager experience?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I'm saying seven for City Manager.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** I'm standing firm on seven.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** I am also.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** It's done.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** As an...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Alright.



**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...actual City Manager?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** City Manager or County Administrator.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** City Manager, yes, ma'am.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** That level.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair, I make a motion that we establish the criteria with a minimum of seven years experience as City Manager.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Second.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Second.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** And a master's degree.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** I hope that that's...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Are we gonna do...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...including...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...vote those separate?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...the public related...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Do those separate or together? In the motion?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yeah. Let me amend that motion, right?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Go ahead.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Adding the master's degree with part of the requirement.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** In what?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** The seven years.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** In what field though, specifically?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** What we talked about earlier, the...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** The public...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Public administration.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...administration, business administration or public related field?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Your second still stands?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Will...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yeah.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Will that include...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** My second still stands.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...the public related fields, Mr. Davis?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** That's what he's saying.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** The public related fields will also be included?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** For the master's degree.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** No no. I'm not talking...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** That covers the master's degree, yes.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Yeah. I'm not talking about the level of education.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Seven years...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Are you talking about pub, you're talking about. I'm not talking about the master's degree or degree in public administration.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** You're talking about...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** I'm talking...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...the experience.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Let me get it out, maybe he can understand me. The public related.., the seven years, a minimum of seven years...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** As a City...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...as a City Manager...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** In numerous places, one place or whatever, but a minimum of seven years.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Okay. So that.., so, if they were a, an attorney, they would not qualify? If they had seven years of governmental experience as a government attorney, they would not qualify for this job?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I, I don't have a problem with it but, you know.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Hmm?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I, I don't have a problem with that. With it being seven years of City Attorney. You know?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Yeah. Well, because what she read earlier included those.., that's why I was saying with the public related fields.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Go ahead.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** I believe that we need someone that has had direct experience running a City. I don't believe that someone in the capacity of an attorney, although they may have litigated and...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** That's just.., as an example.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** I'm just using an Attorney as an example, it could be any other position, this City needs a City Manager that has direct experience managing a City. So...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** My motion...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...therefore...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...stands at seven years.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Seven, seven years with...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** With the master's degree.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...the requirement.., the master's degree.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** And the bachelor's.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...but also with the requirement of the levels of municipal mana'.., managerial experience, should be stated. And I believe that we've said that that is Manager, City Manager, Assistant City Manager, County Administrator, Assistant County Administrator.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** That's it.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Hmm?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Or other public related fields.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** I'm not including other public related fields. That, that's not a part of what I'm looking for.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. But...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Now, that may not be the...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...you all know we just...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...consensus.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...changed that...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I support...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...whole motion just now. Listen...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Thank you.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible]my motion.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Here, let me, let me say this.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I said one thing.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** the public related field was included in the degrees.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well, hold on. Hold on.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** [Inaudible]...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I'm talking about for the...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Related fields [inaudible]...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Hold on everyone, hold on. We.., it was just changed. The motion that Mr. Davis stated was...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Seven years.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...the seven years as the City Manager or...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** And everything else fall in it.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...County Administrator. Not...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No. I said seven years as a City Manager. That's it.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Just City Manager.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** That's, that's in the motion t too.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. And then the master's in public administration, business administration or other public related field?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes, ma'am.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** That is in the degree requirements.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** That's the degree.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Degree...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes, ma'am.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...requirement, yes.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** The degree requirement.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Right.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** That's, that's...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Are we good?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** That's it in the motion.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Seven years, City Manager.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I want, that's it.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...or County Administrator. And then, the master's...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** don't need to add nothin' to it later.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And then the master's degree. Okay. Second still stand? [Pause]. Alright. Is that a yes or a no? Who was the second?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** I am the second.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** I believe that we should encompass, Mr. Davis, with all due respect because you're saying City Manager, period.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Well, I asked earlier, and nobody said anything so I said

[inaudible]...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** County...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...I said seven years.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** ...County Administrator [Inaudible]...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** We said City Manager and County Administrator.

[Inaudible dais discussions]

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Can you amend motion, please?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** To what?

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Yeah. County Administrator.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** The original motion...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** To include the City Manager...

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** The original motion, that was stated...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No see. Now, hold on.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** ...was seven years minimum as a City Manager or County Administrator.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Then it was amended to [stammer] include the master's degree and public or business administration and any other related field.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** That was the motion.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** [Inaudible]..,

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** My motion was seven years as City Manager, and it also included, that's it.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** I withdraw my second.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** 'Cause I didn't want nobody take it and add anything else to it. I knew this was gonna happen. So, if that's the moti'.., if that's the intent to include all those other...

