D 1	Da
Page 1	Page 3
CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH	1 MR. VELASQUEZ: A quorum is present.
PLANNING AND ZONING BOARD	2 CHAIR JAMES: Will you go ahead and state for
	3 the record if the members who are absent gave proper
	4 notice.
	5 MR. GAGNON: Yes. Jeff Gagnon, Assistant
	6 Director of Community Development.
Thomas des Falorica 0 2017	7 I did hear from Mr. Kunuty and Mr. Barber
Thursday, February 9, 2017	8 prior to the meeting that they would not be able to
Council Chambers	9 attend tonight.
600 West Blue Heron Boulevard Riviera Beach, Florida	10 CHAIR JAMES: Thank you. On to item III.
Kivicia Beacii, Fiorida	Are there any additions or deletions to the agenda?
6:38 p.m 9:44 p.m.	12 MR. GAGNON: No, ma'am.
	13 CHAIR JAMES: Okay, we'll have disclosure by
	Board members at this time, followed by the adoption of
	the agenda. Are there any disclosures?
	16 VICE CHAIR McCOY: Madam Chair.
IN ATTENDANCE:	17 CHAIR JAMES: Go ahead.
Dana Jamas Chain	18 VICE CHAIR McCOY: I have a disclosure. I
Rena James, Chair Tradrick McCoy, Vice Chair	19 have spoken to staff from the City Attorney's Office as
Margaret Shepherd, Board Member	
Julius Whigham, Sr., Board Member	
Lina F. Busby, Assistant City Attorney Jeff Gagnon, Assistant Director of	21 this item. Also, I've received e-mails, a number of
Community Development	e-mails from members of the public and other text
DeAndrae Spradley, Principal Planner	23 messages and what have you.
Mario Velasquez, Senior Planner Allison Goldberg, Senior Planner	24 CHAIR JAMES: Any other disclosures?
	25 MS. SHEPHERD: Margaret Shepherd. I had
Page 2	Page 4
BE IT REMEMBERED that the following Planning	about 22 people visit to my home on this matter.
2 and Zoning Board meeting was had at Riviera Beach City	2 CHAIR JAMES: And I will disclose that I was
3 Hall Council Chambers, 600 West Blue Heron Boulevard,	3 contacted by the applicant to make a site visit to
4 Riviera Beach, Florida, on Thursday, February 9, 2017,	4 Tampa, which I was not able to attend. So if we don't
beginning at 6:38 p.m., with attendees as hereinabove	5 have any other disclosures at this time, we'll go ahead
6 noted, to wit:	and move for the adoption of the agenda. Is there a
7	7 motion?
8 CHAIR JAMES: The time is now 6:38. Going to	8 VICE CHAIR McCOY: So moved.
9 go ahead and call the meeting to order. We'll begin by	9 MR. WHIGHAM: Second.
a moment of silence and then the Pledge of Allegiance.	10 MR. VELASQUEZ: Julius Whigham.
11 (Moment of silence observed. Pledge of	11 MR. WHIGHAM: Yes.
12 Allegiance recited.)	12 MR. VELASQUEZ: Margaret Shepherd.
13 CHAIR JAMES: We'll have roll call now.	13 MS. SHEPHERD: Yes.
14 MR. VELASQUEZ: Julius Whigham.	14 MR. VELASQUEZ: Tradrick McCoy.
15 MR. WHIGHAM: Present.	15 VICE CHAIR McCOY: Yes.
16 MR. VELASQUEZ: Margaret Shepherd.	16 MR. VELASQUEZ: Rena James.
17 MS. SHEPHERD: Here.	17 CHAIR JAMES: Yes.
18 MR. VELASQUEZ: Edward Kunuty.	18 MR. VELASQUEZ: Unanimous voting. Motion
19 (No response.)	19 approved.
20 MR. VELASQUEZ: Zedrick Barber, II.	20 CHAIR JAMES: Thank you. On to unfinished
21 (No response.)	21 business. I'm sorry.
22 MR. VELASQUEZ: Tradrick McCoy.	22 VICE CHAIR McCOY: That was adoption. We're
23 VICE CHAIR McCOY: Here.	23 in approval.
24 MR. VELASQUEZ: Rena James.	24 CHAIR JAMES: Approval of the minutes, sorry.
25 CHAIR JAMES: Here.	25 So we have approval of the minutes from the January
	20 approval of the finite of the balloury

1 (Pages 1 to 4)

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

22nd, 2017 meeting.VICE CHAIR I

VICE CHAIR McCOY: Move to approve, Madam .

3 Chair.

4

6

11

12

16

17

21

25

1

3

9

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

MS. SHEPHERD: Second.

5 CHAIR JAMES: Roll call.

MR. VELASQUEZ: Julius Whigham.

7 MR. WHIGHAM: Yes.

8 MR. VELASQUEZ: Margaret Shepherd.

9 MS. SHEPHERD: Yes.

10 MR. VELASQUEZ: Tradrick McCoy.

VICE CHAIR McCOY: Yes.

MR. VELASQUEZ: Rena James.

13 CHAIR JAMES: Yes.

14 MR. VELASQUEZ: Unanimous voting. Motion

15 approved

CHAIR JAMES: Now for unfinished business.
MR. GAGNON: Yes, thank you, Chair. Once

again, Jeff Gagnon, Assistant Director of CommunityDevelopment.

Development.You have

You have before you tonight an item that was previously reviewed by the Planning and Zoning Board on

December 15th of last year. It's a resolution of the

23 City Council of the City of Riviera Beach, Palm Beach

24 County, Florida, approving the site plan and special

exception application from Odyssey Manufacturing

Page 7

because some are marked for public comments, which comes at the end of the agenda. I mean public comments, under that section is section VIII, not section VI.

So just be aware of which box you're checking when you're completing the public comment card so as I go through these and I have not called you to speak on this item, it's because you probably have the wrong box marked. Okay, so we'll go ahead with the presentation.

MR. GAGNON: As a summary of the presentation tonight, you'll be presented with a location map, an aerial image. Current site photos, you'll see both the previous site plan and the amended site plan proposal with notation of the proposed changes. The landscape plan proposed will be provided. Odyssey has provided photos of a similar facility, the same photos from last meeting as well, and then we can look at the staff report.

So here's the subject area. This is a location map of the area itself. Stonybrook is to the west and Tropical Shipping to the east along Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard. Here is an aerial of the site itself. The site does encompass this main parcel and two smaller parcels to the west as well. You can also notice it does abut the railroad tracks as well,

Page 6

Company for the construction of a bleach storage and

- distribution facility, including eight 40,000 gallon
 - storage tanks and a future material storage area on an
- 4 approximately seven acre vacant parcel of land known by
- 5 PCN 56-43-42-32-43-001-0000 located on the south side
- of Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard, east of 1555
- 7 Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard, which is the
- 8 Stonybrook Apartments, and west of 1489 Dr. Martin
 - Luther King, Jr. Boulevard, which is Tropical Shipping,

and providing for an effective date.
 So for the general public, just

So for the general public, just a brief overview of the procedures for tonight. We'll have a staff presentation, followed by a presentation by the applicant. Then there will be an opportunity for public comments on the item as well.

I don't know, Chair James, if you wanted to make a general statement about the pink comment cards, but typically we'd ask for the comment cards to be provided prior to the start of the item. However, we do need a pink comment card to receive public comment.

CHAIR JAMES: There is something I want to note about the comment cards. Right now we're on the agenda, and I think at this point everyone who has submitted a comment card wants to speak on item A, but that's not easily identified on some of these cards,

Page 8

which is a main factor and component of this project proposal.

So here's a view taken from the center of the roadway to the north. This is looking south. You can see Tropical Shipping in this photo. This is a rail transfer station to the north. Also to the north you can see an existing canal and residences. This is a view west. This is also west. You can see the Stonybrook Apartments. And the resolution is difficult to see on this, but this is south across the parcel itself. You can see the parcel itself is currently vacant. This is also a view south.

So the proposal that was provided during the December 15th Planning and Zoning Board meeting, it had a three phased approach. It was for the bleach storage and transfer in phase one, there was a phase two warehouse, and also a phase three storage area for Cemex.

So this is the phase two warehouse area. And what occurred between the December 15th meeting and tonight's meeting is the applicant decided to remove this phase from the development proposal. And obviously, the applicant will have the opportunity to explain that in greater detail, however, I think it was based off of comments that were provided during the

2 (Pages 5 to 8)

last public meeting on this item. So the phase two warehouse, as shown, will be removed.

This is the current proposal. And I'll put the mouse cursor over the same area. You can see the warehouse has been removed. The storage and transfer location remains the same as previously, as well as the storage area for Cemex.

So the landscape plan remains unchanged, except that staff did ask the applicant to add additional shade trees along the landscape buffer adjacent to the Stonybrook Apartments. So the applicant did agree to add an additional 30 shade trees along this location. So to give you a feeling of how many 30 shade trees would equal, currently along this stretch is approximately 30 shade trees currently. So it would be doubling the number of shade trees, so there would be a significant increase in that landscape buffer.

And this is just the other section of the landscape plan towards the south end of the property.

These are the same two photos that were provided during our last meeting. These are photos of the existing facility that Odyssey operates, so it gives you a good general understanding and feeling of what the storage tanks would look like on this site as

Page 11

that the Odyssey proposal is not to manufacture bleach in this location. Any sort of manufacturing of bleach would occur at an off-site location, and this is for storage and transfer of that bleach commodity. So there is no manufacturing proposed on site currently.

As previously referenced, they did decide, Odyssey did decide to remove that phase two warehouse from the proposal. Based off of Board comments and public comments, they thought that that proposal would be more in line with the intent of the code and also what the general public and Board was looking for.

I did want to make reference once again that similar to the last packet that was provided during the December 15th meeting, City Code Section 31-62, which is standards for granting special exceptions, that's included in your packet just behind the staff report as well.

So that kind of guides the Board as far as the review process. And it also guides the staff analysis as far as what specific elements we're looking for to see whether or not that special exception is being met, and it's supposed to guide the Planning and Zoning Board's analysis of the project in general.

So what I'll do is I'll skip down to the special exception analysis. The other sections of the

Page 10

well, in addition to some of the other components anticipated to be, including this site plan.

At this point I'd like to transfer it to the staff report. And just for the record, there is a public reference binder in the back of the room that has all the information that was provided online, which included the staff report. It also includes an additional environmental assessment that the applicant has provided since our previous meeting. So there's some important information included in that document as well. Again, that was presented to the Board when the packet was distributed, as well as having it available to the general public in the rear of the room.

So as I discussed previously, there's three parcels. The primary parcel is approximately seven acres. In total, it's approximately nine acres for the entire development. The existing use is vacant, and the zoning designation is general industrial, and that corresponds to the industrial future land use.

I touched upon the adjacent property uses currently. The two major developments would be Tropical Shipping and Stonybrook Apartments to both the east and west of the property. So I want to touch upon some of the highlights within the background.

I did want to note again during this meeting

Page 12

typical review, the staff analysis and review, staff feels as though the applicant has met those requirements. The special exception analysis, again, the facts of the project are provided to the Board for review and analysis, and it's really on the Planning and Zoning Board to review these facts, ask any additional questions you may have and provide a final recommendation of the project to City Council.

So under special exception analysis, there's a few criteria. For the record, I'll list the beginning of that criteria and also staff analysis of the project proposal.

So the first is ingress and egress to the property and also proposed structures thereon. So as you saw from the previous aerial, it's located on MLK, Jr. Boulevard, and all that ingress and egress to the site is readily available, so staff feels it met that criteria.

(B) is off-street parking and loading areas. This is really a component of the type of structures built and anticipated parking demand. Staff feels that adequate parking has been provided and that the application meets that criteria.

Letter (c) is refuse and service areas, including consideration of relevant factors as listed

3 (Pages 9 to 12)

Page 13

above. So again, there are trash service capabilities for the site, and there is a dumpster enclosure that's been designed per City standards on the proposed site plan, so staff feels that letter (c) has been met by the applicant.

Letter (d), utilities, including such consideration as hook-in locations and availability and compatibility of utilities for the proposed area or structure. Again, all the utilities are available to the site, including sewer, water, electric, and so the typical hookups can be provided for this proposal.

Letter (e) is really a description of how the landscaping and buffering will work for the proposal itself. As previously mentioned, the applicant has agreed to plant 30 additional trees along the landscape buffer adjacent to Stonybrook, and staff feels as if this letter, letter (e) has been met by the applicant.

Letter (f), consider signs or outside displays. At this time there is no sign proposed, no signing proposed on site. In the future, if a sign is requested, it would go through a separate permit process. Additionally, a lighting plan has been provided, and it meets City codes.

Letter (g) is required yards and open spaces. This plan adequately meets all City codes. Most of the development is located in the City of Division

state the development is located in the City of Riviera Beach.

Number four, this resolution would supersede any previous site plan approvals.

Number five, City Council would authorize City staff to approve future amendments to the site plan administratively, so long as they do not deviate greater than five percent from the originally approved site plan.

Number six, a unity of title is required prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Occupancy or a Certificate of Completion for the three parcels.

Number seven, activity on this property which results in offensive noise, which is specifically defined under City Code Section 11-141 and as follows, that shall be discontinued during the time between 8 p.m. and 7 a.m.

Number eight, tanker trucks may actively transport bleach from this location, however, tanker trucks shall not be utilized for long-term storage of bleach or other material on site.

Number nine, the eight 40,000 gallon storage tanks proposed shall only be utilized for the storage of bleach and no other material or substance.

Number ten, approval of any future expansion

Page 14

site itself, as proposed, is currently open, so it meets that requirement.

Letter (h) is other applicable requirements, such as those found in Section 31-481, which is our PUD section of the code, which isn't really relevant to this development in my opinion; Section 31-566, which is our parking section of the code, which was referenced earlier on where adequate parking has been provided; and also Section 31-596, which is our landscape section of the code, which has also been met.

So under Recommendation, City staff advises that the Planning and Zoning Board review and consider all information presented and provide a recommendation to City Council. If the Planning and Zoning Board chooses to recommend approval, City staff recommends including the following conditions of approval. And there are ten conditions of approval below. Some are standard language.

So number one is a two year landscape performance bond for 110 percent of the value of landscaping and irrigation.

Number two, construction and landscaping improvements must be initiated within 18 months of the effective date of resolution.

Number three, all future advertising must

Page 16

requests of the on-site bleach storage capacity of this facility shall require an additional special exception approval. Again, it is currently eight 40,000 gallon storage tanks proposed, which would be a 320,000 gallon storage capacity in total.

So at this time, if the Board does not have questions of staff, I would turn it over to the development team for Odyssey.

CHAIR JAMES: I have a question. MR. GAGNON: Yes, ma'am.

CHAIR JAMES: In your Recommendation, it's not clear if the City is recommending approval or denial. It just states if the Planning and Zoning Board chooses to recommend approval, City staff recommends including the following conditions of approval. So what is the City's position or the staff's position?

MR. GAGNON: Well, again, as described under Code Section 31-62, it specifically provides that analysis responsibility to the Planning and Zoning Board. So again, staff has provided as many facts as we could. We provided an analysis of the special exception criteria to allow the Planning and Zoning Board to analyze that data. However, at this time we feel as if ultimately, that decision falls on the

4 (Pages 13 to 16)

1

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19 20

21

22

23

24

25

3

10

11

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Planning and Zoning Board.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21 22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

1 8

19

20

21

22

23 24

25

CHAIR JAMES: So you're not recommending approval as in previous --

MR. GAGNON: The previous --

CHAIR JAMES: We always usually get a recommendation. So it's just up to us, okay. So noted.

Does the Board have any other comments of staff at this time?

MR. WHIGHAM: I have one question. I know that at our last meeting we were concerned about having a third party involved in this to tell the citizens and the Board whether this condition of the storage tanks would be safe and how about they're doing. And you know, I just thought we were supposed to have a third party involved.

But then too, I'm concerned that the State Environmental Protection Agency hasn't been involved. Have they been notified about this, or the Federal Protection Agency been notified of this concern about what's going on in the City of Riviera Beach?

MR. GAGNON: So in response to the request for a third party analysis, Odyssey did procure that analysis, and it has been provided in the staff report, in the staff packet that's been provided. I think

Page 19

official response. I think it has been worked out, and I think it's a nonissue at this point, however, I

haven't received documentation on that.

VICE CHAIR McCOY: Follow-up, Madam Chair.

CHAIR JAMES: Go ahead.

VICE CHAIR McCOY: I actually went through the minutes, and I specifically tried to preface it, because we were presented with a memorandum that referenced Interstate Commerce Commission Termination Act at the last moment, I think moments before we got into the meeting, and it was stated by the applicant that they were preempted from City's code.

And I asked the question of our Legal Department, if they had an opinion, and it was said that they were going to have to provide a review and then come back and give us the information as to whether there was any preemption. So that's, in my opinion, why we tabled.

MR. GAGNON: I'm sorry. I believe that it was discussed and worked out. And I don't want to speak for the applicant, but I believe that they're comfortable with moving forward with the review process as is. But again, the applicant can respond differently if I'm speaking out of turn.

VICE CHAIR McCOY: Right, but just so I can

Page 18

Odyssey will be able to provide a better description of the findings and results of that report, however, a report was completed.

And as far as contacting DEP or any sort of regulatory agencies, I think that would happen further down the line to ensure that any sort of development was in line with any sort of Federal or State or County laws if they're a different source other than City laws. So that would come at a later date.

CHAIR JAMES: Are there any other Board comments for staff?

VICE CHAIR McCOY: Madam Chair.

CHAIR JAMES: Go ahead.

VICE CHAIR McCOY: I was specifically looking for a response to why we tabled the meeting last -actually, in December when we requested a review of the memo that was provided by the applicant.

MR. GAGNON: I think that after staff reviewed the item, if you recall, there was a condition of approval that referenced a time for use of the railway itself. That condition has been removed from staff's recommendation, being that there are Federal regulations that kind of dictate the use of rail lines.

As far as an official response to the submittal, I'd have to defer. I haven't seen an Page 20

1 know for myself and maybe perhaps other members of the 2

Board, we were provided with documentation that said

that they were preempted from coming to get a special

4 exception. Just because I think it was something like

5 we asked, I was hoping that we would get a response or

6 some information back from our Legal Department or even

7 from City staff as to the applicability of the

8 Interstate Commerce Commission Termination Act. So 9 that's where I'm at.

MS. BUSBY: Chair?

CHAIR JAMES: Go ahead.

MS. BUSBY: Our office can respond. 12

> MR. DeGRAFFENREIDT: Sure. I understand the position taken by the applicant in the memorandum. I respectfully disagree. I think we have the entitlement to apply our zoning applications to the project and it's not preempted. Whether that's true or not, whether I'm right or Mr. Brown is right is really irrelevant to your proceeding. Who's right will be decided in a court of law, should that issue have to be decided there. You have an issue that is unrelated to that tonight, and I respectfully request you to decide

CHAIR JAMES: I'm sorry, could you state your name and --

5 (Pages 17 to 20)

MR. DeGRAFFENREIDT: My name is Andrew DeGraffenreidt. I'm the City Attorney.
CHAIR JAMES: Thank you.

Any other questions?

VICE CHAIR McCOY: Follow-up.

CHAIR JAMES: Go ahead.

VICE CHAIR McCOY: Madam Chair, and I respect the legal expertise of our City Attorney, but a part of our role as being on the Planning and Zoning Board, we're allowed to request information that we deem or think is relevant and necessary in our decision making.

And you know, I would certainly take your opinion, but, you know, we're volunteers, so at the minimum, if the City Attorney's Office has made a determination that it's not applicable, you know, I think prior to us being in the meeting is when we should have found out. So I mean that's a vested role that's provided to the Planning and Zoning Board as members.

So that's what I have for that, Madam Chair, and I would have hoped that we would have had something other than, you know, just a statement on the record. I was looking for an actual memorandum, and that was the whole reason why we tabled this item.

CHAIR JAMES: Any other comments from the

Page 23

last presentation, so I'm not going to go over all that stuff. We're going to rely on what was presented on the record in the December 15th meeting. The only changes have already been covered as far as Odyssey's site drawing. We eliminated the warehouse, and there was a slight increase in the retention pond area. The last thing we did is an environmental risk assessment. It was performed by a third party, based on Board feedback at the December meeting.

So just as a quick overview, staff has stipulated we meet all the requirements for the special exemption, if you agree with them. And secondly, staff -- or Odyssey accepts all of the stipulations in the staff recommendations for approval that have been presented previously by Mr. Gagnon.

Our core business is disinfection. The primary chemical used for disinfection in Florida is sodium hypochlorite, otherwise known as bleach. It's added to the drinking water to create safe drinking water, and it's added to wastewater to make it safe to be disposed of in the ground or in the ocean.

This is a bleach tank that happens to be at the City of Riviera Beach Water Plant. We installed this tank about four months ago to help the City with water quality problems they were having, so we're

Page 22

Board or staff? Okay, we can move on to the applicant's presentation.

(Discussion held off the record.)

MR. ALLMAN: Computers are very maddening at times.

Madam Chairwoman, members of the Planning and Zoning Advisory Board and general public, I want to thank you all for the opportunity to be here and to make this presentation for our proposed bleach distribution facility.

CHAIR JAMES: Please state your name.

MR. ALLMAN: My name is Pat Allman. I reside at 707 South Packwood in Tampa, Florida. And first thing I'd like to do is just to introduce members of our team that are here tonight.

I am the general manager of the company and the project manager. Our CEO, Steve Sidelko, is right here

MR. SIDELKO: Good evening.

MR. ALLMAN: I have a salesman that lives in Fort Lauderdale, Pablo Placenek (phonetic). I'm not sure if he made it. I don't see him. Randall Granberry, he's going to be our local construction manager. And Michael Brown is our local counsel.

So really, this is just a continuation of our

Page 24

actually using bleach at the City of Riviera Beach
 Water Plant to help with water quality problems.

It also illustrates another part of our business, and that is we're a licensed general plumbing contractor who installs chemical systems. If you look at this pie chart here, you'll see that 94 percent of the water and wastewater plants in Florida use bleach for disinfection. These are some of the major cities using bleach. Every one of these cities or counties have multiple bleach tanks, many of them in residential neighborhoods.

Bleach is considered very safe. For example, Palm Beach County has over 2 million gallons of bleach tanks, storage for bleach just at the water and wastewater plants alone. This is where bleach is used in Florida. You can see water and wastewater plants, power plants, small industrial customers, pool stores such as Pinch A Penny and Leslie's Pool, water parks. The City of Riviera Beach uses bleach at its water park here in town. And of course, for bottles, things like Clorox in grocery stores.

So Odyssey is headquartered in Tampa. We have multiple locations in Florida, and we make bleach, we distribute bleach; we are a contractor who puts in chemical systems. And we also sell equipment to the

6 (Pages 21 to 24)

water and wastewater industry primarily. So this is where we are, and as you can see toward the bottom, we're hoping to have a facility in the future in Riviera Beach.

So why Riviera Beach? First of all, there's a supply shortage of bleach in Florida. There's an excess supply of bleach outside of Florida. And this shortage is going to become more pronounced as the last few chlorine gas users get phased out in Florida. Within the next two years in southeast Florida, 25 million gallons of bleach is going to be needed. Right now there's no one in Florida that can make it.

What we're looking to do, rather than spend \$65 million on a salt to bleach plant, we're looking to spend a fraction of that and put in distribution facilities and use the excess bleach capacity that's in Niagara Falls and bring it down here to Florida.

So the second bullet is so our business is integrally related to and dependent on rail service. It's not practical to truck bleach that far. You can get a heck of a lot more bleach in a railcar, and you can get it here a lot cheaper, with a lot less fuel use.

So second point is we're significantly dependent on the intermodal rail system, the

Page 27

Page 28

of community input for our design. The front five acres, as you saw on the picture in the site plan that Mr. Gagnon presented, aren't even being developed. All our operations are on the back of the property adjacent to where the concrete companies are.

The front is going to have a decorative fence. We're going to have landscaping well above the code for the north and west sides of the property. There's a separation wall with Stonybrook Apartments, with landscaping on both sides of the wall, and there's a retention pond behind the wall that further separates Stonybrook Apartments from our site activities.

This shows an identical fence that's at the Tesla dealership that we're going to be putting in by a local fence contractor.

I love computers. You knew that.

You can see what the gate will look like. It's an attractive automatic gate, and the gate is well inside the property limits. We're going to have landscaping all along the fence similar to this, except with more trees.

This shows the Odyssey control room right here in Tampa, where not only do we have people on site during the day, but at night we can watch the site both with security cameras and with -- you can see the -- we

Page 26

transportation system. Riviera Beach is uniquely located to I-95 and the Florida Turnpike. That allows us to get our bleach up and down the southeast Florida coast, which is where all the customers are.

Third, the site in Riviera Beach offers a wonderful place where we can process the bleach by taking it from the railcar to the storage tanks.

And lastly, our product performs a public purpose. Without bleach, you would be not able to drink the drinking water. You'd have to boil it. You couldn't take a shower with it. You'd have to boil it. Without bleach, you'd be discharging the effluent from wastewater plants and creating public health nightmares. People would be sick with cholera and all kinds of other diseases.

So Riviera Beach is an important place because of, frankly, the rail yard on the proposed site. There's four major rail yards on the Florida east coast where Florida East Coast Railroad and CSX Railroad come together. One is in Miami. One is in Riviera Beach right here at this property. There's five tracks. It's a major rail yard. The third is in Fort Pierce, and the fourth is in Jacksonville. That's why this site is the right site, because of the rail.

So how did we get here? Well, we got a lot

can look at every process on the VLCs there.

So to build this thing, we're going to use local suppliers. We've entered into contracts or purchase orders for about two-thirds of the items that we're going to be needing already to build the site. We're also going to use local contractors to build it. So Odyssey is going to act as the general contractor, which allows us to hire all the subs. These are all the subs we're going to be hiring to build the facility, and we have contracts with about half of them already.

This is what we foresee as our total investment in the property. The first phase is the bleach unloading facility, and the total investment is going to approach \$9 million. There we go.

Some of the benefits to Riviera Beach are an investment in the community, job creation, increase in tax base, purchase of outside services and community partnering. Initially we're going to bring 20 jobs.

Okay, well, I think I'll just summarize with this, since I'm not really able to get through the -- here we go. We'll summarize here. So staff has stipulated we meet all requirements of the special exemption. We accept all the other stipulations in the recommendation for approval presented at this meeting.

7 (Pages 25 to 28)

And kind of the last thing I'd like to say is we requested, and if the staff wants to take advantage and request a presentation, but the consultant that did the third party report, Mr. Whigham, is here if you'd like to hear from him.

Anyway, that's all we have, but thank you very much, Madam Chairwoman. Appreciate your all's time.

CHAIR JAMES: Thank you. I would like to have the person from the agency that did the third party review, if you could quickly come up and summarize that report for the audience. Thank you.

VICE CHAIR McCOY: Madam Chair, prior to him coming, can I ask a question of the applicant?

CHAIR JAMES: Sure.

1.5

1.5

VICE CHAIR McCOY: Mr. Allman.

MR. ALLMAN: Yes.

VICE CHAIR McCOY: The warehouse was removed from the site plan. Why was that?

MR. ALLMAN: We thought the best thing was,

since we hadn't planned on building it right away anyway, we thought the right answer was simply it would streamline this whole approval process by removing it, and we thought it would just be a lot simpler and easier. And so, you know, rather than debate whether Page 31

Page 32

the City's Legal Department, and they can speak for themselves, have concluded that, I believe -- and they'll address this -- that we meet the requirements of the special exception without even the application of the Federal statute. That's number one.

And so therefore, the warehouse required a special exception, and the City has taken the position also that the storage tanks also require a special exception, which we disagree with that. But nonetheless, under the statute, I'm sure your City Attorney can tell you, once we meet the requirements for the City code for a special exception, which we have, then it's our position that we are entitled under City code and the law to the granting of the special exception.

VICE CHAIR McCOY: Follow-up, Madam Chair. CHAIR JAMES: Go ahead.

VICE CHAIR McCOY: Well, that begs the question that if you meet the requirements without the Federal statute, why was the memorandum presented that stated that you guys are exempt because of the Interstate Commerce Commission Termination Act? Why did you even offer that up to the Planning and Zoning Board?

MR. BROWN: Well, you're right. I didn't

Page 30

it's needed or not, it was simpler to remove it.

We were going to use it, as you know, to bottle bleach. If we never bottle bleach there, then the 20 jobs the bottling bleach creates just doesn't get -- don't get done. We still need to bring the bleach in for the water and wastewater plants, and that's our core business. So hoping that answers your question.

VICE CHAIR McCOY: It did. But as referenced in the prior meeting, the purpose of the special exception was because you had a warehouse, and those were, in staff's presentation, that those were prohibited unless it came through by special exception.

MR. ALLMAN: Right.

VICE CHAIR McCOY: So we're back here at the special exception, and you've taken the warehouse out. So what gives?

MR. BROWN: If I may, Mr. Vice Chair, I can answer that.

CHAIR JAMES: State your name. Sorry.