[Inaudible comment]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** No. She's just saying...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Davis...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...City Manager and County Administrator 'cause they're...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...they're the same.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** That's it.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Which would be...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Oh, oh. Oh, you said just...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...County Administrator?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yeah.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Okay. Okay. Alright. You said County Administrator?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And City, City Manager.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Seven years, however it comes out?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** No. I mean...

[Chuckle]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...you're either one or the other. I mean...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No. Because I may have four years as City Manager and three years as a County Administrator...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** They're the same level.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I still get to seven years. I...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** They're the same...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Listen...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** They're the same level 'cause we considered them the same.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Listen. I'm just being very clear, of the interpretation of this Board.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** [Inaudible]

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So, my motion will stand., we'll go with seven years, including City Manager or County Administrator.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** That's it. Okay. That's it.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** [Chuckle].

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** And master's degree.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** With., in those particular fields. Public administration, business administration and/or public related field.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** My second stands.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. Madam Clerk. Let's go before they change their mind.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Hubbard?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** I don't think so.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Hubbard.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** No.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson...



[Inaudible dais comment]

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** ...Pardo?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** It was Johnson?

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Davis Johnson?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Miller-Anderson? [Chuckle].

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** That motion is approved with Councilperson Hubbard dissenting.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Chuckle].

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. Item No. 14. Which is Ms. Davis Johnson's Item, wasn't it? Or Ms. Irvin? Ms. Davis Johnson...

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...doing this or no? Who's doing this?

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Which one? 14?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** 14.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible background].

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** I'm sorry. You didn't finish the City Manager, you didn't...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** The time frame.

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** ...talk about the timeline.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Let's go back. Well, that was all they put in front of us here so let's go to the timeline. Is there another document?

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** No.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** We need to set some.., some cri'...

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** This.., I'm passing out the original timeline and I believe you all wanted to...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Just extend it.

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** ...you have change it.

[Pause]

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** You all took a vote.., well, we took a vote on the motion regarding the minimum requirements. We still have a public comment card, Mr. Ezekiel Edmonds. Remember he said he wanted to speak after you all...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yeah.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** ...discussed.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Go ahead.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** We're, we're still discussing the timeframe so.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yeah. Go ahead.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** There has to be public [inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** We're gonna let Mr. Edmonds come up and speak right quick.

**MR. E. EDMONDS:** Yeah. I'll be brief. Given the situation and, you know, all of the back and forth in reference to the City Manager, I think it's important for us to look at the HR Department and Ms. City Manager, I'd like to suggest or direct, if I may, you to look into the competence of the upper management that was left after the, uh, and this no, you know, no, no slight on anybody just if we are going to rebound from such a, a exhausting experience that we've been going through in the past few months, I think it's incumbent upon us to make sure that the people who are selecting the new City Manager are in the proper mindset to make sure that we get the most effective individual or individuals applying for this job. I'm not sure how we come to that but I think we owe to the citizens to look at some of the practices of the HR Department's hiring and see how those

practices have been adopted by the direct reports to the former City HR Director because there could be some misleading..., just training in that department because we've seen public records and the hiring practices of the HR Department are all but fair, in my opinion. And, and some of the, the way that they set up and the process, it seemed to be a little sketchy and open for scrutiny. And, I'm telling you, some of the public records requests that we receive, I don't know how people were hired with that level nepotism that existed in those documents. And, these are some of the same people that we see, you know, carrying out the operations of the department at this point.

So, if I may, you know, I don't know if I have the right to but I would like for you to look into the HR Department and maybe outline some of the practices that were used to hire some of the individuals during the tenure of the former HR Director. Also, I would say to you, these individuals who have created the HR Department's operation standards [pause], I think we just need to look into, to the, the, the practices of the HR Department in the past, you know, five years or so. I mean, it sounds like a lot but, I mean, it's, it's really right there in front of you and I think we'll probably determine that maybe we need to get the City Manager, the Interim City Manager involved in a way where her professional expertise kinda coats the, the, the hiring practices from...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright.

**MR. E. EDMONDS:** ...this point forward.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Thank you, Mr. Edmonds.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. Ms. Hoskins. What are you looking...

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** What you have before you is the original timeline for the City Manager recruitment. Some discussion ensued at the last meeting regarding possibly extending this timeline. We forwarded you all the applicants from the previous job description that was advertised. You wanted to revisit the timeline to look at possibly extending it.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Mhmm.

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** So that's what you have before you now.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Councilman Davis.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Thank you. As we extend this timeframe, as we have an aggressive time in front of us, up to January 3<sup>rd</sup>, one of the things, I know we have the budget [inaudible]to address issues starting April. Maybe, uh, having a timeline that

would have someone [pause] [inaudible] the first meeting in April or the second meeting in March.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** For what?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** No. That's too...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Hmm?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** I think that's too far out.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Well, right now, you, you got holidays coming, we got Palm Beach County Day the second week in January, you have all the MLK events, through that month. So February..., so, second... What? End of February, second?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Just throwin' a date out there to see [inaudible]...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** And you have...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** [Inaudible].