MR. BROWN: Michael Brown. I'm at 2620 Lake Shore Drive, Riviera Beach. I'm the attorney for

Odyssey. 24 Mr

Mr. McCoy, what has happened is that irrespective of the application of the Federal statute,

offer it to the Board. I offered it to your staff and your attorney.

And as a lawyer, just from a legal standpoint, I'm sure your attorney will advise you that you have to address certain legal rights and remedies in administrative proceedings such as this so that the argument can never be made that you waived those rights. So it had to be brought up and addressed.

And again, it's our position the statute applies. It's your staff and your attorney's position that it doesn't apply. But I believe it's your attorney's position that -- and you can obviously confer with them -- that we do meet the requirements of the local ordinance anyway. So we really don't need the Federal statute, in their opinion.

VICE CHAIR McCOY: Thank you.

MR. BROWN: So to answer your question, we had to bring it up, because if you don't bring it up, under the law, you waive the right to have it apply.

VICE CHAIR McCOY: Thank you, Mr. Brown. Follow-up as just a general comment, Madam Chair.

CHAIR JAMES: Go ahead.

VICE CHAIR McCOY: That speaks to precisely why I asked for a response to the memorandum, because

8 (Pages 29 to 32)

1

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1 2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

when we left on December, I think it was 15th, you know, that's where we were. And to get to a meeting today, and it's off the table and we had no idea about it, so that's why I asked was there a response. So I appreciate the clarification.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

1.5

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

MR. BROWN: And Madam Chair, may I address one other point?

Mr. Whigham, you mentioned about that special third party environmental assessment. One was prepared, and that's the gentleman that the Chairwoman is bringing up to address, so that it's clear to you that one was done by an expert in the field who basically did a report to answer the very questions that you address, that is whether there was any health or safety issues that this project would present to the local area or the City of Riviera Beach. And I believe the Chairwoman will have him come up and address those

18 CHAIR JAMES: That's correct. 19 20 MR. BROWN: Thank you. 21 CHAIR JAMES: Thank you. 22 MS. SHEPHERD: Madam Chair. 23 CHAIR JAMES: Yes, Ms. Shepherd. 24 MS. SHEPHERD: May I ask Mr. Allman a 25 question, please?

Page 35

and I'm going to say: I did everything I promised, didn't I? And you'll say: Yes, you did, Mr. Allman, so we'll give you the warehouse.

MS. SHEPHERD: Mr. Allman, I think you're kind of puffing a little bit. I asked you specifically will this company -- if you have it in your head to ever come back with a warehouse. It's either a yes or

MR. ALLMAN: No.

MS. SHEPHERD: Thank you, Madam Chair.

CHAIR JAMES: Thank you. 12 Okay, you can go ahead with your 13 presentation.

MR. HILFIKER: Madam Chair, Planning Board, citizens of Riviera Beach, my name is Steve Hilfiker. I'm the president of Environmental Risk Management, based in Fort Myers. I reside at 7171 Philips Creek Court, Fort Myers, Florida. And I have been court qualified as an expert witness in environmental risk management. My credentials are presented on page 32 of the 35 page technical report that has been prepared and I understand distributed for your review prior to the meeting.

We are one of two environmental forensic contractors that have been hired by the Department of

Page 34

CHAIR JAMES: Go ahead.

MS. SHEPHERD: You said you're taking the warehouse out of this proposal.

MR. ALLMAN: Yes, ma'am.

MS. SHEPHERD: If the Planning and Zoning and Council allow you to come to the city with that project, will you ever build that warehouse in this city?

MR. ALLMAN: That's strictly up to the future business climate and the City of Riviera Beach. One of the reasons that we really -- we did this not just to streamline the process. If we ever want to build that warehouse, we have to come back through the same process, okay? And if we didn't hire local people, if we didn't use local contractors, if we aren't a good member of the community, we're going to be turned down.

But if we do all the things, if we walk the talk, I don't think any warehouse approval, if we ever even want to build one, is going to be a problem, because we would have been that community partner that not necessarily all the businesses that have come to Riviera Beach have been.

So, you know, I believe we walk the talk, and I don't have any trouble standing up here in five years, if in five years I want to build a warehouse,

Page 36

Environmental Protection statewide since 2006. We had the environmental forensics contract from -- it was a ten year term contract from 2006 to 2016.

I have testified before many cities to assess facilities such as this, not just bleach, dry cleaning plants, petroleum service stations, all sorts of properties with potential environmental risks to determine the potential impacts to soil and ground water and to human health and the environment.

I'd like to present a summary of the report. I've prepared a PowerPoint presentation I'm about to show you, which is a summary of the 35 page technical document that is in the public record.

I want everybody to know that I have no financial interest in the outcome. I have never worked for Odyssey in the past, and this January 20th report is the first document presented to Odyssey Manufacturing.

As shown in previous slides, we've already seen a view of the subject property, and I believe the subject property has been adequately identified, so I'll skip over this slide.

The purpose of the environmental assessment that I conducted, with assistance from my staff, was to assess the potential environmental risks to residents

9 (Pages 33 to 36)

and property in the site vicinity that could result from Odyssey's proposed bleach distribution facility at the subject property.

The scope of our assessment was to review the sodium hypochlorite distribution operations, review the project and regulatory documents, and assess Odyssey's Tampa bleach distribution facility.

It's my understanding that a number of citizens and a few Board members, I believe, went to view the Tampa distribution facility. I also viewed the same facility and also visited the subject property, presenting the results of those site investigations here.

So this is a view of the existing Tampa facility, and I've reviewed the engineering plans and the drawings. These are nearly identical operations. The proposed operation is the identical operation. I say nearly because there's just different -- differences between the two. For all intents and purposes, these are identical operations.

And I would like to make it really, really clear that the emphasis on this proposal, this site is for distribution purposes only. There will never be any manufacturing of sodium hypochlorite on the subject property. That's a very important point. Chlorine gas

Page 39

this represents an economic benefit to the community. It will create jobs and other economic benefits.

Many of you have been to the subject property. This is a view of the tracks on the subject property where the bleach will be delivered to the site by rail.

This is the Tampa facility. This facility I inspected on January 17th. This picture is less than one month old. You can note -- we don't have a pointer, do we? All right.

I was unaware when I visited the plant that the bleach was being unloaded from -- that it was being unloaded at the time. When I approached, I heard no noise, heard no sound, smelled no odors.

These tanks are very, very, very well constructed. If you'll note, the release, the fill and release ports on the top of the tank. This hose is rated for 200 pounds per square inch. I'll show you a diagram in a few slides that the pounds per square inch of the product going through the hose is 30, and it's rated for 200.

In the previous slide, this area here is where the fill port is that is in the photo to the left. I'd like for you to note the clamps on the hose and that it's very threaded. It's a threaded, heavy

Page 38

will never be manufactured on, delivered to, stored on, handled by or distributed from the subject property based on the proposed operations. This proposed facility is exclusively for bleach distribution.

In the field of environmental assessment, the things that we look for are storage, handling and disposal. There's three key words when you approach an environmental assessment when a chemical is involved. How is that chemical stored, how is that chemical handled, and how is that chemical disposed of.

This facility will not dispose of any bleach on the subject property. I will go through and explain to you how the facility will store the bleach, and I'll also go through and present how the facility will handle it so that you can get a full picture from beginning to end how bleach will be delivered to the site and how the bleach is stored at the site and then distributed from the site to local facilities, such as wastewater treatment plants, drinking water facilities, pool stores and other legitimate uses and beneficial uses for the community.

It is my opinion, after reviewing all of this information, that there are no significant environmental risks. Any potential environmental risk is de minimis, meaning insignificant. And in my view,

Page 40

duty industrial grade hose. The connection is so secure, both on top, and you can follow the hose down to the side at the base to show where the bleach loads into the piping which feeds the storage tanks.

It's extremely secure. The facility uses telemetry. The telemetry or monitors, computer programming completely monitors the operation. If you notice by the mouse cursor, you see emergency stop switches. The emergency stop switches are there in the event of an unexpected hose -- which is extremely unlikely -- rupture, because the hose is rated for 200 pounds per square inch, and 30 pounds per square inch is flowing through the hose. Those are safety precautions.

And in the report, I document that the flow rate is approximately 150 gallons per minute. There are workers nearby. If any sort of spill should occur -- a very unlikely scenario -- the emergency switch is right there, and they would be able to stop all flow. Worst case type of spill in the event of a hose rupture is approximately 100 gallons, 200 gallons, something along those lines. That's a de minimis, small, insignificant spill.

So the tanks are -- I'll give you a view of the lighting in front of the tanks. The entire

10 (Pages 37 to 40)

property is very well lit. There's tank venting on the tops. Security lights.

1.5

1 8

Please note the containment area surrounding the tanks. There's a four feet high wall completely surrounding the tanks. If the tanks were to rupture, the bleach would be contained within the inside of the tank

And also, finally, note the secure tank foundation, concrete reinforced steel pad that the tanks are resting on. It's a very well designed, very well constructed facility.

Inside the containment, these photographs show the sump, which is the containment slopes down and leads to the sump. In the event of a spill inside the containment area, the pump would pump any storm water out into a wastewater tank. If there was a discharge of bleach, it would pump the water back through the blue filter there on the photo to the left, and it would be pumped back into the tanks. And please note the multiple telemetry stations and stop switches on this side of the compound as well.

When I was on the site, I observed a loader tanker approach, connect the hoses and program the unloading. It's hard to see, but there's a green hose in the picture connected to the truck, and there's also

Page 43

Page 44

and did not detect odors until I was within about ten feet of the pumping/loading operation. I did detect very, very faint odors that dissipated immediately. They did not last for more than a few seconds. As far as the sound, the sound of the truck engine drowned out any noise at all associated with the pumping and the loading facility. So from a noise and odor standpoint, it's my opinion that there will be no issues at all with regard to noise or odors associated with the operation.

The facility has on-site monitoring with these computers. That's what is available under the screen at the telemetry photos I showed you before. They show the tanks; they'll show each tank, its loading capacity.

In this slide right here, this tank right here where the mouse cursor is, that's the tank that is currently being loaded. It's an 11 percent bleach solution that's tracked in here, and it's actively loading currently at 75 percent capacity at the time I took the photo. This you can't read, but that's 30 pounds per square inch. That shows the rating, the pressure on the hose.

These photos are just to show -- just a few more. I didn't want to put too many slides in the

Page 42

a blue hose. The green hose is precautionary only and is a good example of the types of precautions in the design. In the event of an overfill of the truck, that green hose is there to capture that drainage in the event of an overfill.

Here you'll see the driver in the photo to the right loading the computer, setting it for a 5,000 gallon load. And the tanker capacity is 5,400 gallons.

So I just want to reiterate a little more about the security and the containment. Another thing that we look at in environmental consulting and risk management is if a discharge should occur, how is it contained. Inside the tanks I showed you a four feet high wall surrounding the tanks. And outside in the loading area, you note there's a second sump pump outside the wall. That is for any spills that could occur during these loading operations.

The concrete is sloped from the truck down to the sump, and again, any storm water from rain would be pumped into the white tank behind it. Any bleach that should spill there would be pumped and disposed of, pumped and filtered through and disposed back, put back into the tanks.

With regard to any potential concerns over noise or odor, I walked through the entire operation

presentation, but the off-site and on-site, the two

photos on the left are more photos on-site.

The wastewater tank that I discussed here is -- that's on the subject property. That's at the

Tampa site, but that will be on the subject property. And then there's an eyewash station here in the event of any splash to eyes to a worker. And then these are the Tampa operations where everything is being monitored at the Tampa facility.

On the subject property, which I visited on January 18, the orange stake represents the northwest corner of the proposed containment area looking northwest toward the Stonybrook Apartments. And I just wanted to note the distance from that stake to the corner of the building is 358 feet, which is more than a football field. It's a significant distance away. The photo on the right is the existing Stonybrook Apartments, with a concrete batch plant on the adjacent property.

These photos appear nice and clearly on the screen. I don't know if I can brighten them up at all in the projector, so it's difficult for you to see what's the intent of these slides. On the right back here, this is the Tampa facility. Those are the tanks, taken from 805 feet away from the tanks, which is the

11 (Pages 41 to 44)

distance measured from that stake to Martin Luther King. So when I was on the property, I had a measuring wheel, and I measured 805 feet. That's the distance, and that's the tanks would be very, very inconspicuous from the road.

The tree cluster here is approximately where that stake is located. That tree would be inside the proposed containment area. This is a photo from 350 feet away. And this is a photo of the Tampa site from approximately 150 feet away.

The conclusions are outlined in the study.

There's an executive summary page which makes for a quick review of the findings. But the facility operations are limited to the distribution only of liquid bleach. Sodium hypochlorite will be the only chemical stored and handled on the subject property. There will be no manufacturing on the site.

My understanding is that the City has had some concerns in the past over chlorine gas. There will be no chlorine gas generated, stored or delivered to the site. And there's a big distinction between liquid bleach and chlorine gas. They're just not comparable. One is a deadly gas.

And liquid bleach is nonflammable. Really, the only reason that it's considered to be a hazardous

Page 47

not part of the study. But there's no concern with regard to corrosion. They're made out of fiberglass. So it's my opinion that the tanks themselves are not considered a risk.

MR. WHIGHAM: Now I have another, one more question. I read in the report that in the event of a hurricane, what you will be doing as far as putting water in the tanks, you know, with the --

MR. HILFIKER: Yes, sir.

MR. WHIGHAM: -- bleach that's left. But now, to what extent -- there's no precautions for tornadoes, and we are known to have tornadoes in this area. We just had one a couple of weeks ago. No one expected it. Now, acts of God we can't prevent. You know it and I know it. But are these tanks capable of winds, high winds or tornadoes? Could they withstand some of that pressure?

MR. HILFIKER: Yes, sir. I reviewed the codes for the proposed tanks, and I believe it was 170 miles per hour. Now, a tornado can exceed that.

I'd like to call your attention to page two of the report, the very last paragraph: Procedures, controls, equipment, training and policies are in place for risk management and the prevention of accidents.

Here's the important sentence that applies to

Page 46

substance is because it's an eye irritant, it corrodes the skin or it can burn the skin, and because of the corrosive type features that it has. That's why it's characterized as a hazardous substance.

Odyssey's proposed use is not considered to represent a significant environmental risk to the surrounding areas based on the proposed site operations, proposed on-site chemicals and proposed site design. Any potential risks, such as property or exposure impact from spills, are considered to be unlikely and de minimis, insignificant.

So I would be happy to take any questions associated with the study or the proposed operation. Thank you.

CHAIR JAMES: Thank you, Mr. Hilfiker. That was very informative.