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...have an election too.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Part of the..., part of the discussion that we needed to have, if you will recall, we discussed the extent'.., the extending of the City Manager position to Ms. Hoskins until such time as we can complete this process because we wanted to be consistent with the City Charter and she is currently performing the duties of the City Manager so the very first thing that I believe, before we even move forward with this timeline, is to receive a motion to make Ms. Hoskins City Manager, we can determine what timeframe we want to provide for that but we need to do that before we go into timeline because that gives us a better idea of what it is that we're doing and we can formulate this timeline reasonably.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Well, that was suggested the last meeting.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** I'm..., that's why I'm bringing this up now. I am saying that that is what we need to do now before we even [stammer] delve into...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Okay.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...this timeline.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible]...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** So, with that being said, we need to have a discussion before we entertain a motion, if that is the pleasure of the Council.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** We got to...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** What's the 120 days? What, what's the date of that day?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Like, another two weeks maybe.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** I don't know. I'm just.., I'm asking, it's just a question.

**HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN:** I believe it is January the 18<sup>th</sup>.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** January 18<sup>th</sup>?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Okay.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mhmm.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible] by then.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** So, with that being said, is there any additional discussion that needs to take place on when the 120 day term ends?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Mr. Davis.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I'm prepared to make a motion to appoint Ms. Hoskins as the permanent City Manager to stay in compliance with the City's Charter.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Do you have a timeframe to go with that date?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Until a City Manager is selected.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Second.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** It has been motioned to appoint Ms. Karen Hoskins City Manager until such time as we selected a permanent City Manager.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes, sir.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** One of the things I also thought about as we had time to discuss this position, once we hire a City Manager, they're gonna bring in their own

Deputy, which we also support but one of the things I don't wanna see happen is that, that office don't have any historical value about what's been going on in the City over the last decade financially and one of the things I wanna just.., to have us think about, between now and the next meeting is about having a, a hybrid position in the City Manager's office where someone like Ms. Hoskins can stay for a year to make sure that we have some historical value in that office with the current City Manager and their Deputy that they bring in. So, as we transition, all the historical questions they, they can get from someone here versus have to go out to the public and chase, chase situations. I don't wanna cripple anyone, uh, for... Just something to think about. No'.., nothing to do tonight but this something we need to think about is, when we hand the keys to the City over to the next professional.., whoever he or she may be, they're gonna bring in their Deputy but we may have a.., an administrative position that we can create under the current salary that Ms. Hoskins has already been budgeted for in her previous position so that we can have a easy transition so whenever she does retire, [inaudible]drop.., that position expires. And then that City Manager and Deputy can have someone by them that understand how we made it through furlough, how we made decisions over the last decade so the City can have someone there.., one individual there that they consistently can rely on with some, with some integrity that's gonna help put this City moving forward.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Well, I believe that you are correct but I believe that that conversation is a little premature. I think that we need to go ahead and...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...move forward. Your points are well taken. I just believe that we need to move forward. We do have a motion to appoint Ms. Karen Hoskins City Manager until a permanent replacement is found. It's been second. Madam Clerk.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I have a...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Is there any...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...question.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...further discussion?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes, ma'am.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So, we're not putting a timeline on it? We're, we're just going to do that and what if we never come back to revisit this?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Well, here, here's our, our thinking and the discussion while you were out of the room. When.., as we formulate this timeline, we will be crystal clear as to what that timeframe will be for Ms. Hoskins' term ending. So, if you prefer to hold off and amend that until... I, I don't think that.., well, let me just say this, I

don't think that we need to hold off but we should be very clear in our target dates so that we will know when the term of Ms. Hoskins will formerly end.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well, were we not going down the timeline tonight?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** We are...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** We're not...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...we are going down the timeline and, and that's...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...what I'm saying, we will have a better idea of that but we needed to be able... So that we could comfortably get this timeline together, we were discussing that it is probably prudent for us to go ahead and name her so that we don't get beyond the January 18<sup>th</sup> date because what we were working with here, is a January 3<sup>rd</sup> date and we said that that was to escalated and we're going to be readvertising.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Right. So with..., are we not able to go ahead and figure out what our dates are, if we look and see that the ending contract approval date is March 30<sup>th</sup>, I mean, you know, whatever it is, once we get through it then we can vote on...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** If that is the...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...bringing her...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...pleasure...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...in and say until March 30<sup>th</sup>.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** If that is the pleasure of the Council, we were just trying to make sure that we had that in place. If you all want to go through the timeline and then come back...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I think...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...and have the discussion...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I think the motion [inaudible]...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** That's what I would like to do.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...already establishes that.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Either way, it's gonna be...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** It's gonna...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...we're gonna have to...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...it's gonna determined.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...have her there.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** I would like to move forward.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** But we're kinda...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...doing it in a blanket type of way...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** No.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...right now.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** No, no, no. No, because...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Madam...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...the motion said until a permanent City Manager is hired. And so, that will coincide with what this timeline is.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Whatever it turns out to be.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** But what if we never bring this back to finish it?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Well...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Are we gonna finish...

[Inaudible dais comments]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...it tonight?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** We are finishing this, yes, ma'am.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** How can we not bring it back?



**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Because we do that all the time. I mean, if we already named her, there's no point... I mean, if we have somebody, you don't have to bring it back 'cause we do have someone.

**UNK.:** Well...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** We made a decision.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** That's...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I'm just saying...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible]...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...I mean, don't..., I mean, that is [pause] an option. If we're going to name her the per'..., the person now and then, you know, we run outta run time, it's almost 10:00 o'clock, we'll say, 'Well, we don't wanna continue,' we stop.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** You're talking about...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** We're trying to get it done...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...the timeline...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...we got...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Just getting...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...five minutes.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...through this in general. I mean...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** But we...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...you..., we've put things off many times before so...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible background d comment].

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...I mean, it's unheard of.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yeah.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Okay. So, I think we're doing this because the 120 day...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** days [inaudible]...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** ...expires...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Is about to expire.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** ...on January 18<sup>th</sup>. So, if we move forward tonight with extending Ms. Hoskins' contract, then we are in the clear when it comes to the Charter.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I understand that...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** In compliance...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...but why can't we...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** ...and now...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...define the dates now?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** And for [inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Before...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** We're going to...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...we vote?

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** ...do that after we do the motion. So, we'll take care of the motion...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** ...and then we were gonna step by step, then outline...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** ...the dates.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Go ahead. You got it, Chair.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Alright. We...

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Call the question.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Call the question.

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes?

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Quick que'.., quick comment. I did not bring forward a contract when you named me Interim but I will be bringing back a contract as the permanent City Manager. And, in the contract, I would like to.., I'm gonna put language in there to say after the end of this permanent position that I revert back to the Finance Department, as the Assistant or [pause].., and then, the wages will be what you all made the decision as the Interim City Manager, \$150k. So, I just wanna make sure that you all know that I do.., it is my intent to go back to the Finance Department as the Assistant, if no other job is available for me...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** That ain't gonna be an issue.

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** ...anywhere else. Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Yeah.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** There'll be no issue.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** We u'.., we understand...

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Right.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** We understand.

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Okay.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...that you will be returning...

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Alright.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...to Finance.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Pardo?

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Hubbard?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Davis Johnson?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Miller-Anderson?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** No.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** That motion is approved with Councilperson Miller-Anderson dissenting.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I'd like to entertain a motion for the next 15 minutes to extend this meeting to address this issue.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Say that again. To extend it 'til when?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** 15 minutes.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Is there a second?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Second.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Second.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** So we run down this list.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Hubbard?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Davis?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Councilperson Pardo?

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Pro Tem Davis Johnson?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Chair Miller-Anderson?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Unanimous vote.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. So, we're on looking at the timeline.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Yes.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** So, now we're..., job [stammer] re'...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Timeline.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...job readvertisement.

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** If it's your pleasure, you give me a drop-dead date and I can back into these dates for advertising, preliminary examination of applications, background references and screening. If you give me a drop-dead date of when you want the, the final interviews to take place, I can back into it and present it to you at the next City Council meeting.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** For me, I would say a month out since we're a month off from where we are. I would say, like, February 3<sup>rd</sup>? Giving it, like, an extra month.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** That's Saturday.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I mean, February 5<sup>th</sup>.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** 6<sup>th</sup>.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Let's make it the 15<sup>th</sup>.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** [Stammer], that's the Monday.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** The 2<sup>nd</sup> is [inaudible]...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** That's the deadline?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...right?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** The, the, the last day.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** February 5<sup>th</sup>?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Do you wanna have a special meeting just to address that issue, like, on the 15<sup>th</sup>? And we can just address that one issue?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** I think that we...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Don't combine it with a...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I'm sorry. I'm...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...regular Council meeting.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...looking at the wrong thing. February 7<sup>th</sup>.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** For the last application or have the job done?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** The last contract approval, the last...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** [Stammer]...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Down at the bottom, the last block. Push it out a month from where it currently says January 3<sup>rd</sup>, right? Or... That's the end of it, right? January 3<sup>rd</sup>?