Are there any questions from the Board?
MR. WHIGHAM: Yes, I have one or two
questions. Now, these tanks, you explained how they're
going to be made, what they're made out of, but what is
the age generally of these tanks, five, 15 years, 20
years or what?

MR. HILFIKER: These tanks are constructed of fiberglass. They are -- I would have to check the engineering drawings to see their life span. That was

Page 48

your question: Unlikely catastrophic scenarios, such as fire, severe weather -- meaning tornadoes -- airplane crashes and train wrecks have been considered. In the event of a worst case scenario, exposure to neighbors via vapors, direct contact, surface water or drinking water is considered unlikely. The product is a nonflammable liquid and may impact soil and groundwater in a worst case scenario, but is not considered to be a vapor or exposure risk. No combustible materials were observed in the vicinity of the tanks or the loading areas at the Tampa facility, and none are planned for the proposed operation.

Let's say lightning strikes one of the cars before it starts to unload. That is an extremely unlikely scenario, first of all, but in the event that it does and you have a 5,000 gallon discharge, this is bleach. It's not chlorine gas. It's liquid bleach. It's what is used to treat impacted drinking water. It's the same product that was used to assist the City of Riviera Beach to assist in restoring the drinking water quality regarding the chloroform issue.

It is not going to be a fire hazard. It's nonflammable. So if lightning were to strike, nothing would happen. If lightning were to strike the tanks or if an airplane was to crash into the tanks, the

12 (Pages 45 to 48)

1

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

containment system is designed to contain the product from the tanks in that containment vessel. It's engineered to contain the product.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21 22

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

1.5

16

17

1 8

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

come here.

So I carefully considered that, and it's my opinion that that should not represent a concern to the City of Riviera Beach.

You had had a question earlier --

MR. WHIGHAM: Thank you very much. I appreciate that.

MR. HILFIKER: You're welcome. And sir, you had a question earlier about the Department of Environmental Protection. Florida Administrative Code 62-761 -- I'm sorry -- 762 is the Administrative Code, Florida law that regulates storage tanks. These tanks are exempt from that regulation. They do not -- they are not concerned about liquid bleach. That should tell you something.

MR. WHIGHAM: Thanks very much.

CHAIR JAMES: Any other questions from the Board at this time?

MS. SHEPHERD: Yes, Madam Chair.

Mr. Hilfiker, good evening.

23 MR. HILFIKER: Good evening.

24 MS. SHEPHERD: May I ask one question as we 25 go back? I think I heard you say we're not paid to

Page 51

was just -- let me finish, let me finish my thought.

2 There was just a storm, I think in Georgia, somewhere 3

in that area, and the big tank trucks up in the air,

and they blew around like little cars. And you're

trying to make us believe, we as Christians -- I'm

Christian. I don't know about nobody else, but I believe there's a Master up there that will otherwise

say different from you.

You say that it will not contaminate our water. Right now our water is contaminated. With those trucks going in the air and coming down, we don't know where the trucks will -- I'm just putting it out there. I want to be safe for the residents, the citizens of this city. We have already been through so much. I'm going to leave that, because I want to hear from the public.

Thank you, Madam Chair.

CHAIR JAMES: Do you just want to go ahead and state something to that, Mr. Hilfiker?

MR. HILFIKER: Yes. Yes, I do not believe that I stated that the cars would move around. I indicated that if it was struck by lightning and there was a discharge from the cars and 5,000 gallons were to be released, that would be a -- there would be a discharge to the soil and groundwater. There would be

Page 50

MR. HILFIKER: No, no, I did not say that. I was authorized to conduct this investigation under contract by Odyssey, but I have no financial interest in the outcome. I have been paid for my professional services to render a third party opinion. I have no connection to Odyssey in terms of -- basically, I was paid to do this report, and the ultimate outcome, the vote, there's no compensation associated with the outcome.

So it's a third party review that was completed. Obviously, I would not provide my services to prepare a 35 page technical report for free. The applicant was asked to provide a report, they researched and identified our firm to conduct a -- we submitted a proposal to conduct a third party investigation. This is -- the 35 page technical report is the result; submitted an invoice for that and was paid. That's the extent of the relationship.

MS. SHEPHERD: Madam Chair, may I ask another question?

CHAIR JAMES: Go ahead.

MS. SHEPHERD: You just said that the tanks will not, I guess, move on the track during a storm or -- that's not true. Sir. that's not true. There

Page 52

soil and groundwater impacts. But the product itself is the same product used to treat impacted water and disinfect water, wastewater treatment facilities.

Florida Administrative Code 62-780 is called Contamination Cleanup Criteria, and a discharge of over 100 gallons of the product would need to be reported.

My comments in the report address this. It is not a significant risk to neighbors. There's no -it's not a gas. This is a liquid. This is not a chlorine gas that's going to create the need for an emergency evacuation like what occurred years ago here.

Not sure if I answered all your questions, but I don't believe that I mentioned that the tanks would move off the rail. In a tornado, they could be blown off the tracks.

CHAIR JAMES: Thank you.

MR. HILFIKER: My point is that it's -- a discharge would be not a risk to the neighbors, surrounding areas or the -- the only property that would be impacted is that property where the discharge occurred. And when a discharge occurs, the response is to basically pour water on it to neutralize it with sodium bisulfate. So the main point is that it's not a

CHAIR JAMES: Thank you.

13 (Pages 49 to 52)

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

2

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

Are there any other comments from the Board at this time? Thank you for that.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

We're going to move directly into public comments. And before I start with the public comments, I'm just going to read the blurb on the back of the comment card, because I want us to have a productive meeting. I understand that some of you here, this is a highly emotional issue, but we still want to remain calm and courteous to everyone who is here.

So any person making impertinent or slanderous remarks or acting in such a way as to disrupt the orderly flow of the meeting shall be barred from participation at that meeting. The Chairperson may advise that person to cease his or her discussion or may order him or her removed from the Council chambers.

So I'm asking you to please abide by the time clock and be courteous to everyone here. Board members included. That goes for us as well. And with that being said, first person up -- did you have a comment, staff?

MR. GAGNON: Yes, Madam Chair. I did receive one written correspondence with comments on the project, so I was hoping to be able to read that prior to initiating public comments.

Page 55

CHAIR JAMES: Thank you.

Okay, the first person we'll have up is

Leddyon Weathersbee. Please remember to state your name and address, please.

MS. WEATHERSBEE: Good evening. My name is Leddyon Weathersbee. It's spelled L-e-d-d-y-o-n. The last name is W-e-a-t-h-e-r-s-b-e-e. And my residence is 5117 Pat Place in West Palm Beach, 33407.

Okay, it's all new to me. I just wanted to make a comment to the Board. My name is Leddyon Weathersbee, which I already spoke. I had an opportunity to visit the site of Odyssey Manufacture's facility in Tampa, Florida on January 27th, 2017.

I was able to observe the existing operation site, the same type of operation that Odyssey proposed to develop and operate at the rail yard in Riviera Beach, located between Stonybrook Apartments and the Tropical Shipping warehouse located on Dr. Martin Luther King Boulevard.

I asked several questions of Patrick Allman, which is the general manager, and Attorney Michael Brown, for example, safety of the residents of Riviera Beach and the surrounding areas, because I receive the water from the City of Riviera Beach.

And which -- and another question I asked:

Page 54

CHAIR JAMES: Go right ahead.

MR. GAGNON: I did receive a phone call yesterday from Mr. Earl Davis, who's the author of this letter as well. He was unable to make tonight's meeting. However, I was provided this document, and he asked that it be read into the record. It's regarding the Odyssey bleach facility.

Dear Ladies and Gentlemen, I have received a number of phone calls from residents about the Odyssey facility. When I arrived to take a look at the facility, I noticed that there were homes in the area. Also from my observations, the facility was clean.

Standing between the railcars as chlorine was unloaded, I did not detect any noise, leaks or odor coming from the facility. Further, I met with multiple employees, and they spoke very highly of the facility. In complement, the pay scale accommodates the work that was being performed.

Therefore, based on my tour of the facility, all of the negative statements that were brought to my attention regarding the facility were false. I support the project, and there is nothing that agrees with the many complaints that I have received.

It's signed: Sincerely, Earl Davis, Resident.

Page 56

Why did you choose the City of Riviera Beach for your 1

business location? And I also asked about employment

3 opportunities for local residents will create, what

4 they stated, you know, will create well paying jobs.

5 And also wanted to know if you would use local vendors

6 in the beginning development phase and the daily 7 operation of your business. And I was extremely

pleased with the answer.

I believe in check facts and witness the operation of the business and speaking with employees applicable, if it is. Now that I personally observed the proposed operation and asked several questions of Patrick Allman and Attorney Michael Brown and Odyssey employees at the Tampa site, I want the Board and the residents of the City of Riviera Beach to know that I fully support their project. At this time, you know, thank you for listening to me. That's it.

CHAIR JAMES: Thank you, Ms. Weathersbee, and thank you for staying within time.

MS. WEATHERSBEE: I'm sorry, this is new to me, but I did -- if I can say it again, I do receive water from the City of Riviera Beach. Thank you.

CHAIR JAMES: Thank you.

24 Okay, next we're going to have Eddie Strick. 25

MR. STRICK: Hello. My name is Eddie Strick,

14 (Pages 53 to 56)

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

and I live at 3516 Whitehall Drive, West Palm Beach.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12 13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

And the reason that I'm here tonight is a friend in Riviera Beach told me about this, and I know, as an environmental activist, that this City has faced more than its share of environmental problems, power plants, incinerators, many Superfund sites for its size.

My concern, and I don't know that much about bleach, but two people here told me that there's the potential for bleach to turn into, at least a percentage of it, seven percent, under conditions when it gets very hot, could create chlorine gas. So that would be a concern, and I would definitely investigate that, can it potentially become chlorine, which is a deadly toxin.

Number two, with the amount of traffic, with rail traffic and trucks, we're talking about a huge amount of bleach. The potential for an accident, it's not when -- it's not if there could be an accident. it's when there will be an accident. This City already has a water supply that's been tainted over the years, and this could only add to it.

And the fact that people live so close to it, that's a huge concern, because natural disasters or whatnot, anything could happen, and if anything happens Page 59

This is disgracing the name of Martin Luther King, putting a chlorine plant on his street. Let's put something decent here. Let's get some better jobs. Let's get some other jobs. We don't have to have their jobs. Keep it in Tampa.

And railroad tracks is a form of environmental racism. They always put the railroad tracks in black people's neighborhoods and black people's yards so we can get the diesel from the engines and locomotives. This guy said it don't make noise? Trains don't make noise? Whistles, horns. Are we kidding? Are they quiet? It's a joke for him to come in here and disrespect us and a lot of us like that.

Those pictures, you couldn't even see them. An iPhone takes much better pictures than that. It's a disgrace to come in here and lie to us. It didn't show the scale of the height of the eyesores that will be in our back yards. I bet he wouldn't put it in his back yard. If his children lived in Stonybrook, he wouldn't allow it, he wouldn't want it. He wouldn't come in here for that. It's ridiculous. It's disgraceful for us to do that.

Jobs are going to be lost if you allow them to be here, and I think it's -- I suspect it's going to

Page 58

to these tanks, this City could be in huge trouble.

CHAIR JAMES: Thank you, Mr. Strick.

William McCray.

MR. McCRAY: William McCray.

You know, I said it before, I'll say it again: We're getting tired of being sold out. Black people are tired of being sold out by other blacks. It's just a disgrace.

Phase one is just to get their toe in the door. This is a clear case of environmental racism. You want to put incinerators, you want to put garbage dumps, you want to put recycling plants; now you want to put chlorine plants in the City of Riviera Beach. It's ridiculous. It's a danger.

And this guy was talking about a perfect world where nothing is going to happen, where like accidents don't happen. We also have to worry about terrorism. And he says if a plane crashed into it, nothing would happen. Well, he didn't tell you about chemical reactions that liquid chlorine can have if somebody dropped the wrong thing in there, not a very large amount, and it will create gas, and it will kill a lot of people. It's happened before, and it can happen again.

Page 60

be some of the elected officials. If they're dumb enough to pass it, they will go. I'm going to help them. Elected officials are going to help. We're going to have a grass roots movement in here. Heads will roll. Trust me when I tell you that. We're not going to tolerate this anymore.

Bleach, it is chlorine, and it's much more concentrated than a bleach that you buy out of the store. Don't let them fool you. And this gentleman came in here and said that we can't take a shower or you can't drink water without it. Europe is much more advanced than us. They use reverse osmosis. They don't even allow bleach in Europe anymore.

We need to invest in a capital project in this city so that we can have clean drinking water, so that we don't have Flint, Michigans where our most vulnerable and -- people are discriminated against by this kind of conduct in black neighborhoods where they don't care about us.

We're tried of it; we're sick of it. We're hoping you do the right thing. If you don't, the elected officials, if they don't, they're going to pay for it. We're not going to tolerate it anymore.

But this is ridiculous. If a terrorist goes in there and adds a chemical to the bleach and it boils

15 (Pages 57 to 60)

over, it becomes a gas, we're going to be in trouble.

People are going to die. You're going to be responsible. Those deaths will be on your hands.

Let them keep it in Tampa. We don't want it

here. The citizens don't want it. Don't bend, don't fold, don't let the City Attorney bully you into bending and fussing at you. It's ridiculous, DeGraffenreidt coming in here and yelling at you it'll be settled in court. Let them settle it in court. Let us fight them in court. We don't want it here.

CHAIR JAMES: Thank you, Mr. McCray. Elizabeth Pertee Robinson.

MS. ROBINSON: Good evening. Elizabeth Robinson. How did I know I'd come after that?

Let me say passionately I too am concerned about my city. I'm concerned about the power that we lack to use; we have and we lack usage of it.

I went to Tampa out of curiosity to find out exactly what folks were talking about. The information that was shared in the slides was accurate. Those of you who know me know that I don't make a habit of lying to you. I don't even consider lying to be something that you do, because it's not necessary when the facts are there.

We had lunch in the area where the bleach was

Page 63

out; then say good-bye, thank you for playing, but we don't want to play anymore. The experience that I had in Tampa would not lead to that. The experience that I had in Tampa would say let's hurry and get that factory here; let's hurry and get more jobs here, because people are waiting for it. You have the power to make that happen.

It's our time. That hokey-dokey kind of voodoo wisdom that people spout about it's going to kill you, it's going to do this, you asked for a third party to come in and tell you the particulars. They did that. They came in and told you what the facts were. You can either accept the facts or you can continue to say: But no, that's not the truth, it's going to blow up. Be real. We all use bleach in our homes; we all use bleach in our homes.

I said to a friend of mine I had a bad experience with bleach where it splashed into my eye. So the question was, well, if it spills, they're going, the vapors are going to kill them. Really? Really? The wind would take the vapors away if there were any vapors from the bleach.