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Right.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. So, I'm saying let's extend it, uh, February 5<sup>th</sup>, a month out?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No. Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** That's for the contract, is that what you said?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Say that again.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** That's for a contract agreement...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Wait. What am I looking at?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...by that time?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** February 7<sup>th</sup>, not the 5<sup>th</sup>. Say that again.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** You're saying for a contract agreement, by that time?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** The bottom here, is..., currently says January 3<sup>rd</sup>. Are you..., on the time. You see...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I know where...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...the timeline?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...you are, I know where you are.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** So, I'm...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** [Inaudible]...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...just extending this out...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** To...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...one month ahead. Since we're basically giving it..., figure we'll give it an extra month to advertise and..., because we only did the 20 days the first time.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Well, I'll see how the...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** [Inaudible]...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...Board feel about it.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** [Stammer].

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** I, I would certainly like to see this, this advertisement on the street for 30 days.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Right.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** So, if we can incorporate the 30-day advertisement time to make it coincide with a February date, then that's, that should be the marching orders of the City Manager.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So, what...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yeah.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...the 15<sup>th</sup>, on a Thursday, or?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Because the employment offer, the current date said December 21<sup>st</sup> through January 2<sup>nd</sup>.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Right.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I mean, you probably can cut off some\ time there.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** But...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And then...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** She's gonna work it backwards?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yeah. She's gonna...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Yeah. She's...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...work it backwards but...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...work it backwards.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...I'm just saying there may be some places up in there where it can be cut a little bit, to be able to get to the February 7<sup>th</sup>.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** I think it should be on the..., I agree it should be on the street at least, at least 30 days.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Especially with it covering the holidays.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** With the holidays.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Okay. So, do we wanna do this during a Cou'... Well, you said contracts so.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** The last...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** It would be on the Agenda anyway. So.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** February 7<sup>th</sup> meeting.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** So, February 21<sup>st</sup>?

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Let's do the second meeting in February.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Uh-uh.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yeah. The second meeting in February.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** The 21<sup>st</sup>?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes, Madam.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Or if you..., if we want to have a special...

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** That's for...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Special meeting just to do it.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** [Inaudible]?



**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** What? On the 14<sup>th</sup> with the CRA? We can do that.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No. That's...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** No. That's Valentine's Day.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** No, no, no.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** No. That's what I was trying to say.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** No. [Chuckle]. Let's do the...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** 21<sup>st</sup>?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** What's wrong with the 7<sup>th</sup>?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Too quick.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Too close.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** As long as...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** I don't think the 7<sup>th</sup> is too close.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** February 16<sup>th</sup>.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** You need...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** As long as it gives us the thir'...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** The 30 days.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...the 30 days.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** The 30 days is [stammer].

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** February 16<sup>th</sup>? That's on a Friday.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** The 21<sup>st</sup>. The 21<sup>st</sup>?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** .

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** February 21<sup>st</sup>.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** February 21<sup>st</sup>.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** I think that's too far out.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No. We're rushing too much, that's our biggest problem.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** What's wrong with February 21<sup>st</sup>?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No. I said...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Nothing. I'm good...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...that's good.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** ...with February 21<sup>st</sup>.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Oh. You said it's rushing? Or too long?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** No. I just think it., I just think it's too far, too far out, February 21<sup>st</sup>.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible] time.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well, I mean, I said the 7<sup>th</sup>. Well, if you...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** I would've gone...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...look at the...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** I would've gone with the...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Well, can't we have a special meeting in...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...the 7<sup>th</sup>.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** ...regard and just meet halfway?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** You know? I would've gone with the 7<sup>th</sup> as opposed...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** The 15<sup>th</sup> ?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** ...to the 21<sup>st</sup>.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well, Ms., how about Ms. Hoskins look at doing the 7<sup>th</sup> or the 21<sup>st</sup> and then when you bring it back for our next meeting we can., when is our next meeting? We can...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** The 20<sup>th</sup>.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Will we be having one?

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** December 20<sup>th</sup>. So, you're saying...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yeah.

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** ...provide a timeline for February 7<sup>th</sup> and...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And the 21<sup>st</sup>.

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** ...one for the...

**UNK.:** Okay.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** I [inaudible].

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Yes.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Thank you. Just for the record, I know one's going to agree but, um, just for the record, I don't understand why we would want to [pause] do this process two weeks or three weeks before an election, when the makeup of the Board possibly could change, which means that if that happened, that would' meant that the previous Council selected the, the Manager for two weeks. Two weeks before.., two or three weeks before, I think, to me...

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Make it [inaudible].

**MAYOR MASTERS:** For me, I think it's better.., just like, for example, we're not allowing the Interim Manager, the permeant Manager to make any department heads because it's somewhat of a limbo status I understand that and I think that same principal should roll over and I think that we should wait until.., if we're that close, it doesn't do any harm to wait two or three weeks because we don't know what the election is going to bring. That way, the people that will be elected or, or reelected, whatever the case the case may be, will have an opportunity to select their Manager that they're gonna work with for the next time period.