It's our time, and I would say to you use the documents that you have. Take the opportunity to read it and make a decision on your own. Don't let people

Page 62

being loaded to a container. It is true, I did not hear it, nor did I smell it. And I would have said something had I smelled it. I did not know it was even happening. I had the opportunity to speak with some of the employees. They were very pleased with the company, and the salaries were great that I felt.

I think this is a great opportunity for our residents. I think it's time for us to take control of the power that we do have. The applicant has said very clearly if I'm not that partner that I say that I am, then kick me out. You have that power. That's the discretion that you have, or at least our Council people have. You can make a decision that will help our city get rid of this blight that we have.

We have young people who are desperate for work. Some people may not be concerned about employment. Well, there are others who are. Because of bad choices that people have made, possibly they are unable to get jobs. This company offers an opportunity to people who have those special circumstances in their lives. They have families that they want to feed. They have opportunities and careers that they want to pursue. This company offers that opportunity.

I support the idea of taking control of your power. If it's not what it says it is, then kick him

Page 64

bully you into doing what you do. And I think you're
 doing a great job, and thank you for serving us,
 because you are great volunteers.

CHAIR JAMES: Thank you, Ms. Robinson. Earnestine Gorden.

MS. GORDEN: My name is Earnestine Gorden. I live in Riviera Beach.

I'm contesting the bleach for the plant. The reason why I am contesting it is because it's right in the middle, in the center of all the schools. That railroad, the railroad that they have to go right behind one of the schools there, if they have an accident, those kids won't even stand a chance. And I don't care what nobody say, man is not perfect. Man don't make nothing perfect. Things can happen, and you don't sit up there and think things won't happen. It will.

I went out and I got almost 300 signatures from the different communities, different parts of Riviera Beach. Every last one of them said they do not want it, and I'm not joking to you. Over 300 signatures that I have here, and all these people is on the same page. They say they don't want it. They live here in Riviera Beach. They can't afford to buy a house nowhere else, and why don't they respect us? We

16 (Pages 61 to 64)

Page 65

pay our taxes. Why can't we be heard and live happy and be healthy in our area where we live? Thank you.

CHAIR JAMES: Thank you, Ms. Gorden.

Dorothy Danford.

N.

MS. DANFORD: Good evening. I'm Dorothy Danford, 1212 West 7th Street, Riviera Beach.

I lived in this city for over 70 years. I went to school here, I grew up here. There was one paved street in Riviera Beach when we moved here. Okay, I married here, I raised my children here, I am a property owner.

As the young lady said, we do use bleach in our home. But she was talking about things that could happen. You mix bleach with ammonia, and we all know what it will do.

My problem is today it's the same as the first time I heard and spoke about this. It's the brown and black children that live near this. They are susceptible to getting sick with asthma. Kicking these people out five years down the road would not bring the children's health back. Thank you.

CHAIR JAMES: Thank you, Ms. Danford.

23 Carmen Wildgoose.

MS. WILDGOOSE: Good evening.

25 CHAIR JAMES: Good evening.

supply if there's some type of an accident.

It seems like just recently I heard about an area where there was an unexpected sinkhole, and that sinkhole filled up with all kinds of radioactive materials, and that went into the water supply. And the people that are in that area are more severely

affected now than they ever were.

We live in a world where there's lots of water pollution, but now it seems that in order to correct the pollution, they want to bring in more chemicals. And we happen to be trapped between the two railroad tracks, and so now we have to give up our quality of life or our living space to accommodate this other industry where we have to bring in one chemical to try to remedy the bad that other chemicals have caused.

So I'm asking that you not give them the special exception or that we do not have this plant put in our area and our neighborhoods. Thank you.

CHAIR JAMES: Thank you, Ms. Wildgoose.

Dosha Newbold.MS. NEWBOLD

MS. NEWBOLD: Good night. My name is Dosha

Newbold. I live at 825 West 6th Street.

I listened to everything that was s

I listened to everything that was said. I even got a copy of the report, and it answered a lot of

Page 66

MS. WILDGOOSE: Carmen Wildgoose, 821 Avenue

To the Planning Board, Council members, Mayor and others, I came out tonight as a resident of this area to voice my concerns about this project. It seems like our residential neighborhoods are being overtaken by industrial entities, and I feel like we are being squeezed out of our communities. I really like where my home is situated.

The project proposal admits that bleach is a hazardous chemical, and I'm talking about not household bleach, but utility use bleach. So there is a difference. And usually bleach is diluted with something.

But my concern is about poor air quality, water quality. If there is a leak and it gets into our soil, that will affect the quality of our soil in our neighborhoods, not to mention that we are in a position where there's a school. My house is about two blocks away from the proposed site. There's a school, there's a recreational center there. And so I'm really concerned about all of these three components.

The EPA recommended or said that there was no threat to the fauna or the plants in that area, but it does not address the quality of the air or the water

Page 68

questions that I had tonight. I live two streets and about six blocks up from this proposed site.

I find it offensive that people from West Palm Beach went to Tampa and enjoyed the trip of looking at this plant. I think the people that live in the area should have been the people to really go on that trip so they could see it for themselves. That's the first thing.

The second thing, it was brought to my attention that it's not flammable. I'm glad about that. The time of operation, I really appreciate the time.

I want to know if what has been said verbally is going to be put in a contract, especially the summary operations that the gentleman put up on the screen, if it is going to be something verbal or is this going to be in writing.

I'm an advocate for bringing jobs to Riviera
Beach, because we need them. And unfortunately, some
people have records, let's be honest, and they need the
job. Well, we have been told so many times, oh, we're
going to put this in your area and get the -- you know,
open jobs. But they're not for the residents of
Riviera Beach. People come from Royal Palm Beach and
working to Sysco and all the other places.

17 (Pages 65 to 68)

So I want to make sure that if what we're promised is put into writing, then we can go back to that and say, like the gentleman said, if he's going to be a man of his word with this company, put it in writing, not just stand here and tell us, oh, this is what we're going to do.

I'm teeter-tottering on this. I really didn't like -- I'm going to tell you what I didn't like. I don't like the visual of the tanks. I think they're too high. It makes it look very, very commercial.

And unfortunately, the other thing I didn't particularly care for is the fact that we have Stonybrook with low income people. That's 1555 8th Street. But then you have houses in the 1400 block from 1st to 8th Street. So it's in between residents. Unfortunately, Riviera Beach is known for this, allowing residential and this commercial industry to mix. I did read the report. I have the report here.

My other concern is the railroad traffic, because, you know, we can leave out of here tonight, and we'll stand out here 45 minutes trying to get across Blue Heron Boulevard. Where are the trains, and with the tracks, because those tracks run into -- all the way over to UPS. So is 8th Street, Martin Luther

Page 71

role of pastor and bishop of a local church that's just minutes away, if not just a few blocks.

I appreciate, Madam Chair, your line of questioning earlier. I don't understand that in the past there's always been some recommendation from the staff. There seems to have been some hesitation tonight or reservation as to why we didn't get that this time, so that concerns me.

As a minister and pastor of the city, I can tell you that the pastors that I have spoken to that are very close to the Dr. Martin Luther King area, we're all opposed to it.

I am very proud of the fact that our elected officials from the County and the State have gone on record, whether it's Bobby Powell, whether it's Al Jacquet or whether it is Mack Bernard, all three have gone on record opposing this project.

There's also concern -- or it's true, it's on Facebook. Go to their page and see it.

It also concerns me that when I speak to, as the pastor, as the management, when I speak to the management of Stonybrook, they didn't even know about it, number one. Number two, they've not signed on about it at all. Tropical, which is right next door on the other side, they're concerned about it. You have

Page 70

King, going to be blocked when they access the tracks, and how long are they going to be on the tracks? I don't want a traffic situation like we experience right here on Blue Heron Boulevard.

However, I did and I must say that I would appreciate if a Federal or State agency can confirm what the gentleman put out. His report was very explicit. I appreciate all of his concerns and the things that he put out, especially the fact that it's not chlorine gas. And I appreciate that.

But I want things in writing. I want to make sure we know about the traffic situation with these train tracks, and I think if we get that done, the residents will feel a little more comfortable. And I think the tanks need to be brought down. They're very high.

So with that being said, maybe we need to just work on this a little bit, and maybe we can accept this project if we do a little more work on this. Just a couple of more things need to be tweaked, and I think it may go over.

CHAIR JAMES: Thank you, Ms. Newbold.
Bishop Thomas Masters.
BISHOP MASTERS: Thank you, Madam Chair.

Bishop Thomas Masters. I'm speaking in the

Page 72

Federal Gardens, Harmony Heights right across the street. There has not been any kind of meeting with the people who live there.

It is baffling to me, Madam Chair, that in the same area they wanted to bring a warehouse and put the Police Department and we shut that down, they wanted to bring a junkyard in the same area, we shut that down -- and I call it that -- and now here we have this. And I call it, as many say, poison bleach. That's how I see it.

I don't care what they say, how they kind of paint this picture. You go hire your own expert and you pay him and you bring your own expert in. We know you can bring one expert in to say one thing, another one will say just the opposite. So I'm not impressed at all

I will join other clergy, I will join our residents, and we will stand tall and stand firm and say no bleach on my block, period. I'm willing to stand with the clergy of Riviera Beach, particularly in this area. I'm ashamed that we're even talking about this type of facility on Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard, next to schools, next to Stonybrook, next to homeowners. It is shameful. And I'm glad to be on the side with the people of the area. Let the people

18 (Pages 69 to 72)

1

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

3 CHAIR JAMES: Thank you, Bishop Masters.

Thank you, Madam Chair.

Wesley Shuler.

5 MR. SHULER: Thank you. Wesley Shuler, 1859 6

North Congress Avenue.

1

2

4

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

speak.

I do approve this project to go forward, because for one, I did go to the site. For two, I was by the tank. And for three, I did not smell anything.

And since that going over to Tampa, I did hire two people out of Stonybrooks with a record. Too many people is not hiring people out of Stonybrooks. Everybody's talking, but they're not doing no action. And for one, it's just ain't nobody trying to help nobody out of Stonybrooks for not trying to get no jobs. I own a landscaping company. I hired them because they are tired of people saying what they going to do and they don't do nothing.

Mr. Pat had the bus to put together for the people. Not only out of Palm Beach, but the people out of Stonybrooks went to the site itself and saw it for theyself too. So for people to say that they just out of West Palm Beach, it's not just only West Palm Beach. People out of Stonybrooks.

Mr. Pat is willing to hire people with a

Page 75

bring jobs, not (inaudible). He has promised to hire people from this city. Do you know what he -- he was put under pressure that he's going to rent trucks in this area. But you know what he did? He went to the company that he's going to rent the trucks from and inquired: Do you have any local people in your company? He said: Because I'm going to be a good citizen in Riviera Beach.

We talked to the people who are working for this company, and I think out of the ten years, only two quit out of all the people he hired.

Look, I know you're under pressure too. That is the City Council. People are afraid. And they're, you know -- well, fear can cause people to make decisions that are not good. But I'm hoping this, that the information that chlorine bleach is being used in people who have wells, in cities, counties all over this state, and therefore, this is not a -- bleach is not a threat to this community. Nobody's going to take a closed system and put ammonia in it.

Thank you, I -- listen, I'm very -- a go for this project because I think it's going to help the citizens of this city. Thank you.

> CHAIR JAMES: Thank you, Mr. Duncombe. Leonard Warrie.

Page 74

criminal record. Is nothing that -- I don't see nothing wrong with this. People are tired of saying what they going to do, but they not putting their actions together. This project, I don't see it being a hindrance; I don't see it being a burden. It just need to go through. Thank you.

CHAIR JAMES: Thank you, Mr. Shuler. Edward Foster. Is there an Edward Foster present?

Okay, moving on, Donald Duncombe.

MR. DUNCOMBE: Respect to the Board. Donald Duncombe, 1232 West 37th Street.

You know, I understand how people, given information that engender fear and discouragement can feel, and I think that's what's happening here. I visited the site. But you got to understand, Tropical, they operate there. The trains are there next to Stonybrook.

Every city is leaving or getting rid of this gas chlorine and going to bleach. It's stored already in this city to treat water, to treat the waste. And every city is going to it.

Now, look, it's a business plan that this company is going to make money if they put this up. But the thing is this: This gentleman has promised to Page 76

MS. WARRIE: Good afternoon. Give honor to my Lord and Savior Jesus Christ.

I had also went to Tampa, and while we were there, they filled up one of the trucks. We could not smell it. There was no odor at all. One of the tankers came in, filled up the silon (phonetic). We did not smell it. We were right there. It was a nice experience. It came through a neighborhood. It is not out in the woods; it's in a neighborhood.

We left there and then went to the plant. Now, the plant is in an area that is nothing but industry, and I could understand that. I don't have a problem with that. So when I went to the City and I asked them to pull all their paperwork on this plant, it showed me that they had decided not to do the warehouse, and that was good, because that part I was not for. I am for the other part.

That bleach is not going to hurt us. We have one right across in the parking lot, big old tank. When you get in your car tonight, go straight over there and you'll see a big old tank. That's what's cleaning our water from when we had that problem with the water. It is still cleaning it. We have a tank on the other side of that building that if the cars -- if the workers do not stop over it, they get that tank,

19 (Pages 73 to 76)

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

it's going to explode. And it's sitting on the ground. So we do have hazardous stuff in Riviera, but the bleach is not one.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21 22

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

I ask that you go ahead and approve it, and don't worry about being taken off a Board. You (inaudible) anyway. And if your Council the group that want to get you off, there's a group that will keep you on. So go ahead and do what has to be done. This is a project that needs to be done, and one way or another is going to be done.

And the City, they have gone through everything the City told them to do. And staff sat here today, stood here tonight and said they did it, they did it, they did it. How can you deny somebody who did everything you asked them to do? It is regulated for that. FDOT came. They did what DOT wanted. FP&L came. They did what FP&L wanted.

Now it's time for the City to do what we want, what they want, because if not, we're going to end up in court, because so far, they have done everything legally. So we're going to go into court, and you know what the verdict will be. Thank you.

23 CHAIR JAMES: Thank you, Ms. Warrie. 24 Next up, Jessie Gray. Jessie Gray.

25 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: I think she left. Page 79

But, you know, a lot of us are just scared about that. I mean we had a problem on Blue Heron Boulevard years back, you know, with the chemicals being poured out into the ground. So we just, we don't want anything like that happening again here. Thank

CHAIR JAMES: Thank you, Ms. Darville. Issac Searcy.

MR. SEARCY: Good evening. Issac Searcy, 2800 North Ocean Drive, Singer Island, Florida.

And I come before you too just to say I'm coming as a concerned citizen. And my interest was just in the tone of how the City was being represented and the tone of the discussion about the project. It's just that I would like for it to be that we're able to discuss it civilly and then come away -- put forth a good light insofar as Riviera Beach goes, even though we might not disagree or we come to the point where we just did agree to disagree.

So I would ask that we be mindful of that, because if this project doesn't come in, maybe there would be some other project to be here. And I mean there are other businesses that are looking to come to Riviera Beach, so we want to set an example that says, okay, we're welcoming, we'll discuss it and weigh all

Page 78

CHAIR JAMES: Ms. Gray. UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: She left.

CHAIR JAMES: Next we have Charlotte Darville.

MS. DARVILLE: Good evening. CHAIR JAMES: Good evening.

MS. DARVILLE: Charlotte Darville at 361 West 20th Street.

I've been here in the city now for, it's around 43, 44 years. This city, we've had our problems. I know when I first moved here it was a great city to live in, but gradually it went downhill, and we need something positive here. I think, you know, we're afraid from other happenings in different states where there's been leakage and whatnot, and we're concerned about that.

I don't live that far from Martin Luther King. And then with the school there, Tropical Shipping, Stonybrook, I can understand where it's a big concern. I mean it's all fine, great, you know, that they want to give jobs to people here in the city that really need them, and we need that. But like the other lady had said, we want that in writing. If they go forward with this, we want something in writing to that effect.

Page 80

the options.

But I think where the issue comes is that the information -- is what information people have. And I think they're concerned and they become emotional because of the fact that maybe they don't feel as though they're getting all the information that's necessary.

And I appreciate the gentleman that came, because let me share with you too, I too went to the site in Tampa. Now, I'll share with you, I went with some skepticism as to what it would maybe entail, but I wanted to go see for myself. Bible says study to show thyself approved, and that's what I would encourage everyone here that's generally concerned about it, is to go take a look at it for yourselves.

Now, what the people represented here who also went with me is that you did not smell when you were right there really close to those tanks. And what I was expecting, I thought it was going to be a plant, a big plant. It's a storage site. If anybody's familiar with like cotton gins or grain facilities or something like that, it's not a huge site. And it was odorless. They kept it immaculate. It was clean; it was a clean facility, and the people that were there were happy and satisfied employees.

20 (Pages 77 to 80)

And I would just say that with looking at a company, and that something's going to be done at that site at -- on Dr. Martin Luther King, to look at it and see what's the best suited, because you want to think long term as to how this -- how that industrial area, how -- what's going to take place 50 years from now, okay, that there's going to be something industrial there in that site.

So let's not just dismiss this company, okay, because of the fact that they're going to add something additional there industrial-wise, because there's nobody that's going to go in there and put anything residential, okay, because it is such -- because it is next to Tropical and Cemex.

And so I would say I was encouraged by what their operation is and everything that that gentleman laid out. And I would encourage people to get as much information as possible. But everything that that gentleman laid out and did that third party report was the truth. Thank you.

CHAIR JAMES: Thank you, Mr. Searcy. Donald Duncombe. He spoke already, I thought.

So okay, Marina Petrakos-Byrd.
MS. BRYD: Good evening.

Page 83

half a mile, you have to -- a half a mile radius of an accident with bleach, you have to have an evacuation plan in place, and there isn't one. So I was surprised to see that a safety study had been done and it did not include an evacuation plan. That's one thing.

Another thing is that the pollution from the tanker trucks alone coming in and out is a huge concern to the residents there, the children, the elderly, sick people, everybody. I mean the traffic alone is going to be -- going to have a great impact on the residents there. Nobody is talking about that -- at least some people are.

But the people who went and visited the site, the bleach site in Tampa and were so impressed, it might be a fantastic bleach facility. Put it somewhere else. Don't put it in the heart of residents, because the operation that involves the tanker trucks and the railcars, it's not a friendly environment for people to live next door to.

Nobody who owns and runs that bleach company is going to want their family members living next door to that plant, no matter how beautifully it works, because of those trucks and because of the railcars and because of potential accidents. Nobody can guarantee that there aren't accidents.

Page 82

rage oz

CHAIR JAMES: Good evening.
MS. BYRD: I live at 764 West 5th Street.

I have to say that I recognize that the people who visited the plant were very impressed with the very clean operation and that that made a great impact on them. And I have no doubt that as far as bleach companies go, that this is a good one.

I think that the concerns are that if there is an accident, that there is -- well, we spoke with an engineer who said that there is eventually the likelihood that there will be an accident with the tanker trucks. They're going to be leaving at 5:00 in the morning. It's dark. There is not a legal exit from that property going west. You have to go over to Avenue O in order to make a U-turn, a legal U-turn.

There's the potential for an accident there, whether it's a car accident or a train accident. At some point, there is the likelihood that at 5:00 in the morning there may be a tanker truck accident with the bleach, and if that happens, there is the potential for the bleach to heat up and give off chlorine gas.

There is no evacuation plan in place should this happen. The code for bleach is 1791. The 1791 code triggers an evacuation plan should something happen, should an accident happen. And within that Page 84

So -- and also the hours of operation for the Stonybrook residents, plus noise carries. Dinner time is interrupted, breakfast time is interrupted, sleep time is interrupted from eight, whatever the hours were that the operation of the trucks were allowed. It interrupts dinner time and breakfast time. So I couldn't understand that.

CHAIR JAMES: Thank you, Ms. Byrd.
MS. BYRD: I think it needs to be considered.
CHAIR JAMES: Thank you.
Andrew Byrd.

MR. BYRD: Good evening, Board.
CHAIR JAMES: Good evening.

MR. BYRD: My name is Andrew Byrd, 764 West 5th Street.

A couple things. The stenographer, I don't know who's taking the notes, but I read my notes from the first meeting, and what was written down was nothing like what I said. Just in general, the notes from the meeting I was in weren't being represented by what was written. So I don't know if that's Jeff's area or if there's a stenographer that works word for word or if -- I don't know how that works.

But I just made two points the last time, and that was we'll need an environmental study, and you

21 (Pages 81 to 84)

need a community impact study, and that's just because I have a planning background, and I was taught to think that way. I like the study the fellow did tonight, but as Marina was saying earlier, there's codes in Tallahassee you going to have to address if you accept this.

That Code 1791, if you allow one of those tanks to be there, with that code there's a user guide. It's called 154. If you get a chance to read that user guide, it'll specify all the other things associated with it that the City has to have to accommodate an accident for Code 1791. And if you look at those tanks, you'll see written on those tanks on all the photographs 1791. So that's the code.

Now, the one concern I have, and once again, as a planner, is that if there's a person willing to pay \$50 million for a site -- this is location theory -- there's always another person that's willing to pay twice that much for a site.

I just don't like the idea that that be a giant factory. It's bad enough for the cement company. But I personally, having grown up in Riviera Beach, don't like the idea, if they can make it as safe as possible, of a bleach company being smack in front of Stonybrook and right next to a (inaudible)

Page 87

tonight.

We have two attorneys. Their attorney and our City Attorney are saying different things, so we didn't get an answer, and that's not very comforting. The response was: Well, that will be settled in court. We don't want to go to court. We want to settle something here tonight. We want to know if this is a good plan, a not so good plan, if it fits in with our city. We don't want to go to court over this later.

I didn't see a letter from the Fire Department regarding this situation. You're not able to get a recommendation or a non-recommendation from the Community Development. That's also concerning.

The Odyssey people, they have given classes to the Riviera Beach Utility Department, our Water Utility Department on how to use the bleach, the ups and the downs to it. They had to be trained on that.

People are talking tonight about jobs. There aren't going to be any jobs. They mentioned 20. Well, 20 in phase one. They're not even going to monitor the facility from here. They're not even going to have one person to monitor the facility. They're going to do that in Tampa. These are not people who are hiring people.

All right, tonight you got another surprise.

Page 86

neighborhood.

When you look at the manual, it will state that if you had a truck fire, if there was a major truck, tanker truck pulling out -- and that's what the study didn't mention. We didn't see the environment where the other facility is located. People who live there saw it, but we didn't get this presentation.

But the way I understand it is big tanker trucks are going to carry bleach somewhere else. If there's going to be an accident, you have fire. You mix fire with bleach, that hypochlorite, that CL in there, that's from chlorine. That's what you going to get coming out.

Thank you very much.

CHAIR JAMES: Thank you, Mr. Byrd.

Bonnie Larson.

MS. LARSON: I'm Bonnie Larson. I didn't see a lot difference in the presentation tonight and how we saw it the other day.

But Mr. McCoy, you're exactly right. The reason it was tabled last time is because we didn't have an answer about that. You got a letter at 5:00 at the last meeting, and it said something about they didn't have to follow City codes. That was the reason. You wanted that answer tonight. We didn't get it

Page 88

They removed the warehouse portion. That was the bottling section, the chlorine bottling department they were going to do. All right, you asked why it was removed, and the answer was very telling. The answer was because it's easier to get it through. That seemed to be the sticking point last time, was that warehouse. So let's just take it out this time, we can move on.

You asked: Are you ever going to do it again? Well, no, we don't think so. Once they got it, they got it. They presented it to you in the first plan. They're just taking it out now so that it won't be a sticking point. It's going to come back. They said they don't think so. Well, you don't think so? Is that in writing that you're not going to do it?

They say that their plants in Florida are disappearing. Can't get it; can't get bleach in Florida. Wonder why the plants are disappearing. Oh, let's put it in Riviera Beach. They'll take us.

Oh, I read that this chlorine -- it has another name to it -- is subject to heat. This is Florida. We have 97 degrees here in the summer. At the first meeting they mentioned if we had a hurricane, not to worry, we'll take the plants and move -- or we'll take the tanks and move them. I didn't hear them talk about that tonight.

22 (Pages 85 to 88)

How do you move eight 40,000 gallons of bleach? How do you do that? When we have a hurricane, you don't know if it's going to hit here, going to hit in Miami, you don't know where it's going to go. They said last time they're going to move them in case of a hurricane. Where you going to move them to? They didn't mention that this time.

Oh, EPA, EPA. There was something on EPA last time that said about the fauna, it's not going to harm the fauna. We're concerned about our fauna, yes. We're more concerned about human lives here.

Another speaker said that the wind would take the vapors, not to worry; the winds can take vapors. That's right. The wind will take the vapors all over this city.

So don't be swayed by the warehouse, removing that. It's going to come back. They don't plan it today, but it's coming back. So keep that in mind. They're entitled to bring it back later, so keep that in mind when you think about this.

CHAIR JAMES: Thank you, Ms. Larson. Mary Brabham.

MS. BRABHAM: Did everybody on the Board get one of these? Mr. McCoy, did you get one of these?

VICE CHAIR McCOY: I'm not sure what it is.

Page 91

Page 92

two school in the country, all of those areas there, all that circle there, that encompasses. Even on the other side over here. Come on, people; come on, people.

1791. Look at your package there. Those pictures there as I go through this, the 1791. That's the trigger code. It stands for fire and evacuation. Every last one of these pictures here with these tall tanks here, and you see there's a (inaudible) here. Somebody come and pass this around. These tall tanks here.

When Elizabeth Robinson here, yes, they went up there. We don't care. This is our community, and we say no. This is a trigger code. Ms. Brabham didn't establish it. Read it. That's 1791. And read what it says on the back of it; read what it says on the back of it. Who was it established by?

Those high tanks have it and these semi trucks, tanks. These are semi trucks. Look at the pictures what I gave you. That's what will come through our neighborhoods. Not just on 8th Street, Australian, 13th Street; they doing it now. There's no regulation to put it in this City here. Can we take this chance here? No, no, we can't take this chance. We say no.

Page 90

MS. BRABHAM: Will you please give that to him, please?

I'm going to ask you to borrow two of these chairs here.

CHAIR JAMES: Speak into the microphone, Ms. Brabham.

MS. BRABHAM: Okay, before I get started, I need this to sit in a chair right here. I need two chairs right here, please, so that everybody can see this here.

Good evening. Ms. Mary Brabham, Riviera Beach.

Smell is useless when you're sick in bed. We don't care about the smell. We care about the impact. The zoning regulation code is silent. Maximum gallon, are you in compliance? If you exceed even one gallon, you will have to come back for a special exception.

Do not be deceived by the shakedown. These are shakedown people. St. Lucie County, they know it too. Read your package there.

Compatibility section, traffic stop, ingress and egress leads to illegal turns. All of that round circle there, besides Stonybrooks, the only way that they would get out is on a right turn. And O Avenue, there go Lincoln, the Head Start, Suncoast, the number

The railroad, it is only a two track rail, and those tracks are worn; those tracks are worn. Tri-Rail is going to come right in the back of Stonybrooks. We can't have this here. This is detrimental to our community, and shame on them for doing this.

I listen to this Board here about the law. I got it here. It doesn't state that your city is denigrated in approving anything. Those tracks reside in your city. They might belongs to Congress, but Congress can't tell you what to okay to put in your city. They can't do that.

So this is a shakedown that these people do. You got the package. They came over in Tampa on a bid, on a bid. They have a spiel. Read it. It's in there. I can't go through it all. Read it. It's in there.

Also, EPA, they was fined by EPA for \$29,596. They didn't tell you all that. It's in your package there.

They failed to do an impact study because it wasn't necessary. Chlolite (phonetic), the bleach company that was here, yes, it had chlorine. Read it; read it. And how much chlorine vaporized the air? That's why our children sick with asthma and immune system. And the schools that it impacted at that time

23 (Pages 89 to 92)

was Palm Beach SDA Bilingual School, Inlet Grove High School, Riviera Beach Maritime Academy, and that's not all. The other residents that live in our community, it's there; it's there.

1.5

This is a shakedown; this is a shakedown. When they talk about 5 a.m., 5 a.m., you best believe that they going to have that highway just like we see it. We got traffic, too much traffic there now. And they going to make their illegal turns; they going to make them. And those semi tank trucks, those pictures and that fire and stuff, that was just recently; that was just recently of those rigs. Those are the type of rigs.

And they house nothing but gallons of sodium chlorite. This is not no ordinary bleach. I'm tired of this hanky panky. This is high purity sodium hypochlorite. This is what this is here. World War II used it; World War I used it. And guess what? Ms. Brabham and others did their research. Iraq used it and made bombs.

Come on, you people. It's a lot of bull. I don't care where you went at. We know what's going on. If you got a hand in the deal, you take your hand and march on to the beat. But this is our city, and we say no; we say no. That's why you didn't get the impact

Page 95

MS. BRABHAM: Thank you.

CHAIR JAMES: We've actually concluded all of the comment cards we have for this item. There are other cards here that are marked for public comments. So if there's anyone else at this time whose name may be on one of these cards that wants to speak on this item, I'm going to call a name, and if that's you, you can come up to the podium.