Now, that's just my opinion. No one has to agree and I don't care but I say what I say and I put it on the record. And I'm done.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** But Mayor, if you did that with the election being on the 12<sup>th</sup> of March, the swearing in wouldn't happen until a little bit after that and then.., so, you're saying to start at what point in the recruitment process, after the new Council comes on. After the election.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I'm just saying, to me, it's just, it's just more prudent to have, have an election...

[Inaudible dais comments]

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...to have this whole thing after the election, or at least the deadline. That's just for me.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I understand but I'm just, I'm just trying to find out what., are you saying the formal interview part? Do you want to not start the advertisement of it until ten, do you not wanna do the tour until then? There's a few different things. Like, there's some things, I guess, that still can continue but you want the actual formal interview section to not happen until after the new, the...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** I don't think the...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...the election.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...person should be hired...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...until the election. 'Cause you're so close. You're, you're two or three weeks out.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** [Inaudible].

**MAYOR MASTERS:** But that's just me and that's...

[Inaudible dais comments]

**MAYOR MASTERS:** ...just my personal opinion and that's it. It doesn't really matter but what., as far as what part of the process, I just think that you're so close, why not wait?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well, I understand what., I understand your point.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** That's just my point. That's all.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** But, the only thing I'm asking., my., I'm just trying to clarify on, is, we would., you want us to., you're saying for us to continue to move forward, just do not have the interview and then the final selection and an employment offer and contract approval before we have the election?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** That's correct. That's my personal opinion. Just. Yeah.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Okay. Anyone entertain that?

**MAYOR MASTERS:** It's so close.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** No [inaudible].

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Anyone?

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** [Inaudible].

[Inaudible dais comments]

[Pause]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. So, were we in a motion?

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** No. Okay. So, we're just gonna give you that, the February 7<sup>th</sup> and the 21<sup>st</sup>.

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Yes, ma'am.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And then you'll bring it back to us?

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** December 20<sup>th</sup>, and we will be meeting on the 20<sup>th</sup>? Everybody?

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Yes.

[Inaudible dais comments]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** For a meeting? Okay. Alright. Alright. That's it for Item No. 13? [Pause]. Ms. Hoskins?

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Yes, ma'am.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright.

**14.**

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Item No. 14.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON: THE EVALUATION OF THE CITY ATTORNEY**

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Thank you, Madam Chair.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** I checked with the City Manager to find out if any comments had been received from any of my co'.., colleagues and, to date, no revisions to the tool to evaluate the City Attorney was provided. What we have in our package is two, two different documents.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Mhmm.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** One is.., one is a performance evaluation and the other, the other is a image questionnaire. And, the performance valuation does not provide a scoring matrix, however, the image questionnaire does. So, the question that we need to decide.., the, the answer that we need to provide is whether or not we are going to use the image questionnaire as it has a scoring mechanism or do we want to use the performance evaluation and determine a scoring matrix so that we can evaluate the City Attorney.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Go ahead.

**COUNCILPERSON DAVIS:** I reviewed that and I saw that as well. I like the scoring mechanism so we can have something that's standard. The only issue I did have, that this Board hasn't done yet, we have.., there's nothing in there that addresses any benchmarks or goals that was set for the City Attorney. So, how are we gonna, you know, we gotta make sure.., whichever those tools that we use, which I don't know how we can do it without the benchmarks but we have to under.., take that in consideration as we do the evaluation. Benchmarks and goals.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Anyone else?

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** Yes. Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Mhmm.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** So, I am, you know, I don't like the tool and I've never liked tools like this. And maybe it's because of the career that I had, I was never scored, you know, five or five point wo on certain things. I am more comfortable with having a discussion with the person that I am evaluating and if something needs to be written down for the record, well, I'll write it down for the record...

**MAYOR MASTERS:** [Chuckle].

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** ...but, you know, I'm more comfortable just having a conversation with the person that I am reviewing instead of saying, you know, I think on this issue you're a three point two but on this issue I'll give you a five. Quite honestly, I think it's demeaning.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** It is.

**COUNCILPERSON PARDO:** And, you know, I don't think anyone deserves that. So, [stammer], I am more comfortable just having a one on one conversation with Mr. Degraffenreidt. If it's Ms. Hoskins, whomever and just review them that way and then put my notes on the record. But to, you know, to rank someone based on numbers, I don't think it's, it's a fair process. You know, it's not a beauty contest. It's just.., I still.., I find it demeaning.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Madam Chair?