Sarah Steiner.

MS. SHEPHERD: Madam Chair. CHAIR JAMES: Yes, Ms. Shepherd.

MS. SHEPHERD: May I ask a question? If they want to speak on public comment, can they come back, or is this just --

CHAIR JAMES: Well, I had mentioned earlier at the beginning of the meeting that there were cards that may have been marked incorrectly, so that's what I'm trying to go through now. So if I called your name and you spoke on the VI-A, and you want to speak again for a public comment, you will need to do a new card for public comments. Okay, so we're still on VI-A, okay?

MS. STEINER: Hi. I'm Sarah Echo Steiner. I live at 432 North D Street in Lake Worth.

And the reason I'm here is that a friend came

Page 94

studies. That's why you didn't get a lot of stuff.

And then the man wants to stand here, talk about the study that he done. These friends are theirs. I can pull out the list. We got the list. Michael, do your homework. We got the list. Ms. Brabham got it. Ms. Brabham got more than her share to share with this Board here to let you all know. We would object to paying for any such analysis. And this is highly unusual and certainly not customary for a (inaudible).

CHAIR JAMES: Thank you, Ms. Brabham. MS. BRABHAM: We got the trains. But these are semi tanks, truck tanks that will carry those gallons through our city. This called 1791 was not --look at the back of that; look at the back, what's written on there. And all of the tanks have this, including them high-rise tanks that could explode and (inaudible).

CHAIR JAMES: Thank you, Ms. Brabham.
MS. BRABHAM: Fire; fire and evacuation. How
we going to get out here? Each way is a half mile.
Sysco even in this here perimeter. Come on. The wind
blows; the wind blows from south to southeast at 9.7
miles per hour, and that's on a normal day.

CHAIR JAMES: Thank you, Ms. Brabham.

Page 96

to me and said that they're building a chlorine plant, a bleach plant in Palm Beach County. And I said:

a bleach plant in Palm Beach County. And I said: Really? A bleach plant? Well, yes, I'm telling you.

Really? A bleach plant? Well, yes, I'm telling you.
Where are we going to put this bleach plant? Is it

going to be over on, you know, Mar-a-Lago, Palm Beach?

No, no, he said, not Palm Beach. Jupiter Island? No,

no, not Jupiter Island. Wellington? No, no, not

Wellington. Riviera Beach.

Well, why would they want to build a bleach plant in Riviera Beach? I find it so disingenuous that they come into town and say that it's because of the railroad tracks being here, close to the railroad, close to the Port makes it easy access. We know why they're building the chlorine plant here and not in Palm Beach, because no one in Palm Beach would let that happen. No one in Palm Beach will let that on their island.

And I'm just appalled that a scientist would say to you this is the same bleach that is in your water, it's safe to drink. Well, you know what? I can drink one shot of tequila, it's not going to get me drunk. But if I drink that bottle, it sure will.

Disingenuous to say this is the same bleach that's in your house. There's a lot of things in my house that I don't want 32,000 gallons of in my back

24 (Pages 93 to 96)

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14 15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

yard. Also disingenuous.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21 22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

And we can talk about the fact that wind is going to carry it in other directions. That's exactly the problem, the containment.

And I think it's very disingenuous not to talk about the fact that chlorine gas is a by-product of heat hitting this bleach and not talking about the real facts of that being a real security issue. You are right on these tracks. I saw that fence. Any five year old can climb that fence. You've got a real security issue here.

A lot of -- I've got a 14 page report here from Green Peace all about bleach factories and what's happened. And the truth of the matter is that a lot of people are phasing these out, because after 9-11, they saw them as being a legitimate security threat, and nobody wanted them in their back yard. They didn't want this target.

And you're sitting up there, and you want jobs for your community. I get that. You need jobs for your community. They're offering you 20 jobs, possibly, if it works out, at a toxic plant. And that's what they think your citizens need.

You can build a strip club there and hire 20 people from your community. You could build a Family Page 99

lockdown because of spills, of gas clouds, because of fires. This is fact. You can look it up.

You also see the impact on the community, the health. And not only that, look at your real estate property. It goes down. This is not an investment. You're actually killing your neighborhood and you're killing the property value.

Not only that, the children, the health, environmental impact on the children in West Virginia and the amount of breathing difficulties they have is by far -- and the cancer rate is another thing. So take a look at these things before you allow this poison in your community. Thank you.

CHAIR JAMES: Thank you, Mr. Arevalo. Carol Strick.

MS. STRICK: Hello. My name is Carol Strick, and I live at 3516 Whitehall Drive in West Palm Beach. We're about ten minutes from here.

My first comment is people who went to the plant in Tampa and were impressed by the cleanliness and the lack of an odor, well, just try going over to the incinerator on 45th Street. It looks beautiful and there's no odor. But live in the cross fire between the incinerator and the expanded FP&L plant. When we open the door in the morning, whew, it stinks there.

Page 98

Dollar there and hire 20 people from your community. You could build a restaurant there and hire 20 people.

They are offering you chump change. They are playing you, and they are disingenuous about the reason for picking Riviera Beach. And you got to kick them out, because you've got to stand for yourself, because believe me, nobody else will.

CHAIR JAMES: Thank you, Ms. Steiner.

Nery Arevalo.

MR. AREVALO: Good evening.

CHAIR JAMES: Good evening.

MR. AREVALO: My name is Nery Arevalo. I also live at 342 (phonetic) D Street in Lake Worth.

I come to you because I'm very concerned about the children in your neighborhood. I have been involved in education for over 30 years in (inaudible), and mostly in very small communities that are surrounded by other communities with much more wealth. Well, I see you as a target, not only for the children

20 that are nearby on a chemical spill. 21 Here's my point, and that's why I'm here in 22 front of you. I am not from this area, but I have an 23 experience of living in a chemical valley, Charleston,

24 West Virginia, where a lot of this product is 25

manufactured. I have seen cities go down under

Page 100

And that's from those two poisons that were supposedly never going to have an odor. Well, there's a huge odor, and it's dangerous.

The next thing is the company mentioned something about the water. They said that their product is in the local water and West Palm Beach was one of the cities it included. Well, you know what? It's not working. Our water -- everybody in Whitehall, which is 360 apartments, buys their water, filters their water. Nobody drinks the City water from West Palm Beach, which we all consider polluted. So your water is not working in our area.

There are just so many things wrong here. This illusion and this constant mention of landscaping, that's what we heard all the time from the people who were putting the incinerator up. They said: Oh, when you go out there, it looks like some kind of a nirvana, trees, wild animals. That's not what it is at all. It's just an illusion to sucker people in to put this incinerator near where people live.

We asked them: Why are you putting it here? Why don't you put it 20 miles away? They said the reason was because they would have to spend too much gasoline on the trucks. In other words, the gasoline on the trucks is more important than our health.

25 (Pages 97 to 100)

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

And this is an age of pollution, and the less industrialism we have, the better. We're all being eaten up alive by this stuff and we have to stop it. Thank you.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

1.5

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

CHAIR JAMES: Thank you, Ms. Strick.

Going to move into Board comments, and I'm going ask the same thing of the Board that I asked of the public with the comments, that we be courteous.

So with that being said, I'm going to start with Ms. Shepherd.

MS. SHEPHERD: Thank you, Madam Chair.

I don't have any questions to ask. But the one thing I want to do is thank the community for allowing me to sit on the Planning and Zoning. And one thing I've heard over and over, I will not sit at the devil's table. And so with that, I thank the residents for coming out or sitting at my house and talking, and I want to let you know that I hear you loud and clear.

If my time is up to move off of Planning and Zoning, I'm willing. It's a volunteer situation. I have enjoyed my stay. But the one thing I want to say to the public is that I will not sit here and vote for this plant to be here in the City of Riviera Beach.

I thank the city for your love, your support, your respect of me, and I know that in the near future, Page 103

and put stuff on, special exceptions, and get those developments out of the area.

And I was hoping that this company -- I want them here because we want the tax dollars. I want this company to think about that, putting it out on where we got the section. And you can talk with the Planning and Zoning Board Administrator. They can tell you where it is, because I've forgotten the exact location.

But there are 89 acres out there, and there are some companies out there that we rejected from being in the city that are out there, and they're happy. So let's think about that. Move out there. We want you, but move out there. Don't put this in a neighborhood.

Still, I've mentioned this before, I'm a retired educator. I taught kids for 36 years. And there's the schools right around that area. I do not want to see one kid come down with an illness from an accident there that would happen on that street. That's a (inaudible).

There are going to be some accidents. You got a lot of careless people that live right here in Riviera Beach that drive like fools. Our Police Department know that. They'll hit one of those trucks out there (inaudible) in a minute. They might even run

Page 102

Page 104

that whatever become of me is because of you. And with that, I thank this Board, I thank the Chair, I thank all of you, and I thank you for coming out and supporting Planning and Zoning on tonight. Thank you.

CHAIR JAMES: Thank you, Ms. Shepherd. Mr. Whigham.

MR. WHIGHAM: Thank you, Madam Chair.

We know that any chemical is dangerous, hazardous and harmful if not properly handled. We know that. But we have heard so much from the people tonight opposing this site in a neighborhood.

After reviewing these papers that I picked up Friday of what the company is proposing and how they plan to set it up, they answered a lot of my questions. I had ten major questions I was going to ask, but they answered them on paper for me.

Yes, anything is hazardous, anything. But my main question is: Why put this, even though it's a beautiful facility, why put this facility in a neighborhood?

We have in Riviera Beach -- and I worked on that Board in 2010 when everybody was trying to get over there by Tropical, and we put up a plan to put out there by Dwyer Park and other areas out west, we set up an 89 acre industry plot out there for people to go out

into a freight car. So we got to factor all those things; we got to factor all those things.

Let's hope that the company would reconsider talking with the Planning and Zoning Board and moving this plant out west under a special exception that will be accepted, because right now it's not acceptable by the community, and I can see that tonight from the people that spoke.

> Thank you very much, Madam Chair. CHAIR JAMES: Thank you, Mr. Whigham. Mr. McCoy.

VICE CHAIR McCOY: Thank you, Madam Chair.

I have a few things. Number one, it was said a few times, and I want to kind of talk about the process and how we got here, our responsibility as Board members, because it was stated that we're getting chump change, and I want to clarify that.

We're not getting any change. Quite honestly, we're volunteers, and we spend countless hours not just here at the meetings, but reviewing this information. And just as enthusiastic as both sides of this issue is, I mean there's Boards that's available in this City that you should come out and apply and be a part of it.

But the gesture that we were on the take and

26 (Pages 101 to 104)

that we were receiving chump change is not just offensive, I thought it was downright inappropriate, because there's just, in fact, four of us up here today, so in the event that -- I think two members are out. We may lack a quorum. So, you know, I spend a lot of time leaving from my family to come here, and I just thought that that was the most -- I guess from the public's perception, maybe you didn't understand.

But to say that we were under pressure, I mean we're an advisory Board, and we make a recommendation to City Council. Prior to it arriving here, it came through by an application from the applicant, and it went to the staff level, and it was reviewed at the staff level and disseminated through the various departments. Then it's presented to the Planning and Zoning Board for information, for us to vet it out and see if it's consistent with our Land Use Regulations.

And quite honestly, it's been said probably over a half dozen times, "the jobs." Our role doesn't include factoring or even considering whether they bring jobs into our community. I will invite you to visit Municode. We're not even to make a recommendation about the jobs. That's something that's designated with the City Council.

Page 107

regulations.

And just out of curiosity, as being a member on the Planning and Zoning Board, I asked what was that exemption. And then I see Attorney -- our Assistant City Attorney was not familiar with it because it came in at the last moment. And I think it was not unreasonable to ask if we could get an opinion or a response. And that's where we left that off at in December.

So when I got here to the meeting, that's what I was expecting, because it sure wasn't in our packet. And I had inquired with our staff in the Planning and Zoning Board on two different occasions about a response regarding whether this was exempt from the City's code. So I certainly rely on all of that information, and I try to make a decision based off of the facts.

And certainly, I like jobs. I would like to see everybody have a job. But our role is not to consider whether or not they bring jobs.

So I think for the most part, I think all of the concerns that I've had, I, at least, you know, entertained and considered.

I know there was one thing I will ask Madam Chair that was brought up that I was really curious

Page 106

So I don't want the perception to be that we're receiving something in exchange or there may be some jobs coming down the pike that we're making our decision on, because at least for me, that's not, you know, why I'm here and some of the criteria I use. I want to judge the project solely on the merits and the criteria that's required for it to particularly be in our city.

And, you know, this Board is advisory. And if -- you know, that was almost a joke, to say that we might get removed. We don't even have enough members to participate in some of the meetings, so I doubt that that's even an option.

So, and one other point is this. What we rely on is the information that's provided in the packet -- and I think there's a binder out front -- as well as the public comments and the applicant. So you know, all of it is intertwined. And we, I guess we have to rely on information from various sources, and also, you know, we're allowed to do our own independent research.

And I will revisit this again, because it was mentioned two other times, about a request that the Planning and Zoning Board made. But specifically it was stated that this project was exempt from local

Page 108

about. It didn't get mentioned before, but there was something related to how this liquid bleach would be transformed into a gas, and I didn't know if that was possible. And I would ask just as a privilege if the third party environmentalist can respond to that, and then I will finalize my last portion of comments, Madam Chair

CHAIR JAMES: I will allow him to come to the podium and explain that.

MR. HILFIKER: Thank you. Any liquid will boil and turn to gas. The product is very stable. It has -- in my research, the beginning of the process of heating up and beginning to release would be at an average consistent temperature of 95 degrees. The Palm Beach County average annual temperature is 75 degrees. The temperature --

CHAIR JAMES: Let's remain courteous.

MR. HILFIKER: The tanks are ventilated, and the temperature will never approach consistently the temperature necessary to begin that process. It's 20 degrees off.

CHAIR JAMES: Does that answer your question, Mr. McCoy?

VICE CHAIR McCOY: It does, Madam Chair. CHAIR JAMES: Thank you.

27 (Pages 105 to 108)

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

25

VICE CHAIR McCOY: I also recognize, not just this meeting, but in our first meeting, this was unlike any other project that has come before Planning and Zoning where there was a recommendation by staff, and in this case there wasn't. And that gave me the impression that staff didn't approve it, because I only remember one time since 2012 that I've been on the Board that a project came to the Board and staff didn't approve it.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

And we were given a response or an explanation today that it was on us. So you know, I spent some time dealing with the issue. I would have liked to have a response to the legal opinion.

But those are my comments, Madam Chair, and then, you know, we can move forward.

CHAIR JAMES: Yes, I just have a couple of questions as well. I'm looking at the memo from Frank Stallworth, Fire Inspector, and he does not also give a recommendation. He says: The Fire Prevention Bureau has the following comments. They're just comments. So I don't know if these are recommendations for approval or they don't agree with what's proposed or what they've reviewed.

Jeff, Frank Stallworth is the Fire Inspector for Riviera Beach?

Page 111

1 provide again for your review the previous proposal 2 which does have the warehouse included in this area. 3 So this specific area was previously phase two. Being 4 that it's omitted from this proposal, what was phase 5 three in the development, which is the Cemex storage 6 area, that has now turned to phase two, being that 7 there's no longer three phases, there's just two 8 phases.

> As far as operations for this location, if you look on the current proposal, you can see the warehouse is no longer on the plan, however, this storage area still remains. So from the information I've been provided, it will be very similar to the existing facilities adjacent to this location. So Cemex has different aggregates, concrete, rocks, things of that nature. I haven't been provided specific details as far as loads or specific items, but it would just be similar to what is already adjacent to the property.

> CHAIR JAMES: Could you clarify the usage on that? Who's going to be -- who is going to be using that storage area? Is it going to be Cemex or Odyssey?

MR. GAGNON: The proposal currently states that it will be leasable area for Cemex.

CHAIR JAMES: Okay. Those are my questions.

Page 110

MR. GAGNON: Yes, ma'am. Even though the memo specifically doesn't say the word approve, in my previous review of any sort of comment memos, what this is from the Fire Department, it's approval with conditions. They mainly deal with the building plans themselves. So the eight items that are listed within the memo are requirements for the developer to meet prior to issuance of a building permit.

CHAIR JAMES: Okay. So that kind of explains some of these items on here about who this is referring to. I wasn't sure if it was the City or the applicant, but you're saying it's for the applicant, correct?

MR. GAGNON: Yes.

CHAIR JAMES: My other question is phase two is still proposed tonight. That is the future proposal for a material storage area for Cemex. If I could have staff explain to me how that is actually different from the previously requested 11,259 square foot refrigerated warehouse, because the previous application stated refrigerated warehouse, but this in proposed phase two is future materials storage area for Cemex. That's very generalized. So future material storage area, what is going to be stored there, how big is it, if you can answer that?

MR. GAGNON: Yes, if I may, Madam Chair,

Page 112

And so I think we need a motion. Is there a motion? MS. SHEPHERD: I move that the Planning and

Zoning deny the resolution to Odyssey, to deny them a bleach storage and distribution factory known by the, I guess, the PCN 56-43-42-32-43-001-0000, be denied application here in the City of Riviera Beach.

CHAIR JAMES: Is there a second? Is there a second?

VICE CHAIR McCOY: Madam Chair, I want to offer a substitute motion, but I don't want to second that one. So if it doesn't have a second, I would hope that we can move on, because hers was pretty exclusive, and I don't want to commit to that one, so --

CHAIR JAMES: Being that there is no second, the motion fails. Is there a new motion?

VICE CHAIR McCOY: I move to deny, recommend denial of the site plan application and the special exception application, irrespective of where it's at in the city.

CHAIR JAMES: Is there a second? MR. WHIGHAM: Second.

22 CHAIR JAMES: Roll call. 23

MR. VELASQUEZ: Julius Whigham.

24 MR. WHIGHAM: Yes.

MR. VELASQUEZ: Margaret Shepherd.

28 (Pages 109 to 112)

Page 113 1 MS. SHEPHERD: Yes. 1 2 MR. VELASQUEZ: Tradrick McCoy. 2 3 VICE CHAIR McCOY: Yes. 3 4 MR. VELASQUEZ: Rena James. 4 5 5 CHAIR JAMES: Yes. 6 MR. VELASQUEZ: Unanimous voting. Motion 6 7 7 approved. 8 8 CHAIR JAMES: Okay, on to -- there is no new 9 business. We're going to move on to item VIII, General 9 10 10 Discussion, and onto public comments. First up will be 11 Bishop Thomas Masters. 11 12 BISHOP MASTERS: Well, at this point, I'm 12 13 glad you all did the right thing. Great. Let's go 13 14 home. 14 15 CHAIR JAMES: Thank you, Bishop Masters. 15 16 Next we'll have William McCray. 16 17 17 MR. McCRAY: William McCray. 18 I'd like to thank the Board for your insight 18 19 and your wisdom in this decision. And I think it was 19 20 20 the appropriate decision, and I, along with many other residents here thank you very much. 21 21 22 We, as a community, have had enough 22 23 environmental racism and dumping on our citizens and 23 Beach. 24 our community, and we are tried of people selling us 24 25 out. And I don't like to talk behind people's backs, 25 Page 114 1 but Mr. Brown tried to have eminent domain and take 1 2 away people's property once before, and thank God, it 2 3 3

Page 115

would wish though that we could have seen the environment where the comparison was made. I mean that's how I was taught. If you compare apples and oranges, then you should have both the apple and the orange in front of you. We didn't see the environment that they have

in the other site in Tampa. I looked myself though, and I got little pictures from Google. And it's more laid out. The lots are huge. This is not a concentrated, high density environment like what we're talking about on Martin Luther King.

The things that Ms. Brabham and I worked on for the last three weeks had to do with codes and code violations. We did this because of the kids. We spent hours and hours just trying to do the research that I reported. And it would appear that if they wanted to do a big project, they would actually have to force the City to set up a hazmat team and pay for all of that.

Thank you very much.

CHAIR JAMES: Thank you, Mr. Byrd.

Mary Brabham.

MS. BRABHAM: Ms. Mary Brabham, Riviera

I'm tired. I'm tired of people coming into our city abusing us, oppressing us and we just have to

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Page 116

failed. We don't need him coming back, damaging people's property or taking it or making the property values go down anymore. We don't need those kind of lobbies in this city. We don't need that kind of conduct in this city.

Oh, and another thing, this gentleman right here. This meeting is recorded. He works for the City. He clearly seems to be a cheerleader for Odyssey. He went up and he spoke to the City Attorney, Assistant City Attorney off the record, which is clearly, in my opinion, a Sunshine violation, Sunshine Law violation. So I would hope that kind of conduct isn't continued in the future. So that's just a big no, no. If I'm wrong, tell me.

But we don't need this kind of conduct in this city anymore, and I will hope that this will be a lesson for any future applicants who want to dump the environmental racism on this city. Thank you.

CHAIR JAMES: Thank you, Mr. McCray.

22 Andrew Byrd.

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14 15

16

17

18

19

20

21

23

MR. BYRD: Thank you all very much.

24 I think Ms. Brabham said it loud and clear, 25

exactly where most of the community is coming from. I

settle for it. We can do better.

For the community, our inner communities, our schools, everyone knows that I'm a fighting champion for my children and my community. This is never, never, never about Ms. Brabham. I would never allow it to be about Ms. Brabham. I am a servant of God, and I'm going to say it loud and clear: I love Him. I can't do without Him. He strengthens me.

I'm not the best. Perhaps you all are not the best. But when these things comes into our city, we have to say no. We have to stand firm in the belief that we are all entitled to decency and respect. This is what all of us should be about, not looking up, lining up here and there, but lining up for the good, for the entirety that will make each one of us great, that will make our children feel as if that they are -not belong to a city that just radicalize them with pollutions. We got so much of that now. We have to stop.

And our leaders themselves have to stop lobbying for this type of detrimental to their city. If you a leader, you would know how to lead, you would be a good leader with great ideals, not ideals so that they only ingenious you. Stop being crafty with greed. Everything that looks good is not good.

29 (Pages 113 to 116)

When Ms. Brabham set out on this journey, I want you all to look at this binder here. This binder here is nothing but people's names. I told you all that Ms. Brabham, everybody knows where my heart is. I shed tears, but they're not tears of sorrow, they're tears for joy, because knowing I do believe that we can do better. We must do better.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

1.5

16

17

20

21

22

But anytime when our leaders do us like this here and make us rise, it is an awakening all over this land because of the same thing here. We have been oppressed, we have not been heard, and all we ask for is to be treated like we're human beings.

That may be vacant property over there, but it always could be something that is conducive for the neighborhood. Nobody asked to live that way, but you have to conform it so that it can be decency amongst the schools. That hub there have all the schools and practically all of the homes on the west side.

It's shameful of the leaders. But I know someone that's this high, and he looks low. Every dirty deal that is pulled, I want you to know that it will come back to you ten times fold. And when it comes, you won't be able to stand it.

So I say to this City here: Stop doing us residents like this. Let's move the things that we can Page 119

1 property, and that's why they are here; that's why 2 they're here. I hope you all lock it up. Make some 3 type of a motion, make some type of resolution. But I 4 hope you bring it back to the City so we never have to 5 go through this again. 6

Thank you, Madam Chair.

CHAIR JAMES: Thank you, Ms. Shepherd. Staff, we were on project updates. Jeff, we

were on project updates.

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

MR. BROWN: Madam Chair, I was just asking your staff member so that the record is clear that we requested the matter, even though you voted to deny it, that we requested the matter be transmitted to the City Council for final review. I just want to -- I asked Mr. Gagnon to make that official request. I guess he was afraid to do so. But I just wanted the record clear that we now want the matter to go before the City Council.

CHAIR JAMES: Thank you.

Staff, it does go to City Council, because that's our -- our recommendation was for denial, but it still goes to City Council. Is that correct?

MR. GAGNON: The Planning and Zoning Board's recommendation will be provided to City Council.

CHAIR JAMES: Thank you.

Page 118

```
move. It is movable things in here. It is a gold mine
city, but our own people keep selling us out. We have
to stop that mentality. Stop it, people; stop it.
Thank you.
```

CHAIR JAMES: Thank you, Ms. Brabham.

Staff, is there any correspondence?

MR. GAGNON: No, ma'am.

CHAIR JAMES: Okay, Planning and Zoning Board comments, project updates, upcoming projects.

MS. SHEPHERD: Madam Chair. CHAIR JAMES: Yes, Ms. Shepherd.

MS. SHEPHERD: Can I make one comment?

First I want to thank the public once again

for coming out. And I went around in a circle to make sure that we tie this property up, that we make some type of motion, that someone get together so we never have to go through this again. This is the second

1 8 time. We did it with Trademark, and now we're coming 19 with this company.

> Something, staff, has to be done that we do not make this piece of property a property where they can come, put a trash can or something in our yard. That's why I went around in a circle, because I'm tired

23 24 of our people coming here, crying at that podium about 25

that piece of property. It's a prime piece of

Page 120

MR. GAGNON: Yes, ma'am.

CHAIR JAMES: Okay, project updates. Do we have any project updates, Jeff?

MR. GAGNON: I did want to update the Board and make mention of the fact that we are trying to shift a lot of the information to a web based format, so that way the information will be accessible by Board members, general public. We created a new web page on the City web site.

Currently we're still updating project information. However, we're also transitioning our Planning and Zoning Board packets to the same Nova System that the City Council uses, so that, again, will increase transparency. So in the very near future, that will be coming before the Planning and Zoning Board and available to the general public, and staff will follow that up with a memo to the Board.

CHAIR JAMES: Thank you. Before we end, we're going to go to Board comments. Ms. Shepherd spoke already. Mr. Whigham, do you have any closing Board comments?

22 MR. WHIGHAM: No, Madam Chair. 23 CHAIR JAMES: Mr. McCoy.

24 VICE CHAIR McCOY: I do. 25

Mr. Gagnon, I would have, I guess, if it's

30 (Pages 117 to 120)

Page 121 Page 123 1 permissible with staff, I understand we have a new 1 inappropriate. And we're vested with this authority 2 Community Development Director, and we haven't been 2 statutorily. 3 formally introduced. So if not tonight, certainly I 3 So you know, those are my comments. And I 4 would ask that that happens, I guess at our next 4 just don't want to revisit that again because I felt, 5 5 meeting. you know, I felt the approach was very condescending 6 6 and it was inappropriate. But here's where I'm at, and I'm really 7 7 So those are my comments, Madam Chair. bothered again, because I try to operate off of our 8 8 CHAIR JAMES: Thank you, Mr. McCoy. general authority and powers as being Board members. 9 Section 27-35, General Powers: The Planning Board 9 I don't have any additional comments at this 10 10 time, so is there a motion? shall have the power to -- and the first item it says 11 VICE CHAIR McCOY: So moved. 11 is require information which shall be furnished within 12 12 a reasonable time from other departments of the City CHAIR JAMES: Meeting adjourned. (Whereupon, at 9:44 p.m., the proceedings 13 government in relation to its work. 13 14 I don't know what happened, but the response 14 were concluded.) 15 15 that came from the City Attorney, who wasn't even at 16 16 our meeting in December, was irrelevant, inappropriate 17 17 and offensive. Our meeting was December the 16th. 18 18 Today is February the 9th. If that was the whole 19 19 purpose of us temporarily postponing a meeting or 20 20 tabling an item, I would have liked to have that before 21 21 now. 22 22 And here's the thing. It's like we're 23 23 revisiting these failures. And you know, I'm not even 24 24 going to try to point fingers, but you know, even in 25 25 December I said to myself when we got a project that Page 122 Page 124 1 involved Mediterranea and there was some technical 1 CERTIFICATE 2 things that wasn't -- in my opinion, that there was 3 3 some technical things that wasn't presented properly, I 4 THE STATE OF FLORIDA) 4 kind of said to myself, well, being on the up and up, I 5 will hope things turn around for the new year. 5 COUNTY OF PALM BEACH) 6 I had an opportunity to scroll around and 6 7 browse the web site of the City, and I noticed that I 7 8 guess the next few months of projects is on the web I, Susan S. Kruger, do hereby certify that 9 site. And it's actually available, and I didn't have 9 I was authorized to and did report the foregoing 10 to contact anybody, so I thought that was certainly a 10 proceedings at the time and place herein stated, and 11 step in the right direction. 11 that the foregoing pages comprise a true and correct 12 But if we want to ask for information, I want 12 transcription of my stenotype notes taken during the 13 to make sure that it's provided to us in a written 13 proceedings. 14 IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my 14 form. That way we have time to digest it and 15 hand this 16th day of February, 2017. 15 cross-reference it and revisit it. But to be told 16 16 that's not in our scope or it's irrelevant, it's a 17 17 decision that's by us. We're appointed by City 18 18 19 19 And I don't know what the mechanism has to be Presan S. Kruger 20 20 to get information, but I think today we need to make 21 21 it a point that if we ask for something, there has to 22 be a smooth transition on how it leaves from this 22 23 Board, whether it goes to staff or whether it goes to 23 24 City Council. But even two members of the public 24

31 (Pages 121 to 124)

Florida Court Reporting 561-689-0999

25

acknowledged that it was disrespectful and

25