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Go ahead.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** I am not opposed to that. I presented what was provided to me from Mr. Perry because we had not conducted an evaluation. So, if we decide that we want to evaluate him based on our individual meetings with him and the questions that we have for him as it relates to his performance, I'm certainly not opposed to that, if that is that is the measure that we're going to take, then, if that is the consensus of this Board, then let's make that the consensus of the Board.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well, that's not the consensus for me. I think most jobs do, first of all, document appraisals and evaluations. You can have a discussion but it does need to be documented. I'm.., I've seen numerous places that use.., utilize a scoring system. You can do a combination of both during their scoring system and during the, the written statement. I, I think it needs to be more than just a one on one conversation. I mean, we can have one on one conversations all the time but that, that doesn't go anywhere and that doesn't stick. So, I think it needs to be very objective and, and so that we are able to say he's either meeting expectations or he's not meeting expectations and to just have a generic conversation doesn't exactly hit on the areas in which, you know, you, you wanna make sure that we're being covered in.

So, with these two tools that's here, well, the combination of the scoring system and the narrative, that is what I would like to go with. I, I'm not in support of just having a conversation.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Madam Chair...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Anyone... Yes.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** ...we do have public comment cards on this matter.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. Go ahead.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** L.B. Sylvester, Bonnie Larson, Ezekiel Edmonds and Tradrick McCoy.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright.

**MS. B. LARSON:** I thought it was gonna be about the evaluations.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** About the tool...

[Inaudible dais comment]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...the evaluation tool.

**MS. B. LARSON:** [Inaudible] the tool.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Who's next? Mc. McCoy. He was... Oh. Mr. Edmonds here? Who else?

[Inaudible audience comment]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Who else?

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** It's Ezekiel Edmonds, Tradrick McCoy...

[Inaudible audience comment]

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Is L.B. Sylvester still here?

**UNK. AUDIENCE:** I am Mr. Sylvester too.

[Chuckles]

**MR. T. MCCOY:** Tradrick McCoy, then I'm coming back as Mr. Sylvester.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Good evening.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Not tonight.

**MR. T. MCCOY:** [Inaudible] again. Yeah. I, I didn't know this was related to the tools. It was pretty vague but I'm gonna go ahead and address some concerns I have related to the evaluation of our dear Mr. City Manager, or City Attorney who's just sleep on the job over there. He had to be, he had to be pushed to be woken up so keep that in mind.

Last month, the Supreme Court agreed to hear another appeal from Mr. Lozman. Repeat appearances in the court by the same adversaries are unusual and they tend to involve different stages in the same case. Mr. Lozman has pulled off the same rare feat of hauling the City into the Supreme Court in two separate cases. The article goes on to say Elizabeth Wade, a City Councilwoman, said it would help to intimidate Mr. Lozman and make him feel unwanted.., unwarranted heat. You know, five months later he was arrested. Clearly, that was purely personal. That is on the calendar to be heard by the Supreme Court. This is issues that should be evaluated or be considered when the evaluation of the City Attorney comes up. Three's a law firm called [pause] Bedard, Crawford, Roberts, Reynolds, Bedard & Tuzzio, who are the attorneys of record in the Supreme Court case. Over \$750,000 is the master ledger for just defending something that occurred 11 years ago, and clearly, what Ms. Liz Wade thought was gonna be in the closed executive session, was released later in a public records request, or I think it might've been in a subpoena under a court case. We're fighting that now in the Supreme Court, 11 years ago? For what purpose? I mean, clearly, there should be an evaluation from the Legal Department as to what's the purpose and is there any merits for filing, or even appealing, this all the way up to the Supreme Court? This is really an issue. And when you go through evaluating a City Attorney, this is something that you certainly



should keep in mind because it really makes no sense because..., not to mention, it's not just a local embarrassment, this is national embarrassment. And I point to one of the Supreme Court Justices, John Roberts, said, the 2013 case was one of his most favorites cases. So, that should say a lot about the City of Riviera Beach and its legal representation, how, you know, we go about selecting the cases that we choose to, we choose to appeal all the way up to the Supreme Court.

Now, I will also say this, interesting, I think, maybe if it was not last week, the week prior, three commissioners in Martin County was..., I'm sorry, not Martin County [pause]. Yes, in Martin County, was charged with violating the public records law so please keep that in mind Members.

Those are my comments. So, I'll come back as Sylvester in about eight seconds.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright.

[Chuckles]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** We'll see you next week, Mr. Sylvester.

[Chuckles]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Alright. Ms. Hubbard, did you have any...

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** No. No [inaudible]...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Comments? For the tool.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Well, for the, for the tool, for the tool itself, I would like to... I think there should be, you know, somewhat of a com'..., combination. If we're gonna sit down and speak with the Attorney, we can then notate whether or not he has met our expectation and each person that meets with him, we should have this as a benchmark, the tools that are provided here can serve as a benchmark for the questions that we pose to the Attorney when we sit, sit down to speak with him. There's, there's several..., out of the tool, there's, there's several questions that are definitely germane to the evaluation of an, of an attorney. So, at least the [pause]. I think it would, I think that we should, we should at least use them as, as benchmark and we can sit down and write out our, our comments. And each person can render have met expectations or have not met expectations and that'll be enough.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** And then we bring it back before the Council.

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** Ms...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** When..., and we all come together with them?

[Inaudible whisper]

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Yes.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** It's time?

**INTERIM CITY MANAGER HOSKINS:** Fifteen.

**CITY CLERK ANTHONY:** Yes, ma'am.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Anyone wanna motion to extend?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** No.

**MAYOR MASTERS:** [Inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** No.

[Inaudible dais comments]

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** My ear hurts.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Well, we, we haven't made a decision on this.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** No [inaudible].

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** To...

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** I mean, anyone...

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Ten minutes.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...wanna make a motion to extend?

**COUNCILPERSON HUBBARD:** My ear hurts.

**CHAIR PRO TEM DAVIS JOHNSON:** Motion to extend the meeting by 10 minutes to complete this discussion.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** There's a second? [Pause]. Do we have a second?

[Pause].

**MAYOR MASTERS:** Seem like it died.

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Hmm. Alright. Dies for a lack of a second.

## **ADJOURNMENT**

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** Motion adjourn.., I mean...

[Gavel]

**CHAIRPERSON MILLER-ANDERSON:** ...meeting adjourned.

[End Of video]

**City Employees, Public Comment Speakers and Others**

BONNIE LARSON.....MS. B. LARSON

NORMA DUNCOMBE .....MS. N. DUNCOMBE

LLOYD BROWN.....MR. L. BROWN

ASSISTANT POLICE CHIEF MIKE MADDEN .....ASSISTANT POLICE CHIEF  
MADDEN

DR. PHILLIP DUKES .....DR. P. DUKES

LASHONDA DUKES .....MS. L. DUKES

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OF THE HOUSING AUTHORITY JOHN HURT  
.....MR. J. HURT

HOUSING TRUST GROUP PRESIDENT MATTHEW RIEGER  
.....MR. M. RIEGER

FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES DIRECTOR RANDY SHERMAN  
.....FINANCE AND  
ADMINISTRATIVESERVICES DIRECTOR SHERMAN

HOUSING AUTHORITY VICE CHAIR JEFFREY JACKSON  
.....MR. J. JACKSON

NORMA ADAMS .....MR. N. ADAMS

ALFRED JONES .....MR. A. JONES

CRAIG GLOVER.....MR. C. GLOVER

MUNICIPAL RECORDS TAWANA SMITH .....MS. T. SMITH

PORT OF PALM BEACH PEYTON MCARTHUR MR. P. MCARTHUR

GLADYS DARVILLE .....MS. G. DARVILLE

CINDY MARCH.....MS. C. MARCH

CHARLOTTE DARVILLE .....MS. C. DARVILLE

NORMAN DUNCOMBE .....MS. N. DUNCOMBE

EZEKIEL EDMONDS .....MR. E. EDMONDS

LLOYD BROWN.....MR. L. BROWN

L.B. SYLVESTER.....MR. L.B. SYLVESTER

AMON YISRAEL .....MR. A. YISRAEL

BRUCE GUYTON .....MR. B. GUYTON

JAVARIOUS JACKSON .....MR. J. JACKSON

HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINISTRATOR EUREKA IRVIN  
.....HUMAN RESOURCES  
ADMINISTRATOR IRVIN

SUGARMAN & SUSSKIND, P.A. KEN HARRISON  
.....MR. K. HARRISON

ULTIMATE IMAGE COACH PAMELA TOUSSAINT  
.....MS. P. TOUSSAINT

TRADRICK MCCOY.....MR. T. MCCOY

**APPROVED:**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**THOMAS A. MASTERS**  
**MAYOR**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**KaSHAMBA L. MILLER-ANDERSON**  
**CHAIRPERSON**

**ATTEST:**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**CLAUDENE L. ANTHONY**  
**CERTIFIED MUNICIPAL CLERK**  
**CITY CLERK**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**TONYA DAVIS JOHNSON**  
**CHAIR PRO TEM**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**LYNNE L. HUBBARD**  
**COUNCILPERSON**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**DAWN S. PARDO**  
**COUNCILPERSON**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**TERENCE D. DAVIS**  
**COUNCILPERSON**

**MOTIONED BY:** \_\_\_\_\_

**SECONDED BY:** \_\_\_\_\_

**L. HUBBARD** \_\_\_\_\_

**K. MILLER-ANDERSON** \_\_\_\_\_

**T. DAVIS JOHNSON** \_\_\_\_\_

**D. PARDO** \_\_\_\_\_

**T. DAVIS** \_\_\_\_\_

**DATE APPROVED:**   **JANUARY 3, 2018**